INTRODUCTION

The journal Sustainable Business and Society in Emerging Economies (ISSN: 2708-2504 and ISSN-E: 2708-2172) is an open access peer-reviewed research journal published bi-annually by CSRC Publishing, Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan. The journal seeks to bridge and strengthen the link between business activities and society development around myriad of sustainability issues with focus on emerging and developing economies. The content coverage highlights how business organizations can be responsible towards society in pursuing their value added activities. The journal also bring forward issues in social and behavioral sciences for their implications for business organization and their activities in emerging and developing economies. The journal is a platform for business people, academics, and others involved in the contemporary debate about the responsible role of business organizations and society towards each other. Coverage includes various areas of social and behavioral sciences including management sciences. The journal welcomes papers from all those working in this important area, including researchers and business professionals, members of the legal profession, government administrators and many others.

SCOPE AND MISSION

The journal strives to highlight theoretical and policy issues related to sustainable business practices and social issues faced by society in emerging and developing economies. The SBSEE seeks to integrate the actors and institutions in business and society given that sustainability issues are though found in market yet their solution requires deep and coordinated understanding of these issues from perspectives of various disciplines of social sciences, arts and humanities. With this background SBSEE aims to be a premier forum for policy and theoretical discussion of high impact research related to sustainable business and social development in emerging and developing economies.

The journal aims to cover sustainability topics and issues in various sub-areas of business, social and behavioral sciences in context of emerging and developing economies. Purpose is to highlight the theoretical and practical issues faced by businesses and society in these economies. The journal also welcomes submissions which focus the broader areas of business, management sciences and various areas of social sciences, arts and humanities.
EDITORIAL BOARD

Patron
- Prof Dr Hayat Muhammad Awan, President, Center of Sustainability and Research Center

Editor In Chief
- Prof. Dr. K. Kuperan Viswanathan, Senior Member Advisory Board, Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan: kuperan@gmail.com; sbsee@globalcsrc.org

Associate Editors
- Dr. Adeel Rana, University of Sahiwal Pakistan
- Dr. Athifah Najwani Shahidan, Associate Fellow, Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan
- Dr. Owais Shafique, Department of Management Sciences, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur Pakistan

Editorial Advisory Board
- Prof. Dr. Abdul Wajid Rana, Lahore School of Economics, Pakistan.
- Prof. Dr. Ruswati Suryasaputra, Universitas Wijaya Kusuma Surabaya Indonesia.
- Prof. Dr. Mohd Noor Mohd Sahriff, Universiti Utara Malaysia.
- Prof. Dr. Norshuhada Shiratuddin, Universiti Utara Malaysia.
- Prof. Dr. Raja Suzana Raja Kasim, Universiti Malaysia Kelantan Malaysia.
- Prof. Dr. Cornelia Pop, Babes-Bolyai University Romania.
- Prof. Dr. José G. Vargas-Hernández, University of Guadalajara Mexico.
- Prof. Dr. Maria Alejandra Gonzalez-Perez, Universidad EAFIT Colombia.
- Prof. Dr. Arkadiusz Mironko, Rutgers University, New Jersey USA.
- Prof. Dr. Anayo Dominic Nkamnebe, Nnamdi Azikiwe University Nigeria.
- Prof. Dr. D. E. Laouisset, Nottingham Business School, UK.
- Prof. Dr. Mauricio Garita, Universidad Francisco Marroquín Guatemala.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Johanan Zamilpa, University of Guanajuato Mexico.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Małgorzata Bartosik-Purgat, Poznan University Poland.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Rana Dilshad, Bahauddin Zakariya University Multan Pakistan.
- Assoc Prof Dr Jose E. Munoz, Point Loma Nazarene University California USA.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Vasya Taras, University of North Carolina at Greensboro, USA.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Silvia Testarmata, Università degli Studi Niccolò Cusano Rome, Italy.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Artie Aggrawal, Amity University Navi Mumbai, India.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Barbara Jankowska, Poznan University of Economics and Business Poland.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Ernesto Tavoletti, University of Macerata Italy.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Sara Poggesi, University of Rome Tor Vergata Italy.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Shankar Chelliah, School of Management Universiti Sains Malaysia.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Ali Malik, University of Hertfordshire, UK.
- Asst. Prof. Dr. Aasma Safdar, Bahauddin Zakariya University Multan Pakistan.
- Asst. Prof. Dr. Omer Faruk Genc, Abdullah Gül University, Kayseri, Turkey.
- Asst. Prof. Dr. Pawel Bryla, University of Lodz Poland.
- Asst. Prof. Dr. Anju Mehta, University of North Carolina at Greensboro USA.
- Asst. Prof. Dr. Khawaja Khalid Mehmood, Bahauddin Zakariya University Multan, Pakistan.
- Asst. Prof. Dr. Husnul Amin, International Islamic University Islamabad Pakistan.
- Asst. Prof. Dr. Sehar-un-Nisa Hassan, NUST Islamabad Pakistan.
- Dr. Diana Bank Weinberg, Berlin School of Economics and law (HWR), Germany.
- Dr. Muhammad Haroon Hafeez, Bahauddin Zakariya University Multan Pakistan.
- Dr. Waheed Asghar, Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority Punjab Pakistan.
- Dr. Otega Okinono, Delta State University, Nigeria.
- Dr. Muhammad Rizwan, Middlesex University Business School, London.
INDEXING AND ABSTRACTING

The journal Sustainable Business and Society in Emerging Economies is indexed and abstracted by following institutions. The publishing manager and editorial team are committed to enhance quality and outreach of the journal by expanding the indexing and abstracting of its content further.

- SocioRepec
- EconPapers
- SUNCAT
- Google Scholar
- Crossref
- Scilit
- OAI-PMH Compliant Repositories
- RePEc
- Copac
- EDRIC
- IDEAS
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Vol. 2, Issue 1, June 2020

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Journal Information</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Introduction-Scope and Mission</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Editorial Board</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Indexing and Abstracting</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Challenges Faced by the Repatriates and their Subsequent Impact on Repatriates’ Satisfaction</td>
<td>1-11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muhammad Shaukat Malik, Usman Farooq, Famya Khalid</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Conceptual Paper on Corporate Social Responsibility among Malaysian Entrepreneurs</td>
<td>13-19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tengku Anis Syafiqah Tengku Jasmi, Nazlina Zakaria, Lily Julienti Abu Bakar</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Review of Cyberloafing Predictors in Literature</td>
<td>21-27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Huda M. Mashal</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An Impact of Islamic Microfinance on women borrower’s Happiness:</td>
<td>29-35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Psychological and Economic Theoretical perspective in Southern Punjab, Pakistan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sana Fayyaz, Fatima Khurram, Samar Fahd</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effect of Corporate Governance and Capital Structure on Corporate Performance in Malaysian Listed Companies: A Conceptual Approach</td>
<td>37-46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fauzan, Azhar Bin Abdul Rahman, Marhaiza Binti Ibrahim</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effect of Employer Branding Attributes on Talent Retention with mediating Role of Transformational Leadership</td>
<td>47-54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muhammad Imran Hanif, Zain Saeed Qureshi</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Global Research Trend on Organizational Citizenship Behaviour: A Bibliometric Analysis</td>
<td>55-71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jen Ling Gan, Halimah Mohd Yusof</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Challenges Faced by the Repatriates and their Subsequent Impact on Repatriates’ Satisfaction

Muhammad Shaukat Malik, Usman Farooq, Famya Khalid

1Director and Dean, Institute of Banking and Finance, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, Pakistan. Shoukatkatmalik@bzu.edu.pk
2Visiting Faculty, Institute of Banking and Finance, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, Pakistan. usmanfarooquf@gmail.com
3MS Scholar, Department of CABB, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad, Pakistan, famyakhalid5@gmail.com

ARTICLE DETAILS

Objective: Through decades repatriation has been the most ignored and a problematic phase of the Expatriate Management Cycle (EMC). Expatriates when returning back to their home country are referred as Repatriates and this returning phase is known as Repatriation phase of the Expatriate Management Cycle. This Repatriation phase is mainly the unplanned stage where organizational managers make the mistake. They certainly believe that the repatriates are returning back to their home and wrongly assumes that there will be no complications or challenges for these repatriates on their arrival back to home country. This strategic lack results in the immense dissatisfaction of these repatriates soon after arrival to the home country. Our aim is to provide a detailed study on the process of repatriation by identifying the challenges that are faced by the repatriates on their arrival to the home country and to oversee their subsequent impact on their job performance.

Methodology: Data was collected through primary means using convenience sampling method through various organizations and of 300 respondents 186 were filtered out to be analyzed using different statistical techniques on SPSS.

Result: There exist a significant negative relationship between all the identified challenges faced by the repatriates and their job satisfaction level

Implication: At the end of the research some recommendations were also proposed for the organizational managers to overcome these challenges. This piece of research can not only be used by the researchers for their research work but can also be based by the organizational managers to formulate their repatriation strategies.

© 2020 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0


1. Introduction

Due to the globalization today, organizations are challenged to go global by expanding their businesses in the global markets and gaining the international knowledge and expertise. For this reason there is an intense demand in the organizations to send their employees for the international ventures. An Expatriate is a person who is temporarily residing or working in a country or culture other than his culture of origin (Noe, 2013). And these expatriates when
returning back to the home country are called repatriates. This Repatriation phase of the expatriate management cycle is the most key troublesome area for the employers in the global companies because knowingly the organizations do not have any properly formulated procedures and plans for these returning repatriates that often cause moment of high anxiety and tension for these returnees (Yeaton & Hall, 2008).

Despite of facing all the troubles and challenges organizations have not widely accepted the repatriation program in there international human resource systems. They seldom understand the need to initiate any special programs in order to prepare their returning employees to get readjusted back in their home culture. The returning expatriates are assumed to re-enter back into their home country and culture so no special training programs or readjustment strategies are planned by the employers. Due to this strategic lack in handling the readjustment process for the repatriates and not being able to formulate bona fide repatriation plans including career paths for the returning expats, leads these repatriates to underutilization of their knowledge and high ineffectiveness.

In terms of particularly Pakistan this area of international human resource management has almost been untapped. There exists lots of space to see that how these repatriates are being handled in Pakistan. Along with that strategic importance of the repatriation phase of the expatriate management cycle will be seen. Our research will have a two fold significance. Firstly it will be beneficial for the academic sector and secondly it will be beneficial for the organizational managers to know the strategic importance of repatriation process.

1.1. Defining Repatriation Phase
Sending of the employees on international assignments should not be seen as a one way task, rather the returning phase of the Expatriate Management Cycle should also be focused by the organization. Organizations generally focus in planning the expatriation process for their employees that are being sent to some international assignment and usually skip any arrangements for their return back to the home country. Because of this avoidance paid by the organizational managers to the repatriation process causes the repatriates to face numerous challenges on their arrival back in the host country which ultimately results in job dissatisfaction. Organizations must emphasize on devising policies and procedures to untapped the learnt knowledge and expertise from these repatriates in their international exposure. Repatriates gain knowledge and skills from their international experience and transfers this gained experience back in home organization when they return back to their home country (Doherty, Richardson, and Thorn, 2013).

1.2. Identifying the Challenges Faced by the Repatriates
Organizational managers plan the whole EMC, they formulate strategies in order to plan and execute training and facilitating programs for each of the stage of cycle but they knowingly ignore the last repatriation phase and believe that there will be no complications attached to this phase as the expatriates are to return back to their own country and assumes that they will be comfortable to re-adjust in their home country. (M. Jitendra, 2011).

The Repatriation Phase is the key issue for the employees in global companies because the organizations management usually has no proper formulated procedures and plans for the returning expatriates who often cause a moment of high anxiety and several problems for these expatriates (Yeaton and Hall, 2008). Success of expatriation cycle depends upon how well the repatriation phase is initiated and completed. In the repatriation phase employees return back to their primary country and often face with innumerable complications like reverse cultural shock and require lots of assistance and training for their smooth adjustment to the home country (Kjerfve and McLean, 2012).

Repatriates may suffer in the readjustment in to the home organization at the time of arrival from the global venture. Certain phenomenon like culture and organizational environment may have changed. Even the whole organizational or cultural dynamics could have been changed during the period of International Assignments. Policies of the organizations, internal structures of the company, staff or even management might have been changed by the duration repatriate returns from their international assignment which could result in creating readjustment issues (E. A. Kim, 2007).
1.3. Reverse Cultural Shock
Reverse cultural shock may affect different individuals with different intensity. Often it hits greatly to the people who have to make immense changes in their behavior during their adjustment phase at overseas assignments. (Gaw, 2000). Such reps on their arrival back to the home culture have to revert back to their actual state of behavior for which they have to exert with double effort and commitment as compared to that exerted, at the time of adjustment in host culture (Stroh, Gregersen and Black, 2000).

Reverse cultural shock impacts adversely on the repatriates as they lose their social contact from their surroundings and get cut off from the communal contact from their native culture, people and colleagues; and suffer in the readjustment phase when they have to return to their home country and have to readjust themselves in the home culture. At that moment reverse cultural shock hinders their readjusting phase and impact adversely on the repatriates. Its impact may be of much unexpected content (Baruch, Steele and Quantrill, 2002).

1.4. Repatriates Readjustment
An effective management’s involvement is required for the repatriates in adjusting back in their home country. Their social networks are required to be re-established. Repatriates need several trainings and technological learning upon repatriation for proper readjustment (Baruch et al., 2002; Vidal, Valle, Aragon and Brewster, 2007). Moreover upon re-entry to the home culture repatriates and their families may take a long up to one year to regulate back in normal routine of their organizations (Linehan and Scullion, 2002). According to another study repatriates adjustment is a lengthy process and can take up to a year in order to redeveloping their social networks (Jassawalla and Sashittal, 2009).

Repatriation phase is more problematic for the female officials on international assignments (Stroh, Gregersen, & Black, 2000). In readjustment stage females often have to face several stresses because they are assumed to assist their families to readjust back into the home culture and for that reason they face difficulties in their professional readjustment (Linehan and Scullion, 2002). According to another study repatriates were able to identify several factors as a potential source of mediators that influence the readjustment stage. Those factors were the time span that a repatriate has invested in to the international assignment, the distance to which repatriate has gone from the home culture for the assignment, age of international assignment and the attributes of the job assigned (Suutari and Valimaa, 2002).

Repatriates are the employees on which the company invests as much as three to five times more than on a regular employee. Repatriates are the source of updated knowledge, skills and expertise for the organization. But most of the time the acquired knowledge remains untapped due to the lack of policies and procedures by the home companies that hinders the readjustment of the employees into the organization and results in high dissatisfaction of the repatriates and increase in turnover ratio (Kjerfve and Gary, 2011).

1.5. Family Adjustment
According to a cross cultural study held by the authors of Unites States suggested that expatriates and their families on the termination of their international tasks when return back to the home culture had to face several stressors in the form of cultural and environmental settlement. These stressors are the biggest challenge which acts as a hurdle in the adjustment process especially for the families of these repatriates. (Haslberger et al., 2008). At that time it is not only the repatriate who may suffer and face complications in adjustment but his family is also a stakeholder in this process. Spouses of the repatriates on returning back to the home culture suffers in adjusting back into the home environment. If she is a working lady she might also have face her job related issues along with the personal adjustment problems. These expected issues are not particularly discussed in the repatriation phase of EMC (Avril and Magnini, 2007).

If such family issues are not properly planned by the organizational managers they may lead to dissatisfaction of the repatriate which might lead him to switch his company. And the organization may not be able to enjoy with the total benefits that it could attain from the acquired knowledge gained by repatriates (M.C. Bolino, 2007).

1.6. Career Management
Organizational focus should be on the formulation of the international assignments, attractiveness of the training
programs, quality of the compensation and career opportunities offered on return to the repatriates on the termination of the international assignment (McEvoy and Buller, 2013). Turnover ratio in repatriates is more than the other employees. It is due the reason that if the repatriates are unsatisfied with the organizational efforts they achieve on return from the global assignments in terms of their career development and future career aspect they prefer to leave the organization and seek new jobs for them (Vidal et al., 2007a).

Repatriates turnover is one of the major issues for the multinational organizations who are undergoing the repatriation process. Multinationals spend lots of amount on the repatriates and if they switch their jobs this can be of much loss for the organization. Therefore the organizations must put efforts towards formulating attractive career paths and career development opportunities for these repatriates so they could settle back in the organizations and could remain motivated (Lazarova and Cerdin, 2007).

1.7. Job Placement
Organizations can never hide themselves away from reinforcing the repatriation practices. Organizational managers have to provide new job placements and opportunities better than those offered to the expatriates before the international experience. They are also required to create the new career paths for the repatriates where they can best utilize their newly acquired knowledge, skills and expertise which will not only enhance the motivational level of the repatriates but also will enhance the organizational performance (Kjerfve and Gary, 2011). Organizational Management should pay attention on the repatriation process carefully by offering them such new job placements on their return the home country that the skills and expertise acquired by these repatriates could be properly procured and organizational learning could be intensified (Barakat and Moussa, 2014). If the organizations do not plan proper career paths for the repatriates it may turn the repatriates to dissatisfaction on their arrival back to the home country (Bossard and Peterson, 2005).

