### TABLE OF CONTENTS

**Volume 5 Issue 1 June 2019**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A Collaborative Action Research on Teaching Writing to the Spanish Speaking Equatorial Guinea Students of an EFL Class at a Malaysian University College</td>
<td>1-8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abdullah-Al-Mahmud, Suparna Gupta</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consumer Perceived Value in Understanding Herbal Medicine Consumption: A Conceptual Model</td>
<td>9-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adeline Y. L. Tam, Rohaizat Baharun, Zuraidah Sulaiman</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A systematic synthesis of evidence regarding relationship of physical activity and sports participation with trait self-control</td>
<td>19-40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asif Ali, Muhammad Azam, Jawairyiah Mattiullah, Adeel Akhtar</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restructuring and the Dilemma of State Police in Nigeria: to Be or Not to Be?</td>
<td>41-50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Badamasi Saidu, Zuwaira Haruna Rasheed, Ummu Atiyah Binti Ahmad Zakuan, Kamarul Zaman Bin Haji Yusoff</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enhancing Student Competencies Through Digital Video Production: A Project-based Learning Framework</td>
<td>51-62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lim Seh Hoe, Tay Choo Chuan, Hanipah Hussin, Pang Yee Jiea</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of Social Commerce to Develop Intentions to Buy With Mediating Role of Social Support</td>
<td>63-78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lutf Ullah, Rehana Kousar, Irum Saba, Allah Bakhsh Khan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restructuring Nigeria: The Dilemma and Critical Issues</td>
<td>79-98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muhammad Fuad bn Othman, Nazariah binti Osman, Isah Shehu Mohammed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muktar Bashir</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreign Policy and Afrocentricism: An Appraisal of Nigeria’s Role</td>
<td>107-124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muritala Dauda, Mohammad Zaki Bin Ahmad, Mohammad Faisol Keling</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An Assessment of the Roles and Challenges of Civil Society Organizations on the Process of Democratic Consolidation of Nigeria’s Fourth Republic</td>
<td>125-134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Musa Kabir Umar, Muhammad Ainuddin Iskandar Lee bin Abdullah, Kamarul Zaman bn Hajj Yusouf</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mustapha Alhaji Ali, Ummu Atiyah Ahmad Zakuan, Mohammad Zaki Bin Ahmad</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Factors Affecting the Demand for Mountain Biking at Putrajaya Challenge Park, Putrajaya
Nur Syuhada Che Ibrahim, Syamsul Herman Mohammad Afandi, 3 Zaiton Samdin

Goal-setting Theory (GST) and Gamification Relationship in Increasing Mobile Fitness Apps Engagement: A Conceptual Discussion
Pg Mohd Auza’e Pg Arshad, Rohaizat Baharun, Norzaidahwati Zaidin

The Behavior of Using Simcard in Indonesia Border Area
Ray Sastri, Arbi Setiyawan, Setia Permana, Heny Wulandari

Psychosocial Adjustment Among Abused Children in Residential Care
Ropizah Rohani, Zakiyah Jamaluddin, Abd Razak Abd Manaf

Supply and Demand of the Entry-Level Job Competencies in the Hotel Industry
Siti Fatimah Mohamad, Siti Khalijah Nasiruddin, Sarina Abdul Halim Lim, Syafinaz Ruslan

Emergent Typologies of Small Businesses in a Multi-ethnic Wet Market in Malaysia: A Phenomenological Study
Teik Aun Wong

Technical Resources in E-training Acceptance
Zainab Bello

Drivers and Barriers of Sustainability Practices in Emerging and Developing Economies
Zeeshan Mahmood, Waris Ali, Javed Iqbal, Sadaf Fatima
Editorial Advisory Board

- Prof. Dr. Abdul Wajid Rana, Lahore School of Economics, Pakistan.
- Prof. Dr. Ruswati Suryasaputra, Universitas Wijaya Kusuma Surabaya Indonesia.
- Prof. Dr. Mohd Noor Mohd Sahriff, Universiti Utara Malaysia.
- Prof. Dr. Norshuhada Shiratuddin, Universiti Utara Malaysia.
- Prof. Dr. Raja Suzana Raja Kasim, Universiti Malaysia Kelantan Malaysia.
- Prof. Dr. Cornelia Pop, Babes-Bolyai University Romania.
- Prof. Dr. José G. Vargas-Hernández, University of Guadalajara Mexico.
- Prof. Dr. Maria Alejandra Gonzalez-Perez, Universidad EAFIT Colombia.
- Prof. Dr. Arkadiusz Mironko, Rutgers University, New Jersey USA.
- Prof. Dr. Anayo Dominic Nkamnebe, Nnamdi Azikiwe University Nigeria.
- Prof. Dr. D. E. Laouisset, Nottingham Business School, UK.
- Prof. Dr. Mauricio Garita, Universidad Francisco Marroquín Guatemala.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Johanan Zamilpa, University of Guanajuato Mexico.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Malgorzata Bartosik-Purgat, Poznan University Poland.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Rana Dilshad, Bahauddin Zakariya University Multan Pakistan.
- Assoc Prof Dr Jose E. Munoz, Point Loma Nazarene University California USA.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Vasyl Taras, University of North Carolina at Greensboro, USA.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Noman Ahmad Abbasi, Bahauddin Zakariya University Multan Pakistan.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Silvia Testarmata, Università degli Studi Niccolò Cusano Rome, Italy.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Artee Aggrawal, Amity University Navi Mumbai, India.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Barbara Jankowska, Poznan University of Economics and Business Poland.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Ernesto Tavoletti, University of Macerata Italy.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Sara Poggesi, University of Rome Tor Vergata Italy.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Shankar Chelliah, School of Management Universiti Sains Malaysia.
- Asst. Prof. Dr. Aasma Safdar, Bahauddin Zakariya University Multan Pakistan.
- Asst. Prof. Dr. Omer Faruk Genc, Abdullah Gül University, Kayseri, Turkey.
- Asst. Prof. Dr. Pawel Bryla, University of Lodz Poland.
- Asst. Prof. Dr. Anju Mehta, University of North Carolina at Greensboro USA.
- Asst. Prof. Dr. Khawaja Khalid Mehmood, Bahauddin Zakariya University Multan, Pakistan.
- Asst. Prof. Dr. Husnul Amin, International Islamic University Islamabad Pakistan.
- Asst. Prof. Dr. Sehar-un-Nisa Hassan, NUST Islamabad Pakistan.
- Dr. Diana Bank Weinberg, Berlin School of Economics and law (HWR), Germany.
- Dr. Muhammad Haroon Hafeez, Bahauddin Zakariya University Multan Pakistan.
- Dr. Waheed Asghar, Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority Punjab Pakistan.
- Dr. Otega Okinono, Delta State University, Nigeria.
- Dr. Muhammad Rizwan, Middlesex University Business School, London.
A Collaborative Action Research on Teaching Writing to the Spanish Speaking Equatorial Guinea Students of an EFL Class at a Malaysian University College

Abdullah-Al-Mahmud, Suparna Gupta

University Linton College, Malaysia, abdullahalmahmud1980@gmail.com
Linton University College, Malaysia, suparna@ktg.edu.my

ARTICLE DETAILS

History
Revised format: May 2019
Available Online: June 2019

Keywords
Spanish Learners of English, Equatorial Guinea, Error Analysis, Teaching Writing

JEL Classification:
I21, I22

ABSTRACT

Out of the four universal language skills, writing is the most reliable instrument for assessing one’s proficiency in a foreign language due to its challenge of production with a scope of reflection. So the writing samples of a learner can be a rich source of understanding their error patterns not only of performance but also of competence. The error patterns may be due to a first or second language interruption as well as the learners’ different worldviews, cultural/ethnic features and individual characteristics. However, the aim of this study is to look into the typical mistake patterns in Spanish speaking trilingual students’ English writing. It is based on the performance of a group of students from Equatorial Guinea with Spanish as their first or second language. Their essay samples in an English Communication course of a Malaysian university college are analysed and correlated with the consequent interviews with them. The paper identifies the respective weaknesses to be overhauled and strengths to be utilized in teaching writing to the Spanish speaking trilingual English language learners.

© 2019 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: abdullahalmahmud1980@gmail.com

DOI: 10.26710/jbsee.v5i1.545

1. Introduction

Due to its “reflective space and production challenge” (Al Mahmud, Shamala and Suparna, 2018), writing is the main instrument of diagnosing one’s competence in a foreign language. So the English writing samples can be a rich source of understanding the difficulties and error patterns of a group of EFL/ESL students, such as the trilingual/multilingual learners of the Central African country Equatorial Guinea (EG). The researchers in this study find such students to be a unique group of English learners away from home.

There are certain things common to teaching all four skills, such as teachers’ adequate knowledge of what and how to teach. Accordingly, teachers of English writing need to have adequate knowledge of ELT to be able to make their lessons interesting and love their jobs because “Teaching techniques and teachers’ personalities can certainly affect the attitudes and motivation of students…” (Gardner & Lambert 1972, p. 37). There are two major approaches to developing writing skills: Product approach and Process approach (Nunan 1991). The primary concern of the product approach is grammatical accuracy and this is mainly restricted to discrete sentences. This
approach suggests that grammatical accuracy will ultimately lead to good writing. On the other hand, the main aim of the process approach is to develop writing fluency in the learners without caring much about grammatical accuracy.

Like other skills, in L2 learners’ written scripts, usually, two different features are present, mistakes and errors. Brown (2000) defines ‘mistake’ as a performance error which is a failure to follow a known structure properly, which can be self-corrected. It is inevitable that learners make mistakes in the process of foreign language learning. The question is why students go on making the same mistakes even when such mistakes have been repeatedly pointed out to them. The inquiry is more intriguing for English teachers such as the researchers in this study, when the learner group is a special one, such as the Spanish speaking students of Equatorial Guinea learning English as an L3 (third language) in a third country (Malaysia).

1.1 Equatorial Guinea’s Trilingual Learners of English

Equatorial Guinea is a Central African country with a history of colonization first by Portuguese explorers and later by Spanish colonizers. It gained independence from Spain in 1968. The people of Equatorial Guinea are mostly of Bantu origin. The inhabitants of the northern part of the country speak Fang-Ntumu, while those in the south speak Fang-Okah. The two dialects have differences but are mutually intelligible. The Bubi, who constitute 15% of the population, are indigenous to Bioko Island of Equatorial Guinea. Spanish and French are the official languages of Equatorial Guinea. Spanish has been an official language since 1844, and is still the language of education and administration. 67.6% of Equatorial Guineans, particularly the urban people, can speak the language. EG people’s first contact with English was mainly through the Pidgin English of Portuguese and Spanish colonizers.

English teachers in Malaysia and elsewhere are more or less influenced by the homogeneous views about learning in general and language acquisition in particular. This may obscure the philosophical and cognitive differences of European and African learners from the popular notions in ELT practices. Like every other great community, central African students of Equatorial Guinea have to be understood in terms of their sociocultural and sociolinguistic features that have a link with their individual learning styles and processes. EG students are a collective community due to their tribal identities and the common religious belief in Catholic Christianity (93%). This may have determined not only their worldviews and norms of behaviour but also the probable modes of learning. The findings below may shed light on EG students’ linguistic situation the way of thinking that may have impact upon their learning orientation and their writing in EFL classes.

- **Trilingual situation:** All EG learners of English have a trilingual situation because in the background they have an indigenous mother tongue (e.g. Bube, Fang, Benga, Ndowe) and are proficient in Spanish as their second language and the language of their schooling throughout all the years of education.

- **Spanish as the basis of learning English:** As it is clear to the EG students that their indigenous languages come of a completely different origin, when learning English they use Spanish, another European language, as the basis of their linguistic transfer.

- **Fast and competent learner:** As bilingual and multilinguals generally are, the EG students are smarter in linguistic transfer due to their better cognitive proficiency (Cummins, 2007) and faster in learning English. They are likely to have more conscious learning than unconscious acquisition of English due to their conscious comparison of English with Spanish.

- **Verb versus noun:** These basic differences in perspective are apparent even in the languages. In the African indigenous languages, the verb system is the key to meaning and the Africans "do it" with verbs. In Western languages, “nouns and adjectives are most important. In this "format" we have a noun, representing a thing; then we describe it (Jenkins, 1991).

- **Stative versus aggressive:** Why something happens is not as important as the fact that it has occurred. This is why, Europeans, particularly Americans of European origin, appear aggressive to the Africans. Their manner, their way of relating and talking – they all look strange to Africans.

- **Mixed style:** Like other Africans, EG students’ minds also accept logic but not necessarily in the same cause-and-effect manner as inherent in the Anglo-American convention of writing. They rather use imagination and tend to express in a narrative style and a spiral continuity of ideas, information and personal experience of things in their writings. They do not differentiate the writings by such hard and fast rule of formal and informal.

1.2 Spanish Language versus the English Language
Spanish descended from Latin and belongs to the Romance branch of Indo-European language family. It is one of the six official languages of the United Nations. Equatorial Guinea is the only African country with Spanish as the official and educational language like many Latin American countries. In spite of both being European languages and belonging to the same major language family, the Spanish and English languages have the following differences for teachers/learners of English to note.

- **Scripts:** The Spanish language is written in the Spanish alphabet, which is the addition of one letter, ñ, to the Latin alphabet. While there are many similarities between the Spanish and English consonant systems, the differences between the vowel systems and sentence stress present significant difficulties for English learners.

- **Spelling:** Like Bahasa Malay, there is a strong correspondence between the sound of a word and its spelling in Spanish. The irregularity of English causes problems when Spanish learners write a word they first encounter in spoken language and the vice versa. A specific problem concerns the spelling of English words with double letters. Spanish has only 3 double-letter combinations - cc, ll, rr. English, in comparison, has 5 times as many. “Spanish learners often reduce English double letters to a single one, or overcompensate by doubling a letter unnecessarily” (Coe, 1987, p.99).

- **Grammar Highlights:** There are grammatical differences between the two languages that may cause learning difficulty. For instance, a native Spanish speaker may say “I have 43 years,” because the verb used for expressing age in Spanish is translated to the English verb have. Some other differences are, for instance, in their verb systems, word order, use of articles, and use of auxiliary verbs.

2. The Study Objectives and Method

Every effort and step to learn something new is complimented by slips and error. We practice to make things perfect. Similarly, the language learning process is incomplete without errors and mistakes. Erdogan (2005) opines that mistakes are unavoidable in the process of learning a second/foreign language. Educators can use the errors made by the students to reflect on their teaching and understand the learning behaviour of the students. It is claimed that the partial similarities between such two languages as Spanish and English rather cause learning difficulties (Ulla Connor, 1996). So, instead of transfer analysis, analysing the error patterns in a target language separately and then finding their links with the mother tongue background, cultural/ethnic origin and individual features may contribute more (Ellis, 1994).

The aim of this study is not to find more or novel reasons but to get to the common error/mistake patterns of Spanish speaking EFL learners of Equatorial Guinea, which can help an English teacher of writing. Whether a learner deviation in writing is an error (inherent in a student’s understanding/knowledge) or mistake (occurring due to performance barriers and possible to be self-corrected) is rather secondary for this study. Our target is to look at the frequency and intensity of errors/mistakes and highlight them for ELT practitioners. With a process approach in mind, we attempt to see these patterns at two levels: Word level and Sentence level. So, the research questions of this study are two, which also determine the objectives accordingly:

a) What are the common error patterns of Spanish speaking students’ English essay writing at the word level?
b) What are the common error patterns of Spanish speaking students’ English essay writing at the sentence level?

We chose the simple method of textual-grammatical analysis of the writing samples (Essays and sentences) of a group of Equatorial Guinea students of an English enhancement class in a Malaysian university college. Ten samples have been selected for thorough analysis of the word level mistakes such as verb forms, improper tense and spelling and the sentence level mistakes such as word order, collocation, and subject verb agreement. Two samples were collected from the same ten students, one at the beginning and one at the end of the course to find out the change of error patterns. First, the write-ups were checked in details for word and sentence level mistakes. Then the students have been informally interviewed based on their mistakes for a better understanding of their perspective on the occurrence of the mistakes. The mistakes have been counted for their frequency and intensity.

3. Analysis and Discussion

The tables in the following sections show the summary reports of error analysis at word, and sentence levels as found in Spanish speaking students of the aforementioned class. The reports present a comparative picture of their
writing performance at all levels before and after taking the English enhancement course so that the generalizations can be made about the persisting error patterns. The result highlights are elaborated below.

3.1 Word Level Problems
As the tables 1-2 suggest, a vast majority of EG English learners have word-level problems in English writing. However, they are fast leaners as can be evidenced by the reduced number of mistake doers after taking the English class with explicit notification of the problems. In addition, the mistake frequency too has decreased after a learning session of about two months from 60% to 45% in verb/tense forms and 65% to 35% in spelling. Spanish speaking students generally have legible -if not so beautiful - handwriting perhaps due to their familiar ground language - Spanish- using the same Roman alphabet of English. Spelling mistakes seem to be largely due to substituting the Spanish spelling for English vowel sounds, writing a word the way they pronounce (“tree” instead of “three”), or over generalizing newly learned spelling patterns (e.g. applying the ending “-ck” incorrectly in the word “speack”), or following Spanish capitalization rules that do not require days of the week and languages to be spelled with the initial letter in uppercase. Errors related to verbs are mainly the improper use of verbs and/or tense in sentences like the following for instance:

a) We -- from Equatorial Guinea. (We are from Equatorial Guinea.)
b) I go home last week. (I went home last week.)
c) He -- coming to class. (He is coming to class.)

What is to be noted overall, even after taking intensive English proficiency courses the two types of mistakes/errors reported in this study have persisted with little change in frequency but not in their nature. This is where such studies are useful for practicing teachers.

Table 1: Summary of word-level errors of Spanish speaking EG students before and after English courses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Type of Error</th>
<th>Word Level (Before)</th>
<th>Word Level (After)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Number of Students Doing it</td>
<td>Average Frequency of Error (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Improper verb and tense forms</td>
<td>9 of 10</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Spelling</td>
<td>10 of 10</td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2: Reasons and examples of word-level errors of Spanish speaking EG learners

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Word Level (Before &amp; After)</th>
<th>Reasons/Explanation of Errors</th>
<th>Examples of Errors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Type of Error</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Improper verb and tense forms</td>
<td>• Different verb system in Spanish</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• No auxiliary verb in Spanish</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Verbs that are irregular in the past tense are problematic because they must be memorized, even though the present continuous is formed the same way in English as in Spanish.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Spelling</td>
<td>• Substituting the Spanish spelling for English vowel sounds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Over generalizing the “s” of plural.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Over generalizing newly learned spelling patterns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Following L1 capitalization rules</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.2 Sentence Level Problems
At the sentence level, interestingly mistake frequency in word order has been reduced from 65% to 25%. This may be due to the Spanish language having a similar-to-English word order of the main elements in a sentence (i.e. Subject-Verb-Object/SVO). However, different word orders of Spanish for the noun-adjective (i.e. noun followed
by adjective) persists in many students, for example in sentences like ‘I like food Arab (…Arab food). Spanish syntax is generally more flexible than English syntax, which leads EG learners to use awkward sentence structures. So we find sentences like:

- You not like the food Malaysia?
- Today is a day it is raining and we sleep.
- I was all day weekend outside

Parts of speech seem to be another problem that persists with a slight change of frequency after English classes. The main difficulties are found to be in the change of parts of speech according to their function, for example in ‘Do not long your class’ (…lengthen).

Subject-verb agreement problems are due to the fact that Spanish verb conjugation is the same for the subjects “you”, “he”, and “she”, whereas in English an –s must be added to the ending for “he,” “she” and “it”. The mistakes in the use of articles have been because in the Spanish language nouns can be without an article or proper nouns too can be used with the definite article. For example, in English, one must say, “I am a teacher,” but the Spanish equivalent translates literally as “I am teacher.” Use of the auxiliary verb “do” is difficult to acquire because there is not an equivalent Spanish word used in forming questions or in making negative statements. So while making questions and negatives, sentences have been found such as:

- __ You like do homework? (Do you like to homework?)
- I __ no like potato chips. (I do not like potato chips.)

### Table 3: Summary of sentence-level errors of Spanish speaking EG students before and after English courses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Error</th>
<th>Number of Students Doing it</th>
<th>Average Frequency of Error (%)</th>
<th>Number of Students Doing it</th>
<th>Average Frequency of Error (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Word order</td>
<td>6 of 10</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>3 of 10</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Improper word (Wrong collocation)</td>
<td>7 of 10</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>6 of 10</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Parts of Speech</td>
<td>5 of 10</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>2 of 10</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 SV agreement</td>
<td>6 of 10</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>4 of 10</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Use of Articles (omitted or inserted)</td>
<td>7 of 10</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>4 of 10</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Use of Prepositions (incorrect or omitted)</td>
<td>7 of 10</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>4 of 10</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Auxiliary Verbs (missing)</td>
<td>8 of 10</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>5 of 10</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Double Negative</td>
<td>6 of 10</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>3 of 10</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 4: Reasons and examples of sentence-level errors of Spanish speaking EG learners

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Error</th>
<th>Reasons/Explanations of Errors</th>
<th>Examples of Errors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Word order</td>
<td>Adjectives come after nouns in Spanish, which causes this reversed order.</td>
<td>- You not like the food Malaysia?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Today is a day it is raining and we sleep.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- I like food Arab.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- I was all day weekend</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Improper word (Wrong collocation)  
- Unfamiliar with English expressions  
- “Much” and “many” is essentially interchangeable in Spanish  
- So much students go to the lobby.  
- I have 28 years.

Parts of Speech  
- Trouble in conversion from one part of speech to another  
- Problem in using superlative-comparative and prepositions  
- “Please do not long your class”  
- “more better”

SV agreement  
- Spanish verb conjugation is the same for the subjects.  
- My friend come to class everyday.  
- My mother go the church every sunday.

Use of Articles (omitted or inserted)  
- In Spanish nouns can be without an article or proper nouns too can be used with the definite article.  
- My father is _ engineer in _ big company.  
- We must go to the Tesco.

Use of Prepositions (incorrect or omitted)  
- Prepositions are very tricky as well, especially since the Spanish preposition “en” can be translated as “in” or “on”.  
- My uncle is in home now.  
- The sons of my uncle go __ the basketball court for play basketball.  
- Come at class.

Auxiliary Verbs (missing)  
- The auxiliary verb “do” is difficult to acquire because there is no equivalent of it in Spanish in forming questions or in making negative statements.  
- ___ You like do homework?  
- I ___ no like potato chips.

Double Negative  
- Double negative is not wrong in Spanish grammar.  
- My teacher no give me nothing last class.

4. Implication and Conclusion  
Spanish speaking EG learners’ error patterns and the tendencies in their English essay writing as discovered in this study are worth organized reflection. We cannot just discard them as deviations. Both students and teachers should have a rational attitude towards this phenomenon. Through this study, we understand that L1 or a language used as a postulation ground for learning a next language (such as the case of EG learners depending on Spanish which is their second language for learning English) cannot be rejected totally in SLA classroom. The positive transfer in case of Spanish is particularly true about the writing systems and the Spanish-English cognates or similar words. Following are some more specific implications of this study for teachers of English writing:

- As Spanish uses the same Roman alphabet of English with little phonological variation, it is particularly helpful to provide lessons on spelling and pronunciation with explicit comparisons in a list of relevant words.
- Comparison with the ground language (Spanish in this case) can be integrated into ESL lessons for EG learners of English so that the teachers can better anticipate what errors might be made and repeated and the learners can “self-monitor” their use of English.
- Teachers of English writing need to know how to utilize positive transfer by showing probable similarities between English and Spanish and partially or judiciously allowing students to use Spanish for the convenience of idea generation.
- Visual aids featuring common English errors with their correct usage could be created to display in the classroom. Students may be asked to make flashcards with the correct usage for practice.
- Teachers (with some knowledge of the Spanish language) can reduce negative transfer or mother tongue interference by clarifying the differences between the two languages or simply clarifying English sentence structure and other things by showing examples.
- Narrative portions in Spanish speaking students’ write-ups can be maintained in the form of examples to elaborate the supporting points in an essay.

References  
Consumer Perceived Value in Understanding Herbal Medicine Consumption: A Conceptual Model

1 Adeline Y. L. Tam, 2 Rohaizat Baharun, 3 Zuraidah Sulaiman

1Azman Hashim International Business School, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, Malaysia
Email address: adelinetamyl@gmail.com

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

Introduction: Facing extensive competition, the marketers and producers of herbal medicine products (HMP) should pay more concern to maintaining repeat purchases and keeping customers loyal with their products.

Purpose: This study aims to (1) propose the dimensions of consumer perceived value (CPV) for HMP; and (2) propose a conceptual framework to test CPV influences on consumption behavior, repurchase intention and customer loyalty.

Methodology: The value dimensions of HMP included functional value (price), functional value (quality), social value, emotional value (feeling), and conditional value (holistic treatment value). CPV was proposed as an antecedent of repurchase intention and customer loyalty.

Implications: A conceptual framework with a second-order multi-dimensional CPV as the antecedent of repurchase intention and customer loyalty was proposed. This article proposed a conceptual framework to analyze the influence of value dimensions on HMP. This could provide useful theoretical insights into the values perceived in HMP consumption behavior.

© 2019 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

DOI: 10.26710/jbsee.v5i1.614

1. Introduction
Herbal medicine products (HMP) is referred as ‘medicinal products containing exclusively herbal active substances that differ from chemically defined substances in several aspects; most notably, they consist of complex multi-component mixtures resulting from, e.g., extraction of plant parts such as roots and leaves’ (Du et al., 2014: 218). HMP can be consumed in various forms, such as pure herbs, processed herb-based applications, traditional herbs pharmaceuticals products, and herb supplements (Rezai et al., 2013; Wu, Wang, & Kennedy, 2013). HMP is not part of conventional or western medicine but is categorized as a Complementary health Approaches (CHA). HMP is frequently used to prevent illness or maintain health rather than to treat illnesses (Craft et al., 2015; Duffy et al., 2017). HMP is the most commonly used CHA in many countries such as the United Kingdom (Posadzki et al., 2013), Taiwan (Chang, Liu, & Chen, 2014), and Malaysia (IPH, 2015). The market for HMP has grown tremendously in the last few years. The global market for HMP (composed of tablets, capsules, powders and
extracts), grew by 13 per cent from $63.05 billion (USD) in 2014 to $71.19 billion (USD) in 2016 (Hexa Research, 2017).

In response to the high demand for HMP, HMP producers should pay more attention to ensure customers satisfaction. Satisfied customers were willing to buy more and were more loyal to the company (Chiu et al., 2014). Moreover, the costs of attracting repeat purchasers is less than new customers (Chang, Backman, & Huang, 2014). To encourage repeat purchases and build up a loyal customer base, it is important to understand how consumers value the HMP and whether their value perceptions influence decisions to repeat a purchase and to be loyal to a HMP. Consumer Perceived Value (CPV) was found to be associated with higher customer satisfaction, who in turn are likely to have higher repurchase intention and are more loyal to a company (Atulkar & Kesari, 2017).

Few studies have investigated the influence of CPV on determining CHA consumption, particularly for HMP. Dodds, Bulmer, & Murphy (2014) has, applied a qualitative method, provided a comprehensive understanding on CPV of CHA consumers. However, they investigated CPV by assuming that the various approaches under the umbrella of CHA was a single entity and that consumer decision-making processes did not vary for different CHA modalities. Although some studies focused on the HMP use, they did not examine the HMP use for health maintenance and rather focused more on health seeking groups (Charaf et al., 2015; Tangkhatkumjai et al., 2014). Therefore, influence of CPV on HMP use among the healthy population is worth investigating.

This study proposed (1) to developed multi-dimensions CPV for HMP, and (2) a conceptual framework to test the influences of CPV on consumption behavior (repurchase intention and customer loyalty) to provide a better understanding of HMP consumption. This paper is organized as follows. The following section outlines a literature review of CPV and consumption behavior. Next, a proposed conceptual framework is presented. The final section concludes this paper with implications and limitations.

2. Literature Review

2.1 Consumer Perceived Value and Theory of Consumption Value (TCV)

Value is abstract, multi-faceted, and complex, and having different meanings for consumers, researchers, and even practitioners (Gallarza & Gil-saura, 2006). CPV is an ‘interactive relativistic preference experience; the evaluation of some object (product/service) by some subject (consumer)’ (Holbrook, 1999:5). In this paper, CPV is defined as customer utility assessments that are subject to experience and are inherent to or linked with the consumption of products or services. (Woodruff, 1997; Zeithaml, 1988).

This study used a multidimensional approach, which utilizes several interrelated dimensions, combining both utilitarian and hedonic aspects to capture CPV. Leroi-Werelds et al. (2014) concluded that multi-dimensional, consequence-based methods were the best because they had the best predictive ability and fit the concept of ‘value-in-use’. Consumer behavior is a function of various value dimensions (Gonçalves, Lourenço, & Silva, 2016). Thus, Theory of Consumption Value (TCV) (Sheth et al., 1991), which theorizing five value dimensions (functional, social, emotional, epistemic, and conditional) for a multi-dimensional CPV analysis, were used in this study. TCV proposed that CPV influences consumer purchase choices and that the most discriminating value in a purchase decision, product type selection, or branding decision, even for the same product, were not identical (Sheth et al., 1991).

TCV value dimensions were recognized as ‘provides the best foundation for extending existing value constructs’ (Sweeney & Soutar, 2001: 205). TCV has been applied to many contexts, such as team sport games (Kunkel, Doyle, & Berlin, 2017), green products (Gonçalves et al., 2016; Suki, 2016), online retailing (Carlson, O’Cass, & Ahroldt, 2015), and mobile services (Yang & Lin, 2017). Reviewing these studies could provide additional understanding on CPV influence on consumption behavior. Table 1 summarizes the influence of value dimensions in term of beta coefficient value (β), on dependent variables (buying behavior, intention to purchase or use, and loyalty) in the literature from the year 2011. Most studies that applied TCV did not used all five dimensions in their studies, instead using the three most crucial dimensions, FV, SV, and EV. Although most studies used first order value-dimensions to investigate the direct relationships between CPV and dependent variables, some other researchers (e.g. Kunkel et al., 2017; Carlson, Rosenberger, & Rahman, 2016) used a second-order CPV to reflect CPV as a multi-dimensional construct.
Table 1 Relationship between perceived value and dependent variable

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>β-value of Value Dimensions</th>
<th>Dependent Variable</th>
<th>Note</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>^Kim et al., 2011</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>aSelf-image expression; bRelationship support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>^Koller et al., 2011</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>^Wang et al., 2013</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>aIndirect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chiu et al., 2014</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>aX</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goh et al., 2014</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>^Seyal et al., 2014</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>^ Carlson et al., 2015</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>aAustralian sample; bFrance sample;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gallarza et al., 2015</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carlson et al., 2016</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Choi et al., 2016</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gallarza et al., 2016</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>^Suki, 2016</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>aPurchase volume</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sun et al., 2016</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Willems et al., 2016</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>cX</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zainuddin et al., 2016</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>FV only has a significant relation with satisfaction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>^Khan &amp; Mohsin, 2017</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>aConsumer choice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>^Kunkel et al., 2017</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>aStudy 1; bStudy 2; cCommitment to maintaining relationship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>^Yang &amp; Lin, 2017</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>aRelationship</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TCV proposes that value dimensions are independent and contribute differently to various consumer choice situations, in which value dimensions are not interchangeable, do not share common theme and might not be covary with each other, fulfilling the formative construct criteria of Jarvis, MacKenzie, & Podsakoff (2003). Except for Kunkel et al. (2017) and Choi, Ko, & Kim (2016), past studies (Carlson et al., 2015; Carlson et al., 2016) applied first order reflective constructs for value dimensions and second order formative construct of CPV. With one exceptional (Choi, Ko, & Kim, 2016), the hierarchical CPV was found to relate positively to purchase intention and loyalty with β-values ranging between .30 and .67 (Carlson et al., 2015; Carlson et al., 2016; Kunkel et al., 2017).

2.1.1 Functional value

Functional value (FV) are the perceived benefits for a product’s functional, utilitarian or physical performance, which may be derived from product attributes (reliability, durability, and price) (Sheth et al., 1991). In contrast to TCV that proposed FV as a single dimension, Sweeney & Soutar (2001) proposed that there are two types of FV, price/value for money and performance/quality, which are distinct from one another. The price/value for money dimension (FVP) is the utility derived from a product due to a reduction in its perceived short term and longer term costs while performance/quality (FVQ) is the utility derived from the perceived quality and expected performance of a product (Sweeney & Soutar, 2001). Dodds et al. (2014) found that care quality and treatment efficiency were two most important value dimensions sought by CHA consumers. Similarly, Pevec & Pisnik (2016) pointed out that both price and perceived quality were two important value dimensions of health service.

Except for two studies (Seyal et al., 2014; Kim, Gupta & Koh, 2011), FV predicted significantly the dependent variables (Table 1). Most studies analyzed the FVP and FVQ, separately and concluded that the either one of FV dimensions was positively associated with the dependent variables (Yang & Lin, 2017; Chiu et al., 2014), with β-values ranging between .08 and .55. The influences of FVP and FVQ on dependent variables were contradicting. In those studies that confirmed a positive relationship between FVQ and behavior or intention, FVP was found to be insignificant (Suki, 2016; Yang & Lin, 2017). Contrarily, those studies that confirmed FVP had a significant positive relationship with the dependent variables found that FVQ was insignificant (Khan & Mohsin, 2017; Willems, Leroi-Werelds & Swinnen, 2016). Undoubtedly, FV is an important value perceived by CHA users (Dodds et al., 2014). Nevertheless, past studies did not provide evidence on the influence of FVP compared to FVQ in determining repurchase intention and loyalty for HMP. This study proposed to study the perceived value of FVP and FVQ in relation to HMP consumption behaviors (repurchase intention and loyalty) to allow for a comparison between the influences of FVP and FVQ on HMP consumption.

2.1.2 Social value

Social value (SV) is defined as the perceived utility derived from a product’s ability to enhance associations with one or more specific social group(s) and social self-concepts (Sheth et al., 1991). Ghazali et al. (2017) noted that as consumers tend to buy a product that follow society’s perception, social appeal is influential in developing consumer product preferences. Likewise, SV is crucial to consumers by enhancing individual self-concept and self-identification as an opinion leader to use healthcare services (Zaimuddin et al., 2016). Using CHA, allowed users to gain sense of self via feelings of well-being (Dodds et al., 2014).

SV was found to be significantly and positively associated with consumer choice (Khan & Mohsin, 2017), intention to purchase or use (Yang & Lin, 2017) and customer loyalty (Seyal et al., 2014) with β-values ranging between .07 and .53 in all studies (Table 1). Although some researchers (Yang & Lin, 2017; Kim et al., 2011) proposed two sub-dimensions for social value, these sub-dimensions were only appropriate for the respective research area only.
The social value dimension is perceived by consumers as a crucial value dimension. This study proposed to investigate social value influences on HMP consumer repeat purchase intention and loyalty.

2.1.3 Emotional value
Emotional value (EV), also known as hedonic or experiential value, is the utility derived from feelings or various affective states, such as calm, peaceful mind and relaxed (Sweeney & Soutar, 2001). Although Holbrook (1999) suggested that EV should include two sub-dimensions, feeling and aesthetics, TCV proposed EV as a single dimension that most concerned with feelings or affective states. The typical personal and emotional experiences of individuals (positive, negative, or mixed) influence an individual’s EV (feeling or affective arousal) (Suki, 2016).

Consumers who expected to receive a desire EV, will proceed with the consumption experience. Table 1 recorded only the EV of feeling tested in past studies. EV has a significant positive direct relationship with intention to purchase or use (Yang & Lin, 2017; Zainuddin et al., 2016) and customer loyalty (Gallarza et al., 2016) (β-values ranging from .10 to .60) in all but four studies (Khan & Mohsin, 2017; Choi et al., 2016; Suki, 2016; Seyal et al., 2014) (Table 1). Concern for EV is critical for health care products (Zainuddin et al., 2016) and CHA (Dodds et al., 2014). Hence, this study included EV to investigate the influences of CPV on repeat purchase intention and loyalty of HMP consumers.

2.1.4 Epistemic value
Epistemic value (EPV) refers to a product’s capacity to arouse curiosity, provide novelty, and/or satisfy a desire for knowledge (Sheth et al., 1991). Not only will new experience provide EPV, changing to new alternatives will also provide EPV because customers might be bored or satiated with current brands, be curious, and have a desire to learn (Sheth et al., 1991; Yang & Lin, 2017). Lin & Huang (2012) pointed out that consumers seek novelty as ‘to create a database of potentially useful knowledge’ which may be importance in the future and may serve to improve problem-solving skills. Knowledge promotes attitudes and predisposes behavior (Suki, 2016).

Relatively fewer studies have tested EPV. The influences of EPV were inconsistent in past studies (Table 1). EPV was found to positively and significantly predict buying behavior (Suki, 2016) and use or purchase intention (Yang & Lin, 2017; Goh, Suki, & Fam, 2014; Wang, Liao, & Yang, 2013). In contrast, EPV was found to be negatively related with consumer choice (Khan & Mohsin, 2017) and commitment to maintain relationships (Kunkel et al., 2017). A likely explanation for these inconsistencies is that EPV arise from the satisfaction of curiosity, the provision of novelty, or acquisition of knowledge, which were related to use of new product or alternatives, but negatively related to familiar products or brands. For consumers who are loyal to a product or brand, they might be satisfied with a product value dimensions other than EPV. Since EPV was negatively related with decisions to maintain long-term relationships (Kunkel et al., 2017), EPV is excluded in this study.

2.1.5 Conditional value
Conditional value (CV) arises from a specific situation or set of circumstances faced by a consumer that enhance FV or SV (Sheth et al., 1991). These specific situations or circumstances might related to particular time (seasonal), place, or personal condition (Lin & Huang, 2012). CV arises when products and services were used in these specific situation or circumstances (Gonçalves et al., 2016). CV is always designed to reflect situations related to the type of product or service surveyed in a study. For example, in a mobile application usage context, the CV was related to the utility that arises from the use of an application in a specific environment (when lost), time, place, or other constraints (Wang et al., 2013). While purchasing a green product, the CV of the green product is compared against conventional products under specific conditions, such as worsening environmental conditions and the availability of green products in general (Suki, 2016).

CV has been tested in few studies, Khan & Mohsin (2017) was the only study found that CV significantly and negatively predicted consumer choice. A possible explanation for insignificant results was that the condition applied in their study might be perceived as less valuable to respondents. Hence, it is vital to identify conditional variables that fit a study’s context and purpose. A possible condition for personal perception towards CHA use, an appreciation of holistic treatments.

Holistic treatment value a CV of HMP, which is appreciated by both CHA and HMP users (Dodds et al., 2014; Rhee, Ng, & Dusek, 2017). Holistic orientation emphasis on treating the whole person (rather than symptomatic approach) (Ganasegeran, Rajendran, & Al-Dubai, 2014). Dodds et al. (2014) pointed out that a majority of CHA
users appreciating holistic value, which involved the integration of whole (mind, body and spirit). Ganasegeran, Rajendran, & Al-Dubai (2014) also found that an appreciation for holistic treatments was significantly related to CHA use. And hence, this study proposed to include holistic treatment value as a CV of HMP.

2.1.6 Multi-dimensional Consumer Perceived Value

The literature revealed that HMP users appreciate the multiple dimensions of CPV (Goh et al., 2014; Khan & Mohsin, 2017; Suki, 2016). As proposed earlier, the dimensions that should be included in CPV are FVP, FVQ, SV, EV, and CV. These five value dimensions constituted the first order reflective constructs of CPV. EPV are not tested in this study. CPV is a second order formative construct (Carlson et al., 2016) in line with TCV’s proposition that these value dimensions are independent and contribute differently to various consumer choice situations. Accordingly, the following proposition was proposed:

Proposition 1: FVV, FVQ, SV, EV, and CV formed the reflective first order components of CPV. CPV is a formative second-order construct.

2.2 Consumption Behaviors

CPV in this study focused on consumer value perception after product used among HMP users. Thus, this study proposed to examine the HMP consumer behavior using two aspects, repurchase intention and customer loyalty, which are relevant to building long-term relationships between producers and customers.

2.2.1 Repurchase intention

Intention is an individual’s subjective probability to perform a specific behavior (Fishbein & Ajzen, 1975). The Theory of Planned Behavior (Ajzen, 1991) proposed that intention is the only predictor of behavior. Repurchase intention is referred to as ‘the individual’s judgement about buying again a designated service from the same company, taking into account his or her current situation and likely circumstances’ (Hellier et al., 2003: 1764). A repeat customer’s decision to buy the same product or service again is influenced by perceived value from past purchasing experiences, which encompasses multiple value dimensions.

The literature confirmed that CPV is an antecedent of purchase intention, in which all CPV dimensions except for conditional value were found to positively related with purchase intention (Carlson et al., 2016; Yang & Lin, 2017; Goh, Suki, & Fam, 2014). However, limited studies have examined the influence of CPV on repurchase intention among the CHA users. Chiu et al. (2014) confirmed that utilitarian and hedonic value were significantly associated with repurchase intention, while Willems et al. (2016) provided evident that FVP (efficiency), SV, and EV (aesthetics and play) predicted repurchase intention but FVQ (product and service excellence) did not predict repurchase intention. This study examined the influence of second-order formative CPV, with FVP, FVQ, SV, EV, and CV as the first-order, on repurchase intention among HMP users. The following proposition was proposed.

Proposition 2: CPV is positively related to repurchase intention.

2.2.2 Customer loyalty

Loyalty is defined as a commitment to repurchase or re-patronize a preferred product or service consistently. (Oliver, 1999: 34). Chahal & Kumari (2011: 93) pointed out that customer loyalty reflected in two aspects, attitudinal and behavioral. It is more cost efficient to retain customers than to attract new customers (Chang et al., 2014), justifying the importance of focusing on customers who have ever used HMP. Higher value helps in generating customer satisfaction, loyalty and re-patronage intentions (Atulkar & Kesari, 2017). Satisfied customers were willing to buy more and were more loyal to the company (Chiu et al., 2014). Therefore, CPV directly and significantly influences customer loyalty (Gallarza et al., 2016).

Past studies confirmed that three value dimensions (FV, SV and EV) were significantly related to loyalty (Gallarza et al., 2016; Koller, et al., 2011; Seyal et al., 2014; Gallarza et al., 2015). Carlson et al. (2015) also reported that the formative construct of CPV (FVP, FVQ and EV dimensions only) were significantly related to customer loyalty. CV was only tested in Seyal et al. (2014), but the relationship between CV and loyalty was not significant. This might be due to the conditional factors applied in their study, which were perceived as less important by respondents and thus not valued. This study proposed to test the influence of second-order formative CPV, with FVP, FVQ, SV, EV, and CV as the first-order, on customer loyalty for HMP. The following proposition was proposed.

Proposition 3: CPV is positively related to customer loyalty.

14
3. Conceptual Framework and Research Propositions Development
Following the discussion on variables relationships, the conceptual framework is presented in Figure 1. The independent variables were second-order CPV and its five first-order value dimensions (FVP, FVQ, SV, EV, and CV). The dependent variables were repurchase intention and customer loyalty. P1-P3 represent the propositions generated in this study.

![Figure 1 Conceptual framework](image)

4. Limitation and Conclusion
This study’s framework provides new insight in HMP consumption behavior by focusing on the influence of CPV on repurchase intention and customer loyalty. Underline by TCV, this study theoretically contributes to the literature by proposing CPV value dimensions (FVP, FVQ, SV, EV, and CV) specifically for HMP, in which CV tested holistic treatment value among consumers. This study framework could be applied in cross-sectional study to investigate HMP consumption.

This study enables industry practitioners to better understand consumer purchase behaviors and capitalize on the growing interest of consumers in HMP marketing. Information on CPV allows marketers to better plan promotion strategies and product design. In line with the large and increasing consumption of HMP by consumers, knowing the CPV will allow marketers to produce the HMP required by consumers. Besides that, understanding CPV influences will allow marketers to plan strategies to retain existing customers.

References


Khan, S. N., & Mohsin, M. (2017). The power of emotional value: Exploring the effects of values on green product


A systematic synthesis of evidence regarding relationship of physical activity and sports participation with trait self-control

1 Asif Ali, 2 Muhammad Azam, 3 Jawairyiah Mattiullah, 4 Adeel Akhtar

1 Assistant Professor, Department of Physical Education & Sports Science, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Pakistan. goraya128@hotmail.com
2 Assistant Professor, Department of Physical Education, University of Gujrat, Pakistan.
3 Scholar, Virtual University, Islamabad, Pakistan.
4 Assistant Professor, Department of Commerce, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, Pakistan. adeel.akhtar@bzu.edu.pk

**ARTICLE DETAILS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>History</th>
<th>Revised format: May 2019</th>
<th>Available Online: June 2019</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Keywords</th>
<th>Self-Control, Exercise, Activity, Prevention, Trait</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**JEL Classification:**

J20, J29, R10, R11

**ABSTRACT**

Individuals with low level of trait self-control exhibit several negative behaviors such as violence, addictive behaviors (drug addiction, technological addictions), suicide, unhealthy eating, and criminal behaviors. In contrast, high level of self-control thought to be associated with positive psychosocial and physical health related outcomes. Interventions contribute to boost self-control seems essential for individual with risk of low trait self-control.

The purpose of this study is to systematically evaluate the relationship between physical activity and trait self-control. For this purpose, full-text articles were searched in research databases including Psych INFO, PubMed, Medline, The Cochrane Library, Wiley Library, Taylor & Francis, Science Direct, Springer, ERIC, JSTOR, Google scholar, and Sage Journals. Following screening for the study selection criteria and assessment of risk of bias, twenty one studies (13 cross-sectional, 5 longitudinal and 3 interventions) with low or moderate risks of bias were finally selected for qualitative synthesis. Findings from all of the included studies consistently showed that there was a significantly positive relationship between physical activity and trait self-control. It is suggested that increasing self-efficacy, decreasing aggression, and improvement in positive and negative emotional states might be underlying mechanisms working for beneficial effects of physical activity on trait self-control. These suggest that physical activity and exercise may serve as a potential means to enhance trait self-control. Practical implementation and recommendations for policy makers are put forward in this connection.

© 2019 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: adeel.akhtar@bzu.edu.pk


DOI: 10.26710/jbsee.v5i1.627
1. Introduction
The construct of trait self-control is considered significantly critical while determining influential factors effecting human behaviors. In the existing literature, considerable discrepancies exist concerning its conceptualization, assessment tools and procedures, and even its name. However, in general, current theories agreed upon the view that trait self-control can be conceptualized as the capacity of an individual to regulate successfully emotions, feelings, immediate tendencies, impulses, and behaviors, or to control predominant dispositions in an attempt to attain long-term goals in the later life (D. T. De Ridder & Lensvelt-Mulders, 2018). In addition, trait self-control implies as the potential to exhibit consciously in wide range circumstance and situations that can be evaluated using self-reported questionnaires (Allom, Panetta, Mullan, & Hagger, 2016; Tangney, Baumeister, & Boone, 2004).

Research suggested that people's varying with respect to their ability and level of trait self-control that resulting in exerting different impact on certain behaviors, life style, attitudes and over all life of the individuals. For example, individuals with high trait self-control exhibit less criminal behavior (Bobbio, Arbach, & Vazsonyi, 2019), less alcohol and fast food consumption, and healthy eating (Martin S. Hagger et al.). Moreover, research also demonstrated positive association of trait self-control with stable emotions, self-esteem, being open, perspective taking and negatively related with shyness, personal distress, and unconcern (Pilarska & Baumeister, 2018). Other studies indicated that individuals having higher level of self-control exhibited higher academic performance, good social relations, and higher psychological health (Tangney et al., 2004). In contrast, negative effects such as borderline personality symptoms (Hallquist, Hipwell, & Stepp, 2015), depression and loneliness (Özdemir, Kuzucu, & Ak, 2014), aggression and addictive behaviors (Kim, Namkoong, Ku, & Kim, 2008), gambling disorder (von Hammerstein et al., 2018), burnout (Seibert, May, Fitzgerald, & Fincham, 2016), loose temperament (Nęcka, Korona-Golec, Hlawacz, Nowak, & Gruszka-Gosiewska, 2018), obesity and eating disorders (Mackenbach et al., 2019), and suicidal behavior (Baer et al., 2018) appeared to be related with low level of self-control potentials. In the same line, Malouf et al. (2014) found that there was inverse association of trait self-control with maladaptive behaviors including suicidal behavior, unhealthy sex behavior, and substance dependency in a sample of jail inmates.

These findings suggest that the trait self-control is a multi-facets and complex construct that is related with wide range of behaviors, thoughts, and emotions. Therefore, professionals in psychology, therapeutic experts dealing with psychiatric diseases, sociologist, educationist, and criminologists are deeply concerned with the issues generated due to lack of trait self-control (Piquero, Jennings, Farrington, Diamond, & Gonzalez, 2016). In line with above discussions, it seems crucially important to identify the therapeutic interventions, and ways that could help improve self-control in wide range of populations. The experts have been showing great concern regarding therapeutic interventions to deal with issue of low self-control on their target populations. The interventions, approaches, and strategies focusing on developing the skills that regulate emotions, behaviors, cognition and promote problem solving and social skills have importance for considerations in this regard (Crick & Dodge, 1994; Elias, Zins, & Weissberg, 1997; Stein, Thurston, & Mather, 1997). Interventions such as mindfulness training (Rowland, Wenzel, & Kubiak, 2016), situational self-control strategies (Duckworth, Gendler, & Gross, 2016), cognitive-behavioral therapy (Scarpa & Reyes, 2011), relaxation training, cognitive coping strategies, video tape training/role playing interventions, and immediate/delayed rewards clinical interventions (Piquero et al., 2016), have been the main focus of previous research in an efforts to improve trait self-control. On the other hand, researchers are curious to explore more alternative approaches such as physical activity and exercise (Scully, Kremer, Meade, Graham, & Dudgeon, 1998).

Certain level of physical activity and exercise is considered important to constitute several psychological, social, cognitive, and health related benefits that may contribute dealing with self-control concerns. In this connection, previous research showed that an optimal level of physical activity appeared to reduce obesity and poor eating (Fan & Jin, 2013), depression, anxiety, psychotic symptoms, and suicidal behavior (Tao et al., 2007). Moreover, sufficient amount of physical activity is suggested to promote good eating habits, fulfilling the commitments, emotional control, timely completing the household chores, financial spending control, improvement in study habit and reduced negative behaviors such as perceived stress, alcohol, smoking, emotional distress, and caffeine consumption (Oaten & Cheng, 2006) Exercise has also been suggested to foster self-confidence, self-esteem, self-worth, controlling deviant tendencies, problem solving ability, happiness, self-discipline, pleasant mood, and socialization (Lubans, Plotnikoff, & Lubans, 2012; Nieman, 2002). Previous research has also corroborated that athletes encounter various challenges that require utilization of self-control capacity. It is also known that positive psychological states (happiness, pleasant mood) can result in promoting self-control (D. De Ridder & Gillebaart, 2016).
In addition, involvement in physical activity improves characteristics and skills those are essential for self-control abilities. On the other hand, the negative psychological characteristics are related with low self-control can be improved through physical activity. Therefore, this discussion theoretically led to assume that physical activity may be an effective source to improve trait self-control.

Furthermore, lack of involvement in physical activity has become global health concern in recent decades. A large proportion of the people do not meet the basic requirement of participation level in physical activity in almost all of the countries of the world. This lead to prevalence of psychological disorders, physical diseases, social problems, and exerting extra load on nation’s economies (Penedo & Dahn, 2005). In the same vein, self-control has some relationship with health related behaviors including physical activity or unhealthy behaviors such as sedentary behavior, as it has consistently been demonstrated in the past research (D. T. De Ridder & Lensvelt-Mulders, 2018). Then, plausibly it points to the assessment of the efficacy of this relationship. This would be useful for policy makers to make decisions regarding promotion of positive health and nullifying negative health behaviors in the communities. Therefore, the purpose of this review is to assess the relationship of physical activity, exercise, and sports participation with trait self-control. To date, as per our knowledge, no review has systematically presented findings from published work on this topic. This review essentially would add quality based knowledge to the policy makers, psychologists, educationists, and health related professional for making decisions based on evidence based recommendations.

2. Methodology

2.1 Study Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria

Inclusion criteria was as follows: 1) the studies with the objective of assessing relationship of physical activity, exercise, sports participation, sedentary behavior, physical fitness on self-control either as a primary focus or as a sub theme, 2) cross-sectional, cohort, longitudinal, experimental, case-control, randomized control trials, and intervention research studies, 3) studies involved all sample types including students, community and healthy or patient samples, 4) studies used participants with any age (e.g., children, adolescents, adults, and old) that have both male and female genders, 5) studies in English language and conducted in any country/nation, 6) studies included physical activity-related keywords (e.g., physical activity, exercise, sports participation, physical fitness, sedentary behavior, athletes or non-athletes) and the keyword of self-control either in titles or in abstracts, 7) studies measured trait self-control, and 8) studies published in peer review journals. Studies were excluded if they failed to meet the following criteria: 1) full texts were not available, 2) studies did not measure physical activity, exercise, sports participation, sedentary behavior, physical fitness or self-control, 3) studies presented findings solely based on behavioral measures of self-control. However, study is included if it used combination of both self-reported and behavioral measures of self-control. There is less agreement among the researchers on the use of behavioral measures of self-control (Allom et al., 2016), 4) studies presented insufficient data regarding the objectives of this review, 5) unpublished studies, commentaries, letters to the editor, conference proceedings, books and book chapters, thesis and dissertations, 6) case-reports, published reviews, case-series, qualitative studies, pilot studies, 7) studies lacking sufficient methodological details, and 8) studies used self-regulation as synonyms to self-control. Since, the constructs of self-control and self-regulation have not been considering the same in research literature, therefore, we excluded the studies used self-regulation approach as synonym to the concept of self-control (Gillebaart, 2018; Mann, De Ridder, & Fujita, 2013).

2.2 Search Strategy


2.3 Study Selection

Based on inclusion and exclusion criteria, two experts independently performed extensive review to select the studies for this review. The experts performed review in following two steps: firstly, they screened for titles and abstracts of the retrieved studies looking for information and data relevant to the objectives of this review. And secondly, full texts of the retrieved articles were also reviewed for potential relevancy. Three meetings were
conducted among experts to discuss and resolve any discrepancy regarding study selection. Differences of opinion regarding selection of studies were resolved through discussions between both experts. A third expert was consulted in case the disagreement still existed between the two experts. Figure 1 illustrates the full details of study selection procedure.

Figure 1. Search strategy and selection of studies

2.4 Assessment of Risk Of Bias
Two independent reviewers assessed the risk of bias for the studies met inclusion and exclusion criteria. Quality of the cross-sectional studies was evaluated using The Newcastle-Ottawa Scale (NOS) adapted for cross-sectional studies (Herzog et al., 2013). The Effective Public Health Practice Project (EPHPP) Quality Assessment Tool for Quantitative Studies was used for appraisal of risk of bias of longitudinal and intervention studies (Project, 1998). This tool is considered valid and reliable for quality appraisal of cohort, longitudinal, randomized control trials, time series, control clinical design, and case-control studies and have been widely used in previous research (Armijo-Olivo, Stiles, Hagen, Biondo, & Cummings, 2012; Thomas, Ciliska, Dobbins, & Micucci, 2004). Quality ratings of the eligible studies were performed based on the scoring system prescribed by EPHPP reviewer’s dictionary and manual. Based on the appraisal, the selected studies were classified as weak (two or more weak ratings), moderate (one weak rating), and strong (no weak ratings) categories. Discrepancies regarding the quality ratings for admissible publications was resolved through discussions between the two experts and agreement level was determined with a Kappa = .82.

3. Results
3.1 Study Selection
2496 titles and abstracts were carefully screened for admissibility. After removing ineligible abstracts and titles, 58 full text articles were retrieved and considered for further screening. 35 studies were excluded due to not meeting
inclusion criteria for this review and finally 26 articles were selected for quality assessment in full text. Of these, 13 cross-sectional studies were categorized as very good, good or satisfactory. 5 longitudinal studies and 3 intervention studies having low or moderate risk of bias were selected for qualitative synthesis.

3.2 Study Characteristics

3.2.1 Cross-Sectional Studies (N=13)

We found thirteen eligible cross-sectional studies that examined association or relationship of physical activity or physical fitness with trait self-control. The details about characteristics of the selected studies are presented in table 1. A. Study characteristics were extracted following careful reviewing of the selected studied by two experts. These characteristics included author name and year of publication, population, sample size, sample selection procedure, participant’s ages and gender, physical activity and trait self-control measures, data analysis tests, and results and findings.

The total number of participants consisted of 7309 ranging from 134 to 2812 participants in these studies. Five studies were performed in adolescents from school, colleges, or university students and eight studies in adults. Five studies included both adolescents and adults participants. Participant’s ages ranged from 12 to 65 years in these studies. Among thirteen admissible cross-sectional studies, two studies included only male participants whereas remaining eleven studies included both male and female participants. Majority of the studies used convenience sampling while a few studies used purposive (Tedesqui & Young, 2017) or cluster sampling (Chen, Li, Xie, Li, & Zhang, 2018; Chen et al., 2019) procedures. None of the studies used random or systematic sampling procedure for sample selection. The response rates of the participants were greater than 80% in Ten out of thirteen studies. Less than half of the studies (5/13) controlled for almost all of the important confounding factors, whereas, approximately half of the eligible studies (6/13) controlled for the most important confounding factors (e.g., age, sex), except two studies that did not report controlling of confounding variables.

In particular, three studies included professional athletes, one study selected participants from fitness gym, and one recruited participants from soldiers attending physical training. All of these studies used self-reported valid and reliable methods/tools of measuring sports participation, physical activity, exercise, and trait self-control. However, only one study administered objective measures of physical activity. Majority of these studies (8/13) used either short or long version of self-control scale developed by Tangney et al. (2004). In these studies, three were conducted in Netherlands, two in USA, two in China, and one in each of the countries including Finland, Israel, Norway, Canada, South Korea, and UK. All of the thirteen cross-sectional studies were found to have significantly positive relationship or association of sports participation, physical activity, exercise, or physical fitness with trait-self-control.

3.2.2 Longitudinal (N=5) and Intervention Studies (N=3)

We found five longitudinal studies assessed association between physical activity and trait self-control. Table 1.B and C illustrates characteristics of the longitudinal and intervention studies included in this article. These studies consisted of 30 to 3993 participants and included 7153 participants in total. Three studies included participants from university student’s population and two studies were conducted in general population. Participant’s ages were ranged from 15 to 45 years, respectively. The follow up period varied from 2 weeks to 6 years across the five longitudinal studies. Only one study used random sampling approach while reaming four studies used convenience sampling procedures, however, they did justify the sample size. Four out of five studies used valid and reliable physical activity measures. All of the studies used valid and reliable trait self-control measures. These studies also did control for the most important confounding factors either in designs or in analysis. These studies were conducted in Germany (N=2), Netherlands (N=1), Finland (N=1), and Canada (N=1). All of these studies reported significantly positive relationship between physical activity and trait self-control.

We identified three studies with intervention research paradigms assessing association between physical activity and trait self-control. The major characteristics of the three intervention studies are described in Table 1.C. Of these, one study applied randomized control trials (Cecchini, Montero, Alonso, Izquierdo, & Contreras, 2007), one study controlled clinical trial (Shachar, Ronen-Rosenbaum, Rosenbaum, Orkibi, & Hamama, 2016) and one study had time series design (Will Crescioni et al., 2011). Participant’s ages were ranged from 9 to 60 years in these studies. Participants of two studies consisted of school children and participants of one study were selected from university students and general population. These studies included 921 participants in total that ranged from 86 to 649 participants. The intervention period ranged from 5 to 24 weeks, respectively. Of the three intervention studies, two
used team sports as intervention strategy and one study used general physical exercise program (e.g., walking, jogging, aerobic dance, cycling, and swimming). All of the three studies measured trait self-control with valid and reliable tools. One study was conducted in USA, one in Israel, and one in Spain, respectively. All of the three studies had low risk of bias and had overall strong rating. Findings from the intervention studies consistently showed significantly positive relationship of sports participation, exercise, and trait self-control.

Table 1. A. characteristics of cross-sectional studies assessing relationship of physical activity and trait self-control

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author/country</th>
<th>Population, sample, Participants ages</th>
<th>Male %</th>
<th>Response rate (%)</th>
<th>PA measure</th>
<th>Trait self-control measure</th>
<th>Analysis</th>
<th>Results/ findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(Wills, et al., 2007) USA</td>
<td>sample of 539 selected from three public high schools with mean age 14.6 years (SD 0.7)</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>Vigorous exercise, sports participation, and sedentary behavior were measured through 4 items selected from valid and reliable measures</td>
<td>12 items from multiple measures of self-control driven from past research</td>
<td>confirmatory analysis, correlations, and structural equation modeling analysis</td>
<td>Trait self-control were positively related with consumption of healthy eating, sports participation, and negatively related with sedentary behavior. Poor trait self-control exhibited decreased vigorous exercise.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study Author(s)</td>
<td>Sample Description</td>
<td>Sample Size</td>
<td>Age Range</td>
<td>Measure Details</td>
<td>Analysis Details</td>
<td>Findings</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Junger et al., 2010</td>
<td>Sample consisted of 201 adolescents using convenience sampling with ages between 15 and 20 years</td>
<td>50</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Trait self-control ($\beta = .21$) was positively related with physical activity but negatively related with BMI ($\beta = -.17$).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kinnunen et al., 2012</td>
<td>Sample sizes was 482 men ages ranged from 18-29 years ($M = 20$ years)</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shachaf et al., 2014</td>
<td>Sample comprised of 491 10th-11th- and 12th grade Israeli high schools students. They were divided into three comparison groups including 170 in sports group and 185 in non-sports but</td>
<td>44</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The participants in the sport group reported greater self-efficacy, attribution style, and self-control compared with the subjects in the no-activity and physical fitness conditions.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Toering, et al., 2015) Norway</td>
<td>639 male players from soccer teams took part in this study. Participants ages were ranged from 15 to 38 years (M = 23.6, SD = 4.8).</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>Soccer players were divided into groups based on their performance and experience.</td>
<td>Tangney’s SCS chi-square statistic, confirmatory factor analysis, exploratory factor analysis, Multiple regression analyses, Pearson correlation</td>
<td>Players with higher performance and players spending more time in practice exhibited significantly higher trait self-control.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Tedesqui, et al., 2017) Canada</td>
<td>Online survey study used, purposive sampling to select 244 athletes (M age =21.96 years, range = 12–43 years),</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>Athlete’s level of skill and playing practice were assessed through valid and reliable 7 item valid tool.</td>
<td>Tangney’s SCS confirmatory factor analyses, Partial correlations, two separate one-way analyses of covariance.</td>
<td>Enhanced trait self-control was related with higher level of sport participation commitment and more time spending in sport practice.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study</td>
<td>Sample Size/ Characteristics</td>
<td>Sample Size</td>
<td>Average Age</td>
<td>Level and Experience</td>
<td>Self-Control Questionnaire</td>
<td>Statistical Methods</td>
<td>Results/Findings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Chen, et al., 2018) China</td>
<td>210 national level Chinese boxers were recruited through cluster sampling. Participants’ average age was 18.89 years while their average experience was 4.93 years.</td>
<td>36.2</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>Level and experience of boxers were measured through valid and reliable tool.</td>
<td>Self-control questionnaire for Chinese athletes</td>
<td>regression coefficients</td>
<td>The level of trait self-control was high in national boxers of China. Self-control was significantly greater as a function of athlete’s level of competitions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Chen, et al., 2019) China</td>
<td>The sample size was 414 Chinese Professional boxers those were selected using cluster sampling. Average age of the sample was 17.72 years.</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>Level and years of experience was measured through self-reported questions</td>
<td>Self-control Questionnaire for athletes</td>
<td>correlation analysis, variance analysis, regression analysis, Structural equation modeling,</td>
<td>Boxers with greater competition level exhibited higher self-efficacy and higher self-control. Aggression was negatively associated with self-control. Level of self-control was increased as a function of increasing years of training of boxing (β= 0.202, p &lt; 0.001).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Briki, et al., 2016) USA</td>
<td>Sample consisted of 317 American adults (Mean age 32.97 years, SD age 11.30),</td>
<td>29.7</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>Self-reported regular exercise, BREQ-2</td>
<td>Tangney’s SCS</td>
<td>Correlation Analyses, Structural model analysis</td>
<td>Motivation toward physical exercise (MPE) significantly enhanced trait self-control and trait self-control further enhanced subjective well-being in regular exercisers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study</td>
<td>Methodology</td>
<td>Sample Size</td>
<td>Mean Age</td>
<td>Age Range</td>
<td>Data Analysis</td>
<td>Findings</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Gillebaart et al., 2017)</td>
<td>Online survey</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>38.8</td>
<td>18-65</td>
<td>Spearman’s rank-order correlations, regression analysis</td>
<td>Trait self-control was associated with increased duration of exercise (r = 0.33, p &lt; 0.001) and strength of exercise habit (r =0.31, p&lt;0.001).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Park et al., 2016)</td>
<td>Convenience sampling</td>
<td>345</td>
<td>17.7</td>
<td>15-18</td>
<td>Structural equation modeling, independent t-test and one way analysis of variance</td>
<td>Sports participation significantly and positively influenced self-control (β=.154, p &lt; .05).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Beenackers et al., 2017)</td>
<td>Survey</td>
<td>2812</td>
<td>44.8</td>
<td>25-75</td>
<td>Generalized linear regression models</td>
<td>High trait self-control was related with increased physical activity.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Sample included 146 undergraduates university students with their ages ranged from 18-52 years (M age = 23.43, SD = 6.26).

