INTRODUCTION

Journal of Business and Social Review in Emerging Economies (ISSN: 2519-089X & eISSN: 2519-0326) is a peer-reviewed research journal published bi-annually by CSRC Publishing, Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan. The journal is independently managed by the advisory board and associate fellows of CSRC comprising of distinguished faculty at higher education institutions. The journal aims to cover topics and issues in various sub-areas of business, social and behavioral sciences in context of emerging and developing economies. Purpose is to highlight the theoretical and practical issues faced by businesses and society in these economies. The journal specially welcomes submissions which cover the topical areas related to sustainable business and society.

SCOPE AND MISSION

Issues of sustainable economic development are mainly interwoven into economic policies and dynamics of business markets in emerging and developing economies. With this background JBSEE aims to be a premier forum for policy and theoretical discussion of high impact research in emerging economies.

The journal aims to cover topics and issues in various sub-areas of business, social and behavioral sciences in context of emerging and developing economies. Purpose is to highlight the theoretical and practical issues faced by businesses and society in these economies. The journal specially welcomes submissions which cover the topical areas related to sustainable business and society.
EDITORIAL BOARD

Patron

- Prof Dr Hayat Muhammad Awan, President, Center of Sustainability and Research Center

Editor in Chief

- Assoc Prof Dr Abdul Halim Abdul Majid, Universiti Utara Malaysia, Malaysia

Managing Editors

- Prof Dr Ghulam Shabir, University of Central Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan

Associate Editors

- Prof. Dr. Muhammad Hanif Akhtar, Bahauddin Zakariya University Multan, Pakistan
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Noman Ahmad Abbasi, Bahauddin Zakariya University Multan, Pakistan
- Prof Dr Noor Azniza bt Ishak, Universiti Utara Malaysia, Malaysia
- Dr Muhammad Amsal Sahban, STIM Lasharan Jaya Institute, Indonesia
- Dr. Sulaman Hafeez Siddiqui, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Pakistan

Editorial Advisory Board

- Prof. Dr. Abdul Wajid Rana, Lahore School of Economics, Pakistan.
- Prof. Dr. Ruswiati Suryasaputra, Universitas Wijaya Kusuma Surabaya Indonesia.
- Prof. Dr. Mohd Noor Mohd Sahrriff, Universiti Utara Malaysia.
- Prof. Dr. Norshuhada Shiratuddin, Universiti Utara Malaysia.
- Prof. Dr. Anayo Dominic Nkamnebe, Nnamdi Azikiwe University Nigeria.
- Prof. Dr. Jose E. Munoz, Point Loma Nazarene University California USA.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. D. E. Laouisset, Nottingham Business School, UK.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Maria Alejandra Gonzalez-Perez, Universidad EAFIT Colombia.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Shankar Chattopadhyay, School of Management Universiti Sains Malaysia.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Asst. Prof. Dr. S. A. Safdar, Bahauddin Zakariya University Multan Pakistan.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Asst. Prof. Dr. F. A. Genc, Abdullah Gül University, Kayseri, Turkey.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Asst. Prof. Dr. A. Basil, International Islamic University Islamabad Pakistan.
• Dr. Diana Bank Weinberg, Berlin School of Economics and law (HWR), Germany.
• Dr. Muhammad Haroon Hafeez, Bahauddin Zakariya University Multan Pakistan.
• Dr. Waheed Asghar, Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority Punjab Pakistan.
• Dr. Otega Okinono, Delta State University, Nigeria.
• Dr. Muhammad Rizwan, Middlesex University Business School, London.
INDEXING AND ABSTRACTING

The Journal of Business and Social Review in Emerging Economies is indexed and abstracted by following institutions. The publishing manager and editorial team are committed to enhance outreach of the journal by expanding the indexing and abstracting of its content further.

- JEL (Journal of Economic Literature-EconLit)
- WorldCat of Library Literature and Information (LibLit)
- British Library
- DOAJ
- BAS (Bibliography of Asian Studies) EBSCOHOST-only studies with Asian context
- ECONBIZ (German National Library of Economics-ZBW)
- Ulrich’s Periodicals Directory/ProQuest/ International Bibliography of the Social Sciences (IBSS)
- ProQuest/ Humanities Index (HumInd)
- SocioRepec
- EconPapers
- SUNCAT
- Google Scholar
- Crossref
- Scilit
- OAI-PMH Compliant Repositories
- RePEc
- Copac
- EDRIC
- IDEAS
- NLB (National Library Board Singapore)
- BASE
- Zetoc
- ESJI (Eurasian Scientific Journal Index)
- SHERPA/RoMEO
- DRJI (Directory of Research Journals Indexing)
- ResearchBib
- LogEc
- CitEc
**Composite Appraisal of Women Development in Selected Thirty-six Countries with Special Focus on Pakistan: Applying Grey Incidence Analysis Model**  
Tehmina Fiaz Qazi, Abdul Basit, Waheed Asghar, Abdul Aziz Khan Niazi  
1227-1236

**Environmental Disclosures and Environmental Management Strategies – A study of Pakistani Listed companies**  
Waris Ali, Muhammad Abdul Basit Memon, Muhammad Mudassar Anwar, Rehana Kouser  
1237-1253

**Parental Satisfaction and Involvement in the Provision of Early Childhood Special Education to their Young Children with Deafness**  
Ghulam Fatima, Misbah Malik, Samina Ashraf  
1255-1266

**Media Framing of Pandemics: A Case Study of the Coverage of COVID-19 in Elite Newspapers of Pakistan**  
Ayesha Siddiqua, Ghulam Shabir, Atif Ashraf, Ammad Khaliq  
1267-1275

**Corporate Social Responsibility for Competitive Advantage in Project Management: Evidence from Multinational Fast-Food Companies in Pakistan**  
Mariam Sohail, Shahid Iqbal, Waheed Asghar, Syed Arslan Haider  
1277-1288

**Assessing the Mediating Role of Organization Learning Capability between the Relationship of Green Intellectual Capital and Business Sustainability**  
Muhammad Rizwan Sabir, Muqqadas Rehman, Waheed Asghar  
1289-1301

**Service Quality and Customer Retention in Malaysian Commercial Banks**  
Chim Weng Kong, Maria Abdul Rahman  
1303-1312

**The Impact of Covid-19 Pandemic on Mental Well-Being of Health Care Workers: A Multicenter Study**  
Nabila Hassan, Hina Akmal Memon, Noreen Hassan, Shobha Luxmi, Farhat Sultana  
1313-1322

**The Impact of China-Pak Economic Corridor (CPEC) on Pakistan Stock Exchange (PSX)**  
Muhammad Mudasar Ghafoor, Zahid Hussain, Muhammad Yasir Saeed  
1323-1333

**Extent of Integration in Agriculture Supply Chain: The Public Sector Stakeholders perspective**  
Nadir Munir Hassan, Muhammad Nauman Abbasi  
1335-1351

**Police Brutality and Reforms in Pakistan**  
Najma Sadiq, Ume Laila, Tahir Mehmood, Tooba Rehan Haqqi  
1353-1359

**Horrors of Class System: A Marxist Critique of Mansfield’s Doll’s House**  
Sidra Ahmad, Selina Aziz, Salman Amin  
1361-1367
Shahid Iqbal, Nabeel Ehtisham, Syed Farqaleet K. Bukhari, Shahid Mahmood

Pre and Post Covid-19 Lockdown: How the AQI of Three Major Cities of Pakistan will Change? 1379-1389
Ume Laila, Najma Sadiq, Tahir Mehmood, Tooba Rehan Haqqi

Money Demand Balances and Exchange Rate Policy in Pakistan: An ARDL and Non-ARDL Analysis 1391-1399
Shazia Sana, Shahnawaz Malik, Muhammad Ramzan Sheikh, Muhammad Hanif Akhtar

International ESL Students’ Experiences and Perceptions of Effective and Constructive Feedback Practises on their Academic Writing in MA Programme 1401-1413
Marukh Shakir, Mujahid Shah, Munir Khattak

Corporal Punishment Act in Public Schools: A Phenomenological Analysis of Perceptions of Practitioners 1415-1425
Nargis Abbas, Beenish Ijaz Butt, Uzma Ashiq

Assessing Mathematics Teachers’ Dispositions 1427-1437
Khadijah Batool, Muhammad Anwer, Muhammad Shabbir

Interrelation of Multiple Intelligences and their Correlation with Linguistic Intelligence as Perceived by College Students: A Correlation Study 1439-1447
Wajiha Kanwal, Quratulain, Iffat Basit

Early Marriage in Pakistan: So Little Done, but So Much to Do 1449-1456
Uzma Ashiq, Nargis Abbas, Amir Zada Asad

The Socio-Political Obstacles Behind the Scanty Political Participation of Women Parliamentarians 1457-1461
Hamida Bibi

Violent Behavioural Outcomes: An Empirical Examination of Perceived Parenting Rejection Practices in Lahore, Pakistan 1463-1467
Hassan Raza, Saif-ur-Rehmn Saif Abbas, Nazneen Habib

Nigeria’s First Republic and Post 1966 Federalism: A Comparative Study 1469-1478
Isah Shehu Mohammed, Muhammad Fuad bn Othman, Nazariah Binti Osman

The Impact of Economic Growth, Foreign Direct Investment, Urbanization, Fossils Fuel Consumption on Environmental Degradation in Emerging Asian Economies 1479-1495
Muhammad Waqas Ashraf, Hafeez ur Rehman, Imran Sharif Chaudhry

Relationship Between Time Management Behavior and Academic Performance of University Students 1497-1504
Abdur Rashid, Ilyas Sharif, Shakeel Khan, Fazal Malik
Determinants of Customer Perception about adoption of Islamic Insurance (Takaful) in Pakistan
Areeba Khan, Hafiz Abdur Rashid, Rana Muhammad Shahid Yaqub, Saba Abbas

Measuring Pakistan’s Legislative Preparedness against COVID-19: A Critical Study of Newly Promulgated Law
Jibran Jamshed, Ammara Mujtaba, Muhammad Waqas Javed, Syed Wajdan Rafay Bukhari

Socio-Economic and Political Impacts of Vocational Trainings on Tribal Community of Pakistan
Sami Ullah, Zilakat Khan Malik

Social Media Marketing and Committed Customer: Analyzing the Underlying role of Customer Commitment in Developing Country Context
Hafiz Muhammad Usman Khizar, Rana Muhammad Shahid Yaqub, Tasawar Javed, Shanayyara Mahmood

Strategic Dimensions of CPEC: Role of Regional and International Powers
Muhammad Ijaz Latif, Muhammad Tayyab Zia

A Comparative Study of Perjury in Legal System of Pakistan and Islamic Law
Rashida Zahoor, Muhammad Fahad Anwar, Muhammad Asif Safdar, Jibran Jamshed

Implicit Change Leadership, Affective Commitment to Change, and the Mediating Role of Organizational Trust
Sarfraz Ahmed Dakhan, Sheraz Rajput, Tariq Aziz, Khalil Ahmed Channa

Awareness on Islamic Banking: An Investigation on Women Entrepreneurs in Quetta
Saba Raja, Jameel Ahmed, Kaneez Fatima

Sectarianism in Pakistan: A Statistical Analysis of Problems of Shia Hazara Community of Quetta
Gulshan Majeed

Mechanism Between Organizational Support Factors and Motivation to Transfer: Mediating Role of Self-Efficacy
Zeshan Ahmer, Muhammad Aamir, Majid Ali, Muhammad Usman

A Descriptive Analysis of Compensation Offerings and its Impact on Turnover Intentions of Educational Managers of Punjab
Majid Ali, Muhammad Ramzan, Rizwan Qaiser Danish

The Development of a Questionnaire to Measure the Institutional Performance in Higher Education Institutions
Gulshan Fatima Alvi, Nazma Bibi, Mahwish Safder

University Readiness and University Adjustment: Lived Experience of First-generation University Students
Waqas Ahmad, Sadaf Mahmood, Muhammad Shabbir, Nazia Malik
Effect of Practices Executed by Monitoring Education Assistants on Elementary School Teachers’ Mental Health
Sumaira Munawar, Khadija Sittar, Misbah Malik
Composite Appraisal of Women Development in Selected Thirty-six Countries with Special Focus on Pakistan: Applying Grey Incidence Analysis Model

1Tehmina Fiaz Qazi, 2Abdul Basit, 3Waheed Asghar, 4Abdul Aziz Khan Niazi
1Hailey College of Banking and Finance, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan, tehmina.qazi@gmail.com
2Lahore Institute of Science & Technology, Lahore, Pakistan, abasit_shahbaz@yahoo.com
3Director in Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority, Government of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan, waheedasgharpk@gambar.com; director.at@tevta.gop.pk
4Institute of Business & Management, University of Engineering & Technology, Lahore, Pakistan, azizniazi@uet.edu.pk

ARTICLE DETAILS

History
Revised format: November 2020
Available Online: December 2020

Keywords
Countries, grey incidence analysis model, GRA, women development and Pakistan.

JEL Classification
M10, M14

ABSTRACT

Aim of the study is to appraise women development in selected thirty-six countries with special reference to Pakistan. The design of the study comprises of survey of literature, data elicitation and analysis. The study uses grey incidence analysis model (usually known as Grey Relational Analysis or simply GRA). The model has been applied on the secondary data extracted from the website of World Development Indicators (WDI). The countries included in the analysis have been selected on the basis of availability of data. From the result of GRA it can be learnt that thirty-six countries of the world are classified into seven different categories. There are five countries (namely Estonia, Hungary, Slovak Republic, Thailand and Ecuador) categorized as countries having exceptionally high women development, whereas, five countries under each next ensign (very high, high, moderate, low and very low). There are six countries (namely Tanzania, Madagascar, Cote d'Ivoire, Pakistan, Nigeria and Afghanistan) categorized under the ensign of exceptionally low. Pakistan fall under the ensign of exceptionally low. This study is designed on an original country level data extracted from very reliable source and the results of the study are useful for regulators, researchers, NGOs and other stakeholders of the phenomenon by way of providing deeper and new information.

© 2020 Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: azizniazi@uet.edu.pk


1. Introduction

Women play key role in economic and social development of any country. They play vital role in
nutrition security, generating income and improving standard of living. They also play significant role in agriculture. Women are primary caretakers of children and elders in almost every society. Women development is a hot topic of research in domain. There is influx of research studies on the topic viz Iqbal et al. (2016) carried a comprehensive study to assess gender disparities across 167 economies of the world by taking the component (i.e. providing incentive to work, using property, going to court, building credit, access to institutions, getting job and violence protection) of WBL legal gender disparity measure and proclaimed a high degree of legal gender disparity. Islam et al. (2018) gathered data from 59,000 firms of 94 economies and concluded that prevailing unequal laws discourage women participation and empowerment in top managerial positions of private sectors firms. Morgan and Pritchard (2019) discussed in detail gender matters in hospitality and emphasized on highlighting the issues of neglecting female ability despite of rise of feminism. Oladokun et al. (2018) analyzed data of 1502 from south-east and 5024 women from north-east of Nigeria to assess the levels of women assets ownership and bolstered that education plays a pertinent role in owning women assets ownership. A lot of work has also been done in Pakistan concerning women development like a study of women entrepreneurship by Qazi, Nazia, Basit and Hameed (2020). But the authors could not find any study that has compared women development at country level using a composite mathematical approach like grey incidence analysis model. Since it is a hot topic therefore a country level multi criteria analysis is call of the day in order to provide comprehensive and deeper new information to stakeholders. To be more specific there is a severe need of comparing the women development among different countries on objective basis. The objectives of the study are: i) to develop a theoretical framework for country level analysis of women development, ii) to rank the countries on the basis of grey relational grade, iii) evaluate the position of Pakistan qua other countries and iv) discuss the results qua reality. Major research questions are: i) how the countries rank against each other on the basis of women development? ii) where do Pakistan stand among its counterparts? In order to address the issue and attain the objectives of the study there are many alternate methodologies viz TOPSIS, VIKOR, SWARA, AHP, GRA, ISM, SEM etc. This study uses GRA since it seems to be the most appropriate method for analyzing the secondary data of multi alternative cum multi attribute phenomenon. Remaining part of the article is arranged as literature review, theoretical framework, methodology, results & discussions and concluding remarks.