1.8. Societal Changes
International experience can distance the returning expatriates socially. Their stay in the host country can result in social gaps for the repatriates. The social relations and interactions may get disturbed due to the long span of time the repatriates might find themselves in to the state of isolation. This creates a high moral lapse and eventually results in dissatisfaction of the repatriates (Martin, 1984). It is the organizational management who devise such policies that keeps the repatriates motivated towards their jobs. If the organization fails to provide the required support to the repatriates, in dealing up with the challenges like social readjustment, this could result in dissatisfaction of the repatriates (Suutari and Tornikoski, 2001)

1.9. Job Satisfaction
Satisfaction of the employees acts to be a key determinant of organizational success. It has been researched and concluded many a times that a satisfied employee will act to be more beneficial and productive to an organization than an employee who is less satisfied with the organizational practices. A dis-satisfied employee tends to be less motivated towards the organizational workings and fails to pay his best concern towards the assigned tasks from the organizations (Spector, 1997)

The above identified six challenges i.e. the societal issues, reverse cultural shock, career management issues, job placement issues, repatriates readjustment issues and family adjustment issues seems to have an adverse impact on repatriate’s job satisfaction on their arrival back to the home country. Most of the firms do not properly handle their repatriates and ultimately these repatriates get dissatisfied with the passage of time and eventually goes for leaving their organizations. In such cases firms usually have to bear heavy losses not only in terms of capital invested on these repatriates during their international assignments but also in terms of a loss of qualified and competent human capital that could have been a significant resource to the organization who has the international exposure and experience.

Therefore it is the prime responsibility of the organizational managers to retain these repatriates by keeping them motivates and satisfied with the organizational culture.
**Figure 1: Hypothesized Theoretical Model**

**Hypothesis**

H 1: Societal Issues have a negative relationship with Repatriates Job Satisfaction.

H 2: Reverse Cultural Shock has a negative relationship with Repatriates Job Satisfaction.

H 3: Career Management Issues have a negative relationship with Job Satisfaction

H 4: Job Placement Issues have a negative relationship with Repatriates Job Satisfaction.

H 5: Repatriates Readjustment Issues has a negative relationship with Job Satisfaction.

H 6: Family Adjustment issues have a negative relationship with impact on Job Satisfaction.

**2. Research Methodology**

Data for the research work has been collected through secondary and primary means of data collection. The topic we are conducting research on has been very less explored in Pakistan so we opt a semi structured way of interview conduction in order to get the clear dimensions of the topic, as they will allow us to invade into the area of our interest and get the answers of the uncertainties that we have in our research topic. Furthermore, the semi structured interviews act to be instrumental in establishing a piece of academic research that will nourish the concepts and views about the interest area.

For our research work we used a set of close ended questionnaire to accumulate the answers gained from the respondents. Questionnaire we used was 5-point likert scaled and was adopted. It was then tested with Cronbach’s alpha test to check its reliability to attain error free results at the end of the research. In our research secondary data was collected through several published journals, various articles, electronic books and through various researches that have been conducted in different parts of the world. Further the informative material provided by my mentor Mr.
A Sum of total 300 questionnaires was dispersed and of them 186 were processed. Few of them were rejected on the basis of impropite or incomplete filling while others were declined due to the reason that individuals were not residing in Pakistan. In order to maintain the global factor constant individuals (repatriates) only from Pakistan were appraised for the research work. For the analysis and coding of the collected raw data, SPSS (Statistical package of social sciences) was used and several techniques like factor analysis and correlations were applied. The reliability of questionnaire was checked by Cronbach’s alpha test.

3. Findings, Analysis, Discussions and Interpretation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1: Case Processing Summary and Reliability Statistics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Case Processing Summary</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cases</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Excluded</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

List wise deletion based on all variables in the procedure.

The Reliability Statistics shows the Cronbach’s Alpha Result for the used questionnaire. The results show that Cronbach’s Alpha value comes out to be 0.786 which is much more than the minimum required value of 0.70. This value of 0.786 depicts that questionnaire is 78% optimal and internally consistent and highly reliable. Therefore we directly move ahead towards the factors analysis for the research data obtained.
Table 2: Factor Analysis and KMO

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SI1</td>
<td>.740</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SI2</td>
<td>.709</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SI3</td>
<td>.634</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SI4</td>
<td>.805</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RCS1</td>
<td>.582</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.747</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RCS2</td>
<td>.518</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RCS3</td>
<td>.719</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RCS4</td>
<td>.673</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CM11</td>
<td>.804</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.734</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CM12</td>
<td>.840</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CM13</td>
<td>.744</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CM14</td>
<td>.622</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JP11</td>
<td>.724</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.705</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JP12</td>
<td>.801</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JP13</td>
<td>.685</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JP14</td>
<td>.702</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RI1</td>
<td>.727</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.754</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RI2</td>
<td>.685</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RI3</td>
<td>.508</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RI4</td>
<td>.561</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAI1</td>
<td>.741</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.735</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAI2</td>
<td>.648</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAI3</td>
<td>.548</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAI4</td>
<td>.565</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RJS1</td>
<td>.730</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.748</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RJS2</td>
<td>.683</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RJS3</td>
<td>.839</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RJS4</td>
<td>.772</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Interpretation
The table 2 shows the Factor Analysis and Kaiser-Meyer-Olkin (KMO Test). As we know if the value of KMO is greater than 0.60 we can move to further factor analysis. Here the table 2 depicts that KMO of Societal Issues is 0.762, KMO of Reverse Cultural Shock is 0.747, KMO of Career Management Issues is 0.734, KMO of Job Placement Issues is 0.705, KMO of Readjustment Issues is 0.754, KMO of Family Adjustment Issues is 0.735 and KMO of Repatriates Job Satisfaction is 0.748.

Here all the values of KMO are greater than 0.60 which means that we can further go for factor analysis test. Other values in the table 2 shows that the factor analysis of each item of the variable is greater than 0.50 and hence no item of the variable is left behind and all the loading items of the variables are considered for the further research.
Table 3 shows a significant negative relationship between all the independent and dependent variables which are discussed separately below. The relationships in the correlation analysis show that there exists a significant and negative relationship between repatriates job satisfaction and the six identified dependent variables. Higher the degree of family adjustment issues, societal issues, reversal cultural issues, career management issues, job placement issues and the readjustment issues faced by the repatriates lower will be their satisfaction level towards their job. Likewise lower the degree of issues faced by the repatriates higher will be their satisfaction level towards job.

**Hypothesis 1**

**Societal Issues has a negative relationship with Repatriates Job Satisfaction**

Table 3 shows that exists a negative and significant relationship between job satisfaction and societal issues with a value of $-0.460$.

Thus Hypothesis 1 is accepted

That is, higher the intensity of the societal challenges faced by the repatriates lower will be their level of satisfaction towards their jobs

**Hypothesis 2**

**Reverse Cultural Shock has a negative relationship with Repatriates Job Satisfaction.**

Table 3 shows correlation between repatriates job satisfaction and reverse cultural shock is found to be negative and significant with a value of $-0.708$

Thus Hypothesis 2 is accepted

That is, higher the intensity of the reverse cultural shock faced by the repatriates lower will be their level of...
satisfaction towards their jobs

Hypothesis 3
Career Management Issues have a negative relationship with Job Satisfaction
Table 3 shows that there exists a negative and significant relationship between job satisfaction and Career Management issues with a value of -0.692

Thus Hypothesis 3 is accepted
That is, higher the intensity of the career management issues faced by the repatriates lower will be their level of satisfaction towards their jobs

Hypothesis 4
Job Placement Issues have a negative relationship with Repatriates Job Satisfaction.
Table 3 shows correlation between repatriates job placement issues and their job satisfaction is found to be negative and significant with a value of -0.623

Thus Hypothesis 4 is accepted
That is, higher the intensity of the Job placement issues faced by the repatriates lower will be their level of satisfaction towards their jobs

Hypothesis 5
Repatriates Readjustment Issues has a negative relationship with Job Satisfaction.
Table 3 shows that there exists a negative and significant relationship between job satisfaction and Repatriates Readjustment issues with a value of -0.705

Thus Hypothesis 5 is accepted
That is, higher the intensity of the readjustment issues faced by the repatriates lower will be their level of satisfaction towards their jobs

Hypothesis 6
Family Adjustment issues have a negative relationship with impact on Job Satisfaction.
Table 3 shows correlation between repatriates family adjustment issues and their job satisfaction is found to be negative and significant with a value of -0.502

Thus Hypothesis 6 is accepted
That is, higher the intensity of the family adjustment faced by the repatriates lower will be their level of satisfaction towards their jobs. This can be seen from all the above interpretations and analysis tests that all the proposed hypothesis of our research are found to be accepted and thus shows their certainly exists a negative relationship between the dependent and independent variables

4. Recommendations
The organizational managers must develop the proper repatriation strategies. Organizations must arrange pre-return trainings for the repatriates and their families so they may not have to suffer on their arrival back to the home country. Proper career opportunities and job placement strategies for the repatriates should be created and the arrangements for the facilitation of their families should be emphasized by the organizational managers on priority. They must also initiate knowledge seeking sessions so that the knowledge gained by the repatriates could be extracted and used for the growth of the organizations.

This will not only enhance the organizational productivity but will also create a sense of satisfaction in repatriates. Repatriates will consider themself as a valuable asset to the organization which ultimately will enhance their satisfaction towards organization. In sum this could be said that higher the organizational emphasis is on the repatriation phase of the expatriate management cycle lesser will be the challenges faced by the repatriates on their arrival to the home country.

5. Limitations
Our research work conducted has several limitations which are as:
1) Data was collected was only from Pakistan
2) Topic was new and the field was less explored so it was quite difficult to find the target population and for that reason convenience sampling method was used for collecting data
3) Research was not sector specific. Repatriates from all the sectors were considered for data collection.

6. Conclusion
This study was conducted to identify the challenges that the repatriates may face on their arrival to the home country after the successful completion of their international assignments. The issues faced by the repatriates were seen to be the job placement issues, reverse cultural shock, career management issues, societal issue, readjustment issues of repatriates, and family adjustment issues. Repatriates not only suffer with the challenges faced in their organization and work place but also had to suffer with the external factors on their arrival back. These identified challenges faced by the repatriates were then measured through the primary means of research and was analyzed that all these identified challenges were having a significant negative relationship with the repatriates satisfaction.

Organizational managers must take timely and essential steps like development of strategies for the repatriates, pre-return trainings, making compensation packages, organizing sessions for the repatriates so the gained knowledge could be extracted from them and can be transferred to rest of the organization. Organization must also take steps for the readjustment of these repatriates and their families so they could adjust back into the home country easily without taking extra pressure. Higher the emphasis is on the repatriation phase of the expatriation management cycle by the organizational managers lesser will be the chance that the returning repatriates will face challenges on their arrival. And likewise lesser the challenges are faced by the repatriates on their arrival back to the home country; Higher will be their satisfaction level and so will be their performance. Hence, this supports the idea that the repatriation phase of expatriation management cycle, which has been ignored through decades, is equally crucial as the expatriation phase. Managers must pay equal focus and attention in devising repatriation policies and training programs so the challenges faced could be minimized and subsequently the satisfaction level of the repatriates could be raised.

7. Directions for Future
Human resources is an area which is not very mature in Pakistan so there exists a great prospect of research particularly in the area of repatriation no or very less work has been done in Pakistan. So our work can be taken as a base to identify more challenges faced by the repatriates. And these identified variables can be researched and tested through quantitative means research in future. Furthermore our work can be utilized by the organizational managers to make strategies for the returning repatriates. This piece of research can also be used by the researchers to check the global impact of this idea in different parts of the world.

References


A Conceptual Paper on Corporate Social Responsibility among Malaysian Entrepreneurs

1Tengku Anis Syafiqah Tengku Jasmi, 2Nazlina Zakaria, 3Lily Julienti Abu Bakar

1Faculty of Economics and Management, Universiti Putra Malaysia, Malaysia.
anisjasmi@gmail.com
2School of Business Management, Universiti Utara Malaysia, Malaysia.
nazlina@uum.edu.my
3School of Business Management, Universiti Utara Malaysia, Malaysia.
julienti@uum.edu.my

ARTICLE DETAILS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>History</th>
<th>ABSTRACT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Revised format: May 2020</td>
<td>Conflicting views on corporate social responsibility have led to various studies on CSR. However, the previous studies focused mainly on large firms rather than small and medium entrepreneurs. It is important to study corporate social responsibility in the context of small and medium enterprises. This is because any initiatives taken by small and medium enterprises can affect society and the economy due their large contributions. Therefore, this paper provides a view on corporate social responsibility among Malaysian entrepreneurs, mainly small and medium enterprises.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Available Online: June 2020</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Keywords</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Corporate social responsibility, entrepreneur, SMEs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

JEL Classification:
L26, L31

© 2020 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0


1. Introduction

When corporate social responsibility (CSR) was first introduced, it received backlashes and was not widely accepted by businesses. There were negative views and critiques regarding CSR. Not only that, multiple views from different scholars also emerged (Carroll, 1979; Jamali, Zanhour, & Keshishian, 2009). This occurred because the notion of CSR is the opposite of what businesses are perceived to be. Businesses focus primarily on profit-maximizing, which is a conventional way of conducting business. It should prioritize making profits by fully utilizing its resources and in the mean-time still abide by the law, instead of focusing on social responsibility which would incur additional costs to the business (Friedman, 1970). However, year to year and due to the emergence of the economy as well as societal expectations from the society and the stakeholders, many businesses have implemented CSR because they are aware of the importance and the good effect of CSR (Pedersen, 2015).

Compared to before, there has been a shift in the prime focus of social responsibilities (Carroll, 1979). This CSR evolution can be seen in the social responsibility aspects in businesses, as for example, workers’ rights, occupational health and safety, and work equity. In the past, social responsibility aspects, such as occupational health and work equity were not the concerns of a firm. Businesses in the present day have become more responsible in conducting
their businesses by making the acts regarding social responsibility as obligatory regulations.

In Malaysia, there are numerous strategies and approaches carried out by the government and related bodies to increase the implementation of CSR, not only in large firms but also in small and medium enterprises (SMEs) (UNICEF, 2013). Most of the studies have focused on large firms as it is mandatory for large firms to conduct and report their CSR activities; meanwhile, SMEs are not obliged to report their CSR activities, if any (UNICEF, 2013). Therefore, until now, studies on CSR in the context of SMEs have not been widely explored.

2. The Concept of Corporate Social Responsibility

One of the main reasons for the issues related to CSR is its broad concept. There is no standard definition or definite definition in describing CSR (Marrewijk, 2003). Various definitions and concepts have emerged from the debates that have been articulated year by year.

It all started when Howard R. Bowen, who is renowned as the Father of CSR published the first work on the concept of CSR in 1953 through his book *Social Responsibilities of the Businessman*. As seen from the title, previously CSR was only known as the social responsibility of a business. This is because, the role of the businessmen was not widely acknowledged during that era. Bowen’s publication has sparked numerous debates on CSR.

On the contrary, a different view from Milton Friedman emerged in 1970. This was an important stage in developing the idea of CSR. This is because, the view from Friedman was contrastive from other views around that era. Friedman (1970) did not reject the idea of CSR. Instead, Friedman argued that the primary social responsibility of a business is to increase profits by using its resources effectively and getting involved in profitable activities while obeying the laws, such as to not be involved in fraud, illegal methods or dishonesty. Additionally, his work also clearly stated the scope of CSR, its connection to shareholders and owners, as well as its link to profit maximization (Friedman, 1970).

Furthermore, the Companies Commission of Malaysia (2013) defined CSR as the willingness of corporations and businesses to work on sustainability in terms of social, economic and environmental aspects while also focusing on making profits. In addition, UNICEF (2013) defined CSR as the upmost action in abiding by the law by a group of voluntary businesses. Moreover, the World Business Council for Sustainable Development (n.d.) defined CSR as the willingness and the ongoing commitment of a business to develop the economy and at the same time enhance the employees and their families, the community and the society’s quality of life as a whole.

Despite the numerous definitions, CSR can be clearly explained by using a Three-Dimensional Conceptual Model of Corporate Performance. This model was developed by Archie B. Carroll in 1979 and it consists of four dimensions, namely economic responsibilities, legal responsibilities, ethical responsibilities, and discretionary responsibilities. These responsibilities must be satisfied for a firm to become socially responsible.

The first dimension is economic responsibilities. Economic responsibilities are the basic responsibilities that need to be carried out. Generally, a business is the basis in an economic system in a society. Providing goods and services necessary for the members of the society and simultaneously making profits from them are the widely established economic responsibilities accepted by firms (Carroll, 1979). The second dimension is legal responsibilities. Just as with the economic responsibilities, the implementation of legal responsibilities by firms is highly anticipated by the society. This is because, the society expects firms to comply with the judiciary, rules and guidelines while conducting their businesses (Carroll, 1979; Crane, Matten, & Spence, 2013).

The third dimension is ethical responsibilities. There are no standardized instructions in conducting ethical responsibilities for firms to follow, nor are they stated in the law. Nevertheless, the society looks forward to firms’ implementation of them. This shows that the expectation of society is beyond the legal responsibilities. Furthermore, the vague definition of ethical responsibilities makes it the hardest of all the responsibilities for firms to comply with (Carroll, 1979). The last dimension is discretionary responsibilities. This is the most favorable of the responsibilities to be carried out by firms among the others.
It is common for Malaysian firms to conduct discretionary responsibilities. Compared to ethical and legal responsibilities, society anticipates the social roles of firms the most, but it depends on one’s judgement, values and beliefs. In addition, this responsibility is considered as voluntary work and is inclined towards a firm’s willingness to engage in social roles rather than seeing it as an obligation. The examples of discretionary responsibilities are donations, disaster relief, free medical check-ups and organizing talks on health awareness (Carroll, 1979).

Therefore, CSR can be defined as the incorporation of economic, legal, ethical and discretionary expectations of society towards firms at a certain period as the social responsibility of business (Carroll, 1979).