Table 1. B. Characteristics of longitudinal studies evaluated relationship between physical activity and trait self-control.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author/country</th>
<th>Population, sample size and ages, follow up period</th>
<th>Male %</th>
<th>Return rate %</th>
<th>PA measures</th>
<th>SC measures</th>
<th>Analysis</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>Sample included 146 undergraduates university students with their ages ranged from 18-52 years (M age = 23.43, SD = 6.26).</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>PAQ</td>
<td>Tangney’s SCS</td>
<td>Means, standard deviations and correlation coefficients, hierarchical regression analysis,</td>
<td>There was a positive relationship between physical activity and trait self-control. Trait self-control significantly predicted physical activity.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>One group pre-post longitudinal design using convenience sampling in which 63 university students ages ranged from 19 to 32 years (M= 23.5; SD =2.8) were participated. Selected variables were measured consecutively for 20 days.</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>83.3</td>
<td>Self-reported physical exercise participation for 20 days using single item valid tool.</td>
<td>Tangney’s SCS</td>
<td>estimated multilevel models analysis</td>
<td>Reduction in physical activity was significantly lower in the participants showed higher trait self-control when compared with the participants exhibited lower trait self-control.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study Details</td>
<td>Design Type</td>
<td>N/R</td>
<td>Participants</td>
<td>Measures</td>
<td>Methods</td>
<td>Findings</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Droppers et al., 2001</td>
<td>Longitudinal study between 1991 and 1997 with pre-post observations in which 3993 participants (ages 15-74 years) were selected through random sampling from the population of 27000 those were followed up after six years.</td>
<td>N/R</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>Three items concerning physical activity during leisure time from valid measure</td>
<td>RLCS</td>
<td>Individuals with lower self-control reported reduced physical activity at follow-up measures.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pfeffer et al., 2017</td>
<td>Longitudinal prospective design with 2 weeks interval, 118 participants. Convenience sampling, (age: M = 23.18 [SD = 2.57] years; range: 18–30). Sample size was statistically estimated and justified.</td>
<td>46.6</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>Single item vigorous physical activity. Validity was determined.</td>
<td>Tangney’s SCS</td>
<td>Logistic Regression, Exploratory Analyses, High trait self-control predicted higher physical activity behavior.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hagger et al., 2018</td>
<td>Correlational two-wave Prospective study design, Total samples size 3,249. Sample one comprised Finnish males military men (N = 679) from Finland. Sample 2 included 1072 university students from the Spain (N = 282), UK (N = 258), Luxembourg (N = 172) and Philippines (N = 114). Samples Three and four consisted of university students from the Australia (N = 254) and United Kingdom (N = 150). Sample 5 included 235 students from two public schools of Finland. And 280 undergraduate students from 5 universities in Australia were selected for Sample 6.</td>
<td>Botmalefemale with varied ratio in sub samples</td>
<td>3.0 to 59.62</td>
<td>Self-reported participation in physical activity, walking and physical activity done after school hours</td>
<td>Tangney’s SCS</td>
<td>MANOVA, chi-square tests, independent t-tests, regression analyses, the comparative fit index (CFI), the Tucker-Lewis index, RMSEA</td>
<td>Results from the samples of school and university students revealed that there was positive relation between physical activity and trait self-control.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Mean ages of the total sample ranged from 13 to 21 years. Follow-up period was 2,4 and 8 weeks.

(Stork, et al., 2016) Canada

online survey with pre-post prospective study design with 4 weeks period, sample 30 university undergraduate students, mean age of 18.17 years, sample size was justified through power calculations.

| 23 | 98 | IPAQ-S | Tangney’s SCS | Physical activity was predicted by trait self-control (rs = 0.34, p = 0.04). Students with higher trait self-control engaged in exercise for longer durations than that of participants depicted lower trait self-control. |

Table 1. C. characteristics of intervention studies examined relation between physical activity and trait self-control.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author/country</th>
<th>Population, sample size and ages, study design, group conditions</th>
<th>Male %</th>
<th>Return rate %</th>
<th>PA measures/PA interventions</th>
<th>Self-control measures</th>
<th>Analysis</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(Ceccchini, et al., 2007) Spain</td>
<td>Randomized control trial study design, Population was 250,000. Total sample size was 186 middle school students with ages 13.6 mean years. The sample was randomly divided into three age and gender matched groups including experimental group A, experimental group B, and a control group.</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>Playing soccer for 5 weeks. Group A provided with beginners’ five-a-side soccer five level, Group B provided level four, and control group did not participated soccer playing.</td>
<td>CASCQ</td>
<td>Univariate analysis</td>
<td>Experimental group A exhibited significant improvements in delayed gratification, trait self-control, and process self-regulation as a result five weeks of playing soccer than control group.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Shachar, et al., 2016) Israel</td>
<td>Controlled clinical trial design, 649 Israeli school children (ages = 9-11 years) equally divided into sports intervention group and no sports intervention control group.</td>
<td>Experimental group provided with a total of 120 hours of sports activities after school hours for 24 weeks. Sports included soccer, basketball, volleyball, and mini-football whereas Control group received no sport activity.</td>
<td>Tangney’s SCS</td>
<td>Pearson correlations, three-way multivariate analysis of covariance (MANCOVA), linear regression, two-way MANCOVA, and structural</td>
<td>Subjects in the sports intervention condition showed significantly greater improvement in self-control, significant reduction in aggression, negative emotions, and hostile thoughts in comparison with participants in control group.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
USA

12 weak time series single group design, 86 participants (ages, M = 26.56, SD = 10.77) participated in weight loss program for 12 weeks those required to record exercise daily for 12 weeks and trait self-control once in every two weeks. The program focused on reducing weight through gradually adapting healthy food and increased physical activity. Exercises included walking, jogging, aerobic dance, cycling, and swimming.

29.1  62.3  1

BMI, Five questions regarding physical activity drawn from previous research

Tangney’s SCS

Regression analysis, Multilevel modeling

At baseline, participants exhibited higher trait self-control appeared to engage in more physical activity compared with subjects yielded lower trait self-control. Subjects demonstrated greater trait self-control significantly increased amount of exercise more during 12 weeks of intervention period as compared with subjects exhibited lower trait self-control.

Abbreviations: PA = physical activity; BMI = body mass index; LTP = leisure time physical activity; BREQ-2 = The Behavioral Regulation Exercise Questionnaire-2; SRHI = Self-Report Habit Index; SQUASH = Short Questionnaire to Assess Health-enhancing physical activity; PAQ = physical activity questionnaire; IPAQ-S = International Physical Activity Questionnaire, Short Form; SC= self-control; SCS = Tangney Self-Control Scale; SRQ = Self-Regulation Questionnaire; NEO-C = self-discipline; Rosenbaum,s SCS = Rosenbaum,s Self-Control Scale; SCRS = Self-Control Rating Scale; RLCS = Rotter’s locus of Control Scale; CASCQ = The child and adolescent self-control questionnaire;

3.3 Quality of the Studies

3.3.1 Cross-Sectional Studies (N=13)

In this review, 13 cross-sectional studies were identified that were classified as good (N= 8) or satisfactory (N=5) quality rating (See table 2. A. for details). All of the cross-sectional studies included in this review selected the participants using convenience sampling approach. Among 13 selected studies, seven studies were classified as good quality rating. These studies used self-reported valid and reliable physical activity and trait self-control measures, controlled for at least most important confounding factors, reported sufficient response rate except two(Beenackers, Oude Groeniger, van Lenthe, & Kamphuis, 2017; Kinnunen, Suihko, Hankonen, Absetz, & Jallinoja, 2012) studies, sufficiently representative sample, satisfactory sample size with the exception of three(Chen et al., 2018; Gillebaart & Adriaanse, 2017; Toering & Jordet, 2015) studies, and applied appropriate statistical tests for analysis. Five of the selected cross-sectional studies were rated as satisfactory level of study quality(Allom et al., 2016; Briki, 2016; Junger & van Kampen, 2010; Park et al., 2016; Shachaf & Katz, 2014; Wills, Isasi, Mendoza, & Ainette, 2007). These studies had insufficient representativeness of samples and
unsatisfactory sample sizes. However, these studies did use valid and reliable physical activity and trait self-control measures, controlled the most important confounding factors, had sufficient level of participant’s response rate and used appropriate statistical tests for analysis.

Table 2. A. Quality assessment of the cross-sectional included studies based on The Newcastle-Ottawa Scale (NOS) adapted for cross-sectional studies.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study</th>
<th>Selection</th>
<th>Comparability</th>
<th>Outcome</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Representativeness of the sample</td>
<td>Sample size</td>
<td>Non-respondents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wills, et al., 2007</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Junger, et al., 2010</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kinnunen, et al., (2012)</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shachaf, et al., 2014</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toering, et al., 2015</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Park, et al., 2016</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tedesqui, et al., (2017)</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chen, et al., 2019</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gillebaart , at al., 2017</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beenackers, et al., 2017</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allom, et al., 2016</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Quality Rating procedure:

- Very Good Studies: 9-10 points
- Good Studies: 7-8 points
- Satisfactory Studies: 5-6 points
- Unsatisfactory Studies: 0 to 4 points

### 3.3.2 Longitudinal (N=5) and Intervention Studies (N=3)

Out of five admissible longitudinal studies, one study is categorized in strong rating having low risk of bias with no weak rating in any of the component of quality assessment tool (Stork, Graham, Bray, & Martin Ginis, 2017). The details regarding quality ratings are depicted in Table. 2. B and C respectively. In addition, four out of five longitudinal studies were classified in moderate quality ratings (Droomers, Schrijvers, & Mackenbach, 2001; Martin S Hagger et al., 2018; Pfeffer & Strobach, 2017; Schöndube, Bertrams, Sudeck, & Fuchs, 2017). These
studies were characterized by following limitations: weak rating in selection bias 2/5 (Pfeffer & Strobach, 2017; Schöndube et al., 2017) and lower response rate (2/5) (Droomers et al., 2001; Martin S Hagger et al., 2018).

With regard to quality of the intervention studies, we identified three studies with over all strong quality rating (Cecchini et al., 2007; Shachar et al., 2016; Will Crescioni et al., 2011). These studies adequately minimized the selection bias in study samples (2/3) (Cecchini et al., 2007; Shachar et al., 2016), used strong study designs (2/3) (Cecchini et al., 2007; Will Crescioni et al., 2011), controlled for the major confounding factors (2/3) (Shachar et al., 2016; Will Crescioni et al., 2011), used valid and reliable physical activity and trait self-control measures (3/3) (Cecchini et al., 2007; Shachar et al., 2016; Will Crescioni et al., 2011), and had low withdrawal rates (2/3) (Cecchini et al., 2007; Shachar et al., 2016). None of the intervention studies admissible to this article had weak rating in any of the component of quality assessment criteria.

Table 2.B. Quality assessment of longitudinal studies based on Effective Public Health Practice Project (EPHPP) Quality Assessment Tool

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study</th>
<th>Selection bias</th>
<th>B Study Design</th>
<th>C Confounders</th>
<th>D Blinding</th>
<th>E Data collection methods</th>
<th>F Withdrawal</th>
<th>G Intervention integrity</th>
<th>H Analysis</th>
<th>Overall rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Droomers, et al., 2001</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>W</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pfeffer, et al., 2017</td>
<td>W</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stork, et al., 2016</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Strong</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hagger, et al., 2018</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>W</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2. C. Quality assessment of intervention studies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study</th>
<th>Selection bias</th>
<th>B Study Design</th>
<th>C Confounders</th>
<th>D Blinding</th>
<th>E Data collection methods</th>
<th>F Withdrawal</th>
<th>G Intervention integrity</th>
<th>H Analysis</th>
<th>Overall rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cecchini, et al., 2007</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Strong</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crescioni, et al., 2011</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Strong</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Rating scale: Strong = S, Moderate = M, Weak = W

Criteria for overall rating of the study
Strong= No weak rating
Moderate = One weak rating
Weak = Two or more weak rating

4. Discussions
Lack of self-control constitute the likelihood of increased aggression, violent behavior, crimes and delinquencies, sedentary behavior, addictive tendencies, and inactivity that may increase wide range of social and health related
problems. In this connection, interventional strategies are crucially needed that may improve self-control in individuals with low level of self-control. Therefore, this study sought to systematically analyze the efficacy of physical activity, sports participation, and exercise to enhance self-control potentials. As per our knowledge, this is the first article that synthesized the findings from studies with sufficient quality and methodological rigor that tried to present findings on the said area of research. Thirteen cross-sectional studies with good (7/13) or satisfactory (6/13) quality ratings, five longitudinal studies with strong (1/5) or moderate (4/5) quality ratings, and three intervention studies with strong overall quality ratings presented findings in support of significantly positive relationship of physical activity, exercise, and sports participation with trait self-control and the vice versa. The consistency in findings from cross-sectional, longitudinal, and intervention studies provide sufficient evidence in favor of positive relation between physical activity and trait self-control. No study found inverse relation among these variables. Based on these findings, it can be suggested that participation in exercise and sports activities may be considered as a therapeutic mean to enhance self-control in individuals with low trait self-control and vice versa.

These findings are congruent with previous research indicating that participation in sports and physical activities foster positive psychological traits (Shachaf & Katz, 2014), and emotional well-being (Donaldson & Ronan, 2006). Some studies included in this review proposed the mechanisms that might account for the positive relationship between physical activity and trait self-control. For example, findings from an intervention study conducted by Shachar et al. (2016), proposed that improvement in positive and negative emotions, and reduction in physical aggression as a result of participation in sport activities likely to foster self-control. Other studies suggested that participation in physical activities likely to increase self-efficacy, decrease aggression (Chen et al., 2019), and constitute positive habits (Gillebaart & Adriaanse, 2017) that in return might contribute improving trait self-control.

5. Strengths and Limitations of this Study
This study performed systematic literature search in the major research databases and presented well-structured and extensive synthesis of evidence. We evaluated the studies using valid, reliable and extensively used study quality assessment tools that were more appropriate for cross-sectional, longitudinal and intervention studies. Three intervention studies and one longitudinal study with strong methodologies and lower risk of biases added strength to the findings of this study. However, this study had some following limitations. For example, some of the included cross-sectional and longitudinal studies had moderate level of methodological quality that had risk of biased findings.

5.1 Future Research
Randomized control trial research design is considered as the gold standard design with respect to methodological quality. Experimental studies with randomized controlled trial (RCT) are limited on this topic as we could identify only one high quality study that used RCT design. Further research should focus on high quality studies with these research designs. Cross-sectional studies with larger sample sizes using systematic sampling techniques are also needed. Previous research heavily relied on using self-reported physical activity measures. Future research should use objective measures of physical activity while assessing relationship of physical activity and the ability of self-control. The link between type and form of physical activity and trait self-control can be another important venue of research that should be taken into consideration in the future.

6. Conclusion and Practical Implications
Individuals with criminal record have shown low level of trait self-control, hence, Policy makers should consider planning of exercise programs in jails for prisoners to engage them in sporting and exercise programs to enhance self-control levels in these individuals that could further reduce the tendency of criminology. Moreover, in current years, involvement in violent, bullying, aggressive and wide range of addictive behaviors has increased significantly among youth in education institutes. This posed a serious threat to peaceful learning environment of these institutions. Youth with these negative tendencies can be treated by offering special intervention programs including physical activities. This may help to improve self-control that further tends to reduce these negative behaviors among youth. On the other hand, dealing with the problem of inactivity or low level of physical activity has become major concern across the world. Since, higher level of trait self-control is related with increased physical activity, therapeutic intervention that could foster self-control can be helpful to increase level of physical activity in peoples with sedentary behavior. In sum, physical activity can be suggested as a potential medium of improving trait self-control. These recommendations have important implication for the professionals related with
criminology, health, psychology, and education. Policy makers can consider these guidelines while making decisions in these areas.

References


and Mindfulness within Ambulatorily assessed network Systems across Health-related domains in a healthy student population (SMASH): study protocol for a randomized controlled trial. Trials, 17(1), 570-570. doi: 10.1186/s13063-016-1707-4


Restructuring and the Dilemma of State Police in Nigeria: to Be or Not to Be?

1 Badamasi Saidu, 2 Zuwaira Haruna Rasheed, 3 Ummu Atiyah Binti Ahmad Zakuan, 4 Kamarul Zaman Bin Haji Yusoff

1School of International Studies Universiti Utara Malaysia; Federal University Birnin-Kebbi, Kebbi State, Nigeria, Email adress: saidubadamasi@gmail.com
2Waziru Umaru Federal Polytechnic Birnin-Kebbi, Kebbi-state Nigeria
3School of International Studies, Universiti Utara Malaysia
4School of International Studies, Universiti Utara Malaysia

ARTICLE DETAILS

Abstract

The success or otherwise of any police system lies in the institutional structure upon which the institution is framed. As a federation, there is need to stress for devolution of power through restructuring for effective police system. This is necessary giving the heightened insecurity and centralise nature of the police institution in the country. The over centralisation of policing has made the institution to be control and influence at the discretion of the political head as provided in section 214 of the 1999 constitution as amended. On the other hand, giving the political immaturity in Nigeria, decentralising the national policing to give way to state police also has its own implication of over beardedness, possible political influence of the governors against oppositions, poor funding and formalisation of political thugs and party supports at the detriment of the security business. In view of these therefore, effective police system will be achieved through constitutional amendment of section 214 by removing the discretionary command of the political heads which derogated. The institution should be place under justice system to be govern by rule of law.

© 2019 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

DOI: 10.26710/jbsee.v5i1.554

1. Introduction

From the sectarian killings in Mambila and plateau, armed banditry and cattle rustling in Zamfara state, kidnapping in Birnin-gwari to continuing farmers-harder’s crisis in Benue, Nasarawa and southern Kaduna state, Nigeria is witnessing a state of gruesome killings, and even the north-east continued to be ravaged by the activities of Boko-Haram. For even those who have not been cut-off by this variety of security challenges, life isn’t easy or straight forward. Jobs continued to be elusive for the young teaming population who are also continued facing harassment by the police special ant-rubbery squad (SARS). Nigeria’s infant’s mortality rate is one of the highest in the world losing 2300 children under the age of 5 a day (Kasali & Odetola, 2016). Of those who survived, another 2.5million suffers from stunted growth annually due to lack of nutrition (Kasali & Odetola, 2016). The catalogue of the
problems facing the country is long, and there is no gang saying we are not where we should be as a nation. Things are not working, and some say is because of the way we are structured from big government that is too expensive and unwieldy exercising control over too many things to the autonomies of regions. These issues are some of the problems that many believed to be the reasons for the dysfunctionality of the Nigeria’s state. For many therefore, according to Nwogwugwu & Kupoluyi (2015) the answer lies with “restructuring”.

Given the preceding, it is indisputable at present to state that Nigeria is bedevilled by multitudes of existential security challenges. The recent most recurring of the situation in a broader sense are Farmers-herders conflict, youth intolerant (unemployment), kidnapping, cyber-crime, insurgency, robbery, corruption, poverty increase and persistent attacks among communities (Nwogwugwu & Kupoluyi 2015). Against this background, since independence in 1960, there was never time in the history of Nigeria when agitation for restructuring of the federation for fiscal federalism and by extension decentralisation of the Nigeria police force is not at stake, but the call for that is alarming at present due to the magnitude of these conflicts and the general insecurity in the land. The return to democratic governance in 1999 till date, has witnessed an increase in criminal violence due to freedom and liberty enjoyed by the Nigerian people (Eme & Anyadike (2012). Evidently, the rate of the insecurity from 1999 to date, including kidnapping, militancy, ritualism, traffic in persons, Boko- Haram insurgency, child abuse, rape, motivated conflicts of ethnic and religious killings by unknown gunmen is graphically high. Other sources of the insecurity in the land include public disorder resulting from poor governance, economic down turn (recession), public mistrust and dishonesty by looting of public funds which has combinedly heightened the tarnished justice system and tensed the insecurity situation (Akume & Godswil, 2016).

The existing security challenges have made Nigeria to be on the watch list of many countries as “unsafe zone” for businesses and tourism visitation. For instance, Adefi & Anchor (2013) has predicted in 2014, on the likelihood of graphic increase in social unrest and disorder of the Nigerian state with high risk of uncertainty among other countries such as Egypt, Libya, Somalia, Yemen and Afghanistan. In different part of the country such as in the south-south, the militancy activities of various militia groups have scared away lots of foreign investors who moved to some neighbouring countries believed to be safer than Nigeria, Ochei in an interview with The Pointer (2018, July). In the north-eastern part of Nigeria states i.e. Borno, Adamawa and Yobe etc insurgency by the Boko- Haramites have destroyed many lives and properties with broad day light terror in some major cities which have deserted local investors. Major commercial midpoints in the country such as Aba, Kano, Lagos and Port Harcourt are increasingly challenged with banditry in banks and financial centres, offices, shops and market areas with the recent occurrence of bank robbery in Offa town in Kwara State, Ogunbiyi interviewed by PM News (2018, July).

The increasing violent and non-violent security challenges in the country, for instance, the high proportion of cattle-rustling, banditry and indiscriminate kidnapping in the north-western region of Kaduna and Zamfara states; and pastoralist/farmers clashes in north-central states of Benue, Plateau, Nasarawa, Taraba and southern Kaduna area; kidnapping and militancy in the south-east and south-south respectively has proven that safeguarding the vast Nigeria’s landmass and its population growth of about 200million requires more security personnel and equipment’s with knowledge of operating socio-cultural terrain to uproots the emerging criminalities. According to Ochei in an interview with The Pointer (2018, July) avers that “the situation has led to the establishment of various formal and informal security outfits known as ‘vigilante groups’ such as community neighbourhood guards, the village hunter’s guild, and civilian Joint tax force, Karota, Lasma, Operation-Yaki and other security outfits recognised by various state governments to assist the Nigeria Police force. This justifies that, the Nigeria police force were overwhelmed and over stretched by the snowballing crime occurrences in different part of the country. Some of the above-mentioned security outfits for instance the first two, were village organised security outfits set up by various communities for self-defence combining local hunters and the warriors meant to support the strengthening of community security. Also, the emergence and spread of private security guards/enterprises due to denial of peace in institutions and urban communities by criminal’s activities, are all to reinforce the effort of the Nigeria police force in its failure to the mounting security challenges in the country (Ochayi, Vanguard 2018, February). By constitution therefore, securing the lives and properties of the Nigerian citizenry is entrusted on the Nigeria police force which have all been ineffective based on the decimal and regular occurrences of crimes and insecurity in the Nigeria state. By this therefore Ehinderedo (2018) sees that the police have remained dishonourably defeated in the performance of their fundamental task entrusted to them by the constitution.

Going by this scenario of unfortunate development narrated above, it is argued by Aremu in interview with Punch (2018, March) that the Nigerian police force at present are inadequate in addition of been inefficient, under
motivated, corrupt and lacks contemporary policing techniques to match with the modern crimes perpetrated on daily bases. It is on this bases that the public have a poor perception and low morale in their capability to curb the growing sophisticated crimes and insecurity in the country. Worst of it is that, the public see criminal elements in the force through their compromising attitudes and negligence of duty at the time when their service is needed (Innocent & Ogbochie, 2014). The incapability of the current police system in the country is viewed by many Nigerians as due to centralisation of command structure and authority of the police force, with obvious call for decentralisation to give way for the creation of state police as an alternative approach to the disturbing crimes and wide spread insecurity in the country Enehikhuere interviewed by The News (2017, July).

This paper therefore, present and discussed on the issues revolving the creation of “state police” as a recourse to the growing insecurity in Nigeria. It starts with introduction and theoretical explanation, the antiquity of the Nigeria police-force, provision of the constitution, argument “for” and “against” state police, remarks and conclusion.

2. The Concept of Restructuring and State Police
Restructuring is viewed differently by different people. To some, it means creation of more states, while others is going back to regional arrangement to reduce cost of governance through duplication of offices. While to others it means the practice of ‘true fiscal federalism’ where the federating units will be able to finance itself independent of the federal support. Thus, according to Enegholase & Onyeka Obetta interviewed by Vanguard (2012, August, restructuring could mean to be a culmination of enduring clamour by Nigerians for the country to function well. He therefore sees the present composition and structure in the country is not working as a nation. Furthermore, the country will benefit from restructuring in areas like resource ownership, job creation, debt management and enabling environment for investors, creation of state police by weakening the centre. In fact, Johnson (2014), posited a win-win situation for all Nigerians looking at the decentralisation of the police system deeply from security perspectives by making the federating units sustainable to have a local control regarding the public safety.

2.1 State Police
It refers to the act of patrol system in a federation in which the constituents or federating units employs own security officers (police) for controlling, managing and watching over security arising issues within each territorial boundary. Aleyomi (2013) sees state police as “sub-national policing of a specified territory in a federation”. It denotes decentralisation of the present security operations system and power from single authority of the federation. In practice however, it means that when the policing operations, command, logistics are controlled by federating units of government within their territorial boundaries, and not necessarily by the central authority as it is presently with the Nigeria’s federation. In modern democracies such as US, Canada, Britain, Ethiopia etc, policing a federation have undergone a notable change that cut across the levels of government i.e. central, states/regions and local units of a federal system (Owen, 2014). However, state police are a requisite feature in governing a federation state by allowing the peripheral units to employ means of safeguarding its people’s lives and properties within their states jurisdiction, provinces or districts (Owen, 2014). Consequently, introducing state police in Nigeria explains a departure from the status-quo of central policing system, funding and control of the Nigerian police force to give way for each federating units (states) to perform this duty within Nigeria’s federal system.

Simply put, state police signify the absence of a single national police force as currently obtained under the supervision of the Inspector general of police (IG). With state police, state governors are to maintain laws and order through the state police force without interference of the Inspector general of police (IG) or president as the case maybe. Going by this argument, section 214 of 1999 constitution as amended which provides for policing the whole federation through a single police force by the central authority, must be amended. In addendum, section 215(3) of the constitution must also be altered to withdraw the directive power and authority of Mr president or the minister to the Inspector general of police (IG) on matters related to public safety as posited by (Kasali & Odetola 2016). Similarly, the referral proviso of Mr president in a directive to the state governors through commissioner of police on public safety in section 214(4) must be deleted to give way for the creation of state police.

2.2 History of the Nigeria’s Police
Prior to incorporation of the Nigeria state into the capitalist world economy, the various ethnic nationalities that comprises today Nigeria, had a separate workable mechanism through which it protects and enforces laws and order within its domain. In these various systems and in most often than not, social order is achieved though religious creed, natural law, secret cult, oracles, values, royal messenger (Ogunbiyi, 2018). However, the present police system in the country came into limelight around 1860, created by the colonial powers starting with 30 men
consular guard in April 1861 for effective entrenchment of the colonial rules and policies within the Lagos metropolis (Fanran, 2018). In 1863, the name was changed to “Hausa guard”. By 1879, the guards were regularised by ordinance of the colonial administration as the “constabulary of the Lagos colony” operating within Lagos alone. Furthermore, in January 1896, the structure and the name were further changed to “Lagos police force” expanding their operational functions beyond Lagos but south-west comprising the present south-western states. By 1891, the “constabulary guard of oil river protectorates region” was created with headquarter in Calabar present cross river state capital. In 1893, there was also creation of the “constabulary of Niger coast” to operate within the coastal line area with headquarter in Benin city present day Edo state (Fanran, 2018). In 1888, the “Royal Niger constabulary” by royal Niger company with headquarter in Lokoja was created to operate within Ilorin, Bida and Lokoja. In 1900, the Royal Niger constabulary was divided into two as “Northern Nigeria police force and the northern Nigeria regiment” to operate in the northern protectorate. By 1906, Johnson (2014) stated that the “southern Nigeria police force” was created from Lagos police force and part of constabulary of Niger coast; with the bulk of the constabulary Niger coast remained as “southern Nigeria regiments” to operate the southern Nigeria. Finally, April 1930 witnessed the unification of all these segments mentioned above into a single form called the “Nigeria police force” with mandate of jurisdiction to monitor/secure the Nigeria state (Fanran, 2018).

Johnson (2014) stated that various constitutional review in the country at pre and post-independence era i.e. 1951, 1954, 1979 and 1999 have consistently maintained that: “…there shall be a police force in the country which shall be styled as the Nigeria police force to be subjected to constitutional provisions of the Nigeria federation, with no other police force shall be established for the federation or any part there of”. Furthermore, in line with this proviso, section 4 of 1967 police Act spelt out the functions and modus operandi of the force to include: prevention and detection of criminal activities, apprehension of offenders, safeguarding of law and order, lives and property’s protection, enforcement of all laws and regulations and performance of military duties within and outside Nigeria under authority or Act thereof Agawanwo (2014).

The above were the core basic functions of the Nigeria police force giving the constitutional proviso. However, looking at the size of the Nigerian state with estimate of about 180 million and a land space of 913,072.64 square kilometres, Iyang & Abraham (2013) stated that there is need for constant and continuous review in the operation of the force to be able to discharge its constitutional functions. It is important here to note that the Nigeria police force is centralise system in structure and command of operation headed by an Inspector-General of police (IG) as the constitution of the federation started in section 215 (2) of the 1999 as amended that: “the force shall be headed and commanded by the inspector-General of police and the contingents of the force in the states be headed by a commissioner of police in that state subject to the authority of the IG” (Fanran, 2018).

As a diverse nation, Nigeria have structurally undergone series of political changes and development from independence in 1960 to date. Obidimma (2015) stated that, the structural changes have led to the gradual creation of states and local governments units from the inherited three regions at independence. The general cry and
agitations for relative autonomy by the emerging needs from various communities made previous leaders to politically respond to these agitations thereby created states and local government units. For this reason, the Nigeria police force structure was centrally realigned to fit the security needs of the politically created units (states) in the country. Because of that, state police contingents/commissions were set up as well as five directorate units including: Administration and finance, operations, logistic and supply, investigation and intelligence as well as training and command in the headquarter were also created headed by Deputy Inspector-General (DIG’s) (Owen, 2014). At local government level, the police restructuring has devolved power to police zonal command units from eight to twelve in 1999 (Akume & Godswill, 2016).

2.3 Constitutional Dilemma on State Police

As earlier stated, the shouting for the creation of state police in Nigeria by dissolution of the present centralised policing was due to increase of hostilities, crimes and intolerance among the diverse Nigerian nationalities. However, Onyeozilli (2005) has earlier stated in line with Fanran, 2018, that the bone of contention and the dilemma in the constitution can be seen in section 214, subsection 1 of the 1999 constitution of the federation as amended that: “There shall be a police force for the federation as ‘Nigeria police force’ and no other police be created for the federation or any part thereof”. Also, in Section 2, it stated that: “The force shall be under Inspector-General of Police and any contingent stationed in the states shall be subject to the authority of the Inspector-General (IG) to be commanded by state the commissioner of police”. Additionally, in same section, the constitution stated that: “State governors may give the state commissioner of police lawful directives in respect to maintenance of law and order for public safety within the state when necessary, and the commissioner of police shall comply with the directives”.

On the other hand, section 176 (2) of the 1999 constitution as amended states that: “the state governors shall be the chief executive officers of their respective states”. Giving these two conflicting provisions of 214 and 176 (2) above, one could see that the governors being the chief executive and security officers in their respective states are made to be ceremonial heads regarding security in the state given the earlier provision in section 214 (2) which centralises the Nigeria police force states contingents units subject to the Inspector-General authority and not the state governor(s) who are the chief executive and security officers of their respective states. The complexities here is that the section 214 (2) above has reduced the power of the state governors as chief security officers of their states by subjecting the states police contingents command units to the order of the Inspector-General and relegated 176(2) powers of the state governors. This according to Ugwu, Ngige & Ugwanyi (2013) has made the heads of the police contingents units (i.e. commissioners of police) in the various states to be answerable only to the Inspector-General of police at the centre. ‘They’ the commissioners of police in the states are appointees of the IGP and not the state-governors who oversee the security affairs of the states, rendering the governors less important but the IGP.

Practical example of this constitutional dilemma and altercation could be reflected in river state between the then sitting governor Rotimi Ameachi as chief security officer of the state by virtue of section 176 (2), and the former commissioner of police in the state Mbu Joseph Mbu, and all his principal officers who refused to be acknowledging any official correspondent from the governor as section 2 stated above the lawfulness of a governor to give directives to the commissioner of police when the need arises in matters related to public safety. Responding to this complain by the state police commissioner, Mr Mbu has cited section (2) of the 214 stating the constitutional provision for him (as state commissioner of police) to receive or act on the instruction of the IGP in policing the state.

2.4 The Clamour for State Police

However, the present resurgent call for state police in Nigeria is due to uprising of insecurity, terrorism and the spree killings between farmers and herders in different part of the country. The federal constitutions have specified the devolution of powers in its various sections, and the centralized police operation in Nigeria is a negation to the federal principles which have not been able to protect the citizens lives and property’s due to large size of the country. The basic argument for the state police according to Odoshimokhe (2017) is to make the police servicing more effective and efficient and closer to the policing community who understand their languages, geographical terrain and security challenges of the policing community. Furthermore, as insiders, they will work assiduously with the serving community for effective policing within their constitutional parameter to enforce criminal laws made by the peripheral/states legislatures for maintenance of law and order.
The continued agitations on the issue of state police has become a bone of contention in the polity with many commentators calling for it considering the dynamics of society and what is happening in Nigeria polity today given the raise of insurgency in the system. Today, Nigeria legally operates federal system in which power is constitutionally divided between the central and federating units, but with centralised policing system in functions and structure to defend the state constitution of the federation. The outcry by the agitators of state police system is to aid the practice of true federalism like other federating states such as the United States of America where Nigeria copy the model from (Fanran, 2018). State police system was earlier practiced in the 50s and the 60s when the country was peaceful and united in cohabitation of the various nationalities. For those Nigerians in the 50s and 60s, they were nationals to the core when the territorial boundary of the country was safe, and all Nigerians were also safe. But today, the story is different with the bastardisation of the cultivated unity of our forefathers. Though, the country is not at war but in different part, everywhere have become a war zone with insecurity at increase: insurgency of the Boko-Haram, militancy in the Niger delta, herdsmen ethnic militias, border porosity, cybercrime, kidnapping and armed robbery to mention a few (Odoshimokhe, 2017). Accordingly, the proponents of the idea argued that the system is necessary because it will bring security personnel closer to the people by enhancing whereabouts knowledge of the police officers by the people within their area against the present centralised structure that is far from the people. That, the state police personnel will be more familiar with the people and cultural environment under their surveillance through daily interwoven (Fashola, 2013). The issue of state police has become big issue in the last national conference held in 2014 due to the crime increase and the larger size of the present Nigeria police force consisting 36 commands grouped into twelve zones and seven administrative organs to be controlled from the centre.

Another argument by the proponents is that giving the constitutional duties for the police force being closer to the people compare to other security outfit like the army, the police officers are not supposed to be far from the public and thereby need constant interaction with the people in maintaining law and order and be referred to in state of danger. Ochei (2018) has argued that most at times crimes are perpetrated by the local people which requires part of the local to police the area and not someone else transferred from different socio-cultural environment. Another reason for the re-visitation of state police by the proponents is the larger size of the Nigeria state to be effectively policed by the central authority, there will be gross inefficiency.

The UN guideline on police ratio to a giving community is 250 police personnel to 100,000 citizens, an approximate of 400 persons to a police officer (Owen, 2014). By relating this to Nigeria with the total figure of 370,000 police officers nationwide to police a population of approximately 200million as at 2018, equivalent to 540 persons to a police officer, one could argue that the Nigeria police force (officers) are inadequate hence there need for the state police to meet up with the UN guideline. This situation has justified the creation of state police in addition to the rising trend of insecurity in developing world of Africa with Nigeria as example beyond the developed nations which the UN came up with the findings from. Owen (2014) further argued that security control and crimes reduction vary from one country to another. In Nigeria for instance, the way kidnapping has gone high in recent time, state policing knowing the people and the environment will assist in reducing the situation to a barest minimum level.

2.5 Opinion against the state police

On the other hand, the call for the creation of state police has continued receiving criticism been part of restructuring agenda. Prominent Nigerian citizens both serving and retired Inspector- General of police such as Ibrahim Idris and Sunday Ehindero (rd) and many of the northern governors have championed the criticism. The former president Goodluck Jonathan was quoted to have said that “the idea of state police is theoretically good for the country, but giving the political environment in the country, it could be abused” (Nwogwugwu & Kupoluyi, 2015). We are not being able to develop a culture that could allow the implementation of state police. Today in Nigeria, politicians and political control of the police has impacted negatively in the operation of police force and their overall efficiency that has eroded nationalism and efficiency. It also destroys the morale for lack of good culture and discipline to produce good governance by been parochial and partisan. Until we can develop a good political culture and discipline devoid of regionalism and ethnic loyalty where we all believe in Nigeria and not parochial or ethnic sentiments to create rightful atmosphere for workable state police in the country (former IGP, TVC News Nigeria July 2016).

Furthermore, Kasali & Odetola (2016) stated that many states governments cannot promptly pay salary of their civil servants i.e. teachers and health workers for months, and police funding is a capital intensive, if teachers and health
workers could be owing salary from state government, how could the states be able to fund police organisation that is technologically driven equipment’s. If the state police go on strike for six hours as teachers frequently experienced, the state will collapse. Accordingly, until states become economically viable to be able to fund the capital expenses of policing.

Given the UN guideline on the number of police officers to a given population recommending a minimum of 250 officers to police 100,000 people, by implication it means that 1 police officer is to police every 400 people. In Nigerian today giving the report on the strength of Nigeria police by 370,000 as of 2012, (between that time and now, there could be an increase due to the ongoing recruitment), given this scenario, the gap differences in what is obtainable presently in Nigeria is insignificant and therefore the call for the creation of state police because of inadequacy is not justifiable?

According to Akum (2016), if not because of the present situation of political disposition and the IQ of our politicians, state police would have been the best ideal for the country. Furthermore, it is not about the number of the police officers that matters but how well are they equip giving sophistication of today’s crimes driven by technology. For instance, the issue of kidnapping does not require the number of police officers to rescue the victims but the technology to track the kidnappers. Therefore, funding policing by states government cannot well equipped, motivated and trained police officers to their capacity. The number also is a problem, but the police are third maintenance security, the police are involved in all issues of crimes, so, technology driven policing is the answer not state police (Akum, 2016).

Furthermore, the state governors pushing for state police might want to use the police officers under them to affront political opponents giving the political immaturity among the politicians. Example of this could be seen where governors uses the present federal policing to demolished people’s houses and shops. Moreover, the politicians at the state level may end up employing political thugs and party members as police officers to continue brandishing power and humiliation against their political opponents (Innocent & Ogbochie, 2014). Unless if there should be a strict legal structure to make them independent of the governors control different from what we have now, it will be abused.

In a similar vein Obidinma (2015) stated that, state police are achievable only if the constitution is amended, and by doing so, there will be multiplicity of police force in the country with different laws that may contradict one another hence difficulty in coordination. We should not go by a wholesale importation of models from other political climate like US and Canada and expect it to work in our system. What the governors want is absolute power of control Obidinma added.

3. Discussions and Recommendations
The damning reports from within and outside the country on the high toll of deaths is approximately over 50,000 people as reported by Nwogwugwu & Kupoluyi (2015) from 2011 to date is worrisome. In Nigeria today, one can see how little value human lives have compare to the oil commodity. The question to ask here is that, “is state police a solution to the current security challenges in the country? For me, the answer is no giving the preceding arguments for and against. For the mere fact that the Nigeria police is decentralise will not directly stop the challenges looking at it from wider perspective of multiple factors that causes insecurity in the country. One of the important things to note in dealing with the insecurity to improve police efficiency should be seen from two dimensions: geography and history. Geographically, if society fails to understand its geographical terrain to know the axis and exit points, such a country will be badly beaten up in trade and security. Lack of clear understanding of the nation’s geographical security terrain to enable them effectively to plan for trade and security is a major challenge in Nigeria. Most of the attacks heating various communities in different part of the country keeps on occurring and coming from the people that seems to know and understand the terrain very well.

Moreover, there is underutilisation of intellectual resources in the country by not using enough geographers to strategies on the vulnerable point. Secondly, one also must understand the historical antecedents of the vulnerable areas and why the crisis tends to proliferate? The moment such things are understood resources could be easily channelled where it will yield a highest return. Moreover, we need to understand that we are not only dealing with a local problem (insecurity) but rather a regional and continental problem. The deepest crisis faced in the African continent today comes from the Sahel region where Nigeria is bounded to such countries: Niger, Chad, Mali and Burkina Faso. Looking at the human index in those countries, there people moves around unchecked and could do
anything to earn a dollar. They are frustrated not only by poverty, but also climatic changes taking the advantage of the porous borders of Nigeria to come in.

Going by history, Nigeria has practiced state police on regional bases under the 1963 constitution. In 1966, with the incursion of military into governance, the led General Aguiyi Ironsi military government set up a Gobir commission to deal with the perception problems of the regional police. The idea identified by the commission was that the regional police (state police) of that time were over bearded and most often used against people and the opposition. Many people argued that it was the political manipulation of the regional police that led to the 1966 coup in the first place. So, the Gobir commission at that time recommended for national police (Fanran, 2018).

The real problem is that of section 214 of the 1999 constitution as explained earlier which put police under individual and not an institution. The police were relegated to the discretion of one-man as provided by the constitution, which made them not to work as an institution.

Ideally, the police should be under the justice system i.e. Attorney General to bring the nexus and technically made them answerable to justice system. If the police need to arrest criminal, they need to have a warrant from a judge. This will made them to govern by rule of law and not by an “Order” of the president or the governor as provided in section 214 of the constitution. This is the reason why the police service in the country is militarise with high level of political interference.

Furthermore, security operations require innovations and imagination to tackle the growing insecurity rather than the proliferation of security agencies such as EFCC, ICPC, DSS, Civil defence etc which might not be too good for the security effectiveness in Nigeria (Iyang & Abraham 2013). This is because the agencies became duplicated in functions and the funds that are supposed to be pumped to equip, train and motivate police force to be efficient and effective capacity have now been diverted to other similar agencies thereby reducing the power and funding of the police.

The negative perception of trust by the public on the Nigeria police force was inherited from the brutal colonial era of police system against the people commanded by the colonialist to serve their interest (Odoshimokhe, 2017). After independence, the long military rule in the country that came with decree 2 and 4 further militarises policing by enforcing laws not palatable to the people, and the public see police as government agents against their wish. So, until the public begin to see the police as ‘theirs’, and recruitment/promotion is not by tribal or sectional but performance. Additionally, Ogunbiyi (2018) stated that citizens also have a role to play based on the Rousseau concept of social contract as section 14 (b) of the constitution stated that: “the safety and welfare of citizens is the prime-purpose of government” and section 24 of the constitution says that: “every Nigerian citizen has a duty to assist the police in maintenance of law and order”. But today in Nigeria, citizens don’t see that as their obligation rather they alienated police instead of working together through unity of action and thought.

Another factor to improve police efficiency is to have the right political culture and maturity by politicians and the citizens that will gradually develop in the long run of democratic system. How old is Nigeria’s democracy today compare to US for us to have a right political culture and maturity? Nigeria is less than 20 years in democratic system, while US is over 200years (Ohayi, 2018). Therefore, Nigeria’s democracy is at the adolescent stage of growth and development. Police operation is influenced by social and political milieu which right now the environment is not ripe for state police. Until patriotization and national culture is developed.

If state police are to go by, their salaries and remunerations should be deducted direct from the sources to avoid salary backblock by the state governments. And the constituted police council/service commission for each state should constitute representatives from Nigerian Bar Association (NBA) and members of civil society’s to be nominated by their organisations and not the state governors.

Lastly, Nigeria police should operate federal system by decentralising its power of command and authority from the Inspector-General at the centre. The state governors should have a power of command been the security officers in their respective states.
4. Conclusion
From the foregoing discussions, it is evident to say that policing a state requires the socio-cultural knowledge of the environment giving the fact that crimes are perpetrated by the locals and therefore needs the local inputs to tackle the situation. Centralization of police commands and authority is in no doubt a set back to their performance. Also, section 214 of the constitution need to be revised to distance police institution from political control. Right political culture and maturity is needed before state policing is introduce.

References
https://www.arabianjbmr.com/pdfs/RPAM_VOL_1_2/15.pdf


Enhancing Student Competencies Through Digital Video Production: A Project-based Learning Framework

1 Lim Seh Hoe, 2 Tay Choo Chuan, 3 Hanipah Hussin, 4 Pang Yee Jiea

1 Azman 1Institute of Technology Management & Entrepreneurship, Universiti Teknikal Malaysia Melaka, Hang Tuah Jaya, 76100 Durian Tunggal, Melaka, Malaysia, limsehhoe@gmail.com
2 Faculty of Electrical Engineering, Universiti Teknikal Malaysia Melaka, Hang Tuah Jaya, 76100 Durian Tunggal, Melaka, Malaysia, tay@utem.edu.my
3 Centre for Languages and Human Development, Universiti Teknikal Malaysia Melaka, Hang Tuah Jaya, 76100 Durian Tunggal, Melaka, Malaysia, hanipah@utem.edu.my
4 Institute of Technology Management & Entrepreneurship, Universiti Teknikal Malaysia Melaka, Hang Tuah Jaya, 76100 Durian Tunggal, Melaka, Malaysia, yeejiea@gmail.com

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

Purpose: This study purposes to get a demonstration of students’ competencies enhancement through a production of digital video project as a consequence the application of technology through project-based learning (PBL) framework.

Thus, PBL is a key to support students to be more competitive in an external environment.

Design/Methodology/Approach: The respondents were given 4 weeks to plan and organized the video project. Likert-type questionnaire is developed to identify students’ viewpoint on the PBL method in enhancing student competencies. The data were collected through questionnaire from 63 respondents.

Findings: There is a positive significant result in terms of student competencies through PBL framework which provides appropriate structure in determining the level of student competencies.

Implications/Originality/Value: Students able to produce an educational based video on the topic they are learning. By integrating technology in Malaysia Education Curriculum through PBL, student competencies, which consist of communication, collaboration, creation and critical thinking was enhanced. PBL framework provides appropriate structure for determining the level of student competencies. This paper gives a framework which serves as a reference to facilitate the relevant policy-making in the secondary school education trend. This study adds to the comprehension on how PBL should be implemented in the classrooms to encourage students in to pursuing STEAM majors at the higher level.

© 2019 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: limsehhoe@gmail.com


DOI: 10.26710/jbsee.v5i1.508
1. Introduction

According to the “Future of Jobs” report from World Economic Forum, complex problem-solving, critical thinking and creativity will be the main abilities employers expect of laborers in 2020. In present worldwide economy, a country’s prosperity depends fundamentally on the knowledge, skills and competencies of students as previous study (Malaysia Education Blueprint, 2013). The current educational quality development should change from merely meeting the knowledge and the graduation requirements to a high-level competency. There is a essential to improve students’ competencies for 21st century era in order to maintenance the change of universal competition and challenging in the digital world of workplace as previous study (Soparat, Arnold, & The, 2015). Language learning ought to comprise the psychomotor and affective perspectives supported by innovation as a arrangement to proceed with education at a high level and build up student’s competencies for future. The Malaysian educational system is currently undergoing transformation, one emphasis of which is to create a generation who can communicate, collaboration, think creatively, innovatively and critically. This educational program will even now pressure student-centered and differentiated instructing, yet have a more emphasis on project-based work. School-based assessments will likewise move their concentration to testing for higher-order thinking ability. (Malaysia Education Blueprint, 2013). Thus “transmission pedagogy” has formed high-achieving and efficient student, it has claimed that students should be shaped in their creativity, flexibility and high performance workforce for Malaysia to meet the global economic challenges.

School have to provide the opportunity for secondary students a more student-centered, active, engaging and productive role in integration complex learning activities, such as project-based learning(PBL), that reflect the kind of learning approach which students will engage outside of school ((Edmunds, Arshavsky, Glennie, Charles, & Rice, 2017; Asghar, Ellington, Rice, Johnson, & Prime, 2012; Larmer & Mergendoller, 2010). PBL able to increase student motivation by organizing their own learning in solving real-world problems. Existing research that how that PBL is an essential instruction approach that enables students to improve in learning content knowledge, adapt and develop skills necessary for future success. (“Framework for High Quality Project Based Learning,” 2017) Students develop competencies in generating new ideas and products as well as able to work with a variety of technologies as previous study (Dole et al., 2016). Today, students are comfortable integrating technology which is an educational essential piece, not just as entertainment but should be done effectively in learning to enhance student competencies. Beside this, video can be part of the immersive simulation environments; can be installed in increasingly complex virtual learning environment with content, pictures, illustrations, and so on as previous study. (Rasi & Poikela, 2016). This study focus on producing a video about subject matter as learning process. Secondary students will learn content, meanwhile the transferable competencies such as creativity, collaboration and problem solving desired in video production. (Pirhonen & Rasi, 2017; Hakkarainen 2009;2007; Shewbridge and Berge 2004; Jonassen et al. 2003; Jonassen 2000; Verran 1992) A study found the creating video project sincerely extremely positive and respected it propelling to deal with a video which they realized will have use in the future. This exploration recommends that a multimodal video project in a higher education setting enhances learning through increased motivation and positive emotions.

A major challenge for instruction to frame on our better comprehension of experiential learning for the plan of novel environments that are helpful to encouraging in all secondary student communication and collaborative learning skills, profitable and transferable information, and a disposition toward able thinking and critical thinking. A few endeavors to realize the aim of the quality education that incorporate the component are appropriate learning approach one of them learning framework. The transformation framework as a model for the design of secondary education project based learning planned to be dominant in inspiring in students learning processes that encourage the securing of deeper learning. This study was instrumental in distinguishing and indicating the diverse components of the model to enhance student competencies.

The framework is aimed to assist future leaders in providing a progressively total, all encompassing, systematic and sustainability education. In order to develop a superior attitudes and activities of future generations, we need to provide students with an entire arrangement of sustainability competences. PBL framework as shown in Figure 1, is ultimately serve as a guide for students and educators to fulfil their need, moreover to achieve desired educational outcomes in student competencies.
Figure 1 Adopted from Transformational framework in effecting whole school change (Hendry, Hays, Challinor, & Lynch, 2017)

Framework of PBL highlighted the key organizational structure as Table 1, however element of framework of PBL shown in Table 2.

Table 1 Key organizational of framework of PBL

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mission</th>
<th>Instruction Leadership</th>
<th>Strategic Resource</th>
<th>Learning Content</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Student have have a strong sense of wellbeing. Student are affective communicators. Student are confident and involved learners Student are concerned with and contribute to their world</td>
<td>Professional Learning Team Administrator Instructional Walks Individual</td>
<td>Appropriate use of device Wireless infrastructure Learning management system Text book</td>
<td>Culture Team building Responsible life</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2 Element of framework of PBL

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Culture</th>
<th>Professional Learning</th>
<th>Learning Environment</th>
<th>Entrepreneur skill</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Peer-coaching Student-centered Group work</td>
<td>Timetable Development program</td>
<td>Classroom Computer lab Home</td>
<td>Communication presentation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
This framework will assist students to become future leaders as well as citizens who are knowledgeable and understand the natural of world environment. Procedural and conceptual learning are vital and essential tools in improving learning at the secondary school level.

The following model is used in conducting students’ PBL
1. Engagement: The problem is presented to challenge the students, activates prior knowledge in brainstorming and their roles are explained.
2. Inquiry/Investigation: With existing knowledge and information to release problem statement, students need to investigate and acquire up to date with scaffolder activities and best information to conduct the project.
3. Issue Resolution: Students analyze their options and settle on an activity or a choice.
4. Debriefing: Group presentation and discuss not only the substance they have learned and how it may be valuable in new situations yet in addition the procedures engaged in solving the problem.

A few studies have investigated impact of PBL model in knowledge transfer instructional approach. According Beckett (2006), most of these have been conducted in subject-matter classes, while examination on project-based learning in the field of second and foreign language learning is limited (Petersen & Nassaji, 2016). Furthermore, very few studies have directly compared both lower secondary student and upper secondary student competencies toward PBL. Thomas defined PBL focus is how to achieve the goal on peer collaboration on challenging questions or problems as starting of the flow of project process, that encompass students in design, critical thinking, basic leadership, or expository exercises; give an autonomous chance to work with peer; and conclude in project products or presentations” (Petersen & Nassaji, 2016; Thomas, 2000)

The current study set out to investigate PBL as an approach use in Chinese Language classroom. The aim of this study to provide a framework to assess whether students’ video production could be utilized to enhance secondary student competencies. The study is based on competencies of secondary school students who participated in the producing video. The research questions addressed were as follows:

i. What are the level of student competencies in PBL class room?
ii. Is there any difference competencies level between lower secondary school students and upper secondary school students using PBL framework?
iii. Is there any difference level of the student competencies between male students and female students?

2. Methodology
A study was conducted to identify the processes involved when applying the PBL approach. The students were given 4 weeks to plan and organize the video project. This study using the Extended Professional Development Project-based Learning questionnaire designed by Hixson et. al. (2012) to measure the secondary students’ competencies following their project-based learning experience. Then, using SPSS version 23, an independent sample t-test was computed to compare the mean difference and its significance based on statistical cut points.

2.1 Sample
The target sample for this study was secondary school students that have endured project –based learning practice in production video project. In this study, there are 63 students from secondary school in Melaka as respondents of this study. They are 32 upper secondary school students and 31 lower secondary school students. The essential to study the different secondary form were to get the overall picture of the levels of competencies among secondary education students representing the upper and lower secondary student in Melaka. The instrument was distributed to the students through the researcher as a facilitator PBL. From the 65 questionnaires administered, an overall of 63 questionnaires were returned, indicating 96.9% in response rate. There were appropriate questionnaires which were from 36 female students and 27 male student.

2.2 Instrument
This study was conduct to collect qualitative ordinal data. Likert-type questionnaire is developed to identify students’ point of view on the PBL method in enhancing student competencies scales. The standard tests of which the items were taken form has 0.86 average reliability value. This indicates that the items are consistent. The test contained two parts. The first part was on demography and the next part was on assessing the competencies of the students.
The PBL survey instrument is used as a tool for primary data collection. The data was collected through the use of structured questionnaire which consists of questions on demographics and 22 elements of competencies in critical thinking competency (6 elements), collaborative competency (5 elements), communication competency (5 elements) and creativity competency (6 elements). Each of this element was measured on a 5 point Likert scale, ranging from 1 = strongly not agree to 5 = strongly agree. These items were adapted from Hixson et al. (Hixson, Ravitz, Whisman, & Hixson, Nate; Ravitz, Jason; Whisman, 2012). To look at the level of interpretation as reported by respondents, mean score for each indicator was calculated. The scale score had a range of 1 to 5. The number of cells were minimized to interpret the results easily, the scores were recoded into levels of “low” interpretation, “moderate” interpretation, and “high” interpretation. 1 to 2.33 scored “low,” 2.34 to 2.66 was considered “moderate” interpretation, and 2.67 to 5.00 was considered “high” interpretation. (Wan Mohamed & Omar, 2010). Table 3 shows the mean score illustration that is used to compare the competencies level among the secondary students which is used in analyzing descriptive statistics and inferential statistics.

Table 3 illustrates the mean scores for each research question and their levels of competency score analysis.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mean Score</th>
<th>Interpretation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.00 – 2.33</td>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.34 – 3.66</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.67 – 5.00</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In this study, a reliability scale test was carried out for all element in order to evaluate the internal consistency of variables. Based on a reliability index, the value of Cronbach’s Alpha was classified in which 0.90 - 1.00 is very high, 0.70 - 0.89 is high, 0.30 - 0.69 is moderate, and 0.00 – 0.30 is low (Nayan, Mahat, Hashim, Saleh, & Norkhaidi, 2018, Babbie, E. 1992). The internal consistency of the enhancing secondary students’ competencies Questionnaire was high with a Cronbach’s alpha coefficient of 0.86 (> 0.7) indicating good item reliability in the items of students’ competencies Questionnaire.

3. Finding and discussion
This section discusses the result of the study by analyzing the responses of students’ questionnaire which consists of 63 respondents. The discussion will feature the significant findings in Section A, B, C and D, to be specific critical thinking, collaborative learning, communication and creativity respectively. The result of the descriptive analysis can be presented in the Table 3. The following evaluation scale, in view of the Likert scale utilized in the questionnaire was utilized to interpret the mean value.

3.1 Qualitative Ordinal Findings from questionnaire
The quantitative findings present the data from the questionnaire in relation to enhance students’ competency towards project-based learning for digital video production in Chinese language activities. 22 items in questionnaires were used to determine “enhancing student competency”. A five-point scale was utilized to determine responses.

For answering the research questions, the items for each section of competencies on project-based Learning framework are separate according to type of competency, and statistically analyzed using mean scores, based on levels of mean scores analysis. Critical thinking, communication, collaborative learning and creativity as student’s competencies will be considered as low, moderate, or high competency score based on the following value as illustrated in the table 3. The finding regarding the level of student competencies based on secondary education category are discussed according to the data analysis which are descriptive statistics and inferential statistics.

Table 4 The Levels student critical thinking through digital video production on project based learning framework.
For the level of effectiveness in enhancing student competency on PBL through digital video production, there are 6 critical thinking competency elements that are made in the study instrument made on the PBL, critical thinking competency elements of item 1 (analyze competing arguments, perspective to a issue), item 2 (create persuasive argument based on supporting evidence), item 3 (create interpretation from reading), item 4 (solve problem by multi solution), item 5 (draw own conclusion based on analysis of facts), and item 6 (compare information from different source). The frequency of means score on critical thinking can be seen in the critical category from Table 4. It shows 40 respondents or 63.5% in moderate level and 23 respondents or 36.5% in high level. This mean 63.5% of respondents in mean score 2.34 to 3.66 and 36.5% of respondents in mean score 3.66 to 5.00.

Similar to the research of collaborative learning, there are 5 collaboration competency elements that are made in the study instrument made on the PBL, collaboration competency elements of item 1 (work in group to complete a task together), item 2 (work as a team to incorporate feedback on group task), item 3 (work with group set goals and create plan), item 4 (joint products using contributions from member), and item 5 (present group product to the class). The frequency of means score on collaborative learning can be seen in the collaboration category from Table 5. It shows 2 respondents or 3.2% in low level, 23 respondents 36.5% in moderate level and 38 respondents or 60.3% in high level. This mean 3.2% of respondents in mean score 1.00 to 2.33, 36.5% of respondents in mean score 2.34 to 3.66 and 60.3% of respondents in mean score 3.66 to 5.00.

Table 6 The Levels student communication through digital video production on project based learning framework
This study demonstrates there are 5 communication competency elements that are made in the study instrument made on the PBL, communication competency elements of item 1 (decide how to present their group work), item 2 (prepare and deliver oral presentation to others), item 3 (able to answer in front of audience), item 4 (known to convey idea using media other than a written paper), and item 5 (use structure data for use in written products or oral presentations. The frequency of means score on communication can be seen in the communication category from Table 6. It shows 2 respondents or 3.2% in low level, 39 respondents 61.9% in moderate level and 22 respondents or 34.9% in high level. This mean 3.2% of respondents in mean score 1.00 to 2.33, 61.9 % of respondents in mean score 2.34 – 3.66 and 34.9% of respondents in mean score 3.66 -5.00.

Table 7 The Levels student creativity through digital video production on project based learning framework

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Creativity Category</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid Low</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>3.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderate</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>63.5</td>
<td>63.5</td>
<td>66.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The finding of study shows there are 6 creativity competency elements that are made in the study instrument made on the PBL, creativity competency elements of item 1 (invent a solution to a complex, open-ended question or problem), item 2 (test out different idea and self-directed to improve work), item 3 (generate idea to confront problem), item 4 (create original product to express self-ideas), item 5 (use idea creation), and item 6 (have learned creativity and innovation). The frequency of means score on creativity can be seen in the creativity competency category from Table 7. It shows 2 respondents or 3.2% in low level, 40 respondents 63.5% in moderate level and 21 respondents or 33.3% in high level. This mean 3.2% of respondents in mean score 1.00 to 2.33, 63.5 % of respondents in mean score 2.34 – 3.66 and 33.3% of respondents in mean score 3.66 -5.00.

For the high level of effectiveness in enhancing student competency on PBL through digital video production. As Figure 2 shows, the comparison among four competencies indicates critical thinking 36.5%, collaborative learning 60.3%, creativity 33.3%, and communication 34.9% in high level achievement through digital video production on project based learning framework. These results found that among respondents, majority believe that digital video production in PBL to enhance their competencies regard collaboration, compare with critical thinking, creativity and communication. Data is given for four weeks according to project based learning at group. Students were provided numerous opportunities to engage in high level thinking over extended period of time. Group presentation able deliver students chance to collaborate, clarify and validate their thinking. The finding provide evidence for our framework of PBL as a specific learning for secondary school.
The purpose of the study was to inspect the effect of the production of digital video on project-based learning framework in developing secondary student’ competency. The analysis of the results indicates that the production of digital video on project-based learning framework has a significant influence in improving students’ competencies within the element of critical thinking, collaboration learning, communication and creative. The results from the questionnaires study support to this conclusion. From these results it emerges that the production digital video on project-based learning can be considered as a teaching effectively approach in secondary school. In the four competency elements, which are critical thinking, collaborative learning, communication and creativity, the student competencies demonstrated statistically significant high level that can contribute to a successful competency in project based learning.

Next, to analyze each student’s mean score for every competency, the total of the value to each dimension in that competency was divided by the number of that dimension of competency. Table 8 indicates the mean scores and standard deviation of the four dimension of secondary student competencies in PBL classroom.

Table 8 The Result of descriptive statistic for enhancing four competencies through digital video production on project based-learning

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Student Competencies</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
<th>Interpretation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Critical Thinking</td>
<td>3.70</td>
<td>0.41</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Collaboration</td>
<td>3.77</td>
<td>0.67</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Creativity</td>
<td>3.44</td>
<td>0.64</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Communication</td>
<td>3.53</td>
<td>0.49</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8 shows the overall score mean secondary school students in Alor Gajah, Melaka to the different dimensions of competencies from 3.44 to 3.77 on a 5-point Likert-type rating scale. The results present that on average, the respondents exhibited high and moderate levels of 4Cs (critical thinking, collaboration, communication and creativity) competencies. Results suggests that critical thinking and collaboration were enhanced high level by production video project whereas communication and creativity were enhanced high level by production video project. Students develop higher order thinking by a process of production digital video, students become effective communicators, collaborators.

Based on the findings indicate the dimension of collaboration had a total mean of the highest enhancement competency (mean score = 3.77, standard deviation=0.67), followed by dimension of critical thinking (mean score = 3.70, standard deviation=0.41), next the dimension of communication (mean score = 3.53, standard deviation=0.49), and finally the dimension of creativity was the lowest enhancement competency. (mean score = 3.44, standard deviation=0.64). This reflects the level of student competencies of the secondary school students of Alor Gajah, Melaka is to be at a high level and tend to collaborative learning and critical thinking.