2. Literature Review

Women development is highly researched area, there exists a plethora of research on the phenomenon. The authors have reviewed many studies relevant to the topic. While during the survey of research it was envisaged on authentic websites of research like ScienceDirect, JStor, Wiley-Blackwell, Taylor & Francis, etc. Relevant studies that are necessary to set out the outset of the study are reported in this article. Avalanche of published literature can be witnessed on women development across the globe including: identifying the capabilities of women’s leadership and sustainable development in Colombia (Barrios et al., 2020), exploring the relationship between female directorship and firm performance in France (Bennouri et al., 2018) gender inequality in assets ownership in Latin America (Deere et al., 2010), wage gaps of female-male among salaried workers in India (Deshpande et al., 2018; Lee & Wie, 2017; Menon & Rodgers, 2009), uncovered opportunities and barriers of female employment in sports in UK (Forsyth et al., 2019), women segregation in tourism employment in APEC region (Hutchings et al., 2020), women empowerment in East Africa (Miedema et al., 2018), women empowerment in Nepal (O'Hara & Clement, 2018), women asset ownership in rural south-east and north-east Nigeria (Oladokun et al., 2018), participation of Saudi women in development index (Omair et al., 2020), gender wage gap in Mexico (Popli, 2013), gender wage discrimination in Pakistan (Sabir & Aftab, 2007; Yasmin, 2009), gender wage inequality between 1992-2014 in Sri Lanka (Seneviratne, 2020), role of female directors and stock price in China (Shahab et al., 2020), women’s social and financial empowerment in Pakistan (Tahir et al., 2018) and gender wage gap in Philippines (Zveglich Jr. et al., 2019). Bennouri et al. (2018) examined the data of 394 French firms and affirmed that there is a positive relationship between female board directorship and firm performance; similar finding have been found by Nekhili & Gatfaoui (2013) and Peni (2014). Likewise, Chen et al. (2018); Chen at al. (2019) and Ullah et al. (2020) asserted that female board representation has positive impact on firm performance particularly for those firms who intend to be creative and innovative.del Carmen Triana et al. (2019)
argued that educational background of top management team and inter-organizational strategic alliance support for moderation between strategic change and senior management gender diversity. Deshpande et al. (2018) found male-female wage discrimination among salaried workers in India wherein female are likely to be paid less. Forsyth et al. (2019) identified barriers and opportunities of female employment in sports and bolstered that gender inequality is still need to be addressed in educational sports related settings. Hutchings et al. (2020) gathered data from tourism sector of 21 Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation (APEC) member economies and concluded that there is clear segregation of women in tourism employment across the economies due to intersectionality and cultural barriers. Salahodjaev and Jarilkapova (2020) collected data from 176 countries between 1990-2015 and buttressed that female parliamentarism has significant socio-economic results as increased political empowerment of female is vital to the reduction of deforestation levels for different income ranks in both developed and developing nations. Seneviratne (2020) examined gender wage inequality in Sri Lanka between 1994-2014 and revealed following results: i) shrink in gender wage inequality due to women’s human capital improvement, ii) overestimate gain in equality and iii) underestimate gender wage gap. Diederen et al. (2002) and Shinbrot et al. (2019) uncovered potential challenges and contributions for women leadership in sustainable development including: lack of self-confidence and patriarchal structure to refrain women to become leader. Tahir et al. (2018) stated that despite of taking initiative of Benazir Income Support Program (BISP) to alleviate the poverty and empower the women, there is no significant improvement is found in women’s empowerment socially and financially. Zeb and Ihsan (2020) found significant relationship between innovation, entrepreneurship and entrepreneurial performance. They argued that there is direct relationship between innovation and performance; innovation mediates the relationship; moreover, entrepreneurial qualities (i.e. need for achievement and risk-taking propensity) have significant effect on both entrepreneurial performance and innovation. Zveglich Jr. et al. (2019) affirmed that conservative proxies in Philippines undervalue the efforts of gender differences in work experience while discussing gender wage gap. From the aforementioned review following theoretical framework has been derived.

3. Theoretical Framework
Theoretical framework of a study fixes the limits of variables, data set, alternates and criteria (Abend, 2008). Here alternates are the selected countries whereas the criteria are the variables concerning the women development in each country. The nomenclature, operational definition, unit of measurement and acceptable characteristics of every criterion is expounded in Table 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Variable of Women Development</th>
<th>Measure</th>
<th>Criteria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Female Life Expectancy at Birth</td>
<td>Years</td>
<td>Larger is the best</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Female Account ownership at a financial institution or with a mobile-money-service provider</td>
<td>% of population ages 15+</td>
<td>Larger is the best</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Female wage and salaried workers</td>
<td>% of females employment</td>
<td>Larger is the best</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Firms with female participation in ownership</td>
<td>% of firms</td>
<td>Larger is the best</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Female share of employment in senior and middle management</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Larger is the best</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Women in parliaments</td>
<td>% of total seats</td>
<td>Larger is the best</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Nondiscrimination clause mentions gender in the constitution</td>
<td>1=yes; 0=no</td>
<td>Larger is the best</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The close observation of the variables listed in Table 1 possess the characteristics of larger is the best. However, the unit of measurement of the variables are different. The criteria taken to account for building the theoretical framework of the study was decided on the basis of availability of data on the variables.

4. Methodology
This study follows positivist research philosophy and deductive approach. It is a country level secondary data based descriptive study. Overall design of the study consists of literature survey, data elicitation and analysis. The data has been obtained from World Development Indicators (WDI), 2020. On the website of WDI, 2020 complete data of thirty-six countries and seven different variables was available which has been used for the purpose of investigation. The analysis of the study is based on grey system theory advanced by Julong Deng (1989). Out of this theory grey incidence analysis model has been used as a method of investigation. This model proceeds step wise as given in following section (Hamzæçi & Pekkaya, 2011; Kuo et al., 2008; Tayyar et al., 2014; Wu, 2002; Zhang et al., 2011).

5. Grey Incidence Analysis Model (GIAM)
Following steps of GIAM were used to access the best performer among different countries of the world:

Step 1: Created a data set and established decision matrix of data set using following formula:

\[
x_i(k) = \begin{bmatrix} x_1(1)x_1(2) & \cdots & x_1(m) \\ \vdots & \ddots & \vdots \\ x_n(1)x_n(2) & \cdots & x_n(m) \end{bmatrix}
\]  \hspace{1cm} (1)

Table 2: Original Set of Women Development Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr.</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Afghanistan</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Albania</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>...</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Poland</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>...</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Zambia</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source of Data: (World Development Indicators (WDI), 2020)

Step 2: Created reference series and comparison matrix using formula:

\[ x_0 = [x_0(1) \ldots \ldots \ldots x_0(n)] \]  \hspace{1cm} (2)

Reference series is formed with identifying best alternative from normalized matrix which is added to decision matrix to make a comparison among alternatives.

Table 3: Reference Sequence and Comparable Sequences

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr.</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>Reference Sequence</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Afghanistan</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Albania</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>...</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Poland</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>...</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Zambia</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Step 3: Created a normalized matrix using the following formulas for larger is the best/acceptable:

\[ x^*_i(k) = \frac{x_i^{(0)}(k) - \min x_i^{(0)}(k)}{\max x_i^{(0)}(k) - \min x_i^{(0)}(k)} \]  \hspace{1cm} (3)

Table 4: Normalized Comparable Sequences

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr.</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>Reference Sequence</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1230
For example, Afghanistan: female life expectancy at birth, larger is the best

$$x^0_i(1) = \frac{x^0_i(1) - \min x^0_i(1)}{\max x^0_i(1) - \min x^0_i(1)} = \frac{66 - 55}{82 - 55} = 0.4074$$

Step 4: Deviation sequence is calculated by using this formula:

$$\Delta_{ui}(k) = |x^0_i(k) - x^*_i(k)|$$

For biggest deviation following formula is used:

$$\Delta_{\text{max}} = \max_{v_i \in v_k} \max_{v_k} |x^0_i(k) - x^*_i(k)| = 1$$

For smallest deviation following formula is used:

$$\Delta_{\text{min}} = \min_{v_i \in v_k} \min_{v_k} |x^0_i(k) - x^*_i(k)| = 0$$

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr.</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>Reference Sequence</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Afghanistan</td>
<td>0.5926</td>
<td>0.9978</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
<td>0.9980</td>
<td>0.5690</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Albania</td>
<td>0.0741</td>
<td>0.6593</td>
<td>0.5574</td>
<td>0.8407</td>
<td>0.5020</td>
<td>0.5345</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>0.5185</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
<td>0.7692</td>
<td>0.8555</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
<td>0.7069</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Poland</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
<td>0.1099</td>
<td>0.1115</td>
<td>0.4425</td>
<td>0.3213</td>
<td>0.5517</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>0.0741</td>
<td>0.4835</td>
<td>0.3344</td>
<td>0.6637</td>
<td>0.7430</td>
<td>0.7586</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Zambia</td>
<td>0.5926</td>
<td>0.6374</td>
<td>0.9142</td>
<td>0.2950</td>
<td>0.5020</td>
<td>0.7414</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For example, Afghanistan: female life expectancy.

$$\Delta_{01}(1) = |x^0_i(1) - x^*_i(1)| = |1 - 0.4074| = 0.5926$$

Step 5: Grey relational co-efficient is calculated by using this formula based on values of normalized sequence. Term $\xi$ is distinguishing co-efficient between 0 and 1 the usual value of which is 0.5 in literature.

$$\gamma(x^0_i(k), x^*_i(k)) = \frac{\Delta_{\text{min}} + \xi \Delta_{\text{max}}}{\Delta_{ui}(k) + \xi \Delta_{\text{max}}}, \quad 0 < \gamma(x^0_i(k), x^*_i(k)) \leq 1$$

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr.</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>Reference Sequence</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Afghanistan</td>
<td>0.4576</td>
<td>0.3338</td>
<td>0.3333</td>
<td>0.3333</td>
<td>0.3333</td>
<td>0.4677</td>
<td>0.3333</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Albania</td>
<td>0.8710</td>
<td>0.4313</td>
<td>0.4729</td>
<td>0.3729</td>
<td>0.4990</td>
<td>0.4833</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>0.4909</td>
<td>0.3333</td>
<td>0.3939</td>
<td>0.3689</td>
<td>0.3333</td>
<td>0.4143</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Poland</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
<td>0.8198</td>
<td>0.8177</td>
<td>0.5305</td>
<td>0.6088</td>
<td>0.4754</td>
<td>0.3333</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>0.8710</td>
<td>0.5084</td>
<td>0.5992</td>
<td>0.4297</td>
<td>0.4023</td>
<td>0.3973</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Zambia</td>
<td>0.4576</td>
<td>0.4396</td>
<td>0.3536</td>
<td>0.6289</td>
<td>0.4990</td>
<td>0.4028</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
For example, Afghanistan: female life expectancy.

\[ \gamma[x_0^1, x_1^1] = \frac{\Delta_{\min} + \xi \Delta_{\max}}{\Delta_1^1(1) + \xi \Delta_{\max}} = \frac{0 + (0.5) \times 1}{0.5926 + (0.5) \times 1} = 0.4576 \]

Step 6: Weighted sum of grey relational co-efficient (Grey Relational Grade) is calculated as follows:

\[ \gamma(x_0^*, x_1^*) = \sum_{k=1}^{n} \beta_k \gamma[x_0^k, x_1^k] \]  

\[ \sum_{k=1}^{n} \beta_k = 1 \]

**Table 7: Grey Relational Grades**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr.</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>GRG*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>Reference Sequence</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Afghanistan</td>
<td>0.3704</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Albania</td>
<td>0.5901</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>...</td>
<td>..........</td>
<td>...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>0.4764</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Poland</td>
<td>0.6551</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>...</td>
<td>..........</td>
<td>...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>0.6011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Zambia</td>
<td>0.5402</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*GRG = Grey Relational Grades

For example, grey relational grade for Afghanistan:

\[ \gamma(x_0^*, x_1^*) = \sum_{k=1}^{n} \beta_k \gamma[x_0^k, x_1^k] \]

\[ = 0.1429 \times \left(0.4576 + 0.3338 + 0.3333 + 0.3333 + 0.3338 + 0.4677 + 0.3333\right) = 0.3704 \]

**6. Method of Interpretation of Results**

The study follows method of ensigns for interpreting the results of GRA. The scheme of ensigns uses the ranking scale of seven items namely *exceptionally high, very high, high, moderate, low, very low and exceptionally low* (Table 8). Further the brackets of the grey relational grade of the countries are also mentioned in order to make understanding of results more objective.

**Table 8: Scheme of Grouping the Countries under Different Ensigns**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr.</th>
<th>Ensign</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Exceptionally High</td>
<td>Countries having grey relational grade ranging from 0.7910 to 0.6941 are considered as countries having exceptionally high women development.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Very High</td>
<td>Countries having grey relational grade ranging from 0.6891 to 0.6734 are considered as countries having very high women development.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>Countries having grey relational grade ranging from 0.6697 to 0.6446 are considered as countries having high women development.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
<td>Countries having grey relational grade ranging from 0.6296 to 0.5901 are considered as countries having moderate women development.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Countries having grey relational grade ranging from 0.5622 to 0.5359 are considered as countries having low women development.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Very Low</td>
<td>Countries having grey relational grade ranging from 0.5335 to 0.5195 are considered as countries having very low women development.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Exceptionally Low</td>
<td>Countries having grey relational grade ranging from 0.5190 to 0.3704 are considered as countries having exceptionally low women development.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The method of ensigns augments GRA to represent its results in more objective and effective manner. The readers can build more organized and informed opinion about the phenomenon under study by witnessing this classification.
7. Results & Discussion

Results: Gauging the women development of a society is a vital issue for countries since they are complementary wheel to the cart of economy. The issue of time to time country-wide comparative assessment of women development is a research worthy and ever current issue. Therefore, the study aimed to compare women development in selected thirty-six countries and evaluation of position of that of Pakistan as against these countries. Selection of countries and variables representative to women development have been decided on the basis of availability of the data. Technique of data analysis is grey incidence analysis model. The study provides the deeper understanding of phenomenon. The results of the study are represented in Table 9.

The study has classified thirty-six countries of the world into seven different categories (Table 8). From the result of GRA it can be learnt that there are five countries (namely Estonia, Hungary, Slovak Republic, Thailand and Ecuador) categorized as countries having exceptionally high women development. Accordingly, there are five countries under each next ensign (very high, high, moderate, low and very low). There are six countries (namely Tanzania, Madagascar, Cote d’Ivoire, Pakistan, Nigeria and Afghanistan) categorized under the ensign of exceptionally low. Pakistan fall under the category of exceptionally low.

Discussion: With the objective of gauging the country level women development, the study investigated the issue as afresh. Using the GRA, thirty-six countries have been compared on the basis of seven variables in a composite mathematical modeling. In the multitude of variables evaluating simultaneously in one mathematical equation is different approach form that of the contemporary studies. The variables used in this study are different on many counts from the contemporary literature. The study has been conducted in different context and it is tilted towards ascertainment of women development in Pakistan qua other countries. However, the results of the study are consistent with contemporary literature in general Table 10.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>GRG*</th>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>GRG*</th>
<th>Rank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reference Sequence</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
<td>0.6150</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exceptionally High</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>0.6011</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estonia</td>
<td>0.7910</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Albania</td>
<td>0.5901</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hungary</td>
<td>0.7208</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Cambodia</td>
<td>0.5622</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slovak Republic</td>
<td>0.7119</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Montenegro</td>
<td>0.5596</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>0.7020</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Romania</td>
<td>0.5570</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ecuador</td>
<td>0.6941</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Zambia</td>
<td>0.5402</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very High</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Myanmar</td>
<td>0.5359</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Namibia</td>
<td>0.6891</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>0.5335</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nicaragua</td>
<td>0.6871</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>0.5303</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bolivia</td>
<td>0.6856</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>0.5251</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latvia</td>
<td>0.6811</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Ghana</td>
<td>0.5210</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dominican Republic</td>
<td>0.6734</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>0.5195</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Tanzania</td>
<td>0.5190</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serbia</td>
<td>0.6697</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>Madagascar</td>
<td>0.5133</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Macedonia</td>
<td>0.6647</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>Cote d’Ivoire</td>
<td>0.4816</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mongolia</td>
<td>0.6616</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>0.4764</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poland</td>
<td>0.6551</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>0.4712</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rwanda</td>
<td>0.6446</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>Afghanistan</td>
<td>0.3704</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*GRG = Grey Relational Grades

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Studies</th>
<th>Focus of Study</th>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Current study</td>
<td>Country level comparison of women development</td>
<td>Female Life Expectancy, female account ownership, female wage, firms with female participation, female share of employment,</td>
<td>Grey incidence analysis model</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 10: Comparison of results of the present study with prior studies in the literature
women in parliaments, nondiscrimination clause in law
Returns to education by gender, gender earnings differentials
Quantile regression

Gender earnings differentials
Returns to education by gender, gender earnings differentials
System generalized method

Does women political representation affects economic growth
Gross domestic product, per capital, women in parliament, economic growth.
Semi-structured interview, interpretivist approach

Barriers and opportunities of female employment in golf sport
Barriers include administration & play in “a man’s world”, difficult to get top position/job
Enterprise survey

Nondiscrimination in law and disempowerment of women
Ownership, labor market barriers, access to finance, registration of business, ownership of property

8. Concluding Remarks
Gauging the women development of a society is a vital issue. The issue of time to time country-wide comparative assessment of women development is a research worthy and ever current issue. This study has compared thirty-six selected countries on the basis of indicators of women development using grey incidence analysis model. As a result GRA has classified thirty-six countries of the world into seven different categories. It can be learnt that there are five countries (namely Estonia, Hungary, Slovak Republic, Thailand and Ecuador) categorized as countries having exceptionally high women development. Accordingly, five countries under each next ensign (very high, high, moderate, low and very low), whereas, six countries (namely Tanzania, Madagascar, Cote d'Ivoire, Pakistan, Nigeria and Afghanistan) are categorized exceptionally low. Pakistan fall under the category of countries having exceptionally low women development. The study contributes a country wise grey relational grade that ranks the countries as against their rivals. This study also contributed a lot of new information by way of aforementioned classification of countries under different ensigns. It is designed on an original country level data extracted from very reliable source and the results of the study are useful for regulators, researchers, NGOs and other stakeholders of the phenomenon by way of providing deeper and new information. This study also has some limitations. Firstly, it is a secondary data based on cross sectional study, therefore, future researches may use primary data and/or longitudinal design. Secondly, the study uses the data set of WDI, therefore, generalizability of the study is accordingly limited. The future researches should use different data set on similar framework of study. Thirdly, the study used grey incidence analysis model. The results of which must be verified with other mathematical/statistical methodologies. Fourthly, it is an analysis of selected thirty-six countries because of the availability of data, therefore, it is suggested to extend future studies to more countries. Lastly, we have used equal weights for the variable, future researchers may use different weights calculating by the way of expert opinion, AHP, or Entropy method.