Not only does it have various definitions, CSR also has multiple terminologies (Carroll, 1979; Companies Commission of Malaysia, 2013; Nejati & Amran, 2013; UNICEF, 2013). Corporate Responsibility; Sustainability; Sustainable Development or Business Practice; Corporate Citizenship; Responsible Business Practice; Environmental Involvement; Environment, Social and Governance and Triple Bottom Line are the alternative terminologies for CSR (Companies Commission of Malaysia, 2013; Nejati & Amran, 2013; UNICEF, 2013). Different terminologies are used according to the variety of the perceptions, conceptualizations and definitions in CSR (Carroll, 1979).

3. Corporate Social Responsibility in Malaysia
The Malaysian government has made it an obligation for public-listed companies (PLCs) to disclose and report their CSR activities (Companies Commission of Malaysia, 2013; UNICEF, 2013). According to UNICEF (2013), there are no reporting requirements for government-linked companies (GLCs) and SMEs. It can benefit firms in transparency, encourage innovation, enhance reputation, minimize corporate risk, and attract favorable financing conditions (Companies Commission of Malaysia, 2013). The disclosure must be categorized into four categories, namely marketplace content, workplace content, community content, and environment content (Companies Commission of Malaysia, 2013; UNICEF, 2013). These categories hold different characteristics that needs to be reported accordingly to the stakeholders (Companies Commission of Malaysia, 2013).

Firstly, marketplace content. This content illustrates the implementation of socially responsible practices in conducting the business, such as providing help and support to the local businesses and suppliers, customer retention, customer satisfaction, safety and quality of products and services, marketing, advertising, and ethical work conduct (Companies Commission of Malaysia, 2013). However, not all firms implement CSR initiatives in their supply chain (UNICEF, 2013). Additionally, there might be an adequate understanding on the responsibility of products or services (UNICEF, 2013). According to the Companies Commission of Malaysia (2013), the focus stakeholders for marketplace content are customers, business partners and investors.

Secondly is workplace content. In this content, a firm reports the benefits and support provided. For instance, salaries, pensions, employees’ benefits, health and safety requirements, nursing facilities, adequate staff training, equality in employment, diversity, bribery and fraud policies, and employees’ work life balance (Companies Commission of Malaysia, 2013). This can be a drawback to firms with no related policies, such as flexible office hours, diversity coaching or training and childcare amenities (UNICEF, 2013). According to the Companies Commission of Malaysia (2013), the focus stakeholders for workplace content are employees, public authorities and trade unions.

Thirdly, community content. This content provides details on volunteering activities as well as charitable donations and sponsorship that contribute to economic development. The details can consist of improving the quality of amenities and systems in the community, engaging with the locals and healthcare and education of the community (Companies Commission of Malaysia, 2013). This content may contain philanthropic activities rather than other related activities (UNICEF, 2013). According to the Companies Commission of Malaysia (2013), the focus stakeholders for community content are employees, public authorities and related local authorities.

Lastly, environment content. This content demonstrates the actions taken to protect and preserve the environment. Reducing the hazardous gas emissions, waste and environmental pollution, such as water and air, using renewable energy, checking and supervising the firm’s energy usage and keeping biodiversity in existence are the examples of
this content (Companies Commission of Malaysia, 2013). UNICEF (2013) reported that almost 25% of the firms provide no data. According to the Companies Commission of Malaysia (2013), the focus stakeholders for environment content are employees, business partners, investors, consumers, public authorities and the local community.

CSR disclosure and reporting, awards, as well as guidelines provided by the Malaysian government and related organizations are the government’s initiatives to introduce CSR to businesses. Other than CSR disclosure and reporting, there are awards specifically given to firms with remarkable impacts of their CSR programs and activities in order to increase the awareness and the implementation of CSR in the Malaysian firms.

There are the Prime Minister’s CSR awards which comprise a variety of categories, namely the Community and Social Welfare, Cultural and Heritage, Education, Environment, Small Company CSR, Best CSR/Workplace Practices, Empowerment of Women, Special Award-Media Reporting, Best Overall CSR Program, Family Friendly Workplaces and Outstanding Opportunities for People with Disabilities (UNICEF, 2013). The award that was introduced in 2007 has been won by numerous renowned large firms, such as DiGi, CIMB, Telekom Malaysia, MEASAT Broadcast Network Systems, and IBM Malaysia Sdn. Bhd. (UNICEF, 2013). Additionally, the ACCA Malaysia Sustainability Reporting Awards (ACCA MaSRA) has recognized firms in terms of their sustainability report as part of the firms’ annual reports (Companies Commission of Malaysia, 2013).

4. Corporate Social Responsibility in Malaysian Small and Medium Enterprises

The term “corporate” that is used in corporate social responsibility imposes confusion for SMEs. This is because, the term “corporate” is usually associated with large firms (Crane et al., 2013). Therefore, can corporate social responsibility be implemented in SMEs when there are differences in both large firms and SMEs?

SMEs are known for their important roles in the economy as well as their limitations and challenges. Limited resources, financial constraints, low number of employees and lack of knowledge and skills are examples of the challenges faced by SMEs (Musa & Chinniah, 2016). These challenges are some of the distinct features of SMEs and large firms.

However, in terms of CSR, challenges and limitations can act as advantages depending on the circumstances. One of the examples is that the low number of employees in SMEs can make it easier for changes to be implemented. One of the reasons is that, it is easier for the staff to receive the training and knowledge required with a reasonable cost because of the small number of employees. Thus, this will ease the process of implementing CSR in SMEs.

In Malaysia, the awareness of SMEs on CSR was reported to be at the medium level and has been perceived as a positive view (Abdullah, Mohamad, & Mahat, 2015; Mohd Nasir, Abdul Halim, Mohd Sallem, Jasni, & Aziz, 2015). Malaysian SMEs are commonly involved in CSR through monetary donations, property donations and providing assistance to communities in need (Abdullah et al., 2015).

As stated earlier, the government has required that the firms disclose and report their CSR activities. However, there is a difference in the reporting and disclosing of CSR between listed companies and SMEs. Unlike large firms, SMEs are not obliged to report their CSR activities due to the lack of resources and financial constraints that SMEs face (Companies Commission of Malaysia, 2013).

However, in spite of the constraints, SMEs can still get involved with CSR activities. One of the ways for SMEs to conduct CSR activities is by collaborating with large firms in conducting the activities. Yet, it can be more beneficial for large firms as they will get the most exposure, such as from the media (Preuss, 2011).

Other than that, SMEs can consociate with large firms to carry out CSR activities through the supply chain (Companies Commission of Malaysia, 2013; Inyang, 2013). Large firms may implement CSR standards in the supply chain which need to be adhered to. If SMEs were to implement the standards on their own, they would have to bear the high costs that are incurred in the process, such as essential resources and skills (Ciliberti, Pontrandolfo, & Scozzi,
Therefore, it is better for SMEs to work together with large firms. This shows that despite the limitations encountered by the SMEs, there are ways that SMEs can be associated with CSR.

In the context of CSR studies in Malaysia, previous studies focused more on the relationship between CSR and the non-financial performance of firms as well as CSR disclosures (Mohd Nasir et al., 2015). Moreover, the studies also focused on large firms. As mentioned earlier, findings on large firms cannot represent SMEs due to the differences in their characteristics, limitations and challenges.

It is vital to conduct a study and explore CSR in the context of SMEs. This is because of the large contribution on SMEs to Malaysia’s economy. The contributions are primarily in terms of GDP and total employment (SME Corporation Malaysia, 2018). Table 1 portrays the distribution of the SME GDP from various economic sectors of SMEs (SME Corporation Malaysia, 2018).

Table 1: SME GDP by Key Economic Sector (constant 2010 prices)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SME GDP by Economic Sector</th>
<th>SME Contribution to GDP</th>
<th>SME GDP Growth</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Share (%) 2010</td>
<td>2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall(^2)</td>
<td>32.2</td>
<td>37.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>4.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mining &amp; Quarrying</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>0.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>8.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Services</td>
<td>19.6</td>
<td>22.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Thus, with their significant roles in Malaysia’s economy, any social and environmental initiatives taken by SMEs are crucial and become an important contribution to the society as well as give positive impacts to the society and the economy (Companies Commission of Malaysia, 2013).

Additionally, the implementation of CSR can help to benefit businesses in numerous ways. Firstly, it can increase competitive advantage (Companies Commission of Malaysia, 2013). By having CSR, it can differentiate products and services from other brands.

Furthermore, as the customers are more aware of the issues regarding the environment and the workplace, such as
climate change and inequality in the workplace, they are more inclined to choose products that are manufactured under responsible conditions (Companies Commission of Malaysia, 2013).

This can help SMEs to improve their businesses and get recognized by potential customers. Secondly, CSR can also help in retaining employees (Azman & Mustapha, 2018; Thorne, Ferrell, & Ferrell, 2011). Policies related to responsible work conduct, such as work life balance, safety and health requirements and equality in the workplace can strengthen employees’ loyalty (Companies Commission of Malaysia, 2013).

5. Conclusion
There is a positive and increasing advancement in the study of CSR in Malaysia. Previous studies have focused on large firms instead of SMEs as well as the disclosure and reporting of CSR. Therefore, it is important to close the gap in the CSR literature by exploring CSR in the context of SMEs. Furthermore, future studies can contribute to the body of knowledge by considering other factors that contribute to the implementation of CSR in the future.

References


# A Review of Cyberloafing Predictors in Literature

## Huda M. Mashal

Doctor of Business Administration (DBA) from Walden University Amman, Jordan.  
[hu.ash.mashal@waldenu.edu](mailto:hu.ash.mashal@waldenu.edu)

**ARTICLE DETAILS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>History</th>
<th>ABSTRACT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Revised format:</strong> May 2020</td>
<td>Surfing the Internet for personal purposes during working hours is known as cyberloafing. Employers consider cyberloafing as a counterproductive behavior that causes productivity losses. Researchers, however, have demonstrated to find cyberloafing beneficial for the employees' social and emotional needs. It is essential to investigate the causes of cyberloafing to predict the behavior and recommend the appropriate workplace Internet use policies in favor of employee productivity. This paper will provide the main tested cyberloafing predictors in the literature. This paper will provide academic information necessary for establishing future researches on cyberloafing.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Keywords**

Cyberloafing; cyberslacking; predictors; non-work related activities, internet browsing

**JEL Classification:**  
M1, M15

© 2020 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: hu.ash.mashal@waldenu.edu


## 1. Introduction

The Internet is a core tool in the workplace of the 21st century. The Internet facilitates new organizational activities, improves communication, and enhances productivity. However, the open-access of the Internet provides an opportunity for the employees to engage in non-work-related activities (Mashi & Salimon, 2016) and waste time at work (Betts, Setterstorm, Pearson, & Totty, 2014; Gökcearslan, Mumcu, Haslaman, & Cevik, 2016). Office workers may engage in checking, sending, and receiving e-mails, visiting entertainment and social media sites, web browsing, and online shopping (Baturay & Toker, 2015). The behavior of employees surfing the Internet for non-work purposes is referred to as cyberloafing (Aghaz & Sheikh, 2016; Liberman, Seidman, McKenna, & Buffardi, 2011; O’Neill, Hambley, & Bercovich, 2014; Restubog et al., 2011; Vitak, Crouse, & LaRose, 2011).

Some researchers (e.g., Coker, 2011; König & Caner de la Guardia, 2013; Lim & Chen, 2012) have reported the advantages that employees have when taking small breaks in workplaces for Internet browsing. In some studies, employee productivity increased when the employer permitted the use of Internet browsing breaks in the workplace (Coker, 2013). Moreover, employees who engage in personal web usage may support behaviors to balance family/work requirements, improve career advancement, and enhance job skills (Anandarajan, Simmers, & D’Ovidio, 2011; König & Caner de la Guardia, 2013). Therefore, there is research to demonstrate that the time spent engaging in personal tasks might not be as harmful as it may seem initially.

It is essential to identify the causes of cyberloafing to understand this phenomenon and propose an appropriate solution to balance productivity and employee needs. A summary of the tested cyberloafing predictors in the literature...
would provide academic information necessary for establishing future researches on cyberloafing. This paper will consist of three sections. The first section includes identifying terms of cyberloafing in the literature. The second involves a discussion of the cyberloafing predictors along with results reported by the researchers and finally the conclusion and recommendations for future researches.

2. Cyberloafing Definitions in Literature

In the literature, cyberloafing describes a set of behaviors where an employee engages in electronic activities that his or her direct supervisor would not consider job-related (Askew, Buckner, Taing, Ilie, & Bauer, 2014). Lim (2002) identified cyberloafing as “voluntary acts of employees using their companies’ Internet access for non-work-related purposes during working hours”; and “a counterproductive work-place behavior resulting in production deviance” (p. 677).

The other most used term ‘Cyberslacking’ is defined as the extension of typical counterproductive workplace behavior that involves distraction and putting off work to ‘surf the Internet’ for nonwork purposes (O’Neill et al., 2014). Lesser-used terms used to refer to the same phenomenon include internet deviance, cyberbludging, online loafing, internet abuse, problematic internet use, internet addiction, internet dependency, and internet addiction disorder (Kim & Byrne, 2011). Cyberloafing examples include browsing social networks, news, sports, Youtube, online gaming, and online shopping (Cinar & Karciglou, 2015).

Kim and Byrne (2011) created seven empirical terms to define Internet usage for non-work related activities at the workplace. The terms were personal web usage (PWU), cyberloafing, non-work-related computing (NWRC), Internet abuses, problematic Internet use (PIU), Internet addictions, and Internet addiction disorder (IAD) (Kim & Byrne, 2011).

The results revealed that employees consider cyberloafing, PWU, and NWRC positive behaviors because they provide more flexibility for Internet users who feel happy and more productive (Kim & Byrne, 2011). Others perceived Internet abuse, PIU, Internet addiction, and IAD as negative behaviors that cause productivity losses, reduce bandwidth, and cause legal issues (Kim & Byrne, 2011). As a result, people have different attitudes toward different concepts and do not perceive PWU, NWRC, and cyberloafing as prohibited behaviors like Internet abuse, Internet addiction, PIU, and IAD.

Cyberloafing was described as a form of psychological withdrawal behavior, where employees escape mentally from the workplace (Cinar & Karciglou, 2015). Also, researchers consider cyberloafing work deviance behavior. Voluntary surfing the Internet means breaking the organizational norms (Cinar & Karciglou, 2015). Other terms like cyber deviance, Internet abuse, workplace internet leisure browsing, and junk computing describe nonwork-related use of the Internet (Cinar & Karciglou, 2015; Vitak et al., 2011).

Organizations must identify unproductive behaviors to understand the relevant causes and develop fair and acceptable Internet use policies for employees (Strader, Simpson, & Clayton, 2009).

2.1. Predictors of Cyberloafing

Organizations encounter increasing global concern regarding the Internet use for personal purposes during working hours, which is known as cyberslacking or cyberloafing (Liberman et al., 2011). As a result, researchers from different cultures focused on investigating and exploring the causes of cyberloafing as a way to predict the behavior before it exists.

Recognizing the predictors of cyberloafing will enable researchers to understand this counterproductive behavior, guide employers to utilize Internet use to their benefits, and increase employee development and productivity in the workplace. The most critical cyberloafing predictors in literature are:

2.2. Demographic Factors

Age, gender, and computer skills were predictors of cyberloafing behavior at the workplace (Baturay & Toker, 2015). Chen and Nath (2016) considered gender and Internet skills as predictors of cyberloafing whereas Baturay and Toker
(2015) reported that skilled men in using the Internet for cyberloafing were more than women and intermediate users in schools. Skilled employees who perform their job activities using the Internet would practice cyberloafing behavior (Betts et al., 2014).

Men spend more time than women in surfing the Internet (Ferreira & Esteves, 2016). Also, researchers noted that men and women have different purposes of Internet use; women use the Internet for social interaction while men use the Internet for entertainment (Lim & Nam, 2016).

Men believe that cyberloafing time is a decisive action that enhances employees’ productivity (Lim & Chen, 2012; Messarra & Karkoulian, 2011; Restubog et al., 2011; Vitak et al., 2011). However, females in Iranian study exhibited higher cyberloafing compared to males (see Rahimnia & Mazidi, 2015). Therefore, it is incorrect to generalize that men cyberloaf more than women, especially in conservative societies.

Young male employees cyberloaf more than old male employees (Lim & Chen, 2012; Messarra & Karkoulian, 2011; Restubog et al., 2011; Vitak et al., 2011). Because old people do not have computer skills in using the Internet (Chang, McAllister, & McCaslin, 2015). In the United States, young men exhibited cyberslacking more than young women (Vitak et al., 2011). Therefore, Age, gender, and computer skills are important predictors for employees’ cyberloafing.

2.3. Personality Traits

Researchers have examined the impact of the five personality traits (extraversion, openness, agreeableness, conscientiousness, emotional stability) on Internet addiction.

Kim and Byrne (2011) identified Internet addiction as the loss of control over a tedious practice regardless of the negative outcomes. Servidio (2014) tested two hypotheses to investigate the risk factors for Internet addiction in a sample of Italian university students. The results revealed that the risk of Internet addiction increases with personality traits like extraversion, openness, and agreeableness (Servidio, 2014).

Moreover, Jia, Jia, & Karauin (2013) tested the relationship between the five personality factors and cyberloafing in a workplace that has an Internet usage policy. The results revealed that cyberloafing decreases when employees implement the Internet usage policy at work and they have personality traits like conscientiousness and emotional stability (Jia et al., 2013). The personality traits of employees are significant predictors for cyberloafing and Internet addiction.

2.4. Self-Control

Self-control is a human trait that can expect cyberloafing behavior among employees. People having low levels of self-control will engage in cyberloafing (Restubog et al., 2011). Procrastination and neuroticism can predict cyberloafing in the remote working environment (O’Neill et al., 2014).