As Table 8 shows, most student believed that project based learning had highly enhanced them in collaborative learning and critical thinking via producing video project. However, secondary students less communication among peer while implemented PBL. Student competencies level of secondary school students in Melaka by secondary education level based on four dimensions: Critical thinking, collaboration, communication, creativity.

Table 9 Paired samples t-test of student competencies of lower secondary and upper secondary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Student Competencies</th>
<th>Mean (Lower Form)</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Mean (Upper Form)</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>T value</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Critical Thinking</td>
<td>3.55</td>
<td>0.28</td>
<td>3.84</td>
<td>0.48</td>
<td>-2.67</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Collaboration</td>
<td>3.55</td>
<td>0.62</td>
<td>3.98</td>
<td>0.66</td>
<td>-2.75</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Creativity</td>
<td>3.45</td>
<td>0.46</td>
<td>3.61</td>
<td>0.51</td>
<td>-1.22</td>
<td>0.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Communication</td>
<td>3.28</td>
<td>0.49</td>
<td>3.57</td>
<td>0.72</td>
<td>-1.87</td>
<td>0.72</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The objective of this study was to gauge whether there was a significant difference among four competencies of student in lower secondary and upper secondary. Enhancing student competencies in production digital video project. With this, PBL has enabled students to work collaboration and solve problem by critical thinking on their idea, and encourage them to be more creativity and innovative in learning.

Table 9 describes enhancing competencies of secondary students on each dimension can be known from the mean score obtained by secondary students on lower secondary students and upper secondary students. The number questions used consists of 22 item with 5-point Likert scale. The lowest secondary student in critical thinking, collaboration and creativity of enhancing competencies in moderate category, between mean score 3.45 to 3.55. However, communication competency in low category with mean score 3.28. Whereas The upper secondary student in critical thinking and collaboration of enhancing competencies in high category with mean score 3.84 and 3.98. However, creativity and communication competencies in moderate category with mean score 3.61 and 3.57.

The paired-samples t-test was conducted to determine whether student competencies had higher scores upper secondary than lower secondary. The finding in Table 9 indicates that there was highly statistically significant difference between the scores of the upper secondary students and lower secondary student in critical thinking and collaboration competency. From Table 9 it can be seen that the dimension of critical thinking for upper secondary, had an average of (mean score = 3.84) which was higher score than lower secondary students (mean score = 3.55) and with the p-value of 0.01. The paired samples t-test reveal that upper secondary students scores were higher in critical thinking. (mean score = 3.84, standard deviation = 0.48) compared to lower secondary students (mean score = 3.55, standard deviation = 0.28), t (32) = -0.26, p ≤ 0.05.

Additionally, for the dimension of collaboration competency, the upper secondary students had an average score for collaboration competencies had an average of (mean score = 3.98) which was higher score than lower secondary students (mean score = 3.55) and with the p-value of 0.01. The paired samples t-test reveal that upper secondary students scores were higher in collaborative learning. (mean score = 3.98, standard deviation = 0.66) compared to lower secondary students (mean score = 3.55, standard deviation = 0.62), t (32) = -0.75, p ≤ 0.05.

The result showed that the upper secondary students have higher score in critical thinking and collaborative learning than lower secondary students. Therefore, hypothesis upper secondary students have higher score in critical thinking and collaborative learning than lower secondary students, is not rejected.

The finding in Table 9 indicates that there was no significant difference between the scores of the upper secondary students and lower secondary student in creativity and communication competency. From Table 9 it can be seen that the dimension of creativity competency for upper secondary, had an average of (mean score = 3.61) which was higher score than lower secondary students (mean score = 3.45) and with the p-value of 0.23. The paired samples t-test reveal that upper secondary students scores were higher in critical thinking. (mean score = 3.61, standard deviation = 0.51) compared to lower secondary students (mean score = 3.45, standard deviation = 0.46), t (32) = -1.22, p ≥ 0.05.

Additionally, for the dimension of communication competency, the upper secondary students had an average score for communication competencies had an average of (mean score = 3.57) which was higher score than lower secondary students (mean score = 3.28) and with the p-value of 0.72. The paired samples t-test reveal that upper secondary students scores were higher in communication. (mean score = 3.57, standard deviation = 0.72) compared to lower secondary students (mean score = 3.28, standard deviation = 0.49), t (32) = -1.87, p ≤ 0.05.

The result showed that the upper secondary students have similarity score in creativity and communication than lower secondary students. Therefore, hypothesis upper secondary students have higher score in creativity and communication than lower secondary students, is rejected.

In general, the statistical values indicate that upper secondary students in critical thinking and collaboration competencies mean scores significantly higher score than the lower secondary students. Thus, it is possible to say that upper form students’ critical thinking and collaboration competencies determine PBL success enhancing upper secondary school students’ critical thinking and collaboration competencies highly. However, communication and creativity differences between the two groups is statistically no significant. Thus, the statistical values indicate that
upper secondary students in communication and creativity mean scores no significantly lower score than the lower secondary students. Thus, it is possible to say that lower and upper secondary students’ communication and creativity competencies determine PBL success enhancing lower and upper secondary school students’ communication and creativity competencies similarity.

The above graph presents the bar chart representations of the competencies mean scores of the secondary students. There are the groups in the horizontal line: critical thinking, collaboration, creativity and communication. Each of them has two bar that represent the two dimensions of student: lower secondary students and upper secondary students. And, the vertical line indicates the mean scores. Therefore, the four dimensions’ lower secondary students’ competencies are low when compare with upper secondary students.

![Secondary Student Competencies](image)

**Fig. 2:** Graphic Representation of Secondary Student Competencies Literacy Scores

Nevertheless, student competencies determine students’ collaboration competency is the most enhancement level (0.43). Critical thinking and communication more enhancing than creativity as the mean differences between the dimension is greater in critical thinking and communication competencies (0.30) than in creativity competency (0.16).

The secondary student collaboration competency has the highest difference mean score with 0.43. This indicates that secondary upper students are able to collaborate with peer in PBL. The creativity competency has the lowest difference mean score with 0.09.

**Table 10** Comparisons between male and female student on the level of 4Cs competencies on project based learning

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Student Competencies</th>
<th>Mean (male)</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Mean (female)</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Critical Thinking</td>
<td>3.61</td>
<td>0.27</td>
<td>3.76</td>
<td>0.48</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Collaboration</td>
<td>3.66</td>
<td>0.44</td>
<td>3.86</td>
<td>0.79</td>
<td>0.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Creativity</td>
<td>3.48</td>
<td>0.43</td>
<td>3.57</td>
<td>0.54</td>
<td>0.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Communication</td>
<td>3.24</td>
<td>0.51</td>
<td>3.60</td>
<td>0.33</td>
<td>.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The data were used to make inferences regarding the male and the female in enhancing competencies, specific critical thinking, collaboration, creativity, and communication.

When contrasting male and female students on the level of competencies on the different dimensions of the competencies. It is discovered the competencies level for female is moderately higher compared to male students. However, utilizing the independent t test at $\alpha = 0.05$, it was discovered that there is no statistical difference in the level of competencies in the various competencies between male and female students. Table 10 demonstrates the comparison between male and female students on the level of student competencies on the production video project. Hence, there is no significant difference among gender in collaboration, creativity and communication competency in the secondary school.

These are influenced by project-based learning frameworks and hence the impact of formal instruction is understandable. Teachers should refer to the proposed a framework on project-based learning before teaching it themselves, and that it would assist other teachers to plan tasks for students. Research data collected from Malaysia secondary school was used for the development of the framework, these shows that the proposed framework can be use in Malaysia secondary school, as a quality framework of successful research product. This is consistent with Sudjimat research which indicates PBL model can improve various facets of generic skills that include vocational students communication skills, teamwork, problem solving. (Sudjimat, 2016) A framework on PBL practice will contribute towards quality of teaching and learning for teachers and students. The Framework contributes towards productive way of competencies achievement. The framework serves as a reference to facilitate the relevant policy making and contribute to secondary school education. This study also contributes to the comprehension on how PBL should be executed in the classrooms to urge students to pursue STEAM at the high level

4. Conclusions
Implementation of PBL framework in the production of video project of secondary school has been implemented by student based on their perception to the understanding of the PBL framework, as well as to the possible of PBL framework enhancing the competencies of the students. According to the study result, it could be determined that PBL integrating technology develop communication, collaboration, critical thinking and creativity of secondary students. Moreover, it is relation with learning outcome expectation of Malaysia future secondary education.

Teachers should use methods that are proven effective through the framework of 21st Century Learning based on scientific research, which offers guidelines for how to prepare learners with the skills they need in the 21st century education. Digital video production as a critical and open dialogue tool to create by conversations to deepen understanding on diversity topics. Digital video production will support them in the expression of their considerate about the subject matter. As previous study, Prensky (Masino & Niño-Zarazúa, 2016) asserted, the education systems and the learning processes of the student should be revised accordingly, considering that the minds and perception structures of the student, who have been born into technology, have changed too. Spin offs of this project can include project-based educational practices that prepare the students for future market demands and leverage graduate student experience and knowledge to collaboratively develop innovative pathways to student success. Education and the arrangements that encourage the procedure of innovation and knowledge creation have profound effects on the long-run economic development and improvement designs. (Masino & Niño-Zarazúa, 2016)

References
Hendry, A., Hays, G., Challinor, K., & Lynch, D. (2017). Undertaking educational research following the


Use of Social Commerce to Develop Intentions to Buy With Mediating Role of Social Support

1 Lutf Ullah, 2 Rehana Kousar, 3 Irum Saba, 4 Allah Bakhsh Khan

1 MPhil Scholar, Department of Commerce, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, Pakistan. lutfi.khaan@gmail.com
2 Professor, Department of Commerce, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, Pakistan. rehanakousar@bzu.edu.pk
3 Assistant Professor, IBA Karachi, isaba@iba.edu.pk
4 Assistant professor, Department of Commerce, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, Pakistan: abkhan@bzu.edu.com

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

Web 2.0 technology and social media have paved a new way for the communication for individuals and for the businesses of e-commerce firms. This technology has opened the opportunities to introduce new business model which incorporates several social aspects of individuals. As Social Networking Sites are gaining more popularity, these have formed the links between internet consumers and it has become a critical way of getting knowledge for individuals. It has introduced social commerce which is joining of three concepts; e-commerce, web 2.0 and social media. E-commerce firms have started to engage their potential consumers on social media websites for the sake of contacting potential consumers and getting feedback on their products and services. Social Commerce is expanding because of its importance in information sharing. However, emotional support is also considered important factor which is comprised of informational and emotional factors that lead to trust and then ultimately, intentions to buy. This proposed structural model was assessed through collecting data from the online buyers of Pakistan through social media. It was found that in order to generate intentions to buy through social networking sites, social support is vital component that should be focused by the online businesses. This paper is concluded with research limitations and some suggestions for future research.

© 2019 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: rehanakousar@bzu.edu.pk


DOI: 10.26710/jbsee.v5i1.702

1. Introduction

Recent innovations and technology enhancements in information technologies and the introduction of web 2.0 have brought new dimensions for development of e-commerce. Social media facilitates this modern platform for business. After continuous development in web 2.0, a new mode for consumer interaction and communication has
been introduced. Virtual societies and social networking websites are included in this platform. The evolution of social networking has given a modern type of online business which is known as social commerce (N. Hajli, Shanmugam, Powell, & Love, 2015).

The development of social technologies i.e. Social Networking Sites (SNSs) is the major cause of development in this field (Liang & Turban, 2011). These developments provide the platform that attracts the persons to interact with their friends and form an online community. These interactions in online community like on the SNSs, have developed the concept of Social Commerce (Zeng, Huang, & Dou, 2009). These developments form a contemporary view of the customers (Füller, Mühlbacher, Matzler, & Jawecki, 2009), on which participate in forums, review other’s opinions, rate the products, provide a view of their own knowledge and suggest the products and services to others. According to (Hajli, Lin, Featherman, & Wang, 2014), the persons co-create the value with the firm. This is the social commerce era in which persons communicate and their communication influence other consumers in order to buy a product (N. Hajli et al., 2014). Social Media mediates the Social Commerce which is related to online communities and SNSs which are growing constantly and speedily (Hajli, 2014a; Hsiao, Chuan-Chuan Lin, Wang, Lu, & Yu, 2010; Jeppesen & Molin, 2003; Shin, 2013).

Social Commerce has opened the opportunities to introduce new business model which incorporates several social aspects of individuals. As SNSs are gaining more popularity, these have forged the links between the internet consumers and it has become a critical way of getting knowledge for individuals (Wang & Chang, 2013). Social Networking Sites are important for both, businesses and individuals as they help to maintain the current social relations and to form new relations among individuals (Constantinides & Lorenzo-Romero, 2013). In the modern era, growth of online firms has led to a new paradigm which is social commerce. Social Commerce generally refers to applying online social commerce which considers web 2.0 (Z. Huang & Benyoucef, 2013). According to Linda (2010), Social commerce phenomenon is introduced when three concepts are joined with each other which are e-commerce, web 2.0 and social media (Linda, 2010). E-commerce firms have started to engage their potential consumers on social media websites for the sake of getting feedback on their products and services (N. Hajli et al., 2014). Social Commerce is a shift in the paradigm of business method and introduces a new area for the researchers of information system (Saundage & Lee, 2011; Shanmugam, Sun, Amidi, Khani, & Khani, 2016). The ideology of social commerce is based on the fact that it helps individuals and businesses in the transaction, improves communication quality and increases the sale volume which brings loyalty for the e-commerce firm (M. N. Hajli, 2014b). E-commerce evolution into s-commerce is changing the customer role as well. Social Commerce emergence produces the collective bargaining power of the customers as bargaining power has been shifted from sellers to buyers due to the internet usage (N. Hajli & Sims, 2015; Z. Huang & Benyoucef, 2013; J. B. Kim, 2012). Thus, customers are the central point of focus for the businesses. Social Commerce has moved the focus from product to customer (Z. Huang & Benyoucef, 2013; Wigand, Benjamin, & Birkland, 2008).

Firms are trying to figure out the potential of this technology for operating the business (Shi & Chow, 2015). eBay and Amazon are the global firms and are considered as pioneer firms in the e-commerce (M. Hajli, 2013). Now a day, these pioneer global e-commerce firms are trying to change market concentration with social media. Amazon introduced the groups having similar interest in the business which allows customers to communicate and form relationships management system for Amazon (Amblee & Bui, 2011). According to Liu, Cheung, and Lee (2016), social commerce websites are experiencing growth with high speed. According to S.-B. Kim, Sun, and Kim (2013), IT businesses are planning to invest almost US$ 50 billion per year by 2020 in the social commerce.

In the context of social commerce, customers besides communicating also review opinion of others, participate in forums, rate other products, provide view of the knowledge, and suggest some products and services (N. Hajli, 2015a). So because of this, customers can be influenced by other customers and with addition to this, the trust level is increased as trust and security are crucial factors in online platform (N. Hajli & Lin, 2016; N. Hajli et al., 2014). Trust is a challenging subject for the e-commerce as it includes individuals (Gefen & Straub, 2004). These individuals are more likely to transact only if there is existence of trust (N. Hajli, 2015a). Therefore, intentions to buy are generated only when trust is developed in the consumers.

Research in the Social Commerce is still in primary phases in spite of much attention has been given to the concept of social (C. Wang & Zhang, 2012) as Social Commerce understanding is limited and scattered (C. Wang & Zhang, 2012). Practitioners and information systems need more understanding and explanation of the social commerce.
because it is evolving area of research with less empirically focused and require accurate and deep understanding of the social media practices with business perspective (Saundage & Lee, 2011).

Researchers have found empirical evidence that trust is influenced by social commerce constructs (N. Hajli, 2015a). This trust leads to intentions to buy. However, in the context of social commerce, a key construct which leads to intentions to buy has been given less attention which is social support constructs. Intentions to buy are generated when there is a trust and trust is built through social support constructs which are emotional support and informational support. It is important to consider these constructs in order to find the factors behind trust and intentions to buy. Based on the N. Hajli (2015a) work on social commerce constructs, a research model is developed in this study which tries to present a link between intentions to buy and social commerce constructs through social support constructs. Thus, following research questions are addressed in this study.

1) Do social commerce constructs effect social support constructs?
2) Do social support measures effect trust?
3) Does trust influence social commerce intention?

Result of the study suggests that social support constructs which are emotional and informational support, are influenced by social commerce constructs and trust is generated by social support constructs which directly leads to the intentions to buy. Moreover, it is also assessed that social support constructs mediate the relationship between trust and social commerce constructs and trust mediates the relationship between social support constructs and intentions to buy.

Rest of the paper is organized into sections. Literature review is presented in the next section and methodology of this study is discussed in section 3. Section 4 deals with the results and analysis which is followed by discussion in section 5. Section 6 presents the conclusion which is followed by research limitations.

2. Theoretical Background
2.1 Social Commerce Constructs and Social Support Constructs
Individuals communicate in a collaborative online environment on the social commerce platforms (Curty & Zhang, 2013). The constructs of social commerce are regarded as the platforms for consumers of same network or same group in which they share their ideas and experiences. Forums and communities, ratings and reviews given by the customers, and recommendations and referrals are the examples of social commerce constructs that are necessary for development of social support in the virtual communities (Hajli, 2014a, 2014b). Moreover, experience gained from the online social platforms pave the way for social support. Crocker and Canevello (2008) proposed that interaction of individuals through social commerce constructs leads to social support. Previous studies found that people participate in the purchasing platforms because of social support (Ridings & Gefen, 2004). This support comprises of emotional and informational support which are inferred from social psychology domain (M. N. Hajli, 2014a; Ridings & Gefen, 2004). When web 2.0 technology was introduced, it led the boom of social networking sites like Facebook and Twitter. The social networking sites has developed the social support factor and this factor is the major reason of the development of social commerce. Customers obtain social support through social commerce constructs which help the individuals to make decision regarding transaction execution. Hajli (2014a) proposed that social commerce constructs develop the emotional and informational support in the virtual communities. Concluding the above discussion, hypotheses can be developed which are;

H1a: Social commerce constructs affect the emotional support positively.
H1b: Social commerce constructs affect the informational support positively.

2.2 Social Support Constructs and Trust
Social support is the construct from the discipline of psychology and it is described as the communication of the individuals in the network in which they are taken care of each other, supported by each other and answered of the question to help each other (Ali, 2011). This network means online community like chat rooms, discussion boards and social networking sites like Twitter (Daneback & Plantin, 2008; LaCoursiere, 2001). A large number of studies are present on social support in the online context but most of the studies have focused on health sector (Ballantine & Stephenson, 2011; Obst & Stafurik, 2010). Relating to the health sector, people try to solve their medical problems by taking information and advice from the people of same network. So, social support is a key element to develop trust in this context. Moreover, a study by Ridings and Gefen (2004) confirmed that main motives behind
In social commerce, trust is the key challenge. It is being examined to understand its role in social commerce. Positive consumer emotions towards brands like Facebook are spreading with more speed in modern era (Hajli, 2013). Studies have argued that trust is the vital component in the virtual communities (Gefen, Karahanna, & Straub, 2003; Mutz, 2005; Pavlou, 2003) and trust can be enhanced by social support in online communities (Gefen et al., 2003). According to Reychav and Weisberg (2010), online environment which facilitates social support can affect trust (Gefen et al., 2003; Mutz, 2005; Pavlou, 2003). M. N. Hajli (2014b) concluded that trust is raised by social support in the virtual community. It has been confirmed that trust is augmented from social support (Crocoker & Canevello, 2008; Hajli, 2014b).

Virtual communities are comprised of both, emotional and informational. The construct emotional support focuses on articulating individuals concerns and helps in problem solving while informational support provides solutions, interpretations and plans regarding information in online environment. In an online community, these two constructs of support become the major support mechanisms for interaction. When social support is felt strongly by individuals, they feel connected to their friends and thus, trust is built for their friends in the virtual communities (Crocoker & Canevello, 2008; Weber et al., 2004). This discussion can be summed up in the following hypotheses.

H2a: Emotional support affect the trust positively.
H2b: Informational support affect the trust positively.

2.3 Trust and Intentions to Buy
Trust is the vital component in electronic commerce (Gefen & Straub, 2004; N. Hajli et al., 2014; Mutz, 2005; Pavlou, 2003). Customers try to decrease the risk by relying on familiarities when rules are not adequately adopted (Gefen & Straub, 2004). Awareness of a specific social networking site tends to increase when individuals’ participation in the forums in increased and they see other persons’ ratings and reviews about a product (Shanmugam et al., 2016). This creates trust in the deal or the business. Trust creates the power of reducing hesitancy to execute a transaction with an e-vendor (Pavlou, 2003). This power gives the consumer to have a control over transaction (Pavlou, 2003). In the online context, trust is likely to support customers regarding their shopping activities. Studies suggest that consumers’ intentions to buy are influenced positively by the trust (Gefen & Straub, 2004; Pavlou, 2003). In electronic market, trust has a mediating role (Ba & Pavlou, 2002). This is because trust is a key element to influence the business (Yang, Lin, Chandrees, & Chao, 2009). Therefore, it has same effect for social commerce (Shanmugam et al., 2016). Moreover, studies have also found that intentions to buy are developed with the trust as it has a significant role in developing it (Lu, Zhao, & Wang, 2010; Shin, 2010). When looking for the new products or services in online market, less perceived risk and having confidence are important factors (Hassanein & Head, 2007; Shin, 2010). Thus, to examine the role of trust in social commerce context is important to figure out whether it leads to intentions to buy or not? Studies analyzing risk in the e-commerce have found that there is an important link among online buying behavior and trust (Ba & Pavlou, 2002; Gefen, 2002). Thus, we propose that;

H3: Consumers’ trust affects the intention to buy positively.

2.4 Social Commerce Constructs and Trust
Different studies have revealed that constructs of social commerce i.e. review or ratings of the customers for a product directly affect the trust of the individuals which result in higher sales of the company through social media platform (Swapynathan, Wilson, Boe, Almeroth, & Zhao, 2008). Positive comments and high ratings of the products significantly support for the building trust (Ba & Pavlou, 2002). Consumers feel safe and secure in doing transaction with the e-commerce firm when the firm has social presence through social networking sites (Weisberg, Te’eni, & Arman, 2011) as this presence influence the trust positively (Gefen & Straub, 2004). The e-vendor presence is felt through social commerce constructs. Therefore, social word of mouth through these social networking sites about the e-vendors influence the trust (S. Kim & Park, 2013) which can be hypothesized as;

H4: Social Commerce Constructs affect the consumer’s trust positively.
2.5 Social Commerce Constructs and Intention To Buy
Studies have also revealed the influence of comments about the product provided by some users affect the intentions to buy of the potential customers significantly (Chen & Xie, 2005). Major reason behind this impact is that these comments or ratings or provided by those persons who have already used the product and has experience of using it (Forman, Ghose, & Wiesenfeld, 2008). Thus, individuals take advantage of the other persons’ experience. Senecal and Nantel (2004) proposed that these recommendations on the social networking sites has strong effect on the consumer intentions for the products purchase. Information exchange in the virtual community is the basic motive behind the usage of social media and this affect the behavior of the customer positively (Ridings & Gefen, 2004). Thus, hypothesis can be inferred here as following:

H5: Social Commerce Constructs affect the consumers’ intention to buy positively.

2.6 Structural Model
From the above hypotheses, a model for social commerce adoption has been developed to understand the social commerce and social relationships of people on internet which help in developing intentions to buy. Specifically, this study focuses on social commerce constructs to develop trust and intentions to buy by considering social support constructs in social commerce environment. This study considers social commerce constructs which are ratings and reviews, forums and communities, and recommendations and referrals; social support constructs which are emotional and informational support, trust and intentions to buy which are deemed as on-going issues in the e-commerce.

3. Research Design
3.1 Research Instrument
This study tests the relations and hypotheses empirically. Thus, this study utilizes quantitative approach which is based on the data collected through questionnaires which was developed Therefore, a questionnaire was developed which measured the constructs. Trust measures were taken from S. Kim and Park (2013) who developed these measures by amalgamating and modifying the studies of Vatanasombut, Igbaria, Stylianou, and Rodgers (2008) and Cheung and Lee (2006). Intentions to buy was adapted from N. Hajli (2015b) and S. Kim and Park (2013). Social support includes two dimensions which are emotional and informational support. Emotional support was measured using 4 items which tried to assess the individual’s perception that received messages from friends on social networking sites include emotional concerns like empathy, caring and understanding. Informational support was measured using 3 items which tried to assess the individual perception that received messages from friends in social networking sites provide required assistance. Social support was adopted from Shanmugam et al. (2016), who used the items developed by M. N. Hajli (2014a, 2014b); N. Hajli (2015b). Social commerce constructs were measured using 4 items scale which were developed by M. N. Hajli (2014a, 2014b). These measures were altered and modified according to the need of study and were assessed using 5 point Likert scale.

A pilot study was conducted in which questionnaire was submitted to 10 academic and language experts to assess its construction and then it was revised according to their suggestions. Purpose of this pilot study was to make questionnaire easy to understand for the respondents.
3.2 Data Collection
This study is survey based and thus, primary data was collected from the respondents: the persons having at least one-time online transaction through social media. Thus, purposive sampling technique was utilized in the study as it fits best to the need of this study. Data was collected using structured questionnaire which were distributed through emails and Facebook.

3.2.1 Sample Size
There are two approaches for selecting sample size which are absolute number size and subject to variable (STV) ratio. Researchers who suggest absolute number size have given different numbers for the sample size like respondents should be 100, 150, 200, 250, 300 and 500 while researchers who suggest STV ratio suggest ratio of 2:1, 3:1, 5:1, 6:1, 10:1, 20:1 and 30:1. This ratio can be interpreted as for one item, there should be specific number of respondents. We chose subject to variable ratio of 30:1 as it satisfied almost all the arguments which are given by different researchers and satisfied both school of thoughts i.e. Absolute Number Size and STV Ratio, for the appropriate results and factor loading. As this study has 21 items for measurement, target was 630 responses. However, only 476 responses were collected due to non-responding attitude of the online buyers.

3.2.2 Results
Data compilation was done for the analyzing the direction and strength of the relations between the constructs. SPSS 24.0 was used for univariate analysis. Multivariate analysis was done through SmartPLS 3.0. SmartPLS is used for second generation multivariate analysis in order to confirm the theoretical aspects of the hypotheses and for confirmation of the model (Ringle, Wende, & Will, 2005). Thus, this study can be referred to the study following deductive approach (Saunders, 2011).

3.3 Data Screening and Distribution Analysis
3.3.1 Missing Value Treatment
The first step is the analysis of data for its accuracy after its collection (Tabachnick, Fidell, & Osterlind, 2001). As data was collected through online forms, there was no issue of missing responses in the data. Therefore, only data normality property was analyzed only in the SPSS 24.0. PLS-SEM doesn’t focus the normality assumption of the data, however, data distribution property analysis is worth considering (Hair Jr, Hult, Ringle, & Sarstedt, 2016). This property was analyzed through Skewness and Kurtosis assessment in SPSS 24.0 and it was found that distribution of the data is normal as the recommended range of +2.5 and -2.5 was met. Homoscedasticity provides unbiased estimates of the relationship between the independent and dependent variables. In simple words, it points out to the homogeneity of the variance (Joseph F Hair, Anderson, Babin, & Black, 2010). For the homoscedasticity assessment, Levene test (Levene, 1960) was used through SPSS 24.0 and found that all the p values are lower than 0.05 of the results which satisfied the requirement for homoscedasticity assumption.

3.3.2 Respondents Profile
Respondents profile was assessed through SPSS 24.0 which represents some diversity in the respondents as it is shown in Table 1.

Table 1: Respondents Demographic Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Demographic Variable</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>320</td>
<td>67.23 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>156</td>
<td>32.77 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Below 20</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>28.15 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21 to 30</td>
<td>177</td>
<td>37.18 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31 to 40</td>
<td>156</td>
<td>32.77 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41 to 50</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1.89 %</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
More than 50

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education level</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>0%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>High school or below</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>8.40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>College (Intermediate)</td>
<td>119</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate school or above</td>
<td>317</td>
<td>66.60%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupation</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Business owner</td>
<td>229</td>
<td>48.11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>30.67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>21.22%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Daily Internet Usage</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Below 1 hour</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>9.66%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 to 3 hours</td>
<td>189</td>
<td>39.71%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 to 5 hours</td>
<td>121</td>
<td>25.42%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More than 5 hours</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>25.21%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 3.3.3 Model Assessment

After analyzing the data accuracy in SPSS 24.0, SmartPLS was used for the evaluation of proposed model. PLS model is divided into two models which are outer model (measurement model) and inner model (structural model). Outer model estimates the relationship between latent variable and the cluster of manifest variables. Inner model measures the relationship between different latent variables.

### 3.3.4 Outer Model Analysis

Outer model is assessed through validity and reliability (Hair Jr et al., 2016). Cronbach’s alpha is the estimator for international consistency (Cronbach, 1951). As shown in table 4.2, all the variable are found to be having Cronbach’s alpha between 0.604 and 0.754 which is more than 0.6 that is the minimum acceptable value of acceptance (Cronbach, 1951; Joe F Hair, Ringle, & Sarstedt, 2011). The second measure for the reliability is Composite reliability which analyses the robustness with respect to internal consistency. It is also analyzed as Henseler, Ringle, and Sinkovics (2009) concluded “Cronbach’s alpha tends to provide a severe underestimation of the internal consistency reliability of latent variables in PLS path models”. The result of this study revealed that variables of this study are vigorous as mentioned in Table 4.3. The values were higher than the minimum acceptable value of 0.6 (Nunnally & Bernstein, 1994; Tenenhaus, Vinzi, Chatelin, & Lauro, 2005; Werts, Linn, & Jöreskog, 1974) and were ranging from 0.791 to 0.845.

### Table 2: Outer Model Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Construct</th>
<th>Cronbach’s alpha</th>
<th>Composite Reliability</th>
<th>Average Variance Extracted (AVE)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Emotional Support</td>
<td>0.670</td>
<td>0.819</td>
<td>0.602</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informational Support</td>
<td>0.616</td>
<td>0.796</td>
<td>0.566</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The study investigated the reliability of scale items individually through factor loadings of these items for the construct. Outer loadings generation was done through SmartPLS (Ringle et al., 2005). Minimum acceptable criteria of 0.6 (F. Hair Jr et al., 2014; Joe F Hair et al., 2011) was crossed by these items. Some items from emotional support, social commerce constructs and intentions to buy didn’t meet the acceptable criteria and therefore, they were excluded from the model.

Construct validity is assessed through two criteria in the SmartPLS which are discriminant and convergent validity (F. Hair Jr et al., 2014; Joe F Hair et al., 2011). Convergent validity analyses the theoretically vigoroussness of the scale items (F. Hair Jr et al., 2014). It is examined through Average Variance Extracted (AVE) values. The acceptable limit is 0.4 (F. Hair Jr et al., 2014; Henseler et al., 2009) for the AVE values which is surpassed by the constructs in this study as these constructs have values from 0.505 to 0.602 which is mentioned in the Table 3. It means that operationalization of these constructs has more than 50% variance in the observed measurement (F. Hair Jr et al., 2014; Götz, Liehr-Gobbers, & Krafft, 2010).

Another criterion for the measurement of the validity of a construct is the discriminant validity which tests that every variable should be unique from the other constructs (Bagozzi, Yi, & Phillips, 1991). There are two tests for the discriminant validity which are Fornell-Larcker test and the cross loading analysis (Joe F Hair et al., 2011; Hair Jr et al., 2016). Through SmartPLS, cross loadings matrix was obtained. These loadings are Pearson Correlation Coefficients for their variables which demands that loadings of the variables should be higher than the cross loadings (Götz et al., 2010). This study affirmed this requirement as well, as it is mentioned in the Table 4.

### Table 3: Cross Loadings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Emotional Support</th>
<th>Informational Support</th>
<th>Intentions to Buy</th>
<th>Social Commerce Constructs</th>
<th>Trust</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ES1</td>
<td>0.815</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.559</td>
<td>0.583</td>
<td>0.622</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ES2</td>
<td>0.734</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.482</td>
<td>0.432</td>
<td>0.537</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ES4</td>
<td>0.777</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.518</td>
<td>0.495</td>
<td>0.611</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IB1</td>
<td>0.512</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.764</td>
<td>0.443</td>
<td>0.584</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IB2</td>
<td>0.534</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.721</td>
<td>0.436</td>
<td>0.555</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IB3</td>
<td>0.427</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.721</td>
<td>0.492</td>
<td>0.556</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IB5</td>
<td>0.563</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.826</td>
<td>0.537</td>
<td>0.607</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IS1</td>
<td>0.575</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.547</td>
<td>0.567</td>
<td>0.604</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IS2</td>
<td>0.517</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.475</td>
<td>0.509</td>
<td>0.546</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IS3</td>
<td>0.564</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.572</td>
<td>0.497</td>
<td>0.543</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC1</td>
<td>0.483</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.455</td>
<td>0.736</td>
<td>0.527</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC2</td>
<td>0.485</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.476</td>
<td>0.734</td>
<td>0.515</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC4</td>
<td>0.498</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.480</td>
<td>0.771</td>
<td>0.537</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T1</td>
<td>0.569</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.526</td>
<td>0.547</td>
<td>0.732</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T2</td>
<td>0.540</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.539</td>
<td>0.462</td>
<td>0.689</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T3</td>
<td>0.543</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.548</td>
<td>0.503</td>
<td>0.726</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T4</td>
<td>0.468</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.545</td>
<td>0.497</td>
<td>0.664</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T5</td>
<td>0.583</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.535</td>
<td>0.495</td>
<td>0.740</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

At the construct level, discriminant validity is assessed through Fornell-Larcker criterion (Fornell & Larcker, 1981). According to this test, the variable should share more variance with its measures as compared to the other variables in the study. Therefore, Square root of Average Variance Extracted (AVE) of a variable should be higher than its correlation with other variables in the model (Fornell & Larcker, 1981). In this study, requirement of the Fornell-Larcker test were satisfied which indicated satisfaction for the discriminant validity in the model as shown in the Table 5.
Table 4: Latent Variable Correlation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Emotional Support</th>
<th>Informational Support</th>
<th>Intentions to Buy</th>
<th>Social Commerce Constructs</th>
<th>Trust</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Emotional Support</td>
<td>0.776</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informational Support</td>
<td>0.733</td>
<td>0.752</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intentions to Buy</td>
<td>0.671</td>
<td>0.706</td>
<td>0.759</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Commerce Constructs</td>
<td>0.654</td>
<td>0.698</td>
<td>0.630</td>
<td>0.747</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trust</td>
<td>0.601</td>
<td>0.659</td>
<td>0.701</td>
<td>0.705</td>
<td>0.711</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Diagonal values are the squared root of AVE values

After satisfying the validity and reliability of the model, structural model was assessed based on satisfactory result of outer or measurement model.

3.3.5 Inner Model

Inner model or structural model investigates the relation of variables which are identified by the theory (Yaseen, 2015). The estimates determine the level of prediction of these variables as compared to goodness of fit in the Covariance based approach (F. Hair Jr et al., 2014; Hair Jr et al., 2016). Inner or structural model is assessed through four criteria which are coefficient of determination or R2, path coefficients, predictive relevance or Q2, and effect size or f2 and relative predictive relevance or q2 (Hair Jr et al., 2016).

R² assess the accuracy of prediction through analyzing joint impact of exogenous constructs on endogenous constructs (F. Hair Jr et al., 2014). R2 is the common criterion for assessing the model predicting accuracy in SmartPLS. Its value ranges from 0 to 1. Higher value of R² points out to higher prediction accuracy. R² values are moderate and strong as their values range from 0.43 and 0.69. This means that social commerce constructs have explained 43%, 49%, 59% and 69% variance in the emotional support, informational support, intentions to buy and trust respectively.

To analyze the significance through t-values, bootstrapping was done with 5000 resampling with SmartPLS (Hair Jr et al., 2014) as recommended by Preacher and Hayes (2008). Bootstrapping is a technique to estimate the path coefficients precision analysis (Hair Jr et al., 2014). It measures the standard error and t-values for assessing the path coefficients significance. β values are said to be significant if R² is explaining moderate variance with significant t-values at a specific level of confidence or p-value (F. Hair Jr et al., 2014; Hair Jr et al., 2016). This study finds all the t-values are greater than 2.58 and therefore, β is showing two tailed significances at p < 0.01 as shown in Table 5. This means that all the hypotheses proposed in the study are confirmed.

Along with estimation of predictive accuracy of (R²), it is important to assess the prediction relevance of the model in order to justify the quality of model (F. Hair Jr et al., 2014; Hair Jr et al., 2016). Q2 values demonstrate the collective effect of exogenous variables in predicting the inner models Predictive relevance is measured through Stone-Geisser’s Q2 which is the average index of variables (Geisser, 1974; Stone, 1974). Blindfolding process is applied with reflective scales for cross validating values of CV-Redundancy (F2) and CV-Communalities (H2). Range of Q2 values is 0 to 1 and model is expected to have predictive relevance if the value is above zero (Hair Jr et al., 2016). Thus, if the value is high, predictive relevance of the model is also high. Table 6 shows the blindfolding algorithm results through SmartPLS having gap of 6 blocks. Results reveals that all blocks have acceptable value for CV-redundancy and CV-communality as these are above zero (Fornell & Cha, 1994) which points out that model has predictive relevance.

Table 5: Results for Structural Model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>H</th>
<th>Paths</th>
<th>(β)</th>
<th>Standard Error</th>
<th>t-value</th>
<th>Assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>H1a</td>
<td>Social Commerce Constructs -&gt; Emotional Support</td>
<td>0.747</td>
<td>0.035</td>
<td>18.531</td>
<td>Accepted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H1b</td>
<td>Social Commerce Constructs -&gt; Informational Support</td>
<td>0.750</td>
<td>0.030</td>
<td>23.050</td>
<td>Accepted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H2a</td>
<td>Emotional Support -&gt; Trust</td>
<td>0.434</td>
<td>0.044</td>
<td>8.740</td>
<td>Accepted</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The study has found that Social Commerce Constructs have significant direct effect on Intention to buy. However, study also found that the social commerce constructs are positively related to mediating variable which are social support constructs and trust and these mediators are positively related to the dependent variable which is intentions to buy. Therefore, it seems necessary to analyze the mediation effect for the constructs in order to get clear understanding of the mediators’ role in the proposed model. This analysis is done through analyzing indirect and direct effect calculated through the SmartPLS and then calculating Variance Accounted For (VAF). Result shows that all the mediations in this model are partial mediations as the values of VAF are lower than 0.8 but higher than 0.2 as 0.8 describes full mediation and 0.2 shows no mediation (F. Hair Jr et al.).

4. Discussion
This study tries to find out the relationship of social commerce constructs and intentions to buy by considering social support constructs in the relation. In other words, antecedents of intentions to buy in the online context were tried to be figured out through quantitative study. A research model was proposed and evaluated in the study which tried to integrate the social commerce constructs, social support constructs which has emotional and informational support constructs, trust for the online businesses and intentions to buy. This empirical study supported the relations proposed in the study and found that high degree of emotional and informational support can be achieved when social commerce constructs and emotional and informational support exist which lead towards the trust (Hajli 2014) building and then, generating intentions to buy in online context (Hajli 2016). Consumers are more informed now about the products because of the social media and internet. Collecting information about the products is always a first step taken by the consumers in order to purchase it. This information collection process has been made easy by the social media. When this purchase is being done in the online context, the presence of trust is necessary. Trust is the key element in the transaction especially in the online transaction as it defines the obligation of the e-vendor. When trust is built, consumers are more likely to purchase and thus, intention to buy are generated (Hajli 2016). Therefore, it is important to examine the factors that can influence trust in online environment and generate the
intentions to buy. This study examines social commerce and social support constructs as factors which influence the trust and ultimately, intentions to buy are generated. Findings of this study help to understand the process of building trust and creating intentions to buy in social commerce. More specifically, this study reveals that social commerce constructs cause the higher level of informational and emotional support and these social support constructs cause the higher level of trust of the participants of social commerce which leads to the intention to buy. This empirical investigation of social commerce helps to understand the process of building trust and generation of intentions to buy.

This study is different with previous studies in way that it doesn’t consider social support as a second order construct but it takes it as a mediator having its antecedent which is a social commerce construct. By taking social support construct as an antecedent of social support, it explores its effect on social support (N. Hajli, 2015b). Role of these constructs is highlighted for building trust and generating the intentions to buy. Extending the previous studies (M. N. Hajli, 2014a), this study although finds the significant positive impact of social commerce constructs on both constructs of social support but it also reveals that it’s significance impact on informational support is higher as compared to the emotional support. Findings of this study reveals the mediating role of social support constructs in order to develop intentions to buy which is one of the contribution of this study. Moreover, this study reveals that trust is built with the integration of constructs of social supports; emotional support and informational support which confirms the findings of (Shanmugam et al., 2016). Therefore, this study is the extension of literature of social support in the context of social support and trust building process. From a practical viewpoint, the importance of social support is highlighted that e-vendors should try to incorporate the social support for the generation of intentions to buy. Thus, it recommends the e-vendors that social support environment should be created on the social networking sites or at their forums in order to develop intentions to buy and increase sales.

5. Implications of the Study
This study explores the role of social commerce constructs to increase social support in the online communities which increase trust level and intention to buy.

With respect to the theoretically implications, this study suggests a research model in social commerce. This research is a modest contribution to develop better understanding of social commerce through empirical study by incorporating social support constructs as an effect of social commerce constructs to develop trust and intentions to buy in the modern world of social media.

Practically, this research contributes by emphasizing significance of social platforms which are enabled by web 2.0. Its importance for e-commerce firms to figure out a plan for the reviewers and for managing social media efficiently as consumers’ decisions for purchasing is worth studying (Chen & Xie, 2005). Result of this study provide some guidelines to e-commerce firms to use social commerce efficiently for building trust which can influence the intention to buy of consumers on social networking sites. Social platforms like ratings and reviews, forums and communities, referrals and recommendations are vital components in social commerce for building trust. Thus, e-vendors may engage with customers on these platforms to build trust which leads to purchasing behavior.

This study has several limitations according to its conduct. First, data representativeness is limited. This study was conducted in Pakistan which is a developing country. There is a great difference between virtual markets of a developing country and developed country. So, future research can be conducted in advanced economy to increase its generalizability. Second, 5 point Likert Scale was used in this research and 7 point Likert Scale could provide more appropriate results for the model. Third, data collection was done in only one online community which was Facebook. So, its generalizability is limited. So, results can vary for social commerce constructs if other virtual communities are also considered. Fourth, this study focused on social support to build trust and intention to buy. There may be some other variables which can affect this model. Future researchers can try to explore other trust building factors and factors behind intention to buy in social commerce. Fifth, as suggested by Shanmugam et al. (2016), age of the participants can affect the model. Age can be used as a moderator on social support. So, future research can be conducted to take age as a moderator in the study.

6. Conclusion
This study tries to offer better knowledge on the social commerce. Trust has got great attention from researchers in social commerce context. This is due to the fact that trust is a bridge between social commerce constructs and
intention to buy. To investigate how intentions to buy are generated in social commerce context, this study proposed a framework based on theories of social commerce and social support. Social commerce constructs which are referrals, recommendations, ratings, reviews, forums and communities are the important constructs of social commerce. Based on it, a survey approach was used to collect the data from Facebook users who had executed a transaction online. This data was analysed through structured equation modelling to test the hypotheses. Findings of the empirical study using PLS-SEM emphasize the impact of social support in order to generate intentions to buy. Results of this study state that social commerce constructs cause higher informational and emotional support. This support which includes informational and emotional support, increases users’ trust on virtual communities. This study also found that trust leads to developing the intentions to buy which is consistent with previous researches on Technology Acceptance Model. Major finding of this study is that social commerce constructs developed from web 2.0, showed that interactions and relationships of users’ have positive impact on the customer behavior. It is also revealed that social commerce constructs provide opportunity for sharing information, contribution, collaboration and co-creation between and have positive impact on intention to buy. Results concludes that for e-commerce firms, it is necessary to create such platform that brings the customers together for sharing their experiencing. This will create opportunity for designing an effective strategy which will be beneficial for both, consumers and vendors.

In nutshell, this research examines the social support constructs role for generating consumer’s intention to buy through social commerce constructs and hence provide some novel findings.

References
Fornell, C., & Larcker, D. F. (1981). Structural equation models with unobservable variables and measurement error: Algebra and statistics. Journal of marketing research, 382-388.


Liang, T.-P., & Turban, E. (2011). Introduction to the special issue social commerce: a research framework for


Restructuring Nigeria: The Dilemma and Critical Issues

Muhammad Fuad bn Othman, Nazariah binti Osman, Isah Shehu Mohammed

Lecturer, School of International Studies, Universiti Utara, Malaysia, mfuad@uum.edu.my

Lecturer, School of International Studies, Universiti Utara, Malaysia, nazariah@uum.edu.my

Lecturer, School of General Studies, Federal Polytechnic, Bauchi - Nigeria, zababa72@yahoo.com

ARTICLE DETAILS

Objective: The main objectives of this paper are to explore the critical issues in the agitations/calls for restructuring Nigeria. A conceptual model is used and critical issues identified as influenced by many factors and interests with a special reflections on the background history, geography, heterogeneity and politics of the Nigerian state.

Methodology: Secondary sources of data were used to and historical documentation method of data analysis was also used to analyse the data.

Results: There are severally identified issues which are critical to and must be squarely addressed in order to arrive at a desired and mutually accepted stand on Nigeria’s geo-political, ethno-religious and socio-cultural composition, and a sustained unity and stability which are sought in the name of restructuring. Elites and political merchants’ prime interest in power and resources have however, shaped and dominated the restructuring agitations.

Implications: The study is premised on the socio-economic, political and ethno-religious realities of the Nigerian state and society. Therefore, the study presented an outline and a roadmap for the Nigerian policy makers, politicians, citizens and other stakeholders in the Nigerian state. The study stated the most sensitive issues which are indispensable to any re-arrangement, negotiation, consensus and unity in the Nigerian state by the name of restructuring.

© 2019 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: zababa72@yahoo.com


DOI: 10.26710/jbsee.v5i1.567

1. Introduction

The process of evolution/attainment and development of nation/statehood is not achieved overnight – mistakes are made, lessons are learned; considerations, concession, compromises, sacrifices, loses, and gains are made; symbiotic, parasitic or commensalism relations and co-habitation occur and do change with time and circumstances; conflicts of different dimensions occur and never end, while controversies trail some other issues, even wars are sometimes fought and reconciliations made in the long or short run. This is typical to the Nigerian state, and her evolution and development process. Characteristically, Nigeria, according to Orewa (1997) is a
calabash floating on a lake and although it may not sink, it has no definite direction/destination; and all chances to fix the Nigerian state at different times are missed, despite the efforts made by her leadership despite the importance of the leadership to every state, society and organisation (Wooi, Salleh & Ismail, 2017). Thus, Amuwo, Agbale, Suberu and Herault (2003:137) admit that Nigeria’s political development has been dislocated and disrupted and hence, the needs for both structural and institutional coherence. For the longest part of Nigeria’s political history, calls/agitations/clamour for constitutional reviews, amendments, conferences, national question, restructuring, among others, have partly dominated the public discourse. The political atmosphere also remains heated from time to time with military interventions and transitions, elections, opposition parties, marginalised elites/politicians/the public, and geo-regional, ethnic and religious groups, among others. These have prompted various constitutions making and re-making; constitutional conferences and amendments; establishment of Constituent Assemblies, MAMSER, National Political Reforms Conference, Oputa Panel, various Revenue Allocation and Minority Commissions, and National Reconciliation Commission (NARECOM), among others.

All the instances identified above have remained manifestations of restructuring/realigning the Nigerian body polity (Suberu, 2015). While some of the challenges are not new, for they have been there since the pre-independence era, but manifesting in different forms and dimensions, in the recent, substantial part of such have consistently came from the South-Western Region of Nigeria, being one of the three major regions that make up the Nigerian entity since the colonial amalgamation of January 1, 1914.

Such calls/agitations have, however been simultaneously defied and resisted by the other parts of the country, specifically, the Northern Region/part until recently. After what may be partly regarded as previous insistence on status quo maintenance, hide and seek play (calls for National Conference and or Sovereign National Conference, General Abacha’s Constitutional Conference, 1994, Obasanjo’s National Political Reforms Conference, 2005, Jonathan’s National Confab, National Reconciliation Commission), virtually every region of Nigeria is now responding to and accepting (willingly or because of political pressure) the quest/calls for the restructuring Nigeria. This restructuring is, however, enveloped in fear, anxiety, hope, despair and desperation, and the elite’ interests in continuous access to power and resources, with firm control and consolidation of same. The Northern Region of Nigeria, which had in the past resisted virtually all these calls/agitations for the restructuring is submitting to same, but still with mixed feelings and emotion - feelings among some Northerners that whatever may fall from the heaven, it is time stop the hide and seek and face bull by the horn and let what ever happen.

All the same and with whatever motive, for the restructuring to be meaningful and functional, there are critical issues that must be addressed. This study explored the Nigeria’s restructuring dilemma and the critical issues, which must be the focal point of the restructuring for those have been both the unifying and thorny issues in the unity and prosperity of the Nigerian state. The study explored those issues, which form the bedrock of any restructuring/geopolitical alignment and balance, and are the determinants of the Nigeria’s future in relation to unity, cohesion and stability among the component parts of the state.

2. Statement of the Problem
Nigeria, a British make up in 1914, is still carrying and being weighed down by ‘burden of difficult history’ (Unegbu, 2003; Oliver & Chandos, 1962). The atmosphere of Nigerian public/political discourse is presently clouded with calls/agitations/clamours for restructuring. Parceled in such calls and agitation’s cloud are fears, anxiety, hope, optimism, pessimism, threats, and illusions, among others. Ever since the involuntary amalgamation of various ethno-religious, geo-regional and political nationalities that made up the Nigerian entity on January 1, 1914, the country has been undergoing one critical socio-economic and political trial or the other. The issues and trends have been messy, characterised by uncertainty, conflicts (sometimes violent), controversy, compromise, and sacrifice. Resistance to the unity and cohesion of Nigeria has also dominated the Nigerian political scene over national question/national conference/restructuring, devolution of powers/true federalism, among others. However, reactions vary from one part of Nigeria to the others. Dealing with the issue has been complex and sensitive having transcend across ethnicities, religions, geo-politics, among others, and also persistent since the amalgamation, colonial and post-independence period as well (Momoh & Adejumobi, 2017).

Most governments while in power had been resisting such calls/and only play gimmick when much pressurised, some parts of the country have together with the national leadership irrespective of North or South at the headship, resisted and or manipulated such calls/agitations largely due to the questions of constitutionality of such and fear of the known and unknown consequences, including the possible disintegration of the Nigerian state. While some of
the proponents of the restructuring maintain that anyone who does not benefit from the state has the right to question being part of its unity (Ojukwu, 1989). The leadership, which is essential to the success of every state and society as noted by Wooi, Salleh and Ismail, (2017), therefore, needs to do something to address the situation.

The elites on the other hand, especially who lose out in the political merchandise, keep pressurising for the restructuring; other elites use it as a means to secure political relevance and accommodation in the political space, circle and access to the state power and resources (Adetunberu & Bello, 2018); the mutual suspicion, fear, despise and resentment, and North/South gap has widened; there is a general feeling of inferiority/superiority complex among the components of the Nigerian federation; some regard others as parasites, and others as betrayers. Poverty, increased manipulation of religion and ethnicity, inability to withstand election defeat, manifesting dissatisfaction with leadership quality, etc., have been further fuelling the agitations/calls for the restructuring. Many of the calls/agitations centre on what Nigerians refer to as ‘true federalism’ by which they mean a decentralised federation with weak centre and strong component states/regions with resource control autonomy.

There have been consolidating threats to the cohesion, further integration and unity of the Nigerian state with signs and symptoms of not only disaffection, but escalation of insecurities – conflicts over revenue allocation/resource control, cattle rustling, kidnapping, cultism, armed banditry, attacks on oil facilities and installations, bitter politics of ethno-religious and regional identities, ethno-religious intolerances, poverty, ethno-religious, conspired and orchestrated Fulani/ herdsmen-farmers conflicts, unemployment, socio-economic and infrastructural deteriorations and above all, corruption. These have altogether also re-engineered and fuelled the disaffection and partly fuelled the calls for Sovereign National Conference, restructuring, etc., in different names and dimensions (Oyadiran & Toyin, 2015:41; Baba & AeySinghe, 2017:42, Mohammed & Aisha, 2018; Adagbabiri & Okolie, 2018). With those critical issues and problems, Bello (2018:93) notes that the Nigerian state is on a ‘Keg of gunpowder’ and needs to do some things to arrest the situation and prevent the country from collapse.

3. Methodology
A conceptual model was used and critical issues identified as influenced by many factors and interests with a special reflection on the background, history and politics of the Nigerian state. Secondary sources of data were used to and historical documentation method of data analysis was also used to analyse the data. Much of the data from the secondary sources involved the foundation and formation of Nigeria, the positions of the first generation nationalists, the various historical annals of making and re-making of policies and programmes towards Nigerian unity and cohesion and the complications associated with such.

4. Theoretical Framework for the Study
This study is premised on the framework of systems theory which is most suitable for studying a heterogeneous state system, federation and or a complex setting/society/set up where both the political system and its system and sub-systems are inter-dependent on each other in terms of input, output/functions, and what affects one automatically affects the other (Kirchmair, 2017). The systems theory is not limited to the natural sciences only, but also directly linked to the socio-political environment, among others, as the constituents of humankind’s existence and survival (Stead & Stead, 2017). In the systems theory, there are interactions, connectivity, and systematic processing of demands - input and output - policies) (Easton, 1957:384). Nigeria, being a British and heterogeneous making comprises of relatively independent, but interconnected and inter-dependent parts and societies who altogether make up the state and the federation in an arrangement (system) with inter-connectivity with environment, communication, transport, economy, religion, etc., all these are parts of operationalisations of the systems theory (Baeccker, 2017; Baraldi & Corsi, 2017).

The factors of ethnicity, religion, region, culture, etc., all influence and shape the Nigerian system Crawford (1993). More so, Nigerian systemic structure is more properly studied and understood when its heterogeneities are taken into account in relation to the systematic formation of the state itself (McCormick, 2010:445). The systems theory here becomes appropriate and relevant in the context of Nigeria being a federation with sub-systems/structures wishing to restructure the system. Restructuring the Nigerian system is an automatic reflection of the systems theorisations as the sub-systems (component parts, multiple heterogeneities, etc.) are relatively interdependent on one another and an adjustment in one sub-systems affects/alters the system. Restructuring Nigeria, therefore entails adjustments, repositioning, of the heterogeneous constituents which in turn has an overall effect on the Nigerian state system.
5. Background of the Nigerian State and Politics

Nigeria, which resulted from the January 1, 1914 involuntary colonial amalgamation of the Northern and Southern parts of the famous River Niger has since then been faced with numerous challenges of both state/nationhood more than any other country in Africa. Accordingly Kirk-Greene and Rimmer (1981:5) mention such challenges as elites/the masses, North/South, assumed socialism/unitarism, Islam/Christianity, and traditional/achieved authority, but all of which are inconsistent, irreconcilable and characterised by threatening under-currents in the contexts of struggle. The annals of Nigeria’s history has the records of the various struggles for inclusion of Nigerians in the colonial government representations; the internal struggle by the various ethno-regional nationalities to ensure their full inclusion and to avoid dominance of one by the others among themselves; the self-government motion and consequent crisis; the various constitutional developments and deadlocks; the crisis of forming coalition governments in 1959 and 1964 federal elections; the Tiv riots in the Northern Region of Nigeria; the Census crisis; the Western Regional Crisis and election; the treason trial of prominent politicians, including Chief Obafemi Awolowo; the January and July, 1966 bloody military coup and counter-coup; the Nigerian civil war; the dominance of military in national affairs; the Murtala coup of July 29, 1975; the transition to civilian democratic regimes and constitution makings; states and local governments creations of 1976; the return of the military to barracks; the president Shagari’s economic crisis; the return of the military into politics and governance in December, 1983; the mid 1980’s economic crisis and the Structural Adjustment Programme; the 1987 and 1991 states creations; the establishment of MAMSER, the Constituent Assembly and 1989 constitution making; the General Babangida longest and most expensive politics of transition in the history of Nigeria and its failure in 1993; the various ethno-religious conflicts, notably, the 1987 Zangon-Kataf, Kaduna State crisis; the G. G. Orkar coup of April 22, 1990; the June 12, 1993 presidential election and aftermaths; the involuntary withdrawal of the military in 1993; the establishment of and the attendant crisis of legitimacy of the Interim National Government; the return of the military in November, 1993; the 1994-95 Constitutional Conference; the 1996 states creation; the General Abacha regime’s patchy politics of transition and tenure elongation; the Abdussalami transition and the return of civilian-democratic rule in 1999; the ethno-religious tension and rivalry among Nigerians leading to establishment of the various ethno-militia groups, such as the OPC, APC, MEND, MASSOB; the various resource control battles and politics, including court cases with the Federal and States Government over resource control; the general elections and legitimacy crisis of 2003, 2007 and 2011 elections; oil subsidy scams; the Niger Delta militancy; the Boko Haram insurgency; the orchestrated Fulani/Herdsmen-Farmers conflict; stupendous corruption cases and charges (Rahim & Toyin, 2018; Mohammed & Aisha, 2018; Mohammed, Aisha & Saidu, 2018).

Similarly, Amaechi and Muoh (2017:22) have significantly noted the developments of the pre-independence Constitutional Conference during which the then three regions (East, North and West) reached an agreement to adopt federal system, but with gaps on issues of unity between the north and south, seats allocation in the central legislature based on population, revenue allocation on per capita, Electoral College System, and establishment of the Houses of Chiefs and Assembly.

These and other issues have characterised, dominated and affected the Nigerian state and their recurrences continue to determine and undermine the unity, progress and prosperity of the Nigerian state. Additionally, these cumulatively pose more questions than answers on the feasibility and sustainability of the Nigerian state. Hence, the the calls for restructuring, national conference, national question, reforms, constitutional amendments and reverting to true federalism, among others, which are all disguised, masked or labelled with different names. It could be confidently argued that no state in the world with such heterogeneities as Nigeria and undergoing these cumulative trials, has survived secession, collapse/failure or disintegration. Thus, the submission of Baba and Aeyisinghe (2017:42) that Nigeria’s unity is faced with multi-dimensioned threats as calls for and attempts to break away/secession, insurgency, farmer-herdsmen/Fulani conflict, cattle rustling, armed banditry, attacks on oil installations, religious intolerance, politics of ethnicity, religion and identity, unemployment and poverty among others. For those reasons, there have been numerous expressions of disaffection by the various elements of the Nigerian state at different times and in different dimensions, but Nigeria has miraculously survived all these and is still united, though of course with many and other emerging challenges. This, however, does not mean Nigeria will automatically continue and remain, and miraculously survive the problems in future as it would be a political and irrational miscalculation to over-stretch its luck.

6. The Dilemma
The issue of restructuring Nigeria has on one hand plunged all - the Nigerian state authorities, the elites and the general public into a dilemma. This is because there has not been any format, consensus, harmony and or common ground on what, where, when and by whom to restructure Nigeria. Rather, what obtains is a fractured Nigeria in which its peoples, elites and state authorities have different perspectives, view and consider the restructuring in relatively opposing and conflicting directions with mainly ethno-religious, sectional, geo-regional and other personal interests over and above the Nigeria and her national interests of unity, cohesion and development; and also rhetoric (Farayibi 2017; Opadere, 2018). For the people of the Middle Belt/Central Nigeria, for example, restructuring Nigeria would mean separating them from the majority Hausa/Fulani/Muslim north, liberating them from centuries of domination, the freedom to create an Christian enclave and practice Christianity, and uplift the minority and mainly Christian tribes from the area. This restructuring is therefore seen by them as the end and success of their struggles to break away from the larger northern Nigeria and hegemony of the Hausa/Fulani and Islam which they have been resisting for centuries. For the Igbo South-East Nigeria, restructuring is an opportunity to even if not actualise their dream of Biafran state, have the opportunity of accessing national political power which they have not since the Ironsi regime was overthrown in 1966, and also exercise domineering power over the South-Eastern part of Nigeria with over-riding economic power. For the South-South/ oil rich Niger-Delta, it is an opportunity to have full (100%) control of oil resource (Adetunberu & Bello, 2018). For the North, it is viewed as a threat to the existence of Nigeria as one entity, especially with the anticipated devolution of powers, creation of state police, loss of oil revenue share, etc. To the South-West Yoruba, restructuring is viewed with regionalism, greater regional autonomy/true federalism and economic/resource control in loose federation/weak central and strong regional governments/confederation or any other decentralised arrangement, etc.

On the other hand, the elites from all the geo-political parts of Nigeria have together found a safe and secured market and space for political popularity, access to state power and resources, accommodation, relevance and to divide and rule Nigeria and Nigerians. While the Nigerian state authorities maintain caution, fear and reluctance in handling the issue for it may result in threat to the status quo and political instability as there are thorny issues that must be addressed if the restructuring is to hold. More so, the authorities are fully aware of the legal bounds in doing anything outside constitutional framework and provisions, especially those to do with Nigeria’s divisibility and dissolubility (Section 2[1 & 2] of the Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria, 1999). Despite the dilemma, however, there are common but critical and sensitive issues on which the restructuring must centre around if it is to achieve a meaningful end. This article, therefore, explored the issues.

7. Politics of Restructuring Nigeria

It is maintained by Richard Bourne (as cited in Verjee 2017) that ‘anyone who claims to understand Nigeria is either deluded, or a liar’. While the calls for restructuring, adoption of true/fiscal federalism, etc., have been on for long in Nigeria, such have been mainly coming from those who are in the opposition, lost out in the political merchandise or dis-advantaged/marginalised in political power and resource sharing and control; and the elites who seek their selfish class interests; while the others, including state authorities resist and turn away from the calls/agitations, except where pushed to the wall. The various regimes while in power had hardly supported the restructuring, but only play gimmicks game and pass on to subsequent incoming regimes. Many of the agitations are also partly dominated by few elites who are more concerned with popularity, politics of accommodation and interested in acquisition, control and consolidation of the state political and economic powers and resources. For the common man, it has remained the same, the various regimes have been the same with little differences and impact on the lives of the ordinary and the down trodden, except in some few cases. At a point, the politics of restructuring has on its own become a means of seeking relevance, resource allocation, political power expropriation and accommodation among the elites. To be precise, politics in Nigeria in both orientation and character, the calls/agitations for restructuring Nigeria and resistance of same, and the calls for national unity are mostly dishonestly driven to achieve certain person interests of the few (Baba & Aeyesinghe, 2017; Farayibi 2017).

All over the world, the ordinary fight, debate, conflict and violence in political and state affairs are left to the common men on street, in the square, ring side or over the streets. This is typical of Nigerian politicians and politics and just in line with Othman (1984) who notes that: “in any struggle for power and its spoils, there is usually a thin line between one’s moral position and one’s concrete material interests”. As for the leaders/elites, although they differ in interests, ideology and have weaknesses and strength, their own is to sit in the political studio, produce, direct, control, follow up and watch over the actions, while the commoners are there on the field/square acting for them, in their interests and on their behalf. Class interest and the quest for and consolidation of political and economic power and resources, and relevance are major factors influencing not only the restructuring agitations in
Nigeria, but also the actions and reactions of the elites/political class globally (Braji, 2014b; Mohammed, 2018; Turner & Badru, 1984). Therefore, Momoh and Adejumobi (2017) see the restructuring, sovereign national conference, etc., not as the views or meaningful to the toiling people, but the elites and intellectuals feeling about toiling the people.

Like many other past regimes with both lukewarm and reluctant attitudes to the calls, agitations and clamour for the restructuring, in the 2018 New Year broadcast to the nation, Nigeria’s President, Muhammadu Buhari (as cited in Blueprint, January 1, 2018, p. 6) depicts that Nigerians are so impatient that they want to move faster than it is possible when it has to take time before a system develops and mature. He further observes that Nigeria’s problems are more of process than the much agitated restructuring.