References


Tayyar, N., Akcanlı, F., Genç, E., & Erem, İ. (2014). Evaluating the financial performance of companies operating in the field of informatics and technology registered in BIST by analytical hierarchy process (AHP) and gray relational analysis (TIA) method. Accounting and Finance Journal, 61, 19-40.


Environmental Disclosures and Environmental Management Strategies – A Study of Pakistani Listed Companies

1Waris Ali, 2Muhammad Abdul Basit Memon, 3Muhammad Mudassar Anwar, 4Rehana Kouser

1Associate Professor Department of Business Administration, University of Sahiwal, Sahiwal, Pakistan, waris.ali@uosahiwal.edu.pk
2Assistant Professor, Department of Business Administration, Sukkur IBA University, Sukkur, Pakistan, basit.memon@iba-suk.edu.pk
3Assistant Professor, Department of Commerce, University of Kotli, Kotli, Pakistan, mudassarswati@yahoo.com
4Professor, Department of Commerce, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan Pakistan, rehanakousar@bzu.edu.pk

ARTICLE DETAILS

History
Revised format: November 2020
Available Online: December 2020

Keywords
Environmental Disclosure, Environmental Management Strategies, Developing Country, Legitimacy Theory

JEL Classification
M10, M14

ABSTRACT

The main purpose of this paper is to understand the environmental disclosure by listed companies of Pakistan in the light of legitimacy theory. Furthermore, it highlights the environmental management strategies pursued by them. This research used a content analysis research method to codify the reported information in the annual reports into the environment related themes. The data analysis results revealed that the sampled companies appear to give little importance to environmental issues. The companies which have disclosed mainly reported about ‘environmental pollution’, ‘energy’, and ‘conservation of natural resources’ themes; and provided declarative types of disclosure about them. As for as environmental strategies are concerned only a few non-financial companies have followed proactive environmental strategies and made real efforts to address environmental issues. These results seem to reflect that the companies have disclosed environment related information in the annual reports in order to legitimize their existence.

© 2020 Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: rehanakousar@bzu.edu.pk


1. Introduction

Since the last 30 years, the environmental impact of companies’ activities has become a matter of great concern for various parties in a society for example environmental groups, customers, local communities, legislators, and public authorities. The societal demands for safe and clean environment, along with environmental regulations, have forced companies to undertake and implement extensive environmental management programs (see Alcaraz-Quiles et al., 2014). These
institutional pressures have greatly influenced the large companies’ environmental disclosure and environmental management strategies (see Brown and Deegan, 1998; Cormier and Magnan, 2003). This paper investigates the environmental reporting practices and environmental management strategies of listed companies of Pakistan. Environmental disclosure constitutes a part of what is generally called Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR hereafter) disclosure. CSR disclosure is defined as the voluntary provision of information about a corporation’s interaction with its natural and social environment (see Guthrie and Parker 1989, Deegan and Gordon 1996, Hackston and Milne 1996, O’Dwyer 2002). CSR disclosure has four dimensions: environment, human resources, products and consumers, and community involvement (see Hackston and Milne, 1996; Branco and Rodrigues, 2008). As mentioned earlier, this study focuses on environmental disclosure which actually indicates that how an organization treats and interacts with its natural environment.

Previous disclosure studies have pointed out that the disclosure of environmental information is a country dependent phenomenon as studies on different countries produced different results (see Gray et al., 1995a; Islam and Deegan, 2008). This is perhaps the valid reason for presenting disclosure results from another developing country context i.e. Pakistan. Tsang (1998) pointed out that most of the extant literature about environmental disclosure focused on developed countries. The similar was echoed by Newson and Deegan (2002), Belal and Momin (2009), and Fifka (2013) stating that most of the disclosure studies focused on the experience of Australia, the United States, and the Europe. Studies such as: Tsang (1998) have argued that developing countries are at a greater risk in environmental areas due to the low level of interest of relevant publics in environmental issues. It is really precarious to generalize the results of developed countries over developing countries. Scholarships such as: Gray et al., (1996) and De-Villiers and Van-Staden (2006) have argued that studies on social and environmental disclosure are very necessary in developing country contexts due to the presence of multinationals in these countries. Therefore this study is set out to examine the environmental disclosure by listed companies from a developing country context i.e. Pakistan and also highlights the environmental management strategies pursued by them.

This research contributes to the existing literature in the following ways.

- It adds to the environmental disclosure literature about the developing countries in general and about Pakistan in particular as the academic research has identified the need for more studies in the field of CSR disclosure in the context of other developing countries (see Ghazali, 2007; Belal & Momin, 2009; Haji, 2013; Kansal et al., 2014).
- It also contributes to the literature by highlighting the environmental management strategies pursued by the listed companies of Pakistan as previous disclosure literature mainly focuses on describing environmental disclosures (see Deegan and Gordon, 1996; Albertini, 2014).
- It adds to the literature by examining the quality of disclosure by categorising the environmental disclosure into general (i.e. aims and intentions indicators) and specific categories (performance indicators). Studies that examine the quality of disclosure award highest score to specific disclosure (see Cormier & Magnan, 2005; Bouten et al., 2011; Laan-Smith et al., 2005; Van Staden & Hooks, 2007).

The remainder of this paper is organized as: the next section presents the literature review and the second section describes the context of this study. The third section discusses the theoretical framework of this research followed by its methodology. The penultimate section discusses the data analysis results. The last section provides the discussion of results.

2. Environmental Disclosure Studies in Developing Countries

Previous studies on developing countries predominantly focused on Malaysia, South Africa, Taiwan, and India (Amran & Devi, 2008; Haniffa & Cooke, 2005; Huang & Kuang, 2010; Singh & Ahuja, 1983) and largely reported descriptive types of disclosures (e.g. Savage, 1994; Belal & Momin, 2009; Sobhani et al., 2009; Mahadeo et al., 2011b). These studies have shown that developing country companies are more concerned about human resource related activities than community involvement and environment related issues (e.g. Belal, 2001; Gao et al., 2005; Haniffa & Cooke, 2005; Ratanajongkol et al., 2006). It has also been found that these companies paid considerably less attention to environmental issues as compared to the companies in developed countries (Belal &
Owen, 2007; Elijido-Ten, 2009). The factors examined by the studies in developing countries fall within the categories of company characteristics, general contextual factors and internal contextual factors. In the company characteristics category, consistent with the developed countries, the most commonly examined determinants are corporate size, corporate industry, and corporate financial performance and found them to be influencing CSR disclosure (see Singh & Ahuja, 1983; Haniffa & Cooke, 2005; Tagesson et al., 2009). In the general contextual category, consistent with the developed countries, national contextual factors resulted in variation in CSR disclosure among the developing countries (see Williams, 1999; Kamla, 2007; Wanderley et al., 2008). Further, CSR reporting agenda in developing countries is derived by external forces/powerful stakeholders e.g. international buyers (see Belal & Owen, 2007; Islam & Deegan, 2008), foreign investors (Teoh & Thong, 1984; Belal & Owen, 2007; Khan et al., 2013; Chiu & Wang, 2014), international media (Islam & Deegan, 2008), international regulatory bodies i.e. World Bank (see Rahaman et al., 2004), and government regulations (see Tsang, 1998; Amran & Devi, 2007 & 2008; Huang & Kung, 2010). Furthermore, in contrast to developed countries, corporations in developing countries perceive a little pressure from the local public for CSR disclosure (see Belal & Owen, 2007; Belal & Cooper, 2011; Momin & Parker, 2013). In the internal contextual factors category intention to build company image (see Belal & Owen, 2007; Momin & Parker, 2013), cost of reporting CSR information (Mitchell & Hill, 2009; Belal & Owen, 2007), non-availability of CSR data and a lack of motivation (De-Villiers, 2003; Mitchell & Hill, 2009) do influence CSR disclosure in developing countries.

3. Pakistani Context
Pakistan is a South Asian developing country. It is an economically weak country and facing many social (e.g. illiteracy, unemployment, poverty and weak law enforcement etc.) and environmental (e.g. environmental pollution and waste mismanagement etc.) problems. Every government, except the government led by ‘Pakistan Peoples Party (PPP)’ in 1972-77, followed the principles of a market economy and focused on industrial growth. In the last six decades (1955/56 to 2010/11) manufacturing and the other sectors (excluding agriculture sector) of Pakistan have experienced overall average annual growth of 6.40% and 5.50% respectively (Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, 2011). As a result, 648 large public (financial and non-financial) companies now operate in Pakistan and are listed at different stock exchanges of Pakistan, including KSE, LSE, and ISE (SECP, 2011). The growth in different sectors resulted in an average annual GDP growth of 4.87% in the last six decades (Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, 2011) and resulted in an increase in GNI per capita from $340 in 1980 to $1260 in 2012. In addition to this, manufacturing and other sectors (excluding agriculture sector) accommodate 53.35% of the employed persons in Pakistan (see Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, 2011).

Despite corporations’ contribution to the national economy, some corporations have caused, among others, various environmental problems in the country. According to SDPI (2012) 20% of the registered industries in Pakistan are considered highly pollution intensive and creating environmental pollution. It can also be seen from the example of leather tanneries, an export oriented industry of Pakistan, found to be involved in polluting the water which resulted in massive protest from the local community (see Lund-Thomsen & Nadvi, 2010). Similarly, a survey by the federal environmental protection agency showed that leather tanneries located in Kasur and Sialkot are discharging effluents having chrome concentration 182-222mg/litre that is much higher than the standard level of the government i.e. 1mg/litre (PEPA, 2005a).

To govern the corporate environmental issues, the regulatory framework of Pakistan consists of various laws. The main laws regarding the protection of the environment are the Environmental Protection Act 1997, the Pakistan Penal Code 1860, and the Factory Act 1934. Under these rules and regulations, certain guidelines and standards have been established to protect the environment, including the control of pollution and hazardous waste. These laws are implemented by the Environmental

---

1 44.65% of employed persons are working in the agriculture sector of Pakistan (see Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, 2011).
Protection Agency (EPA), a department working under the Ministry of Climate Change of Pakistan. The laws mentioned above require companies, among others, to protect the environment rather than requiring companies to disclose information about the actions taken to protect environmental rights.

The disclosure regulatory framework of Pakistan consists of the Companies Ordinance 1984, the International Financial Reporting Standards (IFRS), the Accounting and Financial Reporting Standards (AFRS) and the Codes of Corporate Governance (see SECP, 2014), and mainly focus on the reporting of financial information and pays little attention to the disclosure of environmental performance. Although the SECP has introduced a law (i.e. CSR order 2009), which requires companies to disclose information about their CSR activities. The CSR Order 2009 only highlights the general items which may be reported by a company to express its CSR performance in the annual report (see CSR Order, 2009) rather than specifying the format of CSR report and indicators to be reported by a company, as is the case in financial reporting, in order to demonstrate their accountability to a broad stakeholders other than shareholders. This Order requires listed companies of Pakistan to report only two items about environmental issues (see CSR Order, 2009). This highlights that there is insufficient regulatory requirements to govern corporate environmental disclosure in Pakistan. It has been argued that Pakistan lacks effective state mechanisms to control environmental pollution in the country (Asian Development Bank, 2006). It has also been reported that the Pakistani government lacks capacity (and sometime political will) for monitoring the social and environmental performance of companies (see Lund-Thomsen et al., 2006; SDPI, 2012). The above discussion demonstrates that the legal system of Pakistan recognises the protection of environmental rights, but the enforcement of these laws is seen as weak in Pakistan.

In the absence of effective state mechanisms to control corporate environmental pollution various groups (e.g. the NGOs, media, and employees etc.) in Pakistan have demanded companies to adopt socially responsible behaviour. This may drive companies operating in Pakistan, as noted in other developing countries such as: Bangladesh (see Islam and Deegan, 2008; Belal and Owen, 2007), to address their associated social and environmental problems. In the increasing demands from various groups in the society, the companies may disclose their CSR related information including environmental disclosure in order to legitimize their continued existence.

4. Theoretical Framework

In this research both legitimacy theory and literature on environmental strategies serve as a framework. Legitimacy theory is used to explain environmental disclosures by the listed companies of Pakistan while the literature on environmental management strategies is used as a guide to determine environmental strategies pursued by them. Legitimacy theory views an organization as a part of a broader social system (under social contract see Shocker & Sethi, 1974) where an organization has influence on and influenced by the other actors, part of the social system (see Islam and Deegan, 2008; Reverte, 2009). To remain the part of a social system a corporation is expected to conform to the norms, values, and beliefs of the given system (see Deegan and Unerman, 2011). A corporation is considered as a legitimate company if the actions/practices taken by the corporation do conform to the expectations of the society in which the firm is operating (see O'Donovan, 2002). On the other hand, if a society’s perception about the corporation’s actions does not match with the society’s expectations a legitimacy gap will occur (see O'Donovan, 2002) that may bring negative consequences to that firm e.g. consumers boycott of a company’s products and/or public demonstrations against the company and/or result in governmental fines etc. (see Deegan and Unerman, 2011). To minimize the legitimacy gap, a company may opt different strategies for example ‘to educate the society’, ‘to alter the society’s perceptions about the corporate activities’, ‘to alter the society’s expectations about the corporate activities’, and ‘to divert the attention from the main issue of concern’ (Lindblom, 1993). These strategies may be targeted to gain, maintain, or repair legitimacy (Suchman, 1995) and each of the strategy requires disclosure of information (see Dowling and Pfeffer 1975). Thus under this theory, CSR disclosure is considered as a tool to conform to the expectations of the society (see Branco and Rodrigues, 2008) in order to gain, maintain, or repair legitimacy.
Legitimacy can be understood in detail from a study by Suchman (1995) who identified three types of legitimacy: pragmatic legitimacy, moral legitimacy, and cognitive legitimacy. Pragmatic legitimacy rests on the self-interested calculations of an organization’s most immediate audience and the immediate audience is involved in direct exchange with an organization. According to Clarkson (1995) customers, suppliers, employees, and the local group (the government and the local communities) are involved in transaction with the firm so these groups can be considered as a firm’s immediate audience. Moral legitimacy relies on managerial judgment that organizational activities are “the right thing to do” or organizational activities are promoting societal welfare (Mahadeo et al., 2011b; Suchman, 1995). In securing moral legitimacy companies disclose pro-social activities and/or show their alliance with social imperatives (e.g. alleviation of poverty) (Mahadeo et al., 2011b). Further, to explain the moral legitimacy Suchman (1995) discussed sub-constructs: consequential legitimacy (judged based on what the organization has accomplished e.g. amount of donation, amount of pollution reduced, and amount of waste handled etc.), procedural legitimacy (based on embraced socially accepted techniques and procedures e.g. adopting best practices to help the needy), and structural legitimacy (based on the presence of morally accepted structural characteristics e.g. CSR department, CSR committee, and quality control department etc.). The third form of legitimacy can be achieved through conforming to established standards and models of ethics prevalent in that society (Mahadeo et al., 2011). Thus, from the above discussion, it can be argued that the disclosure of different types of information by a company can be seen as an attempt to gain pragmatic, moral, and/or cognitive legitimacy.