Remote employees with personality traits like agreeableness, conscientiousness, and honesty will exhibit low cyberloafing (O’Neill et al., 2014). The remote workplaces should hire people of high self-control to control the personal use of the Internet.

2.5. Level of Work Commitment

Employees committed to work will not browse the Internet during working hours (D’Abate, 2005; Paulsen, 2015). He, Zhu, and Zheng (2014) considered the job and personal resources were predictors of work commitment.

Committed employees are proactive, productive, focused, adaptive to the changing work environment, have positive emotions toward their jobs, have good health, and create an environment that encourages work engagement (He et al., 2014). Employers need to improve the workplace environment to advance work commitment.

However, improper management of a workplace may result in a free time that encourages employees to waste their time in personal activities such as cyberloafing (Paulsen, 2015). Moreover, uncommitted employees will cyberloaf
Sustainable Business and Society in Emerging Economies

Vol. 2, No 1, June 2020

and resist performing their job activities (Paulsen, 2015).

The level of employee commitment at work depends on the organizational policy to minimize empty labor and promote the sense of work commitment. Liberman et al. (2011) investigated six individual and organizational factors: job involvement, intrinsic involvement, managerial support for Internet use, a coworker’s perceived cyberloafing, attitude towards cyberloafing, and non-internet loafing.

The results indicated that cyberloafing decreases with increasing job involvement and intrinsic involvement. However, cyberloafing increases with increasing managerial support for Internet use, a coworker’s perceived cyberloafing, attitude towards cyberloafing, and non-internet loafing (Liberman et al., 2011). Finally, employers should administer formal Internet usage policies and provide an active work environment to reduce cyberloafing.

2.6. Work/family Duties

Family duties and obligations may affect the behavior of employees using the Internet at work according to the work/family border theory (König & Caner de la Guardia, 2013). König and Caner de la Guardia (2013) stated that work/family border theory does not explain the Internet use at work for personal purposes.

Employees engage in personal Internet activities at work to meet private demands and obligations even when the employer identifies the job with the restricted use of computers (D’Abate, 2005; König & Caner de la Guardia, 2013). Employers need to apply organizational policies and procedures that consider the employee’s personal lives and family duties.

2.7. Subjective Social Norms, Attitudes, Perceived Behavioral Control and Emotional Intentions

The theory of planned behavior (TPB) presented cyberloafing as a withdrawal behavior; why employees engage in cyberloafing when they are at rest. TPB indicates that subjective social norms, attitudes, and perceived behavioral control are predictors to practice a behavior (Askew et al., 2014). Employers can predict cyberloafing through subjective descriptive norms, cyberloafing attitudes, and perceived ability to hide cyberloafing (Askew et al., 2014).

Researchers implemented the TPB to demonstrate the motivations of cyberloafing in a case study of an Iranian company (Askew et al., 2014). The results supported the theoretical framework (Sheikh, Atashgah, & Adibzadegan, 2015).

Employers may reduce the cyberloafing behavior by applying proper Internet usage policies, increasing the transparency of computer activities, and improving the organizational culture (Sheikh et al., 2015). Therefore, the TPB theory will support the identification of cyberloafing predictors.

Also, the theory of interpersonal behavior (TIB) focuses on predicting behaviors related to emotional intentions (Betts et al., 2014) that can be a cause of Internet misuse during working hours (Moody & Siponen, 2013). Moody and Siponen (2013) proposed a model to predict the behavior of personal uses of the Internet and tested the antecedents of attitude, social factors, affect habits and intentions.

The model was successful in predicting the behavior of personal Internet usage (Moody & Siponen, 2013). Moody and Siponen (2013) concluded that organizations should identify the perceived benefits to encourage employees to reduce the personal use of the Internet. Therefore, the TIB theory explained the cyberloafing predictors.

3. Conclusion

The Internet is a basic business tool for any business, and business leaders need to accept that employees do surf the Internet for non-work-related activities during working hours. In literature, researchers described this behavior through different terms, but the most used term was cyberloafing.

Demographic factors, the big five personality traits, self-control, level of work engagement, work/family duties, social norms, attitudes, perceived behavioral control, and emotional intentions were important predictors of cyberloafing. Employers are responsible for developing organizational policies and procedures for Internet use in the workplace to
provide a safe, productive, and fair workplace environment for their employees. Future studies focusing on exploring other cyberloafing predictors will improve academic literature.
References


Mashi, M. S., & Salimon, M. G. (2016). Consideration of future consequences as an antecedent of employee


Impact of Islamic Microfinance on Women borrower’s Happiness: A Psychological and Economic Theoretical Perspective in Southern Punjab, Pakistan

1Sana Fayyaz, 2Fatima Khurram, 3Samar Fahd

1Assistant Professor, Department of Economics, Govt. Sadiq College University of Bahawalpur, Pakistan, sana.fayyaz@gscwu.edu.pk
2Assistant Professor, Department of Applied Psychology, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Pakistan, Fatima.khurram@iub.edu.pk
3Lecturer, Department of Applied Psychology, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Pakistan, samarphd14@nip.edu.pk

ARTICLE DETAILS

History
Revised format: May 2020
Available Online: June 2020

Keywords
microfinance, happiness, women
Bahawalpur, Pakistan, Islamic, women

JEL Classification:
M20, M21

ABSTRACT

The present research endeavors to see how Islamic microfinance can be utilized to expand happiness in females and keep up reasonable financial advancement in Southern Punjab, Pakistan. It will examine how the standards of Islamic microfinance help ladies in expanding their happiness. It additionally set forth light on the linkage between the monetary turn of events and satisfaction. The review will be led in Bahawalpur the State of Southern Punjab, Pakistan. It will likewise be viewed as that religion is definitely not a blocking component to the usage of Islamic microfinance. It will likewise accept that Islamic microfinance working together with the privilege financial and fiscal arrangements structure, will contribute emphatically to expand joy among ladies in Pakistan.

© 2020 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: sana.fayyaz@gscwu.edu.pk


1. Introduction

Increasing happiness has been an unambiguous or absolute purpose for the group of the individuals of the nation as well as the world. In the life of every human, money has crucial importance. In this respect microfinance alludes to making little credits accessible to destitute individuals (particularly those generally rejected from money related administrations that is ladies) through projects planned explicitly to meet their specific needs and conditions (Khan, 2008). By a gauge, the effort of microfinance establishments is just 4 to 7 percent of the absolute potential market of 25 to 30 million borrowers (State Bank of Pakistan, 2006). While, the legislature of Pakistan has set an objective of arriving at 10 million microfinance clients continually 2015 (Ibrar & Saad, 2013). Predominantly, Non-Islamic microfinance is a loan providing services especially targeting for women and small scale businesses for those that do not have approach to banking and the other associated services. There are two primary instruments for the customers to get the financial services which are as: (1) banking for individuals and small scale or micro level businesses and (2)
group-supported programs, wherever a few people meet up to pertain for loans and different services as a set of individuals. In a few areas, for example Southern Africa and Pakistan microfinance is used for the procurement of loans to poor individuals that is alike to the finance program persistent in conventional banking. Consequently, Islamic microfinance performs a dynamic role aimed at to the betterment of the circumstances of women in Pakistan as it is different from conventional loaning system and according to Islamic sharia, it gives them spiritual satisfaction as well (Christen, Rosenberg, & Jayadeva, 2004).

Thus, Islamic Microfinance is a zone with an unfathomable potential to develop. It is assessed that 72% of the people living in pervasively. Muslims used conventional cash related things, however various surveys showed that in case they had choice they would use sharia-consistence budgetary things. One of Islamic targets is to help the most frail people that accounted in the microfinance vital. Today, the Islamic microfinance is moved in three countries: Indonesia, Bangladesh and Sudan. As demonstrated by Consultative Group to Assist the Poor (CGAP) (2016) study, 300,000 customers were concerned by the Islamic microfinance through 126 associations working in 14 countries and around 80,000 customers are associated with an arrangement of Indonesian cooperatives. Nevertheless, in Islamic countries, Islamic microfinance is up ’til now a little bit of microfinance. It as often as possible makes on account of government support as in Pakistan in 2007, where rules were made to propel improvement (Juliette, 2013).

Now a day, people switched from conventional microfinance to Islamic microfinance because of two out of numerous explanations behind the hole can be introduced here. One, that the quantity of individuals who are living in neediness is huge particularly in country regions and also, there are numerous potential merited customers who decrease the customary microfinance attributes and credits due to rebelliousness with Shariah of Islam. In addition, the traditional microfinance plans of activities dependent on intrigue (Riba) are precluded in Islam and subsequently, can't be utilized by and for the Muslims (Rahman, 2007). Likewise, there is a colossal appealing business sector for Islamic microfinance foundations in Pakistan. Islamic microfinance foundations are the associations that can make light of a job in bringing the hole and give chance to those potential customers who would prefer not to profit the administrations offered by customary microfinance organizations. In addition, Islamic microfinance is reasonable for Pakistan in light of the overwhelmingly Muslim populace as well as on account of the attention on the formation of a simply monetary framework (Kazim & Haider, 2012).

Currently, the network of Islamic banking industry consisted of 22 Islamic banking institutions; 5 full-fledged Islamic banks (IBs) and 17 conventional banks having standalone Islamic banking branches (IBBs) by end December, 2018 (State bank of Pakistan, 2018). Thus, financing through Islamic Banking System, the role of microfinance has renewed into Islamic microfinance in Muslim nations. Therefore, this Islamic micro financing targeting the Islamic financial standards of equity which requires to lighten neediness and to empower the destitute individuals especially vulnerable women to make them capable by offering monetary types of assistance to lead a respectable and a tolerable life (Farooq & Khan, 2014).

Commonly, a part of an ostensible Pakistani Islamic traditional society, woman has a financial dependency on man. Therefore, women have been marginalized often as a more vulnerable members of society. Mostly, it has been seen that females have to face the various boundaries imposed by the male dominant societies of underdeveloped and developing nations. At the community level without their male individuals they are not allowed to move outside the home and make contacts. Thus, the only way to get rid of this vulnerability is that when they are independent because of their own money they feel powerful psychologically. This feeling gives them self-confidence that leads them to be happy in their daily life decisions (Yasmeen & Karim, 2014, Blumberg, 1984).

Henceforth, in perspective of happiness it is enormously necessary to reduce the inequality of getting opportunities for women. This inequality is very common in the world, but are more present in under developing nations. On the whole women’s function is as imperative as a men’s position in giving power to the family and growth of the nation. She is eligible to the equal privileges and benefits as their partner nevertheless, the developing countries represent a unlike situation. There is an inborn difficulty that stops women from contributing in the decision making process and this will deny them from having happiness in their lives (Rehman, 2007). Thus, it is remembered that the above dialog
robust that Islamic microfinance performs a significant role that leads to happiness of women in least developing nations. As they have finance they feel happiness in psychological perspective and economically they feel stable.

2. Literature Review

Happiness may be characterized as a positive enthusiastic state that is most broad and, subsequently, not limited to any particular circumstances or occasions (Kitayama, Markus and Matsumoto, 1995, 2000). Frey and Stutzer (2002) stated that happiness gives the different things and meanings to distinctive individuals. It is interested in everybody to characterize for themselves what Happiness is. They identified the concepts of happiness from the concept of subjective happiness. This subjective happiness (adapted from survey) will affect the objective happiness (scientific measures). The objective happiness will give feedback as cognition and memory to get indications of individuals’ evaluations of happiness (Conceição & Bandura, 2008). Thus, Budriute & Makovska (2008) have illustrated their views in Latvia that the as main contributors of women happiness identified by marital status, employment status, household income and political trust.

In contrast women are at greater threat in terms of financial stability, occupation and living in male overwhelmed culture. There is no opportunity for them to grow in emerging countries. They have rising disparity in various societal and civilizing modes. It is due to the effect of many variables for example, absence of education, unemployment and marriages in young age and family hostility which have banned women from accomplishing better elevation. Furthermore the low condition of women is not only for the reason that of the norms of the society but it is engrained in the governmental and financial structure, which should be changed. Women put in the course of their effort in sustaining the family unit but it is not acknowledged as physical work. They are monetarily and communally reliant on male part of the family. Females do not get advantage from the standing as men in various respects (Rehman, 2007). Thus, to come out this alarming situation the Islamic microfinance is the best way to support the vulnerable women in the context of Islamic state and values.

On the same ground, Hassan and Saleem, (2017) revealed the some interesting facts of Islamic micro financing regarding poor women and noticed that the increase in women’s income and assets played a very important role in enhancing women’s economic independence (Economically) and sense of self-confidence (Psychologically). It helped in breaking the cycle of poverty they live in and allowed them to have more control over their lives and economic decisions. Thus, the Islamic microfinance is way to provide a smooth financial services to facilitate the women.

Therefore, there is a great need of Islamic microfinance in Pakistan to increase the level of happiness among women especially in Pakistan. As there are very few work on the importance and applicability of Islamic microfinance in Pakistan. Hence, availability of Islamic microfinance plays an important role in happiness of women that will further leads to the betterment of family and society. Thus the present research will emphasis on the Impact of Islamic Microfinance on Women Borrowers happiness in Bahawalpur, Punjab, Pakistan. The current paper will make contribution to increase the happiness level of women.

3. Problem Statement

From the above critical assessment the problem statement mainly focuses on the issue of happiness of women which has been affected by lack of finance and critical socio-cultural conditions. Islamic microfinance significantly attributes to the economic development and progress of countries through involving themselves in some sort of economic activities with confidence and thus improving their quality of life which leads to happiness. Thus, Islamic microfinance plays an important role because, many people are far from the facilities given by old conventional microfinance system.

Meanwhile, majority of the Pakistan’s population belong to remote regions. The province of Punjab especially, southern Punjab is particularly renowned as a patriarchal society. Females are the symbol of respect of males and not given their due human rights (Rehman, 2007). As per authority human rights of females are preoccupied with male rights (Maria, 2003). The people of Pakistan are extreme cohorts of conservative society. The parents of the girl conduct the social training for her as to obey and serve men in every situation, whether it is about household chores or critical matters of life like to choose the life partner and the decision of having number of children is also taken by the male member of the family (Shareef et al., 2012). However economic activities which have been highlighted in
previous studies but not in the context of Islamic microfinance so it still require further exploration.

The social implications of women stature in such a conservative society asks for a contained access to resources whether they be of economic or non-economic nature (Maria, 2003). This deprivation of women is caused by lack of earnings. The low economic status of women asks for the economic liberation and acknowledgement of women as decision makers in economic and personal lives.

This authorization may lead in the alleviation of the traditional exploitative customs, thereby relieving the next generation of these inordinate bounds exercised on women (Younas, 2007). Women in Pakistan are unable to start their own business because of lack of finance (Shabbir and Gregorio, 1996). As in the words of Khan (2007), the National Commission on the Status of Women (NCSW) survey- 2016 of home-based workers in Pakistan investigated that minority of women voted for home-based workers whereas majority of women voted to have loans to start their own business. There is a need of women authorization and liberation in order to empower them in their personal and economic capacities. Thus, there is essential to study the effect of economic activity on women borrowers’ happiness (Laila, 2006).

In this expression the world happiness report (2019) that out of 155 countries, rather the rank of Pakistan in happiness is 67 at the world level, but the downward changes in the happiness level occurs from (2017-2018) is in negative (-0.312), which shows that happiness of the Pakistan is decreasing gradually due to the poor quality of life (World Happiness Report, 2019).

Even the rate of change in happiness of Bangladesh, India, Sri Lanka and Afghanistan are also decreasing gradually (-0.195, -1.137, -0.030, -0.520) respectively, except Pakistan and Nepal whose happiness level is increasing 67 (+0.703) and 100 (0.328) in 2019. While in 2017-2018 both are on 81 (-0.312) and 121 (-0.143) correspondingly, which shows the living standard is getting better day by day. Henceforth in the greater part of the emerging nations, micro credit especially encourages the underprivileged individuals to begin little business with a specific end goal to build their income, and as an outcome to accomplish a superior expectation for everyday comforts for themselves and their families (Jamal, 2008).

Islamic Microfinance is a tool to increase living standard of people in developing countries by increasing their income levels and better sustenance for family members. Women are a key factor in development of society and country. Most of the research is done on the women in the Western countries. Pakistani culture and societal norms are bit different as compared to other societies in the west. Steady quality of life may generate a different impact on lives of women in a Pakistani society as compared to other countries. It is wildly believed that participation of women in labor force improve the monetary independence of women which indicates towards happiness, satisfaction in life and in improving quality of life. Hence, there is great need to study on women in Pakistan in the context of Islamic microfinance.

Islamic Microfinance is a new field in Pakistan as it emerges in Pakistan in 2007. There are few researches in the context of women with respect to Islamic microfinance. In Pakistan, this takes latest scrutiny prospect that will try to inaugurate a dynamic part of Islamic microfinance with happiness in women. It is highly essential to realize the effect

\[1\) n.a; not available.
of Islamic microfinance with happiness of women and supportive factors. Moreover, the studies have been overseen in distinctive view. Thus, the most offended side of the society are women. Hence this is a important prerequisite to give attention on the latest alarming problems that expands the meaning of happiness amongst females.

4. Methodology
The most suitable research design for this study will be Quantitative. The methodology will be used mostly by regression analysis and doing correlation of cross-sectional data. A few other inquiries are involved in the interviews to reflect the details regarding the happiness of the women via Islamic microfinance. Also, interviews are conducted with the field officers of the Islamic microfinance program managed by Islamic banks providing microfinance loans.

4.1 Design of the Study
For this study, the most appropriate research design will be quantitative. Therefore, women borrowers will be the principle objective of this research to investigate the impact of Islamic microfinance. Moreover, to fulfil the analyst needs the correlational methodology will be appropriate to identify the crucial components that relates to the dependent variable. A representation of population will be taken as a significant conclusion. It will be depicted around a fact in a specified time that is representative of the total population. Further, to collect the data a survey questionnaire will be used.