From the other and a different perspective, there are already both legal and political debates, which may ensue to a legal battle over the constitutionality of the restructuring vis-a-vis the powers of the National Assembly, which is constitutionally established to make new, amend existing and or repeal all laws in the Federal Republic of Nigeria under clearly spelt conditions and provisions, and not ethno-regional loyalty, interests, affiliations, such as the Arewa Consultative Forum, ACF, Afenifere, Ohaneze Ndigbo, among others (Sections 4 [1-9], 47, 48 & 49 of the Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria, 1999). There are fears, nervousness, anxiety and mixed feelings/emotions among all the regions for losing national share of resources – North; anxiety to secede and depend on oil wealth – East; and the confidence to survive with little or without oil by the West. The entire bid/clamour for the restructuring is caught with a dilemma over what, who, where when and how to restructure. Aside the realities of the problems bedevilling the Nigerian state, there have not only been manipulations, but also crisis of confidence on the attempts by the authorities to institute mechanisms such as the conference, debate, questions, etc., relating to the restructuring. For example, Agamuuo (2014) laments that the 2014 Goodluck Jonathan administration’s National Conference was packed up with retired, weak men and women, failed politicians, and retired military officers who have over the years been recycled in such conferences and constitutions making; and also ethno-regional loyalists who are largely responsible for the failures of the Nigerian state and whose major concern was how to share national resources, but not leading Nigeria out of the troubles they had embroiled her into.

Similarly, Baba and Aeysinghe (2017:43) have raised doubt on the sincerity and feasibility of the restructuring for the fact that: “The elites whose supports are required to make disintegration possible are strongly united because the unity of the country seems to be fetching them serious fortunes through corruption and injustice at the expense of the ordinary citizens”.

8. The Nigerian Elite Factor

There are two broad classes in the society – the elites who are the rulers monopolising power and resource control, but few in number; and the masses who are ruled by the elites, but always larger in number (Peters, 2005:40-44; Mosca, 1939:50). The elites are the few who wield control, consolidate and manage state/societal power and resources in more or less, the interest of the ruled masses. Like many other developing states, politics and statehood in Nigeria are built an unequal wealth, status, prestige and influence with dependence for patronage and reward for state power, support, resources and influences (Wilson, 1996:92). The patron-client relation centres on persons of unequal wealth, status, prestige and influence with dependence for patronage and reward with state power, support, resources and influences (Wilson, 1996:92). The patron-client relation is governed by the collective individual interests of the elites who make up a class for canvassing promoting, consolidating and protecting their collective interests, but do have internal clashes where their individual differences conflict with those of one another – intra class fractions (Mohammed, et al., 2018). The agitations for restructuring Nigeria is partly engineered by the elites, who have lost out in the power change and hand shake game over sometimes in the Nigerian politics. This has manifested in form of raising the dust for restructuring where no political accommodations are offered to such elites upon transition from one government to another or circumstances where appointments into public offices, resource (oil) allocation and control of political power and relevance are lost (Adetunberu & Bello, 2018). The affected elites then resort to politics of opposition, change and seeking relevance/accommodation, including the calls/agitation for restructuring. On the other hand, the elites vested with state powers at the same time hardly agitate or support such calls/agitations having been with the status quo. This explains why the much and incessant pressure/opposition to governance come from either the opposition, the dis-advantaged or those who feel aggrieved by the existing
political and economic power structures (Mosca, 1939). To sum up the Nigerian elites character in relation politics, restructuring and unity of the Nigerian state, Baba and Aeysinghe (2017:41) conclude that:

Politics in Nigeria is dishonest in manner and orientation. The calls for negotiations on the terms of national unity are dishonesty-driven. The opposition to negotiation or to call for restructuring is also dishonest. The greater part of the dishonesty is located at the level of the elite. It is precisely the problem of dishonesty that largely informs the agitation for restructuring of the country.

Tied to that, political marketing is now global and the political market needs are everywhere are in the globe and all the stakeholders – governments, politicians the masses, the media, etc., adopt the tools of the market and marketing in order to design and sell products for satisfaction of the political consumers (Wymer & Less-Mashment, 2005:1; Baines, 2011:xxi). However, there are numerous manipulations, challenges and intricacies in the market, and sale and consumption of the political products as may be determined by the market (political arena/state), consumers (the public), and the marketers/suppliers (politicians and government) (Sarwate, 1993:80-83). Some Nigerian political entrepreneurs have resorted to trading in the restructuring agitations in order to achieve their self-centred ends, but masked in restructuring the Nigerian state. This is typical of elites and politicians, especially in developing states – exploiting every instance, circumstance and opportunity to achieve ends/interests of state political and economic power acquisition, control and consolidation. Indeed, Nigerian elites, political entrepreneurs and agents have consistently employed political scheming, ethnicity and religion to achieve their targets, and thus, an un-ending demand for states and local governments’ creations with elites’ interests in state power and resources, which also pose other challenges to the Nigerian state (Saylor, 2016; Hislope & Mughan, 2012).

9. Federalism in Nigeria
From October, 1954 to January 1966, Nigeria had operated federal system of government with the powers shared among the Federal, three and later four Regional Governments of the East, North, West and later the Mid-West. However, with the January, 1966 first and bloody military coup, Nigeria was re-directed from federal to unitary system which also lasted for only about six month, then consumed its architect (General Ironsi) and became abolished. Upon assumption of power, General Gowon indicated the imperative and desire to return to the federal system, for being the only system that could guarantee the various interests and unity of the Nigerian state and her integral parts, considering its heterogeneous character and complexities. Twelve States (six each for the north and south) and Provinces for each were later in 1967 created which replaced the former and abolished four Regions. Despite its complications and challenges, federalism has so far remained the most feasible option for Nigeria, being a legacy from the British colonialists who in 1914 welded different ethno-religious, geo-political, ethno-cultural and linguistic nationalities into one political entity. Simeon and Conway (as cited in Gagnon and Tully 2001:339) have summarised that the main rationales in federalism are reduction of conflicts, increase in harmony among the component parts, granting autonomy and self-determination and identity by the minorities, and limiting the majority’s impositions on the minorities in a reconciled arrangement.

Despite the challenges which are inherent in every federal system and arrangement, federalism as a system is a means to an end, but not an end in itself, and the central issue in it lies in how the political actors manage and relate in operating the system (Adedeji & Ezebasili, 2018). Thus, Burgess (2006:1) vividly note that both understanding and full comprehension of federalism is not possible, because it (federalism) comprises of some intangible characters, and there is no uniformed means and pattern of operating it in the world and, therefore, strongly asserts that although:

Federal theory does exist, there is, as yet, no fully fledged theory of federalism. At best there is partial theory based on rigorous conceptual analysis and the pursuit of terminological precision. At worst there is crass empiricism rooted in the failure to develop concepts and define the key terms.

Although the 1999 Constitution of Nigeria has no provision for regionalism, one of the issues raised under the current agitations in Nigeria is that of regional autonomy. In the same vein, Riker (1964:142) has maintained that what obliterates and sustains the autonomy of units in a federation is the political culture of the component units. It is pertinent to therefore, note that, even if a change is made and greater powers are given to the component units/states/regions, political culture and observance of the rule of law are more important than anything in achieving the desires of granting autonomy and overall interests of the federalism.
Therefore, for Ewetan (2012:1084), the central issues bedevilling the Nigerian federal system revolve around the centralist system of fiscal relations; dominance of the Federal Government in revenue sharing from the Federation Account; disharmonious Federal-State relations; critical issue of over dependence on oil revenue; and conflict over revenue sharing principles and formula. It is thus identified that the central points of contention in the Nigerian federalism are the main background of the federalism itself, the cordiality and harmony or otherwise of the inter-governmental relations, the requisites of operating the federalism, the federalism vis-a-vis the other forms of association, the various units in the federal system (states, federal, local, regional, etc.), fiscal matters, political parties (their number, nature and character of establishment and operations), and the strategies for national distribution of services and offices. Despite those however, federalism is so far, the most feasible and alternative arrangement of government in multi-ethnic and geo-religious states as Nigeria, although all the dangers which signalled the collapse of other former federations have been evident in Nigeria (Salawu, Adelabu & Oladele, 2015). There are, therefore, critical issues and interests in Nigerian federalism which also involve political recognition of the minority, autonomy and access to state power and resources (Adetoye, 2016). Similarly, Daniel (2015), Babalola (2015) and Kalu (2016) assert that Nigerian federalism has over the years been negatively affected by numerous constitutional reviews and amendments, corruption in public affairs, abuse and marginalisation of the minorities and elites’ manipulation of state power and resources, and therefore, the call for true federalism in Nigeria ought to commence with re-examining the current constitutional provisions on the federal system, rather than seeking for other alternative arrangements.

10. Fiscal/True Federalism

Nigerians have imbibed a tag for a peculiar federal arrangement they clamour for - ‘true federalism’. By that term, Nigerians mean a federal system which grants the units more powers than the centre with fiscal responsibilities or rather, the federal arrangement which obtained in Nigeria between 1954 and 1966 when the three and later, the four regions (East, Mid-West, North and West) were constitutionally more powerful than the central government that was limited to less and specific exclusive legislative powers. Rightly observed, however, Azaiki (2007:151) depicts that federalism entails negotiations and sacrifices, and that true federalism results from the deliberate compromises where the autonomous units sacrifice some of their socio-political and economic rights and interests for the overall unity of the sovereign, larger and stronger federation.

In the same vein, Shafritz, Russel and Borick (2007:159-160) have described fiscal federalism as “the fiscal financial relations that exist between and among units of government in a federal system...” and that “the theory of fiscal federalism, or multi-unit government finance, addresses the question of the optimal design of governments in a multilevel (or federal) government system”. They additionally note that fiscal federalism is a form of government that is operational in solving the problems of a heterogeneous state, such as the maintenance of high rate of employment with stable prices, equitable distribution of income by the centre, while the other local/regional units handle the allocation of resources for the purposes of local/regional demands. By this submission, the government has an obligation to solve three basic economic problems of attainment of the most equitable distribution of income; maintenance of high employment with stable prices; and establishment of an efficient pattern of resource allocation. This means addressing the question of structural balance/imbalance in resource/revenue allocation among the states and local and the financial autonomy of the units (Amah, 2017).

11. The Critical Questions in Restructuring Nigeria

While there are several and diverse reasons for the call/agitations for restructuring the Nigerian state, there are, similarly, critical questions which also require critical and technical answers on the restructuring agenda. These questions border on not only the scope and limitations, but also the legal status of the restructuring and extensively include: what is it to be restructured? The geography of Nigeria? The politics? The People? The state system? Who organises/conducts/regulates the restructuring? Who will represent who, what and where? What is the method of representation? What is the constitutionality or unconstitutionality of the restructuring alongside the Nigerian Constitution and its provisions on the Nigerian state in terms of laws making, repeal and amendments? What is the formula for representation of the ethnic nationalities, regions, states, zones? What will be the terms of reference for the restructuring? Whose constitutional power is it to amend/change the Nigerian constitutional laws? This indeed, are unavoidable questions which require definite and constitutionally backed answers for the restructuring to a both legally and politically binding on the Nigerian state and the citizens (Amaechi & Muoh, 2017; Rahim & Toyin, 2018:134; Sections 2, 4, 8, 47, 9[1-4] of the 1999 Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria).
Restructuring Nigeria, if feasible, would certainly be neither easy nor can it be done within a short time and or process, in addition to various constitutional provisions and limitations on national issues. This is also in view of the sensitivity of the restructuring and the complex nature of the Nigerian state and societies characterised by heterogeneities - socio-political, economic and geo-religious backgrounds, experiences and directions, civilisations and world views. All the same, this study identified the following as the critical issues in restructuring Nigeria.

12. The Nigerian State, Unity and the Reality
To understand the significance national unity in any bid to restructuring in Nigeria, it is inevitable to reflect on colonialism, Nigeria’s pre-colonial and colonial era. Colonialism has been the main factor responsible for the involuntary reconfiguration of the former African states, Caliphate, Kingdoms, Empires, and mini states, and the re-configuration of the various peoples geo-ethnic and political settings, which also culminated to colonial and post-colonial ethnic and religious identities of the states and societies (Zahorik, 2017; Ayoade, 2010; Ake, 2000). Furthermore, the colonial policy of divide and rule in Nigeria had made negative impacts on the heterogeneous peoples, who were amalgamated and that further distanced the various ethno-religious and geo-regional groups by derailing their natural form and process of evolution and homogenisation. To make matters worse, the British colonialists deliberately and for their convenience, separated the Northern and Southern Nigeria’s administrations which also fostered geo-ethnic tension and disunity in the post-colonial Nigeria. Hence, Nigeria like the other colonised African states is made to carry “the burden of a difficult history” (Jacob, 2012:14). Therefore, what favoured the British political, economic and imperial interests has become a problem for Nigeria, which for over a centenary, could not be solved (Rahim & Toyin, 2018:134).

Primordial loyalty according to Geertz (1994), is an attachment that stems from the sense of a given social existence – belonging to and or speaking a particular language, following a particular religion, having been born into a particular family/clan, emerging out of a particular circumstances of history, living in a particular place; or the having vital facts on an issue, and in addition to those facts also given other interpretations/meanings from the one’s viewpoint as a result of blood relation, speech, customs and traditions, religious perspective, place of residence, historical antecedents, and person’s physical appearance. Due to the inter-play of so many factors – historical, religious, social, economic, political, and regional, among others, these primordial loyalties have taken over national loyalty in Nigeria and negatively hit the national unity. The extent to which Nigerians have and act within the tendencies of this primordialism has permeated every aspect of Nigeria’s national life and this is in line with the submission of Itumo (2017:43) that: “No matter the status of an individual in this country, he has more attachment and loyalty to his indigenous group than to the nation, itself”. However, some of the political leaders and elites become involved in such attachments not because they have the conviction that it has any positive impact, but for the fear that their ethno-regional groups may sanction or frown at their inability to canvass their ethno-regional agitations (Adangor, 2017:8).

Nigerian unity has since colonial days been a major challenge to both the nationalists and the ordinary citizens of Nigeria. This is because according to Ojukwu (1989:1) “the problem with Nigeria is that she is fully embroiled in an identity crisis”. This identity crisis is rooted in the nature of the colonial conquest and the involuntary weld up of different peoples, nations, states, political and geo-ethnic groups. With that, Nigerians, for example, do not actually perceive and view one another as fellow Nigerians, but ‘old time’ and ‘sworn enemies’ (Bello, 2018:93). It is therefore not surprising to face such a challenge. However, the failure over a century to achieve a reliable unity has been the major concern of all. According to Baba and Ayesinghe (2017:41), Nigerian unity and integration process has been marred by many events, especially from 1966 from where some of the federating units became tired and bored of the union, while some others still felt the union must be up held at whatever cost. Although the journey to nationhood/federalism is continuous and mistakes are made, lessons learned and corrections made, the apparent trail of Nigerian state character reflects the inability of the federation to even resolve the basic rudiments which bind and tie the people together. Despite being united for over a century, Nigerians still look back with contemplation of whether to remain in or pull out of the Nigerian federation. The past (violent attempt) by the Biafrans, which was crushed seemed to have been only one out of many, but for the might and legitimacy of the Nigerian authorities to use force and crush any acts and threats of secession and treason from the Nigerian state.

From the varied, but practical conceptions and manifestation of actions of Nigerians, including the elites, the Nigerian unity is conceptualised and worked with differently by Nigerians as observed by Taribo (2014:37-38) that unity in the Nigerian state means different things to Nigerians in their respective regions and ethno-cultural settings. In that respect, to the Hausa/Fulani/North, Nigerian unity means unity in diversity with each part developing at its
own pace, ‘cooperative assistance’, and the protection of original and ethno-cultural values in a confederal arrangement; to the Yorubas, Nigerian unity means ‘peaceful co-habitation’ and ‘meritorious development’ of each ethno-regional group alongside ‘fiscal, political and administrative federalism’; and to the Igbos on the South-East, Nigerian unity means one vast borderless market, unitary administration with freedom to work, residence and the discharge of national civic duties; but for the minorities across Nigeria, unity depicts gang up by the majority ethnic groups (Hausa/Fulani, Yoruba and Igbo) against the minority groups on one hand, and a fierce rivalry between the majority groups that reduced them (minorities) to hostages of the majority groups.

In that regard, Baba and Aeysinghe (2017: 45-46) have observed the major threats to Nigerian unity which also relate directly to the restructuring as: poor national governance and leadership; marginalization; religious intolerance; internal conflicts affiliated with ethnic, religion and politics of identity; poor environmental management policy; over centralization of power and resources; corruption; poverty; unemployment; and lack of patriotism. However, to understand the complex nature and character of evolution of Nigeria and other colonised African states, a deep reflection has to be made into the history of colonial conquest, merger and fragmentation of the former pre-colonial states and societies of Africa (Mamdani, 1996).

Thus, Nigeria’s first Prime Minister, Sir Abubakar Tafawa Balewa had maintained that ever since the involuntary colonial amalgamation of the Northern and Southern protectorates of the Niger River on January 1, 1914, the country has remained far from being real and united country, but only on paper, because the supposed unity was not originally evolved by the peoples themselves, but mere British desire and interests imposed on the people. Currently, instead of the national unity, loyalty and cohesion, the various ethnic, religious and geo-regional groups are more concerned with the promotion and consolidation of their various particularistic interests, with the dominance of the ‘tripod’ majority ethnic groups – Hausa/Fulani, Igbo and Yoruba, and the two dominant religions – Islam and Christianity (Asogwa, 2018:49).

There also come the issues of domination, marginalisation, dissention and resentment of one another. On one hand, Nigeria’s unity fracas cannot be discerned from the long age nurtured fear of marginalisation and or domination by all the ethnic groups, but especially the oil-rich and other minorities in the Middle-Belt/central Nigeria. In particular, the perceived dominance of the Northern Region of Nigeria over national affairs has remained to date, a major concern of the Southern part as Johnson and Olaniyan (2017:7) note, and all possible means, including violence, calumny, conspiracies, media war had been used in the past to break the Northern hegemony, including the disagreements/deadlocks at the various constitutional conferences, such as the 1950 Ibadan Conference during which the Northern Region insisted on having larger representation in the central legislature, which the South reluctantly agreed to; the attempts to merge Ilorin/Kabba with the Western Region during the First Republic; resistance to quota system; the experience of the January, 1966 Coup, among others, in a struggle/rivalry over political hegemony (Mohammed, Aisha & Saidu, 2018; Mohammed & Aisha, 2018; Mohammed, 2018).

Nigeria’s unity amidst numerous socio-historic, ethno-religious and geo-political complications, backgrounds and interests form the bedrock and the most critical element that must be traded with both keen interest and caution for the restructuring to hold and achieve any meaningful ends.

13. Imbalances, Mutual Fears of Domination and Marginalisation

A critical issue that must be addressed by the restructuring are the both perceived/imagined and real imbalances, domination and marginalisation which have for long resulted in mutual suspicion and fear among Nigerians. The pre-colonial political, economic socio-cultural and religious backgrounds and experiences of the North and West on one hand, and the East on the other; the arrival of the colonialists through the Atlantic Ocean located from the South; the nature and character of the various ethno-religious and geo-political nationalities welded in the January, 1914; the involuntary amalgamation itself; the pattern of colonial domination and rule - direct and direct; the nature and character of colonial socio-economic development; the embedded pattern of educational inequalities between North and South, which persist till today; the primacy of the North in terms of geography and population; and the perceived, feared and resented Northern hegemony in Nigerian politics are all unavoidable variables that resulted in the imbalances of the Nigerian state and culminating to the issues of domination and marginalisation with mutual fears and suspicion among the component parts of the Nigerian federation. These have occupied the political thought and atmosphere of all the regions and discourse of Nigeria (Farayibi 2017), irrespective of whether advantaged or disadvantaged in one aspect or the other.
Additionally, these have further resulted in not only rivalry and competition, but also attempts to subvert justice, power and resources for self-favour. These factors contribute to what Morgenthau (1973) submit that “Any segment of the population which feels itself permanently deprived of its right and full participation in the life of the nation will tend to have lower morale, to be less ‘patriotic’ than those who do not suffer from such disabilities”. It is obvious that there are imbalances, marginalisation and domination, but the controversial questions are ‘who dominates who, what and how?’, ‘who marginalises who?’ and ‘where?’ These questions are prompted by the fact that all the ethnic, religious, geo-political, regional and majority/minority groups are marginalised/dominated by others in one way or the others, but the degree of the domination and marginalisation varies from one area, perspective to the other. In addition to that, the cry for fear, domination and marginalisation where there is none has become a means used by Nigerians to attract attention, sympathy and or justify their demands/actions/reactions (Itumo, 2017). To that effect, the minority groups always treat the three majority groups with fear, resentment, dissatisfaction and suspicion, believing that they (the majority) have dominated everything. Likewise, the majority groups (Hausa/Fulani, Igbo and Yoruba) treat one another with suspicion, fear and contempt, believing that each has dominated the others. The fear, domination and marginalisation hold, therefore, on two fronts of majority/minority, and the majority/majority. These have resulted in allegations, counter allegations, accusations, manipulation of figures and facts, fallacies overtaking facts, as well as campaign of calumny over the media and other avenues such as ethnicity and religion, among others. In such a fallacious submission, which also proves the character. This acc

This is a manifestation of the extent to which the various parts of the Nigerian entity view and treat one another in respect of issues of unity, marginalisation, domination and suspicions, apart from other moves latently made to outwit one another such as breaking the hegemonies, reconfiguring geo-political compositions, and or exploiting the weaknesses of one another in the federation and in the elites’ struggle for access and control of political power and resources, such as the Ilorin/Kabba West Merger, the 1962/63 and 1974 Census Crisis (Mohammed, 2018; Mohammed & Aisha, 2018, Mohammed, Aisha & Saidu, 2018).

At the earlier stages of Nigeria’s federalism and nationhood, the various regional governments of the First Republic had respectively embarked on both latent and manifest programmes and policies to ensure full representation of their regions in the federation and avoid internal domination of their respective intra-regional affairs (Ojo, 2016; Abdulkadir, 2004). In the Northern region, for example, the Regional Premier, Sir Ahmadu Bello embarked on the ‘Northernisation Policy’, which not only ensured that Nigerians from the other regions, especially the East Igbos were checked in the prior domination of the Northern Public Service and commercial/industrial activities, and a quick, catch up and crash programmes to train the Northerners through both short and long term courses, trainings and up-grading in order to check the excessive domination of the northern public and economic affairs by the non-northerners and also ensure fair share and representation of the Northern Region at the central level of the federation (Paden, 1986; Clark, 1991; Mohammed, 2018). However, despite the fact that decades have gone since the enactment of that policy, there are still loopholes in the balance of appointments, distribution of resources and dominance of one tribe, section, region or state in the public service and other spheres of the Nigerian state. For example, by 2003, Northern Nigeria, which had more states, local governments and larger population has only about 10 percent of the total number of engineers in Nigeria, 8 percent of the Nigerian banks executives; 15 percent of the total number of Professors; less than 2 percent of insurance practitioners; about 25 percent of Nigerian lawyer/legal practitioners (Adamu as cited in Oyadiran & Toyin, 2015).

Despite the afterwards developments, and with the inception Federal Character Principle, there still exist imbalances which are more and relatively tilted towards one region against the others in different perspectives (Oyadiran & Toyin, 2015; Adamolekun, Erero & Oshionebo, 1991; New Nigerian, January 12, 1999, pp. 13; Weekly Trust, January 19, 1999, p. 12). There are similarly, other areas where the imbalance/character reflects disadvantaged positions to other sides/regions of Nigeria, and each of the geo-political, ethno-religious parts of the country is dis-advantaged and or marginalised in one way or the other, depending on location, type of public service provided, top leadership of the establishment in question and precedence of its pioneer/preceding leadership character. This accentuates the vulnerabilities in the unity and federal arrangement of the Nigerian state and when
any group/part making up the federation feels marginalised or neglected, its commitment to the union and loyalty to the state are eroded (Adongor, 2017).

The issue of domination in the Nigerian federalism is also enveloped in the control of the central government and the question of who represents the units/tiers/ethnic groups, the modes of representation and the fear of the three dominant ethnic groups by the majority as well as the mutual fear among the three majority groups over the control of the centre, which is strategic to all the units and ethnic groups (Amah, 2017; Ojo, 2016). Many other components of the Nigerian federation, especially from the Northern part/non-oil producing areas, which have over the years defied and resisted the calls/agitations for the restructuring, fear (though mainly off the reality and ignorance political and economic realities and unexplored potentialities of the Nigerian state) the uncertain consequences of the restructuring if held. This fear largely revolves around the question of revenue allocation and how to survive in the restructured Nigeria in the event of adoption of fiscal federalism with autonomy of the lower components of government on resource control.

With the growing fear of both domination and marginalisation, ethno-religious struggles set in, especially in the Middle Belt/Central Nigeria, where religion is used as both the rallying point and instrument of resistance to perceived domination and marginalisation by the Northern minorities, who are largely non-Muslims and the majority Hausa/Fulani/Muslims ethnic group in Northern Nigeria. So also among the Southern minorities, especially the South East, there has for long been the fear and resistance against domination and marginalisation in the Igbo majority region, which became more manifest (with dissent and resentment) during the Nigerian civil war (Taribo, 2014; Osaghae, 1998). That struggle, however, does not involve religion because the South East is largely homogeneous in terms of with Christianity as the most prominent.

14. Resource Control/Revenue Allocation

It has been maintained by Alhaji Abubakar Rimi, the former and first elected civilian Governor of Kano State 1979-1983 (cited in Onu, 1981) that revenue allocation remains a very sensitive and controversial issue, especially in semi-autonomous states with developing economies like Nigeria with both multi-party democracy and different levels of government – the federal, states and the local. The larger portion of the clamour, calls, agitations, and controversy over restructuring in Nigeria centre on resource control and allocation. The assertion by Henry (2007:354) clearly reflects this situation and that the age-long political-economy questions of authoritative allocation of values - who gets what, when and how are more pronounced in the process of revenue allocation between and among components of a government, which is called fiscal federalism, i.e., granting funds by one government to the others for the purpose of attaining some specific policy goals. He further maintains that the keystone of fiscal federalism is “the transfer of funds from one government to one or more other governments in a federation”. Hence, the theorists and proponents of fiscal federalism maintain that grants in aid from the central government may be needed in order to supplement the local spending for the national purposes, provision of minimum, uniform services and compensate the citizens in the other areas whose spending/services are beneficial to citizens from the other parts of the federation such as water supply, education and health care (Shafritz, Russel, & Borick, 2007:160).

In line with that, the resource allocation/revenue sharing formula in Nigeria currently favours the federal/central government (Adedeji & Ezebasili, 2018). Foundational to this, Dudley (1982:167) and Elaigwu (1998:6) have also noted and lamented how powers are much concentrated in the federal government (exclusive powers). As a result, the current sharing formula for revenue in the federation which gives 52.68%, 26.72% and 20.60% for the federal (central), states and local governments respectively, is decried as largely skewed to and driven to the centre, as the Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria, 1999, conferring the Exclusive Powers on the Federal Government with 68 items, including resource control, exploitation and harnessing (Second Schedule [Part I] of Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria, 1999).

Resource control/allocation is therefore, is a critical issue in every meaningful restructuring of Nigeria for it forms the bedrock of and determines the regional, inter-governmental, political and socio-societal settings and relations among the component parts, the citizenry and elites.

15. A Feasible System of Government

The systems of government operated by the African states are largely impositions/imports, hence suffer from both misconception and poor operation in the African states systems (Ejiofor, 1981:3-5). Ever since the amalgamation of
Nigerian state by the British colonial masters in 1914, the search for an acceptable system of government has been on and remained one of the major challenges to the unity, prosperity and development of the Nigerian state. As a result, Nigeria has tried and undergone both the prominent presidential and parliamentary systems, but still remains afflicted by both (Ajulu, 1991:11). Both systems are not devoid of their problems as Hargrove (in Kane, Patapan and Hart 2009:13) assert that both the systems swim against the tides of the dynamics of democracy, but the democracy itself flourishes with time. In Nigeria, the main fear and dilemma that surround the adoption of presidential system is that despite the fact that is easy to form government with stability of tenure, irrespective majority/minority party, it is, however, too expensive and prone to dictatorship, loose party structure and discipline (Shagari, 2001:199, 248, 296; Mohammed, et al., 2018:282-285; Olakunle, 2004:6-7). Specifically, the presidential system is prone to emergence of what Vile (1974:134) calls ‘imperial president’ although “the exact limit of what the president can do and cannot do, depend upon the circumstances, upon his character, and upon the precise combination of the complementary and off-setting sources of power that face him in a specific situation.” This is typical of Nigeria where the president combines the three offices of Head of State, Head of Government and Commander in Chief of the Armed Forces of the Federal Republic of Nigeria (Section 135 of the 1999 Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria).

On the other hand, the parliamentary system, earlier practiced by Nigeria in the late 1950’s to mid-1960s is generally less fractious, enables effective and efficient governance, more cost-effective with enactment and flow of policies and information, with strict party/government/opposition structure and discipline, and less dictatorial, constants checks on government and policies by the parliament and the opposition. However, on the other aspect, the government can easily collapse/be voted out (vote of no confidence), there may be delays in formation of government, especially where there is no absolute majority party, and distractions from the official opposition, among others (Malemi, 2010:35-37). Each of the imported systems therefore, has its two faces of advantages and dis-advantages for Nigeria, and pose a dilemma of adoption/adaptation. Nigeria is caught between the two options on one hand and the option provided by Ejiofor (1981:4) of a focused and an internal search with respect to the indigenous socio-political attitudes of Nigerians in order to arrive at a realistic system that would fit into the Nigerian realities and peculiarities, especially that both the presidential and parliamentary have been tested. The dilemma centres on which of the two systems to adopt/adapt upon restructuring or what alternatives, including an indigenous, but generally accepted system to the heterogeneous Nigerian set up.

16. Issues of Secularism, Sharia Implementation and Customary Laws
Religions comprise of two related embodiments in terms of spirituality (transcendence, sacredness and ultimacy); and materially, as a mobiliser and or ginger to achieving social, political objectives. Hardly would therefore, be any religion without interest in socio-political issues in a state (Calvert & Calvert, 2001:140; Haynes, 2002:116). Nigeria is a secular state (Section 10 of the 1999 Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria), but despite this provision, there is heated controversies, competition and rivalry between Islam and Christianity, and to a lesser extent customary/traditional religions and that has characterised the Nigerian state. Similarly, the issue of Sharia is not new to Nigeria, Nigerians and others who are familiar with its development, especially in the Northern Nigeria, where it has been in practice long before the colonial conquest, domination and coming of Christianity (Ajetunmobi, 2018; Iwobi, 2004; Harnischfeger, 2008). However, for the substantial part of Nigeria’s political history, and especially from 1977 with the Murtala/Obasanjo Constituent Assembly (CA) and up to date, the Sharia issue/controversy remains not only heated and threatening, but also a source of fear and phobia, political machinations, elites manipulations and a tool for political and ethno-religious campaign by politicians from both pro and anti-Sharia perspectives, as the issue recurs (Harnischfeger, 2008; Angerbrandt, 2011; Laitin, 1982). This has further been resulting in conflicts and violence masked in religion and Sharia, but having numerous undertones – political interests, elites control, economic advantages and dis-advantages, access to state resources, corruption, among others.

In what Hassan (2015:5) tagged as “the strands of misunderstanding and outright stereotypes”, Sharia is seen by many who are ignorant of what it envisages/have its phobia or have subscribed to the anti-Sharia conspiracies and narratives, especially in the recent, as the attempt to by the Muslims, particularly the elements from the Northern Jihadist to continue the Jihadist Dan-Fodio march to Sea with the Holy Qur’an. It has therefore been most sensitive and controversial, and thus the Military in 1977-8, 1989 and 1994 constitutions making made over-rulings with ‘no go areas’, including the Sharia question (Kendhammer, 2013). To break deadlocks in past constitutions makings and in order to avoid rancour in making processes, the lingering phobia, misconception, political manipulation and conspiracies and narratives prompt the imperativeness of its extensive and intensive deliberations in any
restructuring bid for the Nigerian state. Although the Sharia at moment involves only the Muslims and adhered to only in Islamic personal laws status and between Muslim litigants, Nigerian Muslims keep agitating for its full implementation, including the Islamic criminal law aspect and establishment of Federal Sharia Courts in order to redirect the limitations of application of full Sharia judgements from states and Sharia courts of appeal, just as there are questions over its criminal aspect applications and clashes between it and the Nigerian constitution/common/English laws in terms of perspectives, content and contexts (Iwobi, 2004; Harnischfeger, 2008). On the other hand and at the same time, however, the non-Muslims, particularly the Christians have through both peaceful and violent avenues consistently resisted the sharia laws and its implementation (Turaki, 1999; Kukah, 1993; Turaki, 1991; Hassan, 2015).

Similarly, the application of Sharia, especially in heterogeneous areas (though it clearly involves only the Muslims wanting to protect their faith), is a source of concern and worthy of an in-depth consideration (Harnischfeger, 2008). The Muslims insist that the essence of Sharia is to preserve the human sanctity, property, family, faith and intellect. The non-Muslims mainly resist Sharia, believing its anti-basic human rights and inflicting inhuman and degrading treatment and punishment on humans, and that it has conferred special treatment to Nigerian Muslims vis-a-vis the others, and the ultimate attempt to dominate the Nigerian political space and marginalise the non-Muslims, and indeed negative stereotyping and false narratives (Anyia, 2017; Harnischfeger, 2008; Quraishi, 2011; Onaiyekan, 1987; Hassan, 2015). Tied to the Sharia and restructuring is the question of customary vis-a-vis the constitutional laws, especially in heterogeneous areas. The Sharia and customary laws have their significance, particularly in resolving deep Islamic/traditional contentions and issues, which the common/constitutional/English laws do not make provisions for or are not popular and sound to handle since the common/English/constitutional laws are alien to the peoples of the Nigerian state. More so, although people resort to the English laws, they (Nigerians) mostly do so where the Sharia/customary laws/traditional provisions fail to address their issues and cases at hand. There is thus a fix and that must be addressed in the restructuring bid, for religion is the most sensitive aspect of lives of the Nigerians, and is the most flashy point exploited by the elites and the political class in their struggle for power and resources, which often results in conflicts, violence and carnages for significant part of Nigeria’s history, especially from 1987 (Hassan, 2015).

17. Structure of the Nigerian State/Federation
Also a critical issue that relates to the restructuring of Nigeria is whether federal or any other arrangement which could fit into the Nigerian heterogeneities. Although Nigeria has been operating federal system since October 1954 and even before independence, and Nigerians have in respect of their heterogeneities found a relatively safe haven of being together in federalism aside the British imposition of the system, the questions of the efficacy and continuity of the system and structures of the federation have remained un-answered/un-resolved questions, including the number of levels/tiers, their powers, inter-governmental relations and effective harmony and coordination of functions/powers. All these are in respect of the ethnic tripod character on one hand, and the multitudes of the minority ethnic groups immersed in the federation (Babalola, 2015; Uzodike, Allen & Whetto, 2010; Amah, 2017; Ibiam, 2016).

18. Land Tenure System and Administration
The issue of land is paramount to every community, nation and state and it is a socio-economic and political factor that has a ‘non-negotiable necessity’, having being a central factor in the socio-political and economic spheres of both individuals and the states (Akinbola & Yassin, 2017; Eck, 2014). Nigeria has a total land area of 923,768 sq. km out of which the usage stands as: 304,843.44 for arable; 406,457.92 for pastoral; 27,713.04 for permanent crops; 110,852.16 for forest and woodlands; and 73,901.44 for other purposes (Oyetayo, Rahman, Choon, Idowu & Abidoye (2017). There is however, an un-even distribution of the land area as the Northern region has the vastest land area, and this un-evenness is one of the driving factors of legal, political, communal and inter-governmental conflicts. While the Northern region has this vastest land in addition to population and resources, in comparison the South, which has lesser population and a more compressed land, especially the South Eastern part of Nigeria. Thus, socio-economic, geo-religious and political activities are all determined and or influenced by the North-South geography, land availability and proportion disparities (Arowolo & Deng, 2018).

The issues of land tenure system, land use act, land administration, though silent in Nigerian state policies and administration, are a very critical and not only affect the economic development of the Nigerian state through agriculture and other economic activities, but also affecting and influencing the socio-cultural and political coexistence and relations among Nigerians (Lawin & Tamini 2018; Schoneveld, 2017). Issues of indigene/settler,
allocation/sales/ownership and control of land are inter-twined and all have a direct bearing with one another, including the unity and prosperity of the Nigerian state, especially with diverse political, socio-economic and other interests (Oyetayo, Rahman, Choon, Idowu & Abidoye, 2017). It has, therefore, remained a major, but a neglected challenge not only to Nigeria, but the African countries with negative effects and continue to threaten productivity, peace, stability and development (Migot-Adholla, Hazell, Blarel, & Place, 1991; Braimoh, & Onishi, 2007; Peters, 2004; Plateau, 1996). In Nigeria, for example, it has for long being affecting the peace among communities, states and states and federal government – Ife/Modakeke, Umuleri-Aguleri, Tiv/Jukun, Mwangavul/Ran, Ezillo/Ezza-Ezillo, Atyap/Hausa/Fulani, Fulani/famers, new anti-grazing laws in some states, in addition to hundreds of thousands of legal cases that have been lying in courts for long (Mohammed, 2018; Mohammed & Aisha, 2018, Alubo, 2004; Alubo, 2006; Hagher, 2002). There are not only the risks, but the increased insecurity over customary lands in the customary system, which also has bearing on improved economic status (Ghebru & Girmachew, 2017).

Land tenure system and administration, therefore, features critically in the restructuring for even if the land tenure/customary/administration system will not necessarily be the same all over Nigeria to be restructured, there has to consistent harmony so that economic and other activities and relations, in addition to agriculture and agro-allied sub-sectors could be fully exploited, harnessed, secured and guaranteed. This will for ever remain a major determinant and influencing force on peaceful co-existence and relations among Nigerians. In the recent, the controversial Anti-Grazing/Night Grazing Laws in some of the Southern and North-Central/Middle-Belt states have given a dimming light to the peace, security and stability of Nigeria, with continued resistance and clashes between farmers and Fulani/herdsmen on one hand, which is another tip on the age long Umuleri-Aguleri, Ezillo-Ezza Ezillo, Tiv/Jukun conflicts all over Nigeria (Mohammed & Aisha, 2018:27). For the restructuring agenda to achieve optimal objectives, there has to be a thorough exploration and exhaustion of issues on land tenure system with respect to the laws of Land Administration, Land Use Acts, Land Use Decrees, traditional/customary/community land system and structures. Tied to land tenure is the citizenship/indigene/settler controversy and conflict. Land ownership has become a life and death affair among the Africans and specifically Nigerians, as such expropriation of land and its allied resources are knit in indigene/settler in order to include/exclude, deny some and confer its ownership, control, allocation and reallocation on others (Itumo, 2017). This has resulted in conflicts, migrations, relocations in several parts of and across Nigeria and has been claiming thousands of lives for long (Alubo, 2004, Alubo, 2006, Hagher, 2002).

19. Establishment and Maintenance of Police Force
The issue of maintaining/establishing the federal, regional and or state/local police is also critical to the restructuring (Ogbo, Obi-Anike Happiness, Agbaeze & Ukpere, 2014). Over the years, many states, especially from the southern part of Nigeria have been clamouring for the establishment of states police machineries in the name of combating crime (Bakare, Murana, & Aliu, 2018; Chinwokwu, 2017). The federal government, however, having been vested with the powers to establish and maintain the Nigeria Police Force, has resisted such clamours for not only going against the subsisting constitutional provisions of Nigeria, but also the possibility of the states turning such to ethno-religious militias and for other particularistic interests, which would result in inter-ethnic, religious, communal, state/federal conflicts (Sections 214-216 of the 1999 Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria). The question/debate arises on whether to maintain the existing federal police force or establish states/regional/local police forces and at whose expense? Under whose control? This is prompted by the First Republic experience during which there Native Police for the regions existing alongside the Federal/Central Police Force (Mohammed, et. al., 2018; 394-395).

20. The Way forward
Having identified the critical issues in the agitated restructuring, for Nigeria to achieve a sustained unity, stability and integration, and a successful restructuring by whatever conditions, approach, time and circumstances, there have to be an extensive, intensive, focused and genuine exploration, agreement, consensus, sacrifices and compromises on the critical issues raised in this study. In addition to those, good governance at all levels; inclusiveness of all Nigerians irrespective of differences; ethnic and religious tolerance among the parts of the federation; sound socio-economic and environmental policies; determined fight against poverty and corruption, unemployment and national loyalty and patriotism; and re-allocation of the constitutional powers are indispensable to the continuity, integration and development of the Nigerian state and federalism.

21. Summary and Conclusion
All the politics in Nigeria among the elites is about the struggle to access and consolidate the hold of political power and state resources. This, however, there are also rationales behind the clamour/calls/agitations for restructuring in Nigeria, although the square/battle field of Nigerian politics is largely attended more by the poor, deprived masses, the downtrodden and dejected, the illiterate and ignorant, etc., while the real architects, masters and managers of the political and economic games and affairs are the elites who know themselves and no matter what happens between and among them, they, despite their internal fractions at certain points reach areas of collaboration, connive, reach consensus, make compromises to host, accommodate one another and further grip the political and economic powers of the Nigerian state. Meanwhile restructuring is one of their resorts to such. Restructuring would however, benefit Nigeria and Nigerians if truly the critical issues of ethnicity, religion and identity, marginalisation, resource control, revenue allocation, autonomy of regions/state, inclusiveness in decisions making, citizenship/indigeneship, establishment and roles of state/regional/central police, devolution of powers, land tenure system/use act, secularism/sharia/state religion are addressed. It is the ability/inability to fully consider and resolve these issues that would determine the validity, reliability and success or failure of the restructuring.

References


Muktar Bashir

School of International Studies, Universiti Utara Malaysia

Department of Political Science, Usmanu Danfodio University, Sokoto, P.M.B 2346. Nigeria, Email adress: muktarbashir20@gmail.com

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

This article empirically discusses the Authoritarian nature of the ruling People’s Democratic Party (PDP) on Federal Radio Corporation of Nigeria (FRCN) in Nigeria’s Fourth Republic between 1999-2015. It employed qualitative method as a means of data collection and analysis. The primary data was generated via in-depth Interviews with relevant stakeholders who were purposively selected. Secondary data was also utilized to compliment the interviews. The article is written within the purview of the Authoritarian theory of communication and it was found that FRCN between the period under study has been dominated, controlled and dictated by the ruling PDP, reporting issues unethically. The outfit was mostly dancing to the tune of the party in power (PDP). It is recommended that FRCN should not be directly controlled by the government or party in power. Also, a law should be put in place to make it discharge its responsibility of communicating vital, truthful and objective information fairly for the people to be equipped with factual information capable of bringing the needed informed decision particularly during elections.

© 2019 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

1. Introduction

No society can develop without effective communication and information sharing between and among different interest groups (Lal, 2017). In modern time, the media is saddled with the responsibility of communicating vital and truthful information to the populace to enable them make informed choices especially during elections. An informed citizenry is an asset to any competitive democracy like that of Nigeria. Therefore, the centrality of the media in transforming a democratic society to the upper level has been attested and re-attested by different scholars (Chen, Ping, & Chen, 2015; Ellison & Hardey, 2014; Kent, 2013; Mancini, 2013; Santas & Ogoshi, 2016). The Nigerian democratic journey in the current republic came into play after more than a decade of a prolonged Military rule which was authoritarian in nature. The country transited to civil rule beginning from 1999 to date. A retired general (Olusegun Obasanjo) emerged victorious after the 1998-1999 general elections as the president of the
country under the platform of Peoples Democratic Party (PDP). The party dominated the political landscape of the country till 2015 when the party lost to the opposition All Progressive Congress (APC).

There was an agreed consensus among scholars that the 1999 transitional programme that was originated, promoted and executed by the Military and their allies was a shallow one resulting to what Ihonvbere (1999:6) and others termed as “transition without change”. This can be observed by looking closely at the “visibility of the retired generals with their financial muscles in the polity as well as an authoritarian hangover resulting from the long years of military kleptocracy (Olukoyun, 2004:70). After the 1999 general elections, the military and the new President Obasanjo militarized the institutions of governance including the media such as FRCN. The media was directly force to serve the government interest. Instead, it should be allowed to perform its normative function of educating, informing and entertaining the public with truthful information fairly that is capable of informing the general public in making informed decisions particularly during elections. Scholars have written vast of literature dealing with the activities of the media during elections generally. However, there is scanty attention on the authoritarian nature of the ruling party (PDP) on the largest radio station (FRCN) in the electoral politics of Nigeria with special focus to the current fourth republic between 1999-2015. It is on this note; the article tends to fill the huge gap created in the literature which justifies the direction of the study.

2. Overview of Federal Radio Corporation of Nigeria (FRCN)

The Federal Radio Corporation of Nigeria (FRCN) came into being in 1933 by the British colonial government. It started as Radio Diffusion Service (RDS), which allowed the public to hear news and programmes emanating from British Broadcasting Corporation’s radio service at a designated location through loudspeakers (Atoyebi, 2001).

The RDS was transformed to Nigerian Broadcasting Service (NBS) with stations in Kano, Kaduna, Lagos, Ibadan and Enugu. By April 1st, 1957, an act of parliament reorganized the service into the Nigerian Broadcasting Corporation (NBC) whose mission was to provide independent and impartial services to the people of what is today referred to as Nigeria. Other stations of the NBC came into limelight in 1962 which included; stations from Onitsha, Port Harcourt and Calabar in the Eastern part of Nigeria; Katsina, Maiduguri, Sokoto, Zaria, Ilorin and Jos in the North and Ijebu-Ode, Abeukuta and Warri in the West. All these stations were serving as subsidiary to the regional station. The local or subsidiary stations broadcast programmes of local concern during the part of the day, and then connect to their regional stations for regional programmes. The national programmes were transmitted from two shortwave transmitters and one medium wave transmitter located in Segunle close to Lagos.

All the three regions (North, West & East) established their regional stations (Olukotun, 2002). The Western Region started, when Awolowo (the western regional leader) was denied access to the NBC to respond to allegation made by the colonial government of Sir. Macpherson in 1954. They established their TV and radio station collectively referred to as Western Nigerian Broadcasting Service (WNBS) in May, 1960. However, by October 1st, 1960 and 1962, the Eastern and Northern region came up with their stations respectively (Uche, 1989), as Eastern Nigeria Broadcasting Service and Broadcasting Company of Northern Nigeria (BCNN). Moreover, NBC was used by the Federal Government to actualize its mission, the same thing applies to the regional stations. They were out to serve only the regional interest. By April 1st, 1978, the NBC was directed to handover all its subsidiary stations to the Federal Government. What was left for NBC was its original stations in Lagos, Ibadan and Enugu, which were merged with BCNN to constitute the Federal Radio Corporation of Nigeria (FRCN) (Amadi & Atoyebi, 2001).

3. Methodology

The article is embedded within the interpretivist philosophical approach of research. It involves qualitative method of data collection. The data was generated through in-depth interviews with informants who were purposively selected to answer the research question. The people interviewed falls within the following categories; media practitioners; academicians; party members and members of non-governmental organization that monitored different elections in the country. These informants were given codes that represent them in the analysis. The table below summarize the information of the informants and the dates they were interviewed.
Table 1.1 Information of informants, categories and the date interviewed

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Informants Code</th>
<th>Date interviewed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Media Practitioners A</td>
<td>A1</td>
<td>20th May, 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A2</td>
<td>4th Sept, 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>B1</td>
<td>17th July, 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B2</td>
<td>8th Aug, 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pol. Party Members C</td>
<td>C1</td>
<td>5th June, 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C2</td>
<td>5th June, 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academicians</td>
<td>D1</td>
<td>7th July, 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D2</td>
<td>5th Aug, 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D3</td>
<td>5th Aug, 2017</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. Justification for the selection of the Informants

They were selected considering their position and the vital knowledge they possess in relation to the subject matter (Seawnght & Gerring, 2008). However, qualitative method of data analysis was used to present and analysed the data based on the objective of the paper. The analysis was used through Nvivo 11 software. The software is a qualitative one that assist researchers to systematically arrange and manage data. Its usage is necessary as captured by Richards (2015); Silver and Lewins, (2014) when they stated that it is fair to say that the researcher who does not use software beyond a word processor will be hampered in comparison with those who do. This showcases the fact that using computer aided software in qualitative study adds value to the researcher as he/she gain more skills compared to others.

5. Authoritarian theory of Communication

The theory is one of the four normative theories of communication that was recognized by Siebert, Petterson and Shramm (1956). It originated in the 16th Century England, when monarchs used this approach to dictate the affairs of their locality. Kunczick, (1988:3) provides that “recognition of the truth was entrusted in the hands of the few elites able to exercise power in a top-down approach”. Therefore, whether the ownership of the media is publicly or privately handled, the authoritarian media must in this respect uphold what the authorities want at all times (McDermott, Fowler, & Smirnov, 2008). For them, the authorities exist to serve the interest of all and as such cannot be criticized under any circumstances (Barker-Plummer, 1995). The media outfits are under the absolute control of the leaders and there is no freedom of the press, no matter the democratic system in place. Censorship is always resorted to protect and boost government image. The people under this theory cannot ask questions, nor can they question the activities of the government, all that is required from them is complete obedience to the government. The theory has been criticized as antithetical to not only electoral process but democracy as a whole (Stevens, Bishin, & Barr, 2006). However, despite the criticisms, it is still relevant in explaining the authoritarian nature of the ruling PDP on FRCN between the period under study. The party dominated the political scene of the country from 1999 to 2015. Therefore, during this period, PDP dominated all the machineries of governance including the media to dance to its tune against the larger interest. This was not unconnected with the fact that, the media outlet (FRCN) was directly under government control, its finance and employees are all product of the government. Therefore, they must serve the interest of the government or party in power or face charges where and when necessary as would be seen in the next section of the paper.

6. Result and Discussion of findings

The figure below showcases the categories of informants that talked on the Authoritarian nature of the ruling party (PDP) on FRCN between the period under study.
Democracy is not only about election, it is a work in progress, it does not start and end with elections. Rather, it entails citizens’ collective participation in debate concerning their destiny. In addition, citizens must have access to adequate information about the political parties, manifestoes, prospective candidates willing to contest elections as well as information about the electoral processes generally for the people to make informed decisions particularly during elections. Federal Radio Corporation of Nigeria (FRCN) being the dominant radio station in the country (Kur & Endwell, 2015) is saddled with the responsibility of communicating vital and truthful information for the Nigerian people to actualize the democratic purpose without fair or favour. However, such normative role of the outfit has been compromised by vested interest to the detriment of the larger interests in the polity. An informant disclosed that “FRCN is a government owned media house, so you should understand that there are limitations. The attention of FRCN will basically be on the ruling party against that of the opposition parties” (Interview with B1 on the 17th July, 2017). Lending credence to the above is the fact FRCN and other state-owned radio stations failed to provide equal access and fair coverage to the various competing parties during the 1999 and 2003 general elections (European Union Election Observer Mission EU EOM, 2003). The report further narrates that there was strong bias in the coverage of FRCN to the advantage of the ruling PDP at the federal and other states in the country. However, the bias nature was not unconnected to the following; financial instability of the media, low purchasing power of the population, illiteracy, media reliance on sponsorship for survival, a media culture of deference to the party in power, problems of professional development and the weakness of both government-and self-regulation” (European Union Election Observer Mission, 2003). The media were unable to overcome these challenges and provide adequate coverage of the general elections.

FRCN have the obligation of providing impartial and unbiased information to the electorate, because they are owned publicly as well as their ability to cover widely than any of its kind to relate and reach larger number of people in the country. For example, the outcome of the 2003 election was characterized by all sorts of irregularities and minimum standards of democratic elections were not met. The elections at different levels of governance was challenged in the court of law against the ruling party (EU EOM, 2003).

Moreover, the activities of FRCN during the coverage of 2007 general election was not different from that of the 2003 exercise. An informant added that the scenario of the 2007 election coverage by FRCN have been considered as worse than the previous coverage. The period was characterized by over ambitious of PDP leadership to hold onto power by all means (Interview with D3 on 5th August, 2017). It was observed that President Obasanjo of the ruling PDP monopolized all agencies of government including the media (FRCN) to serve his interest. He was quoted to have said “winning 2007 elections for me and my party (PDP) is a do or die affair” (Bratton, 2008). This attested to the authoritarian nature of the media outfit by the ruling PDP to the detriment of the opposition parties in particular and the general public in general. This was against the provision of the Electoral Act 2006 as amended under section 102 (1) which provides that “a government owned print or electronic medium shall give equal access on daily basis to all registered political parties and candidates’ of such parties”. Section 103 (2) added that the state apparatus including the media shall not be employed to the advantage or disadvantage of any political party or
candidate at any election. On the overall, the outcome of the media coverage on one hand and the conduct of the elections on the other hand were characterized by all sorts of irregularities and bias against the opposition parties (Interview with D2 on the 7th July, 2017). The election was considered as the worst ever conducted in the history of election monitoring across the globe (EU EOM, 2007). The outcome of the election was challenged in the court of law at different levels of governance in the country.

The media outfits (FRCN) prior to the 2007 general elections venture into voter education which was minimal and largely urban focused (EU EOM, 2007). Instead the outfit was expected to dwell much of its political coverage in penetrating all the nooks and crannies of the country which could result to massive voter education and participation in the electoral process. The tensed political atmosphere prior to the election prompted serious comments from United State of America (USA) and United Kingdom (UK) government in relation to the activities of the media in particular and general conduct of the elections in general.

In USA, Army Lieutenant General Micheal D. Maples, Director for Defense Intelligence Agency stated before the US congress that the potential for violence in Nigeria 2007 elections remain high as candidates from the predominantly Muslim North and Christian South compete for office. British on its own side express concern over the issue of press freedom in Nigeria citing the killing of a well-known Lagos journalist and detention of several others in Abuja (EU EOM, 2007). These were so much pronounced against those media outfits and practitioners that goes against the ruling PDP in most cases. Although, the monopolistic nature of the ruling party (PDP) on media outlets in the Nigerian politics was not unconnected with the power bestowed on the media in any democratic settings. In view of this, it is argued that:

Most political parties, who are in the habit of using the media for whatever reason, do so with the intention of retaining public support to maintain and advance their political career, because they are aware that most citizens usually gravitate toward the direction of the media position on public issues. The Nigerian journalists should endeavor to provide sufficient and balanced information on the personality profiles of political aspirants so that the public would be conversant with the history of each of the candidates concerned while deciding on the candidates to votes into public office or parliament. The public often rely on the media for information on the ideologies and manifestoes of political parties, as well as on the competence of the candidates contesting for the elections (Obboh, 2016: 76).

The above showcases the pivotal role of the media practitioners as the custodian of the truth and as such they should in no circumstances be allowed to serve a particular interest against that of the majority.

In 2011, EU EOM observes that there were frequent abuse and misuse of public resources including the media in support of the ruling party (PDP) in the country. For example, during the election period, the ruling party at the federal and state levels merged their official assignments with campaign activities. State-owned broadcast stations such as FRCN devoted a greater amount of time and space in supporting the activities of the ruling PDP (Interview with B2 on the 8th August, 2017). The Europen Union Election Observer Mission (2011) in its reports submitted that there was political reportage of campaign advertisements, praising the ruling party (PDP) at the central level and the President Jonathan before and after his visit in different states of the federation, which was allegedly sponsored and financed by the respective public resources in the various states across the country. This is adequately captured by the Authoritarian theory of communication which argues that he who controls political power monopolize other institutions of governance including the media for his own selfish end (Siebert, Peterson & Schramm, 1956). This is necessary according to the theorists that, state exist for the sake of life and it continues to exist for the sake of good life. Therefore, the leaders or party in power is always acting for the best interest of the majority, which i believe may not necessarily be the case, as personal interest of the party in power or leaders in most cases dominates the decision making process of the government against that of the general public.

This is against the provision of the regulatory body (National Broadcasting Commission), as provided for under section 5.2.19 that “A broadcaster shall avoid adulation and the tendency to glamorize persons or resort to praise singing or denial of access to those of contrary views or political leanings to such persons”(NBC, 2012: 70). Furthermore, in preparation for the 2011 general elections, there was the existence of 187 radio stations, 109 TV stations, 35 cables and 4 satellite broadcast stations cutting across the country which covered and monitored the 2011 general election (NBC, 2011). However, radio still remains the key medium of communication in the country (EU EOM, 2011). The ruling PDP was severally accused of personalizing the state resources under their control at
different levels of governance such as vehicles and security personnel to the disadvantage of the opposition parties. In addition, some observers reported incidence of restriction for opposition parties on accessing state-owned space and assets. It was added that, during the electioneering campaign of the 2011 general elections and beyond, the line between the ruling party and the state is often blurred. However, this authoritarian nature of the ruling party on all the machineries of governance led to uneven playing field for the opposition parties (EU EOM, 2011), thereby compromising the ethical nature of the media industry and serving against the legal frameworks of election coverage. Moreover, the 2011 political campaign was quite different with the most controversial election campaign of 2007 in the Nigerian politics, as in the former there was high level of respect to freedom of speech with few cases of harassment, intimidation and police questioning.

It was added that, the ruling party dictated the affairs of the radio station and institution of governance outside the purview of the legal frameworks to dance to its direction (Interview with D3 on the 5th August, 2017). The 2015 general elections equally followed suits as the media was monopolized in favor of some political parties against the others. As captured thus:

The 2015 general election was somehow fair, but FRCN was to a lesser extent bias in its participation. This is because during the electioneering campaigns, you noticed that the media house was biased. They favored the ruling PDP in airing the election campaigns. Not only that, it also engaged in propaganda and offensive campaigns against the major opposition party (APC). That was quite unfair to the affected political party (Interview with C1 on the 5th June, 2017).

An informant added that…the management staff of FRCN to be specific were employed and promoted by the ruling PDP government prior to the 2015 elections. As such advertorials or commercials of the oppositions were not accepted in the public media outlets such as FRCN, mostly because some of these adverts were against the ideology of the ruling party… (Interview with D2 on the 7th July, 2017). It was observed that “FRCN happens to be the mouthpiece of the then ruling PDP and as such people boycotted or disregard any information that comes from FRCN and listens more often to independent stations” (Interview with A2 on the 4th Sept, 2017). He further substantiated the above statement in preparation to the 2015 general elections that:

I was called upon in a meeting by the Director-General (DG) of FRCN, after I gave directives on a live political programme called ‘Hannu da Yawa’ where people called and asked questions about the state of the nation to be aired twice. At the end, the DG clearly told me that he was directed by the then Vice-President Namadi Sambo of the then ruling party (PDP) to inform me that he and the government were not happy with me by giving directives to air live program twice for people to ask questions about the state of the nation. Thereafter, the DG made it very clear that from now henceforth, I and my editors are hereby directed not to air any jingle (s) or adverts for the opposition party (APC). After the meeting, I drew the attention of the DG reminding him on the danger of such unprofessional directives but he was not listening. I clearly told him that, I cannot be part of this. I communicated same to my editors and left them to make choices on what to do and what not to do. In short there was constant interference by the ruling PDP (Interview with A2 on the 4th Sept, 2017).

In addition, the opposition party before the 2015 election (APC) said that Some private radio stations did their best in striking a balance in covering and disseminating activities of the various political parties compared to FRCN which gave more priority to the then ruling party (PDP) especially at the eleventh hour of the election (Interview with C2 on the 5th June, 2017). It was asserted that:

The private radios being independent stations skillfully and tactically reported the election effectively because they cannot openly take side as their main motive is profit making. Therefore, they need patronage from both sides ‘courtesy of commercialization’ to make money for its survival. They cannot reject adverts or jingles as what obtained under FRCN which supported the ruling party. The stations largely depend on commercials for survival and as such they attend to he who pays. They were fair in that regard to a very large extent (Interview with D1 on the 7th July, 2017).

It was further corroborated that initially, the opposition parties patronized both public and independent radio stations, but it was later realized that the public stations related more with the party in power (PDP). Therefore, the opposition parties had to utilize the services of some private radio stations which gave fair hearing and equal opportunity to all competing parties. In short, “we mostly patronized all independent media organizations that gave
fair playing ground for the opposition parties to sell their manifestoes and candidates (Interview with C1 on the 5th June, 2017).

Therefore, the regulatory body (NBC) whose function is to regulate the activities of the media was also in total control by the party in power. This is considering the view of an informant in relation to the coverage of 2015 general elections in the country thus:

Everyone has witnessed in the last 2015 election campaigns how some media outfits metamorphosed into agents of support to the then ruling PDP or the ruling government. In fact, that led the NBC to call for a meeting of the media controllers in respect of the campaign coverage of the elections and warned us (the media practitioners) against the coverage of provocative comments. I stood up and said, I think the regulatory body does not need to call us for this meeting because they are aware of the media houses that are engaged in covering inciting comments unfairly between and among the competing parties. If at all there is the need for the meeting emphasis should be referred to the media houses involved in the unprofessional act but i believe the present administration of APC will sanitize the profession (Interview with A1 on the 20th May, 2017).

However, the unfair treatment or political coverage of political parties by the broadcast media is undemocratic and unethical. It burdens to the nascent democratic dispensation of the country. Indeed, the media industry rather than being indulgent and partisan, has a lot of obstacles to take care of in the political life of the nation such as massive awareness on political apathy. As noted that unequal access of the broadcast media industry manifested where: “state institutions were widely abused for partisan ends; the incumbent group or party is systematically favored at the expense of the opposition; and the opposition’s ability to organize and compete in elections is seriously handicapped” (Fan & Pedrycz, 2017: 148). This uneven playing ground is further compounded by the power of finance, as the ruling party has more funds than the opposition groups which gave them upper hand to monopolize the media industry especially relating to commercialization. Lievrouw (2011) supported the above when he asserts that the poor and less endowed groups lack the resources and competence to engage in the intensive competition for media attention and space. An informant further disclosed that:

Most people became so much aware that not only FRCN but also other public media stations became political than otherwise expected. They were partisan and unfair to the public, the people became so disappointed in FRCN in particular, leading people to hate and disregard any information coming from FRCN especially relating to politics and election, thereby contributed immensely to the fall of the ruling party (PDP) at the central level of governance in the country (Interview with B2 on the 8th August, 2017).

Although, the media is supposed to give fair or balanced coverage to the competing groups irrespective of their political party affiliations which will no doubt equip the citizens with adequate information that will encourage them to make informed decision in the electoral politics of the country. However, supporting the course of a particular political party (mostly the ruling party) will no doubt affect the democratic system of the country on one hand and on the other hand, the citizens would be disenchanted with the workings and operations of FRCN in particular and the activities of the government in general. This will affect the citizens’ participation in bringing the needed stable and educative society.

7. Conclusions
The role of the media cannot be downplayed in any democratic settings like that of Nigeria. The media station under investigation (Federal Radio Corporation of Nigeria) between the period under investigation has been observed to be dominated and dictated by the ruling Peoples Democratic Party in the Nigerian Electoral process. This was not unconnected with the ownership control of the radio station (FRCN) by the ruling government (PDP). The party in power dictates the affairs of the media outlet to the detriment of other interest for selfish purpose. This is however antithetical to democratic dispensation. It is also concluded that, the regulatory body of the media station (National Broadcasting Commission) should be independent of the ruling party’s control to make it discharge its responsibility fairly between and among the media outlets. This will no doubt equip the populace with adequate information that will lead to informed decision by the people in supporting a particular political party in any electoral contest. Achieving these would transform the democratic system to the upper level.

References
resources limited.


Foreign Policy and Afrocentricism: An Appraisal of Nigeria’s Role

1 Muritala Dauda, 2 Mohammad Zaki Bin Ahmad, 3 Mohammad Faisol Keling

1 Ph.D Candidate, School of International Studies, College of Law, Government and International Studies (COLGIS), Universiti Utara Malaysia (UUM). The Corresponding email address: kalmurtala@gmail.com. 2 Senior Lecturer, School of International Studies, College of Law, Government and International Studies (COLGIS), Universiti Utara Malaysia (UUM).