5. Literature on Environmental Management Strategies

To determine the environmental management strategies implemented by corporations, academic research has presented several frameworks which mainly fall into two categories: sequential and non-sequential approach to environmental management (Albertini, 2014). Sequential approach to environmental management consists of several stages ranges from non-compliance to proactivity (see Hunt and Auster, 1990; Roome, 1992). A ‘non-compliance’ strategy occurs when a company has not developed an environmental policy at all either intentionally or by managerial default to address the requirements of law and social pressures (Albertini, 2014). The non-compliance environmental strategy of a corporation can be determined by the number of indicators such as environmental penalties, accidents, or lawsuits regarding non-compliance with regulatory requirements (Thomas, 2001; Lorraine et al., 2004).

A ‘compliance’ strategy occurs when a company pursues an environmental policy to a minimum level in order to avoid litigation or loss of market share (Hunt and Auster, 1990). A company pursuing this strategy may report about air, water and waste pollution resulting from its manufacturing processes in order to satisfy the government and its relevant stakeholders (Roome, 1992). In this case environmental performance is generally measured through pollution control indexes such as greenhouse gas emissions, effluents and waste management (Albertini, 2014).

‘Concerned citizen’ companies normally go beyond regulatory requirements and usually implement voluntary environmental management programs. Such a company focuses on reducing waste and toxic emissions, conserving energy and other natural resources, reducing and recycling solid waste and, finally, reducing the impact of business activities on the eco-system (Hunt and Auster, 1990). In this situation environmental performance is usually measured by the amount of environmental investment, the initiation of a pollution prevention program, or the participation in voluntary
environmental management programs (Albertini, 2014).

A ‘proactive’ company places great emphasis on environmental management systems by focusing on development of capabilities regarding waste minimisation and green product design (Hunt and Auster, 1990). The implementation of such environmental management systems (EMS) is made to enhance corporate environmental performance (Hassel et al., 2005). In this case environmental performance can be judged by several indicators such as the proportion of output generated using less pollution intensive processes, environmental training of employees, the number of eco-friendly products produced, and the modification in manufacturing processes (Albertini, 2014).

In non-sequential approach to environmental performance, companies choose their environmental commitments and pursue approaches with regard to different environmental issues at present (Christmann and Taylor, 2002). Such a company can have an opportunistic attitude towards environmental issues and can adopt a restrained, speculative, or conditional commitment (Albertini, 2014). In the case of opportunistic strategies, environmental performance is mostly measured by widespread disclosure about environmental awards, cleaner practices, environmental standards, and partnership with non-governmental organizations (Albertini, 2014). In summary environmental management strategies pursued by companies, whether sequential or non-sequential, are reported through CSR disclosure indicators. Despite several environmental management strategies discussed above, Albertini (2014) has only used three strategies: compliance, opportunistic, and proactive in order to make the analysis simple. Consistent with Albertini (2014), this research also rely on these strategies for the analysis of environmental disclosure made by listed companies of Pakistan. As mentioned earlier, a compliance strategy is measured by the amount of water and energy consumed, the number of environmental penalties, the extent of waste management, and/or the amount of effluents discharged. An opportunistic strategy is measured by environmental charter or sponsorship, environmental awards, and extra financial rating, while a proactive strategy is measured by a proportion of output generated using less pollution intensive processes, environmental training of employees, the number of eco-friendly products produced and the modification of manufacturing processes.

6. Methodology
This research uses a content analysis research method to codify the reported information in the annual reports into the environment related themes. The environmental disclosure instrument was developed from Hackston and Milne (1996) and later on updated based on the environmental information reported in the annual reports of thirty leading companies of Pakistan. The final environmental disclosure instrument consists of five themes: environmental pollution control programs, preservation of natural resources, conservation of energy, aesthetics development programs, and other environment related information. Each theme has further three categories: aims, actions, and performance indicators, which serve as a base for examining the quality of environmental disclosure. Aims/ intentions category covers companies’ policies and general types of disclosures about a theme. The action category covers activities performed by a company to accomplish its aims/intentions. The performance category contains information about the inputs (e.g. amount and time spent on the protection of environment etc.), the outputs (e.g. number of people benefited and pollution reduced etc.) and the third party evidences (e.g. environmental awards and survey results etc.) (for details see Vuontisjärvi 2006, Bouten et al., 2011). The aims and actions categories of a theme consist of declarative types of disclosure whereas the performance category of a theme covers both monetary and non-monetary quantitative evidences. The types of information disclosed about a theme can be better explained by the following examples. For example: a corporation reports that they are committed to reduce pollution and that they have installed a carbon collection plant, worth Rs.50million, which reduced 20 tons of carbon dioxide (tCO2e). With the help of this example, the following table explains the three types of information.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example</th>
<th>Aims/Intentions</th>
<th>Actions</th>
<th>Performance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Item 1</td>
<td>To reduce pollution</td>
<td>Installation of carbon collection plant</td>
<td>Reduced 20 tCO2e (measured in outcome terms) &amp; Rs.50 million</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
After the finalization of this research instrument, it was used by the two coders to code the environment related information in the annual reports of listed companies selected into the sample. This research selected a sample of 120 listed companies (see Table 3) by including all the companies whose annual reports were available for the year 2011 on their respective websites or on the KSE website. This research used Krippendorf’s Alpha statistical measure to check inter-coder reliability and the results showed convincing evidence of inter-coder reliability because all the environment related themes have Krippendorf’s Alpha value greater than 0.851 (for interpretation see Table 2). The discrepancies found between the two coders were later resolved through mutual discussion. The annual reports were selected as a source of information for content analysis due to their easily accessibility and credibility. Annual reports were also used as source of information for content analysis in the previous disclosure studies (see Amran & Devi 2007; Belal 2001; Hackston & Milne 1996; Haniffa & Cooke 2005). One important point to mention here is that the quantity of environmental disclosure is measured, as consistent with the previous studies (see Hackston and Milne, 1996; Sobhani et al., 2009), by counting the number of sentences reported to express a company’s environment related efforts.

### Table 2: Krippendorf’s Alpha Value Interpretation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Krippendorf’s Alpha Value</th>
<th>Interpretation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&lt;0</td>
<td>Poor agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.0 – 0.20</td>
<td>Fair agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.21 - 0.40</td>
<td>Slight agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.61 – 0.80</td>
<td>Substantial agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.81 – 1.00</td>
<td>Almost perfect agreement</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Adopted from Seppanen (2009)

### Table 3: The Sample Description

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Number of companies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Manufacturing Firms:</strong> Manufacturer of textiles, chemicals, foods, non-metallic minerals, electrical equipments, motor vehicles, trailers and semi-trailers, refined petroleum products, basic metals, papers, pharmaceuticals, tobacco, and rubber and plastics products</td>
<td>67 (55.83%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Financial and Insurance Firms:</strong> Banks, insurance, and Modarba companies</td>
<td>41 (34.17%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Other firms:</strong> Companies involved in supplying electricity, gas, steam and air conditioning and companies involved in transportation and storage, extraction of crude petroleum and natural gas, telecommunications, and construction of buildings</td>
<td>12 (10%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Firms</strong></td>
<td>120 (100%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

7. Data Analysis Results

The data analysis results revealed that 47% of the sampled companies reported about environmental issues and they reported on average 4.94 (standard deviation 12.78) sentences. The sampled companies gave more attention to ‘environmental pollution’ theme (28%) followed by ‘energy’ (12%), ‘conservation of natural resources’ (8%), and ‘aesthetics’ theme (4%). In addition, 39% of the companies disclosed other environmental related information. The results indicated that the most commonly reported indicators are: the commitment to protect the environment (38%), the intention to abate pollution (18%), and the intention to complying with environmental rules and regulations (14%). The results also showed that sampled companies gave relatively more attention to the aims and actions indicators than to the performance indicators. The attention in now paid to each theme of environmental disclosure.
8. Environmental Pollution Theme

‘Environmental Pollution’ covers references made to control or to reduce the environmental pollution (e.g. noise and emissions etc.). Under this theme 24 companies (20%) showed their commitment to abate pollution, 25 companies (21%) reported information about the action indicators, while only 10 companies (8%) disclosed information about the performance indicators. It reveals that more companies documented disclosure in the qualitative way. Here qualitative evidence means that companies are reporting information in a declarative way rather than providing quantifiable evidence. The most commonly disclosed indicators are ‘companies’ commitment to reduce environmental pollution’ (18%), ‘compliance with environmental laws’ (14%), ‘installation of new equipment’ (5%), ‘environmental management system in place’ (6%), and ‘environmental awards’ indicators (6%). In addition, a small number of companies reported information about other indicators such as: ‘research and development’ (3%), ‘anti-litter campaign’ (1%), ‘trees plantation to reduce pollution’ (3%), ‘noise educational programmes’ (2%), ‘noise protective gadgets’ (2%), ‘amount of pollution reduction’ (1%), and ‘number of trees planted’ (2%). Thus the sampled companies gave more attention to expressing their commitment to reduce environmental pollution and to comply with environmental laws rather than to the actions taken and the result achieved.
9. Conservation of Natural Resources Theme

‘Conservation of Natural Resources’ covers references made by the companies to the conservation of natural resources (e.g. water, gas, oil, and other material etc.). Relative to the environmental pollution, a small number of companies reported the conservation of natural resources theme (8%). Under this theme, 9 (8%), 6 (5%), and 2 (2%) companies disclosed information about aims, actions, and performance indicators respectively. Under this theme, a small number of companies disclosed information about ‘companies’ commitment to conserve natural resources’ (8%), ‘water recycling’ (3%), ‘usage of recycled material’ (2%), ‘quantity of paper recycled’ (1 company), and ‘quantity of other natural resources saved’ (1 company).

Figure 4: Conservation of Natural Resources
10. Energy Theme

‘Energy’ theme encompasses references related to firms’ efforts to save/conserve energy and firms’ efforts for the renewable energy (e.g. wind energy and solar energy etc.). Under this theme, 9 companies (8%) reported about their commitment to conserve energy, 8 (8%) companies reported about the actions taken by them to conserve energy, and 6 (5%) companies disclosed performance indicators. Under this theme, companies disclosed about the efficient usage of energy in manufacturing process (2%), the usage of waste material for energy production (3%), the usage of renewable energy (2 companies), the up-gradation of system (2 companies), the expanses made on the energy conservation programmes (2 companies), the quantity of energy saved (3 companies), the energy shortage awareness programmes (1 company), and the energy saving results (1 company).

11. Aesthetics Theme

‘Aesthetics’ theme covers references related to firms’ efforts to beautify the environment (broadly) or to make the factory green (narrowly). Relative to the other environmental disclosure themes, a small number of companies made disclosure about this theme (4%). Under this theme, the companies reported about ‘their intention to make the factory green’ (2%), ‘the sponsorship of gardening and flower competition’ (1 company), ‘plantation of trees’ (3 companies), and ‘number of trees planted’ (3 companies).
12. ‘Environment other’ Theme
‘Environment other’ theme covers issues related to the environment, not covered by the other environmental disclosure themes. Under this theme, a large number of companies reported about ‘their commitment to protect the environment’ (38%) and ‘the environmental awareness programmes (e.g. earth day celebration, world environmental day) carried out by them’ (4%).

13. Environmental Disclosure and Legitimacy Theory
The data analysis results revealed that 47% of the sampled companies reported, on average, 4.94 (standard deviation 12.78) sentences about the environmental issues and mainly focused on ‘environmental pollution’, ‘energy’ theme, and ‘conservation of natural resources’ theme. The results indicated that the maximum support was received by the commitment to protect the environment in general (38%) followed by the intention to abate the pollution (18%), and the intention to complying with environmental rules and regulations (14%). Contrary to the above indicators, none of the performance indicators was supported by at least 10 companies. This indicates that the listed companies made qualitative (or declarative) types of disclosure about the environmental issues. This result is consistent with an environmental disclosure study conducted in South Africa, a developing country, where the sampled listed companies made more general disclosure than specific disclosure (see De Villiers and Van Staden, 2006). This result is also consistent with another study conducted by Mahadeo et al. (2011b) where Mauritius, another developing country, listed companies also made environmental disclosure in the declarative way. Some authors in the disclosure field have argued
that the specific environmental disclosure by the firm may attract unwanted attention of the public and may be a threat to its legitimacy (see O’Dwyer, 2002; Mahadeo et al. 2011b). Similarly some have argued that negative environmental news adversely affects the market value of the firm (see Lorraine et al., 2004; Thomas, 2001). The general disclosure, noticed in this study, shows that companies in Pakistan may be attempting to avoid scrutiny of ecological impacts of their operations. Thus listed companies of Pakistan are aiming to maintain their legitimacy.

The results also revealed that only 3 environmental disclosure indicators were reported by more than 10 sampled companies. This shows that Pakistani listed companies are less concerned about the environmental issues. The low level of concern about environmental issues can be attributed to the poor economic conditions, the high unemployment, and the poor law enforcement situation in Pakistan. In such situations, the relevant publics are usually less concerned about environmental issues. This low level of environmental disclosure, under pragmatic form of legitimacy, can be attributed to the lower level of interest of the immediate audience of the firm in environmental issues. Thus pragmatic legitimacy provides explanation for the dearth of environmental disclosure in Pakistan. 18.33% of sampled companies have given references to the abatement of pollution in the country. It indicates the companies are trying to promote social welfare by abating pollution. Thus it can be argued that companies are disclosing environmental related information to gain moral legitimacy. Some of the sampled companies have given reference to the installation of new equipment (5%) and implementation of environmental management systems (6%). These companies may be attempting to gain procedural legitimacy by adopting social accepted systems/practices. In addition to the above, 17 sampled companies expressed their acquisition of ISO certificates (e.g. ISO 14000). Under legitimacy theory, these companies may be attempting to gain procedural legitimacy (a type of moral legitimacy) by adapting socially accepted techniques and procedures (see Suchman, 1995). According to Bouten et al. (2011) a company may be considered as an accountable if it discloses information about three categories: aims, actions, and performance of a theme. Above presented evidence states that the most of the sampled companies’ disclosure falls in the aims and actions categories of a theme. Therefore, it can be argued that the environmental disclosure by listed companies of Pakistan was not targeted to express their accountability rather provides support for legitimacy theory.

14. Environmental Disclosure and Environmental Management Strategies
Table 4 shows the environmental management strategies pursued by the listed companies of Pakistan. The results have shown that financial firms are paying little attention to environmental issues and have not reported about their environmental strategy. However, limited non-financial firms are appearing to pursue different environmental management strategies ranges from compliance to proactive environmental strategy. The non-financial companies which have disclosed environment related information mainly appear to follow opportunistic environmental strategies (Table 4). Under opportunistic strategy the most commonly reported indicators are environmental standards (17 companies), environmental awards (7 companies), trees plantation (8 companies), and installation of new equipment (6 companies). However, a very small number of companies appear to practice proactive environmental strategies. Under proactive strategy non-financial companies paid attention to installation/up gradation of system to save energy (2 companies), environmental awareness programs for employees (4), and to environmental management systems (7 companies).
### Table 4: Environmental Management Strategies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Industries</th>
<th>Compliance Strategy</th>
<th>Opportunistic Strategy</th>
<th>Proactive strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Manufacture of textiles, chemicals, foods, non-metallic minerals, electrical equipment, motor vehicles, trailers and semi-trailers, basic metals, papers, pharmaceuticals, tobacco, and rubber and plastics products</td>
<td>Percentage of pollution reduction (1)</td>
<td>Anti-litter campaigns i.e. beach cleaning campaign/systems (1)</td>
<td>Environmental management system in place (7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Recycling water e.g. installation of water recycling system (3)</td>
<td>Trees plantation related to pollution reduction (8)</td>
<td>Installation/up gradation of system e.g. installation of gas and heat recovery system (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Recycling paper (2)</td>
<td>Number of trees planted (5)</td>
<td>Use renewable energy e.g. wind energy, solar energy, energy from wasted heat (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Use recycled material (2)</td>
<td>Environmental awards e.g. AEEA Awards, NFEH, ACCA-WWF (7)</td>
<td>Installation/up gradation of system to save energy e.g. rich reflux re-boiler (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>%age or amount of paper recycled or used or both (1)</td>
<td>Environmental Standards i.e. ISO 14000 and/or GOTS (17)</td>
<td>Environmental awareness programs for employees (4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Amount of other natural resources saved (1)</td>
<td>Voicing the company concerns about energy shortage i.e. energy shortage awareness programmes (1)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Amount of energy saved (1)</td>
<td>Amount of money spent on energy conservation programmes (2)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sponsoring gardening and spring flower competition (1)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>General awareness programmes e.g. earth day celebration, world environmental day (1)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Using energy more efficiently during the manufacturing process (2)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Utilizing waste material for energy production (3)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Providing protective gadgets from noise (2)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Noise education (2)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Installation of new equipment e.g. dust collection equipment (6)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturers of refined petroleum products, Companies supplying electricity, gas, steam and air conditioning Companies involved in transportation and storage Companies involved in extraction of crude petroleum and natural gas Telecommunication Construction companies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Banks and Insurance companies</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modarba companies</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Number of companies has been mentioned in bracket
15. Discussion and Conclusion

The purpose of this article is to describe the quality of environmental disclosure and associated environmental management strategies. The data analysis results revealed that the sampled companies paid least attention to environmental aspects and focused on limited themes such as ‘environmental pollution’, ‘energy conservation’, and ‘conservation of natural resources’. The mainly reported indicators are the commitment to protect the environment in general (38%), the intention to abate the pollution (18%), and the intention to complying with environmental rules and regulations (14%). Contrary to the above indicators, none of the performance indicators was supported by at least 10 companies. This indicates that the listed companies made qualitative (or declarative) types of disclosure about the environmental issues. This result is consistent with the studies conducted in other developing countries such as South Africa, Bangladesh, and Mauritius and pointed out that listed companies have made environmental disclosure in the declarative way (see De Villiers and Van Staden, 2006; Belal, 2001; Mahadeo et al., 2011b). This result in contrary to the studies conducted in developed countries which point out that companies in developed countries appear to disclose both declarative and quantitative information (see Cormier & Magnan, 2003; Cormier et al., 2005; Bouten et al., 2011). The difference in types of disclosures can be attributed to the difference in magnitude of pressures from various stakeholders in developed and developing countries. The same has been pointed out by the recent research of Ali et al., (2017). They stated that developed countries companies are prone to pressures from various internal and external stakeholders such as shareholders, investors, creditors, regulators, environmentalists, and the media, while in developing countries CSR (environmental) disclosure is influenced by the pressure of only external forces/powerful stakeholders such as: as international buyers, foreign investors, international media and international regulatory bodies (e.g. the World Bank). They also stated the companies in developing countries perceive little pressure from the general public regarding disclosure of CSR information.