4.2 Participants
A sample of 164 women from the population will be selected as a participant of the study. The current research expects to investigate the impact of Islamic microfinance on Women’s borrower’s happiness. The ages of females from 18 to 65 years will be selected as a sample of the present study from the division Bahawalpur, Southern Punjab, Pakistan. Therefore, G* power technique will be used to collect the data by using non-random sampling technique. Convenience Sampling will be used for sampling procedure.

4.3 Data Analysis
The Partial Least Square software will be used for the Structural equation modeling for the analysis of data collected by the questionnaire survey. For this purpose, descriptive statistics will use for each measurement of the research.

5. Conclusions
Wrapping up, the current research is estimated to endorse considerably on women borrower’s happiness in under developing country like Pakistan. The present research will be a great support in literature review. The previous researches focused on only the relationship of the variables. Nevertheless, the current study will put emphasis on the remaining important factors that are under studied till now. Specifically, this research will be a revolutionary endeavor to broaden the literature. In economic research this study will have many societal and concrete effects.

Accordingly, in emerging good community the current research focuses the key factors that having an impact on the Pakistani society. These dynamics are acknowledged as an important factor which is ignored at policy level in Pakistan. The key points in the present research is Islamic microfinance will improve the happiness of women because it also fulfills their spiritual satisfaction. Women may have more comfortable when there are no economic restraints. The vital purpose of life of a woman is being at peace which may indicate towards respectable happiness in life.

References


Micro Credit Improve Well-being of Borrowers in the Punjab (Pakistan)? Pakistan Economic and Social Review, 31-47.


# Effect of Corporate Governance and Capital Structure on Corporate Performance in Malaysian Listed Companies: A Conceptual Approach

**1Fauzan, 2Azhar Bin Abdul Rahman, 3Marhaiza Binti Ibrahim**

1PhD Scholar, Department of Tunku Puteri Intan Safinaz School of Accountancy, Universiti Utara Malaysia, fauzansholeh76@gmail.com  
2Professor, Department of Tunku Puteri Intan Safinaz School of Accountancy, Universiti Utara Malaysia, azhar258@uum.edu.my  
3Senior Lecturer, Department of Tunku Puteri Intan Safinaz School of Accountancy, Universiti Utara Malaysia, marhaiza@uum.edu.my

## ARTICLE DETAILS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>History</th>
<th>ABSTRACT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Revised format: May 2020</td>
<td><strong>Purpose:</strong> Corporate governance and capital structure are seen as significant factors in improving corporate performance. Many researches focusing on how the corporate governance connected to the capital structure have been conducted. However, the information involving public firms in Malaysia remains scarce. Hence, this research aims to advance a conceptual framework that perceive the two major factors; corporate governance and capital structure, towards the performance of public firms in Malaysia.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Available Online: June 2020</td>
<td><strong>Design/Methodology/Approach:</strong> The annual reports of the companies registered in Bursa Malaysia (year 2013 to 2016) was used as the secondary data. The data was extracted using Thomson Reuters Data Stream Version 5.1 which available at the Sultanah Bahiyah Library of Universiti Utara Malaysia.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Keywords</th>
<th><strong>Implications/Originality/Value:</strong> The information provided in this study will serve as an added knowledge to redefine the corporate governance policy and capital structure towards strengthening the role of corporate governance and capital structure in public firms in Malaysia. This research will facilitate further enhancement of the company performances and benefit the financial report users, creditors, investors, shareholders, as well as stakeholders in public firms in this country.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Corporate Governance, Capital Structure, Corporate Performance, Malaysia</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>JEL Classification:</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>L26, L31</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

© 2020 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: fauzansholeh76@gmail.com


## 1. Introduction

Corporate performance has always been a major concern among the stakeholders within a company, including the proprietor, investor, supplier as well as the employee (Jaffar & Abdul-Shukor, 2016; Madrid-Guijarro et al., 2018).
According to the researchers, a solid company performance will allow the company to produce trade opportunities and increase prosperity. Truncated performing companies are commonly not competitive and more likely to experience financial difficulties (Brigham & Houston, 2014). Therefore, it is important for a company to review their performance over the period in stripe with constant changes in the commercial situation (Najmi et al., 2005). Performance dimension will inform companies to income appropriate achievement and change their strategy to secure the company's upcoming (Najmi et al., 2005). Parker (2000) highlighted numerous reasons urging the needs of an organization to quantify their performance. These include to evaluate the achievement of the company, to determine whether there is an increase in profit, to understand the process of all activities occurring within the company, to recognize where problems may ascend and actions to be taken to correct them, to meet customer needs and to ensure that decisions are made according to a proper evaluation.

Corporate governance has been reported to give influence on the performance of a company (Abidin et al., 2009; Ahmed Haji, 2014; Akpan & Amran, 2014; Al-Ghamdi & Rhodes, 2015; Apadore & Zainol, 2014; Bahreini & Zain, 2013; Ghazali, 2010; Haniffa & Hudaib, 2006; Johl et al., 2015; Ong et al., 2015), capital structure (Ali et al., 2016; Ana et al., 2012; Basit & Hassan, 2017; Bhattarai, 2016; Goyal, 2013; Salim & Yadav, 2012; San & Heng, 2011; Tharmila & Arulvel, 2013; Vătavu, 2015; Zeitun & Tian, 2007). Corporate governance is an established instrument that is adopted to ensure that directors and managers make decisions and operate the company in a way that benefits the stakeholders (Lashgari, 2004). This mechanism includes the procedures, duties, rules, regulations and organizations that affect the way companies are governed, directed, or measured. The Malaysian Code on Corporate Governance (MCCG) 2017 (Mustapha & Ahmad, 2011) stating that the corporate governance is a term that is regularly used to describe procedures and constructions in directing and managing corporate business activities to enhance shareholder productivity.

In Malaysia, the corporate background has been sparked by several cases of corporate governance that have a poor record of history such as Renong in 1997 that made loans and had to incur the debt of RM 20 billion (Malaysia Today, 2010). In addition, the Malaysia Airlines System (MAS) in 1999 suffered losses of RM 260 million, while Perwaja Steel in 2004 suffered losses of RM 2.56 billion (Utaranews, 2017). Transmile in 2007 and the Klang Free Zone (PKFZ) in 2009 also suffered losses of RM 227 million and RM 254.85 million, respectively (Malaysia Kini, 2016). In addition to the trust cases, the Minority Shareholder Watchdog Group (KPPSM / MSWG) in 2017 released statistical data on corporate governance obtained from the publicly listed companies on Bursa Malaysia. Based on these statistical data, corporate governance in Malaysia seems to continue to decline and increase (MSWG, 2017).

As such, the Malaysian administration has reserved steps to evaluate and support the corporate governance wherein 1998, the Malaysian Institute of Corporate Governance (MICG) was set up to develop corporate governance in Malaysia. One of its main responsibilities is to develop better practice guidelines by taking examples from companies in other developed countries around the world. Besides, another factor that causes fluctuations in a company’s performance is the capital structure. Capital structure is the approach taken by a company to finance its sources of investment (assets) through the proportions of liability and impartiality (Saad, 2010). Brockington (1990) and Ahmadpour & Yahyazadehfar (2010) describes the capital structure as a component of financing sources consisting of equity and debt.

Generally, companies can choose different types of capital structure. Based on the financial theory, capital
structure is said to affect the financing of a firm and its economic presentation (Abor, 2005). It also influences the commercial activity of a company since it involves the managements of financial resources that available to conduct commercial activities. The breather of the paper is organized as surveys. The following discussion will include the summary of the previous researches that focusing on the hypothetical background of the association between the corporate governance and the corporate performance as well as the corresponding hypotheses that have been developed in this study.

2. Literature Review
An overview of the literature related to the topics under review is corporate performance, corporate governance, and capital structure.

2.1 Corporate Performance
The corporate performance is assessed by its achievement or the marketplace situation (Hooley et al., 2001). According to Abu-Jarad et al., (2010) most educations have created that dissimilar firms in dissimilar states incline to provide dissimilar presentation evaluation criteria. Several publications have suggested the monetary productivity and development of the company as the greatest commonly used criteria for evaluating corporate performance. Several scholars take trusted on particular presentation criteria for a company such as creation achievement, sales and marketplace part development, and productivity associated to their projections (Maury, 2006). Other researchers use impartial presentation criteria in relations of revenue, efficiency, distribute sales, productivity, maintenance efficiency, timely delivery, volume consumption, and value (Lind et al., 2000). The use of such objective performance standards is the simplest way to evaluate a company's presentation. Corporate performance also remains restrained by means of long-term criteria such as market presentation and short-term criteria such as a non-market presentation. Some examples of the standards that can be used are the market value addition (MVA), economic value addition (EVA), cash flow growth, earnings per share (EPS), asset growth, dividend growth, and sales growth (Abdullah, 2004; Coles et al., 2001).

However, this research will use returns on assets (ROA) and returns on equity (ROE) as indicators to assess company performance. This method was adopted in the previous study by Dehaene et al., (2001) in their research regarding the firms in Belgium and several other studies such done by Haniffa & Hudaib, (2006) and Aik Leng & Abu Mansor, (2005). Brown and Caylor (2005) also used ROA and ROE as key measures in assessing the corporate presentation. The data of the profit before interest and tax were used as it reflects the company's actual performance and acts as a dependent variable. Additionally, this research will also use the Tobin Q and Intellectual Capital Value Added to measure the company performance.

2.2 Corporate Governance
Corporate governance could be described as the process of how the organization is operated. This process requires stability among the responsibilities of the numerous stakeholders to achieve the financial purposes of the association (Bonn & Fisher, 2005). Corporate governance involves the use of systems or instruments that guides the company management to a decision making that will benefits its stakeholders (Denis & McConnell, 2003). Corporate governance is mainly developed to observe the behaviour of diverse stakeholders and to decrease the agency costs related to principal and agent relationships (Lashgari, 2004; Runhui et al., 2011; Xu & Qiu, 2012). Arora and Sharma (2016) studied the companies of the 20 most important industries in India. They found out that large board size tends to give an advantage to the board of directors, especially to the decision-makers, and consequently affect the financial performance of a company. However, Arora and Sharma (2016) reported that quality does not show a significant part in the presentation of the company, especially on ROE.

The researches that studied on the influence of corporate governance towards the performance of companies in Malaysia has not produced any conclusive results. Ghazali (2010) in his research of 87 non-financial companies listed under the composite index in Malaysia reported that the company performance was not significantly affected by its corporate governance. Abidin et al., (2009) in their research of 75 firms revealed that the importance of the independent directors that was highlighted by the MCCG (2011, 2012) and Bursa Malaysia is strongly related to the company performance in a long period of time. Meanwhile, a research conducted by Haat
et al., (2008) involving 142 firms in Malaysia concluded that corporate governance serves a robust impact on predicting a firm performance. Ponnu (2008) in his research of 100 Bursa Malaysia companies stated that there was a strong association between the corporate governance structure and the corporate presentation.

Koufopoulos et al., (2008) that studied on 27 companies listed under the Athens Stock Exchange (ASE) reported that the only factor that produce a positive impact on the company performance is the board size. However, the impact is not statistically significant. Uadiale (2010) that studied 30 companies listed under Nigeria Stock Exchange (NSE) found a negative relationship between the ROE castoff as a representation to assess the presentation of the firm by the quality functions of the chairman and chief executive officer. On the other hand, Sanda et al., (2005) found a positive association between the company performance and the segregation of the duty and function of chief executive and chairman in 93 companies under NSE. However, Leng and Mansor (2005) that studied the 120 registered corporations in Malaysia over four years (1996 to 1999) found that the chief executive with the chairmanship of the board of directors influenced the company performance positively.

### 2.3 Capital Structure

Capital structure could be defined as the proportion of sanctuaries used by a company for the purpose of a long-term financing and debt. These include the external equity, internal equity, and major stocks (Margaritis & Psillaki, 2010). The ordinary share capital is commonly obtained form the public through the issue of ordinary shares to the shareholders. This type of finance is only applicable to certain type of companies. These shares provide voting rights and may affect the company's decision-making process at the Annual General Meeting. The common stock comes with the high level of risks due to the uncertainty of the refund. Ordinary stocks cannot guarantee refunds and have outstanding claims.

In corporate finance, capital structure is a term used to describe the way a company manage its assets by balancing the ratio of debt, equity or hybrid securities (Saad, 2010). It describes how a company use its entire procedures and development using various bases of resources.

Modigliani-Miller theory is the most adopted theory of capital structure and has been widely accepted around the world. According to Modigliani-Miller, this capital structure operates in a perfect market. Numerous perfect market norms have been made up of rational investment uses, no taxation, perfect competition, no bankruptcy and efficient markets. Modigliani-Miller stated that the financial or financial structure of a company is not associated with the value of a perfect market. Gleason et al., (2000) reported that different capital structures and classification of retail culture will affect the structure of retail capital. The study that was conducted on 14 European countries revealed that the culture does not influence the retailer presentation and the capital structure have influence on the company performance. On the other hand, another research was carried out by Akintoye (2008) to understand the capital structure presentation for the selected food and beverage firms in Nigeria. This research used sales as an indicator of company performance and leverage as an indicator for the fashion structure. Akintoye (2008) concluded that capital structure significantly affects company performance.

King & Santor (2008) studied the connection between family ownership, corporate performance and capital structure of companies in Canada. Based on Tobin Q's ratios, the results show that families with independent companies having a single class of shares shows the same marketplace presentation, higher bookkeeping presentation constructed on ROA, and higher financial leverage based on overall debt to other assets compared to other companies. By comparison, family-owned companies having two-class shares shows a lower valuation of up to 17% relative to the company size, despite having the same ROA and financial leverage.

In the present study, we used short-term liability, long-term liability and total liability as a measure for capital structure.

### 3. The Conceptual Framework and Hypotheses Development

The conceptual framework was designed to discover the association between corporate governance and capital
structure with corporate performance. In this proposed framework, corporate governance (including the independent directors, CEO duality, board size, board meetings, shareholder ownership, and tenureship) and capital structure (including short-term liability, long-term liability, and total liability) was considered as independent variables and the performance of the company was set as the dependent variable. Figure 1 shows the association between corporate governance and corporate performance as well as the relationship between capital structure and corporate performance.

![Diagram of Corporate Governance and Corporate Performance](image)

Figure 1. The Conceptual Framework of the Research

### 3.1 Corporate Governance and Corporate Performance

Good corporate governance instruments give stockholders confidence in their companies that their investment will accept satisfactory revenues (Shleifer & Vishny, 2012). If elements of corporate governance do not exist or are not functioning properly, investors will not put their investment in the company or buy equity securities (company shares). As a result, the country's economic growth may be adversely affected as many good business opportunities are overlooked and at the same time pose financial difficulties to companies, employees and consumers (Haat et al., 2008). This shows that the destruction of stockholder assurance in Malaysia is outstanding to weak corporate governance standards in the country and lack of transparency in the financial system (Rahman et al., 2011). The failed system of a corporate governance is found to be the main factor that lead to the collapsing of several companies in Malaysia (Mohamad & Ibrahim, 2002).

According to Ghazali (2010), the main purpose of corporate governance is to understand long-term stakeholder value and it is predictable that firms that excel in their corporate governance will stays longer in the industry compared to the companies that have a weak corporate governance structure. Haat et al, (2008) also mentioned that the general perception of corporate governance has a positive association with stable corporate performance due to the introduction of regulations by the MCCG and the listing requirements on Bursa Malaysia. Previous researches have suggested that corporate governance has a helpful effect on company performance, and a good corporate governance is expected to boost corporate performance and increase company value (Alves & Mendes, 2004; Chang et al., 2005). It also can be a great measure in preventing fraud (Yeh et al., 2002). Firms with improved corporate governance similarly have improved functional presentation than firms with unfortunate corporate governance (Black et al., 2006). Due to better operations, companies with better control are expected to have higher returns (Jensen & Meckling, 1976).

This study provides comprehensive information on how good corporate governance practices will produce a positive outcome on the performance of the company. This statement is corresponding to the agency theory that stated that good governance practices provide better supervision, protect shareholders' interests and able to
improve company presentation.

Based on the arguments above, the hypothesis was developed as follows:
H1: There is a positive relationship between corporate governance and corporate performance.

### 3.2 Capital Structure and Corporate Performance

Mesquita and Lara (2003) reported that the rate of repayment was definitely associated with short-term liability and equity. On the contrary, it has a counterpart to long-term liability. A long-term liability is not profitable for the company as it reduces profitability due to interest payments. While Fu (1997) found a significant association between capital structure and profitability. Furthermore, Chou and Lee (2010) reported that equity and liability repayment are strongly associated with with assets.

Similarly, Amjed (2007) revealed a strong association between luck and debt. The findings of the research also support the static trade-off theory which states that total debt has nothing to do with monetary presentation since of the distinct appearances of long-standing and short-range debt. On the other hand, the capital structure has a significant negative effect on the monetary presentation of a company (Onaolapo & Kajola, 2010). Concurrently, Pratheepkanth (2011) reported that there is a negative association between capital structure and financial performance. Furthermore, Ferati and Egypt (2012) found a positive association between short-term liability and financial performances and negative association between long-term liability and financial performance. Meanwhile, the positive influence of corporate capital structure on the presentation of the firm was reported by Aburub (2012). Additionally, Akhtar, Bakhsh, Ali, and Kousar (2019) found that total debt does not caused a great effect on the company's presentation. Abbas et al., (2014) reported the presence of significant negative association between liability and financial performance. Similarly, other studies also supported that there is a positive relationship between corporate performance and capital structure, which indicthe underlying theory of capital structure (Adesina et al., 2015; Deping & Yongsheng, 2011; Fosu, 2013).