ARTICLE DETAILS

History
Revised format: May 2019
Available Online: June 2019

Keywords
Foreign Policy, Afrocentrism, National Interest, Diplomacy, Stability

JEL Classification: L50, L52, L59, C62

ABSTRACT

Nigerian foreign policy is a tool used by the country to achieve its national interest. The country’s external policy has been tailored to be Afrocentric since its independence in 1960 which shows the commitment of Nigeria towards Africa’s stability and development. The principles of Nigeria’s foreign policy and its Afrocentricism has consistently operated by the government of the country irrespective of whether it is civilian or military administration. The notion of four concentric circle of Nigerian foreign policy where the country considers its national interest and the interest of its neighbouring States first, the West African sub-region, Africa’s interest and the interest of the world, have accrued numerous benefits to the country. The benefit of Nigeria’s Afrocentric policy has enormously assisted the country’s image internationally. This has invariably promoted Nigeria’s influence during global decision making. The study makes use of systems theory that viewed an individual or group as an ecosystem with moving parts that affect each other. Meaning that, if any part of human body is suffering from pain or any deficiency, the entire body will be feeling pain which can make the whole human body to malfunction. Likewise Nigeria, if any African country is in a crisis, all countries in Africa should look for a way-out to rescue the situation. The study therefore is qualitative in nature that employs the use of both primary and secondary data source. Twelve respondents were interviewed from various higher institutions and government agencies, and the data was analyzed thematically through Nvivo 10.

© 2019 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: kalmurtala@gmail.com


DOI: 10.26710/jbsee.v5i1.511

1. Introduction

The foreign policy of all nations indicates the national interest to be pursue by the country. Similarly, the objective of such policy is part of the determinant factors of the country’s image at the global system. Nigeria like many other countries of the world, has been purposeful on this, which yielding positively to the country. This is because both actions and reactions of Nigeria to issues concerning it, is arguably guided by its foreign policy objectives. Apart
from the issues affecting Nigeria, the country also ensure that Africa matters are adequately taken care of in its foreign policy objectives. In other word, Nigeria’s favourable policy towards Africa has given it an edge over other countries in the continent.

According to Osuntokun (2007), Nigeria’s foreign policy during the first republic was founded on “constructive Pan-Africanism” (p.1). This was pattern of Nigerian foreign policy during the first republic before it was changed from constructive Pan-Africanism to concentricism. The concentricism according to Nigerian former minister of foreign affairs, Chief Ojo Maduekwe quoted in Ashaver (2014) as “citizen foreign policy” (p.2). The concentric notion of Nigeria’s foreign policy was formulated by Gambari where he observed the tensions and dynamics that has characterized the Nigeria’s external policy which has resulted to a reduction in Nigeria’s revenue on oil internationally (Ashaver, 2014). Gambari observed that reduction on Nigeria’s oil revenues have exposed the country into some economy difficulties in the countries relations with West Europe and the United States. For that reason, he argued that Nigeria’s foreign policy should be centred on four concentric circle. Meaning that, Nigeria shall consider its interest first, the interest of West African sub-region as second, the interest of Africa as its third priority and lastly, the interest of the entire world (Gambari, 1989; 2017).

As a result of this changes in Nigeria’s external revenue on oil, Gambari came up with a notion called a concentric circle designed for the country’s foreign policy to survive (Gambari, 1989; Amuwo, 2016). Hence, the survival of Nigeria’s foreign policy through its concentric circle have made it visible for the country to contribute immensely to the African development, and in particular the stability needs in the African continent. The role of Nigeria in Africa, both at the continental and regional levels have showcase Nigeria’s potential and commitment/passion for African unity, development, and stability.

Thus, this study seeks to appraise Nigeria’s role in African continent through its afrocentric foreign policy to ensure unity and stability in the continent. In other word, Nigeria’s favourable external policy to Africa continent, has exposed the country into series of commitment and responsibility that should be fulfilled in order to achieve the goals and objectives set to be realized by the African Union as a continental organization. Although, this responsible on Nigeria through its Afrocentric foreign policy requires series of sacrifices from the country such as manpower/personnel and monetary/material resources which are to be provided in order to carry out the development and stability tasks in Africa. It is against this backdrop the study is appraising Nigeria’s role in Africa through its foreign policy tailored to promote peace, stability and development in the continent.

2. Statement of Problems
As described by Northedge (1968), a country foreign policy is “interplay between the outside and inside” (p. 15). This arguably shows that foreign policy of a country is one of the determinant factors for countries to relate with one another. The foreign policy of Nigeria has influenced the action and decision of the country on the issues in African continent. This has also made Nigeria a reckoning point for any meaningful development in Africa. Hence, this has canvassed for a number of studies on Nigeria’s foreign policy such as Inamete (2001), Osuntokun (2007), Ashaver (2014) and Gambari (2017) where the study focused on how Nigeria’s foreign policy has influenced the country in terms of decision making process. Similarly, studies like Fayome, Chidozie and Yartey-Ajayi (2015), Abduralrasheed, Muda and Ahmad (2016) viewed Nigeria’s foreign policy on the perspective of leadership personality that is ruling the country. Also, Cilliers, Schunemann, and Moyer (2015), Ogunnubi and Isike (2015), Ogunnubi and Okeke-Uzodike (2016), and Ogunnubi (2017) concentrated their search towards whether Nigeria deserves to be addressed as hegemon through its designated role by its foreign policy on African matters.

However, it was discovered from the literature that limited studies appraised Nigeria’s action and decision in Africa which its foreign policy mandate on the country as part of its responsibility in the African continent. Irrespective of the system of government/administration Nigeria is operating (either military or civil rule), the principle and notion of its concentric external policy remain the same. As a result of this therefore, the study appraises Nigeria’s role in Africa through its foreign policy tailored to promote peace, stability and development in the continent.

3. Methodology
The study adopts a systematic review of literature focuses on foreign policy, diplomacy and national interest with emphasis on Nigeria. The study is a qualitative type that utilize both primary and secondary data sources. The primary sources of data involve the views of experts gathered through interview granted to professionals in the field of international relations. Similarly, the literature on Nigeria’s foreign policy settings reported in journal articles,
Furthermore, the study makes use of systems theory to appraise the Nigeria’s role through its foreign policy structured to promote stability and development in Africa. Similarly, the theory is used to analyze perhaps the reason and benefit of the Afrocentric foreign policy of Nigeria to the country and to the entire Africa at large. Systems theory is also known as the systems science. It is originated from biological sciences by its founders Bertalanffy Ludwing and Maturana Humberto (Boulding, 1956; von Bertalanffy, Ludwig, 1974). It was later employed by many disciplines to investigate phenomena from a holistic perspective. Scholars who subscribe to systemic perspective of analyzing events, believe that it is impossible to understand an event or issue by breaking it into small components. Rather, they assumed that global assessment is require to understand phenomenon. The scholars viewed an individual or group as “an ecosystem with moving parts that affect each other” (Adams, Hester & Bradley, 2013). The theory is featured in a group of parts that interact to form a coherent whole. It is also described as having a “distinct boundary separating the system from external elements and distinguishing between inputs, or factors that impact the system, and outputs, or effect and products of the system” (Mele, Pels & Polese, 2010, p.130).

The systems theory is emphasizing on the connectivity of every part of the system with one another. Meaning that, if any part of human body is suffering from pain or any deficiency, the entire body will be feeling such pain which arguably can make the whole human body to malfunction. Therefore, the theory is relevant to the study due to the fact that, the foreign policy of Nigeria is designed is such a way that the country will be concerned with happening within Africa. This is because, it maybe irrational for Nigeria not to show concern over any problem/difficulty that maybe encountered by any African countries, particularly the neighbouring States (Ashaver, 2014; Dauda, Sakariyau & Ameen, 2018). Apart from being irrational if Nigeria turn a blind eye to the problems facing by other African countries, the aftermath of such problems on Nigeria will be greater than the cost to be incurred if the country in crisis is rescue on time (Wapmuk, 2014). Hence, another relevance of systems theory to the study is that it serves as a protective signal to Nigeria. This is because, the theory assists Nigeria on the needs to maximize its favour or benefit to other African countries which at the same protecting the country from sharing or inheriting products of such crises (like refugees, insurgency, terrorism, and other social vices) from other country.

4. Conceptual Clarifications

4.1 Foreign Policy

Foreign Policy: As argued by Enuka and Odife (2009) foreign policy is shaped by two determinants, (the foreign and the domestic). This influenced Adeniji (2000) to stressed that “the external factor i.e. the nature of the international system in which nations operate, primarily determines the foreign policy of especially the developing countries” (p.34). He expressed further that, “this is a reality to which African countries have to adjust” (p.34). Another scholar, Tyoden, (1989) posited that socio-political domestic milieu is a crucial determinant of foreign policy. This indicates that aside from the impel of foreign policy machinery, there are other domestic factors that are significance to be considered in the formulation of foreign policy. These include the organization and government’s nature, political institutions and ideal practice of socio-political customs of the society (Enuka & Odife, 2009).

The term foreign policy is a strategy which was designed institutionally for the decision makers to guide their actions within the international environment in order to achieve the country’s national objectives (Ota & Ecoma, 2015). It can also be described as an actions and reactions of a Nation to event in the international environment and internal circumstances towards the policy is formulated. This is argued by Ota and Ecoma (2015) that “a State in the international system can either precipitate an event in the external environment to which other actors would react or react to events precipitated by other state or non-state actors” (p.57). Franknel (1975) equally opined that county’s foreign policy encompasses its general commitments and attitudes toward the international environment, and country’s strategy to realize both the internal and external aspirations and objectives.

As entrenched in the 1999 Constitution of Nigeria under Chapter 2, Section 19(a-e) which stated the fundamental objectives and principles of Nigeria’s foreign policy as follows: (a) promotion and protection of the national interest; (b) promotion of African integration and support for African unity; (c) promotion of international cooperation for the consolidation of universal peace and mutual respect among all nations, and elimination of discrimination in all its manifestations; (d) respect for international law and treaty obligations as well as the seeking
of settlement of international disputes by negotiation, mediation, conciliation, arbitration and adjudication; and (e) promotion of a just world order (1999 Constitution of the Federal Government of Nigeria; Salisu, 2013, p. 171; Akindele, 2013, p.13). These objectives of Nigeria’s foreign policy mentioned have been followed consistently by the country towards its action and reaction in the African continent (Gambir, 1986; Ogwu, 1986; Akinremi, 1989; Akindele, 1990; Salisu, 1999; Ayam, 2010). Also, supported the claim is Akinboye (2013) who argued that:

It is very clear that there is continuity across regimes in spite of changes in the pursuit of national interest. There is constancy in Nigeria’s foreign policy objectives and foreign relations from the civilian regime of Prime Minister Abubakar Tafawa Balewa to President Goodluck Jonathan (p.13).

Beyond that, it is arguable that the present administration in Nigeria under President Muhammadu Buhari is adopting similar objectives toward the country’s relationship with the international community.

4.2 Diplomacy

Diplomacy: The term diplomacy has been viewed differently by many scholars. Satow (1966) described diplomacy as “the application of intelligence and tact to the conduct of official relations between the governments of independent states” (p.1). However, the view of Satow on diplomacy was faulted on the basis that not all diplomats are intelligent or skillful, but they participated either in one way or the other in the diplomatic process (Ogunsanwo, 2007). McDermott (1973) viewed diplomacy as “a science which permits its practitioners to say nothing and shelter behind mysterious nods of the head…, a science who’s most successful exponent is he who can swim with his head above streams of events he pretends to conduct” (p.37). Morgenthau equally asserts diplomacy as “the technique for accommodating conflicts of interest, and the promotion of national interest by peaceful means” (1978, p.529).

Plischke (1977) capped it all by defining diplomacy as “the political process whereby States establish and nurture official interrelations, direct and indirect, to pursue their respective goals, interest and substantive and procedural policies in the international environment” (p.41). Similarly, Ota and Ecoma (2015), described it as a system of negotiation and communication between State and other actors who are non-state, and ready to engage in the international relations through cooperation to provide remedy to contentious issues rather than engaging in war.

4.3 National Interest

National Interest: The term is mostly used to prescribed and at the same time described foreign policy (Nye Jr, 1999). According to Huntington (1997), “without a sure sense of national identity, Americans have become unable to define their national interests, and as a result subnational commercial interests and transnational and nonnational ethnic interests have come to dominate foreign policy” (p.29). Similarly, the Commission on America’s National Interests have put it straight in 1996 when it declared that, “national interests are the fundamental building blocks in any discussion of foreign policy…. In fact, the concept is used regularly and widely by administration officials, members of Congress, and citizens at large” (Nye Jr, 1999, p.23).

Under a democratic system of government, a country’s national interest can be arguably described as a set of priorities that guides the relationship of a country with the rest of the world. Ota and Ecoma (2015) equally argued that country’s foreign policy is one of the determinants that shape the principle of national interest. He stressed further that national interest encompasses some “values and ideals which a nation so cherishes that she would rather go to war than compromise” (p.57). Foreign policy defends national interest through diplomacy, but when diplomacy fails, the former can be defended through war and the force of arms. Other component of national interest includes, sovereignty, territorial integrity, political culture, citizens’ welfare among others.

5. Historical Background of Nigerian Foreign Policy and Africa’s Centrepiece Policy

The foreign policy of Nigeria has its origin dated back to its independence in 1960. The objectives and principles of Nigeria’s foreign policy was articulated and elaborated by the country’s Prime Minister, Alhaji (Sir) Abubakar Tafawa Balewa in his address at the United Nations General Assembly to mark Nigeria’s admission as 99th member of the organization on 8th October, 1960 (Ota & Ecoma, 2015). Similarly, Jaja Wachukwu’s appointment as Nigeria’s First Minister of Foreign Affairs and Commons (the ministry was later named as External Affairs), affirmed Africa as the country’s focus of foreign policy. The fundamental principles of Nigeria’s foreign policy were later affirmed and made clear by Jaja Wachukwu on 4th September, 1961 at the Federal House of Representatives. These principles includes: (a) to promote national interest and world peace; (b) to have Africa as the centre-piece of Nigerian foreign policy, with a view to achieving cooperation and progress among African
States, and achieving total independence in all African states; (c) to promote international friendship, cooperation and neutrality; (d) to respect the sovereign equality of all states, irrespective of size, and to honour the principle of non-interference in other countries’ internal affairs (Ota & Ecoma, 2015, p.56).

As argued by Gambari (1989), Agbu, Okereke, Wapmuk and Adeniyi (2013), Nigeria’s foreign policy since independence has undergone series of changes with exception to its principles which remain the same. The reason for changes in Nigeria’s foreign policy was as a result of change of country’s leadership or head. Despite the changes in the leadership of Nigeria, the country ensure that its foreign policy is Afrocentric which focusing more on political cooperation, economic development, amicable settlement of crisis within Africa (Folarin, 2013; Oni & Taiwo, 2016). The personality interest and influence of leaders in Nigeria (either military or civilian rule) determines which country/countries outside Africa to relate with, which invariably shape its foreign policy directions (Ajayi, Njoaguani, Olorunyomi & Folarin, 2015).

The personality and interest of a leader in a country play a crucial role in the determinants of foreign policy objective (Levy, 2013). Scholars like Gambari (1989, p.2; 2017, 12) and Adebajo (2008, p.7) argued that Nigerian leaders adopt the “notion of four concentric circles of national interest”. The first circle is described as the innermost core which involves the security of Nigeria and its citizens’ welfare. It also covers the maintenance of spirit of good neighbourliness with States that surrounded Nigeria like Chad, Benin, Niger and Cameroon. The second interest centered on Nigeria’s relationship with West African countries located within ECOWAS sub-region. Thirdly, the interest and commitment of Nigeria to the entire African continent, while the fourth one is the country’s concern to the entire world through its membership to the organization outside Africa.

The leadership of Nigeria under Alhaji (Sir) Abubakar Tafawa Balewa as its first Prime Minister tailored the country’s foreign policy to Africa centrepiece policy. Balewa’s administration operated pro-West style of foreign policy due to Nigeria’s colonial lineage with Britain (Wogu, Sholarin & Chidozie, 2015). The Balewa’s administration was overthrown by a military government through coup on 15th January, 1966 led by General Johnson Aguiyi-Ironsi. The military government under Aguiyi-Ironsi was ousted after six months through another military coup which steered in General Yakubu Gowon as the new Head of government in Nigeria (Ajayi, Njoaguani, Olorunyomi & Folarin, 2015). Gowon’s government operated on Balewa’s pro-West foreign policy style where the government signed treaties with Britain, United States and some Western countries with exception to the Soviet Union that Nigeria’s government prevented its embassy in the country (Oni & Taiwo, 2016).

The administration under General Gowon was toppled in another coup led by General Murtala Ramat Mohammad and General Olusegun Obasanjo as his Chief of Staff in 1975. The new government introduced a new innovation into Nigeria’s foreign relations (Ogunsanwo, 1980; Ewoh, 2014). General Murtala’s administration was conscious about the imperial plans of the Western powers, especially the US. This made the administration to focused more on eradication of neo-colonialism, racism and apartheid from the continent of Africa, particularly in some Portuguese colonies (Daoud, Sakariyau & Ameen, 2018). The Nigeria’s commitment towards the eradication of racism by Murtala’s administration was demonstration in his speech at the OAU extra-ordinary meeting that took place in Addis Ababa on 11th January, 1976 where he stressed that:

Mr. Chairman, when I contemplate the evils of apartheid, my heart bleeds and I am sure the heart of every true blooded African bleeds….Rather than join hands with the forces fighting for self-determination and against racism and apartheid, the United States policy makers clearly decided that it was in the best interests of their country to maintain white supremacy and minority regimes in Africa (Leadership Newspaper, 2016).

The foreign policy style operated under Murtala’s government elevated Nigeria to serve as a regional power and at the same time project the country to be more important in Africa (Dickson & Ezirim, 2017). Despite the fact that General Murtala was assassinated by Lieutenant Colonel Buka Suka Dimka in an unsuccessful coup which took place on 13th February, 1976, his Chief of Staff, General Obasanjo assumed the position of Head of State of Nigeria (Folarin, 2013).

The administration of General Obasanjo conducted an election which emerged Alhaji Shehu Shagari as Nigeria new elected president in 1979 (Nkem-Onyekpe, 2015). The administration of President Shagari upheld the existing Nigerian foreign policy principles. However, there was another coup which was led by Generals Muhammadu Buhari and Tunde Idiagbon. The military took over power from Shagari administration on 31st December, 1983.
with their agenda of promoting the image of Nigeria and its relations with other countries. Similarly, another military coup led by General Ibrahim Badamosi Babangida ousted Generals Buhari/Idiagbon’s administration. The administration of General Babangida was described by Olowu (2017) to have canvassed for some setbacks in Nigerian foreign policy.

The administration of General Babangida introduced policies like Structural Adjustment Programme (SAP) that are not healthy for Nigeria’s economy. The administration conducted an election in 1993 which was worldly considered to be free, fair and credible, but the result of the election was annulled by General Babangida regime which resulted to mass protests and demonstration by Nigerians both at home and abroad (Adegoju, 2014). The regime later handed over power to Chief Ernest Shonekan as an interim government on 26th August, 1993. The interim administration was overthrown by another military government led by General Sani Abacha (Yunusa, 2016). The administration of Abacha arguably contributed to the deteriorating image of Nigeria to extent of its pronounced corruption rate.

Nevertheless, the sudden death of General Abacha on 8th June, 1998 paved way for the assumption of power by General Abdulsalam Abubakar. The General conducted general election that produced Chief Olusegun Obasanjo as the Nigerian president on 29th May, 1999 (Collier & Vicente, 2014). The government under President Obasanjo embarked on numerous foreign trips to the international community with the objective of correcting the dented image of Nigeria (Durotoye, 2015). The shuttle diplomacy of Chief Obasanjo’s administration assisted Nigeria in many ways ranging from redeeming the country’s image, debts waving/cancellation, opportunity to chair some meetings of AU, ECOWAS, G-17, among others (Lanre & Olumide, 2015). This opportunity is arguable aid the Nigeria’s foreign policy principle to be exercised.

Subsequently, Chief Obasanjo’s administration was succeeded by another civilian government under Alhaji Umaru Yar’adua/Dr. Goodluck Jonathan in 2007. The administration of Dr. Goodluck Jonathan ensured its promote the good image of Nigeria to the global world before the administration was handed over power to another democratically elected government (Okeke & Aniche, 2013). Since, the year 2015 when President Muhammadu Buhari took over power, his administration has been maintaining the existing principles of Nigerian foreign policy, particularly on the need for peace and stability in the African continent and the world at large (Amuwo, 2016).

Therefore, it can be argued that the continuous exercise of Nigerian foreign policy’s principles, particularly the four concentric circles by both past and present government of the country is attesting to the notions and assumptions of systems theory. This is because, Nigeria has foreseen it that, if it fails to come into the rescue of the African countries, or the neighbouring States during their needs, it will be difficult for its national interest to be achieved. Thus, the willingness and commitment of Nigeria towards actualizing part of its foreign policy’s objective of maintaining peace and stability in the Africa is arguably canvassed for its significant role played during the transformation of the Organization of African Unity (OAU) to AU. This also canvassed for Nigeria’s role in formulation of Article 4(h) of the AU Constitutive Act which allows the organization and States to interfere in the internal affairs of other members whenever there is grave violation of human rights.

6. Benefits of Nigerian Afrocentric Foreign Policy: An Examination of its Peace and Stability Function

It can be argued that part of Nigerian foreign policy’s objectives is to ensure peace and stability within the country and the entire Africa. Similarly, for the country to be able to achieve this objective, its foreign policy is tailored to be Afrocentric. This and many other reasons have influenced Nigeria’s interest and commitment in Africa’s stability which the country has been canvassing for other African countries to emulate such (Bello, Dutse & Othman, 2017; Dauda, Ahmad & Keling, 2017). It is argued that without peace and stability in an environment, there will be no room for any development in the area. This argument was buttressed by Nelson Mandela in his speech on April, 2000 that “what happens in Africa impacts on its relations with the world. Sustainable growth and development therefore requires peace, security and stability. And they require the unity of the African continent. Peace is the greatest weapon for development” (Marshall Plan Project Group, 2017, p.3).

Therefore, there are numerous benefits that Nigeria is deriving from its Afrocentric foreign policy towards ensuring peace and stability in Africa. These benefits are as follow: (a) security benefit; (b) citizen diplomacy; (c) sovereignty protection; (d) unity and cooperation; (e) international recognition and clout. Hence, figure 1.1 below
indicates some benefits accrued to Nigeria due to its Afrocentric policy of ensuring stability in the African continent.

Figure 1.1. Nigeria’s Afrocentric Policy and its Stability Benefits

6.1 Security Benefit
Security Benefit: security factor is one of the reasons for the frequent intervention of Nigeria to ensure peace reign in the African continent. As stipulated in the Nigerian foreign policy’s principles in which its national interest could be achieved through the notion of four concentric circles propounded by Ibrahim Gambari, the country should be conscious and security-wise about the happenings around it (Achumba, Ighomereho & Akpor-Robaro, 2013; Innocent & Onyishi, 2014; Badiora, 2015). This means that, the earlier Nigeria addresses the security challenges within its environment, the better for the country and vice versa. As a result of this Nigeria is directly or indirectly protecting itself by assisting other neighboring countries to ensure stability and normalcy in their countries.

Informant NIIA1 has attested to the above function of Nigeria in ensuring stability in Africa as proclaimed by its foreign policy’s principles. He argued that “wherever the needs for security in Africa falls within the concentric circles, Nigeria’s national interest is realized. Wherever, there is peace and security, it is in Nigeria’s interest to give in its supports”. Similarly, another informant supported the above views that once Nigeria is in Africa:

A proverb says that if a neighbour house is on fire and one does not assist to keep off the fire, as time goes on, the fire will spread to one’s home. So, there is a benefit that Nigeria ultimately derived by helping to secure other countries particularly in the West Africa region, the neighbouring countries. Doing this Nigeria is enhancing its security (Informant ABU2, personal communication, September 16, 2017).

Meaning that, Nigeria is protecting itself by contributing to peace and stability of another country in Africa. As argued by Ojakorotu and Adeleke (2018), “Nigeria contributed the highest troops and fund in defraying the cost of ECOMOG deployment in Liberia, Sierra Leone, Guinea-Bissau, Cote d’Ivoire, Mali among others” (p.37). This self-commitment to stability particularly among the neighbouring countries has made the former Head of State of Nigeria, General Ibrahim Babangida during his regime to have supported the need for peace during the Liberian conflict. He argued that:

The Ecowas Region Constitutes .......... concentric circles governing Nigerian foreign policy and defence policies – there is therefore no gain saying the fact that when certain events occur in this region depending upon their intensity and magnitudes where bound to affect Nigeria’s policies – Military and socio-economic environment, we should not stand – by as a hapless and helpless spectator. We believe that if the events are such that have the potentials to threaten the stability, peace and security of the sub-region, Nigeria is duty bound to react to either avert and disaster or to take adequate measures to ensure peace, tranquility and harmony (Bassey, 2011, p.7).
Hence, the above submission can be argued that the involvement of Nigeria in maintaining stability in Africa, particularly the neighbouring countries, is to avert the spillover effect of such crisis from manifesting to the country.

As part of Nigeria’s assistance to other African countries during their time of need, Ashaver (2014) argues that “Nigeria had granted a four billion and two billion naira loans to Ghana and Sao Tome and Principe respectively” (p.9). This according to Adeniji (2000) was done by Nigeria to those beneficiaries in exchange for a goal. Adeniji stated that:

For the Ghanaian deal, it is for execution of the West African pipeline project. When completed, it would help in gas distribution from Nigeria to other countries in the sub-region, thus boosting Nigeria’s gas export. Turning to the two billion naira loan granted to Sao Tome and Principe, it is for a joint venture agreement whereby Nigeria could provide the expertise and operational workforce for the Sao Tome and Principe oil and gas venture (p.43).

Similarly, informant MFA1 stressed that “looking at the benefits that Nigeria is deriving from its stability role, one would rather say there are many benefits coming to the country”. This indicates that Nigeria tend to benefit from its stability and developmental contribution to other countries in the African continent.

Contrary to the above view, it has been suggested that Nigeria should concentrate more on its efforts or actions that will fetch reward in return for the country because some of its beneficiaries mostly pay the country with ingratitude (Dauda, Ahmad & Keling, 2017). This view is corroborated by Akinboye (2013) when he argues that:

Unfortunately and disappointingly, many of the countries that have benefitted tremendously from Nigeria’s largess often turned around to show ingratitude to both its citizens and the government itself. South Africa exhibited xenophobic attack against Nigerian citizens living in that country. Besides, the countries it has supported financially, diplomatically and strategically becomes but the butt of derision and envy by them. Some of these countries equally harbour or even offer training facilities for terrorists, while others campaign openly against Nigeria’s bid to occupy one of the permanent seats of the United Nations Security Council. From these instances, it has become clear that the age-long philosophical notion of Africa as the centre piece of the country’s foreign policy has become moribund, mundane and anachronistic (pp. 43-44).

Another informant expressed that although some countries that benefited from Nigeria payback with ingratitude, but the country should not always expect reward or benefit for its action in Africa to come in a form of visible reward. He argued that:

Nigeria has been assisted other countries with no reward. In which they are expecting tangible or visible thing in terms of reward. The benefit to Nigeria for maintaining peace, security and stability in Africa is a long term. In fact, it even assists Nigeria. This is because, if there is crisis in neighbouring countries and Nigeria failed to show concern, a part from the fact that those countries may not come to Nigeria’s aid during its need, the repercussion of the crisis such as refugees, social vices among others, will have a great influence on the country if it fails to act on time (Informant MFA1, personal communication, September 8, 2017).

The notion of not always expect reward to be in a form of tangible or visible reward is supported by Tambo, Ugwu and Ngogang (2014), Dauda and Ameen (2017) that, Nigeria’s stability and developmental contribution in Africa maximize the country’s security benefit. This has canvassed for the view of informant MFA2 that:

Nigeria’s passion for peace and stability in Africa is normal because if Nigeria fails to be at alert on peace and security in Africa, the country will also share from the consequences. So, apart from the fact that Nigeria is making peace and ensuring stability in African continent, the country is also assisting itself, protecting itself from any spillover effects (Informant MFA2, personal communication, September 8, 2017).
Informants MFA4, MFA3 and UniJos also argued that, it is for the national interest of Nigeria that make the country to be committed to the stability of the African continent. And by doing more to Africa in terms of stability, Nigeria is maximizing its benefits. Similarly, informant Unilorin was equally shared the view that Nigeria should always involve in the stability and developmental process in Africa. He added that:

*Stability and peace are the foundation of progress, prosperity and development. Without a stable and peaceful continent, the aspiration of having a prosperous, progressive and developed Africa that is free from the words poverty and disease will remain a mirage. So, the benefit of peace and stability can never be overemphasized for Nigeria and for all other countries. Without peace and stability, you can hardly achieve any of the goals or objectives (Informant Unilorin, personal communication, August 28, 2017).*

Hence, Nigeria’s commitment to Africa’s stability and development is described by Jordaan (2017) as an indirect way of waxing stronger of the country’s security. Arguably, this is an advantage to Nigeria’s security when compare with those that have not been involved in the stability struggle in the continent. Figure 1.2. below illustrates a consensus among the interviewees regarding security benefit as gain accrued to Nigeria due to its Afrocentric policy of ensuring stability in the African continent.

![Security Benefit](image)

**Figure 1.2. Security Benefit as Gain Accrued to Nigeria due to its Afrocentric Policy of Ensuring Stability in Africa**

### 6.2 Sovereignty Protection

Sovereignty Protection: This is another benefit for Nigeria’s involvement in ensuring African stability and development as entrenched in its foreign policy. As argued by Innocent and Onyishi (2014) that a State is considered protected when it is security conscious about its territorial boundary. This perhaps has made Nigeria to always forthcoming towards addressing any security challenges in the African continent.

An informant has expressed that “Nigeria is protecting its sovereignty by maintaining peace in Africa” (Informant BUK). The intervention of Nigeria in the crises of countries like Liberia, Sierra Leone, Guinea-Bissau and others was described by Kabia (2016) as an avenue to prevent the escalation of crises in those countries into its domain. The view argued by informant NIIA1 that “it is beyond that because sometime the understanding was that when such is allowed to thrive, it gives room for extra African power to keep intervening and meddling in the internal affairs of African countries”.

As argued by Englehart (2017), Goldenziel (2017) and Yurchenko (2017), sovereignty is one of the essential features of a State, and its protection is mandatory for its survival. Similarly, scholars like Karimi, Koosha, Asfad and Ansari (2017) have argued that one of the assured ways for the protection of sovereignty and territorial integrity of a State is for that State to always support its neighbours in their struggle to ensure stability in the environments. This action expressed by Nigeria is what informant UniJos described as “peace loving in the African continent”.

115
Consequently, one can be argued that Nigeria’s role in ensuring stability in Africa has directly or indirectly reduced the spillover rate of such crisis on the country. For example, Nigeria’s impact towards the return of peace to Chad in between 1965-1979, and 2005-2010 can be attached to an act of preventing the country from sharing part of the likely products of crisis in Chad such as militants, refugees among others (Akinterinwa, 1987; Adetula, 2015). This action of Nigeria towards promoting stability and development in Africa has boost the country’s image within the African continent and world at large. Therefore, figure 1.3. below shows a consensus among the interviewees regarding sovereignty protection as a benefit accrued to Nigeria due to its Afrocentric policy of ensuring stability in the African continent.

Figure 1.3. Sovereignty Protection as Benefit Accrued to Nigeria due to its Afrocentric Policy of Ensuring Stability in Africa

### 6.3 International Recognition and Clout

International Recognition and Clout: This is another benefit derived by Nigeria from its Afrocentric policy of foreign policy toward the continent. Many countries that Nigeria has in one way or the other assisted will always accord certain regards/respect for the country in all his aspiration (Dwyer, 2015). This according to Folarin (2013), Ashiru (2014), Fayomi, Chidozie and Ajayi (2015) canvassed for the recognition attached to Nigeria by the international community which invariably promote the global image of the country.

An informant has argued in support of the views that the leading role played by Nigeria particularly during most peacekeeping or stability operations in Africa has accounted for the trust and confidence of the global community on the country. He asserted that:

> Nigeria’s International recognition and clout not only in Africa, but among the committee of nations at the United Nations, the European Union, and others, make those organizations to respect Nigeria and reckoned with it particularly when it comes to peacekeeping exercises. This has made other African Nations to also respect Nigeria (Informant ABU1, personal communication, September 11, 2017).

Similarly, another informant urged Nigeria to increase its tempo and commitment in ensuring stability and development in Africa. This will promote Nigeria’s influence during the decision making at the global level. He argued that:

> The external projection of Nigeria is a tool to influence decision at the global level in favour of itself and Africa at large. This has accorded recognition to Nigeria and made it a place to reckon with when to address the instability in West Africa and in Africa at large. Nigeria has the intention, the Will, the capacity and the wherewithal to provide peace and stability (Informant ABU2, personal communication, September 16, 2017).
Nigeria has been described by Adesoji (2016) as one-time largest troops contributor to the UN peacekeeping operations in Africa where it deployed both civilian and military personnel to assist in the return of peace back to many countries. This action of Nigeria has argued by informant NIIA1 to promote the country’s prestige among other African countries. He posited that “international relations is more of game of the powerful against the weak”. Therefore, it is possible for Nigeria to influence more at the global decision, if the country continues its developmental and stability function in the continent. Although, there are records that Nigeria had influenced great decisions in Africa. For example, at the AU 19th Ordinary Session held in Ethiopia on 15th-16th July, 2012 when the Chairman of the Commission was to be appointed. Nigeria was not in support of South African candidate Nkosazana Dlamini-Zuma but preferred Jean Ping, a candidate from Gabon. Nigeria ensured that it mobilized other African countries to vote in favour of Mr. Jean Ping, and the candidate eventually emerged as the Chairman of AU Commission. (Wapmuk, 2014).

Therefore, the influence commanded by Nigeria at the AU 19th Ordinary Session could be arguably described as an intangible benefit for the assistance the country had rendered to the Africa. It is an advantage for Nigeria to always improve its involvement towards ensuring development and stability in the African continent. Figure 1.4. below indicates a consensus among the interviewees regarding international recognition and clout as another benefit accrued to Nigeria due to its Afrocentric policy of ensuring stability in the African continent.

![International Recognition and Clout as Benefit Accrued to Nigeria due to its Afrocentric Policy of Ensuring Stability in Africa](image)

Figure 1.4. International Recognition and Clout as Benefit Accrued to Nigeria due to its Afrocentric Policy of Ensuring Stability in Africa

**6.4 Fostering Unity and Cooperation**

Fostering Unity and Cooperation: This is another benefit accrued to Nigeria for its Afrocentric policy in Africa. The assistance rendered by Nigeria to other African countries will promote the unity and cooperation in the continent (Oni & Taiwo, 2016). Fostering unity and cooperation in the African continent is one of the objectives set for the AU (AU Constitutive Act, 2002). According to Guzansky (2015) and Suphattanakul (2017), peace and stability is not guarantee where there is no cooperation. This arguably has been one of the motive for Nigeria’s action towards fostering unity and cooperation in African continent.

An informant argued in support of the assertion on the need for unity and cooperation in Africa by stressing that “Nigeria is protecting its sovereignty by maintaining peace in Africa and also such has promoted unity in the continent” (Informant BUK). Hence, promotion of unity and cooperation by Nigeria through its contribution to stability and development in Africa could be arguably referred to as an intangible benefit coming to the country. Similarly, informants NIIA1, NIIA2, MFA3 and MFA2 also attested to the relentless contribution of Nigeria as part of the factors that promote the harmonious relationship among the African countries. Their views is equally supported by another informant that:

> Without a stable and peaceful continent, the aspiration of having a prosperous, progressive and developed Africa that is free from the words poverty and disease will remain a mirage. The benefit of peace and stability can never be overemphasized for Nigeria and for all other countries. Without
peace and stability, you can hardly achieve any of the goals or objectives (Informant Unilorin, personal communication, August 28, 2017).

Hence, Nigeria has indirectly assisted the continental organization in Africa, AU in realizing part of its objective of promoting unity and cooperation among the African countries. Figure 1.5. below illustrates a consensus among the interviewees regarding unity and cooperation as a benefit accrued to Nigeria due to its Afrocentric policy of ensuring stability in the African continent.

Figure 1.5. Unity and Cooperation as Benefit Accrued to Nigeria due to its Afrocentric Policy of Ensuring Stability in Africa

6.5 Citizen Diplomacy

Citizen Diplomacy: This is another benefit accrued to Nigeria for its Afrocentric policy of ensuring stability in African continent. As argued by Marshall (1999), Melissen (1999), La-Porte (2015), Usman and Obiyan (2017), the determinant of the treatment or respect accord to nationals of a country in abroad is measured by the level at which such country is rated by the international community. Meaning that, treatment that will be accorded to Nigerians outside the country is determined by the perception or the level at which the global community rated the country. For a country like Nigeria with a population of over 140 million in year 2006, which also recorded over 190 million in December, 2017 needs to contribute more into Africa's peace and development for its national to be well accorded abroad (Worldometers, 2018). The population figure of Nigeria recorded by the UN Department of Economic and Social Affairs, Population Division has affirmed the claimed that Nigeria is the most populous country in Africa. And that one in every black found anywhere in the world is a Nigeria (Emelumadu, 2010; Ujara & Ibietan, 2016; Dauda, Ahmad, Keling & Ameen, 2018).

Similarly, Joseph (2014) argued that a country has the responsibility of protecting the interest of its citizens both at home and abroad. And one of the ways to do so, is to project a good image of ones’ country. The view is supported by informants ABU2 and BUK that the aim of Nigerian foreign policy is to ensure that the welfare and security of Nigerians and safeguarding the country’s territorial integrity. Doing this through Nigeria’s contribution to the development and stability of other African countries, the country’s image will the positively projected and its citizens will be accorded well at the international community. Figure 1.6. below shows a consensus among the interviewees regarding citizens diplomacy as a benefit accrued to Nigeria due to its Afrocentric policy of ensuring stability in the African continent.
7. Conclusion

Foreign policy of Nigeria is one of the tools the country is using to achieve its national interest. Similarly, the concentric nature of Nigeria’s external policy has shaped the directions of its policy to be Afrocentric which has made the country to always put Africa’s consideration in all its affairs and decisions both locally and internationally. As a result of this, Africa becomes the centre-piece of Nigeria’s foreign policy which has made the country to be committed to the development and stability of the African continent. Numerous achievements have been made by Nigeria through its Afrocentric foreign policy to the continent such as unity and cooperation, peace and stability and other developmental facilities which mostly available to areas where there is harmonious relationship. This has in one way or the other assisted the continental organization in Africa, AU to achieve some of its objectives to the continent. By doing this, Nigeria is arguably protecting itself from inheriting the likely consequences of crisis from the conflict zones such as refugees’ problem, social vices, militancy, insecurity among others.

Therefore, Nigeria is encouraged to always maximize its benefits to the African continent in order for it to enjoy its own peace. Similarly, there are both tangible and intangible benefits that is accruing to Nigeria for its Afrocentric foreign policy towards ensuring stability and development in Africa. These include security benefit, sovereignty protection, unity and cooperation, citizen diplomacy, international recognition and clout. Apart from the fact that some tangible and intangible benefits coming to Nigeria for its commitment to development and stability of Africa, it also promotes the country’s image internationally which is an additional tool or strategy for Nigeria to influence during the decision making at the global arena.

References


An Assessment of the Roles and Challenges of Civil Society Organizations on the Process of Democratic Consolidation of Nigeria’s Fourth Republic

1 Musa Kabir Umar, 2 Muhammad Ainuddin Iskandar Lee bin Abdullah, 3 Kamarul Zaman bn Hajj Yusof

1 PhD Scholar, Department of Political Science, School of International Studies, Ghazali Shafie Graduate School of Government and International Studies, University Utara Malaysia/ Lecturer, Department of Political Science, Umaru Musa Yar’adua University Katsina-Nigeria kabirumarmusa@gmail.com
2 Lecturer, Department of Political Science, School of International Studies, Ghazali Shafie Graduate School of Government and International Studies, University Utara Malaysia, ainuddin@uum.edu.my
3 Lecturer, Department of Political Science, School of International Studies, Ghazali Shafie Graduate School of Government and International Studies, University Utara Malaysia, kzaman@uum.edu.my

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

This paper investigated the roles and challenges of civil society organizations (CSOs) in the democratic consolidation of Nigeria. As the third sector, civil Society is known to be at the forefront in the democratization process for quite a long period of time, but their contributions are continuously being relegated especially by the state who viewed them with negative lenses particularly when they are opposed to their conducts. The paper had therefore tried to examine three civil society organizations namely Centre for Democracy and Development (CDD), Alliances for Credible Elections (ACE) and Stakeholder Democracy Network (SDN).

It achieved this objective by using a qualitative semi-structured face to face interviews supported with secondary sources of data. Nvivo 12 software was used in coding, categorization and general management of data.

The study revealed that CSOs in Nigeria have promoted the reliability of election by observing every phase of the country’s electoral process. Indeed, the CSOs have promoted democratic principles of civic participation, political engagement and tolerance among some political parties thereby advancing democratic consolidation in the polity. They have also stimulated policy changes in some crucial socio-economic policies. Again, the study revealed that CSOs faced economic problems which seriously distresses their operations and sustainability especially inability to extend into rural areas. It has also shown donor organization influence on the organizations which encroach their ideological base.

The paper concluded by suggesting that the civil society must devise a means of economic survival as well as further strengthen their capacity through training and retraining to fully understand how governments operate for effective and concrete criticisms that would enhance democratic productivity to the people. Civil society should be allowed to freely ventilate democratically without threats from the state since it inspires governments to be more accountable, transparent, honest and responsive to the public needs, which will make it further win the support of the public hence reinforce its legitimacy.

© 2019 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0
1. Introduction
Before the re-emergence of democratic rule in 1999, civil society organizations (CSOs) are mostly believed to be significant only against military regimes (Kopecky & Spirova 2008), hence overlooked during democratic regimes (Brack & Weinblum, 2011). Immediately after the entrenchment of democracy it was later observed that the CSOs are inextricably linked with the process of democratization and would forever remain relevant for democratic consolidation (Igbokwe-Ibeto, Ewuim, Anazodo & Osawe, 2014). Indeed, democratic consolidation has been a phrase bedevilled with so much ambiguities, as it defined a singly acceptable meaning because of contextual distinctions as what constitutes a consolidated democracy might not necessarily be so in another setting. Nevertheless, the most prominent and frequently applied sense of the phrase is the eight criteria outlined by Robert Dahl in his influential book Polyarchy. The criteria are: the right to vote; the right to be elected; right of political leaders to compete for support; free and fair elections; freedom of expression; alternative sources of information; freedom of association; and public policy institutions depending on votes and expressions of preference (Dahl, 1971). Thus, CSOs are instrumental mechanisms for making these criteria to fruition in democratic societies particularly the developing ones. It is, however, important to note that even though civil society has no single meaning in social sciences literature (Mercy, 2012; Igbokwe-Ibeto, Ewuim, Anazodo & Osawe, 2014), yet it has been used by several political philosophers, such as Hobbes, Locke, Montesquieu, De Tocqueville, Hegel, Marx, and Gramsci (Zaidise, 2004). Diamond (1994) argued that civil society is an important mechanism for checking the excesses of democratic régimes, scrutinizing their possible abuses and violations of the law, and subjecting them to public scrutiny. Hence, a vibrant civil society is an additional essential ingredient for bringing, consolidating and maintaining democracy. According to Nuhu (2011) numerous studies have been more attentive on democratization process leaving behind the issue of democratic consolidation. However, very minute knowledge is known by which different CSOs contribute to democratic consolidation and the challenges they faced in Nigeria despite their immense role in bringing about democracy in the country (Igbokwe-Ibeto, Ewuim, Anazodo & Osawe, 2014), though Hegel viewed some CSOs as actors of downplaying democracy (Mercy, 2012). The big questions that concerned this study are: what role civil society organizations play in the democratic consolidation in Nigeria? What are the challenges faced by the CSOs in Nigeria? It is important at this juncture to note that country (Igbokwe-Ibeto, Ewuim, Anazodo & Osawe, 2014) have distinguished two main categories of CSOs in Nigeria namely: those that are made up of organizations whose purpose is extending the borderline of liberal democratic practices and pressure groups whose actions indirectly improve the development of democracy though their main focus is on the pursuit of own interests.

Beginning from this observation, the key objective of this paper is to have a new viewing platform by exploring the roles and challenges of CSOs in a country bedevilled with poverty, corruption, ethno-religious crisis and other socio-economic and political problems which are antithetically parallel to the principles of democracy. Thus, the study restricted itself to three selected CSO’s in Nigeria namely Centre for Democracy and Development (CDD), Alliances for Credible Elections (ACE) and Stakeholder Democracy Network (SDN). It also analyses how these CSOs autonomously impacted the country’s democratic consolidation process between in the Fourth Republic. Following the introduction, the paper dealt with operational definition of concepts. The third part of the paper dealt with the methodology, the fourth segment dwelled on the discussion of findings and the final part dealt with conclusion and recommendations.

2. Conceptual and Theoretical Issues
2.1 Democratic Consolidation
Democratic consolidation is a concept which denotes democratic continuity with certain features which includes popular legitimacy, diffusion of democratic values, party building, stabilization of electoral rules, decentralization of state power, judicial reform, alleviation of poverty, elimination of authoritarian enclaves, the organization of functional interest and economic stabilization (Schedler, 1998). Contemporary realistic studies on democratic consolidation more often than not follows two strategies to understand what the notion entails i.e. the substantive and prospective approaches (Svolik, 2015). The substantive approach focuses attention on a set of results to be observable in a well-entrenched democracy and then weigh the degree at which democracy satisfies them. Such
attractive results often consist of strong political opposition, energetic civil society, and popular acceptance of key democratic principles among the general populace. Additionally, the second, potential approach principally links consolidation with the stability of democracy (Svolik, 2015). Equally important, is the argument of Usman cited by Ibietan and Ajayi (2015) where on cautionary note argued that changing over to a democratic form of governance is not an automatic certification for democratic consolidation. To them, democratic consolidation involves refining the democratic institutions and interactions between and among political actors. There is therefore, the tendency to link democratic consolidation with profound unlikelihood of democratic collapse. It is, therefore, pertinent to note that scholars have differing views on the definition of democratic consolidation. One is a “minimalist conception,” emphasizing procedural or formal democracy. The other is a “maximalist conception,” focusing on the outcomes of politics, such as institutionalization of political institutions, social justice, and economic equality (Lee, 2007). The minimalist conception of a consolidated democratic regime viewed it as the process of transforming the arrangements, prudential norms, and solutions that have emerged during the transition into relations of cooperation and competition that are reliably known, regularly practiced, and voluntarily accepted by those persons or collectives that participate in democratic governance (Schmitter, 1992; Aduku & Umoru, 2014). In the same vein, Aduku and Umoru (2014) highlights that democratic consolidation implies the internationalization of democratic culture and the institutionalization of democratic best practices by a country that has successfully embarked on a democratic transition. In its positive formulations, this branch of consolidation studies speaks about the goal of reaching democratic continuity, maintenance, entrenchment, survival, permanence, endurance, persistence, resilience, viability, sustainability and irreversibility. By contrast, negative formulations call upon the inevitability of moving beyond states of “non-consolidation,” democratic fragility, instability, uncertainty, vulnerability, reversibility and the threat of breakdown. For all differences in nuance, the unifying purpose beneath this multifaceted vocabulary is straightforward. In biological metaphors: It is basically preoccupied with keeping democracy alive, with preventing its “rapid death” (O’Donnell, 1992). In this paper, democratic consolidation is referred to as the persistence and stability of democracy and its principles.

2.2 Civil Society
The World Bank (2013) translates the phrase civil society as a large group of non-governmental and non-profit making organizations that exist in public life, projecting the interests and values of their members or others, based on principled cultural, political, scientific, religious or philanthropic considerations. In other words, it is also construed to mean non-governmental entities such as community groups, non-governmental organizations (NGOs), labour unions, indigenous groups, charitable organizations, faith-based organizations, professional associations, and foundations. According to Markus (2001) in his focus on the development of the concept of civil society in Poland, he argued that the usage of the term civil society is constantly increasing, including other social phenomena, from associations to civility, trust to social capital which has became relevant for both present social theory and practical activities of people of various societies. Moreover, Islamoglu (2001) viewed civil society as a self-regulating, self-governing body outside the state which is always opposing the state, representing both societal associations expected to generate civility, social cohesion, and morality. In this discourse, CSOs denote to associations that are neither in the state nor private sector but are involved in a civic activity meant for the promotion of the interests of their members and the general society.

2.3 Theoretical Framework
The Liberal Democratic Theory is adopted for the paper to serve as a framework. Liberal democratic theory traces its origin and name to the European scholars of 18th century on their contributions to the streams of thoughts in the great and famous enlightenment movement. The major advocates of the theory are Voltaire, Giovanni Vico John Locke, J.J. Rousseau, John Stuart Mill, Adam Smith, Baron De Montesquieu and Thomas Jefferson former President of U.S.A among others. The theory is employed in analysing democracy and democratic consolidation because it describes the form of democracy predominant in western capitalist societies which later began to gain relevance in the peripheral capitalist societies like Nigeria.

The main features of the theory are reception of capitalist mode of production; competitive multi-party democratic system; application of the rule of law; availability of pressure groups in form of civil society organizations; separation of powers coupled with clear checks and balances; strong prominence on human rights such as freedoms of peaceful assembly; press; free and fair periodic elections; speech; free press and (Mohammed, 2013; Kwasau, 2013). Basically, liberal theory of democracy was intending to encourage citizens participation in the administrative affairs of governing societies by allowing all adult citizens the right to vote and be voted for regardless of any social status be it religion, gender, ethnicity or ownership of the means of production. The theory is therefore used
as a framework of this analysis because it specifically outlined how democracy should behave if the process is expected to function and endure successfully. In this context, it could be seen that for the consolidation of democracy in Nigeria, the CSOs as one of the major ingredients of liberal democracy must ardently allowed to ventilate freely to ensure among other things the credibility of elections, influencing public policy and ultimately the respect of the rule of law. This can be done through various ways beginning from public enlightenment or voter education on the significance of election, checking the excesses of the elected democratic leaders and ensuring democratic productivities reached the common man. Indeed, these are some of the major arguments the theory exposed as the important factors which the CSOs are playing key role for an effective, efficient, successful and sustainable democratic consolidation.

The theory has, however, been challenged by many critics as they believed it does not respect absolute majority rule. This is because the actual power is concentrated in the hands of the few so-called representatives. Thus, Marxist scholars described it merely a class-based system of governance like oligarchy. Besides that, many scholars accused it of being too expensive particularly when it comes to elections expenditure which would have been more meaningful if spent on a productive societal project.

3. Methodology
The methodology employed in this paper is a qualitative approach using face to face semi-structured interview in data gathering. According to Yin (1984) and Babbie (2004) qualitative design is considered more appropriate for explanatory and descriptive researches. The choice of the qualitative design was further informed by the need to explore the perspectives, thoughts and perceptions of the relevant stakeholders and experts in CSOs and democracy, politicians and academics respectively. The study also used expert choice sampling technique by recruiting 8 informants, who are political party leaders, leaders of the three selected CSOs and an academic (an expert in civic political movements). This method is used because the informants are possessing a wide range of vast relevant expertise and experiences on the phenomenon under investigation. Secondary data in form of journal articles, newspapers, textbooks and some documentary materials from the political parties and civic organizations were used to support the interview submissions. The interview data was subjected to the managing procedures by first organizing the data, the preliminary reading of database, coding, transcribing, thematic organization, representation and forming an interpretation of them as Creswell (2013) viewed that doing such enables the researcher to present more reliable and precise results.

Table 1: The Code and the category of Informants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Interpretation</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Informant 1, 2, 3 &amp; 4</td>
<td>Civil Society Leaders</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 5</td>
<td>Political Party Leader</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informant 6</td>
<td>Academic</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Work, 2018

The reasons for selecting these informants was because they have broad ideas and experiences in the activities of civil society organizations in their efforts to consolidate democracy in the country (Mercy, 2012). They were interviewed to get the most reliable and first-hand data on the activities of CSOs between 1999 and 2017. The data was analysed after transcription, coding, thematic organization and representation.

4. Discussion of Findings
4.1 The Roles of Civil Society Organizations in Nigeria’s Democratic Consolidation
Civil society organizations are indispensable actors in a democratic enterprise as they encourage citizens democratic participation to ensure a functioning and healthy democracy (Jamali S., Hasan, H. & Ching, L.C., 2016). To some degree their contributions in terms of consolidating democracy supersedes political parties particularly in Nigeria. The diagram below shows the informants who responded on the contributions of CSOs towards democratic consolidation in Nigeria.
The role of civil society organizations become more pronounced especially in the developing societies of Asia, Africa and Latin America where immediately after their independence the military toppled their bequeathed democratically elected governments and hold onto power for many decades. This powered the emergence of civil associations with pro-democratic agendas to start agitating rigorously for the entrenchment of democratic rule. Informant 4 and 6 have argued that civic associations have been the major players in the Nigeria’s democratic process since during the military. They further lamented that, CSOs were the actors that pressured the military to go back to their respective barracks for their constitutional responsibilities thereby paving the way for the re-emergence of democracy in Nigeria. Informants 2 and 3 argued that, at all levels, civil society organizations play significant roles in democratic processes up to the end of deepening or consolidating it in the system. Indeed, the role of civil society in deepening democracy is tremendous as Thapa (2016) points out citing Stephan and Linz (1996) who reasoned that a strong civil society is necessary in the beginning of democratic transition through its consolidation (Mercy, 2012). This is in line with the liberal democratic theory postulation that the CSOs are crucial agents in monitoring the process of elections in Nigeria. They enlighten the public on civic responsibilities such as monitoring elections. In fact, the chief functions of CSOs in democratic consolidation is ensuring credible elections; guarding against democratic threats; influencing public policy; responding to and empowering citizens through advocacy programs such as voter education among others (Mercy, 2012). Through advocacy these CSOs generally interrogate the way in which policy is directed and partake in the agenda setting as to raise important issues that would eventually strengthen the democratic processes (Igbokwe-Ibeto, Ewuim, Anazodo & Osawe, 2014; Botchway, 2018). The liberal democratic theory has strongly explained the greater need of the activities of pressure groups in form of CSOs on governmental policy influence for the betterment of the citizenry and which affect the continued survival of the democratic process. Indeed, informants 1 and 6 has averred that CDD, ACE and SDN have been very agile in promoting democracy through an all-inclusive approach in any aspect of Nigeria’s democratic process. These associations recommend policy answers to the democratic regime and ultimately open the space for public argumentation. For example, these CSOs works in various areas such as constitutional and electoral reforms programs in Nigeria which strongly helped in the consolidation the nascent democracy. Additionally, the CSOs engage in pushing for policy options preferable to them or which they go against which in turn influences positively in consolidating democracy in the country. They do this through various events such as conferences, media campaigns, workshops, seminars among others (Boothway, 2018). In fact, in Nigeria the CSO’s have been the voice of the poor especially when an unwanted policy is about to be put in place. Accordingly, apart from giving citizens respect for the state and positive engagement, vigorous civil societies play an immeasurable roles towards democratic consolidation by enhancing the accountability, responsiveness, inclusiveness, effectiveness, and hence legitimacy of the political system (Diamond, 1994). In the opinion of Informants 1 and 5 as per as democratic consolidation is concerned, CSO’s are at the forefront in promoting the ideals of the process
more than the political parties. According to them, in Nigeria, most of the political parties are becoming inactive and mute until a new election season. In the contemporary world opposition parties are the most distinctive features of democracy and the absence of which is regarded as the absence of democracy (Robert Dahl cited in Van Biezen & Wallace, 2013), yet CSOs roles supersede the former as it is the live wire of democratic movement from the beginning to the end (Thapa, 2016).

Moreover, CSOs are believed to be at the forefront of peace-building in the country. Informant 1, 2, 3 and 6 had attested to the fact that CDD, ACE and SDN have played immense roles in ensuring a conflict-free process of democratization which eventually led the process to unimaginable successes. In relation to peace-building, the CSOs have contributed extremely in promoting multiparty democracy because they have strengthened and removed the feeling of distrust and bitterness among political parties (Botchway, 2018). Through this the political parties come together and use the same platform to advance their party’s manifestoes and interrelate with each other without any rancour. This indeed has made the democratic experiment in the country more meaningful and fruitful.

### 4.2 The Challenges of Civil Society Organizations on Democratic Consolidation in Nigeria

According to informant 4, 5 and 6 one of the greatest challenges of civil society organization world over is that the political leaders and corporate interest scuttle their efforts because they see them as threats to their primitive accumulation. Sriskandarajah (2015) maintained that civil society suffers long lasting attacks in many countries because of the serious questions they upon ask about power, which the elites usually went to any length to get and maintain for personal aggrandizement. In short, CSOs face series of intimidations and attacks from the state forces who are always going against their activities This, indeed, make the civil society space a very tumultuous one and risk bearing which at times cost the lives of some actors.

Again, informants 1, 2 and 3 narrated that most of the CSOs are not ideologically based. According to them the CSOs in Nigeria are not doing things out of goodwill for they are sponsored by some specific agencies which made them to promote some certain ideologies. In such situations it is assumed that they are not working to promote politics or democratic consolidation. In addition, informant 2, 5 and 6 have lamented that one major setback affecting the CSOs themselves is that they are frequently silent in proactively affecting the people and the society at large except where the issue has become of a national topic. They have the tendency of relying on the state for information and direction to head-start on sensitive matters. These failures and many more of the CSOs made their activities in deepening democracy to remain in a serious doubt (Igbokwe-Ibeto, Ewuim, Anazodo & Osawe, 2014; Botchway, 2018).
Thirdly, additional greatest challenge opposing the CSOs in their drive towards democratic consolidation is lack of financial base. Informant 6 and 1 have attributed most of the failures of the CSOs to economic shortcomings. They argued that most of these associations do not have a strong economic means of survival and operations in Nigeria. This is in consonance with the opinions of Igbokwe-Ibeto, Ewuim, Anazodo and Osawe (2014) that:

The lack of financial autonomy of civil society compromises their independent approach to issues and ability to carry out long term plans and programmes. This perhaps explains why they could not insist on a new socio-economic and political order in Nigeria prior to the return to civil rule. Also, with growing poverty in the land, members and the leadership of civil society are likely to capitulate in the face of the present economic realities that has pauperized majority of the political and economic elites. The poverty question therefore, is crucial to roles civil society can play in democratic consolidation in Nigeria (Igbokwe-Ibeto, Ewuim, Anazodo and Osawe, 2014:9).

Of course, it is argued that scarce financial muscles are a crucial drawback which stalled the actions of the CSOs in democratic consolidation process. This is especially the rationale behind being them mostly urban-based. Indeed, among the shortcomings of these associations is seen in being them mostly urban-based. Their presence in the rural areas is quite minimal. Informant 1 described that majority of the CSOs are urban-based; thus, their activities of democratic consolidation in the country is seriously limited because rural areas are the most populous part of the country where civic enlightenment is more required than the urban centres comparatively. Therefore, the direction of these associations is circumscribed to urban areas while important social forces in countryside are ignored (Mercy, 2012). And, neglecting the rural areas suffocates democratization by making the process more elitist hence injurious to consolidation of democracy.

5. Summary
In practical sense, civil society have been well acknowledged to be the greatest force in nurturing and maintaining democratic ideals in any society without which democracy might likely be at the verge of collapse. A robust and dependable civil society represent the interests of the people and serve as a check on the excessive use of power and primitive accumulation by the state actors. Indeed, the study revealed some signs of an increasing strength and boldness in civil society towards democratic consolidation in Nigeria. It revealed that CSOs are very central democratic actors in the process of democratization by monitoring numerous governmental or political activities in the country. Through monitoring the CSOs therefore challenge any policy move that is inimical to democratic principles which in effect improves the efficiency and success of democratic governance and its consolidation. It has also revealed that these CSOs engaged in advocacy programs that help in enlightening the public on the civic education and several policy programs of the state that aid in the betterment of the lots of the populace as clearly explained by the liberal democratic theory which emphasise the need for CSOs in the process of democratization. Moreover, the result shows that the three CSOs have a strength that aids them to take on certain things that other CSOs in Nigeria did not do.

6. Conclusion
The paper has discussed and analyzed the roles and challenges of CSOs in the consolidation of democracy in Nigeria’s Fourth Republic by using liberal democratic theory as an explanatory framework. It therefore explained how these associations contribute in the democratic consolidation of the country through public enlightenment programs; influencing government policies and the advocacy for adherence to rule of law among others. Furthermore, it spelt out the challenging issues confronting the CSOs specifically on matters relating to inadequate financial resources; lack of national spread and external influences by international donor organizations respectively. It finally showcased the importance of these actors in consolidating democratic form of governance in Nigeria. It is therefore vividly clear from the foregoing that CSOs have become indispensable actors in the democratic consolidation of Nigeria despite the myriads of challenges bedeviling their activities. Thus, their need to become more actively vibrant in the democratic development has become significant, hence, greater need for recommendatory solutions become necessary.

7. Recommendations
So, it has become unarguably necessary for civil society actors to restructure their patterns and strategies in relating with government to provide a worthwhile checks and balances that would eventually consolidate democracy. More so, funding is a crucial element in the organization and processes of civil society. CSOs should also learn and create a way of economic survival to reduce their dependence on foreign donor agencies who use such means to influence their activities by imposing their ideologies and philosophies upon them. The governments should encourage free
civil society since it inspires governments to be more accountable, transparent, honest and responsive to the public needs, which will make it further win the support of the public and reinforce their legitimacy. This would allow civil society opposition actors to ventilate freely for the advancement of democratic consolidation in developing democracies. Moreover, CSOs should also strengthen partnership with other democratic stakeholders in a responsible and productive way that would further consolidate democratic integrity in Nigeria. It is also of paramount importance for civil society to extend their activities beyond urban centres to the rural areas. This would allow for an all-inclusive movement in consolidating democracy and its ideals in all the nook and crannies of the country to have national spread. The paper also suggested for further studies on CSOs whose activities seems to indirectly negate democratic consolidation in Nigeria.

References


Women in Nigeria Labour Congress: A Comparative Study of the Northern and Southern Regions

1 Mustapha Alhaji Ali, 2 Ummu Atiyah Ahmad Zakuan, 3 Mohammad Zaki Bin Ahmad

1 Department of Political Science and Administration. Yobe State University, Damaturu. Nigeria. mustaphaalhajiali2@gmail.com: alimustapha07@gmail.com
2 Ghazali Shafie Graduate School of Government College of Law, Government and International Studies School of International Studies (SOIS),Universiti of Utara Malaysia. hannahadham1212@gmail.com
3 Ghazali Shafie Graduate School of Government College of Law, Government and International Studies School of International Studies (SOIS), Universiti of Utara Malaysia. mohdzaki@uum.edu.my

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

The paper examined the position of women participation in NLC of Northern and the Southern regions and explored the mechanisms NLC put in place to empower women in the Northern and Southern regions of Nigeria.

This paper is qualitative in nature. Data were obtained through the primary and secondary source of data collection. Contrast analysis approach was employed in comparing the position of women participation and empowerment in the NLC of the Northern and Southern regions of Nigeria. All data acquired were thematically analyzed using MAXQDA Software Version 2018.

This paper is a Case study because it provides the researcher with an in-depth understanding of the social phenomenon. Empowerment theory and the liberal feminist theory were used to explain the topic under study. This is because the postulations of these theories centered on equality between both genders in all societies.

The study found that the position of women participation and empowerment in the NLC of the Northern region of Nigeria is low, because of patriarchal nature of the region, compared to the position of women participation and empowerment in NLC of the Southern region. It further added that women participation in the NLC of both regions is strong and healthy development.

The paper recommended that women should be empowered educationally and allowed to hold managerial positions. It, in addition, suggested that parents and religious leaders should advise women from religious and parental points of view to participate actively in NLC of both regions.

© 2019 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: mustaphaalhajiali2@gmail.com


DOI: 10.26710/jbsee.v5i1.654
1. Introduction

The formation of the Nigerian Labour Congress (NLC) is targeted at ensuring a forum that protects workers’ rights and interest. This informed the establishment of NLC in 1978 with the purpose of engaging the employer on sustaining employee welfare. Since its inception, NLC which cut across all states within Nigeria has been able to engage the Nigerian government on various issues affecting workers in the country.

NLC is the central labour union in Nigeria and is the umbrella of all sub-unions. It is recognized by Decree No. 44 of the 1976 Constitution as the sole representative of all unions in the nation. NLC is made up of 43 unions (Wabba, 2017). It has national executives and secretariats as well as states councils in all the 36 states in the country. It was created in 1978, after the unification of four unions, namely: Labour Unity Front (LUF), United Labour Congress (ULC), Nigeria Trade Union Congress (NTUC), and Nigeria Workers Council (NWC). Many associated unions were modernized into 43 unions that are formed to protect the rights and interests of their fellow members, and also to mediate between the government and the civil servants (NLC Reports, 2016; Wabba, 2017).