The sampled companies mainly appear to report positive information and self-laudatory in nature. This result confirms the findings of the research where companies tend to disclose declarative or narrative disclosure and avoid reporting negative information (Hackston and Milne, 1996). In this way environmental disclosure seems to be a tool to maintain legitimacy (Cho and Patten, 2007; Cho et al., 2010). Companies aiming to gain or maintain legitimacy may use communication strategies including financial reports disclosures to influence social perceptions (Lindblom, 1994; Deegan, 2002). Companies’ activities may affect a large number of stakeholders including shareholders, investors, customers, employees, and government etc. A company’s long term survival depends on a firm’s ability to legitimize its activities in the context where the company is operating. Thus, managers as a consequence attempt to manage public impressions through positive and self-laudatory disclosures.

Focusing on the environmental management strategies, financial firms paid little attention to the management of environmental issues. This may be attributed to low levels of pressures from various stakeholders regarding protection of environment as financial companies are not dealing with environmentally sensitive material. Further a small number of non-financial companies in Pakistan followed proactive environmental management strategies thus corporations in Pakistan appear to approach environmental problems with Band-Aid solutions despite highest media attention, huge settlement cost for environmental claims and increased emphasis to environmental matters in the world particularly in the developed countries. A little emphasis to proactive environmental management strategies by corporations may be attributed to a lack of public demand for environmental management, insufficiency of environmental regulations and weak law enforcement mechanisms in Pakistan. Recently the incorporation of environmental management agenda into the election manifesto by the political parties in Pakistan, particularly Pakistan Tareek-e-Insaf, has broadened the scope of corporations’ obligations. Thus it is the right time for corporation to reconsider their environmental management efforts and to ascertain that they are fully prepared and protected. Previous scholarship have argued that the sustainability of long-term profits requires investment in preventive environmental management programmes and the failure to do so may leave a company at a disadvantage as compared to its
counterparts with better foresight (see Hunt and Auster, 1990). The previous studies have also shown that the environmental disasters made by Shell Ltd. resulted in loss of alluring contracts regarding oil extraction (see Deegan and Unerman, 2011). Further consumers’ repudiation of Exxon credit cards, due to the public reaction, after the Alaskan oil spill is another example showing that how an environmental disaster directly influenced corporate performance (Hunt and Auster, 1990). These findings suggest that companies operating in developing countries in general and Pakistan in particular need take proactive measures to handle environmental related issues in order to avoid future settlement cost.

This research is not free from limitations. The results of this research cannot be generalised to non-listed companies of Pakistan as this research analyses the annual reports of listed companies only. This research used data from the annual reports published in the year 2008 which is unable to present the current picture of environmental management practices of listed companies of Pakistan. The research also highlights some areas for the future research. This research mainly relies on the annual reports of corporations published in 2008, which may give the partial picture of corporate environmental disclosure. Thus the future research should use latest environmental disclosure data published in both the annual reports and on corporate websites. The future research should focus on the factors influencing the environmental disclosure. The understanding of such factors may help the policy makers to implement environmental management programs in the country. Further, future researcher should also compare the environmental disclosures practices of local and multinational companies. This will enable the researchers to trace out the impact of international exposure on environmental disclosure practices. Furthermore, they should collect the longitudinal data to determine the increase in environmental disclosure with the passage of time. The future research should also be focused on the other dimensions of CSR disclosure: human resource, products and consumers, and community involvement disclosure because focusing only on the environmental disclosure gives the partial picture of corporations’ assumed social responsibilities.

References


De Villiers, C. J. (2003). Why do South African companies not report more environmental information when managers are so positive about this kind of reporting?. Meditari Accountancy Research, 11(1), 11-23.


Hackston, D., & Milne, M. J. (1996). Some determinants of social and environmental disclosures in
New Zealand companies. Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal, 9(1), 77-108.


Parental Satisfaction and Involvement in the Provision of Early Childhood Special Education to their Young Children with Deafness

Ghulam Fatima, Misbah Malik, Samina Ashraf

1 Associate Professor, Institute of Education and Research, University of the Punjab, Lahore-Pakistan
fatima.iwr@pu.edu.pk
2 Assistant Professor, Institute of Education and Research, University of the Punjab, Lahore-Pakistan
misbah.iwr@pu.edu.pk
3 Assistant Professor, Department of Special Education, University of the Punjab, Lahore-Pakistan
samina.dse@pu.edu.pk

ARTICLE DETAILS

History
Revised format: November 2020
Available Online: December 2020

Keywords
Parents, satisfaction, parental involvement, ECSE, deaf young children

JEL Classification
M12, M14

Abstract

This qualitative study was planned to investigate into parental satisfaction and engagement in the availability of Early Childhood Special Education (ECSE) to their deaf young children studying in Govt. Deaf and Defective Hearing Schools (GDDHS) in Punjab, Pakistan. The parents of 989 deaf young children constituted the population of study. A representative sample of parents of eighty-two children who gave their consent to participate in the study was taken from ten schools at district level located in four zones of the Punjab. A semi structured and open ended interview protocol consisting of three parts (Part 1=Demographic information about children and their parents, Part 2= Parental Contentment, Part 3= Engagement of parents) was employed. The interviews were recorded on audio tape, Afterwards, transcription was made and codes were assigned. Thematic analysis was done and data was presented in tabulated form. Frequencies were run. Major findings showed that majority of parents were not contented with speech, speech reading, and reading identification skills in their children. Majority of them were not involved in teaching to their children due to being illiterate. They had no guidance about teaching to their young deaf children. On the basis of results, suggestions to Punjab Special Education Department were made.

Corresponding author’s email address: fatima.iwr@pu.edu.pk


1. Introduction

Since the decade of 1960, there has been a growing notion about the difficulties and challenges that children with special needs have during the early years of life. Much emphasis has been placed upon the first few years of life as a critical period and time for great learning to take place. During the late 1950s
and early 1960s, pioneer efforts (Bloom, 1964; Kirk, 1958) gave birth to the idea that external experiencial and environmental factors could greatly influence and enhance the course of a child’s development. In 1965, the national Head Start Program created a new public focus on the importance of early education. Head Start was created on the sound foundations of civil rights advocacy and on untiring efforts of US public and private sector institutions working on early childhood education programs. President Lyndon B. Johnson takes its credit for his endeavours on War on Poverty in 1960. He declared the formation of Head Start in a special message to Congress on 12th January, 1965. His main concern was on the development of early childhood education programs to educate the disadvantaged children early (Hinitz, 2014; Fatima, 2015). Head Start proved a milestone in preschool education. For the first time large numbers of young children were exposed to mass screening programs that had the potential for identifying and perhaps remediating problems at an early age (Hinitz, 2014; Caldwell, 1973). Pakistan came into being on August 14, 1947. The significance of early years education for special need children in Pakistan was recognized in The Pakistan Educational Conference (1947) in the following words: “Children between the ages of 3 and 6 needed attention in special schools. Government might give a lead in opening a few pre-primary schools, their provision should be left mainly to private agencies (p.20).”

The following education policies consisting Report of the Commission on National Education (1959, Chapter: 16, pp.257-259), and National Education Policy and Implementation Programme (1979, p.28-29) stressed on the training and education of special need children. In coming years, National Policy for Persons with Disabilities (2002) clearly stressed the equivalent rights, prospects, and availability of medical, educational, social, psychological, vocational education, employability, and placement of special persons without any discrimination. It is also commendable that the training and education of parents and communities to recognize special needs of persons with disabilities was focused. Unluckily, much attention was not paid on educating and training the parents of special need children. National Plan of Action (2006) laid emphasis on urgent identification of special needs and delivery of early services of intervention to young special need children. The term Early Childhood Development (ECD) was used in this regard. National Education Policy (2009) clearly acknowledged the significance of early years. It mandated “one-year pre-primary education for all children between 3-5 years of age and two year specialised training for teachers in dealing with young children”. The National Education Policy (1998-2010) openly declared “kachi” as the initial class in schools of primary education, but due to non-availability of facilities, and services, this project has not been materialised so far (Abidi, 2015; Fatima, 2015).

Globally speaking, involvement of parents of children with deafness in the programs of early intervention, and early education in schools is greatly supported and appreciated. Parent and family focused approaches and models (Kirkwood, 2016; Calderon &Greenberg, 1997; Roush &Matkin, 1994) are being used on a large scale. The Individuals with Disabilities Education Act (IDEA), reauthorized in 1997, authorizes parents to get involved in the process of decision-making in their child’s education. The parents are encouraged to take active part not only in the educational planning but also in placement related decisions for their children with special needs. Congress also emphasized to conduct joint parent-professional training to clarify the roles of all stake holders in the education of children (Margolis, 1998). Many researches on parental involvement with children with special needs have also highlighted that parents play an indispensible role in the teaching of academic, language, motor, social, and vocational skills (Innocenti& Taylor, 1998; Leyser, 1985). Calderon and Greenberg (1993) investigated that child’s functioning is expressively influenced by functioning of mothers and coping strategies. These findings were supported by the ratings of objective teachers. Children of parents having better skills in problem solving were rated by teachers as better adjusted and more capable than children of parents with poor problem solving skills. Additionally, socio economic status of parents regarding their children’s education and communication needs was positively correlated with the reading achievement of their children. Musselman and Kircaali-Iftar (1996) studied the spoken language development of 20 children with deafness. Out of 20, 10 children were having unpredictably high spoken language skills,
and 10 were with unpredictably low spoken language scores relative to the background and training. A number of variables were consistent with higher spoken language skills, and, one of them was direct instruction by parents. Collected data exhibited that parents having children with high spoken language skills conceived deafness as a challenge to be defeated. Contrary to this, parents having children with low spoken language skills might have viewed it as a disparity to be adjusted. The authors concluded that aspects of family functioning work together with other educational interventions to affect their child’s development.

2. Rationale of the Study
A considerable research is available on poor reading, writing, mathematical skills in students with deafness (Akhtar & Inam, 2005; Galaudet Research Institute, 2005; Wahid & Ishfaq, 2000; Stinson & Walter, 1997). Moreover, the skills of speech, and speech reading in young children are also not developed despite attending deaf schools for many years (Parveen, 2007; Latif & Watto, 2005; Hart & Risley, 1995). Ultimately, persons with deafness are unemployed, or under employed (Ahmed & Rehman, 2006; Blanchfield, Feldman, Dunbar, & Gardner, 2001; MacLeod-Gallinger, 1992; Schreodel & Geyer, 2000). Keeping in view the graveness of problem, it was conceived to find the root causes in ECSE program being run in Government Deaf & Defective Hearing Schools in Punjab.

3. Objectives of the Study
Parents, being the most important stake holders, were considered to have share in the emergence of the problem. In connection to this, present study was conducted to have a look into parental satisfaction and involvement in the provision of ECSE to their deaf young children.

4. Questions of the Study
The following questions were sought by the study:
1. What is the satisfaction level of parents with the provision of ECSE to their deaf young children?
2. To what extent the parents are involved in providing ECSE to their deaf young children?
3. What measures can be taken for the improvement of ECSE program?
4. How can the involvement of parents in the provision of ECSE be increased?

5. Method
5.1 Design and Procedure
It was a qualitative study in nature as data were collected by conducting interviews with the parents of deaf young children. The population of study included the parents of all 989 deaf young children studying in 34 Government Deaf & Defective Hearing Schools established in 31 districts in the Punjab.

5.2 Participants
A sample of parents of 82 deaf young children, who confirmed their attendance on the scheduled date and day, was taken from 10 districts (Lahore, Gujranwala, Gujrat, Jhelum, Sialkot, MuzaffarGarh, Dera Ghazi Khan, Rawalpindi, Mianwali, and Sahiwal) in four zones of the Punjab province.

6. Instrumentation
An interview protocol consisting of three parts: (Part 1: demographics of parents and children; Part 2: questions on parental satisfaction; Part 3: questions on parental involvement) was developed. Six aspects of ECSE for deaf young children i.e. speech, speech reading, reading recognition, writing, mathematics, parental guidance and counselling were included in the interview protocol on the basis of literature review. Part 1 included description about sample districts, children, parents, their age, qualification, profession, number of children with deafness, and monthly income. Part 2 comprised eight open-ended questions. Part 3 including five open-ended questions was about parents’ own involvement in and contribution to the development of their deaf young children. The validity of the instrument was assured by taking opinions of five experts in deaf field.
7. Data Collection Procedure
Data were collected personally by conducting meetings with the parents of deaf young children. Initially, the heads of the sample deaf schools were contacted and requested about access to the subjects. Keeping into consideration the daily schedule of the schools, and ensuring the availability of parents, a meeting schedule was prepared. All parents were informed about the purpose of meeting by the respective schools. On the specified days, date and time, the researchers visited the schools. The parents were gathered in a separate room along with their deaf young children. Every parent was interviewed separately. They were also made confident of giving data with complete privacy and anonymity. During the interviews, guidelines regarding practicing speech, speech reading, teaching of reading, writing, and mathematics, and on other deafness related aspects were also given to parents which were welcomed by them. Some of the parents were paid some amount and reimbursed for the mileage to the school. One interview took 40 minutes on average.

8. Data Analysis and Results
Part 1 of the interview protocol was related to demographics about parents and their deaf young children. This information is being presented in the following table 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Districts</td>
<td>D.G.khan</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Gujranwala</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Gujrat</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jhelum</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lahore</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mianwali</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Muzaffargarh</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rawalpindi</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sahiwal</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sialkot</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>14.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender of the Children</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>61.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>39.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class of the Children</td>
<td>KG I</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>69.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>KG II</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>30.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender of the Parents</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>32.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>67.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fathers’ Age</td>
<td>26-30 years</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>31-35 years</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>22.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>36-40 years</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>37.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>41-45 years</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>14.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>46-50 years</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Above 50 years</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Late</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mothers’ Age</td>
<td>below 25 years</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>26-30 years</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>28.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>36-40 years</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>26.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>41-45 years</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>46-50 years</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Above 50 years</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Late</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fathers’ Qualifications</td>
<td>Illiterate</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>43.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Matric</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>43.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Intermediate</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 1 presents the details of demographic information about parents of deaf young children. Parents were taken from ten districts of four zones. These districts were selected through simple random sampling. Parents of 50 (61%) male, and 32 (39%) female deaf young children participated in the study. The reason of this disparity was that the strength of male deaf young children enrolled in 34 GDDHS was larger (60%) than female deaf young children (40%). The number of parents whose children were enrolled in K.G.I, was greater (69.5%) than those whose children were studying in K.G.II (30.5%). The reason of this difference was that most of the parents of children of K.G.I reported that they had been called for meeting for the first time. It is significant that more mothers (67.1%) participated in the study as compared to fathers (33%). It might be due to the reason that most of the mothers (90.2%) were housewives. Most of the fathers were in the age range of 36-40 years (38%), and mothers 26-30 years (28%).

The number of fathers of deaf young children who had passed matriculation was larger (44%) than those with other qualifications. Besides this, 44% of them were illiterate which was alarming. On the other hand, a vast majority of mothers (60%) was illiterate and 30% had passed matriculation. It is a matter of concern that no mother was having graduation, masters, or any other qualification. Most of the fathers (78%) were related to labour work, and most of the mothers (90.2%) were housewives. The monthly income of most of the families was PKR 5000-10,000/- which reflects their poor economic condition.