Based on the arguments above, the hypothesis was developed as follows:
H2: There is a positive relationship between capital structure and corporate performance.

### 4. Conclusion

This research proposes a conceptual framework for examining corporate governance consisting of the independent directors, CEO duality, board size, board meetings, shareholder ownership, and tenureship as well as capital structure (including short-term and long-term liability, and total liability) towards the corporate performance of public companies in Malaysia. The information provided in this study will be the foundation for future work in obtaining a more solid understanding of the impact of corporate governance and capital structure on corporate performance. Hence, it is hoped will be useful in tackling corporate performance problems in Malaysia.

### References


Management and Planning, 02(03), 138–150.


MSWG. (2017). *Key corporate governance statistics of public listed companies in Malaysia*.


Effect of Employer Branding Attributes on Talent Retention with mediating Role of Transformational Leadership

1Muhammad Imran Hanif, 2Zain Saeed Qureshi

1Assistant Professor, Institute of Banking and Finance, Bahauddin Zakariya University Multan, Pakistan
2MS Scholar (Business Administration), Institute of Banking and Finance, Bahauddin Zakariya University Multan, Pakistan, zainsaeed12@yahoo.com

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

The drive of this paper is to empirically survey, the association between employer branding elements and transformational leadership on talent retention in telecom sector of Pakistan. This study involves the data collected from questionnaire. The respondent were employees and employers of telecom industry of Pakistan. Our sample size comprise of 250 employees includes both male, female of different age group out of which data from 181 respondents were entered into Statistical Package for the Social Sciences SPSS-19. Data are analyzed by means of descriptive statistics, bivariate correlations and regression through SPSS-19 and Smart PLS. Our findings indicate that employer branding attributes like compensation strategy, persons orientedness, and perceived organizational support are positivity relation with talent retention whereas the training and development is not showing significant relation with talent retentions. Mediating effect of transformational leadership is proved.

© 2020 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: zainsaeed12@yahoo.com


1. Introduction

The aim of this study to explore research conducted by Christopher N. Arasanmi, Aiswarya Krishna, (2019), and checks the effect of employer branding attributes on talent retention and with the mediating role of transformational leadership. Employer Branding Attributes have influenced by Talent Retention this is the explanation that Employer Branding Attributes became an emergent subject matter of research now a days. The goal of this exploration is to study literature and relationship between Employer Branding Attributes and Talent Retention with tallying transformational Leadership as a mediator. The study has decision-making implications for Pakistani organizations. This innovative age of globalization boons many exciting opportunities to
international managers, this has increased demand of manager to cope up globalization. In era of globalization only those firms succeed and compete which redesign and reshaped their policies and structure with response to dynamic need of markets. Employer branding contains the utilitarian, monetary and mental advantages gave by an organization to its workers. Employer branding traits are certain for business positive image, and utilized for fascination of potential representatives. (Christopher N, 2019). The adaptability is a most important factor in attaining the key to achieve viable edge. According to Chartered Institute for Personnel and Development (CIPD, 2015). The expression “branding” as applied in human resource management suggests to the arrangement of immaterial traits and characteristics which draw in the potential representatives to offer their administrations to a specific association.

There is rarely any literature available regarding employer branding attributes and talent retention in telecom sector. This Study would shed light on what attributes attract employees and make employer distinctive from other employer in order to keep talent retain and sustain. Prior studied were available on Job Satisfaction and Organizational Commitment. This focuses on Employer Branding attributes along with role of transformational leadership style because they are recognized as influential in the dissemination of best practices.

2. Literature Review
2.1 Employer Branding Attributes
Employer reputation assumes fundamental task in the advancement of a company's upper hand and manageability. Employer branding advocates for the satisfaction of representatives' goals and desires since workers respond support, favor and support from organizations with obligation and enriched organizational performance. Christopher and Krishna, (2019). In 1996, Ambler and Barrow were pioneer to introduce the term “employer branding” in the field of HRM. Lyons and Marler, (2011) explore that attracting and retaining the talented employees is an emerging issue. Prior researches illustrate that strategies of employer branding effects the competitive advantage of the organization, workers aptitude to recognize corporation standards and member of staff retention (CIPD, 2007). It has been scare exploration work on the linkage concerning employer branding and employee retaining. The paucity of literature appears to reveal the contention that employer branding is now in the emergent stage and a firmness prerequisite for more technologically advanced tactics to entice and retain endowments (Maheshwari et al., 2017). According to Kasekende et al., (2018), assumed that the organization offered as employers branding can be distinguish into three, specifically, remuneration strategy, people’s orientedness, leadership and training and developments.

According to Abayomi, (2019) Human Resources Strategy (HRS) needs and Remuneration administration are in line with organization’s pursuit, vision, corporate goal and strategy, as well as supporting is strategic in nature especially. Sudhanshu & Chauhan, (2013) argued that salary is the most crucial factor for employees in the organization. Global Shapers Survey (Annual Survey 2017) conducted by World Economic Forum (WEF), According to the annual Global Shapers through more than 30000 respondents having age under 30 on 180 countries finding were that, 49.3% consider that salary is the most important criteria in choosing for a job. Training and Development is characterized as the level of career-related bolster got from their chiefs that permits subordinates to control their performance goals, giving performance feedback, helping them the progress profession plans, and provided that training opportunities. As said by Hanif, et al. (2014) training was viewed as basic for maintainable human capacity to be accomplished, results reliably demonstrated that preparation was essential at all the management levels including operational and vital strategic levels. In a report published by US National Economic and Development Office it has been written that the rate of training in high performing organizations is around 8.9 days employee annually whereas those organization having performance is low are 2.8 days employee per annum. Perceived Organizational Support can be looks as an significant organizational resources and it is, consequently, prone to improve subordinates' excitement and vitality levels, for example, work commitment (Park et al., 2018).

Earlier and contemporary insights on the influence of organizational supports and retention of an employees with an organization such as. Ghosh and Sahaney (2011) revealed that all support either it is organizational
support or, career development, interdepartmental support, upper administration support, worker prosperity and work-life security progressively affect talent retention. People Orientedness refers as People who are committed at work find their work energizing and meaningful, and they experience a passionate work-related wellbeing state and enhancing motivation. According to Kasekende et al., (2018) talent endowment retention is fruitful if the employer’s are to construct their corporate brand through motivating workstation pleasurable and work lifespan balance so as to grow their attractiveness.

2.2 Dependent Variable: Talent Retentions
Talent retentions is delineate as the exertion through an employer to cling to efficient workers in order to meet expectations’ of corporate intentions. Tlaises et al., (2017) described that fascinating, selecting, evolving and retaining talents has now become a top preference among high-ranking leaders which is expressed as managing talents. Korn Ferry Institute, (2017) reported that there is an excruciating “war for talent” being struggled, which is moderately subsequent from an acute shortage supply of talent internationally. A global talent deficiency is heading, and its fiscal impact has been forecasted to extent over US$8tn by 2030, it is essential for organizations to continue and flourish to retain talent as it always been, and will lifelong process. According to Snejina Michailova, (2018) talented employees prefer career more than a job, when talent is given appropriate career growth chances, they are more ardent to stay loyal with their organization.

2.3 Mediating Variable: Transformational Leadership Style
There is an upsurge in overall world leadership conference by the professional senior executive and globally leadership courses, for example at Harvard Business School, the London Business School and the Henley Leadership program. According to Sangeet et al., (2018) it’s also observed that diverse styles of leadership are feasible in different cultures. But transformational leadership look like to fit the requirement for an innovative leader, transformational leadership comprises four dimensions: idealized influence, inspirational motivation, intellectual stimulation, and individualized consideration.

3. Research GAP
The detailed review of the literature in the previous section reveals that empirical research on talent retention didn't locate a huge connection between initiative advancement practices and talent retention. There is very scarce literature available that deals with impact of Employer Branding Attributes upon Talent Retention in organizations. According to (Christopher et. al, 2019). Further research ought to survey the impact of different factors as manager marking on maintenance. Potential regions incorporate reward and pay, workplaces, manager backing, preparing and improvement as employer branding characteristics.

There is rarely any literature available regarding employer branding attributes and talent retention in telecom sector. This Study would shed light on what attributes attract employees and make employer distinctive from other employer in order to keep talent retain and sustain. Prior studied were available on Job Satisfaction and Organizational Commitment. This focuses on Employer Branding attributes along with role of transformational leadership style because they are recognized as influential in the dissemination of best practices.
4. Theoretical Framework

![Diagram](image)

5. Hypotheses Development
This subsection develops hypotheses with the aim to fill the research gaps. Main hypotheses are:

H1: Reward strategy is positive related to Talent Retention.
H2 Training and Development is positive related to Talent Retention.
H3 Perceived organization support is positive related to Talent Retention.
H4 People Orientedness is positive related to Talent Retention.
H5 Transformational leadership style may mediate the association between employer’s brandings attributes and talent retentions.

6. Research Methodology
6.1 Population and Sample
The study involves the data collected from the primary sources. The primary source is middle management employees of telecom sector i.e Mobilink, Telenor, Zong, Ufone and PTCL. The questionnaire results illustrated that, there were 72.5% of male and 27.5% females. Out of 200 survey questionnaires administered, 181 usable responses were received with a response rate of 90%. Ages of respondents range from less than 25 were 43.5%, 32.7 % were aged from 26-30, 31-35 were 40.6% and 11.6% respectively and 35 and above were a total of 4.3%. Hence it is seen that the sample was collected without any discrimination. Respondents were from both gender, ageing from less than 26 to 35 and above. There were 27.5% bachelor, 46.4% masters, and 23.2% M.Phil and PhD holders are 2.9%.

6.2 Data Collection Method Procedure
This is quantitative based study a questionnaire was used as instrument.

6.3 Data Analysis
Data was arranged enter in SPSS and various tested were perform on data to test validity and reliability.

6.4 Sampling Technique
In order to undertake this research a convenient sampling technique was used.

6.5 Measuring Instrument
In order to undertake this research a questionnaire was used as instrument for collecting data. A 1–5 Likert scale
(5 =strongly agree, 4 =agree, 3 =neutral, 2 = disagree, 1 =strongly disagree) used in this study.
Reward strategy; Six measurement items were adapted from (Dileta, 2015). Some of the items are; my organization rewards employees for exemplary work in a variety of ways. Training and development; Four measurement items were adapted from (Broek, 2015). Some of the items are; A job where I can develop into elements of greater responsibility. Perceived organization support; Some of those measurement items of POS were adapted (Christopher et al., 2018). Some of the items are: my organization cares, thinks about my general fulfillment at work; and my organization truly thinks about my prosperity and well-being. People Orientedness: Seven measurement items were adapted from (Broek, 2015). Some of the items are; A job in which I can work occasionally at home, A job in which I can determine the start and end times of my working day itself. Talent Retention; Four items were adapted from Kyndt et al. (2009). One of the items was: if I needed to carry out another responsibility or capacity, I would take a gander at the potential outcomes inside this organization. Transformational leadership; Four measurement items were adapted from (Broek, 2015). Some of the items are; A manager who delegates challenging responsibilities to me, A manager who encourages me to come up with my own initiatives.

7. Data Analysis and Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reliability Statistics</th>
<th>Cronbach's Alpha</th>
<th>Cronbach's Alpha Based on Standardized Items</th>
<th>N of Items</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>.879</td>
<td>.888</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Original Sample (O)</th>
<th>Mean (M)</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>T Statistics</th>
<th>P Values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>People Orientedness -&gt; Talent Retention</td>
<td>0.149</td>
<td>0.153</td>
<td>0.085</td>
<td>1.755</td>
<td>0.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People Orientedness -&gt; Transformational Leadership</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td>0.19</td>
<td>0.083</td>
<td>2.184</td>
<td>0.015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percieved Org. Support -&gt; Talent Retention</td>
<td>0.19</td>
<td>0.205</td>
<td>0.079</td>
<td>2.419</td>
<td>0.008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percieved Org. Support -&gt; Transformational Leadership</td>
<td>0.119</td>
<td>0.13</td>
<td>0.071</td>
<td>1.666</td>
<td>0.048</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reward Strategy -&gt; Talent Retention</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>0.048</td>
<td>0.09</td>
<td>0.446</td>
<td>0.005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reward Strategy -&gt; Transformational Leadership</td>
<td>0.28</td>
<td>0.283</td>
<td>0.062</td>
<td>4.529</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training and Development -&gt; Talent Retention</td>
<td>0.193</td>
<td>0.208</td>
<td>0.13</td>
<td>1.478</td>
<td>0.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training and Development -&gt; Transformational Leadership</td>
<td>0.083</td>
<td>0.113</td>
<td>0.087</td>
<td>0.955</td>
<td>0.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transformational Leadership -&gt; Talent Retention</td>
<td>0.166</td>
<td>0.159</td>
<td>0.077</td>
<td>2.159</td>
<td>0.015</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

H1: Reward strategy is positive related to Talent Retention. (Supported)
The first hypothesis was to check the relationship of Reward strategy and Talent Retention, on the basis results, it is evident that Reward strategy is highly and positively significant with Talent Retention as the significance level is 0.005.

H2 Training and Development is positive related to Talent Retention. (Not Supported)
The second hypothesis of the study was to check training and development is significantly related to Talent Retention or not. The statistical results reveal that both variables are not significant with a significance level of 0.07. This hypothesis is not accepted because the P value is greater than 0.05 that is less than 0.001

H3 Perceived organization support is positive related to Talent Retention. (Supported)
The third and most important hypothesis was to test the combined impact of Perceived organization support and Talent Retention. The significance of this hypothesis is 0.000. The level of significance indicates that this hypothesis is approved. If Perceived organization support is employed with talent Retention it will together have a synergetic effect on the enhancement of talent Retention.
H4 People Orientedness is positive related to Talent Retention. (Supported)
The connection between people’s orientedness and talent retentions. The results specified a positive relation and major association between the two. This hypothesis is accepted because the P value is less than 0.05 that is less than 0.001. The finding for this hypothesis is supported by Asuman et al, (2018), who said that combination of the outcomes ratify that the people orientedness in are positively linked to talent retention.

| H5 Transformational leadership style mediates the association between employer’s branding attributes and talent retentions. (Supported) |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Employer Branding -> Talent Retention | 0.437 | 0.438 | 0.105 | 4.176 | 0.000 |
| Employer Branding -> Transformational Leadership | 0.646 | 0.644 | 0.061 | 10.548 | 0.000 |
| Transformational Leadership -> Talent Retention | 0.311 | 0.311 | 0.096 | 3.244 | 0.001 |

8. Discussion
Results of the data analysis in previous section were presented. Mean values for all variables and their associated dimensions were all above 3.00 on a scale from 1.00 to 5.00 except for transformational leadership which was slightly below 3.00. Mean value for independent variable employer branding is 3.8406 which implies that organizations carry out and emphasize employer branding attributes and talent retention also. Mean value for dependent variable talent retention is 3.7971 on a scale from 1.00 to 5.00. As far as mediation is concerned, it has a mean value of 3.6087 which entails that managers perceive business environment to be uncertain and competitive. Through these findings we can infer that all three forms of employer branding attributes are carried out in the sampled firms, however, new talent retention is slightly more emphasized than new offering and branding attributes model in our case. At the point when organization perceive their commitments and show worries for their prosperity and give a positive workplace; at that point representatives are probably going to remain and stay with an organization (Ghosh et al., 2013). Additionally, these findings are consistent with earlier studies. According to this study, make a working environment where staff skills are esteemed and remunerated; this results into craving that even then next day would discover them at work station. The examination further finds that representatives in organization would remain be a section in such organizations since they feels that while at certain work environment staff abilities are esteemed and compensated.

9. Conclusion
In the country case Telecommunications being a crucial contributor in services sector, remained as a stimulus for rest of the economy. Digitization is the buzzword in literally every segment of the society be it industry, manufacturing, Small & Medium Enterprises (SMEs), agriculture, health, education or media. Therefore the role of PTA in particular and IT & Telecom sector in general has become pivotal for economic growth and employment generation. Services are one of the best sources to accelerate growth in stagnant or slow growth economies. These facts imply that growth in services is fundamental to the growth of the whole economy. At organizational or business level, innovation is the central driver to competitive advantage and superior performance and is considered an engine of growth. On the other hand, forces of globalization, cut-throat
competition, and ground breaking technologies are exerting influence on organizations and economies alike. In the light of gaps identified above, there seemed a void in many areas of employer branding research. This research thesis is an endeavor to bridge the aforesaid gaps in the field and is both timely and needed. This research activity to offers new understandings in the fields of employer branding and talent retention. This shed light on the correlation between main variables employer’s branding (IV), talent retentions (DV) and transformational leadership (MV). First, this study finds that employer branding considerably influences talent retention of the telecom sector organizations of Pakistan which was hypothesized to be so. It reinforces the previous findings that employer branding directly impacts talent retention (cite few such studies).

The first hypothesis was to check the relationship of Reward strategy and Talent Retention, on the basis results, it is evident that Reward strategy is highly and positively significant with talent retention as the significance level is 0.005. The second hypothesis of the study was to check training and development is significantly related to talent retention or not. The statistical results reveal that both variables are not significant with a significance level of 0.07. This hypothesis is not accepted because the P value is greater than 0.05 that is less than 0.001. The third and most important hypothesis was to test the combined impact of Perceived organization support and Talent Retention. The significance of this hypothesis is 0.000. The level of significance indicates that this hypothesis is approved. The fourth hypothesis was a relationship between people’s orientedness and talents retentions. This results as indicated a significant positive association between the two. So this hypothesis is accepted because the P value is less than 0.05 that is less than 0.001. The last and most important hypothesis was to test the mediating impact of transformational leadership on employer branding and talent retention. The significance of this hypothesis is 0.000. The level of significance indicates that this hypothesis is approved.