The major obligation of the NLC is to consolidate, train, unionize all groups of the nation workforces; protect and spread the governmental, economic, cultural and social rights and privileges of Nigerian employees; liberate and unite Nigerian labour and individuals from all forms of abuse and marginalization; attain gender fairness in all places of services; support and expand the links and influences among Nigerian employees and the natural associates in and outside the Nation and; lead the struggle for the changing of country into a fair, caring and independent state (Wabba, 2017; NLC, 2017).

The labour union prepares individuals for nationalist movements and remove the wide gap between the elites and the masses in Nigerian. It raises some questions about access to health services, education, and other welfare packages. It dares authoritarian inclinations, demonstrated by the call to form a national government in which authorized disagreement was eliminated and by the Protective Imprisonment Act of the 1960s, and the over-all subjugation by the military forces in the 1980s (Aiyede, 2004)

There are numerous authorized laws, state and global declarations in favour of gender equality rights, which are related to economic, political, and social reimbursements, without any form of subjugation because of any unfair principles of class, gender or race. Still, women are subjugated in several economic sectors on the Nigerian national economy. Furthermore, since the 1976-85 declaration as the United Nations Period for Women, it has been presumed that women in various places of work will develop much interest and take part vigorously in labour activities. Thus, this paper examined women participation in labour activities of the Northern and Southern regions of Nigeria.

Over the years, women are advocating for equal rights in participation in politics and labour unionism of their choice. They have been relegated to subordinate positions for a long time. Their struggle over values or claims to status and power between them and their male counterparts become apparent. Women want to see a situation where political divisions are minimized. Thus, fostering great collaboration between women and males in politics and decision-making activities is pertinent.

However, Mbamalu (2016) and Allen (1972) disclosed that women marginalization began in Nigeria during the colonial administration. It started when the Southern and the Northern protectorates were amalgamated in 1914. This problem continued to exist up to post-colonial era, where the military picked up from where the colonial masters stopped. However, all these were because of western cultural ideology that was created by the colonialists that subjected women to domestic responsibilities because of gender differences and some reasons known to them. This problem persisted up to independence period when women were still discriminated in leadership positions. This has created a wide gap that needs to be filled up.

The central argument is that the situation of women in Nigerian Labour Congress generally is that they are marginalized both in membership and leadership positions; they are a vulnerable set of people in the NLC and the society at large. Women have been crying out in recent time and have expressed their desire to be part of the development of the nation: They want to take part in the policy and decision-making process. Obviously, there was a consensus among policymakers, both national and international, that empowering women is a way towards achieving fairness equity and justice in any nation. Empowerment means involvement, participation and having a voice in what is happening in the country. The males have forgotten that “male and female are made to complement
one another. How then can a nation afford to under-equip and underutilize half of its resources (Women) (Ali, 2014).

Moreover, it is contended that women’s participation in NLC is very imperative. This is because gender in the Congress is very important, and it matters a lot. Because of this, women need distinct representation to accommodate their needs and aspiration in all the organizations they belong to. Given this, the paper examined women participation in the Nigerian Labour Congress of the Northern and Southern regions. This study attempts to respond to the following research questions:

2. Research Questions
The paper answered the following questions:
  a) What is the position of women participation in NLC of Northern and the Southern regions?
  b) What are the mechanisms that NLC put in place to empower women in the Northern and Southern regions?

2.1 Objectives of the Study
The general objectives of the study are to compare the Northern and Southern women participation in Nigerian labour congress with reference to Borno and Oyo states. While the exact objectives are:

  a) To examine the position of women participation in NLC of Northern and the Southern regions
  b) To reveal the mechanisms that NLC put in place to empower women in the Northern and Southern regions

2.2 Significance of the Study
The study is of great significance in two aspects. This is because the research came up with two important contributions: these include academic and practical contribution.

The study is significant in enriching existing literature on gender inequality. Specifically, it helps to identify and filter a myriad of factors affecting women participation in NLC of the Northern and Southern regions. The significant contribution of the study lies in bridging the knowledge and literature gap, and in encouraging Northern and the Southern women to participate vigorously in the union activities like their male counterparts.

The contribution of the study also lies in filling the gaps in the pre-existing works on NLC membership and leadership positions. Gaps are evident as there is still limited study and work regarding the women empowerment as well as their participation in the leadership of labour union, especially in NLC. Scholarly analyses of trade union movement’s activities and leadership in Nigeria are more oriented towards the functional and participatory aspects of men. Several studies among different authors focus on the issues related to women’s marginalization in the economic and political activities, and their focuses only cover one region. (Abara, 2012; Wabba, 2017; & Briony, 2017).

In relation to the practical contribution, the outcome of this study would be beneficial to researchers, policymakers, academics, students conducting research in a similar field of study, as well as public and private organizations. The findings of this study can help in policy proposals, which in turn would help in improving the position of women empowerment and participation of the two regions in the trade union movements. The research outcome would contribute to the enhancement of the situation and the position of women empowerment in NLC. It would also serve as a basis for future research on a related topic particularly those that focus on gender-related matters.

2.3 Scope of the Study
Considering the broad nature of the topic, and the country under study, this research focus on women participation in NLC; a contrast analysis of gender gap in the Northern and Southern region in the fourth republic. This is because, since the amalgamation of the Southern and Northern Nigerian in 1914, Nigerian constitute two regions, presently, called Nigeria (Mohamed and Allah, 2014). But, due to many states within the two regions, the study focused on Oyo state from the Southern region, and Borno state from the Northern region respectively.

3. Literature Review and Concept of Gender
“Gender refers to the biological characteristics that categories someone as either female or male; whereas ‘gender’ refers to the socially determined ideas and practices of what it is to be female or male (Reeves and Baden, 2000). However, gender is socially constructed and differs from one culture to another. Canadian International
Development Agency (CIDA’S) policy on ‘Gender Equality’ (1996) noted that Gender is simply defined as socially built responsibilities and functions of men and women. The concept also comprises the hopes held about the characteristics, attitudes, and likely behaviors of both sexes. According to Wollstonecraft (1988), who is believed to be the first to recognize the social future of male and female, “most differences between the sexes are socially created and not by nature”. This assertion is in line with a social constructionist theory, which emphasized that all gender differences that exist in the society are not natural; they are artificially created by individuals in the society.

“Gender is a wide set of features that distinguish between male and female entities in societies extending from the idea of biological identification or sex in humans.” In ordinary speech, gender is used interchangeably with "sex" to denote the condition of being a male or female. However, in sociological terms, gender has undergone a lot of debate as efforts have been made by scholars to differentiate between sex and gender; that ‘sex’ refers to the “organic division into male and female and ‘gender’ to the parallel and socially unequal division into femininity and masculinity. Gender can, therefore, refer specifically to “socially constructed and institutionalized differences and unequal relationship between men and women in societies (Cobble, 2012)”.

However, the term gender has been defined by different scholars based on their perception and understanding. Gender in the context of this paper is defined as some physical and mental attributes that differentiate male from female, and these features are biological in nature.

Gender inequality is mainly the consequence of human behaviour that negates people their human rights (Rahman, Chaudhry, and Farooq 2018). The denial of women from rudimentary liberties concludes unexpected costs for society in terms of lower human capital, lower growth and bad administration (World Bank 2001; Sen 1999 as cited in Rahman, Chaudhry, and Farooq 2018).

3.1 Women in the Pre-Colonial era and Colonial Administration

Nigeria has a deep root in colonial history, women marginalization first started and imposed by colonial masters in African nations. It begins with the colonial administration, starting with the amalgamation of two protectorates i.e. the Southern and the Northern protectorates. (Yoruba and Igbo in the Southern and western parts and the Hausa/Fulani in the Northern part) to the Nigeria's independence and its governance, and then to the post-independence (Adu, 2008).

In addition, Adu (2008) noted that Women in the pre-colonial period played a significant role in the political party of the nation. In the different regions of the country, women were actively engaged in politics and took part in decision-making in the traditional institutions of their various regions. But colonial masters created political subjugation that sidelined the women from holding political and elective offices during colonialism. In a related development, Ajayi (2007); Momoh (2008) and Agbalajobi (2010) showcased that in the pre-colonial era, culture, ethnicity, and religion played a very substantial part in shaping the political atmosphere of Nigeria. Yet women were not adequately absorbed in the political and administrative arrangement of the country. In a similar opinion, Momoh (2008) pinpointed that women's duties in the African context are traditionally housewives instead of donating to the development of the economy of the society. This is true from a common Igbo adage that sees wives as ‘oriaku’ “literally meaning "sit back" and enjoys your husband's wealth.”

Scholars such as Mbamalu (2016) and Allen (1972) have gone to a large extent to explain that women were not politically lowered in the Nigerian context, but with the coming and introduction of the colonial system of government after 1900 they were relegated and politically discriminated. Their previous political roles became very low as the colonial rule created a patriarchal government in which women were subjugated to domestic responsibilities and not allowed to hold any administrative position. This argument is not in line with the assertion of the Liberal Feminist Theory, which centered on gender fairness among men and women in every context. Liberal Feminist believes that both genders are equal and deserve equal treatment.

In the work of Adu (2008) colonialism contributed significantly to women marginalization in Nigeria. As mentioned earlier, colonialism in Nigeria destroyed most of the available institutions in all regions. The British system of administration had misconceptions of operating the administrative system in both Hausa, Igbo and Yoruba land. However, Okonjo (1975) describes the western administrative system in the African societies, more especially Nigeria as “the last retreat of barbarism and tyranny a land where rules were oppressed and resources are exploited.
Furthermore, Adu (2008) suggests that the period of male governance needs to come to an end. Moreover, Okonjo (1975) makes a similar observation and suggested that in order to bring an end to male domination over the women much need to be invested into education so as to educate and encourage women to take part in a leadership position. It is noted that African leaders were being downgraded by international organizations, which include International Monetary Fund (IMF), the World Bank (WB) and G7. He concluded that "African men have abandoned Africa leadership, therefore, there is a need to shift the political control base to the women".

Similarly, Agbalajobi (2010) espouses that division of labour on gender could be linked to colonial policy. Though the issue of gender discrimination was invoked during the pre-colonial era but was more pronounced by the colonial institutional settings in the post-colonial administration. A study by Ajayi (2007) clarifies that right from independence Nigerian women have been denied chances of assuming political headship at all stages of authority in the nation's local, state and federal government set up. This was as a result of the colonial ideology of male domination over women. This ideology is not in line with Empowerment and Liberal Feminist theories that dwelled on gender equity in all societies.

3.2 Causes of Gender Discrimination and Violence against Women

Gender imbalance is not associated with Nigeria alone. It is a phenomenon that affects all societies across the globe, and it is found in all facets of the daily activities with women more prone to poverty, maternal mortality, unemployment, illiteracy, among others. According to the United Nations (UN) statistics "women perform two-thirds of the world’s work; women earn one-tenth of the world’s income, women are two-thirds of the world illiterates (Momoh, 2009). So far, it is noted that women formed half of the world’s population but owned only one percent of the world assets. It is also understood that women are frequently exposed to numerous forms of mental, sensual and emotive ferocity. As a result of inequality in power sharing in the society, and between male and female and the influence of patriarchies or patriarchal norms that support inequality. The above mentioned are forms of violence against women as grouped by the United Nations Development Fund for Women (UNDFW, 2006).

Nigerian women are confronted with numerous restrictions in the exercising of their civil rights. Women’s liberty of movement is limited in that they are grateful to get their spouses’ approval to get a visa or to travel outside the nation. The practice of “purdah”, whereby women are isolated from the public space is widely practiced among the Muslim community in the Northern part of the nation. Women in purdah cannot move out of their community freely without the husband’s permission and must be accompanied by a close relative when the need arises. Purdah also restricts women’s freedom of dress in that Muslim women must be veiled in all public places. Widows in some regions of Nigeria face the utmost degree of marginalization; they are limited to home activities and must keep their heads shaved and wear grief or mourning clothing (Ali and Hamidu, 2016). This view is not in line with Empowerment Theory, which suggested that both men and women should be empowered and shall have access to welfare services such as education and health services. This would help in empowering them and encourage them to control production factors and to participate in decision making.

3.3 Women in Administration

A study by Anugwom (2009) observed that the patriarchal settings of the society is one of the main limitations impeding the women development in education. Therefore, he is of the opinion that most of the educational and administrative sectors are organized and dominated by their male counterparts. In addition to that, the authorized body founding administrative work, their time of meetings functions, and their administrative activities are frequently personalized to the men only, without considering the nature of women activities in the society. This is because some women are assigned dual responsibilities (i.e. domestic and union responsibility). Consequently, the activities are not formed with the purpose of taking women to be “commanding them”. Because of this, they find it hard to perform their functions actively in the administration process. This is as a result of their educational background. To support the argument, a study by Parpart (1988) labels the administrative structure as ‘patriarchal ideology’ which denies women’s involvement in most of the trade union activities. Considering the Nigerian condition, Ubeku (1983) argues that the societal customs and traditions do not support the women to lead men in all spheres of lives. It is further noted that women in the labour union are being intimidated by their male’s counterparts. There is the existence of subtle intimidation of the female members of labour unions by their male counterparts. This problem of intimidation by the males coupled with the fear of the men anger has made women to restrict themselves to the domestic assignment. The intimidation of women by the men is against the postulations of
the Liberal Feminist Theory, which believes in gender equality among men and women in every society as well as in organizations.

Nevertheless, it is known that Africa is patriarchal in nature; however, the main block of patriarchy was wrecked when African men finally started agreeing to take women as contemporaries and partners in progress in the workplaces. With this development, one would expect more women in political and administrative positions. While the remains of patriarchy exist in their rowdy nature, the real problem lies in the lack of women determination towards administrative positions in trade unionism in Nigeria Momoh (2009) argues that “women have regarded administrative activities as the prerogative of men”. Over the years, they have dreaded union affairs due to the personality clashes, hostility, and hooliganism displayed by the men (Momoh 2008). The problem was further worsened by the attitude of some women workers, who are not willing and interested to participate in union elections in their offices in order not to offend their proprietors or bosses. In many African nations (Nigerian inclusive) it is noted that gender matters have given rise to the religious, cultural and social context that assigned men a higher position and domination on all power sources (Momoh, 2009).

3.4 Women Empowerment

Women empowerment is the ability to train women some important skills to be active and dependent on society. According to Kabeer (2002) women's empowerment is about the procedure in which those who have been deprived in any aspects of life and have the capacity to make planned life choices acquire such capacity. Empowerment means ways that involve some series of stages through which individuals or group of people become conscious of their rights and privileges to protect their rights. By taking these stages, the individuals increase their living standards such as health, education and economic condition. Empowerment is a process which allows people to significantly advance their living standard (Menhas, & Yaqoob, 2013).

4. Empowerment Theory

Empowerment Theory is concerned with the process of empowerment which covers five stages: welfare, access, conscientization, participation, and control. In this case, Conscientisation refers to the first level and is the beginning of empowerment because the women realize that they are being disadvantaged not due to their inability but due to their gender. So, therefore, the theory centered on women empowerment and gender fairness in society. The theory is concerned with the understanding of discrepancy between sex and gender, and consciousness that gender characterizations are traditions and can be altered. 'Conscientisation' believes that the sexual division of labour should be fair and agreeable among men and women. Given this, the theory calls for women empowerment and gender equality. This can be accomplished through the levels of empowerment as mentioned earlier (Longwe, 1990).

4.1 Liberal Feminism

To support the empowerment theory, the study used liberal feminist theory. The theory is much concerned with gender equality that men and women were born equal and should be given equal treatment and deserved fairness in all aspects of life endeavours. The liberal feminist theory thus is consistent with the dominant American ethos in its basic acceptance of democracy: Its appeal to the value of individualism, choice, responsibility, and equality of opportunity. The theorists do not seek revolutionary changes in society, but rather they want reforms within the existing social structure (Rubery, 2002).

Feminist's philosophers have contended that in any patriarchal civilization, be it outdated, industrial or collective, a system of gender and monetary system function concurrently. They described patriarchy as a not fair system that is cruel to womenfolk. As an egalitarian and political thinker Carole (1989) wrote, "The patriarchal shape up the modification between male and female the political change of domination and freedom."

5. Method of Data Collection

The study adopted both interview research method and available documents. For the survey, the interview was used to extract information from individual participants. So, the secondary data was, however, gathered through the survey of relevant published and unpublished materials in the bibliographical sections of various libraries (John W. C., 2009). In the case of the interview, data were collected from 14 participants seven from each region.

Theses fourteen participants were purposively selected to represent the entire Congress. Participants were chosen because of their position and the knowledge they have on the union matters. The justification for using only 14
participants is that the researcher has reached a saturation point where the participants have started repeating the
data. Saturation refers to the situation where the participant has no new information on the research questions under
investigation (Creswell, 2009).

5.1 Research Design
This study is a Case study because it provides an in-depth understanding of the social phenomenon, or it helps in
providing an in-depth understanding of a case or cases. It also assists in studying an event, or a program, and
activity through numerous sources (Creswell, 2013).

5.2 Method of Data Analysis
All the data generated through the interview and relevant literature were analyzed thematically using MAXQDA
2018. In the courses of the analysis, the study uses a contrast analysis approach in comparing the position of
women participation in NLC of the Northern and Southern regions. It further compared the mechanisms uses in
empowering women in the Northern and Southern regions (Herve Abdi & Williams, 2010; Marshall, & Rossman,
2006;).

Table: 1.1: Demographic Data of the Participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Demographic Features</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20-30</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-40</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41-50</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51-60</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qualification</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary School Certificate</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diploma</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria Certificate in Education (NCE)</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Degree</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Masters/ Ph.D.</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Occupation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civil Servants</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Study (2017)

6. Findings
Considering the nature of the topic investigated, the study, therefore, merits to compare women participation in the
Northern and Southern regions in Nigeria, focusing on Oyo and Borno states, respectively. The justification for
Borno state is that it is one of the educationally developed states among the Northern states, considering the women
population in the workforce in the state but does not correspond with the strength of women in the NLC. The effort
of the government in investing much in education by establishing public schools across the state as one of its plans
to encourage both men and women enrolment in education by giving free education to both genders. This is in line
with Empowerment Theory, which centered on empowering both genders in the nation, by allowing them to have
equal access to welfare services. But the level of women in education is at the minimal, which eventually affects
women in public service and labour Congress at large, compared to women education in the Southern region,
precisely Oyo state. Borno state is patriarchal in nature, which marginalized women to domestic up keeping. This
is against the postulations of Empowerment and Liberal Feminist Theories, which believe in gender fairness among
the sexes in all societies.

In terms of education, the paper found that the first university in the Northern region was established in 1975 in
Borno state, and in 2016 the state government make it two with the establishment of another University in Borno
state. Still, Borno state women are unlike their Southern counterparts that are westernized, educationally sound and
empowered. The justification for Oyo state is connected with the view of Logbaby (2000, 2007). Oyo state was first
colonized by the British people before the colonization of the Northern region. And the first Nigerian University
was established in Ibadan, so, western education was first started in the Southern region. That is why the Southern
women were more educated, exposed and empowered than the Northern women. In addition to this, the state was
the center of administration in the old western region, and it is homogeneous in outlook, unlike Borno state that is heterogeneous in nature. Considering the Atlantic Ocean in the Southern axis of the nation, the Southern region becomes a strategic center for commerce and industry. However, it is also blessed with abundant natural resources like Clay, Kaolin, and aquamarine.

It has been debated by numerous researchers that women, by nature of their representation in the NLC in the Southern states, have brought diverse and broader matters into labour movements, influenced the strategy output to be sociable, and altered the environment. This has stimulated some womenfolk to vigorously get involved or participated in labour movements of the Southern region.

6.1 The Position of Women in NLC of the Northern Region (Borno State)

The study found that women are part and parcel of the NLC of the Northern region, but their position in the labour union of the region is very low because of the culture, patriarchal and religion nature of the region, that designed and assigned domestic responsibilities to women. This was disclosed by the participants, who explained that women in the Northern region are less active in labour matters because of the family background and religion inclinations that do not support women to take part in the labour activities. Out of the eleven positions, only two are females while nine are males. To support the above assertions, another participant opined that some parents in the Northern region sees it as a taboo for a female to take part in the labour activities because NLC comprises both men and women. This opinion contradicts the assertion of the Liberal Feminist Theory, which believes that both genders were born equal and need to be treated equally in the society.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Gender</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chairperson</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vice-Chairperson</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treasurer</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secretary Finance</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secretary</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assistant Secretary</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assistant Secretary Info</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secretary Welfare</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Auditor I</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Auditor II</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Relation Officer</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Fieldwork (2017); AUPCTRE (2017).

From the above table, it is understood that women occupied only two positions in the NLC of the Northern region, precisely Borno state. The positions occupied by women are invariably that of the treasurer and the financial secretary. This is because the men have confidence in the women’s prudence in financial and record keeping, and this was exposed by the participants. They all believe that women can hardly mismanage the union fund.

6.2 The Position of Women in NLC in the Southern Region

The position of women participation in the labour union of the Southern region was believed to be active. This was expressed by the participants, unlike the position of women in the labour union of the Northern region. For instance, in the Southern region, precisely Oyo state, a labour movement has eleven posts, out of these eleven positions seven are occupied by males and four by females. This signifies that women are active in the NLC of the Southern region compared to the women in the NLC of the Northern region. Similarly, another participant showcases that “in the Southern region they used to leave some position for women like financial secretary or treasurer, so I don’t know if is applicable to NLC in the Northern region”.
Table: 1.3 Showing the Positions Occupied by Women in NLC of the Southern Region (Oyo State)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Gender</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chairperson</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vice-Chairperson</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treasurer</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secretary Finance</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secretary</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assistant Secretary</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assistant Secretary Information</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secretary Welfare</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Auditor I</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Auditor II</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Relation Officer (PRO)</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Fieldwork (2017); (AUPCTRE, 2017)

The table above depicts the positions occupied by a female in the NLC of the Southern region, precisely Oyo state. Women occupied four positions in the NLC of Oyo state. The positions occupied include: the treasurer, financial secretary, secretary welfare and Auditor II. This was disclosed by the participants, who added that women in the NLC of the Southern region are participating in the labour movement because of education, exposure and desire to take part in the labour activities.

7. Discussion
This section of the paper discusses the results of the findings on women in NLC of the Northern and Southern regions. Nigerian women have come across several difficulties while volunteering in labour activities more especially in the Northern region. There is a wide discernment from the men counterpart, in electing an aspirant, allocating political offices or taking part in any union of their choice. Often, males constitute a higher proportion of the membership in the union and this tends to affect women when it comes to empowerment, participation and electing or selecting labour leaders. Meanwhile, the study discovered that men have the highest proportion in the union membership and leadership; they tend to control the union positions, therefore, have the advantage in persuading labour politics. These findings are not in line with Empowerment and Liberal Feminist Theory that dwelled on gender fairness among men and women. Empowerment Theory suggested that both genders should have equal access to welfare services; they should involve them in the decision-making process in societal matters.

The study found that women in most of the cases constitute a lesser fraction of the labour movements in the Northern part of the country because of the cultural, religious and social attitudes of the societies, which most frequently demote women to the subordinate positions. Because of this, only a few men, even among the educated, allow their companions to come out to take part in the labour movements.

Another challenge confronting women in labour unionism is an inadequate education. It is observed that women constitute a greater ratio of the uneducated group in the Northern part of Nigeria, unlike the Southern women, who believe in education. This is first because of the family background. Most of the parents in the Northern part of the country prefer to educate their male children then their female ones whom they believe will later get married to another family, and therefore, get united into another family. Therefore, a greater number of women go on unschooled and not exposed to labour activities. These findings do not correlate with the beliefs of the Empowerment and Liberal Feminist Theory that centered on gender equality among men and women.

Lack of financial power is a factor to participation and women empowerment in labour activities in the Nigerian context, precisely in the Northern part of the country. The study instituted that most of the Northern women are not financially sound compared to their Southern counterparts that are financially sound. It is also understood that family or household tasks such as childbearing deter women from participating effectively in labour matters. During their adult lives, most women are involved not only in childbearing but also in child nurturing. Hence, much of the time they may have wished to devote to labour activities are taken up by their maternal tests and responsibilities.
It is also found that several factors were noted as a hindrance to women participation in labour activities of the Northern region. These problems explained what is responsible for the arbitrary rate of exclusion of women from unionism in the Northern part of the country, and why few of them hold a position in the union of their choice.

Poverty is another factor to women participation in labour movements: The study found and disclosed that women are not financially buoyant especially in the Northern region where most of them depend on their husbands and parents, as such, they don’t have the financial power to compete with the men in union matters. Though women in the Southern region are a bit okay financially, because most of them are not dependent on their husbands or parents, they also struggle like their male counterparts. However, to overcome the women economic set back, Empowerment Theory suggested that both genders need to be empowered by giving them equal treatment in terms of welfare services in the nation. This will encourage them to be involved in the decision-making process and policy implementation. To support the argument, a study by Rahman, Chaudhry, and Farooq (2018) pointed out that educating women is significance in poverty reduction. In this case government should provide all genders with free education, precisely to girls and children from poor background, and they should be given monthly stipend. This would encourage them to send their children to schools, especially the female’s ones.

Some social socio-cultural factors such as religion contribute in subjugating women from taking part in labour related matters especially in the Northern part of the nation. This has accounted for some of the strategies used in excluding women from the labour movement, precisely in the Northern part of the nation. However, the study showcased that in the Northern parts of Nigeria women are secluded and not allowed to participate in any public matters like labour movement. For instance, in the Northern part of the country, it is understood that an important factor inhibiting women's participation is the religion (purdah system i.e. house seclusion of women). This result contradicts the postulations of Liberal Feminist Theory that believes in gender parity among both genders.

It is observed that women cannot lead but to be led. This is because of some cultural provisions that are not in support of women to lead, and which subjugated them to subordinate position. People in the north believe that women position is at home to take care of the young ones and to prepare meals for the entire family. With these stereotyped roles, it is difficult for women to participate in labour unionism since they are restricted to the private sphere. Therefore, men do not see or accept women as leaders. Similarly, any woman who aspires to do those things that men do (unionism for instance) is seen as ‘’cultural or religion deviant.” Some women are seen by men as being assertive or outrageous.

The study pointed out that most of the Northern women are not educated. This put them at the subordinate position. Women also were subjugated to lower positions because of their low level of education. However, the percentage of educated women has increased in recent time in Northern parts of the country. In the past, people believed that women should be married at the earlier age to produce and raise children and take care of the husband, which is against the assumptions of Empowerment and Liberal Feminist Theories, which are concerned with gender equity among all sexes.

Participatory time constraints: The study noted that time is an important factor for women participation in NLC. So, the study found that most of the time allocated for the union meetings are not favourable to women. This is because of the nature of their dual responsibilities and marital duties that need ample time to execute them. This means most of the women’s time are assigned to domestic work. In most of the cases women have less time for the union activities. In addition, most of the union meetings are scheduled to hold in the night time, which is against the marital obligations and regulations, and against religions and cultural doctrines of the Northern region.

7.1 Mechanism and Strategies to Empower Women in the NLC
The study found that there are internal and external mechanisms to empower women in the NLC of the Northern and Southern regions. Under the internal mechanisms, education, women committee, women commission, motivation, and gender policies are some of the strategies and policies used in empowering women to participate actively in the union activities of the two regions under investigation. Here, the paper discussed the mechanisms, policies, and strategies to empower women to participate actively in the NLC of the Northern and Southern regions. Moreover, the study found that international agencies play an important role in empowering women in the NLC of both regions. These agencies include international labour organization, international conventions, and Geneva affirmative action among others. Women commission and women committee are constitutionally formed to
empower women in the NLC of both regions but are more effective in the Southern region because of exposure and education background.

Education is found to be one of the major mechanisms to empower women to participate actively in the labour movements of the Northern and Southern region. The study discovered that women in the Southern region were educated compared to their counterparts in the Northern region. This is because women in the south were exposed to Bible schools, Harmattan school, Rain school and Institute of Labour Law Management Relation, among others. However, it is observed that women in the Southern region were educated through the above-mentioned institutions. Because of this, the study found that the least among educated women in the Southern region is secondary school leaving certificate, unlike women in the Northern part that were marginalized to the domestic responsibilities at the household. This finding is in line with Empowerment Theory, which buttressed that both genders should have an equal access to welfare services such as education and health services.

Harmattan School is one of the mechanisms NLC put in place to empower women in the NLC of the Northern and Southern regions, though is more functional and effective in the Southern region. This is because women in the Northern region are being subjugated to domestic activities because of the patriarchal nature of the region that everything is managed and controlled by the men. Harmattan School is an institution where union members attend in order to acquire knowledge of labour activities.

Rain School was provided by the NLC as a strategy to empower their members on the labour movements. This School operates mostly from November to December annually. However, the institution is in the Southern region. That gave the Southern women ample opportunity to attend the school and take part vigorously in the labour unionism of the Southern regions. But women in the Northern regions find it difficult to attend because of remoteness, lack of interest, marital status, and pregnancy, among others.

The paper later disclosed that gender parity is necessary for attaining educational goals and objectives that will bring about maintainable development possible. Professionals detected that economic growth and education are the two key Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and the most significant for the remaining objectives to be accomplished. Recently, a report from the International Monetary Fund (IMF) notes the importance of gender fairness to economic development which is attained through investing in educational sector. This is because gender parity yields public-private returns, and backup both economic and social development. The development of international social justice and the human rights program, and their welfares extend to people, relations, groups, and humanity at large.

Workshops and Seminars are other strategies used in empowering women to participate actively in the labour movement of the Northern and Southern regions. The study noted that Southern women are actively participating in the NLC because of their education background and through workshops and seminars being organized by the NLC of the Southern region.

The Aba women riot of 1929 also encourages women to participate in the labour movement of the Southern region. When the Southern women watched the 1929 Aba riot movies organized by their fellow women on taxation policy, that gave them the courage and morale that women can do what the men are doing even better.

The study found that gender policies and strategies are what empower and encourage women to participate actively in NLC of the Northern and Southern regions of the country. This was explained by the participants at the interview session. They all revealed that education and gender equality among men and women in the society would encourage and empower women to actively participate in the labour movements of the Northern and Southern regions, and it will as well lead to economic and social development in the society.

It is understood that most of the women are not actively participating in the NLC because of poverty. The study found that women are low-income earners, which is why they are not competing with their male counterparts for a position in the NLC. But this is mostly found in the Northern region; women from the Southern region are well empowered, and they compete with the men for any position in the NLC of the region.

This coincided with the submissions of the Global Partnership for Education (2016) that gender-responsiveness must be the main precedence throughout the work of the Global Partnership for Education, given the massive joint
status of gender equality and education. As the international community has become gradually conscious, education plays an important role in understanding development to gender fairness for authorizing girls and boys with basic skills for work, increasing livelihood opportunities, influencing and autonomy, knowledge and skills for leadership capacities.

8. Limitation of the Study
The study has some limitations because the study focused only on two regions and precisely two states (Borno and Oyo) all in Nigeria, hence and certainly, a generalization cannot be ruled out. The qualitative method was limited to a sample of fourteen participants. Again, the participants did not cover all the thirty-six states of the country. However, this study does provide an in-depth understanding of certain localities and a certain type of people, in this context, women in NLC in the two regions (Borno and Oyo states).

9. Recommendation for Future Research
This research work recommends future research to broaden the body of knowledge in the literature of the position of women participation in the NLC. Subsequent research could explore other different unions or associations. The quantitative study could be conducted to enable researchers to drive generalization in some aspects relating to women participation and empowerment in NLC. A comparison will be much more meaningful if men are also incorporated as subjects of investigation.

10. Conclusion
The study concludes that the position of women participation in the NLC of the Northern region is low compared to the position of women participation in the NLC of the Southern region. This is so because several mechanisms and strategies were employed by the NLC of the Southern region in empowering women. This is because of their educational background and exposure compared to the women in the NLC of Northern regions most of whom are not educated and are being controlled by religious and cultural inclinations. The paper concludes that since NLC comprises both genders, women should equally participate in its decision making and implementation of policies in the NLC of both regions. It then concludes that women are underrepresented in the labour unionism of both Northern and Southern regions but is more pronounced in the NLC of the Northern region.

Finally, the study noted that women in the Southern region were empowered through different kinds of NLC programs, such as training like skills acquisition and capacity building that help in empowering them to participate actively in the labour activities movements. In this junction, it is discovered that women in the Southern region are more empowered than their Northern counterparts who are mostly restricted at home to look after the young ones and to prepare meals for the family. More so, the researcher, in addition to the above, completes that women in the Southern region were opportune to attend seminars and workshops in line with the NLC programs, to empower and encourage them to actively participate in the union activities of the Southern region.

11. Recommendations
The paper came up with the following recommendations:

- The government should establish and implement poverty alleviation programmes at all three tiers of government to empower women.
- The government should initiate women empowerment schemes that would empower women in all regions.
- A credit scheme should be established for women and it should be under the control of women organization.
- PDP policy that women will be refunded the money used in contesting elections should be implemented in the labour union. This policy should serve as a morale booster.
- Inverse marginalization of women is the finest process to improve the participation and empowerment of women in NLC. In this case, the government creates a strategy by allocating a free and mandatory seat to women. This would encourage them to take part in the NLC of both regions.
- Women issues and problems and ways to enhance them should be deliberated through women wing and should be used as the medium of discussing issues related to women in the NLC of both regions.
- All union meetings should be carried out in the daylight, not in the night time, and it should be in the union offices, not private housing. This is because many spouses would not permit their wives to attend any union meeting in private houses or in the night time.
- The government should help in educating women by giving them free education, especially in the Northern region where women are less educated and not adequately participating in the NLC of the region.
• Government and NLC should engage in enlightening women on the importance of their participation in the union activities in all regions.
• Religion and traditional rulers should discourage culture and traditional norms that sidelined women to domestic activities.
• Parents and spiritual leaders should help in enlightening women on the significance of women participation in NLC of both regions because they can represent the rights and interest of their female members in the labour unions.
• To encourage women to take part in the labour unionism, all parents and the community elders should assist in encouraging them on the necessity of women participation in the labour activities of both regions.
• To encourage women to participate actively in the labour activities of the Northern and Southern region, there is a need for proper and adequate orientation on the significance of women participation in NLC.
• NLC should establish Harmattan and Rain Schools across the nation to educate women on issues related to labour activities.

References
Wabba, A. (2017). Address of the President of Nigerian Labour Congress, to Opening Session of the 4th National Gender Conference of NLC,
Factors Affecting the Demand for Mountain Biking at Putrajaya Challenge Park, Putrajaya

1 Nur Syuhada Che Ibrahim, 2 Syamsul Herman Mohammad Afandi, 3 Zaiton Samdin

1 School of Social and Economic Development, University Malaysia Terengganu, Malaysia, nursyuhadacheibrahim@gmail.com
2 Institute of Tropical Forestry and Forest Products, Putra Infoport, Universiti Putra Malaysia, syamsulherman@gmail.com
3 Institute of Tropical Forestry and Forest Products, Putra Infoport, Universiti Putra Malaysia, zaisa@putra.upm.edu.my

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>History</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Revised format: May 2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Available Online: June 2019</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The popularity of Mountain Biking (MTB) in Malaysia is increasing. This adds to the demand for more cycling sites and special events for MTB. In line with the growing demand, the Malaysian government encourages participation in active sports and recreation as a healthy lifestyle. One of the approaches is through the establishment of the Putrajaya Challenge Park (PCP). This study is conducted at PCP, one of a well-known MTB site in Malaysia. It has a network of treks where these treks are rated with different difficulty levels for cyclists to choose from according to their ability and preferences. MTB is known to be associated with risks and high technical skills, hence it is of great interest to understand the factors affecting demand in such sport. Therefore, the purpose of this study is to determine the factors affecting the demand in MTB participation at PCP. Data was collected using a structured questionnaire and obtained a total of 302 usable questionnaires. A multiple linear regression analysis is employed and it is found that three factors were significant at 95% confidence level; total travel cost, years of participation and cost of equipment upgrades. The finding from the study is to supply PCP management with the information for future adventurous recreational events in PCP or in other similar establishments. This research also identifies some key findings and makes some recommendations for future research and management.

© 2019 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: nursyuhadacheibrahim@gmail.com


DOI: 10.26710/jbsee.v5i1.616

1. Introduction

Malaysia is experiencing an increasing participation in an adventurous recreational activity; Mountain Biking (MTB). For that reason, the Malaysian government encourages the participation in sports and recreation through the launching active sports-related programmes and also the development of appropriate facilities. MTB is a physically active and vigorous type of recreational activity and which suit to be categorised as adventurous recreational...
activity. Adventure recreation is a form of recreational activities that contain structural components of real or perceived danger and usually involve a natural environment setting in which the outcome is uncertain but influenced by the participant (Ewert and Hollenhorst, 1997). As for details, MTB can be described as cycling focusing primarily on off-road travel and it is an environmentally sustainable and quiet activity that gives the rider a physical and enjoyable outdoor experience (Mountain Bikers of Santa Cruz, 2007). The popularity of MTB has grown substantially over the last 25 years and continues to grow Chiu &Kriwoken (2003) and the growing popularity in such recreation has captured the government attention to establish a proper infrastructure to suit this type of activities. One of the developments is the Putrajaya Challenge Park (PCP), well-equipped for a number of popular extreme activities in the country that include Mountain Biking (MTB), Bicycle Motor Cross (BMX), Skate Boarding and Wall Climbing (WC). However, this study only focuses on MTB. Although MTB associated with risk, many people enjoy these unique activities to get the thrilling experience from the activity. While many take part in MTB to practice their skill, there are also individual who engaged in these activities for the purpose of exchanging techniques with others and for whatever reason, all of these are the benefit that a person might get upon engaging in recreational activity (Haskell, 1987; Gurin& Harris, 1985).

The recreational demand function for a particular site is a relationship between the number of trips taken by an individual in a given period of time and trip price (travel cost), site characteristics and personal preferences or characteristics (Chakraborty and Keith, 2000). This demand correlation has been used to forecast visitation rate to the site and to estimate social welfare associated with the site and/or changes in site characteristics (Chakraborty and Keith, 2000). Hence, in this study, the demand for MTB in PCP is specified by regressing the dependent variable (visits per year) and the identified exploratory variables.

2. Materials and Methods
This section deals with the methodology in the study that comprise of three sub sections.

2.1 Study Area
Putrajaya Challenge Park (PCP) offers customized facilities for extreme recreation in Malaysia. It was developed by Putrajaya Holdings with the cost of RM38 million and is currently operated by Putrajaya Corporation in collaboration with the Extreme Sports Association Malaysia (ESAM). PCP is well-equipped with facilities for adventure recreational activities particularly Mountain Biking (MTB). It covers an area of about 30.33 hectares and is located in Precint 5, Putrajaya. It has a network of MTB trails that passes through an oil palm and rubber plantation, secondary forests as well as bushes and grassy areas on hilly slopes.

2.2 Instruments
Instruments are essential in acquiring information, analyzing data and recording the findings and therefore are imperative in any research work (Sulaiman, 2004). In this study, questionnaire survey was used and the data for this research were obtained from a series of on-site surveys conducted at PCP. The target group for the survey was those who participate in MTB and likely to be using cycling treks and facilities at PCP. The survey was conducted by the researcher herself with the help of field assistants. Convenience sampling was applied and the sampling period was on Saturday and Sunday starting from 8.00 am to 3.00 pm. The total final count of the usable sample was 302. Data collected are analyzed using SPSS version 20.0.

2.3 Multiple Regression Analysis
Multiple linear regression analysis is applied to determine the factors influencing the demand in MTB. The functional model for this study is shown in Equation 1.

\[ V_{ij} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 T\text{TraCost} + \beta_2 \text{EquipCost} + \beta_3 \text{YearsParticipate} + \beta_4 \text{BenefitIndex} + \beta_5 \text{AltsiteCost} + \beta_6 \text{OnSiteTime} + \beta_7 \text{Age} + \beta_8 \text{Income} + \beta_9 \text{YearsEdu} + \epsilon_i \]

Equation 1

Where:
- \( V_{ij} \): Number of visits by individual \( i \) to site \( j \) in a year
- \( T\text{TraCost} \): Total Travel cost to the site including opportunity cost for travelling to PCP
- \( \text{EquipCost} \): Equipment upgrades cost (Ringgit Malaysia)
- \( \text{YearsParticipate} \): Years of participation in MTB (Years)
BenefitIndex : Mean score for benefit in MTB
AltsiteCost : Cost for travelling from home to alternative site for 2 ways(Ringgit Malaysia)
OnSiteTime : Time taken for MTB at PCP (Hours)
Age : Age of the respondent (Years)
MonthlyIncome : Income of respondent in a month (Ringgit Malaysia)
YearsEdu : Years of education of the respondent (Years)

3. Results and Discussions
This section discusses about the result for this paper. It consists of two parts; descriptive statistics of mountain bikers and factors affecting demand for MTB at PCP

3.1 Descriptive Statistics
Descriptive statistics of the variables used in this study in term of means, median, standard deviations (SD), minimum and maximum are presented in Table 1. The mean for visit per year is 16 times, suggesting high participation frequency in PCP. Similar findings were also observed in previous studies; Green (2003), Koepke (2005), and Reiter and Blahna (2002). The mean total travel cost is found to be RM65.90, which is relatively low. This is due to the fact that most of the participants come from areas near to the PCP (Table 2). Mean for years of participation in MTB is 29 months (equivalent to 2 years and 5 months) suggesting the participants are experienced cyclist. Mean alternative site cost is RM8.90 while for on-site time is RM3.60. The average age is found to be 31 years old. The average for monthly income is RM3329.80. Mean for years of education is 14 years indicating that most of the users are those receiving university or college education. According to Bammel (1982), education was one of the factors influencing people to take part in recreation. People with education are generally aware of the benefits upon participation in recreational activity. The mean cost of equipment upgrades is RM1635.80 which is relatively expensive for a recreation activity. Since many of MTB gears are imported and of high quality most of it, is generally expensive. Nevertheless, in spite of the high price, it is acceptable for many MTB cyclists due to its safety and comfort of the equipment.

Table 1: Descriptive statistics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Median</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>Minimum</th>
<th>Maximum</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Trip demand/year (Times)</td>
<td>16.00</td>
<td>8.00</td>
<td>32.00</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>365.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total travel cost (RM)</td>
<td>65.90</td>
<td>55.00</td>
<td>42.30</td>
<td>0.30</td>
<td>424.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Years of participation (months)</td>
<td>29.00</td>
<td>24.00</td>
<td>34.00</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>324.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternative site cost (RM)</td>
<td>8.90</td>
<td>7.25</td>
<td>7.60</td>
<td>0.30</td>
<td>48.45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On site time (Hours)</td>
<td>3.60</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td>1.30</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>8.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age (Years)</td>
<td>31.00</td>
<td>30.00</td>
<td>6.00</td>
<td>17.00</td>
<td>58.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monthly income (RM)</td>
<td>3329.80</td>
<td>3000.00</td>
<td>2202.30</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>12000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Years of education (Years)</td>
<td>14.00</td>
<td>14.00</td>
<td>2.79</td>
<td>6.00</td>
<td>19.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost of equipment upgrades (RM)</td>
<td>1635.80</td>
<td>1000.00</td>
<td>1933.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>9500.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Participants to PCP come from various place of origin. Table 2 shows that residents of Selangor form the largest percentage of participants to PCP (70.5%), followed by participants from Kuala Lumpur (14.6%) and those from Putrajaya (9.3%) while other states contributed smaller proportions of participants.

Table 2: Origin of the mountain bikers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State Of Origin</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>% Of Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Selangor</td>
<td>213</td>
<td>70.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kuala Lumpur</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>14.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Putrajaya</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>9.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negeri Sembilan</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>4.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melaka</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pahang</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Johor</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.2 Factors affecting Demand for MTB at PCP
Table 3 reports the result of multiple linear regression analysis. The determination coefficient, R2, measures the proportion of the variation in the dependent variable explained by the independent variables and is found to be 0.368 indicating that only 36.8% of the variation in the MTB participation in this study is explained by the independent variables. From this study, three factors are found to be significant at 95% confidence level. The variables are total travel cost, years of participation in MTB and equipment upgrades cost. The other variables include alternative site cost, on-site time, monthly income, age, years of education are found to be not significant. According to Gadja (2008), it has been observed that factors such as marital status, occupation and income do not have any influence on frequency of participation in mountain biking.

Total travel cost is found to be inversely related to the demand of MTB. This implies that frequency of participation increases with low expenses in travel cost. The coefficient of the variable (-0.071) indicates that 0.071 of the standard deviation in the frequency of participation (dependent variable) is expected to decrease when the total travel cost (independent variable) increases by one standard deviation while holding all the other independent variables constant. Lesser expenditure in travel cost indicates nearer place of origin to PCP. This means that those who lived nearer would have more MTB sessions in PCP than those who are living further. This is supported by the fact that majority of the participants lived in Selangor, a neighbouring state to Putrajaya.

Years of participation is found directly proportionate towards dependent variable as shown by positive coefficient. The coefficient of the variable (6.487) indicates that 6.487 of standard deviation in the demand in MTB are expected to increase when years of participation increases by one standard deviation while holding all the other independent variables constant. MTB involves technical riding skill which also correlates to experience level. In general, participants with higher skills are more likely to commit in such activities since they are more experienced and have more knowledge in controlling and minimising risk. Those who have involved in MTB longer relatively are more experienced that newer cyclist. Ewert and Hollenhurst (1989) indicated that commitment includes participant with high level of skills, experience and commitment to the activity as they were prepared to face considerable risks in an environment that was unpredictable.

The relationship between equipment upgrades cost with frequency participation is found to be directly proportional. The coefficient of the variable (0.002) indicates that 0.002 of the standard deviation in the frequency of MTB participation is expected to increase when equipment upgrades cost increases by one standard deviation while holding all the other independent variables constant. This result indicates that cyclist will increase their MTB activity when they have upgraded their cycling equipment. It is because new upgraded equipment would have better quality and more comfortable during cycling. It also shows that the willingness to invest more on equipments is the indicator of an increasing commitment in MTB with increasing experience level (Cessford, 1995).

Table 3: Multiple Regression Output

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>β</th>
<th>t-value</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Constant</td>
<td>2.356</td>
<td>0.775</td>
<td>0.439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Travel cost (Ringgit Malaysia)</td>
<td>-0.071</td>
<td>-2.017</td>
<td>0.045*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Years of participation in MTB (Years)</td>
<td>6.487</td>
<td>11.898</td>
<td>0.000*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost of equipment upgrades (Ringgit Malaysia)</td>
<td>0.002</td>
<td>2.424</td>
<td>0.016*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

R square, R² = 0.368, R = 0.606, F = 57.761
* Significant at 0.05 confidence level

4. Conclusion
This study is successful in determining the factors affecting the demand in MTB participation at PCP. In the study, people participation in MTB is determined by three factors; distance to PCP, experience level of cyclist and the quality of equipment. As PCP is located at residential area, the majority of user would be from the vicinity areas. The commitment of the cyclist is evidenced by the expenditure in upgrading, while experienced cyclist are more committed. These are the elements that can be considered by the management of PCP in relation to MTB.
Additional research is proposed to better understand the determinants of the demand in other adventure activities at PCP such as Skateboarding, Bicycle motor-cross and Wall climbing.

Acknowledgements
The authors would like to thank the research assistants who gathered and helped in data collection. This study was financed by a grant from Research University Grant Scheme (RUGS) Project Number 03-01-11-1158RU. All remaining errors and omissions in this paper are solely ours.

References
Goal-setting Theory (GST) and Gamification Relationship in Increasing Mobile Fitness Apps Engagement: A Conceptual Discussion

Pg Mohd Auza’e Pg Arshad, Rohaizat Baharun, Norzaidahwati Zaidin

Azman Hashim International Business School (AHIBS), Universiti Teknologi Malaysia

Article Details

Purpose: The main purpose of this paper is to propose a research model conceptual through the extension study of goal-setting theory (GST) and gamification on mobile fitness app user engagement among Malaysian millennial group. This paper is discussed the justification of goal-setting theory (GST) and gamification in supporting engagement relationships.

Methodology: This paper proposed a quantitative method in determine the relationship between independent and dependent variables of engagement behavior. It also used a cross-sectional design because the data will be collected in a short period of time.

Findings: The finding of this paper is expected to support the justification of goal-setting theory (GST) and gamification in explaining the user engagement relationship. It also enriches the knowledge of goal-setting theory (GST) and gamification in body of literature.

Practical Implication: A further studies should be given to the goal-setting theory (GST) and gamification in order to enhance the user engagement on mobile fitness app especially for Malaysian Millennial Group.

Social Implication: By studying goal-setting theory (GST) and gamification in mobile fitness app engagement context, it will promote a healthy and fitness lifestyle among Malaysian millennial group that also can contribute to healthy lifestyles practice in social community.

© 2019 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: auzae89@yahoo.com.my


DOI: 10.26710/jbsee.v5i1.548

1. Introduction

In the modern age, the advancement of mobile technology and application in mobile devices such as smartphones and PC tablets has given a great impact on society that changed the life of millions of people around the globe (Jusoh, 2017). Both academician and practitioner have found that mobile technology such as mobile application (mobile apps) offer a new method of conveying an intervention message to attract and motivate user to adopt health-conscious choices channel such as mobile fitness apps (Lim and Noh, 2017). Several mobile mobile fitness apps that
incorporate with several persuasive features have been introduced to the market in order to engage users to adopt mobile fitness apps which allow them to feel the physical exercise experience (Higgins, 2016).

In 2015, mobile health (m-health) apps category such as mobile fitness is one of the fastest growing categories and more than half of all mobile devices user mostly from smartphone user are downloaded mobile fitness for the purpose of improving their healthy life styles (Byun, Chiu and Bae, 2018). Krebs and Duncan (2015) concluded that 58% of smartphone users have downloaded at least one of mobile fitness onto their mobile devices. Due of the increasing demand of mobile fitness apps, several sports brand provider such as Nike and Adidas are developing their own mobile fitness for their customers (Gibbs and McLaren, 2017). The vast of mobile fitness apps on the market are more focusing on consumers and the advancement of mobile apps has encouraged practitioner to develop a mobile fitness apps which more focus on consumers’ requirement which contributed the growth of mobile fitness market today (Kai-Kao and Leibovitz, 2017). Smartphone based applications such as mobile fitness has offered a method for consumers which help them to monitor and motivate to engage in a healthy lifestyle (Sarcona et al., 2017).

Like other new technologies, mobile fitness apps developer faced the fundamental challenge in how to encourage user especially for new comers try out the apps with gamification concepts and engage to the apps once the using it (Lim and Young-Noh, 2017). For instance, gamified Nike mobile fitness apps faced the severe dissatisfaction and user disengaged because Nike removed some features of game mechanics such as badges in 2016 (Welch, 2016). In addition, the misjudgement from mobile fitness apps practitioner without considered the user opinion such as gamified experience can leads to the failure of engaging user (Wolf, Weiger and Hammerschmidt, 2018). Therefore, it is important for practitioner to understand how gamification is associated with mobile fitness apps and how gamified flow can nurture user to engage.

In academic research, given the recent development of mobile fitness app, formal literature which citing the gamification on mobile fitness apps remain limited. Although the gamification helps mobile fitness app developer to generate $ 2.8 billion dollar in industry but there is a little evidence in academic research and literature to support that gamification improved user engagement in mobile fitness app (Peterson, 2016). Review of past academic literature depicted that some of limitation about gamification effectiveness in improving mobile fitness apps user engagement behavior. Therefore, the information above leads to shed light on the research problems and shown the opportunity for conducting the research which discussed in the next session.

2. Problem Statement

The understanding of impact on the user engagement on mobile fitness app is one of the fundamental elements towards on the performance of mobile fitness app. Mobile fitness app developer face the fundamental challenge on how to make people to try out the mobile fitness app and engage once they start using it (Lim and Young-Noh, 2017). In order to increase the engagement of the mobile fitness app, the group of researchers have emphasized the importance of gamification study in mobile fitness app while performing physical and fitness activities (Thomson, Nash and Maeder, 2016; Hermsen et al., 2016). This feature has been successfully used in the popular mobile fitness app such as Wii Fit that improved user engagement in physical activity (Chao, Scherer, Wu, Lucke and Montgomery, 2013).

Since the ultimate objective of gamification is to improved user engagement behavior through the application of game design and element in non-game context, scholars have argued and criticise the notion of gamification. Burke (2014) argued that the purpose of gamification is to change the behavior such as improve engagement but it is more on to develop the skills and drive innovation among user. Robson et al. (2016) supported this notion and proposed that gamification can be only defined as user engagement through the application of game design and game mechanics principles in non-game context with user self-development skills.

Theoretically, there had been variety of engagement theory and model used by scholars to cater the engagement behavior in mobile fitness app. Engagement variables are studied in mobile fitness app to analyzed individual reactions to different initiatives. Some of scholars proposed to study game design and game mechanics known as gamification in explaining the engagement behavior (Hofacker et al., 2016). However, most of gamification study are limited and focused on education context only and there is a lack of theoretical connection which causes the shortcomings in explaining the engagement behavior (Bui et al., 2015; Berkling and Thomas, 2013).
Only few of scholars investigated the application of gamification as an antecedent in explaining the engagement behavior on mobile fitness app context (Goodwin and Ramajaun, 2017; Chen and Pu, 2014) and the extension study of goal-setting theory and gamification in mobile fitness app (Lim and Noh, 2017; Arraya et al., 2015), which cannot truly represent the user engagement explanation on mobile fitness app context. The reviews of the existing literature of goal-setting theory research revealed that most of scholars extend goal-setting theory on organisational engagement context (Bipp and Kleingeld, 2017; Smith et al., 2017).

Thus, to fill of the research gap as mentioned on above of the discussion, this research seems to proposed a comprehensive research framework by including all potential variables of goal-setting theory and gamification that may influence individual to engage in new technology and the mobile fitness app.

3. Literature Review

3.1 Engagement Behavior

Engagement relationships has been attracting among practitioners as well as academician in recent years. The technological innovation in mobile devices increasingly required practitioners to engage their customers at all possible touch points (Islam and Rahman, 2016). Engagement relationships can be defined as the approach to create, build and enhance individual relationships (Brodie et al., 2013) and as an imperative strategy to build a sustainable competitive advantage (Brodie et al., 2013; Van Doorn et al., 2010). Browden (2009) proposed that engagement views as a psychological process which involved cognitive and emotional aspects. He illustrates that engagement as an interactive process on commencing with satisfaction and as the part of culminating loyalty where the transitional pathway to loyalty captures the calculative, affective commitment, trust, involvement and customer delight. However, Van Doorn et al. (2010) argued that engagement is a primarily behaviors to the specific customer activity based on types or patterns. Based on these two arguments, it shows that the engagement conceptualization is still on the mixed opinions which required to extend the engagement concepts.

A number of scholars have considered the consequences of engagement which included the concept of perceived value (Kim, Kim and Wachter, 2013), satisfaction (Hapsari, Clemes and Dean, 2017; Khan, Rahman and Fatma, 2016; Kim, Kim and Wachter, 2013), brand image (Hapsari, Clemes and Dean, 2017; Greve et al., 2014) and time convenience and interactivity (Kim and Baek, 2017). Among the number of the engagement consequences, not many scholars extend the study of gamification constructs as the consequences of user engagement in academic literature and research although scholars have provided the details on how gamification could conceptualize the user engagement in mobile application such as mobile fitness app (Hofacker et al., 2016). Thus, the engagement studies in information technology has faced the issues and challenge to convince the fact that user would engage and accept information technology and application. Therefore, this study extends the understanding of engagement conceptualization by focusing on mobile fitness apps engagement because this app is related on user engagement behavior.

3.2 Gamification

The development and innovation of multiple technology application with features games has brought the new trend known as gamification. It has become a fast- emerging business practices in worldwide industry (Yang, Asaad and Dwivedi, 2017). The term of gamification initially introduced by Nick Pelling in 2002 and it started gain the popularity in information systems (IS) academics around 2010 (Liu, Santhanam and Webster, 2017). The co-author of “Game Based Marketing” books Gabe Zichermann defined gamification as “the art of turning your customer’s daily interaction into gaming experience that serve the business purposes” (Zichermann and Liner, 2010).

Based on insights from the group of scholars and extensive literature review on gamification concepts, the group of scholars extended gamification definition in different contexts. Early scholar such as Deterding et al. (2011) defined gamification concepts as the practice of applying game elements such as gamefulness, gameful interactions and gameful design with a specific intention in mind. Werbach and Hunter (2011) improved the conceptual definition of gamification concept as the application of game elements and design principle into non-game context in order to create engagement relationship among users.

Hofacker et al. (2016) suggested that gamification should be studied by looking human behavior psychology perspectives because it considered as an external motivator that appeal human to act through game design and mechanics experience. They defined it as the practice of game elements and principles in non-game design context such as human psychology behavior and reaction through enhancement of the consumer value and encouraging
value creation of behavioral psychology outcomes such as engagement, greater loyalty or product advocacy. Therefore, it is crucial to extend the studies on gamification and how gameful elements motivate user to perform desired activities which interpret the behavioral such as engagement.

Although gamification positively enhance the engagement and acceptance behavior but some of scholars found that there is an issue that occurred on the study of gamification constructs such as lack of research context (Sanmugam et al., 2014) and small sample size (Hamzah et al., 2015). Therefore, it is important to extend the study of gamification constructs in different context for better justification (e.g., Khaleel et al., 2016; Hong and Masood, 2014). From researcher knowledge, there is no scholars extend the study of gamification in different context such as mobile fitness app because it is also related with the engagement behavior as suggested by scholars (Seman and Ramayah, 2017). Hence, the paper aims to filling this gap by studying the gamification relationship with engagement behavior in mobile fitness app context.

3.3 Goal-Setting Theory (GST)
Goal-setting theory is originally introduced by Locke (1968) who proposed that the individual desired behavior is achieved when the specific goals is clear. It has been applied for decades among scholars because it helps to explain the individual motivation to perform better in related tasks and performance which related in many contexts through the setting and monitoring goals (Locke and Latham, 2002). This theory is developed based on the findings from various empirical studies which posited that user behavior is directly related to the individual’s goals for pursuing with the relevant content (the object of an action) and the intensity (the amount of effort to achieve the goal) (Locke and Latham, 2002).

Goal setting theory theorized that goal core as the immediate regulators of individual behavior and the standard used to evaluate the task performance (Kylo and Landers, 1995; Locke and Latham, 1984). Goal core identify as the specific, measurable and commitment as the major inputs that provide an external referent such as time, space or increment to track the progress of goal achievement that reduce the ambiguity that allow to focus on precise action and behavior that related to goal achievement (Miner, 2003; Locke and Latham, 1990). Locke and Latham (2002) concluded that the more specific, measurable and higher commitment set by individual or organization, the more explicitly performance would be affected and lead them to achieve the target goals.

Based on research notes by Locke and Latham (2006) on goal-setting theory application, they recommended that goal-setting theory should be extend by scholars by looking an individual behavior such as engagement from different context instead of organization. Mento, Steel and Karen (1987) furthered the goal-setting theory in organizational setting and obtained the conclusion that there is a positive relationship between goal core and goal mechanism which increased their task performance that are most worthy of serious consideration. DeWalt et al. (2009) found that there is a direct correlation between those who achieved the set of goal core would motivate to create additional strategy or add more mechanism to the task performance based on feedback. Parker, Jimmieson and Amiot (2009) found that autonomy as goal mechanism improved their self-efficacy which improved their task performance towards reaching the goals. Thus, the idea and concepts of goal-setting theory helps to motivate and teams to perform better and engage more in different context (Sorrentino, 2006).

This research lends an additional support from goal-setting theory to the research model and previous body of research suggests that most of gamification design and methods are include some way of goals setting at both the organizational level as well as the individual level (e.g., Morschheuser et al., 2017; Mo-ra et al., 2017). For instance, Jacobs (2013) examined the gamification implementation by looking individual perspectives in organizations and it noted that goals as the center of the model but it does not investigate the relationship between gamification and goal-setting theory. Based on research notes by Locke and Latham (2006) on goal-setting theory application, they recommended that goal-setting theory should be extend by scholars by looking an individual behavior such as engagement from different context instead of organization such as mobile fitness app. Thus, this study will look the extension of goal-setting theory in explaining an individual goal on engagement behavior in mobile fitness app context.

4. Underpinning Theory
4.1 Self-Determination Theory (SDT)
Self-Determination theory (SDT) (Deci and Ryan, 1985;2002) is one of the general theories of motivation that systematically support the dynamics of human needs, motivation and well-being within the immediate social
context. This theory proposed that humans’ have three universal and basic needs such as autonomy (have a sense of control and agency), competency (feeling competent with tasks and activities) and relatedness (feeling included or affiliated with others) that required an individual’s experience that elaborated sense of self and achieve a better psychological well-being through the satisfaction of the three basic needs (Deci and Ryan, 1985).

Instead of supporting the dynamics of human needs, Self-Determination theory (SDT) explained on how human achieve their goals or perform activities based on their psychological or cognitive responses which constitute the different form of motivation on a continuum (Deci and Ryan, 1991). This theory also posited that intrinsically motivated people who have the highest level of self-determination that undertaking behaviors for reasons of interest and inherent satisfaction. In addition, there is the existence of extrinsic motivation that also regulate the behavior such as external (controlled), introjected (to avoid guilt or shame), identified (personally endorsed) and integrated regulation (congruent with values, goals and needs that are part of self) (Ryan and Deci, 2000).

Previous research identified that the constructs of Self-Determination theory (SDT) were good predictor and support the justification of human actual behavior such as engagement (Weinstein and Ryan, 2010; Hagger and Chatzisarantis, 2009; Ryan and Deci, 2006; Ryan, Rigby and Przybylski, 2006). In addition, the research that used Self-Determination theory as underpinning theory have supported the justification in explained the frequently practiced goal-directed behaviours (Hagger and Chatzisarantis, 2009; Hagger, Chatzisarantis and Harris, 2006). There is also an extensive evidence that Self-Determination theory (SDT) supported the justification of indirect effect on target behavior through the intervene variable role (Hagger and Chatzisarantis, 2009; Standage, Duda and Ntoumanis, 2003; Hagger et al., 2002) as well as supported the justification of direct effect on behavior (Lavergne et al., 2010; Sheldon et al., 2003; Green-Demers, Pelletier and Menard, 1997; Grolnick and Ryan, 1987). In this study, Self-Determination theory (SDT) in supporting the justification of goal-setting theory and gamification in mobile fitness app engagement.

5. Research Model Framework
The research model framework for this study is designed as below:

Figure 1: A Proposed of Research Model Framework

6. List of Propositions
Although there are a lot of antecedents and factors that have been identified as important determinant of an individual engagement, this paper aims to achieve the objective as to provide the explanation of gamification and goal-setting theory in mobile fitness app user engagement. Thus, the hypotheses are proposed as follows:

H1: Goal core positively related with Engagement
H2: Goal core positively related with Goal Mechanism
H3: Goal core positively related with Gamification
H4: Goal Mechanism positively related with Engagement
H5: Gamification positively related with Engagement
7. Methodology
This study proposed a quantitative approach. It is a hypothetical deductive research design because it is aimed to generate the knowledge and identifying the relationship between the independent and dependent variables of engagement. Cross-sectional design is applied because the data collection will be conducted in a short period of time. Convenience and purposive sampling are being used to select Malaysian millennial group who used mobile fitness app and joining the fitness training in Klang Valley area. The reason of selected Malaysian millennial as the target of respondents because they are major mobile fitness app user (Archana and Heejin, 2008) and highest number of mobile fitness app downloder (Robinson, 2006). A total of 400 questionnaires will be distributed among them.

8. Implication and Recommendation For Future Research
The extension study of goal-setting theory (GST) and gamification in mobile fitness app can encourage a fitness and healthy lifestyles which can reflect the daily lifestyles of millennial group. The knowledge of this paper is expected to provide the recommendation on engagement knowledge for fitness instructors and fitness centre who are wished to extend their fitness market strategy in mobile application. Furthermore, the results on this research is expected to be useful for game designer in develop the application of gamification in persuade the potential user to engage. It also contributes a wider understanding of mobile fitness app developer especially on how to encourage mobile fitness app users to engage and avoid the abandonment in future. Moreover, it provides effective guidance for mobile health and service marketing industry in developing engagement strategic plans to promote fitness lifestyles by including gamification role in mobile fitness app in future.