Part 2. Parental Satisfaction

Part 2 of the interview protocol consisted of eight open-ended questions which were asked to parents to have knowledge about their contentment on the availability of ECSE services by the respective schools. Responses of parents were audio-recorded and afterwards transcribed. Common themes were derived and categories were made. The frequency distribution of parents’ responses is presented as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Development of speech</td>
<td>No speech</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>62.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Less intelligible speech</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>23.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Moderately intelligible speech</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Intelligible speech</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>11.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2 shows that majority of the parents (62.2%) responded that their children had no speech. The parents of 19 children (23.2%) told that the speech of their children was less intelligible restricted to only bilabial sounds. Only 3 (3.65%) parents were of the view that their children had moderately intelligible speech consisting of a few words of daily use. The parents of nine children (11%) told that their children had intelligible speech. It is worth mentioning here that most of these parents, whose children had got some intelligible speech, reported that they had been hiring the services of speech therapists of private sector, but, due to heavy charges, they had discontinued taking speech sessions. They were now practicing those speech lessons at home.

Table 3: To what extent speech reading skills of your child have developed?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Development of speech reading skills</td>
<td>No speech reading</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>79.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Speech reading of few words</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>18.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Good speech reading</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3 shows that most of the parents (79.3%) responded that the speech reading skill of their children was not developed. Parents of 15 children (18.3%) reported that their children could do speech reading of a few words. Parents of only two children (2.4%) answered that the speech reading skill of their children was good. It means that the area of teaching speech reading to deaf young children was being ignored in schools.

Table 4: How much your child has developed reading skills?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Development of reading skills</td>
<td>Can’t read</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>42.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Can read alphabets only</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>45.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Can read words</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4 depicts that parents of 37 (45.1%) deaf young children reported that their children could read alphabets only whereas parents of 43% children answered that their children could not read anything. Additionally, parents of 10 (12.2%) children informed about their children’s ability to read words. In other words, the number of children who had developed reading skill was small.

Table 5: How much your child has developed writing skill?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Development of writing skills</td>
<td>Can’t write</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Can copy alphabets</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>58.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Can write alphabets</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>23.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>independently</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Can write words</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>13.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4 shows that parents of 48 (58.5%) deaf young children responded that their children could copy alphabets. Parents of 19 (23.2%) children were of the view that their children could write alphabets independently. The parents of 11 (13.4%) children reported that their children could write words, whereas the parents of only 4 (5%) children informed that their children were not able to write anything. It shows that majority of deaf young children were at the stage of copying alphabets only. Contrary to this, syllabus of classes K.G.I and K.G.II consisted of alphabets, words, and sentences. Parents’
responses on the development of writing skills reflected a wide gap between the intended goals and children’s present level of functioning.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Development of mathematical skills</td>
<td>Can’t count</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>13.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Can count upto 5</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>22.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Can count upto 10</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>48.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Can count upto 15 or more</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>15.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5 shows that parents of 40 (49%) deaf young children were of the view that their children could count upto 10 digits with understanding. Parents of 18 (22%) children reported that their children could count upto 5 digits with understanding. Parents of 13 (16%) children were of the view that their children could count digits upto 15 or more with understanding. The syllabus of mathematics for K.G.I and K.G.II included counting both in digits and words, back counting, sums of addition, and subtraction etc. The present level of functioning of deaf young children exhibited a wide gap to abridge.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Parent Teacher Meetings</td>
<td>Not conducted</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>19.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conducted irregularly</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>51.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conducted regularly</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>29.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6 shows that the parents of 16 (19.5%) children reported that parent teacher meetings were never conducted. Parents of 42 (51.2%) deaf young children replied that parent teacher meetings were conducted in the schools on irregular basis. The parents of 24 (29.2%) children reported that parent teacher meetings were conducted on regular basis. It means that there is need to pay attention on this aspect of ECSE.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Guidance and counseling sessions</td>
<td>No sessions</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>39.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>On parents’ request</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>52.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Regular sessions</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7 throws light on the organization of sessions for the guidance and counselling of parents of deaf young children. The parents of 32 (39%) children responded that schools were not conducting sessions on parental guidance and counselling. The parents of 43 (52.4%) children reported that sessions for the guidance of parents were conducted in schools on parents’ request. The parents of only seven (8.5%) children informed that schools were conducting sessions on parental guidance and counselling on regular basis. It becomes evident from the data that in the absence of parental guidance, required results cannot be achieved.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Written material</td>
<td>No written material</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8 throws light on the situation prevalent in GDDHS in Punjab. All of the parents 82 (100%) reported that schools were not providing any written material (booklets, pamphlets, work sheets, tips on
teaching to children) to parents of deaf young children.

**Part 3. Parental Involvement**

Part 3 of the interview protocol was about parents’ own involvement in and contribution to the development of their deaf young children. The analysis of this part is presented as follows:

### Table 9: Do you give practice of speech lessons to your child at home?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Practice of speech</td>
<td>No practice</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>31.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No knowledge about methods</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>35.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Practice speech</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>32.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Practicing speech lessons to deaf young children at home is a matter of great concern. Table 9 shows that parents of 26 (32%) children answered that they did not practice speech to their children at home. Parents of 29 (35.4%) children reported that they had no knowledge about practicing speech to their children at home. Parents of 27 (33%) children were of the view that they used to practice speech to their children at home. It means that parents of only 27 (33%) children out of 82 were practicing speech at home.

### Table 10: Do you give your child training in speech reading?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Training in speech reading</td>
<td>No training</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>64.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Effort with no response</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>14.63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Training in speech reading regularly</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>20.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 10 presents responses of parents about practicing speech reading to their children at home. The parents of 53 (65%) deaf young children responded that they had no concept of speech reading and resultanty they were not giving any training to their children at home. The parents of 12 (15%) children informed that they used to try to teach speech reading to their children, but, they did not give response. The parents of only 17 (21%) children were of the view that they used to give training on regular basis and their children had started giving good response. It means that majority of parents of deaf young children (79%) were not able to teach their children the skill of speech reading which would have resulted in deficiency in this area.

### Table 11: Do you teach your child reading recognition of alphabets and words?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teaching of reading recognition</td>
<td>No reading recognition</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>76.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Don’t know the method</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Teaching reading recognition through speech</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>14.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 11 throws light on the responses of parents about teaching of reading recognition to their deaf young children. Parents of 63 (77%) children responded that they did not teach their children reading recognition of alphabets and words included in their syllabus. Parents of 12 (15%) children informed that they used to teach their children reading recognition of alphabets and words through speech whereas the parents of seven (8.5%) children reported that they did not know how to teach reading recognition to
their deaf young children. It shows that parents of only 12 (15%) children were helping their children in developing reading recognition skill. Contrary to this, parents of 70 (85%) deaf young children were not contributing to the development of reading skills in their children.

### Table 12: Do you teach your child writing of alphabets and words?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teaching of writing</td>
<td>No training</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>13.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Supervising in doing home work</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>65.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Giving practice in writing</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>20.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>82</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 12 presents the responses of parents of deaf young children about teaching of writing skills to their deaf young children. The parents of 11 (13.4) children expressed their inability in teaching writing of alphabets and words to their children. Parents of 54 (66%) children reported that their involvement was restricted only to supervising their children during doing their home work. Parents of 17 (21%) children were of the view that they used to practice writing of alphabets and words to their children. It means that majority of the parents were involved in guiding their children just in completing their home work. Extra efforts were being made by parents of only 17 (21%) deaf young children.

### Table 13: Do you teach your child mathematics at home?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teaching of mathematics</td>
<td>No teaching of mathematics</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>19.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Supervising in doing home work</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>53.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Teaching with material</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>26.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>82</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 13 shows that parents of 16 (20%) children expressed their inability in teaching mathematics to their children. Parents of 44 (54%) deaf young children used to supervisethem in doing their mathematics home work. The parents of 22 (27%) children were teaching them mathematical concepts with the help of material. In other words, most of the parents showed their involvement in teaching mathematics to their children.

### 9. Discussion

This research study examined the parental satisfaction on and involvement in the major aspects (speech, speech reading, reading, writing, mathematics, and guidance and counselling) of ECSE for their deaf young children. Individuals with Disabilities Education act (IDEA), reauthorized in 1997, has given parents the right to indulge in the planning of individual educational plan, and placement decision for their children with disabilities. One of the key themes of the 1997 amendments to the act is emphasis on parent involvement in the provision of special education to their children with special needs. In congruence to this, National Policy for Persons with Disabilities (2002), a first ever policy of its kind in Pakistan, has stressed the training of parents for the education of their special needs children. Contrary to this, the data taken from the parents highlights that parental involvement in the education of their deaf young children was not on satisfactory level. Moreover, Parent Teacher Meetings (PTMs), and guidance & counselling sessions were being conducted on a very limited scale. It shows that National Plan of Action, 2006, which was formulated for the implementation of National Policy for Persons with Disabilities (2002), is not very successful in enforcing the policy deliberations in its true spirit.

Musselman and Kircaali-Iftar (1996) found that children with unpredictably high spoken language skills were those whose parents were directly engaged in their studies. In consistent to this, the present study
represents that parents of deaf young children were not involved on a large scale in teaching to their children due to being unfamiliar with the instructional methods. As a result, their children were not exhibiting better performance in academics. Here, the performance of deaf schools is also questionable which are not making arrangements for the involvement and training of parents in the educational process of their deaf young children (Humphries, Kushalnagar, Mathur, Napoli, Rathmann and Smith, 2019).

Calderon and Greenberg (1993) and Calderon, Greenberg, and Kusche (1991) reported that maternal functioning and coping factors significantly affect a child’s functioning. Additionally, socio economic status of parents was positively correlated with their deaf children’s reading achievement. These findings are consistent with those of the present study which highlights poor socio economic status of parents, especially, of mothers who represent higher rate (60%) of illiteracy. The remaining 37% had passed Secondary School Certificate (S.S.C.) Exam, and only 4% had the qualification of Intermediate. There was not even a single mother with college or university education. As a result, the deaf young children were lagging behind in developing speech, speech reading, reading recognition, writing, and mathematical skills.

Irrespective of the parental engagement in the education of their deaf young children, their satisfaction on the provision of academic support extended by the schools does matter. As reported by them in interviews, it is evident that deaf young children (62%) were having no speech, and only 11% children had developed intelligible speech. Similarly, 79% children had not developed speech reading skill, whereas, only 2% children had learnt good speech reading. In addition to this, only 12% children could have read words and 13% could have write words included in their syllabus. As far as mathematical skills are concerned, only 16% children could count upto 15 or more with understanding. The academic level of children reported by their parents poses a question mark on the performance of schools because as compared to the prescribed syllabus, the achievement level of children, as reported by their parents is very low.

10. Implications of the Study
On the basis of data collected from parents in the form of interviews, results, and points considered in the discussion portion, the following points are worth mentioning:

1. The study has serious implications regarding the performance of schools for deaf children as parents of deaf young children are not satisfied with the services provided to their children. As the speech related skills of deaf young children are not developed, it is imperative to focus on these areas through employing speech therapists, and monitoring their performance according to a set pattern.
2. As parents are not satisfied with the academic condition of their children, teachers’ instructional practices need to be improved. Refresher courses pertaining to the areas of ECSE, should be conducted.
3. Training courses for parents on speech, speech reading, teaching of reading, writing, and mathematics need to be organized through arranging the payment for travelling and daily allowances.
4. For the guidance of parents, sessions should be conducted on regular basis.
5. As the parents are having low socio economic status, reimbursement for mileage should be made when they are invited for Parent Teacher Meetings or guidance and counselling sessions.
6. To reduce illiteracy rates among mothers, adult literacy enhancement campaigns should be launched by the Ministry of Education and Special Education which will ultimately bring about change in the academic condition of deaf young children.

References


Blythe S.F. Hinitz (2014), Head Start, A bridge from past to future, Young Children. www.naeyc.org/yc


Media Framing of Pandemics: A Case Study of the Coverage of COVID-19 in Elite Newspapers of Pakistan

Ayesha Siddiqua, Ghulam Shabir, Atif Ashraf, Ammad Khaliq

1. Introduction
The threats of Global pandemics are considered as the most serious threats to the contemporary human societies (Davis, 2005; Elbe, 2010; Fidler, 2004). The actual idea of pandemic is quite threatening for the whole world as the challenges related to controlling and mapping the disease are not limited to the immediate location of the outbreak. The post-world war optimism of the developed world sent the threat...
of pandemics to the history books because of the evolution of vaccines, anti-viral medications and antibiotics (Abraham, 2007; Dry and Leach, 2010). But the spread of fatal infections which became resistant to prevalent antibiotic treatments (Abraham, 2007; Dry and Leach, 2010) made even the western developed world realize about the intensity of its vulnerability. In the cases of Ebola, SARS and H1N1 flu the consequences of epidemics were manifested in a multifold manner because of the enhanced levels of global connectivity (Pieri, 2019).

The Coronavirus disease (COVID-19) illustrated that how a pandemic which started in China could travel so fast to the rest of the world while causing widespread havoc and panic across the globe. Patients infected with COVID-19 were prone to respiratory illness ranging from mild to moderate. As per the World Health Organization’s directives “the best way to prevent and slow down transmission is to be well informed about the COVID-19 virus, the disease it causes and how it spreads” (World Health Organization, 2020). The emphasis on the acquisition of information regarding the virus made it possible not only for the media to give the issue tremendous amount of coverage but also allowed the audience to be more attentive and receptive towards all sorts of available information. COVID-19 was speculated to emerge from a wild life market of China situated at the city of Wuhan in the year 2019. Although a report by EU has accused China of manipulating the information regarding the crisis but China rejected all such accusations along with rejecting the call for any independent investigation regarding the origin of the virus (Coronavirus: China rejects call for probe into origins of disease, 2020).

The role of mass media in the time of pandemics can be viewed extremely critical not only with respect to creating awareness about the disease but also in terms of enhancing the chances of better survival of the contemporary human societies. This paper attempted to comprehend the development of media frames in the coverage of COVID-19 along with analyzing the patterns through which the impact and risks related to COVID-19 were presented in the e papers of the mainstream English press of Pakistan. The significance of the study lies in its focus to comprehend the evolution and development of frames which were dominantly used by the Pakistani press to tackle the humanitarian crisis which emerged because of the COVID-19 pandemic.

2. Media Coverage of Pandemics
In the unpredictable times of pandemic spread the role of media gains greater attraction as it sets the agenda for public debate and at the same time helps people in knowing about the risks related to the pandemic. The outbreak of corona pandemic coincided with a time in evolution when the sources of information dissemination have become most sophisticated and the acquisition of information itself has acquired the position of one of the most valued entities.

The significant role of media in case of pandemics cannot be undermined as the mechanisms of scrutiny by the World Health Organization (WHO) are themself dependent on the information provided by different sources of media, along with official communication channels (Dry, 2010). Studies on the media coverage of pandemics have also incorporated innovative ways of operationalizing data gathered from posts, tweets, blogs and social media. The early detection of health crisis had also incorporated the technique of sentiment analysis (Schulz et al., 2013). The dependence on media was also significant for its potential to guide in the case of absence or failure of formal support systems and also to communicate health and emergency related messages to different segments of the society. A research conducted by Time Magazine showed that compared to the English language print coverage of Ebola epidemic in 2018 the articles published on COVID-19 were considerably greater in number (Ducharme, 2020). Luther & Zhou (2005) examined the media framing of SARS virus by the Chinese and U.S. print media and they concluded that the dominant frames used for covering the SARS virus included responsibility, human interest, leadership, conflict and economic consequences.

Although the significance of social media analysis holds a vital position but the coverage of national newspapers still played a significant role in shaping the policy and public discussions on matters pertaining to health emergencies (Dry and Leach, 2010). The connection between health communication
and journalism is often examined through the lens of framing. Scheufele and Tewksbury (2007) asserted that framing can be understood as an assumption in terms of how news is portrayed in the media is bound to have an influence on how it is perceived by the audience. The issues that received more information were also considered more important by the members of audience as the media not only tells us what to think but also what to think about (Entman, 1993). Entman (2007) further asserted that classification of media frames can be divided into different categories with respect to the functions they perform. These functions can be classified with respect to defining the problem, mapping out causal interpretations, and providing recommendations. The concept of framing has been widely employed by researchers across a wide range of themes. Frames can be interpreted as a sequence of cognitive schemes through which we perceive, communicate, organize and prioritize the information regarding certain issues while keeping the context in view (Pieri, 2009). It is through the process of framing that media attains the ability to attract attention towards a particular issue (Entman, 2007). In terms of health crisis especially in the scenario of COVID-19 pandemic media framing helped in imparting significance to the information regarding pandemic (Liu & Kim, 2011). Prospect theory by Kahneman & Tversky (1979) also suggested that the messages containing gain-frames like accentuating the benefits of hand washing were highly likely to be more persuasive than the messages containing loss-frames like accentuating the risks of virus as a result of not washing hands. The study at hand is exploratory in nature as not much synchronized literature was available regarding the media framing of pandemics in general and COVID-19 framing in particular.