10. Implication
This research study also offers many valued implications for executives in the widespread of sectors and others organizations. Administrators can learn, engage in and choose the finest combination of numerous dimensions of employer branding to synergize talent enactment and gain competitive edge over contenders. They can also learn how different dimensions of employer branding attributes intervene and whether reward strategy and perceive organizational support in the organizational environs play any major role in shaping the optimum unification of various dimensions of employer branding and in overall performance of employees. In this way, this study benefits business and Human resource leaders in their decision making and tactic formulation. Overall, this research study has valuable implications and contributions in the fields of employer branding attributes and talent management alike, apart from some valuable insights for practitioners, managers, service organizations and businesses, policy makers, economist and governments.

11. Limitations
This research is not without limitations, these limitations constitute areas for future research First of all, and there is a query of external validity. All the more explicitly, to what degree the consequences of this examination can be summed up outside the telecom area and over other areas. Sample size was not huge enough as there were some budgetary and time limitations which may almost certainly hamper the external validity and generalizability of the after effects of this examination crosswise over whole area and crosswise over creating economies.

12. Future Research
This research was carried out on the telecom sector only, hence it would seem interesting to replicate this survey on a much more diversified sample of users such as corporates and multinationals, it can focus on entire public sector which may include public financial services, other private financial services, etc. In this study we examined the impact of on these attributes and elements of employer’s branding such as compensation and reward strategy, people’s orientedness, trainings and developments and perceived organizational supports. So in future other dimension such as Career Advancement, Job Satisfaction, Culture & Values, Innovation & Technology, CSR and diversity & Inclusion should be considered.
References:
Broek, M. t. (2015). FROM EMPLOYER ATTRACTIVENESS TO EMPLOYER BRANDING. MANAGEMENT AND GOVERNANCE.
A Global Research Trend on Organizational Citizenship Behaviour: A Bibliometric Analysis

Jen Ling Gan, Halimah Mohd Yusof

PhD Scholar, Azman Hashim International Business School, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, Skudai, Johor, ganjenling@gmail.com
Senior Lecturer, School of Human Resource Development and Psychology, Faculty of Social Sciences and Humanities, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, Skudai, Johor, halimahmy@utm.my

Objective: There are limited literatures that discussed on the trend of OCB. Hence, this bibliometric analysis is aimed to evaluate the global research growth to retrieve and analyse the publication on OCB. The bibliometric analysis is used to search the database of Scopus from the oldest publication in 1988 to the recent publication in 2019. The objectives were to evaluate the trend of OCB research, details of co-authorship, leading institutions and countries, top scholars, and leading author keywords.

Methodology: This study used VOS Viewer 1.6.11 to analyse and visualise the global research trend on OCB in analysing the bibliographic data. Bibliometric maps were retrieved from VOS Viewer 1.6.11.

Results: This study retrieved 2,356 journal articles from Scopus database from 1988 to 2019. The publication’s trend revealed that the number of publications has been increasing steadily since 2002. The leading countries in OCB research are the United States and China. Among the fifteen leading universities, five of them were from the world’s top 150 universities. Among the keywords, ‘commitment’ has the most link with OCB, which indicated that OCB is active in the management field compared to other fields such as nursing and psychology.

Implication: This paper can be beneficial for academicians, organisations, and business policymakers in understanding the global trend of OCB besides discovering the future directions and opportunities for future studies.

© 2020 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: ganjenling@gmail.com
6. Introduction

The topic of sustainability management has been widely discussed in nowadays. Organizational citizenship behaviour (OCB), which is known as one of the contributors to the performance of sustainability, has been drawing attention in academic field (Wang et al., 2018). OCB is defined as employees’ behaviour which is voluntary-based, not being recognised by formal reward system and formal job scopes, and could improve the performance of organization (Organ, 1988). Over the decades, many empirical studies had been conducted to examine the antecedents of OCB, as well as to investigate the outcomes of OCB. However, the global trend of OCB is yet to be discussed. The big picture of OCB trend could be served as guidance for future researchers in looking for new areas in OCB research. Therefore, this paper intended to present bibliometric analysis to outline the trend of OCB since 1988 to 2019.

Although the attention to OCB has been growing, the discussion of global research trend on OCB is still lacking. Yaylaci (2016) has presented the research trend of OCB from the year of 2000 to 2015. However, the scholar focused on single country, which is Turkey only. In addition to that, the scholar covered only the years from 2000 to 2015, where this is insufficient to get a complete big picture of OCB trend since beginning. On the other hand, Romeo Delgado et al. (2017) had also analysed the trend of OCB using bibliometric approach. However, only Web of Science (WOS) database’s data was retrieved by the scholar, where the data could be limited from only one database. Although WOS and Scopus databases might consist of overlapping journal indexing, both databases index different journals as well (Aghaei Chadegani et al., 2013). Scopus is known as the biggest database that covers multidisciplinary research. Therefore, this paper was intended to conduct data mining via Scopus database to collect more research articles which may not available in WOS and may not discussed by Romeo Delgado et al. (2017) and Yaylaci (2016). One of the coverage differences between Scopus and WOS could be seen, where the oldest paper of OCB in Scopus was 1988, while the oldest paper in WOS was 1991. This proved that both databases cover different journals, resulting different findings on data mining.

This paper can be beneficial for academicians, organisations, and business policymakers in understanding the global trend of OCB besides discovering the new directions for future studies. The discussion of this paper has four objectives: (i) to investigate the trend’s outline of ‘OCB’ article; (ii) to indicate the contribution of active scholars, nations, and organizations; (iii) to discover the terminology, concept, and topic of interest; and (iv) to provide new insight of potential international collaboration between countries, and future directions.

2. Methods

Bibliometric analysis can be conducted through collecting the bibliographic data of other scholars in the particular field, where those scholars communicated their thinking via citations or writing (Zupic and Carter, 2015). It is believed that bibliometric analysis is helpful in analysing the topic of interest in fields, as well as providing insight for future researchers (Khudzari et al., 2018). Bibliometric analysis focuses on the performance of publications in certain fields and explains the dynamics of the fields which are different from a review paper (Cobo et al., 2011).

2.1 Search Strategy

This study conducted data mining from October 7th to 10th, 2019 in Scopus database by setting the central theme for the bibliometric analysis. The central theme for the research articles is “organizational citizenship behaviour” in the title and abstract to analyse the global research trend of OCB. The list of articles was sorted by years (oldest to latest) in which the oldest is 1988 and the latest is 2019. However, it was cautioned that OCB can have different spelling, such as “behaviour” and “behaviour”. Hence, with this information, the query string for this bibliometric analysis was set as: (TITLE-ABS ( "organ*ational citizenship behav*" ) AND DOCTYPE ( ar ) AND PUBYEAR > 1988 AND PUBYEAR < 2019 AND ( LIMIT-TO ( SRCTYPE , "j" ) ) ). The asterisk symbol was used in the query for the purpose to include both results of “organizational citizenship behaviour” and “organisational citizenship behavior”. A total of 2, 713 documents was found in this query string.
The 2,713 documents might include review papers which were irrelevant for the bibliometric analysis. Hence, an additional step was done to exclude the review papers by adding related phrases into query string, such as “review”, “progress”, “revisit”, and “highlight”. After screening the contents of the list, 265 documents were found as review articles. The EIDs (Scopus article identifier) of the 265 documents were recorded and added to the next query string for the purpose to exclude them. After excluded review papers, 2,448 documents were found. However, these 2,448 documents were in different languages. The author might have difficulties in understanding the articles that were not in English language, hence non-English language articles were excluded in the searching process. A total of 92 articles was found to be in other languages, therefore 2,356 articles were obtained for this analysis. The result of searching was then analysed based on document type, country, affiliation, year, subject area, authors, and source. In order make a ranking list, the indicators of bibliometric such as h-index and total of citations were collected. The process of search strategy was illustrated in Figure 1. The detailed search strings were listed in the section of supplementary material (Table S1).

2.2 Bibliometric Map
This study exported the bibliographical information of 2,356 articles to analyse using VOSviewer version 1.6.11. VOSviewer assisted the author to visualise and build bibliometric maps which will be shown in the subsequent sections. The items in this paper that were included in VOSviewer were objects of interest such as countries of publications and author keywords. Each item might be connected with a line in VOSviewer and each line was given a strength value to illustrate the strength of the relationship between items. It is believed that stronger relationship tends to have higher strength value (Khudzari et al., 2018). There was also the link strength in the co-authorship analysis that illustrated the amount of publication between both linked countries that have co-authored. On the other hand, the link strength in keywords co-occurrence analysis showed the quantity of researches where the two linked keywords occurred simultaneously (Van Eck and Waltman, 2018).

2.2.1 Co-authorship Analysis
This study had included 89 countries that were affiliated with 2,139 authors in the co-authorship analysis. The affiliated countries were clustered into nine regions, namely America, United Kingdom, Middle East, Asia, Oceania, Europe, Eurasia, Africa, and Caribbean.

2.2.2 Analysis of Co-occurrence
The analysis of co-occurrence included author keywords and excluded Scopus indexed keywords with a total of 171 keywords from 2,356 articles. Before importing all the author keywords into VOSviewer, thesaurus file was created in order to avoid similar keywords from repeating. Hence, this study screened and grouped the synonymic keywords. For example, organisation, corporate, and company have the same meaning and they are re-labelled as ‘organisation’. The minimum occurrences of author keywords were set to five in producing the output of analysis. The VOSviewer was set to visualisation mode to visualise the output in viewing the strength of link between keywords, number of occurrences, and average publications of year.
3. Results and Discussion

3.1 Progress of Research Output

There were 2,356 research articles published in 31 years. Figure 2 shows the growth of publication. The first research in OCB was in 1988 (Dalton and Cosier, 1988) and there was no published research until 1989. From 1995 onwards, the number of publications in OCB has been increasing steadily. It is believed that the research works on this topic were active since 1995. The annual growth rate increased rapidly in 2002 when the number of publications was almost five times more than the publications in 1995. The increasing number of publications has resulted in the increased number of cumulative total publications. From 2006 to 2019, the number of publications of OCB has rapidly and significantly increased. Therefore, it is believed that the attention on OCB publications will increase in future. It is suggested that more research works should have public access for the reference of future researchers. As of 2019, only 7.7% (182 research articles) had public access for readers.

![Figure 2. Annual quantity of organizational citizenship behaviour research articles in Scopus database from 1988-2019](image)

Recently, OCB has started to receive attention from the scholars, hence increasing the number of publications. The subject area analysis indicated that the concerns of management are the main attention in OCB trend, where the followings are the top five ranking of subject area as analysed from Scopus: Business, Management, and Accounting (1,555 articles), Social Sciences (305 articles), Psychology (823 articles), Social Sciences (773 articles), Economics, Econometrics, and Finance (229 articles), as well as Arts and Humanities (200 articles). Although major concerns are in management and social sciences field, the topic of OCB can be in multidisciplinary area as well. This can be seen when a number of publications (130 articles) was published in the area of Nursing, Medicine, and Health Professions. Besides, OCB was discussed in the field of Sciences as well, where 170 articles were published in the area of Environmental Sciences, Computer Science, as well as Agricultural and Biological Sciences. This proved that OCB is not only essential in management field, it might be important for employees in health sector and Sciences field as well.

3.2 Top Productive Journals

Table 1 showed that the top ten productive journals were from eight publishers. The three journals that were leading respectively from American Psychological Association (APA), Kluwer Academic Publishers, and Routledge. Out of the eight publishers, Elsevier and Kluwer Academic Publishers owned the greatest number of journals, where four out of ten journals are from these two publishers. The remaining four journals are published by John Wiley & Sons Inc., SAGE Publications, Emerald Group Publishing Ltd., and Wiley-Blackwell. Majority (80%) of the journals were in Quartile 1 (Q1), while only two journals were in Quartile 2 (Q2).

The most productive journal was Journal of Applied Psychology, where 98 journal articles were published, and covering 4.2% of total publications in OCB. Followed by Journal of Business Ethics (60, 2.5%), International
Journal of Human Resource Management (58, 2.4%), and Journal of Organizational Behavior (52, 2.2%). Among the ten journals, Journal of Applied Psychology has the most citation with a total of 14, 688. Journal of Organizational Behavior has the second highest citations (5, 770) among the ten journals. One of the papers from Journal of Vocational Behaviour has the highest citation among the ten papers (2, 540 citations).

According to the CiteScore 2018 analysis, four journals scored more than 5.0 in CiteScore. The journal with highest CiteScore was Journal of Management (10.96), while the journal with lowest CiteScore was Journal of Applied Social Psychology (1.99). CiteScore has been viewed as one of the criteria for scholars in the process selecting journals to publish their works (Khudzari et al., 2018). Hence, to assist the future scholars in looking for suitable journals, a list of top 16 CiteScore journals was attached in Table S2 (Supplementary Materials).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Journal</th>
<th>Quartile</th>
<th>TP (%)</th>
<th>TC</th>
<th>CiteScore 2018</th>
<th>The most cited article (Reference)</th>
<th>Times Cited</th>
<th>Publisher</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>International Journal of Human Resource Management</td>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>58 (2.4)</td>
<td>1,278</td>
<td>2.71</td>
<td>The link between perceived human resource management practices, engagement and employee behaviour: A moderated mediation model (Alfes et al., 2013)</td>
<td>195</td>
<td>Routledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Journal of Management</td>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>41 (1.7)</td>
<td>5,377</td>
<td>10.96</td>
<td>Job Satisfaction and Organizational Commitment as Predictors of Organizational Citizenship and In-Role Behaviors (Williams &amp; Anderson, 1991)</td>
<td>1,599</td>
<td>SAGE Publications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Leadership Quarterly</td>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>37 (1.6)</td>
<td>3,959</td>
<td>6.23</td>
<td>Transformational leader behaviors and their effects on followers' trust in leader, satisfaction, and Job Satisfaction (Williams &amp; Anderson, 1991)</td>
<td>2,228</td>
<td>Elsevier Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Journal of Business and Psychology</td>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>36 (1.5)</td>
<td>1,160</td>
<td>3.17</td>
<td>Broken promises: Equity sensitivity as a moderator between psychological contract breach and employee attitudes and behaviour (Kickul &amp; Lester, 2001)</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>Kluwer Academic/Plenum Publishers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----</td>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Journal of Managerial Psychology</td>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>34 (1.4)</td>
<td>1,983</td>
<td>2.05</td>
<td>Antecedents and consequences of employee engagement (Saks, 2006)</td>
<td>1,258</td>
<td>Emerald Group Publishing Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Journal of Vocational Behavior</td>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>29 (1.2)</td>
<td>3,765</td>
<td>4.80</td>
<td>Affective, continuance, and normative commitment to the organization: A meta-analysis of antecedents, correlates, and consequences (Meyer et al., 2002)</td>
<td>2,540</td>
<td>Elsevier Inc.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Note:** TP= Total Publication; TC= Total Citation

### 3.3 Top Nations, Collaboration, and Institutions

Figure 3 illustrated the leading nations that contributed to the development of OCB studies at the global level. About 50% of the publications were dominated by United States and China, which indicating that the both countries were the key contributors in this research topic. United States had the most publications with 847 publications, covering 40% of the publications in the global level. With 203 publications, China was ranked as the second most productive countries in OCB publication. To provide more detailed information on productive countries and institutions, a list of top 50 leading countries was attached in Table S3 (Supplementary Material).

In Figure 3, among the top 15 countries, only six countries scored more than two third (2/3) single country publications (SCP), namely Iran (90.6%), Israel (86.3%), India (80.8%), Taiwan (80.5%), Turkey (75.0%), and United States (67.3%). When SCP is high, it brings a meaning that the nations had more collaborations among the nations (Khudzari et al., 2018). While, United Kingdom had the lowest SCP (18.6%) that only 44/172 publications were associated to other organizations from 44 nations. It is believed that, by collaborating with other international institutions, it can be an effective approach to share expertise, as well as a good strategy to be ranked higher. Although Taiwan is a comparatively smaller country, 28 (22%) of its published works were worldwide collaborations which associated to 18 countries, consequently it was ranked as top 6th leading nation. In addition, there are five institutions were ranked as the top 150 best universities in World University Rankings 2019 (THE, 2019), namely University of Toronto (21st), Seoul National University (63rd), Erasmus University Rotterdam (70th), Monash University (84th) and Michigan State University (93rd). From this, it can be seen that OCB has been receiving attention from the top universities in international level.
Figure 3. Leading nations and institutes in OCB studies

Furthermore, Figure 4 illustrated the distribution of the countries. According to Khudzari et al. (2018), the stronger the linkage between two countries, the locations of both countries will be closer in VOSviewer. While, the stronger the linkage, the line showed in VOSviewer will be thicker. In OCB area, the region that had highest publication rate was from America (42), followed by Asia (26), Europe (24), Middle East (14), Africa (13), United Kingdom (4), Eurasia (3), Caribbean (2), and Oceania (2). The co-authorship analysis indicated that United States was the country that had the most affiliations (50 links, 388 co-authorship), then followed by United Kingdom (44 links, 172 co-authorship), China (43 links, 232 co-authorship), Australia (42 links, 146 co-authorship), Germany (38 links, 73 co-authorship), and others. The analysis found that two fifth (2/5) of the countries had less than ten international collaborative publications. In addition, there were researchers from nine countries were not affiliated with any countries in publishing OCB articles, namely Costa Rica, Croatia, Iraq, Malta, Morocco, Puerto Rico, Sri Lanka, Syria, and Uganda. Few factors could be the contributors to the trend of international collaboration, such as number of international students, diverse research working colleagues, sufficiency of research funding, as well as supportive climate in research institution. For instance, from the Scopus database, it indicated that National Natural Science Foundation of China is the top funding sponsor, hence resulting that China was the top two productive country in publishing OCB articles.
3.4 Top Scholars

The top 15 productive authors in the research area of OCB are listed in Table 2, whom currently attached to seven countries as follows: United States (8), Canada (1), Israel (2), Australia (1), UK (1), Pakistan (1), and India (1). The leading authors’ first publication ranged between the years of 1990 to 2011, in which more than half (10) of them were first author, and five of them were second author. As shown in the column of affiliations, it can be seen that OCB is often discussed in the field of business and management, only minority of the authors were from the fields of Psychology, Education, and Political Science.