This study should extend the discussion on how the application of goal-setting theory and gamification towards the engagement behavior in mobile fitness app. Future research is recommend to investigate on the relationship of engagement behavior from goal-setting theory and gamification in various research context to gain in-depth knowledge about the engagement behavior.

9. Conclusion
There are rising number of researches of engagement in mobile healthcare application such as mobile fitness apps. In same vein, the application of goal-setting theory (GST) and gamification have been extended by the group of scholars by looking in engagement behavior in various of research context. However, most of the application of goal-setting theory are being conducted in organizational settings while gamification in education engagement. Surprisingly, there is a dearth of goal-setting theory and gamification study in engagement behavior in academic research. Hence, it is advisable for future research to extend this study of goal-setting theory and gamification in order to look the engagement in mobile application such as mobile fitness app.

This research is worthwhile to be extend because the results of this research can contribute the body of knowledge in engagement research especially in individual engagement justification in mobile application such as mobile fitness app. It also helps mobile fitness app practitioner and developer in increasing the user engagement on their apps through the understanding of goal-setting theory (GST) and gamification research. More research on the extension of goal-setting theory (GST) and gamification especially on the engagement of mobile fitness app are encouraged since there is a limitation of this research.

REFERENCES
Berkling, K., and Thomas, C. (2013). Gamification of a Software Engineering course and a detailed analysis of the factors that lead to its failure. In Interactive Collaborative Learning (ICL), 2013 International Conference on. 525-530. IEEE.


Using constructs from self-determination and achievement goal theories to predict physical activity intentions. Journal of Educational Psychology, 95(1), 97.


The Behavior of Using Simcard in Indonesia Border Area

Ray Sastri, Arbi Setiyawan, Setia Permana, Heny Wulandari

STIS Polytechnic of Statistics, Indonesia: rasesatri@stis.ac.id
National Statistics Training Centre, Indonesia.
Statistics Indonesia.

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

Digital life exists in the border area. The cellphone is a part of daily life. Signals from many telecommunication service providers, both Indonesia and foreign, are captured. The problem is when foreign signals captured, then the roaming rate charged. Some people avoid it by switching their simcard to a local simcard. Some people in border area using local simcard (from Indonesian service providers) some use foreign simcard, and other use mixed of them (local and foreign). Knowing about border crosser behavior in using simcard is important not only for the telecommunication service provider but also for the government. The study aims to estimate the number of border crosser based on their behavior in using simcards when entering Indonesia. This study uses data from Survey of Foreign Tourist Based on Mobile Positioning Data conducted by Statistics Indonesia in 2017. Based on that survey, there were 28.305 of border crosser having cellphones. The method of analysis is multinomial logistic regression. The response variable is the behavior of using simcard with 3 categories; foreign, local, and mixed. The model fit the data well. The result show that 53.8 percent of border crosser are foreigners most of the them entering Indonesia through Kalimantan. The use of simcard in the boundaries area is significantly influenced by sex, age, purpose to visit Indonesia, and region. There are 7.3 percent of foreigner use mixed cards and only 1.4 percent use local cards. For border crossers from Indonesia, there is 99.7 percent use local cards while the other 0.3 percent use mixed cards and no one uses foreign cards.

© 2019 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: rasesatri@stis.ac.id


DOI: 10.26710/jbsee.v5i1.727

1. Introduction

The general entrance to a country such as at an airport, port, or land border usually have an immigration checking process. In Indonesia, many traditional border gates have no immigration checking process. These gates are located in seven provinces; West Kalimantan,
East Kalimantan, Papua, East Nusa Tenggara, Riau, Riau Island, and North Sulawesi. They are usually used by locals or resident from neighbor countries that live not far from the border line.

Like other area, digital life also exist in border area. The cellphone is a part of daily life. Signals from many telecommunication service providers, both Indonesia and foreign, are captured. The problem is when foreign signals captured, then the roaming rate charged. Some people avoid it by switching their simcard to local simcard. Some people in border area using local simcard (from Indonesian service providers) some use foreign simcard, and other use mixed of them (local and foreign). Knowing about border crosser behavior in using simcard is important not only for the telecommunication service provider but also for the government. For the service provider, they can improve their service. For Indonesia government, they will get additional information to improve their foreign tourist data.

There has no study about using simcard behavior and its relationship with user characteristics, especially in Indonesian traditional border area. It is due to the location. Almost all of the traditional border gates are located in remote area. It was very difficult to get the data until Statistics Indonesia conducted a Survey of Foreign Tourist Based on Mobile Positioning Data in 2017. From this survey, we get much information about characteristics of border crosser. Mburu and (2012) were about consumer in their simcard. The study was done in Botswana and the result showed that the propensity in switching is influenced by a variety of factors. Some are network rollout, quality service, cost of calling, completion, network failures, and policy. They also concluded that the propensity in switching is different between males and female.

The aim of this study is (1) to analyze the characteristics of border crosser (2) to analyze the effect of the border crosser characteristics to the behavior in using simcard (3) to estimate the number of border crosser based on their behavior in using simcards when entering Indonesia.

2. Research Methodology
This study uses data from Survey of Foreign Tourist Based on Mobile Positioning Data conducted by Statistics Indonesia in 2017. Data collection was carried out by interview using a questionnaire in all traditional border gate around Indonesia. Respondents in this survey included all people entering Indonesian territory both Indonesian resident and foreign residents. Based on that survey, 32,316 people crossed the border line and 28,305 of them have cellphones. The unit of analysis in this study is border crossers who have cellphones.

The method of analysis is multinomial logistic regression. The responses variable (Y) have 3 categories, so that we will form 2 logit model with the last category become the reference. The general model of the multinomial logistic regression model as follows:

\[ g_1(x) = \ln \left( \frac{P(Y = 1|x)}{P(Y = 3|x)} \right) = \beta_{10} + \beta_{11}x_1 + \cdots + \beta_{1p}x_p \]  \hspace{1cm} (1)

\[ g_2(x) = \ln \left( \frac{P(Y = 2|x)}{P(Y = 3|x)} \right) = \beta_{20} + \beta_{21}x_1 + \cdots + \beta_{2p}x_p \]  \hspace{1cm} (2)

Y is the responses variable, \( \beta \) is the parameter, and X is the explanatory variable. The parameter \( \beta \) measure the relationship between explanatory variable and responses variable. It is estimated using Maximum Likelihood Estimation (MLE). The general form of conditional likelihood with n independent observations is as follows:

\[ L(\beta) = \prod_{i=1}^{n} \left[ \pi_0(x_i)^{y_{i0}}\pi_1(x_i)^{y_{i1}}\pi_2(x_i)^{y_{i2}} \right] \]

Parameter estimation (\( \hat{\beta} \)) is obtained when the \( L(\beta) \) function maximum. \( \hat{\beta} \) are obtained through Newton Raphson's iteration method (Hosmer and Lemeshow, 2000).

Goodness of fit test of the model is done by the Pearson Chi-Square (Agresti, 2002) with the null hypothesis is the model fit the data well. The test statistics is:
\[ X^2 = \sum_{j} \left( \frac{n_j - \mu_j}{\mu_j} \right)^2 \sim \chi^2_{(p-1)} \]

With \( j \) is index for category of \( Y \), \( n_j \) is the observation frequency, \( \mu_j \) is the expected frequency. The null hypothesis is rejected if \( X^2 \geq \chi^2_{(\alpha; p-1)} \).

Testing the parameter simultaneously is used to see the effect of all explanatory variables on the response variables in logistic regression. The null hypothesis used is that there is no effect of the explanatory variable on the response variable against the alternative hypothesis there is at least one explanatory variable that affects the response variable. The test statistics is:

\[ G = -2 \ln \left( \frac{\text{Likelihood null model}}{\text{Likelihood conditional model}} \right) \sim \chi^2_{(p)} \]

The null hypothesis will be rejected if \( G \geq \chi^2_{(\alpha; p)} \) or \( p \)-value \( \leq \alpha \).

Parameter partial test is done by Wald test. The null hypothesis is no effect of the \( k \)-th explanatory variable on the response variable in the model \( j \). The alternative hypothesis is the \( k \)-th explanatory variable affect the response variable in the model \( j \).

The test statistics is:

\[ W_{jk} = \left( \frac{\hat{\beta}_{jk}}{\text{se}(\hat{\beta}_{jk})} \right)^2 \sim \chi^2_{(1)} \]

We will reject the null hypothesis if \( W_{jk} \geq \chi^2_{(1; \alpha)} \) or \( p \)-value \( \leq \alpha \).

The interpretation of the multinomial logistic regression model is done by odds ratio. In models with three categories of response variables, odds ratios are calculated for the comparison between response variable in category 1 and response variable in category 3, and between response variable in category 2 and response variable in category 3. For example:

\[ \text{OR}_1 = \frac{\exp(\beta_{10} + \beta_{11}(1) + \beta_{12}(0) + \cdots + \beta_{1p}(0))}{\exp(\beta_{10} + \beta_{11}(0) + \beta_{12}(0) + \cdots + \beta_{1p}(0))} = e^{\beta_{11}} \]

\[ \text{OR}_2 = \frac{\exp(\beta_{20} + \beta_{21}(1) + \beta_{22}(0) + \cdots + \beta_{2p}(0))}{\exp(\beta_{20} + \beta_{21}(0) + \beta_{22}(0) + \cdots + \beta_{2p}(0))} = e^{\beta_{21}} \]

Or it can be written succinctly as \( \text{OR}_1 = e^{\beta_{11}} \) dan \( \text{OR}_2 = e^{\beta_{21}} \).

Variable used in the study can be seen in Table 1.
Table 1. Variables Used in This Research

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>VARIABLE</th>
<th>TYPE</th>
<th>CATEGORY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RESPONSE VARIABLE</td>
<td>SIMCARD</td>
<td>CATEGORICAL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Answer Variable</td>
<td></td>
<td>1: LOCAL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2: MIXED</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3: FOREIGN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EXPLANATORY VARIABLE</td>
<td>SEX</td>
<td>CATEGORICAL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purpose of Visit to Indonesia</td>
<td></td>
<td>1: MALE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2: FEMALE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purpose of Visit to Indonesia</td>
<td>AGE GROUP</td>
<td>CATEGORICAL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1: &lt;30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2: 30-39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3: 40-49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4: &gt;49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purpose of Visit to Indonesia</td>
<td>PURPOSE OF VISIT</td>
<td>CATEGORICAL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TO INDONESIA</td>
<td>1: HOLIDAYS (HOLIDAYS, HEALTH, &amp; BEAUTY)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2: VISITING RELATIVES (VISITING FRIENDS / RELATIVES, RELIGY CEREMONY / ZIARAH)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3: JOB AFFAIRS (BUSINESS / BUSINESS, SERVICE, MICE / MEETING, EDUCATION / TRAINING, OR SPORT MISSION / CULTURE)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4: OTHERS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purpose of Visit to Indonesia</td>
<td>MAIN JOB</td>
<td>CATEGORICAL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1: PROFESSIONAL / BUSINESS ACTORS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2: GOVERNMENT OFFICERS/ MILITARY / PENSIONARY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3: PRIVATE EMPLOYEES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4: OTHERS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purpose of Visit to Indonesia</td>
<td>REGION</td>
<td>CATEGORICAL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1: RIAU &amp; KEPRI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purpose of Visit to Indonesia</td>
<td></td>
<td>2: KALIMANTAN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3: OTHERS</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. Result

During the survey period, the largest number of border crossers was in West Kalimantan, (51 percent), followed by East Nusa Tenggara (18 percent) and Riau (17 percent). The lowest number was in North Sulawesi, (1 percent). West Kalimantan and East Nusa Tenggara can be entered by road, so that easier for someone to cross the border.

Not all of border crossers are foreigners. About 53.8 percent of them are foreigners and 46.2 percent are Indonesians. However, all of border crossers in the Keerom, Papua, are foreigners. In Bengkalis, Riau, It is about 99.58 percent foreigners but all border crosser in Rokan Hilir are Indonesians. The percentage of border crossers according to residence can be seen in Figure 2.

Even though cellphone is very important today, not all of the border crosser use cellphones. Only 87.59 percent of them use cellphones. In North Sulawesi, only 45.43 percent of border crossers use cellphones while in Papua only 47.44 percent. Figure 3 shows the highest cellphone use is in Riau, 98.05 percent.
The use of cellphone is always followed by the use of simcard. About 10.03 percent of foreigners use local simcard and 16.69 percent use mixed simcard. Indonesian resident whose back to their home are 71.17 use local simcard, 21.01 percent use foreign simcard that they brought from neighbor countries, and 7.82 percent used mixed simcard.
Most of Indonesian pass traditional border gate to back home after some activities in neighbor country. Whereas, most of the foreigners come to visit their relatives. People living near border areas usually have relatives that live not far from their place but in Indonesian territory. For all of the purpose to visit Indonesia, most number of them use foreign simcard. Table 3 shows that a foreigner tend to use mixed simcard than switching all of their card to local.

### Table 3. Use of Cards in Border Areas Based on the Purpose of Visiting Indonesia

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PURPOSE</th>
<th>SIMCARD</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>LOCAL</td>
<td>MIXED</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1: HOLIDAYS</td>
<td>1.24</td>
<td>1.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2: VISITING RELATIVES</td>
<td>6.64</td>
<td>10.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3: JOB AFFAIRS</td>
<td>1.42</td>
<td>3.31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4: OTHERS</td>
<td>0.73</td>
<td>1.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>10.03</td>
<td>16.69</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sex, age, purpose of visit, main job, and region are simultaneously affect the use of simcards of foreigners when entering Indonesian territory through traditional border gate. Foreign men and age under 50 tend to use local simcard. But those visit Indonesia for holiday, main job "other", and cross the border line via Kalimantan are tend to use foreign simcard. For Indonesian, male, age under 50, private employees, and visit Indonesia through Kalimantan are tend to use foreign simcard. Estimation of parameter is completely in Table 4 and Table 5. By region, foreigners entering Indonesia through border gate in Kalimantan are tend to use foreign cards while those who enter Riau and Riau Islands tend to use local cards. Overall, Indonesian people tend to use foreign cards when passing Kalimantan. Whereas for regions other than Kalimantan, Indonesians tend to keep using local cards when crossing the border line.
### Table 4. Estimation of Parameters of Multinomial Logistic Regression Models for Foreign Border Crossers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SIMCARD</th>
<th>EXPLANATORY VARIABLES</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
<th>Exp(B)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LOCAL</td>
<td>Intercept</td>
<td>-3.626</td>
<td>.151</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>1.506</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[SEX: MALE]</td>
<td>.410</td>
<td>.069</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>1.506</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[SEX: FEMALE]</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>.</td>
<td>.</td>
<td>.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[AGE GROUP:1]</td>
<td>1.237</td>
<td>.111</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>3.445</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[AGE GROUP:2]</td>
<td>1.163</td>
<td>.108</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>3.201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[AGE GROUP:3]</td>
<td>.960</td>
<td>.112</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>2.612</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[AGE GROUP:4]</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>.</td>
<td>.</td>
<td>.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[PURPOSE: HOLIDAY]</td>
<td>-.268</td>
<td>.134</td>
<td>.046</td>
<td>.765</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[PURPOSE: VISIT RELATIVES]</td>
<td>1.247</td>
<td>.110</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>3.481</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[PURPOSE: JOB AFFAIRS]</td>
<td>1.411</td>
<td>.131</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>4.100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[PURPOSE: OTHERS]</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>.</td>
<td>.</td>
<td>.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[MAIN JOB:1]</td>
<td>-.577</td>
<td>.137</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.562</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[MAIN JOB:2]</td>
<td>-1.632</td>
<td>.157</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[MAIN JOB:3]</td>
<td>-.587</td>
<td>.072</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.556</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[MAIN JOB:4]</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>.</td>
<td>.</td>
<td>.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[REGION:1]</td>
<td>1.029</td>
<td>.074</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>2.798</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[REGION:2]</td>
<td>-1.477</td>
<td>.095</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[REGION:3]</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>.</td>
<td>.</td>
<td>.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MIXED</td>
<td>Intercept</td>
<td>-2.416</td>
<td>.112</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[SEX: MALE]</td>
<td>.401</td>
<td>.057</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>1.493</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[SEX: FEMALE]</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>.</td>
<td>.</td>
<td>.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[AGE GROUP:1]</td>
<td>.828</td>
<td>.091</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>2.288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[AGE GROUP:2]</td>
<td>.916</td>
<td>.087</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>2.500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[AGE GROUP:3]</td>
<td>.917</td>
<td>.088</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>2.501</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[AGE GROUP:4]</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>.</td>
<td>.</td>
<td>.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[PURPOSE: HOLIDAY]</td>
<td>-.942</td>
<td>.107</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.390</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[PURPOSE: VISIT RELATIVES]</td>
<td>.923</td>
<td>.078</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>2.517</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[PURPOSE: JOB AFFAIRS]</td>
<td>1.258</td>
<td>.093</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>3.520</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[PURPOSE: OTHERS]</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>.</td>
<td>.</td>
<td>.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[MAIN JOB:1]</td>
<td>-.564</td>
<td>.115</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.569</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[MAIN JOB:2]</td>
<td>-1.020</td>
<td>.101</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[MAIN JOB:3]</td>
<td>-.324</td>
<td>.059</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.723</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[MAIN JOB:4]</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>.</td>
<td>.</td>
<td>.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[REGION:1]</td>
<td>.444</td>
<td>.061</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>1.560</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[REGION:2]</td>
<td>-1.552</td>
<td>.070</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[REGION:3]</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>.</td>
<td>.</td>
<td>.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 5. Estimation of Parameters of Multinomial Logistic Regression Models for Indonesian Boundaries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SIMCARD</th>
<th>EXPLANATORY VARIABLES</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
<th>Odds Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MIXED</td>
<td>Intercept</td>
<td>-1.866</td>
<td>.130</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>1.731</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[SEX: MALE]</td>
<td>.549</td>
<td>.079</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>1.731</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 6. Results of Predictions of Multinomial Logistic Regression Models for Foreign Border Crossers and Indonesia

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OBSERVATION</th>
<th>PREDICTED</th>
<th>FOREIGN</th>
<th>INDONESIA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>LOCAL</td>
<td>MIXED</td>
<td>FOREIGN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LOCAL</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>377</td>
<td>1075</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MIXED</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>483</td>
<td>1923</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FOREIGN</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>234</td>
<td>10710</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Percentage</td>
<td>1,4%</td>
<td>7,3%</td>
<td>91,3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on the model, we get the prediction in Table 6. Multinomial logistic regression models for foreign border crossers have an overall accuracy 75,0 percent while 70,8 percent for Indonesian. Overall, foreigners entering Indonesian territory through traditional crossing 91,3 percent use foreign cards, 7,3 percent use mixed cards and only 1,4 percent use local simcard. For border crossers from Indonesia, according to the model, 99,7 percent use local cards while the other 0,3 percent use mixed cards and no one uses a foreign card.
4. Conclusion
About 53.8 percent of border crossers are foreigners most of them entering Indonesia through Kalimantan. The use of simcard in the boundaries area is significantly influenced by sex, age, purpose to visit Indonesia, and region. According to the model, the prediction of a foreigner entering Indonesian territory through traditional border gate is 91.3 percent use foreign cards, the remaining 7.3 percent use mixed cards and only 1.4 percent use local cards. For border crossers from Indonesia, according to the model, 99.7 percent use local cards while the other 0.3 percent use mixed cards and no one uses foreign cards.

Reference
Psychosocial Adjustment Among Abused Children in Residential Care

1 Ropizah Rohani, 2 Zakiyah Jamaluddin, 3 Abd Razak Abd Manaf

1 Awang Had Salleh Graduate School of Social Development, Universiti Utara Malaysia, Email adress: ainulomeimama@gmail.com
2 Lecturer, School of Social Development, Universiti Utara Malaysia, Email adress: zakiyah@uum.edu.my
3 Lecturer, School of Social Development, Universiti Utara Malaysia, Email adress: a.razak@uum.edu.my

Purpose: The purpose of this paper is to propose a conceptual framework on the key determinant of psychosocial adjustments in terms of behavior, social, emotion and mental health among abused children in residential care.

Methodology: This research is designed as a qualitative study approach. Case study method is used to explore primer data which emphasis on psychosocial adjustments and narrative data from the perspective of children living in residential care. Research participants consist of children living in welfare care in Perlis, Malaysia and the respective staffs.

Findings: Chronic abuse will leave harmful effects on various aspects of the children’s development. Abuse will also affect one’s emotional wellness and balance which will further impact the psychosocial stability of an individual in adulthood. Most victims will not be able to develop a sense of belonging and necessary social skills which eventually will lead to these individuals not being able to socialize in the real life situations. Therefore the placements of these children in a safe environment so as to ensure better care and protection must be given proper attention. The transition of caregivers from parents to the welfare centre will affect these children too. They need time to build trust and relationship so that they can feel comfortable to share their experiences and also emotions. Caregivers in the institutions are the main elements in ensuring the quality and effectiveness of educational programmes of the centres.

Practical Implications: Rehabilitation programme is needed to balance the children’s needs based on age and ability to give the residents chances to practice skills and also learn to adapt to the outside world.

Social Implications – The institutions should provide conducive life experiences as they have a large impact to the success of the rehabilitation process. In addition, good quality services in fulfilling the children’s need will assure healthy development of the children and their ability to adapt well to the outside world

© 2019 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: ainulomeimama@gmail.com

1. Introduction
Child abuse involves direct actions which are unsuitable or lead to physical hurt towards children by adults or caregivers and eventually will effect their development emotionally, socially and psychologically (Koizumi & Takagishi, 2014). There are various forms of child abuse be it physical, sexual, emotional and abandonment (Bruskas & Tessin, 2013). Child abuse is complex and complicated predicament to be diagnosed to determine whether it is an accident, illness or intentional hurt (Alavi, Amin, Subhi, Mohamad, & Sarnon, 2012). Child abuse is not restricted to the child’s situation alone but it involves those who have been trusted to care for the child such as helpers, relatives, neighbours or even teachers (Md.Akhir et al., 2012; United Nations Children’s Fund Malaysia, 2010).

According to the Welfare Department Statistics or Jabatan Kebajikan Masyarakat (JKM) (2014), reported cases of child abuse indicate worrying figure for the period of 2010 to 2013 which is 14,662 cases. The victims of abuse will be rescued and if the children need care and protection, actions will be taken according to the Children Act 2001 as follows (Jabatan Kebajikan Masyarakat, 2015), (i) being placed in child home for three years or until the victims reaching the age of 18, or (ii) being put in the custody of a qualified and suitable caregivers for a period decided by the court under the supervision of a ‘protector’ (a welfare officer). According to the statistics released by the Welfare Department (2014), for the period of three years from 2012 to 2014, the total number of children needing protections has increased around four to seven percent. In the year 2012, a total of 3,831 cases were reported and have increased by 7.5 percent to 4,119 cases in 2013. The cases further increased 4.3 percent to 4,295 cases in 2014.

2. Problem Statement
Although abuse cases in Malaysia are getting worse, studies on cases and victims are unpopular and difficult to find (Wahab, Tan, Marimuthu, Razali, & Muhamad, 2013) especially those related to psychosocial adjustments studies involving victims of abuse are limited may be due to difficulties to access the respondents (Wahab et al., 2013). Very little information regarding life and roles of residential care are known in Malaysia (Raj & Raval, 2013).

The main aim of setting up a protective institution is to educate, kick start behavioural changes and self perception and also to influence identity building (Raj & Raval, 2013). The process should be carried out through various social pedagogic activities and approaches led by trained professionals such as social workers, teachers, counselors, special needs services and psychiatrics (Morton, 2015). However, children currently living in the residential care do not receive effective services from the mentioned group of professionals. Instead, they are placed in a special social environment together with children and adults, interacting and connecting daily (Glantz & Gushwa, 2013). In the efforts to handle psychosocial challenges, the residents of residential care are more comfortable sharing problems and seeking supports from peers within the institutions as compared to the staffs of the institution (Abd. Manaf & Mokhtar, 2013). This clearly indicates that children’s development are not individually focused in the care and protective institutions. Hence, the children are facing difficulties in handling psychosocial adjustments when they are in an outside environment away from the care and protective institutions (Almas et al., 2015).

Limited knowledge regarding issues related to the residential care residents will create a stigma and negative images as from adults’ perspectives, these children are categorized as troubled children (Chan, 2013). Inadequate primer data which covers psychosocial adjustment and narratives data from the residence perspectives are the loopholes that need to be explored. Limited information and data related to psychosocial development is a sign to the need of more attention and research in the area.

3. Literature Review
3.1 Psychosocial Adjustment
Psychosocial adjustment refers to one’s ability to function and adapt successfully in fulfilling surrounding needs (Almas et al., 2015). Psychosocial needs are also pictured as stable mental health in various aspects such as personal contentment, family, satisfactory relationship, the ability to contribute to the community and acquiring positive social skills. One of the psychosocial adjustments concept is by looking at the individual being free from external or internal behavioural problems. To evaluate one’s psychosocial situation is when the individual interact or communicate with surrounding people in a social situation (Renfree, Mcdermott, Nelson, Zeanah, & Fox, 2015).
In conclusion, psychosocial adjustments refer to a balance aspects of behavioural, emotional, cognitive and social domain (Almas et al., 2015;Renfree et al., 2015).

3.2 Effects of Child’s Abuse
Chronic abuse give harmful effects in various aspects of the victim’s life development especially children who face constant abuse at every development stage (Yampolskaya, Mowery, & Dollard, 2014). Past and contemporary studies have proven that children who suffer abuse and maltreatment since young will exhibit critical behavioural problems (Yampolskaya et al., 2014). The behavioural problems may occur externally or internally. Therefore, these behavioural problems are the main contributor towards the lack of social inclinations such as running away from home, disciplinary problems, delinquents, free sex and substances abuse(Morton, 2015).

Victims of abuse pose higher risks in having social problems due to low self efficacy, self concept, lack of stress management and problem solving. This situation leads to unhealthy development of self image and consequently leads to social such as being disruptive, withdrawal, low self esteem and insecurities in building relationships (Abd. Rahman et al., 2013). Previous studies have also linked negative social adjustment with personality problems which occur due to lack of social skills, interactions and communications especially with strangers. A few findings from previous studies also indicate that the aspect of problems in social adjustment will affect adjustment ability (Henrichon, 2016). To sum it up, most abuse victims are not able to develop sense of belonging and social skills needed and eventually caused them the inability to socialize in the real world.

Emotional problems caused by post traumatic stress will haunt the victims all their life (Abd. Manaf & Mokhtar, 2013). Emotional problems are closely related to anxiety, depression and anger caused by the stress they experience. In accordance to studies conducted by local researchers, they reported that victims of sexual abuse experienced confusions, guilt, fear, self blaming, emotional and trapped with the incidents (Wahab et al., 2013). This clearly shows that the effects of abuse are really serious as they will disrupt emotional balance and well being which later affect the individuals’ psychological stability into adulthood.

Among abuse issue chosen by researcher is mental health disorder. This is because abuse have been linked to severe mental health disorder throughout the life. Mental disorder is caused by the feeling of fear, disappointment, low self esstem, feeling of being threatened and repetitive memory of the incidents (Mokhtar, 2015). Severe mental disorder are shown by increased confusions, psychiatric problems like suicidal thoughts as indicated

3.3 Care and Protective Institutions
Children growing up in care and protective institutions need more than food, clothing and shelter. Instead they should be given more opportunities to build ties with adults in a surrounding which emphasizes the concept of family institutions (Nalasamy & Ah, 2013). Building up good relationships between caregivers and residents are crucial as these influence teenagers’ perceptions to be more tolerant in accepting rules. Strict and rigid rules are seen as a way to control and discipline children. Hence, most rehabilitation programmes in care and protective institutions are focused on behavior modifications to reduce naughtiness (Nalasamy & Ah, 2013), as the main reasons for the children’s placement are emotional and behavioural problems (Schmidt, Cunningham, Dalton, Powers, Geenen & Orozco, 2013). Rigid, inconsistent and unclear rules (Saim et al., 2013) especially in reprimanding them (Abd. Manaf & Mokhtar, 2013) would cause confusion to the children. However, these children see all forms of barriers and limitations imposed on them as a term of rigid rules and only for the benefits of the administrators.

The effectiveness of the placements of the children in care and protective institutions is often doubted as it leaves negative effects on the children (Schmidt et al., 2013). The children are affected in the aspects of health, education and difficulties in securing jobs when they leave the institutions. Teenagers living in these institutions also posses less encouraging opinions on life and prospects of the future as compared to the teens of the same ages in normal environment (Nalasamy & Ah, 2013). Experiences living in residential care have incited over socialization process due to sharing of amenities and sharing of love to fill up the hollowness existed (pseudo family), due to separation from family. Nevertheless, over socialization does not encourage positive learning pattern because the residents are prone to spending time doing none academic activities. However, the residents feel that negative attitude towards learning happens due to ineffective programmes, under qualified counselors, unappealing moral classes and outdated facilities. This situation usually puts these teens in the low academic achievements.
The placement of young children at protective institutions have impacted their development as it is proven that they will face social problems when they reach their teens. This is due to the focus of the institutions is more towards fulfilling their physical needs as compared to social interactions (Nalasamy & Ah, 2013). Apart from that, it is found that the care and protective institutions are using the same form of treatment on all residents without referring to the children background such as their admittance criteria (Yampolskaya et al., 2014) clinical report.

4. Underpinning Theory
Attachment theory is a collaboration between John Bowlby and Mary Ainsworth which tries to explain and measure babies responses when they are being separated from their mothers (Fonagy, 2018). Attachment theory is also known as psychosocial theory that explores human’s experiences developed from the interactions between individual psychology and their environment. This consequently affects individuals psychosocial development throughout a lifetime (Fonagy & Campbell, 2016). Previous studies indicate that intimacy with parents is closely related to a few teen’s psychosocial adjustments such as behavioural problems, emotion, cognitive and school’s. Researchers on psychology development theory have adopted attachment theory as the guidelines and framework to understand individual differences in emotional development and psychosocial functions and also teens’ adjustment away from the family context (Soares et al., 2014).

5. Framework
Abuse that happen severe the ties with parents as primary caregivers. As the continuous step to continue care and protection, children are placed in residential care. The effects of separation from families and experiences of being abused leave marks on the aspects of behavior, emotions, cognitive, mental and social. Hence indirectly these situations disturb the stability of the children’s psychosocial adjustments.

![Research Framework](image)

Figure 5.1: Research Framework

6. Methodology
This research is designed as a qualitative study approach. The researcher chooses case studies based on exploratory studies which requires deep understandings on psychosocial adjustments of residents in the protective institutions. Data collections are done through semi structured individuals and groups interviews. The location is Rumah Kanak-Kanak (RKK) Arau, Perlis which is supervised by the Welfare Department of Malaysia. Participants is chosen based on suggestions by the shelter’s administration and their consent for interviews. Thematic analysis will be carried out to identify the main theme to the psychosocial adjustments of the behavior, social, emotions and mental health.

7. Implication and Recommendation For Future Research
The implications of the research are for the care services and victimizes children’s rehabilitations. The findings of this study will contribute towards psychosocial adjustments of the RKK residents through improvement of care and help services based on the children’s specific needs. The RKK administrations could also share the information about the institution in collaboration with the community to increase awareness and positive acceptance of the care and protection institutions’ residents. It is hoped that the findings of this study will be of benefit to those involved as a reference to identify factors that contribute towards healthy psychosocial development of the residents.
As a suggestion for future studies, different contexts and settings apart from the institutions should be taken into consideration. Apart from that, similar studies are needed to explore their psychosocial adjustments in the outside environment when they leave the care and protective institutions.

8. Conclusion
In conclusions, through the study conducted, the residents receive equal rights in various areas including education through involvement in various activities, learning facilities, teaching and better career prospects. The residents of the institutions can also move freely as the members of the society and are able to choose preferred career in the future. Positive acceptance from the society is necessary as psychosocial adjustments will then take place smoothly. If unrecognition or negative perceptions from the society occurs, these children will feel left out and they will be unable to adapt successfully due to stress and low self appreciation.

References

Supply and Demand of the Entry-Level Job Competencies in the Hotel Industry

1 Siti Fatimah Mohamad, 2 Siti Khalijah Nasiruddin, 3 Sarina Abdul Halim Lim, 4 Syafinaz Ruslan

1 Universiti Putra Malaysia: s_fatimah@upm.edu.my
2 Universiti Putra Malaysia: sitikhalijah448@gmail.com
3 Universiti Putra Malaysia: sarinalim@upm.edu.my
4 Universiti Putra Malaysia: syafinazruslansr@gmail.com

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

This study aimed to discover the supply and demand of entry-level job competencies, particularly from the perceptions of human resource managers in 4- and 5-star hotels. Also, the gap between the supply and demand of the entry-level job competencies were identified. This study applied the qualitative approach through a semi-structured interview and analyzed using a thematic analysis. Findings of this study showed that human resource managers perceived the competencies of fresh graduates supplied to the hotel industry in both positive and negative views were communication skill, technical skill, cognitive skill, and interpersonal skill. In contrast, the critical competencies demanded in the hotel industry for the entry-level job were interpersonal skill, communication skill, technical skill, leadership, information management, teamwork, and cognitive skill. Out of the four competencies supplied to the industry, the employers perceived only one positive competency was supplied to them, and the other three were regarded as insufficient. It is anticipated that the findings obtained from this study may enhance the collaboration between the hospitality industry and universities to bridge the competencies gap of fresh graduates.

© 2019 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

Corresponding author’email address: kabirbhumarmusa@gmail.com

DOI: 10.26710/jbsee.v5i1.544

1. Introduction

There is a consistent growth of the hospitality industry, particularly the hotel sector, starting from the twentieth century, and it was projected to continue to remain strong at five to six percent growth in 2018 (“2018 Travel and hospitality industry outlook,” 2018; “Hotels worldwide - important statistics”, 2018). Though there is a steady growth portrayed by this industry, high employee turnover is a never-ending issue to the hospitality industry (Birdir, 2002; Emiroğlu, Akova, & Tanrıverdi, 2015; Ghiselli, La Lopa, & Bai, 2001; Nor, Noor, Ahmad, Khalid, & Ibrahim, 2017; Yao, Qiu, & Wei, 2019). Turnover is not the only issue in the hospitality industry. Beesley and Davidson (2013) examined the skills shortages in the hospitality industry and reported that there was an imbalance between the skills supply and demand. As such, the unemployment issue raised due to the mismatch between the supplied and demanded skill sets, where the education providers were struggling to overcome the educational
mismatch (Hanapi & Nordin, 2014; Lillo-Bañuls & Casado-Díaz, 2015; Sam, 2018). Managers criticized fresh graduates were incompetent, and this claim led to the dynamic review of curriculum structure which incorporated various strategies in the educational module (Beckley, 2002; Chan, Fong, Luk, & Ho, 2017; Chang & Yeado, 2003). Efforts have been taken to reduce turnover as well as incompetencies, by identifying essential skills needed in the hospitality industry and professional development (Chung-Herrera, Enz, & Lankau, 2003; Guglielmino & Carroll, 1979; Kay & Russette, 2000; Milman & Ricci, 2004; Bharwani & Jauhari, 2013).

The current Malaysian Prime Minister, Tun Mahathir Mohamad, sees Vision 2020 as Vision 2025 (Sim, 2018) and there will be a higher expectation among the skills demanded in the labor market as we are moving towards the era of Industry Revolution 4.0. The Education Blueprint 2015-2025 portrayed a framework of a higher educational institution with less focusing on traditional and academic pathways and placed an equal value on much-needed technical and vocational training which will provide competent fresh graduates. On the other hand, the government also believed that there is no such commodity as instant graduates, but they have the privilege to expect the availability of fresh graduates with the relevant basic knowledge and skills from the higher educational institutions (Ministry of Education Malaysia, 2015). It is critical to ensure that the academic curriculum and training system meet both the educational and the industry expectations, particularly within the context of the hospitality management (O’Mahony, McWilliams, & Whitelaw, 2001; Purcell & Quinn, 1996; Zaitseva, Kozlov, & Nikolskaya, 2017).

This study aimed to explore the supply of fresh graduates’ competencies; the demand for entry-level job competencies; and to identify the gap between the supply and demand of the entry-level job competencies, from the perceptions of hotel managers. By determining the relevant job competencies, it is anticipated to facilitate hotel human resources managers in selecting and hiring employees, that later will ease the career planning initiatives.

2. Literature Review
2.1 Defining Competency
High employee turnover is a never-ending issue to the hospitality industry, specifically the hotel and foodservice sectors (Birdir, 2002; Brown, Thomas, & Bosselman, 2015; Ghiselli, La Lopa, & Bai, 2001; Milman & Ricci, 2004). Both higher education institutions and industry are striving to improve graduates’ employability and employee retention by developing strategies and recognizing key competencies in the workforce (Chung-Herrera, Enz, & Lankau, 2003; Cloutier et al., 2015; Kay & Russette, 2000; Milman & Ricci, 2004; Suleman, 2016). Understanding employment competencies desired by hospitality managers is the responsibility of educators in higher institutions. The relationship between educational factors and employability is an important understudied area in the hospitality literature that need to be discovered more over time (Dittman, 1997; Hsu, Gilmore, & Walsh, 1992; Tas, 1988; Eurico, da Silva, & do Valle, 2015).

The competency concept became one of the key literature in the management strategy field since the 1990s, where core competency is identified as an asset to increase individual’s competitive advantage (Mitrani, Dalziel, & Fitt, 1992). There are a few meanings of competency incorporating intentions, convictions, and qualities (Mirabile, 1997). Bird and Pearson (2000) defined competency as the skills, knowledge and other attributes that lead to the success of a chosen area. Meanwhile, Mitchelmore and Rowley (2010) viewed competencies as the combination of observable and applied knowledge, skills and behaviors that create a competitive advantage to an organization. Competency is a reflection to the job performance as employers would have a strategy and target in amplifying employee’s abilities to perform a job (Naquin & Holton, 2003). Jackson (2009) categorized competency into technical competency and managerial competency. On the other hand, Bharwani and Talib (2017) proposed three categories of competency: cognitive competency, functional competency, and social competency. Cognitive competency refers to knowledge-related competency, while functional and social competencies refer to technical skills, behaviors and attitudes skills, respectively. Though different researchers have different categories for competency, employee’s competencies in the hospitality industry are essential to help in engendering a memorable hospitality experience (Bharwani & Jauhari, 2013).

2.2 The Competencies Supplied to the Industry
The latest Malaysian Qualifications Framework (MQF) proposed five clusters of learning outcomes to be followed by higher education institutions in Malaysia: i) knowledge and understanding, ii) cognitive skills, iii) functional work skills with focus on practical skills, interpersonal skills, communication skills, digital skills, numeracy skills, leadership, autonomy and responsibility, iv) personal and entrepreneurial skills, and finally v) ethics and
professionalism (Malaysian Qualifications Agency, 2017). The previous MQF only proposed eight components of the competencies to be mapped in the learning outcomes, comprise: i) knowledge, ii) problem solving and scientific skill, iii) practical skill, iv) communication, leadership, team skills, v) social skills and responsibilities, vi) value, attitudes and professionalism, vii) managerial and entrepreneurial skills, and finally viii) information management and lifelong learning skills (Malaysian Qualifications Agency, 2007).

Though the above skills were infused in most of the university curriculum, there was still an imbalance between the supply and demand of graduates’ competencies (Goldsmith & Mohd Zahari, 1994; Teijeiro, Rungo, & Freire, 2013). Researchers suggested different approaches and strategies to fill in the skill gap and to improve the collaboration among the industry, university and government (Goldsmith & Mohd Zahari, 1994; Jackson, 2009; Yunus, 2015). It is reported that fresh local graduates, particularly in Malaysia, were theoretically-trained in the areas of their specialization but lack of soft skills, including critical thinking, communication skill, and poor English proficiency (Azmi, Hashim, & Yusof, 2018; Goldsmith & Mohd Zahari, 1994; Singh & Singh, 2008). Azmi et al. (2018) identified 12 crucial employability skills perceived by undergraduates: disciplined, responsibility, positive attitude, time management, teamwork, open-minded, transparent, communication skills, leadership skills, creative and innovative, appearance, and finally stress endurance. The skills were listed accordingly, started from the most important to the least. However, these skills were perceived by undergraduates from various programs, where the study was not conducted within a specific degree program.

2.3 The Competencies Demanded by the Industry
In the 1980s, fundamental competencies for managers required by the hotel industry consisted of comprehensiveness in overseeing visitor issues, commit to the workplace morale, provide sufficient written and oral communication, exert proficient appearance and balance, build a positive relationship with clients and subordinates (Tas, 1988). As time changes, the above competencies were no longer viewed as essential competencies to the industry. Changes in workforce demographics, economic, technology and globalization affected the environment of the hotel industry (Dessler, 2013). Raybould and Wilkins (2006) listed nine most important generic skills perceived by the hospitality managers, with the most important skill was interpersonal skills, followed by problem-solving, self-management, teamwork and leadership, adaptability and learning, written communication, oral communication, conceptual and analytical, and the least important skill was information management. Likewise, the competencies suggested by Jackson (2009) applied to the 21st century, for example, the effective development of solutions that require the application of technology, motivating and mentoring techniques, and solving issues with stakeholders. Recruiters have long proposed that new hires require a blend of experience, readiness, managerial and technical skills which include exhibit authority capacity, create positive client connection and tackle their issues, ability to communicate, self-control, uplift state of mind, human aptitudes, conflict resolution, and ability to empathize (Josiam, Devine, Baum, Crutsinger, & Reynolds, 2010; Nelson & Dopson, 2001; Tesone & Ricci, 2012; Zopiatis, 2007; Ahmad & Pesch, 2017).

3. Research Methodology
3.1 Research Design and Instrumentation
Qualitative research design has been chosen as this study aimed to explore the manager’s perception regarding the competencies supply and demand of the entry-level jobs in the hotel industry. By employing a qualitative study, a researcher can have a better understanding and gain in-depth information on a particular topic (Creswell, 2009). This study was conducted in the Klang Valley area where 4- or 5- star hotels were chosen as the sample. The selection of this hotel group was due to the large size and systematic human resource practices, as compared to 1- to 3-star hotels (Nasurdin, Ahmad, & Tan, 2016). The unit analysis of this study was the human resource or training manager, and the purposive sampling was employed for this study. Purposive sampling involves identifying a group of individuals with specific characteristics (Creswell, 2009). The sample of this study was chosen based on certain criteria: 1) hotel manager, 2) involved in the recruitment process, and 3) possessed more than one year experience in the current position or the hospitality industry. The interviews were conducted in both English and Malay languages, depending on the respondent’s convenience. Data saturation was attained from eight managers of 4- and 5- star hotels in Klang Valley. The semi-structured questions were applied in the interview with the help of prompt and probe questions. The questions comprised of three parts: 1) introductory questions to get acquainted with the respondents, 2) the competencies of fresh graduates that they experienced, and 3) the demand of entry-level job competencies in the manager’s hotel. The definition of fresh graduates within the scope of this study was given to the interviewee to ensure the responses would be within the context of this study. The context of fresh graduates
this study was the undergraduates from local public and private universities who were recently graduated from the hospitality degree.

3.2 Data Analysis
Thematic analyses of the translated transcripts were carried out for the data analysis. The coding process was made based on the literature review and emergent codes found in this study were used to identify themes related to the competencies of the entry-level job. The data analysis started by organizing and preparing the data for analysis which included transcribing interviews, sorting and creating notes. Then, the data was coded by bracketing chunks or writing word representing the theme in the margins. This process includes capturing data, segmenting sentences or paragraphs into categories, and labeling the categories with a term based on the actual language of the informants (Creswell, 2009). The validity of the data was ensured by peer debriefing, which involves locating a peer debriefer who reviews and asks questions about the qualitative study, in order to verify that the study resonates with people other than the researcher (Creswell, 2009). Academic experts within the field were invited for this test and validated the themes emerged in this study.

4. Results and Discussion
A total of eight hotel managers in Kuala Lumpur participated in this study, comprised of seven 5-star hotels and one 4-star hotel. There was an equal distribution of the manager’s gender: female and male. One of the managers is non-Malaysian, and the rest are Malaysians. The positions of the respondents were director and vice presidents of human resources, training manager and human capital development manager. They have one to four years of experience in the hospitality industry.

The hotels in this study offered the managerial position and non-managerial position to fresh graduates. The management trainee was the managerial position given to fresh graduates who have graduated less than twelve months, and they need to undergo on-the-job training for 12 months or more depending on the performance. Meanwhile, the non-managerial position included guest service agent, waiter, housekeeper, and account receivable clerk. Majority of the respondents informed that they offered non-managerial positions.

“……we call that management trainee or voyage in the hotel chain. We are offering to the fresh graduates that have graduated not less than 12 months. They will join us, and we train them up to the managerial level.” (R2)
“Normally, it’s a service staff for fresh graduates. For operation, guest service agent in the front office, a waiter in the food and beverage department, housekeeper, other departments depend on the position like account receivable.” (R1)

“Normally, it’s a service staff for fresh graduate.” (R6)

4.1 The Competencies of Fresh Graduates Supplied to the Hotel Industry
The competencies of fresh graduates perceived by the hotel managers were mentioned in both positive and negative views, which were: 1) communication skill, 2) technical skill, 3) interpersonal skill and 4) cognitive skill. The competencies were arranged from the highest to the lowest weightage, or the frequency mentioned by the managers. Only one competency, the cognitive skill, was viewed as the real competency in this study and the other three were viewed as incompetent. The perceptions given by the hotel managers were based on their experience and observation.

The fresh graduates were able to speak in the English language though not fluent and lack of confidence. The managers also experienced with some of the candidates that communicated in both English and Malay languages during the interview, where they called as “rojak”.

“The students from East coast Malaysia are good people but lack in English and confident.” (R1)

This statement is in line with the statement from the Malaysian Employers Federation stating that poor command of English was the reason for graduate unemployment (HR in Asia, 2018). The managers also claimed that due to low confidence, it gave a bad impression towards the recruiters. The communication skill supplied to them was insufficient and not up to their expectation.
The managers viewed basic technical skills were needed in the entry-level job for fresh graduates like cooking and computer skill. They never doubt that fresh graduates were good in theoretical knowledge. However, the managers claimed that graduates have a minimum amount of hands-on skill and not practically well-trained.

“...because we have students that come from hospitality school and they never see a functional kitchen or a functional room. They just study theory. In the hospitality field, you cannot study only from theory, you need to feel things, you need to do things, and you know how to do things.” (R6)

The lack of technical skill has caused the hotels to spend more time and money in giving training to fresh graduates to prepare them for their jobs.

Then, the managers perceived that graduates were incompetent in term of the interpersonal skill, which elaborated as a lack of willingness to learn and lack of positive attitude. The fresh graduates refused to learn new things in the work environment, particularly the hotel system. This created difficulties to the hotel managers in motivating them to fit in with the work culture. Besides, the managers stated that they prefer to have an unskilled employee who can be trained but lack of attitude cannot be tolerated.

“Some of the graduates reveal their bad attitude during the probation period, and we will not offer them the position which will affect the hotel performance in future” (R5)

Finally, the only competency satisfied by the hotel managers was the cognitive skill. The fresh graduates were theoretically ready for the workplace. They possess knowledge that they learned from the university. Nonetheless, the managers reported it was insufficient to have knowledge but lack of hands-on practice.

“Their skill is theoretically ready but not in practical or hands-on work” (R5)

4.2 The Competencies of the Entry-Level Job Demanded by the Hotel Industry
There are seven competencies demanded by the hotel industry, as perceived by the hotel managers in this study. The competencies of the entry-level job were listed from the highest to the lowest weightage. The competencies were: 1) interpersonal skill, 2) communication skill, 3) technical skill, 4) leadership, 5) information management, 6) teamwork, and 7) cognitive skill.

The interpersonal skill was the most frequent skill stated by the hotel managers, which comprised bold personality, willingness to learn, attitude and people-oriented. Human interaction is much important in the hotel industry, and the managers require graduates with attractive personalities to join their organization. The managers would hire candidates who show strong personality and able to convince them that the graduates can cope with the working environment.

“... a bold or good personality will be an advantage for them.” (R7)

“They would like people who love to smile or talkative or love talking to people. This kind of people that we are looking at for the job.” (R5)

The next competency required for the entry-level job in the hotel industry was communication skill, which consisted of English proficiency, confidence, and writing skill. The managers reported that effective and professional communication is important for positions in hotel management, food and beverage management, and club management. Verbal communication is critical in interacting with guests, and it reflects the hotel's image. The hotel managers emphasized the English proficiency as one of the competencies demanded from fresh graduates, particularly for the front of the house positions and managerial positions. In addition, writing skill was perceived as the component of communication needed in relation to the documentation job within the hotel industry.

“... make a formal letter or formal document according to hotel standard is one of their jobs” (R5)

The technical skill demanded by the hotel industry comprises cooking and computer skill. Cooking skill is important for kitchen staffs while computer skill is important to almost every department in a hotel. The managers perceived that the entry-level position should possess basic knowledge in using Microsoft Office. Meanwhile, the
level of cooking skill was determined based on the chef hierarchy, and the higher position would require a difficult cooking test.

“... the cooking test for CDP (chef de partie) but the commis position, they need to know the basic cooking only and undergo a regular entry-level test.” (R3)

Leadership qualities and self-determination were the components belong to the next skill, leadership. The hotel industry required graduates who can self-develop, where this group of people knows what to do in achieving personal or organization goals without being instructed. The managers perceived that some people were born to be a leader, but leadership can be developed from time to time, depending on the employee’s willingness to infuse the leadership traits and via training provided by the hotel. Also, the managers believed that experience is an important aspect to become a good leader.

“Another thing is about leadership skill; it is needed if you want to become a manager, you should have leadership in a way for you to lead others. Sometimes it comes naturally to the individual itself.” (R7)

Although the information management was not in the list of the high weightage skills mentioned in this study, it was still demanded by the hotel industry. The information management skill required by the industry referred to the paperwork management. At the starting point in the entry-level job, mainly to the managerial position, employees have to do a lot of documentation and paperwork as they assist the manager. The responsibilities include writing a formal letter, filing documents and preparing files for the company’s records. Thus, the entry-level employees should know how to manage available information in the hotel to ensure the operation remains smooth and escalate the productivity of the business.

“The graduates need to have basic management skill as they will start with basic work that required lots of documentation” (R6)

The lowest weightage of the competencies demanded by the industry were teamwork and cognitive. The managers perceived teamwork was needed for the entry-level job as the hotel organization comprised several departments and required cross-communication to ensure the hotel operation runs smoothly. On the other hand, knowledge was still considered as the competency needed not only by the hotel industry, but to all types of industry. Without the fundamental knowledge related to the field, candidates will not be hired for the entry-level job.

“…. they should be theoretically ready ….” (R5)

4.3 The Gap between the Supply and Demand of the Entry-level Job Competencies

It can be concluded that there was a gap between the supply and demand of the entry-level job competencies to the hotel industry in Klang Valley. By comparing both the competencies supplied and demanded perceived by the hotel managers, the only supplied competency that met the industry’s expectation was the cognitive skill. The other three competencies supplied to the industry: communication skill, technical skill, and interpersonal skill were viewed as insufficient or incompetent. Table 2 shows the comparison between the supplied and demanded competencies of the entry-level job in the hotel industry. The competencies are listed according to the weightage or frequency mentioned in the interviews.

Table 2: Comparison between the Supplied and Demanded Competencies of the Entry-Level Job in the Hotel Industry

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Supplied Competencies</th>
<th>Weightage/Frequency</th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Demanded Competencies</th>
<th>Weightage/Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Communication skill (-ve)</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Interpersonal skill</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Technical skill (-ve)</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Communication skill</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Interpersonal skill (-ve)</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Technical skill</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5. Information</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>management</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>6. Teamwork</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The results were in line with the report stated in the Malaysian Education Blueprint 2012-2025. There was a mismatch between the supply and demand of graduates’ competencies, where employers reported that graduates were lack of skills and attitudes (Ministry of Education Malaysia, 2015). The managers in this study suggested a few approaches to overcome the mismatch, including 1) implementing buddy systems for an internship programme and newcomers like fresh graduates, 2) create excitement in the work environment to motivate new employees, 3) give training to employees.

5. Conclusion
This study explored the supplied and demanded competencies for the entry-level jobs as perceived by the hotel managers in Klang Valley. It is found that out of four supplied competencies, only one competency matched with the demanded competencies, which is the cognitive skill. The three competencies supplied to the industry were regarded as incompetent: communication skill, technical skill, and interpersonal skill. The managers perceived that there were seven key competencies needed by the industry: 1) interpersonal skill, 2) communication skill, 3) technical skill, 4) leadership, 5) information management, 6) teamwork and 7) cognitive skill. Obviously, the managers were not satisfied with the competencies supplied to them. Though the curriculum in public universities has been improved from time to time, the gap between the competencies supply and demand is still persistent. The managers recommended a few suggestions to solve the issue.

This study is anticipated to give an insight about the components and descriptions of the supply-demand competencies to all the stakeholders: undergraduates, fresh graduates, academics, higher education institutions, the Malaysian government, and the hotel industry. By understanding the mismatch, undergraduates would have an awareness to be more proactive in developing their skills once they have enrolled in the hospitality program. Fresh graduates would know how to strategize in presenting themselves during an interview. Academics and higher education institutions would review and improve the curriculum program to escalate the employability of their graduates. The coordination between the government and the hotel industry was anticipated to resolve this issue. It is suggested to further investigate the issue by examining the perception of undergraduates and academics. The motivation, challenges and constraints in possessing the competencies can be explored.

References
Educational Development, 57, 1-10.


Emergent Typologies of Small Businesses in a Multi-ethnic Wet Market in Malaysia: 
A Phenomenological Study

1 Teik Aun Wong
1 Inti International College Penang Email: teikaun@yahoo.com

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

Small businesses are an invaluable source of local knowledge that provide insights into indigenous commercial, cultural and social values and beliefs. This article explores various emergent typologies of small businesses in a multi-ethnic Southeast Asian wet market principally with regards to their social responsibility and sustainability. The field site is Jelutong wet market in Penang, Malaysia. The philosophical and methodological framework is phenomenology, and principal data collection tool is semi-structured interview. Thirty (30) primary interviews and five (5) verification interviews were conducted in various local languages and dialects. Three (3) typologies emerged and named the Lifestyle, Livelihood and Legacy typologies. Identifying and understanding these three (3) typologies in small businesses provide important inputs for public policy.

© 2019 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: teikaun@yahoo.com


DOI: 10.26710/jbsee.v5i1.620

1. Introduction

Small businesses form the backbone of most nations’ economies. Small businesses include incorporated small and medium enterprises (SME’s), un-incorporated businesses, individuals operating with business licenses, unregistered businesses and individuals operating without business licenses. In Malaysia, 97% of business establishments are SME’s and they account for 65% of the country’s employment. SME’s are responsible for nearly 36% of the country’s GDP and nearly 18% of Malaysia’s exports (The World Bank, 2017). In Pakistan, SME’s are considered as “engines of economic growth and have major input towards sustainable gross domestic product (GDP)” (Rasheed & Rahman, 2016). Approximately 3 million SME’s in Pakistan account for 90% of overall businesses, employ 70% of the labor force, contribute 30% towards the GDP and 25% towards the country’s total earnings (Robu, 2013; Khan & Khalique, 2014). As such, SMEs play a crucial role in both the Malaysian and Pakistani economies in terms of output, employment, exports and innovation1. Similarly in the UK, “There is no location

1 SME’s are also predominantly indigenous to the local economy and are thus more entrenched and unlikely to shift their operations outside the country. This is in contrast to large corporation many of whom operate across different countries and are less entrenched or embedded into a particular country. These multi-national corporations usually have no qualms about shifting their operations around different countries to suit their business needs. In the process, considerable dislocation and disruption of the local economy and community could occur.
which is not dominated by small firms in numerical terms, since small and medium-sized firms account for over 99 percent of businesses in all regions (although regional sectoral density does vary across regions). This is why, at least collectively, small firms and their practices play a significant role in the UK today, and should, therefore, not be excluded from debates on business ethics and social responsibility.” (Spence & Rutherford, 2000)

Despite the evident importance of small businesses, they are not frequently the focus of research in terms of social responsibility and sustainability. “Extant research on CSER (Corporate Social and Environmental Reporting) uses a very limited range of theoretical lenses. The vast majority of research uses legitimacy theory, stakeholder’s theory and institutional theory as the main conceptual basis. This limited choice of theory has implications for the limited insights on CSER (Mahmood & Ahmad, 2015). Furthermore, research on the social impact of businesses traditionally focusses on large firms and attention on small businesses is only recently gaining traction (Quinn, 1997; Spence, 1999; Vyakarnam et al, 1997). This is partly attributed to the fact that small businesses are difficult to identify, track and comprehensively studied. Small businesses typically operate using local languages and this presents a barrier to researchers not versed in those languages. In societies that are multi-ethnic as in the case of Malaysia and many Southeast Asian countries, the myriad of languages and dialects used even within a localized community compounds the difficulty. On top of linguistics, the cultural, social and religious context have to be considered and accounted. Even gender variations have to be considered in the milieu (Ahmad & Seet, 2010). Nonetheless, the value of scholarship on small businesses in Southeast Asia is significant as they possess a distinct local characteristic and are largely free from foreign influence. As such, they provide an insight into indigenous commercial, cultural and social practices as well as beliefs.

2. Research Field Site
The field site selected for this study is Jelutong wet market in the state of Penang in Malaysia. In Malaysia and most parts of Asia, wet markets are relatively common and ubiquitous microcosms of indigenous commerce and communities2. The vendors in wet markets consist of individual small businesses. An operating license is required and a monthly fee paid to the local municipal or city council. Priority for operating license is usually given to local small businesses3. Wet markets are the archetypical ‘free marketplace’ espoused in economics by Adam Smith. Adam Smith described the free marketplace where prices are determined by supply and demand “where there is perfect liberty, or where he may change his trade as often as he pleases” (Smith, 2007). Adam Smith elaborated by contrasting the free marketplace with a monopoly. “The price of monopoly is upon every occasion the highest which can be got. The natural price, or the price of free competition, on the contrary is the lowest which can be taken, not upon every occasion, indeed, but for any considerable amount of time”. The characteristics of wet markets in Southeast Asia closely approximate Smith’s ‘free marketplace’ and serve as a suitable proxy for the free market economy in general. A wet market also serves as a representative of society in general. “The social interaction of the people is also important in the society and they connect each other in different sectors of society” (Ali, Chaudhary & Farooq, 2018).

3. Methodology
The principal data collection instrument employed is semi-structured interviews. The structured component gather basic data of the respondents. The non-structured component comprises free and flexible discussions with respondents on topics of their interest. This allows for new areas deemed important by respondents to emerge and inform the subsequent analysis.

The language used is the language the respondents are most comfortable in expressing themselves. As a result, a multitude of languages and dialects are used such as Hokkien (the local Penang Chinese dialect), colloquial Malay (otherwise known as “Bahasa Pasar” or literally “market language”), English and Mandarin. This linguistic diversity reflects the multi-ethnic context of Jelutong wet market in particular and Malaysian society in general.

---

2 It is noted that in bigger towns and cities in Malaysia such as Kuala Lumpur, Johor Bahru and George Town, wet markets are slowly and surely giving way to encroaching modern hypermarkets and shopping malls. This parallels the situation in America where the expansion of modern mass retailers particularly Walmart has seen the demise of many traditional “mom and pop” stores and small businesses.

3 In Penang there it is an explicitly stated policy that only Malaysian citizens can be granted an operating license as wet markets are considered a form of social service that costs considerable tax monies. The license fees are usually a token sum far insufficient to cover the cost of building and maintaining a wet market.
The semi-structured interviews employ the framework of phenomenology. Phenomenology is a broad concept and has been “conceptualized as a philosophy, a research method and an overarching perspective from which all qualitative research is sourced” (Maykut & Morehouse, 1994). Phenomenology focuses on describing and interpreting a particular phenomenon from the social actors’ perspective, experience and understanding. “Phenomenology is an approach that focuses on how life is experienced. It is not primarily concerned with explaining the causes of things but tries, instead, to provide a description of how things are experienced first-hand by those involved” (Denscombe, 2007).

The analysis of data obtained from semi-structured interviews adopts Schutz’s methodological approach (Schutz, 1963). The strength of this approach lies in its ability to give voice to social actor’s authentic accounts of complex phenomena and systematically interpret and analyze the phenomenon to articulate a conceptual framework. In line with the philosophy of phenomenology an abductive research strategy is employed. Abductive research strategy starts with adducing everyday lay concepts, meanings and motives of social actors and finishes with developing a theory that is iteratively tested (Blaikie, 2007). To operationalize abductive research strategy, the social actors’ accounts of their actions in everyday language are obtained and referred to as first-level constructs or everyday typifications. Subsequently, social scientific concepts referred to as second-level constructs or typologies are generated to describe the first-level constructs. The typologies are then tested by translating back to everyday language and referring back to the social actors. If the social actors do not accept the typologies, revisions are required until they are accepted (Ong, 2010).

3. Respondent Pool

Purposeful sampling is used in the respondent selection. “Purposeful sampling is a technique widely used in qualitative research for the identification and selection of information-rich cases for the most effective use of limited resources” (Patton, 2002). “There exists numerous purposeful sampling designs. Examples include the selection of extreme or deviant (outlier) cases for the purpose of learning; the selection of cases with maximum variation for the purpose of documenting unique or diverse variations that have emerged in adapting to different conditions, and to identify important common patterns that cut across variation; and the selection of homogeneous cases for the purpose of reducing variation, simplifying analysis, and facilitating group interview” (Palinkas et al., 2013).

A total of thirty (30) separate semi-structured interviews was conducted and recorded. The length of the interviews ranges from six (6) to thirty nine (39) minutes. A further five (5) informal verification interviews was conducted with the original respondents for verification of the appropriateness of the typologies. All of them agreed that the emergent typologies represent a good spectrum of the attitude and mindset of small businesses in Jelutong wet market.

4. Results and Analysis

The responses from respondents are analyzed from two (2) perspectives. Firstly, they are deliberated based on their views on business, legality, morality and philanthropy. Secondly, they are viewed based on a comparison by trade, age, period in business and legality of the business. From these two (2) perspectives, eighteen (18) first-order construct or everyday typifications are captured as emergent themes listed below:

#1 - Tendency to down-play business operations is present.
#2 - Business is conducted in a casual manner or as a “Lifestyle”.
#3 – Legality is not an intrinsic concern.
#4 – Legal businesses do not begrudge the illegal ones.
#5 – Legal businesses have a positive view of the state of the economy.
#6 – Reasonable and non-exploitative pricing is an ethical concern.
#7 – Profitability is a prime concern.
#8 – Ensuring quality of product is an ethical concern.
#9 – Providing good service is an ethical concern.
#10 – Ethical behavior is also expected of the customers
#11 – Recipients of charity must be deserving.
#12 – Charity can also assume non-monetary forms.
#13 – Religion influences philanthropic orientations.
#14 – The absence of doing evil equates to doing good.
Type of trade has a bearing on attitudes towards charity.
Respondents above fifty (50) years lean toward “Business as a Lifestyle”.
Different periods in business influence respondents’ openness.
Legality is viewed as a rubbery concept.

Three (3) second-order constructs or emergent typologies were derived from the iterative analysis of the data and emergent themes. The respondents’ world-view revolves around their business which is unsurprisingly as they are all small businesses in a busy wet market. Some respondents were interviewed twice but they are counted only once in the typology tabulation. These typologies are to be viewed as a spectrum as befit the inherent subjective nature of social phenomena. These three (3) emergent typologies are named Lifestyle, Livelihood and Legacy typologies.

4.1 Lifestyle Typology
The first emergent typology is the Lifestyle typology. Emergent themes associated with the Lifestyle typology are as follows:

- Business is conducted in a casual manner or as a “Lifestyle”.
- Legal businesses do not begrudge the illegal ones.
- Reasonable and non-exploitative pricing is an ethical concern.
- Ensuring quality of product is an ethical concern.
- Charity can also assume non-monetary forms.
- Religion influences philanthropic orientations.
- Respondents above fifty (50) years lean toward “Business as a Lifestyle”.