3. Methodology
The study aimed at exploring the dominant frames used in the coverage of COVID-19 by the Pakistani English e papers. In the wake of COVID-19 pandemic the sales of hard copies of newspapers decreased as they were considered a possible source of infection. Resultantly the online readership of the newspapers grew. Newspaper media coverage of pandemics in both print and online mediums has continued to influence the framing of policy and public debates (Wald, 2008; Stephenson and Jamieson, 2009; Dry and Leach, 2010). Entman (1993) while explaining the process of framing asserted that “to frame is to select some aspects of a perceived reality and make them more salient in a communicating text, in such a way as to promote a particular problem definition, causal interpretation, moral evaluation, and/or treatment recommendation for the item described” (p.52).

The coverage was analyzed through qualitative inductive content analysis of the COVID-19 related news stories published in the e papers of Dawn and Express Tribune. The stories published from the time period of 01 April, 2020 to 30th April 2020 were retrieved from the Lexis Nexus database. The time period was significant because of the increase in the number of COVID-19 patients in Pakistan. Total 45 stories were retrieved. Among the selected stories 20 stories comprised of Daily Dawn and 15 stories comprised of the Daily Express Tribune. The unit of analysis was every individual story. The selected stories were analyzed through the process of careful open coding as a result of which three key themes emerged with respect to the coverage of COVID-19 pandemic which included Scientific Development related to Pandemic; Scale of Pandemic; Social & Economic Impact of the Pandemic.

4. Findings
The recurrent themes which emerged as a result of open coding are discussed in detail along with the dominantly employed frame categories.

4.1 Scientific Development Related to Pandemic
Stories falling under the theme of scientific development incorporated frame categories related to definition of the pandemic; medical updates; health related precautions; development of vaccines; new findings regarding the causes and symptoms of COVID-19.

In a story published in Dawn regarding the development of Corona Virus vaccine the World Health Organization said that it will supervise the research about COVID-19 treatment in Pakistan especially to comprehend the effectiveness of malaria drugs in the corona treatment. The story also dealt with the
mutation aspect of the virus as it mutates while travelling from one population to another (WHO oversees research to develop corona treatment in Pakistan, 2020).

In a similar story published in the Express Tribune, the successful genome sequencing carried out by University of Karachi was reported. The story also reported that the sequencing was carried out to comprehend the genetics of Corona virus and the whole process was done under the supervision of both young and senior Pakistani doctors (Pakistan carries out whole genome sequencing to help combat COVID-19, 2020).

In the time of a pandemic with such common symptoms an obvious challenge was to get oneself tested. In a related story published in Dawn a step-by-step guide was shared with the readers for how to get their COVID-19 related symptoms checked in Pakistan. The story incorporated the versions of health professionals to explain the process through which a person can be tested for COVID-19. In the first step in case of any manifested symptoms the patient was advised to visit any public or private hospital which was designated by the government. At the designated hospital the doctor will check the patient in order to determine broadly if he or she may be suffering from coronavirus. In case the doctor rules out the option of corona virus the patient will be asked to go back. In case the doctor concludes that the patient has corona symptoms a swab of his saliva will be taken and sent for testing. Further the story also stated that at government facilities the test would be done free of cost. Along with the government designated facilities it was also mentioned that some of the private labs were also conducting tests against a certain fee (Here’s how you can get checked for coronavirus in Pakistan, 2020).

In another story published in Dawn the usefulness and legitimacy of world Health Organization (WHO) was questioned with reference to the pandemic spread and the steps taken to contain its harmful effects (“WHO and COVID-19”, 2020). In a story published in The Express tribune the issue of disposal of hospital waste was highlighted (Ahmed, 2020). The story stated that the contaminated medical waste of hospitals in Karachi posed a serious threat in terms of increasing the infection rate. The complaints of the hospital staff were also made part of the story in which they asserted that they were not provided with any special instructions with respect to dumping the waste of the infected patients. The story also gave background information on how the disposal of medical waste had remained an unresolved issue in Pakistan even in the pre corona scenario. The public hospitals’ representatives, on the contrary, assured that hospital waste was properly disposed of. Infection Control Society of Pakistan also endorsed the point of view of the hospital staff by asserting that the possibility of the spread of COVID-19 virus from the highly contaminated waste was very high (Ahmed, 2020).

Thus the news stories falling under this theme were mostly meant to educate the readers so that they can have a very clear idea of the problem that they are dealing with. The writing style of these stories was mostly kept simplistic. The difficult jargon related to medicine was mostly avoided and where the use of jargon was unavoidable the jargon was properly explained.

4.2 Scale of Pandemic
Stories falling under the theme of “Scale of Pandemic” incorporated frame categories related to mapping the evolving trends in domestic infection cases; facts and figures related to infected, recovered patients and critically ill patients; number of pandemic related deaths; mode of transmission of COVID-19.

In a story filed from Karachi the increasing number of corona cases in some parts of Karachi was highlighted. The areas of Karachi which reported the highest number of corona cases were emphasized including Gulshan-i-Iqbal, North Nazimabad and Saddar. The story also included the facts that patients with underlying health conditions like diabetes and hypertension were more prone to succumb to the disease. The district wise breakdown of the corona patients in Sindh was also made part of the story. “The data showed that while most cases were reported among the age-group 20-29 years (21pc) followed by age-group 30-39 years (19pc), people at the age of 70 and above are the most severely affected age group followed by 60-69 years….whereas the gender wise analysis showed that 70pc
patients were men whereas 30pc were women” (Illyas, 2020). The stories like these which were rich in data helped in prioritizing the areas and parts of population which need to be focused in order to effectively deal with the COVID-19 breakout in terms of policy formulation.

In another story the “highest single day tally” related to COVID-19 cases till April 19, 2020 were reported by The Express Tribune. The story started with the background information regarding the corona virus and then moved on to the current situation which stated that 1,137 patients were reported till date (April 19: Sindh record highest single-day tally of Covid-19 cases, 2020). In a similar story published by Dawn a detailed graphical story was reported when the number of deaths crossed 100 in Pakistan and how it took Pakistan among the world’s 40th country to be severely effected by COVID-19 (Junaidi, 2020). The story further reported deaths and scale of pandemic province wise in Pakistan.

In an opinion story published in The Express Tribune the writer warned about the ever increasing scale of COVID-19 pandemic and how Pakistan is extremely vulnerable with its inadequate hygiene and health systems (Ahmar, 2020). The writer of the story also drew a comparison between the government’s claims of containing the virus and the competing ground realities. The challenges of social distancing in densely populated localities along with ever increasing income pressures faced by the middle and lower middle classes were also highlighted in the story. The “inability” of the people sitting in power to enforce right measures was linked to the increasing levels of frustration among the people. The writer further elaborated on the social and psychological implications of the pandemic faced by different segments of the Pakistani society (Ahmar, 2020).

Thus the stories falling under this theme mostly comprised of the unfolding information regarding the pandemic. Most of the stories were developing in nature as the pandemic itself was unfolding itself at a very fast pace. The information was mostly compiled in manner which was meant to warn both the readers and the policy makers about the tremendously growing scale of the pandemic.

### 4.3 Social & Economic Impact of the Pandemic

The stories falling under the theme of social and economic impact comprised of the frame categories related to recommendations for reviving the economy crisis; social distancing; lockdown; charity; apathy; foreign help; economic impact of the pandemic at domestic and international level; economic relief to individuals and small and large scale enterprises by the government.

In a story published in Dawn the Prime Minister of Pakistan urged the Pakistani nation to donate for the Coronavirus Relief Fund as the funds will be utilized to provide relief to the segments of the society who are hit hardest because of the coronavirus lockdown measures. Along with asking for donations the Pakistani Prime Minister also urged the youth to step forward in these difficult times and provide essentials and food items to the struggling strata and also play their part in minimizing the effects of corona virus. For this purpose the registration of youngsters in the PM’s Corona Tiger Force was also encouraged (Covid-19 relief fund: PM urges people to donate so government can take care of those in need, 2020).

In a story published in The Express Tribune the alliance between China and Pakistan was highlighted as China pledged more help for Pakistan in order to fight the corona pandemic. The story was filed in the backdrop of the meeting between Pakistani Foreign Minister Shah Mahmood Qureshi and the Chinese Ambassador to Pakistan Yao Jing. As the Pakistani FM congratulated the Chinese Ambassador over “successfully dealing with the pandemic” the Chinese Ambassador asserted that China “would continue its support for its iron brother” (China pledges more help to Pakistan in fight against corona pandemic, 2020).

A story published in Dawn focused on the different strategies that can be adopted by the freelancers to survive their businesses during the pandemic (Saleem, 2020). As a result of the massive layoffs in the
job market the sources of income generation for freelancers were also equally dried up because of the loss of the clientele. The story educated the freelancers regarding certain steps that can be taken to minimize the effects of economic downturn for the freelancers. The recommendations included reviewing the business tools and expenses, exploring alternative options of financing, harnessing business network, transferring the work to online platforms, optimizing work space and routine, encouraging flexibility, focusing on innovation and investing in the development of skills (Saleem, 2020).

The impact of coronavirus on the economy was discussed at length in another story published by The Express Tribune (Rehman, 2020). The story also incorporated the information regarding conspiracy theories through which the crisis is seen not as targeted towards public health rather seen as a “politically motivated agenda to transform the global economy”. The adverse effects of lockdown on Pakistani economy could result in the squeezed livelihood opportunities for small and medium businesses and daily wage earners in particular. The story also correlated the effects of closure of businesses, industries, transport and airports to the overall condition of the economy. The story reiterated the fact that although Pakistan’s economy has withstood many challenges in the past but the current situation requires more apt public policy and its implementation (Rehman, 2020).

The details regarding smart lockdowns and its effectiveness in dealing with Covid-19 spread was discussed at length in a story published in Dawn (“Smart lockdowns lead to effective handling of Covid-19 in Pakistan”, 2020). The decline in the number of COVID related deaths was attributed to the smart lockdown strategy in Pakistan. The acknowledgment in this regard was made by the Medical Microbiology and Infectious Diseases Society of Pakistan. The story further stated that the isolation centers which were established in Karachi and Lahore were not used to their full capacity owing to smart lockdown strategy. In a similar story published in The Express Tribune the government’s strategy to “ease lockdown” was related to the reporting of lesser number of cases in comparison to the projected number of cases (“April 29: Govt prepares to ease lockdown, considers 15, 525 Covid-a9 cases as below projections”, 2020). The story stated that Pakistan despite being close to China remained relatively free from virus for a much longer period of time but the number of cases spiked as pilgrims who returned from Iran tested positive for COVID-19.

The stories falling under this theme mostly comprised of the direct human interest stories as they dealt with areas which directly affected the everyday life of individuals in terms of their economic and social preferences. The stories also provided recommendations for the economic and social revival of the Pakistani society in particular and the world at large.

The recurrent themes in the selected content and the dominant frame categories employed for framing COVID-19 pandemic by the Pakistani media are summarized in the following figure:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Dominant Frame Categories</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Scientific Development related to pandemic</td>
<td>Defining the pandemic; medical updates; health related precautions; development of vaccines; new findings regarding the causes and symptoms of pandemic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scale of Pandemic</td>
<td>Trends of domestic infection cases; mode of pandemic transmission; facts and figures related to infected; statistics related to patients (recovered and critically ill); number of pandemic related deaths;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social &amp; Economic Impact of the Pandemic</td>
<td>Recommendations for reviving the economy crisis; social distancing; lockdown; charity; apathy; foreign help; economic impact of the pandemic at domestic and</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5. Discussion and Conclusion
Effective and timely communication strategies by the health and government departments for public awareness have mostly played a pivotal role in handling pandemic situations. The media framing of these strategies helps the public in adopting required precautions to control the outbreak along with limiting the mortality and morbidity rates. As Barry (2009) rightly pointed that “in the next influenza pandemic, be it now or in the future, be the virus mild or virulent, the single most important weapon against the disease will be a vaccine. The second most important will be communication” (p. 1039). The connection between health communication and journalism is often examined through the lens of framing. Scheufele and Tewksbury (2007) asserted that framing can be understood as an assumption that how news is portrayed in the news is bound to have an influence on how it is perceived by the audience. Entman (1993) while explaining the process of framing said that “to frame is to select some aspects of a perceived reality and make them more salient in a communicating text, in such a way as to promote a particular problem definition, causal interpretation, moral evaluation, and/or treatment recommendation for the item described” (p.52). Thus framing is one of the most frequently applied theories in terms of comprehending the coverage of disasters (Durham, 1998; Haider-Markal, Delehanty, & Beverlin, 2007). Media framing also traces its origin to cognitive psychology as framing heavily relies on the ideas, concepts and feelings which are stored in human memory in the form of a node and connected to each other through semantic tracks (Price & Tewksbury, 1997). Resultantly the way health issues are framed in the media has impact on the audiences’ comprehension of those particular health issues.

Entman (1993) asserted that the issues which received more information were also considered more important by the members of audience as the media not only tells us what to think but also what to think about. The study analyzed the dominant frames used in the coverage of COVID-19 pandemic by the versions of the mainstream English press of Pakistan. Three broad themes emerged as a result of the inductive content analysis which included Scientific Development related to pandemic; Scale of Pandemic; Social and Economic impact of Pandemic.

Stories falling under the theme of scientific development incorporated frames related to defining the pandemic; medical information; health related precautions; development of vaccines; new findings regarding the causes and symptoms of COVID-19. The news stories falling under this theme were mostly meant to educate the readers as factually and as succinctly as possible. Stories falling under the theme of “Scale of Pandemic” incorporated frames related to mapping the evolving trends in domestic infection cases; facts and figures related to infected, recovered and critically ill patients; number of pandemic related deaths; mode of transmission of COVID-19. The stories falling under this theme mostly comprised of the unfolding information regarding the pandemic. The information was mostly compiled in manner which was meant to warn both the readers and the policy makers about the tremendously growing scale of the pandemic. The stories falling under the theme of Social and Economic impact of pandemic comprised of the recommendations related to revival of the economic and social activities; social distancing; lockdown; charity; apathy; foreign help; economic impact of the pandemic at domestic and international levels; economic relief to individuals and small and large scale enterprises. Thus the study supported the view that it is through the process of framing that media attains the ability to attract attention towards a particular issue (Entman, 2007). In terms of health crisis especially in the scenario of COVID-19 pandemic media framing helped in imparting significance to the information regarding pandemic (Liu & Kim, 2011).

Although this research was mostly exploratory in nature because of the unfolding patterns of the pandemic coverage during the selected time period but it helped the researchers in locating the following areas for future inquiry:
• Role of Journalists and reporters in health emergencies as front line workers
• Dependence of public policy makers on media framing in matters related to public health
• Media coverage of pandemics and its effects on stimulating strokes of panic and fear among the audience

References
Ahmar, M. (2020, April 17). As the pandemic crisis deepens. The Express Tribune. Retrieved from


Corporate Social Responsibility for Competitive Advantage in Project Management: Evidence from Multinational Fast-Food Companies in Pakistan

1Mariam Sohail, 2Shahid Iqbal, 3Waheed Asghar, 4Syed Arslan Haider
1PhD Scholar, Department of Management, Superior University, Lahore Campus, Pakistan, Mariam_sohail10@yahoo.com
2Assistant Professor, Management Studies Department, Bahria University, Islamabad Campus, Pakistan, siqbal.buic@bahria.edu.pk
3Director in Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority, Government of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan, waheedasgharpk@gamil.com; director.at@tevta.gop.pk
4PhD Scholar, Department of Management, Sunway University Business School (SUBS), Sunway University, Selangor Darul Ehsan, Malaysia, haidershah24@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

The aim of current article is to examine the relationship between corporate social responsibility and competitive advantage in Project Management. This research used “Quantitative Methods” in which data was collected from five multinational fast-food companies of Pakistan by use of Likert Scale questionnaire. A sample of 80 persons was selected by using random sampling technique who are engaged in the selection and execution of corporate social responsibility activities. Data was statistically analyzed using the SPSS software version 20. Findings indicate that most of the multinational fast-food companies of Pakistan are engaged in corporate social responsibility practices. So, there is significant positive relationship between corporate social responsibility and competitive advantage.