The top three leading authors were from United States. Bachrach, D.G. was the first leading author from University of Alabama, with a record of 15 publications since 2000, 666 times of citations, and with 13 h-index. Followed by Bolino, M.C. from The University of Oklahoma, a total of 15 publications (1999-2019), 12 h-index, as well as higher number of citations than the first leading author (2, 209). Four authors (5th, 6th, 10th and 12th) were affiliated to the same university, which are University of Haifa (5th and 6th) and Michigan State University (10th and 12th). It was discovered that the trend of OCB has been gradually increased since 2000, where Bachrach, D.G.’s article was the first published in the same year. Although these are top 15 productive and leading authors in OCB publications, it should be noted that their names are not necessarily appeared in Table 1, under the column of most cited articles. Their names would only be found in Table 1 and Table 2 if they have published actively, such as the author Podsakoff, P.M.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>ID of Author in Scopus</th>
<th>First publication year</th>
<th>TT Pub</th>
<th>h-index</th>
<th>TTCtn</th>
<th>Current Affiliation</th>
<th>Country</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Bachrach, D.G.</td>
<td>6701519822</td>
<td>2000&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>666</td>
<td>University Alabama, Department of</td>
<td>US</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<sup>a</sup> Year not specified in the text.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>Management and Marketing</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Bolino, M.C.</td>
<td>6701369361</td>
<td>1999&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Chiaburu, D.S.</td>
<td>16678220400</td>
<td>2006&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Paillé, P.</td>
<td>23995349700</td>
<td>2009&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Somech, A.</td>
<td>6701826962</td>
<td>2002&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Cohen, A.</td>
<td>7404781570</td>
<td>2000&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Podsakoff, P.M.</td>
<td>6603818084</td>
<td>1990&lt;sup&gt;b&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Spector, P.E.</td>
<td>7006644298</td>
<td>2001&lt;sup&gt;b&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Johnson, R.E.</td>
<td>12647656600</td>
<td>2006&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Lester, S.W.</td>
<td>7005311026</td>
<td>2001&lt;sup&gt;b&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Restubog, S.L.D.</td>
<td>13905925700</td>
<td>2007&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Van Dyne, L.</td>
<td>6603945507</td>
<td>2001&lt;sup&gt;b&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>De Cremer, D.</td>
<td>7006810104</td>
<td>2005&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>Islam, T.</td>
<td>53863375600</td>
<td>2011&lt;sup&gt;b&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.5 Author Keywords

Before creating a thesaurus file, this study recorded 1001 author keywords was recorded, where 17.0% (170) were used only once, 32.2% (322) were used twice, 16.7% (167) were used thrice, 8.1% (81) were used for four times, while 26.0% (260) were used for more than five times. The author keywords were re-labelled by creating a thesaurus file before processing the analysis. There was a total of 171 author keywords yielded from the analysis (minimum five occurrences).

3.5.1 Concept and Terminology

The result of author keywords co-occurrences analysis indicated that ‘OCB’ was the most regularly used keywords in the past studies, where there were 1385 occurrences and 170 links to other keywords as illustrated in Figure 5. Two types of OCB were mentioned in author keywords, which were service-oriented OCB (9 occurrences, 11 links), and OCB Environmental (OCBE) (8 occurrences, 10 links). In addition to that, several keywords were used in conceptualising the OCB, for example, ‘citizenship’ (26 occurrences), and ‘prosocial behaviour’ (6 occurrences), ‘courtesy’ (8 occurrences), sportsmanship (14 occurrences), conscientiousness (22 occurrences), altruism (21 occurrences), helping (26 occurrences), and civic virtue (14 occurrences). The concept of OCB was connected to the few theories, such as ‘person-organization fit’ (22 occurrences), ‘social exchange’ (78 occurrences), and ‘social identity’ (17 occurrences), ‘conservation of resources theory’ (9 occurrences), ‘self-determination theory’ (8 occurrences), and ‘affective events theory’ (5 occurrences). It can be seen that social exchange theory had the most occurrences, where the scholars believed that, reciprocity (5 occurrences, 11 links) could happen when employees are treated well by organizations, the employees will reciprocate by exhibiting OCB in organizations (Liaquat & Mehmood, 2017). One of the most cited papers in Table 1 was related to ‘reciprocity’, which was “Doing unto Others: The Reciprocity of Helping Behavior in Organizations” by Deckop, Cirka, and Anderson (2003).

3.5.2 Topic of Interest

Organizational citizenship behaviour (OCB) has been gaining attention in recent years, where it was recognized as one of the contributors in enhancing the sustainability of organizations (Wang et al., 2018). Among 171 author keywords, ‘commitment’ has the most occurrences (206 occurrences, 99 links), followed by ‘job satisfaction’ (183 occurrences, 102 links). The analysis results are consistent with the findings in Table 1, where two most cited papers mentioned about ‘commitment’ as well as ‘job satisfaction’ in examining OCB. The first paper discussed about “Job Satisfaction and Organizational Commitment as Predictors of Organizational Citizenship and In-Role Behaviors” by Williams and Anderson (1991), while the second paper discussed about “Affective, continuance, and normative commitment to the organization: A meta-analysis of antecedents, correlates, and consequences” by Meyer et al. (2002). The branch of ‘commitment’ that is, ‘affective commitment’ (64 occurrence, 49 links) was also frequently mentioned among the scholars in examining OCB.

The bibliometric analysis result of author keywords indicated that, majority of the top ten author keywords were the antecedents of OCB, namely ‘organizational justice’ (166 occurrences, 82 links), ‘perceived organizational support’ (100 occurrences, 69 links), ‘job engagement’ (83 occurrences, 74 links), and ‘organizational trust’ (77 occurrences, 64 links). Among the top ten, only ‘turnover intention’ (66 occurrences, 47 links) was the most discussed consequence of OCB. The analysis results brought a meaning that, most of the past studies discussed antecedents of OCB, as compared to the consequences of OCB. The high frequency of the discussion in ‘job
engagement’ could be seen from Table 1, where two most cited papers that were discussed by Saks (2006) and Alfes et al. (2013) were about employees’ ‘engagement’. Besides, the topic of ‘organizational justice’ was also one of the frequent discussed topic in OCB studies, where Moorman’s (1991) “Relationship between Organizational Justice and Organizational Citizenship Behaviors: Do Fairness Perceptions Influence Employee Citizenship?” was one of the most cited papers, as indicated in Table 1.

Other than organizational behaviour variables, OCB was also concerned in psychology field. There were nine author keywords that related to psychology field. ‘Psychological contract’ had received the most attention (52 occurrences, 48 links). This is consistent with the result that showed in Table 1, where there was one ‘psychological contract’ related articles listed as the most cited papers, which was “Broken promises: Equity sensitivity as a moderator between psychological contract breach and employee attitudes and behaviour” (Kickul & Lester, 2001). Followed by author keyword ‘emotional intelligence’ (41 occurrences, 39 links), where it is believed that emotion (10 occurrences, 19 links) is one of the key elements in exhibiting OCB among employees (Ilies et al., 2013). ‘Emotional intelligence’ had become the recent trend in OCB research (Average Publication Year: 2014.976). Besides these keywords, other author keywords that related to psychology field were also mentioned, such as ‘emotional exhaustion’ (18 occurrences, 24 links), ‘emotional labor’ (18 occurrences, 20 links), and ‘psychological capital’ (14 occurrences, 16 links).

Furthermore, OCB was also related to seven types of leadership in organizations, namely transformational leadership, ethical leadership, servant leadership, authentic leadership, spiritual leadership, charismatic leadership, and transactional leadership. Among these seven leadership styles, transformational leadership had the most co-occurrences in OCB research (69 occurrence, 58 links), followed by ethical leadership (45 occurrences, 39 links), and servant leadership (25 occurrences, 26 links). Besides these seven types of leadership, it is believed that other types of leadership were discussed by the scholars because the general term of ‘leadership’ had high occurrences in OCB research (80 occurrences, 77 links). These leadership styles could be connected because it was believed that transformational leadership could enhance the level of OCB among employees (López-Domínguez et al., 2013). The high frequency of discussion in transformational leadership could be seen in Table 1, where one of the most cited paper by Podsakoff et al. (1990) was about “Transformational leader behaviors and their effects on followers' trust in leader, satisfaction, and organizational citizenship behaviors”.

Among the author keywords, a total of 12 country names were found in the analysis, where this probably be due to most of the authors discussed the OCB of the 12 countries. The country that had the most occurrences was China (33 occurrences, 33 links). According to Chin (2015), OCB has been widely discussed because they believed that OCB could boost up harmonious working environment, where China culture emphasizes on harmonious relationship. Besides, due to the inherited complexity and uncertainty in China economy, voluntary positive behaviour (OCB) is highly needed in an organization to help each other when problems happened (Zhang, Bai, Wang, 2014). Hence, it could be justified that ‘China’ has the most occurrences among the author keywords. It was followed by India (18 occurrences, 34 links), Malaysia (15 occurrences, 21 links), and Pakistan (12 occurrences, 24 links). From this analysis result, it could be seen that Asia countries, which are collectivists, emphasized the occurrence of OCB in organizations in order to maintain good relationship. The culture of country in affecting OCB had been discussed, where one of the most cited paper by Moorman and Blakely (1995) was about “Individualism-collectivism as an individual difference predictor of organizational citizenship behaviour”, as indicated in Table 1.

Lastly, based on the analysis of author keywords co-occurrences, it is suggested that future studies should conduct more research on the relationship between corporate social responsibility (CSR) and OCB in organizations. This is because CSR (31 occurrences, 35 links) has become one of the recent author keywords in the area of OCB (Average Publication Year: 2016.839). The relationship between CSR and OCB was frequently discussed through two theories, namely social identity theory (17 occurrences) and social exchange theory (78
occurrences). Future studies could adopt the relevant theory to examine the impact of CSR on OCB. This is because it was believed that the action of CSR from organization could bring positive impression to employees, which in turn the employees will reciprocate by showing OCB to the organizations (Kim et al., 2017).

Figure 5. The bibliometric map of author keywords (Minimum occurrences: 5) ([http://bit.ly/OCBKeywordsGJL](http://bit.ly/OCBKeywordsGJL))

3.7 Limitations of Study
This study has restricted the search for ‘OCB’ to the titles and abstracts. This approach might miss out selecting articles on OCB in Scopus database. It is believed that some authors might not include the keywords of ‘OCB’ in their studies and opted for ‘extra-role performance’ in explaining the extra positive behaviour among employees. Future researchers are recommended to compare the studies on ‘OCB’ using various databases, for example to combine Scopus and WOS. Web of Sciences shows the most ‘hot paper’ in their system compared to Scopus. By combining multiple databases, the bibliometric analysis can obtain more comprehensive results. Furthermore, this study did not include all languages OCB research articles, hence future studies are recommended to include all languages research articles to provide comprehensive results.

4. Conclusion
The discussion and analysis explained an outline of organizational citizenship behaviour growth based on 2,356 related studies in Scopus database. Since the year 2000 till current year, the growth of OCB has been increasing rapidly as OCB is recognized as one of the contributors of performance in organizations. The analysis indicated that the United States and China were the leading countries in OCB research area. The United States was also the most affiliated country in this research area. Other countries such as Sri Lanka and Morocco are recommended to have international collaboration with leading affiliated countries to broaden their research scopes. OCB was active in the management and business area. It was discovered that ‘Organizational Citizenship Behaviour Environment’ (OCBE) was new area in examining OCB. The OCBE area has the potential to become hot topic in future because because OCBE could promote the sustainability of organizations, which is one of the hot issue in this era.

References


**SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIALS**

**Research article:**

A Global Research Trend on Organizational Citizenship Behaviour: A Bibliometric Analysis

**Supplementary information:**

Table S1: Search strategies and query strings

Table S2: The leading CiteScore journals in Organizational Citizenship Behaviour studies (Minimum 20 research articles)

Table S3: The top 50 most productive institutions in Organizational Citizenship Behaviour Research

**Authors:**

Jen Ling Gan¹, Halimah Mohd Yusof²

**Affiliations:**

¹ Azman Hashim International Business School, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, 81310 Skudai, Johor.

² School of Human Resource Development and Psychology, Faculty of Social Sciences and Humanities, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, 81310 Skudai, Johor.

**Corresponding Author:**

ganjenling@gmail.com

---

### Table S1: Search strategies and query strings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Search for:</th>
<th>Query Strings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>i</td>
<td>Central</td>
<td>OCB research articles</td>
<td><code>('TITLE-ABS-KEY (&quot;organizational citizenship behavior&quot;) AND DOCTYPE (ar) AND PUBYEAR &gt; 1983 AND PUBYEAR &lt; 2020 AND (LIMIT-TO (SRCTYPE, &quot;j&quot;) YEAR &gt; 1974 AND PUBYEAR &lt; 2018 AND (LIMIT-TO (SRCTYPE, &quot;j&quot;)))</code></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii.</td>
<td>Central</td>
<td>Review articles in (i)</td>
<td><code>('TITLE-ABS (&quot;organizational citizenship behavior&quot;) AND (TITLE (&quot;recent&quot; OR progress OR review OR critical OR revisit OR advance OR development OR highlight OR perspective OR prospect OR trends OR bibliometric OR scientometric) OR (ABS (progress OR review OR bibliometric OR scientometric ))))</code></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii</td>
<td>Central</td>
<td>OCB research without review articles and excluding non-English languages</td>
<td><code>('TITLE-ABS (&quot;organizational citizenship behavior&quot;) AND DOCTYPE (ar) AND PUBYEAR &gt; 1991 AND PUBYEAR &lt; 2020 AND NOT EID (insert EID of review articles here*) AND (LIMIT-TO (SRCTYPE, &quot;j&quot;)) AND (EXCLUDE (LANGUAGE,&quot;Spanish&quot;) OR EXCLUDE (</code></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Table S2: The leading CiteScore journals in Organizational Citizenship Behaviour studies (With minimum requirement of twenty publications and above)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Name of Journal</th>
<th>CiteScore in 2018</th>
<th>Link of Journal</th>
<th>Organization of Publishing</th>
<th>Amount of Publication</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rank</td>
<td>Institution</td>
<td>Country</td>
<td>No. of Publications</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Michigan State University</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>38</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>University of Haifa</td>
<td>Israel</td>
<td>36</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Indiana University</td>
<td>Indiana</td>
<td>35</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Hong Kong Polytechnic University</td>
<td>Hong Kong</td>
<td>27</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Pennsylvania State University</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Chinese University of Hong Kong</td>
<td>Hong Kong</td>
<td>25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Erasmus University Rotterdam</td>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td>25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Monash University</td>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>19</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Islamic Azad University</td>
<td>Iran</td>
<td>19</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Northern Illinois University</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Lingnan University, Hong Kong</td>
<td>Hong Kong</td>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Renmin University of China</td>
<td>China</td>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>University of Toronto</td>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>The University of Georgia</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>Université Laval</td>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>Kansas State University</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>17</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td>University of South Florida, Tampa</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>17</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.</td>
<td>Sun Yat-Sen University</td>
<td>China</td>
<td>17</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.</td>
<td>University of the Punjab, Lahore</td>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>17</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20.</td>
<td>Universiti Sains Malaysia</td>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21.</td>
<td>Purdue University</td>
<td>Indiana</td>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22.</td>
<td>Seoul National University</td>
<td>South Korea</td>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23.</td>
<td>Hong Kong Baptist University</td>
<td>Hong Kong</td>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24.</td>
<td>Texas A&amp;M University</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25.</td>
<td>University of Oklahoma</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26.</td>
<td>Zhejiang University</td>
<td>China</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27.</td>
<td>Universiti Teknologi Malaysia</td>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28.</td>
<td>University of Illinois at Chicago</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29.</td>
<td>University of New South Wales UNSW Australia</td>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number</td>
<td>University Name</td>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Rank</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30.</td>
<td>Griffith University</td>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31.</td>
<td>Florida State University</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32.</td>
<td>Texas Christian University</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33.</td>
<td>Clemson University</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34.</td>
<td>Temple University</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35.</td>
<td>McMaster University</td>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36.</td>
<td>University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37.</td>
<td>Universiteit van Amsterdam</td>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38.</td>
<td>Loyola University of Chicago</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39.</td>
<td>University of Wisconsin-Eau Claire</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40.</td>
<td>Handelshøyskolen BI</td>
<td>Norway</td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41.</td>
<td>Auburn University</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42.</td>
<td>National University of Singapore</td>
<td>Singapore</td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43.</td>
<td>University of Michigan, Ann Arbor</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44.</td>
<td>Payame Noor University</td>
<td>Iran</td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45.</td>
<td>Universiteit Gent</td>
<td>Belgium</td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46.</td>
<td>University of South Florida System</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47.</td>
<td>Ohio State University</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48.</td>
<td>Arizona State University</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49.</td>
<td>Australian National University</td>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50.</td>
<td>Western University</td>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>