Respondents are not desperate to earn money and does business primarily as a pass-time or recreation. This mindset is aptly summed by the Hokkien phrase “kui jit” (“pass day”). Having said this, they are not operating a charity or non-profit enterprise. Business still goes on, but social activities are present alongside and in some instances overshadow commercial ones.

It helps that most of the respondents in this typology are financially stable and do not fully depend on their business to materially support themselves or their families. All of them are above fifty (50) years of age and most are operating their business in Jelutong wet market for more than ten (10) or even twenty (20) years. Some of them are second generation businesses. Even those who are operating in Jelutong wet market for less than ten (10) years have work experience elsewhere.

Their ethical system is based on providing and ensuring quality in their products followed by fair and appropriate pricing. There is a discernible sense of pride in the quality of their products and having a good reputation for quality products is of utmost importance. As there is hardly any distinction between the business and the business-owner among small businesses in Jelutong wet market, this favorable reputation goes beyond their products and is reflected onto them as honorable and reputable individuals.

Most respondents do charity with several of them indicating that they contribute a lot in terms of frequency and quantum. The high quantum of charity points to the lower prominence of profit-making. Social capital considerations such as socializing, contributing towards community and simply being happy play a prominent role. Doing charity by being meaningfully involved in charitable organizations and contributing time, money and effort contributes towards these objectives. Economic considerations are not cast away but significant consideration is given to social capital formation.

---

4 Current research on small businesses have identified several typologies namely the “Lifestyle firm”, “Salary-substitute firm” and “Entrepreneurial firm” (Barringer & Ireland, 2012). Coincidentally the term “Lifestyle” is also used for one of the typologies identified in this article. Nonetheless, the meaning and context is different as the “Lifestyle firms” referred to in the earlier literature are businesses that provide the owner the opportunity to pursue or explore a particular lifestyle and earn a living while doing so. Examples include ski instructors, golf and tennis professionals, wine bars and tour guides.
4.2 Livelihood Typology
The second emergent typology is the Livelihood typology. Emergent themes associated with the Livelihood typology are as follows:

#1 - Tendency to down-play business operations is present.
#3 – Legality is not an intrinsic concern.
#6 – Reasonable and non-exploitative pricing is an ethical concern.
#7 – Profitability is a prime concern.
#9 – Providing good service is an ethical concern.
#10 – Ethical behavior is also expected of the customers.
#11 – Recipients of charity must be deserving.
#14 – The absence of doing evil equates to doing good.
#18 – Legality is viewed as a rubbery concept.

Respondents are actively engaged in business predominantly to make money to materially support themselves and their families if applicable. This attitude towards business is aptly summed by the phrase “tharn chiak” in Hokkien and “cari makan” in colloquial Malay. In other words, their hard work is not a choice but a necessity to make a living and many are also the primary bread-winner of their families. Non-economic concerns such as accumulating social capital are secondary albeit still present.

Their ethical system is primarily based on providing reasonable and competitive pricing. As their main preoccupation is to make a living, the appropriate pricing is a prime concern as it immediately translates into quantum of profits. Having said this, they do not indiscriminately or exploitatively price. They view reasonable and appropriate pricing as the “right thing to do” or as an ethical behavior.

Most do perform charity albeit in small amounts and none indicate that they do charity “a lot”. The fact that the majority do charity is noteworthy given that none of them appear to be particularly wealthy and their main objective in Jelutong wet market is to make a living. In the course of making a living, they do not disassociate themselves from helping others. As exemplified by a respondent who sells rice meals, she empathizes with other whom she described as “orang susah” (people in hardship) as she is also an “orang susah”.

Most are aged fifty (50) years or less and operating in Jelutong wet market for less than ten (10) years. Their comparatively shorter business presence in Jelutong wet market makes them less socially connected to the place compared to those that have been operating longer. Furthermore, many also conduct business in places other than Jelutong wet market and thus spread out their social capital among acquaintances in different localities.

4.3 Legacy Typology
A third emergent typology is the Legacy typology. Emergent themes associated with the Livelihood typology are as follows:

#6 – Reasonable and non-exploitative pricing is an ethical concern.
#7 – Profitability is a prime concern.
#8 – Ensuring quality of product is an ethical concern.
#11 – Recipients of charity must be deserving.
#12 – Charity can also assume non-monetary forms.
#13 – Religion influences philanthropic orientations.

The distinct feature is that respondents are working hard even though they are not dependent on the money earned from their business. Working hard on their business is not perceived as a means (earning more money) towards an end (a presumably more comfortable life). Rather, it is an end by itself.

Respondents in the Legacy typology are all above fifty (50) years of age and do not need to support their children anymore as they are all grown up and independent. Their ethical system is predominantly based on quality considerations and they take pride in freshness of their products and in honestly communicating with customers.

---

5 Some of them could arguably be deserving of charity and social welfare themselves.
All respondents practice charity with one respondent doing it on a high scale in relation to his socio-economic situation.

The distinctively unique characteristics of respondents in Legacy typology is their approach towards business. They are hard at work but are not entirely dependent on the money earned from the business. In other words, their hard work is not a necessity for making a living but is a conscious or perhaps subconscious choice. They are all above fifty (50) years old and do not need to support their children unlike the Livelihood typology whom the majority are below fifty (50) years of age. The fact that they are all already over fifty (50) years old and mostly operating in Jelutong wet market for over twenty (20) years indicate that they are not “transiting” from the Livelihood to the Lifestyle typologies due to advancing age. They are fixed in their outlook towards business. They pursue their business as a predominantly economic concern even though they could conceivably switch to the more socially-oriented Lifestyle typology approach. It is noted that in the Livelihood typology there are also respondents above 50 years of age. However, these respondents are still working primarily to support themselves.

In contrast, all respondents in Legacy typology state that their children are already grown-up, independent and with some of them indicating that they are actually being supported by their children. It is postulated that the respondents in the Legacy typology started in the Livelihood typology when they were younger and had to work hard to support themselves and their families. Subsequently, their socio-economic situation improved and they successfully provided for their family economically and raised their children. At this stage of life when they are over 50 years old respondents in the Legacy typology did not transit to the Lifestyle typology with regards to the mindset and attitude towards business. Consciously or perhaps subconsciously, they continued to adhere to the Livelihood typology mindset and attitude even though they are economically already more secure and do not need to work as hard as when they were in Livelihood typology.

As such, the term “Legacy” to describe this typology is deemed apt to describe the legacy of their earlier mindset and attitude. Working hard to earn money is not perceived as a means to an end to support themselves, their families and their children. Rather, hard work is conceived as an end in itself and vigorously pursued even when the necessity and urgency have diminished. In other words, hard work is perceived as a worthy and meritorious endeavor in and on itself.

4.4 Summary of Typologies
The characteristics of the Lifestyle, Livelihood and Legacy typologies are summarized below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lifestyle Typology</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Social considerations – commercial and social concerns are approximately equal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business ethics - primarily based on ensuring quality of product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charity - higher quantum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trade - equal in raw food and cooked food, least in non-food</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age - all over fifty (50) years of age</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Livelihood Typology</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Social considerations – commercial concerns as the base followed by social concerns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business ethics - primarily based on reasonable pricing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charity - lower quantum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trade - mostly in non-food, least in raw food</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age - majority less than fifty (50) of age</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Legacy Typology</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Social considerations – commercial concerns as the base followed by social concerns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business ethics - primarily based on ensuring quality of product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charity - higher quantum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trade - mostly in raw food</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age - all over fifty (50) years of age</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 1 - Summary of the characteristics of Lifestyle, Livelihood and Legacy typologies**

The Legacy typology shares similarities with Livelihood typology in employing economic considerations as the base of their outlook. However, as noted earlier their motivations are different. The Legacy typology also shares similarities with Lifestyle typology in their shared focus on quality as the main ethical concern and higher
propensity for charity. This suggests that the weightage ratio of economic consideration vis-à-vis ethical and social considerations is closer to that of Lifestyle typology.

It is postulated that the bulk of young businesses start in a Livelihood typology and as they progress in years and economic standing, they might switch to other typologies. The following diagram depicts the postulated temporal relationship among the different typologies:

![Figure 1 – Postulated temporal relationship among Lifestyle, Livelihood and Legacy typologies](image)

### 5. Conclusion and Public Policy Implications

The emergence of the Lifestyle, Livelihood and Legacy typologies among small businesses in Jelutong wet market is a novel and significant finding. The Lifestyle typology is unique towards small businesses as their commercial and social considerations are roughly balanced and inter-twined to the extent that they are difficult to distinguish or separate. For Lifestyle typology and to a lesser extent Legacy and Livelihood typologies, business is a social activity that goes beyond merely commercial transactions and considerations. “An innate tendency is created on part of employees for performing more than the prescribed roles and characters assigned by organizations” (Liaquat & Mehmood, 2017). Social considerations are given weightage accordingly alongside commercial ones.

The findings from this study re-focuses attention on the fact that businesses are fundamentally a social construct. A business is a social contract created by members of society with the tacit endorsement of the general society. As a social construct, it is imbued with the characteristics of its creators – individuals within society. Commerce is but one of its multifarious concerns. Commerce itself is a social concern as its ultimate beneficiaries are individuals in society. The importance of the social aspect is manifested in important role social capital plays in the typologies.

Concurrent with the re-emphasis of businesses as a social construct is the re-focus on the importance of the local community towards national development. Local communities function best when they are cohesive and empowered, and further research is required as “Community empowerment efforts are central issues that often are often leveled by the government and society, but until now the issue of community empowerment is still in the socialization stage to find a model of development specific community groups, given the complexity of the problems faced by the community itself both individually and in groups” (Nujun & Pratiwi, 2018).

Public policy needs to be cognizant and take into account these different typologies to ensure social sustainability. The contributions of small businesses towards both commercial and social development needs to be recognized and promoted accordingly. Granted, this research is exploratory in nature and specific public policy with regards to the findings of this research have yet to be developed and tested. Nonetheless, public policy that specifically promotes small businesses and wet markets is recommended as they provide both social and commercial benefits, and
ultimately promote social sustainability. The re-focus of businesses as fundamentally social constructs have wider public policy implications particularly in town planning and socio-economic policies.

In conclusion, this research has contributed towards the understanding of small businesses in Southeast Asia with findings that have public policy implications. This research also points the way for further studies on small businesses from a sociological perspective particularly with the adoption of the philosophical and methodological framework of phenomenology.

References
Ahmad, Noor Hazlina & Seet, Pi-Shen (2010). Gender variations in ethical and socially responsible considerations among SME entrepreneurs in Malaysia. International Journal of Business and Society, 11(1), 77-88


# Technical Resources in E-training Acceptance

†Zainab Bello

†Waziri Umaru Federal Polytechnic, Birnin Kebbi, Nigeria: zbello03@yahoo.com

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ARTICLE DETAILS</th>
<th>ABSTRACT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>History</strong></td>
<td>This paper examines the role of availability of resources in the acceptance of e-training in the Nigerian civil service. Perceived ease of use (PEOU) and Perceived usefulness (PU) of Technology Acceptance Model (TAM) was used as the base for consideration.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Keywords</strong></td>
<td>Questionnaires were used to collect data from 450 heads of departments. The framework of the paper made up of technological infrastructure, internet facility, PEOU and PU was tested with SmartPLS 2.0 M3 software. This paper found both that PU and PEOU indicated strong predictive role in e-training acceptance. In addition, technological infrastructure was found significant. However, internet facility had in significant effect in e-training acceptance. This paper showed that availability of resources can help in the acceptance of e-training in the Nigerian civil service. This will help to improve the outlook and overall performance in the civil service. It will be beneficial to policy makers and government agencies in developing policies regarding e-training, create awareness of the benefits of accepting e-training in the public sector leading to better performance and efficiency. Relationships of technological infrastructure and internet facility which are necessary in the acceptance of e-training in the Nigerian civil service were examined in this paper.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>JEL Classification:</strong></td>
<td>M53, M59</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

© 2019 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: zbello03@yahoo.com


**DOI:** 10.26710/jbsee.v5i1.671

## 1. Introduction

In any economy, knowledgeable human capital is regarded crucial to attaining set goals for organizations. This has made organizations commit huge resources for the training and growth of their work force (Obi-Anike & Ekwe, 2014). There has been an observed upsurge in the acceptance of technology in the operations of most organisations (Mckay & Vilela, 2011). This is as a result of the changes and advancement in the use of technology in carrying out operations including training in most organisations (Ramayah, Ahmed & Hong, 2012).

Technological advancement and awareness has altered the manner in which people do things (Ramayah et al., 2012). This has necessitated organizations to look for means which are effective in the provision of training to their personnel (Hong, 2008). This is because different ways of doing things are emerging with accelerating speed and
information has to be dealt with in a smaller time frame by workers (Ramayah et al., 2012). This includes training related issues (Mohsin & Sulaiman, 2013). Training executives feel the necessity to provide knowledge and skills more speedily and adequately each and every time it is needed (Mohsin & Sulaiman, 2013). In the era of just-in-time technology, just-in-time training turns out to be a critical part for success in organizations (Mohsin & Sulaiman, 2013). This has made training to expand beyond what is available in the traditional class room.

Training could be seen as the planned process in which knowledge or skills are acquired or changed in order to derive better performance in certain activity (Abba & Sawha, 2009). The importance of training workers in organisations has been emphasized (Abba & Dawha, 2009) and it has been suggested as a way of improving and optimizing employee’s performance. Training is one of the key strategic tools for organizations to get competitive advantage over others with intellectual human capital in the global village (Mohsin & Sulaiman, 2013). Therefore, training methods should be effective to yield better and sustainable performance (Mohsin & Sulaiman, 2013). The training method could either be conventional or e-training.

In the conventional (traditional) training method, the trainee and trainer have to be physically present in the same venue for training to take place. However, with the conventional training methods, issues have been identified that stands as limitations to trainees which includes issues like distance to training centres, time of training, training content, cost, work schedules and family responsibilities (Alrawashdeh & Huda, 2010). Even though traditional training cannot be totally replaced, the pressures of growing workforce, diminishing budgets for traditional training and the constraints of schedule makes e-training an attractive alternative (Alrawashdeh & Huda, 2010).

Additionally, while attracting and retaining the right people is a challenge in itself, the additional task of providing company-specific training can create further demands upon time and resources. This is especially true where constant change in the business environment requires continuous training. In this context, traditional training method is no longer capable of satisfying the organizational demand for continuous manpower training (Mohsin & Sulaiman, 2013). Thus, organisations engage in providing online training facilities and therefore turn to electronic training for their workforce for the acquisition of knowledge and skills (Mohsin & Sulaiman, 2013).

E-training could be seen as a web based educational system which utilizes computer network and information technology (Hsbollah & Idris, 2009). Basically, e-training are activities that are conducted via the internet and it is considered to be much faster and cheaper, convenient, available 24/7, and flexible (Mohsin & Sulaiman, 2013). In recent years, e-training has been considered one of the most promising fields in Human Resource (HR) educational technologies (Amara & Atia, 2016). It has become a standard in most organization and corporate arenas (Amara & Atia, 2016). E-training has developed as a fresh way of skill preparation and information attainment (Amara & Atia, 2016). It has increased in popularity as organizations strive to provide flexible, reliable and fast learning environment in a cost saving manner (Lorenzetti, 2005). This goes to show that e-training is proven to be more effective and interactive than traditional training (Mohsin & Sulaiman, 2013). It has also been argued that owing to fast advancement of technology and communication infrastructure, e-training has become the innovative approach of training in most organizations (Amara & Atia, 2016; Ramayah, et al., 2012).

Adjusting to the e-training trend has been easy for organisations in developed countries due to the fact that, environment and mind set of these countries revolve around technology (Ramayah, et al., 2012). Developing countries are also hopping on the e-training bandwagon in the hope of getting the benefits of the trend (Ramayah et al., 2012). In the African continent, some countries have started using technology to train. This advancement is evident in the report of the Commonwealth which showed type of information and communication technologies being use in Africa (Nneka, 2010). However, Africa is still in the infancy stage of e-training. This is shown in the African database survey conducted with 70 per cent low connectivity (Unwin, 2008). Nevertheless, there is interest in the usage of information technology (Nneka, 2010). Developing countries like Nigeria particularly the civil service has not joined the technological trend in general and e-training in particular with observed in-availability of resources (El-Rufia, 2011). This is surprising as Nigeria is a country with technological presence (Uwaifo & Uddin, 2009). Proper awareness of the benefits of joining the technological world has been attributed to this drawback in the Nigerian civil service (Okifo & Igbunu, 2015).

When there is no awareness of the benefits of e-training, it would lead to the employees in the Nigerian civil service rejecting the system (Okifo & Igbunu, 2015). It is therefore necessary to examine the perceived attitude of the employees in the Nigerian civil service with respect to acceptance of e-training. This will help to assess what will
influence employees to accept e-training (Davies 1989). Furthermore, it has been suggested that it is necessary to examine e-training acceptance before it can be implemented in any organisation (Harfoushi & Obiedat, 2011). In this assessment, the perceive usefulness (PU) and perceived ease of use (PEOU) of e-training will help to determine the acceptance of the system (Davies, 1989). Additionally, since e-training acceptance requires the assessment of the level of the employee’s awareness based on their attitude and belief, then there is need to examine the factors that will encourage the acceptance of the system (Buabeng, 2012) by the employees in the Nigerian civil service. Literature has shown that among these factors are availability of resources (Park Kim & Kim, 2014). Due to the peculiar nature of Nigeria and the civil service being large and conservative in its operation (El-Rufia, 2011), this paper examines technological infrastructure and internet facility as dimensions of availability of resources. Additionally, since research on the acceptance of e-training in the Nigerian civil service is scarce, this paper therefore examines the role of availability of resources in the acceptance of e-training in the Nigerian civil service with PEOU and PU as the base for consideration.

2. E-Training Acceptance

E-training acceptance is agreeing to use e-training system based on the awareness of e-training benefits (Harfoushi & Obiedat, 2011). Since Programmed Logic for Automatic Teaching Operations (PLATO) was developed in the 1960s, more interactions can be done online today (McKay & Vilela, 2011). Globally, online training environment has become part of most organisations (Athey, 2012). Traditional way of training is nearly phased out with the advancement in information and communication technologies which have made training more flexible (Salawudeen, 2010). Due to the drawbacks of traditional training (Bonk & Wisher, 2002) more organisations have accepted e-training (Loh et al., 2013). Although acceptance of e-training system has not reached some countries, there is an increase of around 40 per cent in organisations and individuals using the e-training system (McKay & Vilela, 2011).

In order for e-training to be accepted there is need for the employees in an organisation to have adequate knowledge of e-training and how it differs from traditional training. Furthermore, they need to know how e-training system is designed, its characteristics and the benefit of accepting e-training (Amara & Atia, 2016; Harfoushi & Obiedat, 2011). Therefore, when employees accept e-training, there will be an interactive two way information flow, training will be collaborative in which the trainees learn through practice and self-research (Amara & Atia, 2016). Furthermore, search and investigations will be done over the internet which permits trainees time to digest and interpret information. Additionally, individual difference on abilities to handle training and system related issues are taken into considerations (Amar & Atia, 2016; Harfoushi & Obiedat, 2011). With e-training acceptance, organisations can have speedy growth in innovations, and absorb these innovations with education, ICT, and the digital knowledge (Amar & Atia, 2016). Accepting e-training will present large number of trainees with equal opportunities for training at different levels bringing about savings in time and training cost (Amar & Atia, 2016). E-training acceptance builds interactive relationship between trainers and trainees, improves the trainee’s skill in the use of computers as well the internet, which is very helpful career wise (Harfoushi & Obiedat, 2011).

Furthermore, it has been stated that the acceptance of e-training enables the provision of several sources of information which will permit assessment, scrutiny and discussions (Ramayah et al., 2012). Additionally, trainee’s skills and information are updated in line with current trends; experiences will be shared through e-training medias; training atmosphere will be shared through fresh methods and different information experience and sources which will enable meeting the needs for qualified staff on certain jobs and disseminate the culture of information technology to create a community that can be in tune with the global village (Amara & Atia, 2016). Studies have suggested framework for e-training acceptance in particular to answer the question of how to go about e-training acceptance (Harfoushi & Obiedat, 2011; Mohsin & Sulaiman, 2013). This includes awareness, issue of bandwidth, computer self-efficacy and language barrier (Mushin & Sulaiman, 2013). Furthermore, it has also been suggested that the acceptance of e-training in an organisation be assessed in form of readiness factors of the organisation in terms of availability of resources if e-training is to be accepted and implemented successfully (Harfoushi & Obiedat, 2011). Therefore, it is also necessary to assess the attitude and belief of the employees, their perceived believes about the usefulness and ease of use of the e-training system which will influence the acceptance of the system (Davies et al. 1989; Harfoushi & Obiedat, 2011). Based on the peculiar nature of the Nigerian civil service which has been discussed previously, this study examines the variable of availability of resource with technological infrastructure and internet facilities as dimensions.
2.1 Technology Acceptance Model

An extension of the theory of reasoned action, the technology acceptance model (TAM) assesses elements that can stimulate either the rejection or acceptance of technology (Davis, 1989; Venkatesh & Davis, 2000). Perceived usefulness and perceived ease of use are the two vital variables of the TAM (Purnomo & Lee, 2013). Lee (2006) endorsed the continual refining of PU and PEOU as bases so as to assess their strength in technology acceptance. Sabrina (2007) suggested that TAM should be tested in differing cultural settings as Jebakumar and Govindaraju (2009) argued outcomes in applying TAM varies with cultures. The goal here is to use PU and PEOU, the two key constructs in the TAM, as a base in examining the role of the dimensions of availability of resources in e-training acceptance in the Nigerian civil service.

2.1.1 Perceived Usefulness

Perceived usefulness (PU) refers to an individual’s perception that the use of a particular system can advance performance in their job (Davies, 1989). PU is one of the key construct of TAM that has effect on individual attitude in relation to acceptance of information system (Davies, 1989). When a user believes that a system can help in being rewarded with bonuses, raise or promotion that system is said to be high in PU (Davies, 1989). In carry out any activity, an individual usually tries to assess the effort that will be required for that activity (Bugembe 2010). Therefore, when a system is perceived to be useful in comparison to other system, users are more likely to accept it (Purnomo & Lee, 2013).

Purnomo and Lee (2013) stated that acceptance is the product of a rational assessment of the system which guides the decision to accept. PU serves as base in TAM and the construct is used to determine the connections between acceptance and the external variables of a study (Han, 2003). Furthermore, PU has shown significant close connections in system acceptance (Davies et al., 1989; Han, 2003; Purnomo & Lee, 2013). This is because user assesses their performance based on their opinion of how that system can help in their performance. Therefore, that contributes to PU being the belief that information system will lead to quality work activity (Purnomo & Lee, 2013).

It has been argued that due to the worth of outcomes, individual acceptance of system is affected by PU (Purnomo & Lee, 2013). This is because e-training will be accepted if users have belief that the relationship between e-training and performance is a positive one (Harfoushi & Obiedat, 2011). Therefore, PU is important in determining user’s acceptance of e-training (Davies et al., 1989). Applied in the perspective of this study, PU is the belief relating to e-training outcome.

Ong et al. (2004) found that when the objective is acceptance of system, PU effect is direct and most significant as long as the system provides contents that are useful and attractive to the user. Employees may perceive e-training system useful if they perceived e-training system to be useful. Studies (Lee et al., 2014; Purnomo & Lee, 2013) have shown that PU has direct significant effect on acceptance. Therefore, this study hypothesis is that:

H1: PU has significant relationship with e-training acceptance

2.1.2 Perceived Ease of Use

Perceived ease of use (PEOU) refers to the level an individual believes the use of a certain system would be effortless (Davies 1989). PEOU is one of the key construct of Technology Acceptance Model (TAM) that has effect on individual attitude in relation to acceptance of information system (Davies, 1989). In carry out any activity, an individual usually tries to assess the effort that will be required for that activity (Bugembe 2010). Therefore, when a system is perceived to be easy to use in comparison to other system, users are more likely to accept it (Davies, 1989).

In TAM, acceptance is the product of a rational assessment of the system which guides the decision to accept that system (Davis, 1989). PEOU serves as basis in TAM and the construct is used to determine the connections between acceptance and the external variables of a study (Han, 2003). Furthermore, the construct has shown significant close connections either in current or future system acceptance (Davies et al., 1989, Han, 2003). This is because user assesses their effort based on their opinion of the system, if it can be used with less effort which that contributes to PEOU being the level in which an individual feels that they can use e-training system effortlessly (Lee et al., 2011).
It has been found that when e-training acceptance is perceived by users to be laden with effort in usage, individual will not accept it (Harfoushi & Obiedat, 2011). However, PEOU plays an important role by helping to lessen the doubts that come with the acceptance of any new system (Elliott & Frank, 2008). Therefore, PEOU is important in determining user’s acceptance of e-training system (Davies, et al 1989). Applied in the perspective of this paper, PEOU is the belief that using e-training will be effortless.

Ong et al. (2004) found PEOU to be significant predictor of acceptance of system which is concur by Lee et al. (2011). These studies indicated that in the acceptance of new system, PEOU has positive and direct effect. Their findings are in line with the findings of Venkatesh and Davis (2000) which suggested that PEOU has direct and strong effect on acceptance which further strengthens the original work of Davis et al. (1989). Employees will perceive e-training system useful if they perceived the system to be easy to use. Studies have shown that PEOU has significant effect on acceptance directly (Lee et al., 2011; Ong et al., 2004). PEOU have however been found to have in significant effect on acceptance (Chong et al., 2010). Furthermore, studies have shown that PEOU through PU has significant effect on acceptance (Ong et al., 2004; Rym et al., 2013). These studies have shown that PEOU can affect attitude indirectly via PU depending on the study factors which are external to TAM usage (Legris, et al., 2003; Lie et al., 2009). Therefore, this paper hypothesized that:

H2: PEOU has significant relationship with PU
H3: PEOU has significant relationship with e-training acceptance

2.2 Technological Infrastructure

Technological infrastructure is considered as part of technological architecture (Nchunge, Sakwa & Mwangi, 2013). Furthermore, Bhattacherjee and Hikmet (2008) referred to technological system as system which is required for the implementation of technology in organisations. This study looks at technological infrastructure as the physical technological resources that can aid e-training acceptance.

The operations of organisations have been greatly influenced by the developments in technological infrastructure. This can be seen in emergence and strengthening of the world economy which has been transformed into information and knowledge based economies (Nchunge et al., 2013). This has made many organisations particularly in the developed countries to use technology to stay in operation. Selim (2007) stated that technological infrastructure is an important organisational capability that should be considered as an effective source of value. Availability of technological capacity is an important factor to be considered when introducing new system in an organisation (Bhattacherjee & Hikmet, 2008).

To have successful e-training acceptance in an organisation, there is need for appropriate technological medium and channels to allow for sharing of information and communication (Selim, 2007). It is necessary to ensure that the infrastructures are reliable, up to date and of good quality. With reliable technological infrastructure e-training will be accepted (Yiong, Sam & Wah, 2008).

In the Nigeria civil service, infrastructure is one of the major challenges facing the sector. The country like many developing countries is still suffering from digital divide (Akpodiete, 2012). Furthermore, it is also believed that infrastructure and ICT literacy are combinations that are necessary in the usage of technology and communications tools to create, manage, evaluate as well as integrate information in order to have an enabling e-training environment in the Nigerian civil service. This is why speakers at Nigeria Computer Society (NCS), 2013 conference advocated a robust infrastructure deployment for the country. The forum had noted Infrastructures are needed to create, manage, implemented appropriately and successfully services that involve technology.

Studies have found infrastructure to be important in usage as well as it relate significantly to acceptance of systems (Bhattacherjee & Hikmet, 2008; Özgen, 2012). Infrastructure has important role in the acceptance of electronic learning in educational institutions (Yiong et al., 2008). However, Thompson (2010) reported a contradicting result; there was no statistical prove in his study that infrastructure support had influence on system acceptance. Therefore, this study hypothesis that:

H4: Technological infrastructure has significant relationship with PEOU
2.3 Internet Facilities

Internet is a set of systems that enable two or more computers to send and receive information from one another (Jebakumar & Govindaraju, 2009). For this study, Internet facility refers to the availability of open standard network connectivity to aid e-training acceptance (Jebakumar & Govindaraju, 2009). The availability of internet facilities has been stated to provide greater convenience thereby enhancing the acceptance of technology (Jebakumar & Govindaraju, 2009). It has been stated that in technology acceptance availability of internet facilities is an important factor (Martins & Kellermans, 2004) because it aids in e-training, effective communication between trainers and trainees is done mostly via the internet.

Furthermore, studies have argued that less stress and dissatisfaction on access and connectivity will further enhance the acceptance of e-training as well as its success (Jebakumar & Govindaraju, 2009; Martins & Kallermanns, 2004). The availability of internet facilities helps in facilitating smooth information exchange. It has been argued that internet facilities allows trainees to receive from trainers innovations that helps in stimulating as well as enhancing learning (Brown, 2002). Manipulations, creativity and initiatives from both trainees and trainers are very much supported with the presence of internet facilities (Jebakumar & Govindaraju, 2009). Jebakumar and Govindaraju (2009) found availability of internet facilities to relate significantly with PEOU. Their result showed that availability of internet facilities is an important factor to be considered in the acceptance of electronic training. Adika (2003) found people access to internet will make them to use technology more. In addition, Ehikhamenor (2003) argued that although 50.4 per cent of Nigerian scientists had access to internet, the availability of infrastructure and issue with ease of use is the constraint faced by the respondents of his study. Some studies results agreed with Ehikhamenor’s findings (Oduwole, 2004; Luambano & Nawe, 2004). Therefore, this paper hypothesis that:

H5: Internet facility has significant relationship with PEOU.

3. Methodology

To achieve the aim of this paper, data were collected with the use of questionnaires. Since the focus of this paper is the Nigerian civil service, the population for this paper were all the federal ministries. The country has twenty-seven (27) federal ministries. Each of the 35 states has Twenty-four (24) while there are three additional federal ministries in the Federal Capital Territory (FCT), Abuja making it twenty-seven (27) in total. There are two hundred and thirty-eight (238) departments in each state and two hundred and fifty-seven (257) departments in FCT, Abuja giving a population of eight thousand five hundred and eighty-seven (8587) departments. The sample size for this population is 367 (Krejcie & Morgan, 1970). 40 per cent was added to this sample size in order to minimize low response rate (Salkind, 1997). This gives 514 as the sample size for this paper. The unit of analysis is individual and the respondents are the heads of each selected department.

Cluster sampling was used to collect data considering that there are six (6) geo-political zones in the country. Two zones were randomly selected from cluster of five (5) zones in Nigeria. One zone was not assessable due to insecurity in the zone. Considering the determined sample size of 514 and the number of Federal ministries in each state, one state was also selected at random from each of the two selected zones. Therefore, the Federal Capital Territory (FCT), Abuja was picked from the North-central while Kaduna state was picked from the North-west. The Federal Capital Territory (FCT), Abuja has 27 Federal ministries with 257 heads of department while Kaduna state has 24 Federal ministries with 238 heads of departments, making the total heads of departments from all the ministries of the two selected samples to be 495.

514 questionnaires were distributed to the targeted respondents and a total of 472 questionnaires were retrieved. However, 22 questionnaires were incomplete and therefore not useable (Hair et al., 2013). Therefore, 450 questionnaires that were fully completed were used for analysis in this paper. SPSS version 2.0 was used to clean the data after collection. SmartPLS 2.0 M3 software of Partial Least Square (PLS) path modelling analysis method (Ringle et al., 2005) was used to determine the validity and reliability of the variables. In addition, to test the measurement and structural models, PLS algorithm was used to assess convergent and discriminant validity, reliability of individual item, and internal consistency which determined the measurement model fit (Hair et al., 2013).

Furthermore, PLS algorithm was used to get the composite reliability coefficients and the Average Variance Extracted (AVE) (Geladi & Kovarlski, 1986). The AVE scores acceptable has been suggested to be .5 or above (Fornell & Larcker, 1981). Furthermore, they also argued that the AVE square root should be greater than the
correlations among latent construct in order to derive discriminant validity that is adequate. Composite reliability coefficient has also been suggested to be much better from the range of .7 and above (Hair et al., 2013). Additionally, bootstrapping procedure was used to evaluate the structural model in order to get the t-statistics (Hair et al., 2013).

This paper considered PLS path modelling to be the appropriate method of analysis due to several reasons. First, in PLS, the relationships between variables (structural Model) and the relationship of latent variables (Measurement model) and their indicators can be simultaneously estimated (Duarte & Raposo, 2010). Furthermore, since this paper is explorative with the application of technology acceptance model (TAM) theory, the approach of path modelling is required. This is because studies have suggested that when research is prediction-oriented, the appropriate approach to use should be the path modelling in PLS (Hair et al., 2013).

Additionally, non-normal data are treated well with PLS since in social science data tend to have the problem of normality (Osborne, 2010), in PLS analysis of data do not necessary need to be normal (Chin, 1998). Therefore, to avoid problem of normality that might occur during analysis of data PLS was considered for this paper.

4. Findings/Discussion
In order to get the reliability and validity of the constructs the measurement model was assessed. Table 1 presents the over view of the analysed results.

![Figure 1: Measurement Model](image)

**Table 1: Over View of Results**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Loadings</th>
<th>AVE</th>
<th>Composite Reliability</th>
<th>α</th>
<th>R Square</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>E-training Acceptance</td>
<td>ETA1</td>
<td>0.751</td>
<td>0.536</td>
<td>0.890</td>
<td>0.856</td>
<td>0.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ETA2</td>
<td>0.754</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ETA3</td>
<td>0.765</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ETA4</td>
<td>0.733</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ETA5</td>
<td>0.773</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ETA6</td>
<td>0.694</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ETA7</td>
<td>0.648</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internet Facility</td>
<td>INTFAC1</td>
<td>0.930</td>
<td>0.773</td>
<td>0.944</td>
<td>0.924</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>INTFAC2</td>
<td>0.796</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>INTFAC3</td>
<td>0.776</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>INTFAC4</td>
<td>0.950</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>INTFAC5</td>
<td>0.929</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 1 showed individual item loading above the required values of between .50 and .70 (Hair et al. 2011) indicating items reliability. In addition, internal consistency was reliable with values for cronbach alpha (α) more than .50, coefficient of composite reliability exceeded the least accepted range of .70 (Hair et al., 2011). All the average extracted variance (AVE) of each construct reached the accepted range of .50 (Chin, 1998).

Furthermore, the correlations that exist between variables as compared to the square roots of AVE indicated discriminant validity adequacy (Fornell & Larcker, 1981). This is presented in Table 2.

Table 2: Square root of average variance extracted(AVE) and Latent Variance Correlations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>ETA</th>
<th>INTFAC</th>
<th>PEOU</th>
<th>PU</th>
<th>TECHINF</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ETA</td>
<td>0.732</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTFAC</td>
<td>0.116</td>
<td>0.879</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PEOU</td>
<td>0.499</td>
<td>0.211</td>
<td>0.740</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PU</td>
<td>0.533</td>
<td>0.056</td>
<td>0.497</td>
<td>0.801</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TECHINF</td>
<td>0.651</td>
<td>0.179</td>
<td>0.477</td>
<td>0.529</td>
<td>0.741</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In addition, R square showing the explained variance of construct(s) in the endogenous variable is given as 36 per cent for ETA, 24 per cent for PEOU and 25 per cent for PU respectively. In order to test the relationships between variables that had been hypothesized, the structural model was assessed.
Figure 2: Structural Model
The t-value significance level was calculated by a two-tailed estimation (Hair et al., 2013). Base on the t-value rule of thumb for interpretation for two tail relationship (1.65 = 10%, 1.96 = 5% and 2.57 = 1% significance level respectively), Table 3 presents the result of hypotheses testing.

Table 3: Results of Hypothesis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypotheses</th>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>T-Value</th>
<th>Accepted/ Rejected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>H1</td>
<td>PU has significant relationship with e-training acceptance</td>
<td>3.549***</td>
<td>Accepted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H2</td>
<td>PEOU has significant relationship with PU</td>
<td>4.037***</td>
<td>Accepted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H3</td>
<td>PEOU has significant relationship with e-training acceptance</td>
<td>2.695***</td>
<td>Accepted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H4</td>
<td>Technological infrastructure has significant relationship with PEOU</td>
<td>3.858***</td>
<td>Accepted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H5</td>
<td>Internet facility has significant relationship with PEOU.</td>
<td>1.395</td>
<td>Rejected</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

***Significant Level is at 1%

Table 3 shows that H1, H2, H3 and H4 were supported at 1 per cent statistical significance (t=3.549, 4.037, 2.695 and 3.695 respectively, t > 2.57). This indicates that all variables of this paper with the exception of internet facility have effect in e-training acceptance.

5. Conclusion/Implication
The purpose of this paper is to examine the role that availability of resource has in e-training acceptance in the Nigerian civil service taking into consideration the PU and PEOU of the system. Availability of resources in this paper has two dimension; technological infrastructure and internet facility.

The framework of this study was proposed to assess the acceptance of e-training in the Nigerian civil service. This study included critical factors and tested them with SmartPLS 2.0. The results of this paper show the Nigerian scenario particularly the civil service.

E-training acceptance is important and necessary in organisations and studies have been assessing this in several settings and cultures in order to meet up with the trend in technology. The findings of this paper show the effect of each variable examined. Both TAM constructs and technological infrastructure were found to have significant effect on e-training acceptance. However, internet facility was not significant in this paper.

As stated above, the findings of this study establish that PU and PEOU have direct significant influence on e-training acceptance as well as PEOU having effect on e-training acceptance through PU. This shows that perceived belief and attitude are crucial in technology acceptance. This result is contrary to the findings of Purnomo and Lee (2013) However, this paper’s result agrees with other studies results on this relationship (Lee et al., 2011; Rym et al., 2013). The findings of this paper with regards to the two key TAM constructs indicate that the heads of departments in the Nigerian civil service perceive e-training as useful and have the confidence and belief that they can operate the system. The result of this paper reaffirms the predictive strength of PU and PEOU in technology acceptance.

This paper found technological infrastructure to have significant effect in e-training acceptance which is contrary to the findings of Thompson (2010) but support the findings of Selim (2007) and Yiong et al. (2008). This indicates that technological infrastructure is influential in determining the acceptance of e-training in the Nigerian civil service. This study statistically shows that e-training can be accepted in the Nigerian civil service if it is perceived as being easy to use in the sense that user’s belief the availability of the right and appropriate technological infrastructures can aid acceptance. Therefore, since technological infrastructure is necessary (Bhattacherjee & Hitmet, 2008), it’s availability in adequate quality, quantity and being user friendly would help in user’s perception of e-training reliability thereby boost e-training acceptance. This is because technological infrastructure is a
necessity in the usage of technology and communications tools to create, manage, evaluate and integrate information to have an enabling e-training environment (Purnomo & Lee, 2013). The findings indicated that internet facility did not have effect on e-training acceptance. This finding is contrary to findings of Jebakumar and Govindaraju (2009). This result indicates that internet facility is not influential in determining the acceptance of e-training in the Nigerian civil service. Although it has been argued repeatedly that availability of internet facility is a critical factor in technology usage, this study result shows the negative issues that surrounds internet in Nigeria (Bankole, 2013), that there is sceptic perception about involvement of internet in e-training acceptance.

This paper showed that e-training as an alternative to conventional training can positively affect organisations in developing countries, particularly Nigeria. Indicating that with e-training, organisational performance could be much better and particularly making the civil service move forward to another way of engaging as well as delivering knowledge to building a skillful workforce. Furthermore, the process of e-training acceptance could motivate decision-makers to seek support from higher authorities in the provision of resources to the ministries. This could help to improve the workforce thereby leading to more growth in the civil service and consequently contributing to the country’s growth.

In addition, more literature was generated with regards to e-training acceptance particularly in the Nigerian civil service. Furthermore, the predictive strength of the key TAM constructs was tested in a different setting to ascertain its ability in technology acceptance with regards to developing countries and particularly the Nigerian civil service. The literature showed contradictions on the researched constructs thus this paper confirmed the relationships of the researched construct with TAM showing the effects on how and why the said relationships exist. Empirically, four (4) relationships were supported with evidences.

This paper examined two external variables in addition to the TAM constructs as well as focusing only on the federal ministries in Nigeria; future research can investigate more critical factors. Furthermore, the scope of focus can be broadened by future research to include more stakeholders and other African countries. This can help in generalisation of results. In addition, this paper used SmartPLS 2.0, other soft-ware can be utilized for analyses which may give more significant results.

Reference


Drivers and Barriers of Sustainability Practices in Emerging and Developing Economies

1Zeeshan Mahmood, 2 Waris Ali, 3Javed Iqbal, 4Sadaf Fatima

1Department of Commerce, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, Pakistan. zeeshanmahmood@bzu.edu.pk
2Department of Management Sciences, University of Sahiwal, Sahiwal Pakistan. waris.ali@bzu.edu.pk
3Institute of Management Sciences, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, Pakistan. javediqbal@bzu.edu.pk
4Department of Commerce, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, Pakistan. sadaf.fatima.sahu@gmail.com

ARTICLE DETAILS

History
Revised format: May 2019
Available Online: June 2019

Keywords
Sustainability practices, SMEs, Institutional theory, Emerging Economies, Pakistan.

JEL Classification: Q56, B52

ABSTRACT
This paper examines the drivers and barriers to adopt sustainability practices in Pakistani SMEs. Corporate sustainability has become important issue during the last few decades. Existing literature focus on large companies and thereby paid limited attention to SMEs. There is an increased understanding that SMEs should focus on sustainability practices to remain competitive. There is limited research that capture the extent of adoption of sustainability practices as well as its drivers and barriers. This paper fills the gap and uses institutional theory to explain the drivers and barriers of sustainability practices in SMEs of Pakistan. This qualitative research was conducted in Multan, Pakistan where interviewees from the managers of eight SMEs in the manufacturing sector were conducted. In addition to this questionnaire was sent to SMEs in order to capture the extent of the adoption of sustainability practices. The research findings show certain drivers: commitment by top management, competitor pressure, stakeholders’ pressure and barriers: lack of resources, lack of training and education and lack of awareness for the adoption of sustainability practices. This paper contributes to the sustainability literature in emerging and developing countries. Through an increased awareness of drivers and barriers, policy makers and practitioners may take necessary steps to improve sustainability practices in SMEs

© 2019 Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: zeeshanmahmood@bzu.edu.pk

DOI: DOI 10.26710/jbsee.v5i1.683

1. Introduction
Pressure on Companies to adopt sustainability practices has been increased due to the globalization. Various supranational institutions, governmental as well as non-governmental organizations and professional associations are promoting the agenda for sustainable development. Prior to the year 1980, sustainable development was part of the environmental lexicon, especially in the third world development context. The concept of sustainable development gained momentum when the World Commission on Environment and Development (WCED) defined the term as ‘development that meet the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generation to meet their own need’ (Brundtland, 1987, p. 43). “Sustainability” is a term that has also many definitions. Many authors use this term by different names in their papers like energy efficiency, green practices, environmental management (Hillary, 2004; Trianni, Cagno, Thollander, & Backlund, 2013). The term sustainability has emerged

213
over time from the “triple bottom-line” consideration that includes social, economic and environmental responsibility (Lu et al., 2015).

Corporate behavior for sustainable development has acquired new relevance recently. The increasing interest in sustainability is because of the increasing occurrence and growing awareness of the socioeconomic and environmental issues. Previous literature shows the issues facing by the organizations due to the environment. There is a propensity to legitimize firms that act in a socio-responsible manner toward environmental impact (Vincenza Ciasullo & Troisi, 2013). Climate change has become one of the greatest challenges for mankind today. Our ecosystem is deteriorating due to the increased deforestation, consumption of non-renewable resources and global warming. With the increased problems related to the environment like global warming, air pollution, water pollution, waste problems and land degradation, most of the firms have moved towards engaging and practicing environmentally friendly practices (Leonidou, Katsikeas, Fotiadis, & Christodoulides, 2013). These challenges appeared to be the great and most important challenges, not only for humanity but also, for the sustainability of the business (Kim, Kim, & Qian, 2018). Thus, now it has become compulsory for the firms to take up the matter seriously, by developing new strategies, in order to survive in this new business environment (Guenther & Hoppe, 2014)

Business organizations are an important player for sustainable development. The activities of the business may contribute both positively and negatively to sustainable development (Gray & Milne, 2002; Herzig & Schaltegger, 2006). In recent years, the demands for business behaviors that are consistent with sustainability are increasing (Milne, Tregidga, & Walton, 2009). Therefore, the concept of corporate sustainability is gaining prominence in the agenda of governmental and non-governmental organizations (Christofi, Christofi, & Sisaye, 2012; Montiel & Delgado-Ceballos, 2014). The concept of corporate sustainability is based on the fundamental belief that business, through sustainable performance, can deal with sustainable development. this context, corporate sustainability performance, can be considered as the degree to which an organization incorporates global sustainable performance, can be considered as the degree to which an organization incorporates global sustainable development responsibilities into its business strategy and operations (Morioka & de Carvalho, 2016). Over the years, several practices (e.g. sustainability accounting, sustainability reporting, sustainability balanced scorecard) has been develops to incorporate the dimensions of corporate sustainability so that companies can contribute to sustainable development (Lourenço & Branco, 2013).

Firms are under ever increasing pressure by investors, policy makers, stakeholders and shareholders to adopt sustainability practices and to consider sustainability performance more seriously (Morioka & de Carvalho, 2016). Existing research on sustainability has focused on pressures, challenges and opportunities to adopt sustainability practices in big organizations and moreover due to these pressures and opportunities the firms are getting involved the sustainability practices. Mostly big corporations have taken step to adopt sustainable practices, but small and medium enterprises are less aware, However the existing research on sustainability lacks the issues and opportunities of the sustainability practices in the small and medium enterprises.

2. Sustainability Practices in Small and Medium Enterprises
Sustainability incorporates social, environmental and economic impacts on business. It is important for the economic growth and employment that the sustainable business practices should be maintained. Sustainable practices ensure the social progress, recognition the needs of everyone and they preserve the natural resources in future. Previous studies have focused on analysis of existing sustainable practices in different countries. For example, (Retamal, 2017) identified some sustainable practices in their study that include: use of durable quality goods, repair, recycling, minimize transport of goods, minimum disposable packaging, reduce private vehicle kilometer travelled. Delai and Takahashi (2013) also added some practices to the literature that include (1) environmental; air (global warming, human health effect, ozone depletion), Water (consumption, acid), land (land use, waste production), energy (consumption and resources), materials (dissatisfaction of consumption and consumption), bio-avid and products and services (product recycling and environmentally friendly products (2) Social warehouse and decent work (education, training and development), corporate citizenship, customer relationship management, suppliers and partners and public sector ( taxes and subsidies). Similarly, Font, Garay, and Jones (2016) explains some sustainability practices in their research that include (1) environmental: to use environmental friendly products, recycling the waste, energy and water saving activities (2) social: encourage people to apply for jobs, in your employment practices promote gender equality, facilities are adopted for disables persons (3) economic: encourage customers to use local products, wherever possible choose local staff, salaries of
the staff are above industry average. After reviewing these studies and other literature (see, e.g., De Silva & Forbes, 2016; Delai & Takahashi, 2013; Retamal, 2017; Scur & Barbosa, 2017) we derived a list of practices that are commonly referred as sustainability practices. These practices include: waste management, recycling, energy saving, water saving, customer satisfaction, packaging, total quality management, employee education and training and sustainability reporting. This study is using these practices for research.

Due to many problems facing SMEs, many developed countries have set rules that are specific to small and medium enterprises. These regulations protect small and medium enterprises while regulating their environmental impact. Many studies show that there is lack of such regulations in developing countries. But mostly developed countries have set regulation regarding sustainability practices. Like, in the United States, Regulatory Flexible Act (RFA) and Small Business Regulatory Implementation Act (SBREFA) wants to provide SMEs with clear and guidance on the environmental management regulatory. Although an individual SME, because of small size, may have a relatively low impact on the environment, their overall impact is huge on account of large size of the SME sector (Brammer, Hoejmose, & Marchant, 2012). SMEs are providing 90% of the worldwide business and 70% pollution is generated by SMEs, yet the literature shows the mainly focus of sustainability on large organizations, often multinational companies.

The economy of Pakistan is heavily dependent on SMEs. Ninety nine percent of Pakistani business consists of SMEs which is contributing to 40% of Pakistani GDP, 70% of Pakistan’s on agricultural employment, 25% of Pakistan’s export earnings and 35% of the value-added manufacturing industry. In any economy, SMEs plays crucial role. They provide jobs and contributes in the economy in different ways. Pakistan is a country with larger population, a country having noticeable debt and export/import imbalances. Given the importance of SMEs in the economy on national and international level and its impact on social and environmental issues it was surprising that SMEs relatively marginalized in the discussion on sustainability and relatively ignored in academic research.

The concept of sustainability in Pakistan is quite new. There is imperative need to understand the sustainability/environmental and social issues for the Pakistani business community. The organizations are considered as being innovative that are adopting sustainable practices. The business community of Pakistan needs to adopt these sustainable business practices not only to respond the challenges of the sustainable development of Pakistan, but also to comply with the competitor and regulatory pressures. In this perspective, this research aims to identify some sustainable business practices adopting by different country’s organizations. ACCA Pakistan has conducted a research on sustainability practices. The research shows twelve sustainability practices that is taken in this research. The practices are “Energy saving, water saving, reducing in fertilizer use, concern for bio diversity, water purification, compliance with product and waste disposal regulations, employee education and training, workforce diversity, workforce health care provision, community investment/local philanthropy, conformity with recognized environmental management standards, e.g. ISO14401, sustainability reporting”.

Existing research has identified many drivers for the adoption of sustainable business practices. According to bin Ibrahim and binti Jaafar (2016) key drivers include: customer pressure, regulatory pressure, government support and uncertainty of environment.. Some other factors identified by Scur and Barbosa (2017) include environmental regulations, stakeholder and customer pressure, financial benefits, competitors, market trends, company image, environmental conservation, supply chain requirements, green innovation, internal motivations and employee demand. Yusof, Abidin, Zailani, Govindan, and Iranmanesh (2016) has identifies internal and external environmental drivers to implement sustainable practices. Internal drivers include organizational support and quality of human resources and external drivers includes customer pressure, regulatory pressure and government support.

Numerous studies also highlighted many barriers experienced by owners-managers regarding environment and sustainability practices (Lawrence, Collins, Pavlovich, & Arunachalam, 2006). These barriers include external factors such as lack of awareness, lack of knowledge and skill, the lack of consumer demand and supply chain pressure for environmental reform. These barriers also include internal barriers, such as owner-managers’ perception that their firms’ impact is insignificant (Lawrence et al., 2006). (Ghazilla et al., 2015) identify some barriers to implement sustainable practices that are organizational, environmental knowledge, business environment, societal influence, technology, regulation/government, financial and supplier). The previous research has suggested that “the lack of resources” is a major obstacle Environmental measures, including financial resources, knowledge and loss in time between SMEs (Sweeney, 2007). High investment costs and lack of
financial resources, doubtful payback about green investment, lack of human resources in green initiatives, lack of ICT skills for managing green initiatives, lack of environmental customer awareness, lack of financial incentives and lack of well-defined regulations framework. These are some barriers pointed out by (Evangelista, 2014).

3. Theoretical Framework:
This study used institutional theory to explain the drivers of sustainability practices. According to a great number of researchers (for example Mohanty & Prakash, 2014; Zhu, Sarkis, & Lai, 2007) institutional pressure is one of the most important factors that have encouraged companies to implement sustainability practices. According to institutional theory (Scott, 2008), adoption of sustainability practices may be result of three different types of pressure; coercive pressure (the pressure from the regulatory bodies and government), Mimetic pressure (The pressure from competitors and rivals), and the normative pressure (that comes from market and public).

Institutional Theory has been used extensively in studies exploring environmental management (e.g. Bansal, 2005; Hoffman, 1999). Coercive pressure includes the pressure from stakeholders like customers, regulations and competitors. According to Large and Thomsen (2011) the customers and stakeholders are responsible for the environmental performance of the organizations. In this context, besides companies, partners like governments, consumers and environmental organizations have also played a role in increasing the of sustainability practices. The normative pillar focuses on values and norms (Scott, 2008). The main role in the field builds social expectations, which include what is necessary for an organization and how things should be done. These expectations become external pressure for an organization in which the organization adopts organizational methods with great motivation to respect social responsibilities (Greenwood, Oliver, Lawrence, & Meyer, 2017). Manufacturers can be motivated through normative driver to start their sustainable purchasing effort Normative pressures are very important for organizations to implement sustainable practices and it can come from consumers and sustainable organizations can (Barber, 2007). Mimetic drivers can promote manufacturers to learn from those pioneer companies. Mimetic drivers motivate companies to emulate the practices of successful competitors in the industry. Manufacturers have gained the opportunities to learn, how to compete in the industry, from domestic and foreign competitor (Gollagher et al., 2010).

4. Research methodology
This research adopts qualitative methodology as it is best suited to capture the perceptions of respondents about various issues (for example benefit, drivers and barriers). It allows researcher to be involved in the research process. There is absence of the qualitative methods in the field of sustainability practices in SMEs, especially in the context of Pakistan. This method is different in the context of data collection, interaction with different participants, analyzing data and findings. Qualitative method is important because it deals with the values and ideologies that help the deepen research. This study contains three research questions. The first question relate to the extent SMEs are adopting sustainability practices. To answer this, question a questionnaire was developed and distributed to managers of different SMEs. A total of 200 questionnaires were filled and duly received by us. The second and third questions relate to the drivers and barriers of sustainability practices. To answers these questions semi-structured interviews were conducted with managers of SMEs based in Multan. The 8 Small and Medium Enterprises investigated are in the Multan region. As it is impossible both financially and physically, to survey all SMEs in all categories i.e. manufacturing, trading, services and textile. So, this study chooses the textile sector for interviews.

5. Results
5.1 Sustainability practices have been adopted in Pakistani SMEs
The extent of use was analyzed by filling the questionnaires. Table below shows the results of the questionnaires.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Practices</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Extent of use</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Rarely</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-Waste Management</td>
<td>85%</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.2 Barriers to adopt sustainability practices

5.2.1 Lack of resources

We found that many companies do not invest in sustainability practices due to the lack of resources. In an interview the respondent says,

“Limited access to capital prevents us to adopt sustainability practices. Although we are trying to adopt these practices but still, we are not practicing. Because our organization is small enterprise, we don’t have enough budget to adopt sustainability practices” (Interviewee1)

Resources is not big issue for big corporations, but for small and medium enterprises lack of resources is main issue. Many SMEs do not have enough finances to implement sustainable practices. Like the argument of Apeaning and Thollander (2013) that the lack of capital is the main barrier for SMEs to adopt sustainability practices, that prohibits the organizations to adopt sustainability practices. another interviewee says,

“If we adopt such practices, this require finance to initiate. And we have limited resources and finance to carry on our day to day operations. We mainly work on our goal that is making production. But we use some measures we feel that they are compulsory for our organization. Because our organization is textile, so we follow some measures like labor safety laws” (interviewee 4)

Thollander, Danestig, and Rohdin (2007) identified that SMEs tend to prioritize other capital investment, but they ignore the adoption of sustainability practices. Consistent with their view, one of the respondents said that as the have limited resources so they priorities to invest in other projects for the sake of profit.

“As every organization’s purpose is to make profit. Our organization is small sized and have limited resources. So, our top management priorities to invest in other capital investment rather to invest sustainability practices. It is obvious that adoption of sustainability practices takes capital and we (SME) don’t have enough finance to adopt these practices” (Interviewee 6)

5.2.2 Lack of awareness

Lack of awareness has been identified as another main barrier for the adoption of sustainability practices. Besides this, if people are aware than they resist to change, this is also the barrier while implementing sustainable practices. One of the respondents said,
“The personnel’s in our organizations may resist to change if we adopt these sustainability practices. Moreover, they may also not have environmental values, therefore they give a lower priority to sustainability practices” (Interviewee 6)

Most of the SMEs have a problem that their managers were unaware about sustainability practices. The lack of expertise and understanding of strategies to address environmental issues is the second barrier. Many SMEs not having expertise have trouble to adopt sustainable practices (Simpson, Taylor, & Barker, 2004). Consistent with the views of the authors one of the interviewees says,

“Management is unaware about the long-term benefits of sustainability practices. This is barrier for our organization that management is unaware of the benefits of the sustainability practices. Moreover, our organization does not have expertise to make strategies for implementing these practices, so this is the main barrier for us (SME)” (Interviewee 1)

However, not all managers agree with this point that lack of awareness is the main issue. For example, one of the interviewees explain in these words.

“I am not agreeing that the managers are unaware about sustainability practices. Now days every organization knows about the perceived benefits of these practices. Many organizations are moving towards these practices. As well as our organization is concerned, as a manager I am aware about sustainability practices, but our upper management is not making any rules to adopt sustainability practices” (Interviewee 4)

5.2.3 Lack of staff Training and skill
Most of the SMEs are facing the problem of staff training and lack of skills. When we take the interviews some of the SMEs showed that they have old staff. They have no adequate skills that are necessary to use these sustainability practices. So, keeping in mind the perspective of the previous studies we ask from one of the respondents about this fact he says,

“Training is the best thing whenever any organization want to change something. Because we cannot replace whole the staff, so the best way is to organize the trainings. But there are no training programmers held in our organizations, so many of the members of the organization do not have enough capabilities to adopt sustainability practices” (Interviewee 1)

Level of knowledge and experience of the managers and other staff is very important for adopting sustainability practices. Similarly, awareness to seek knowledge about change is also important. For this purpose, teamwork is leading factor. One of the respondents talks about this factor, he says,

“Nothing is impossible to learn. We know adopting sustainability practices are beneficial for our (SME) organization. But according to me there is lack of coordination and lack of teamwork too that leads to problem of learning about these practices. If the management emphasis on teamwork than may b there is no need for special training programme” (Interviewee 6)

5.3 Drivers to adopt Sustainability practices
5.3.1 Stakeholders pressure
Bianchi and Noci (1998) suggest that environmental management in SMEs stems from one of two channels; either the attitudes of managers–owners or stakeholder pressure and interaction. One of the respondents says,

“We are using CSR approach and it is highly appreciated to achieve goals with social responsibility. We are using sustainability practices because of our stakeholder’s demand. Obviously, stakeholders who invests in our organization, they pressurize us to adopt sustainability practices” (Interviewee 3)

Sustainability is related in the context with responsibility and is defined by the owner values. Most of the stakeholders have believe that the organization should adopt those policies and acts that will show the norms and values of the organization. Many stakeholders pressurize their enterprises to adopt sustainability practices because in this way they feel honorable because these practices show that they care about the lives of the people and their
organization have values. One of the interviewees says,

“Yes, we are using sustainability practices. The main reason why we are adopting these practices is the pressure from our stakeholders. They believe that this shows our norms and values and our care towards people. Personally, I also believe that by using sustainability practices our image will increase, in the sense that we (SMEs) are working on the base of values.” (Interviewee 7)

Consistent with the results of these authors one of the respondents give the statement,

“I must say that due to the pressure of our stakeholders we are adopting sustainability practices. According to me this is not necessary that if we adopt sustainability practices, our financial performance will increase. But our stakeholders believe that the financial performance will increase if we adopt sustainability practices” (Interviewee 1)

5.3.2 Competitors pressure
Majority of SMEs have competitors’ pressure to adopt sustainability practices. One of the respondents say

“Yes, we are adopting sustainability practices as it could provide a competitive advantage. We (SME) have a strategy “have a keen eye on your competitors” to compete our rivals. So, we have to adopt sustainability practices because our competitors are moving toward these practices” (Interviewee 1)

While taking interview from one of the interviewees, he revealed the fact that was quite different from the others. According to him, their organization have enough financial resources to continue their operations and they are making very good profit, so he commented,

“Why you think there is always a competitive pressure behind adopting any strategies? We have our own system, our own strategies. We are doing our best and we are on the high ratio of profit. We don’t see what our competitors are doing. We always work on our set strategies. We do what we must do. Although we are adopting sustainability practices but not because of our competitors, but because of our own set strategies” (Interviewee 3)

5.3.3 Regulatory pressure
Legislation appears to be one of the main drivers of sustainability practices amongst SMEs as reported by the following interviewee.

“We are facing regulatory pressure from government. We are adopting some of the sustainability practices by our own. But there are some practices which we have to adopt because of the regulatory pressure like it is compulsory for the textile enterprises to have 5% open area” (Interviewee 2)

Environmental fitness is a compulsory factor the governments demand from organizations (Mohanty & Prakash, 2014). According to Carbone and Moatti (2011) some current studies explore that for adopting sustainability practices, there are different standards, depending on the type of institutional pressure. Pakistani Government have also implemented many acts and regulations for environment protection. Similarly, when we interviewed one of the SMEs, they explain the fact that there are many regulations from

“We have regulatory pressure to adopt sustainability practices. According to me now it is trending to adopt sustainability practices due to many reasons, one of the important reasons is the rules and regulations imposed by the government to save the environment.” (Interviewee 1)

The concept of sustainability is growing in Pakistan. With the growing concept of sustainability practices the regulations by government are also increased. Some organizations are adopting sustainability practices because they feel it necessary to save the environment, other are adopting because of the regulatory pressure by the government. There are many laws and regulations prepared by the government of Pakistan to save the environment. While interviewing, one of the respondents explore about the regulations they have to follow. In his words,

“Government have implemented some rules regarding environmental protection. It is mandatory for us to
follow those rules. Labor safety laws and waste disposals are the rules that we are following by the pressure of the government.” (Interviewee 5)

5.4 Commitment by the top management:
Management is the main thing for the achievement of the long-term goals. While taking interviews one of the respondents says,

“According to me, management has key role in the adoption of sustainability practices. Many organizations have strategies on the implementation of sustainability practices, but few are implementing, because their management is not serious in practicing. So, if the top management is committed, it can drive organizations to adopt such practices”. (Interviewee 8)

Another respondent elaborates about the regulations set by the top management. Strict environmental regulations by the top management pushes the organizations to adopt the sustainability practices to reduce the cost and increase the efficiency. In his words,

“We (SME) are adopting sustainability practices because our top management has strict regulations to adopt these practices. As far as, I know the reason is not that the other firms are adopting so we should, rather by adopting sustainability practices, the cost can be reduced, and the overall firm’s efficiency increased.” (Interviewee 5)

6. Conclusion:
Our research confirms the presence of coercive, normative and mimetic pressures in the adoption of sustainability practices. According to our interviewees important drivers of sustainability practices are the regulatory pressure (Coercive), stakeholder’s pressure (Normative), competitor’s pressure (Mimetic) and commitment by top management. Our research also shows some barriers to adopt these practices that are lack of resources, lack of training and education, and lack of awareness. Consistent with the results of Vanalle, Ganga, Godinho Filho, and Lucato (2017), this research has concluded that competitive pressures and stakeholder pressures are one of the main driver for the adoption of sustainability practices. Stakeholders exert normative pressures on companies to implement ecofriendly environmental practices. Firms employ their resources to implement the sustainability practices to answer their stakeholders. The research findings show that SMEs adopts sustainability practices if there are regulatory pressure. This is the driver to adopt sustainability practices and called coercive driver. Regulatory pressures forces SMEs to adopt sustainability practices. This study confirms lack of resources, lack of training and lack of awareness as main barrier in the adoption of sustainability practices. Scarcity of these resources result in limited normative pressure which means that sustainability practices are mainly driven by coercive and normative pressures.

This research has some practical implications. First this research will help the policy makers by highlighting the barriers which are faced by SMEs in the implementation of sustainability practices. This study confirms the lack of normative pressures which is why the adoption of sustainability practices is limited. Policy makers can make sustainability education part of the curriculum at different levels. In the absence of normative pressures, policy makers may think of taking the regulatory route to enforce the adoption of sustainability practices. There is also a need to change the mindset of the managerial staff of SMEs that sustainability practices bring benefits for the company. This research may be a beginning point for further investigation of sustainability practices among SMEs in Pakistan and promote Pakistani researchers’ interest to use SMEs sector as a population. It is expected that the Pakistani government will give more attention towards sustainability practices in SMEs and improve existing training programmes on the adoption of sustainability practices.

References


Delai, I., & Takahashi, S. (2013). Corporate sustainability in emerging markets: insights from the practices reported by the Brazilian retailers. *Journal of Cleaner Production, 47*, 211-221.