© 2020 Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: siqbal.buic@bahria.edu.pk


1. Introduction

Nyuur, Ofori and Amponsah (2019) states that organizations now-a-days are concerned for stakeholders and social issues and want to become good corporate citizens. Ağan et al. (2016) discussed that the honor of an organization depends on the directing values of an organization. Lee et al. (2016) said that organizations have become superior economic institutions of the world from respective ambiguity over the last one and a half century. Prior studies also indicated that in modern business world organizations are interested in ethics and values are considered an important element of success (Solomon, 2016; Farooq et al., 2020). Moreover, organizational values are continually fluctuating because of various
Corporate social responsibility (CSR) contains the actions by which minimum responsibilities of an organization to the stakeholders are raised (Alshbili & Elamer, 2020). Social responsibility means constructive contribution of an organization to the society. CSR is the involvement of an organization in the actions by using its resources that would assist the society (Noor et al., 2020). CSR helps in building a constructive and long-term relations with the society. If an organization is working for the welfare of the society i.e. giving donations, they will have to pay less tax as donations for these activities are exempt from tax and this decreases the burden of tax on an organization. Although, competitive advantage (CA) is the organizational ability to consume its rare resources and skills in the selection and execution of schemes (Shaukat, Qiu & Trojanowski, 2016). CA supports organizations to yield higher profits as compared to their competitors, increase the market share and lead in the industry. The CSR is a valuable approach which helps the organizations in getting a competitive advantage over its rivals and researchers are interested in this topic (Farooq et al., 2020, Noor et al., 2020).

Therefore, the purpose of this study is to explore the CSR activities of the multinational fast-food companies in Pakistan and to investigate the relationship between corporate social responsibility and competitive advantage. The previous studies in this field had determined the role of corporate social responsibility in determination of competitive advantage for multinational fast-food organization. But this report will cover the future concerns of fast-food companies to use the extent of corporate social responsibility to build strategies for Pakistan. It is important for the fast-food organization, so to drive the ideas and assist in selection of CSR activities that construct strategies either for short term or for long term.

2. Literature Review
2.1 Corporate Social Responsibility

The concept corporate social responsibility (CSR) is an important ethical issue which organizations should consider while making decisions (Jesus Herrera Madue, 2016). A business term CSR evolved in the last years of twentieth century when a large number of organizations diverted their attention to the effect of organizational actions on environment and society (Ahmad, Shafique & Jamal, 2020). Though, CSR is gaining importance now-a-days. Essentially, CSR is the responsibility of an organization to its society, especially the responsibility to its stakeholders and those who affect the organizational decisions and practices (Mahmood & Alsayegh, 2020). CSR is the activities of an organization in addition to its core expertise that are operated to provide benefit to the society. CSR is associated with the actions in which minimum responsibilities of an organization to the stakeholders exceeds which are described by rules (Arslan & Demirtaş, 2016). It is valuable for the organizations to work for the welfare of society by using its resources. The society is an essential component of the organization which provides human resources, consumers, raw materials and investors (Schulz & Flanigan, 2016). Organizations give extensive response of goodwill to the society which is tangible and measurable (Bakhsh, Mahmood & Mahmood, 2019).

Organizations should examine their CSR practices by using the similar plans that direct their important business decisions. Organizations will determine that CSR is not only a cost, restriction, or a charitable act but can also lead to innovation, opportunity and competitive (Odipo & Njeru, 2016). CSR is the motive to support and obligate organizations to accept more accountability for their conduct (Advantage, 2020). Organizations take their responsibilities of providing employment, eradicating favoritism and preventing pollution (Joscha Nollet, 2015). Furthermore, CSR is a concept in which organization takes the responsibility of helping the society and the monetary concerns of its investors (Wójcik, 2016). Recent study by Waple, & Brachle (2020) specified that CSR contains four components: philanthropic, legal, social and economic responsibility shown in pyramid form where philanthropic is at the top and it follows legal, social and economic responsibility directed towards the bottom of an organization. Economic responsibility is central obligation of an organization regarding organizational
profits by satisfying the wants and requirements of customers (Bakhsh et al., 2019). Legal responsibility is the obligation of an organization to follow law. An organization that performs the social responsibility practices, we will state that it follows the principles related to the business ethics. Philanthropic responsibility considers that organizations are good corporate citizens and add to the resources of society. CSR includes two important elements: transparency and responsibility. No doubt the basic purpose of organizations is to perform financially and to earn profits but they are also responsible to the stakeholders.

Additionally, the subject of discussion in the CSR field is that an organization survives with the aim of earning profit or to seek other activities. According to the stakeholders approach the main purpose of the organization is to work for the welfare of their stakeholders (Zhang et al., 2020). An organization should perform the functions that are related with profit and also be the good corporate citizen. Organizations should keep in mind that how their functions and polices will influence the employees, environment, community and society (Lu et al., 2020).

2.2 Competitive Advantage

Competitive advantage (CA) is the organization’s ability to obtain expertise in order to operate in a better way as compared to its competitors and to supply best quality goods and services than their rivals (Saedi et al., 2015). CA is the picture in which an organization generates greater economic value than its competitors (Zhao et al., 2019). Economic value is the difference between full economic cost of goods or services and advantage perceived by a buyer of organizational goods or services. There will be the competitive equality when an organization generates the same economic value as its competitors or there will be competitive disadvantage when an organization generates less economic value than its competitors (Nyuur et al., 2019).

According to (Opilo, Mulili & Kimani., 2018) CA is a valuable asset for an organization as it guarantees the progress of an organization even if the performance of economy is poor. If an organization has selected its own market segment and is superior to its rivals because of its cost, it will be a market leader and customers will prefer this brand. CA is that how organizations achieve their targets while competing with other rivals (Su et al., 2016). To achieve their goals organizations must outperform than their competitors in the industry. In this case organizations could not fulfill the wants of their customers efficiently and they could charge high prices to increase their profits. Similarly, if an organization is cost-effective, it would charge low price to its customers which will lead to increase in revenues (Aksak et al., 2016). Organizations not only get competitive advantage over its rivals but also they sustain it for a long time. According to the (Lee et al., 2016), that it’s the competitive advantage because of which customers prefer the products of a company over its competitors. Organizations can get sustainable CA by using generic strategies such as cost leadership, differentiation and focus (Yin & Jamali, 2016).

Multinational fast-food organizations have various important channels to achieve competitive advantage. (Wickert et al., 2016), described that an organization uses cost leadership strategy in which it produces the goods at low cost to achieve more profits than its competitors. Organizations can also use differentiation strategy in which they offer unique products or services to customers than their competitors. In focus strategy, organizations concentrate on a narrow segment of the market and in this segment cost leadership or differentiation is achieved and finally this market segment will be less appealing for the rivals. Organizations can also get competitive advantage by using their resources. Some of the resources can generate advantage for an organization as favorable organizational prestige, brand equity, organizational ability to consume resources efficiently like delivery of the products is speedy than rivals.

2.3 Corporate Social Responsibility and Competitive Advantage

Various studies have been conducted on CSR (JoschaNollet, 2015; Alshbili et al., 2020). Prior studies examined the relationship between CSR and competitive advantage and stated that every organization
can recognize specific social issues and organizations can have better solution of these issues by which they will gain CA (Lu et al., 2020). Aksak et al. (2016) studied the relationship between CSR and corporate strategies in the stock exchange companies and reported that CSR plays an important in building the image of organizations and concluded that CSR related concerns should be given more importance. Advantage (2020) studied that CSR is a tool to manage stakeholders in large companies. This study concluded that while formulating strategies involvement of CSR is important to make unique products and brand whereas actions done for CSR fulfill the criteria of the cost benefit analysis. Waples & Brachle (2020) defined that organizations have an important role in providing benefit to its society.

There is an association between CSR and competitive advantage (Ağan et al., 2016). According to (Wójcik, 2016), companies can get a chance of competitive advantage with the help of CSR. (Lu et al., 2020) clarified that firms perform social responsibility activities because they perceive that it will help them in getting competitive advantage. Firms are the part of society; they are not separate from the society in which they exist and perform their operations. Now-a-days firms are motivated to perform the CSR activities (Solomon, 2016). So, the managers give more importance to CSR like other investment decisions. Wickert et al. (2016) also illustrated there are two different CSR cases, first is normative case which state that organizations should perform social responsibility actions because it is ethically good and second is business case which state that organizations should be asked that how they can make economic progress by paying concentration on social responsibility actions. To perform CSR activities, companies have to make short term investment but the benefits associated with CSR are long-term.

### Figure 1: Research model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Corporate Social Responsibility</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sponsoring Students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Projects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environment Care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partnership with NGOs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Profit sharing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organization culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methods to measure CSR</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. Methodology
3.1 Research Design
In this research paper, “quantitative research methods” is used to analyze the data (Park & Park, 2016). The primary data is used in this research which has been collected from Five-point Likert scale questionnaire which is adopted from (Mbugua, 2012). The questionnaire is composed of 3 main parts demonstrating:
- Demographics
- CSR Practices
- Competitive Advantage

The simple random sampling technique has been selected owing to a number of reasons including expedited data collection due to time restraint and availability of reliable data in order to gather data and analyze it quickly. Due to COVID-19, respondents are not willing to provide data in face to face meeting therefore data was collected through online. An aggregate of 120 surveys were conveyed and 80 participants returned the questionnaire. The response rate was quite encouraging in such difficult COVID-19 time period, yielding a response rate of 66.66%. Because of time limitation data has been
collected within three months (i.e. February 2020 to April 2020) for this study. Population for this research consists of managers, project managers working in five multinational fast-food organizations. The SPSS version 26.0 software was used for analyzing the responses received from the respondents to confirm the data reliability and further analysis (Pallant, 2020).

Out of these respondents, 61% were male and 39% were female, as the presence of women in construction projects in Pakistan is quite low. The majority of the sample fell within the ages of 21–30 years old. With respect to the educational level, large numbers of respondents are Master degree holders. Also, the respondents of current study had majority Forty-six (58%) employees have work experience of 1-5 years, twenty-nine (36%) employees have work experience of 6-10 years and five (6%) employees have work experience of 11-15 years. All these work experiences of employees were in their current organizations.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1: Descriptive Analysis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21-30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41-50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qualification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intermediate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Master</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-5 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-10 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11-15 years</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.2 Corporate Social Responsibility Practices
8% employees responded that their organizations sponsor to the brilliant and needy students to a very great extent, 25% employees responded that their organizations sponsor students to a great extent and 59% employees responded that their organizations sponsor students to a moderate extent.

44% employees responded that their organizations are involved in community projects to a very great extent, 52% employees responded that their organizations are involved in community projects to a great extent and 4% employees responded that their organizations are connected with community projects to a moderate extent.
46% employees responded that their organizations do environment care to a very great extent because their production processes are environment friendly, 51% employees responded that their organizations do environment care to a great extent and 3% employees responded that their organizations do environment care to a moderate extent.

56% employees responded that their organizations have partnership with NGOs in different activities to a very great extent, 34% employees responded that their organizations have partnership with NGOs to a great extent and 6% employees responded that their organizations have partnership with NGOs to a moderate extent.
Figure 5: Partnership with NGOs

43% employees responded that their organizations share profits with needy members of the society to a very great extent, 41% employees responded that their organizations share profits with needy members of the society to a great extent and 14% employees responded that their organizations share profits with needy members of the society to a moderate extent.

![Figure 6: Profit sharing with needy members of the society](image)

37% employees responded that their organization culture is supported by HR policy of CSR to a very great extent; 50% employees responded that their organization culture is supported by HR policy of CSR to a great extent and 11% employees responded that their organization culture is supported by HR policy of CSR to a moderate extent.

![Figure 7: Organization culture supported by HR policy of CSR](image)
26% employees responded that their organizations have methods to measure CSR obtaining desired results to a very great extent, 50% employees responded that their organization have methods to measure CSR obtaining desired results to a great extent and 24% employees responded that their organization have methods to measure CSR obtaining desired results to a moderate extent.

![Figure 8: Methods to measure CSR obtaining desired results](image)

The findings indicate that multinational fast-food companies of Pakistan are actively engaged in the corporate social responsibility practices.

### 3.3 Relationship between CSR and Competitive Advantage

Pearson correlation coefficient test was applied to find the relationship between corporate social responsibility and competitive advantage. This statistical test measures whether there is any association between CSR and competitive advantage.

Table 1 represents the correlations between corporate social responsibility and competitive advantage. There is significant positive relationship between CSR and competitive advantage \( (r = 0.605, p = .000) \). Thus, we can say that the multinational companies which are actively engaged in CSR will get the competitive advantage over its rivals.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2: Correlation Analysis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Corporate Social Responsibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competitive Advantage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

### 4. Conclusion

The findings of the paper indicate that most of the multinational fast-food companies in Pakistan are engaged in corporate social responsibility practices. They are voluntarily engaged in these activities. Pearson correlation coefficient was used to find the association between CSR and competitive advantage.
which represent that there is significant positive relationship between CSR and competitive advantage. Multinationals which are involved in CSR practices will have more competitive advantage as compared to the companies which are not involved in CSR practices.

5. Limitations of the Study
There were limited resources available for this research such as shortage of finance and time. Small sample size is also the limitation of this study. Only quantitative method of research was used in which questionnaires were distributed among the employees of five multinational fast-food companies and results were statistically analyzed but there is also need of qualitative research to get more detailed information of the topic.

6. Future Research Suggestions
Further study is needed to confirm the relationship between corporate social responsibility and competitive advantage and to overcome the limitations of current research. Future research can be done by conducting interviews of human resource managers of the multinational fast food companies to get their perceptions and views about CSR and competitive advantage. Industries other than fast food can be studied to find out the strength of relationship between CSR and competitive advantage in each industry.

References


Zhao, Z., Meng, F., He, Y., & Gu, Z. (2019). The influence of corporate social responsibility on
competitive advantage with multiple mediations from social capital and dynamic capabilities.
Sustainability, 11(1), 218.

Appendix:

1) Questionnaire

Section A: General Information

1. Gender
   Male ( ) Female ( )

2. What is your age group?
   21-30 ( ) 31-40 ( ) 41-50 ( ) 50+ ( )

3. What is your level of education?
   Intermediate ( ) Bachelor ( ) Master ( )

4. How many years of work experience do you have in this organization?

Section B: Corporate Social Responsibilities Practices

To what extent does your company is engaged in each of the following Corporate Responsibility practices

1. Sponsoring brilliant but needy students.
   Not at all       Little extent      Moderate extent      Great Extent      Very great extent
   1                      2                          3                            4                           5

2. Community projects such as drilling bore holes for the semi-arid and arid areas.
   Not at all       Little extent      Moderate extent      Great Extent      Very great extent
   1                      2                          3                            4                           5

3. Care for the environment through use of environment friendly production processes.
   Not at all       Little extent      Moderate extent      Great Extent      Very great extent
   1                      2                          3                            4                           5

4. Partner with Non-Governmental Organizations’ in various activities.
   Not at all       Little extent      Moderate extent      Great Extent      Very great extent
   1                      2                          3                            4                           5

5. Share profits with under privileged members of the society through initiatives that explicitly state this.
   Not at all       Little extent      Moderate extent      Great Extent      Very great extent
   1                      2                          3                            4                           5

6. Have an organization culture reinforced through the Human resource policy of fostering CSR in the day to day running of the organization.
   Not at all       Little extent      Moderate extent      Great Extent      Very great extent
   1                      2                          3                            4                           5

7. Have a think tank within the organizations strategy to deliberately choose and execute CSR activities.
   Not at all       Little extent      Moderate extent      Great Extent      Very great extent
   1                      2                          3                            4                           5

8. Have a budgetary allocation in its financial planning cycle for achieving CSR activities
   Not at all       Little extent      Moderate extent      Great Extent      Very great extent
   1                      2                          3                            4                           5

9. Projects aimed at uplifting the orphans, sick and the homeless.
   Not at all       Little extent      Moderate extent      Great Extent      Very great extent
   1                      2                          3                            4                           5

10. Economically empowering community through establishing products that allow businesses to thrive.
   Not at all       Little extent      Moderate extent      Great Extent      Very great extent
    1                      2                          3                            4                           5

11. Mechanisms of measuring effectiveness of CSR achieving desired outcome e.g. benchmarking, balance score card.
    Not at all       Little extent      Moderate extent      Great Extent      Very great extent
    1                      2                          3                            4                           5
### Section C: Competitive Advantage

1. Your company is the preferred number one choice of customers.
   Not at all Little extent Moderate extent Great Extent Very great extent
   1 2 3 4 5

2. The market share of your company is the largest among its competitors.
   Not at all Little extent Moderate extent Great Extent Very great extent
   1 2 3 4 5

3. Your company provides high quality products.
   Not at all Little extent Moderate extent Great Extent Very great extent
   1 2 3 4 5

4. Your company provides a wide range of products.
   Not at all Little extent Moderate extent Great Extent Very great extent
   1 2 3 4 5

5. The products of your company are easily availability in the market.
   Not at all Little extent Moderate extent Great Extent Very great extent
   1 2 3 4 5

6. The delivery of the products of your company is faster due to presence of an optimized supply chain.
   Not at all Little extent Moderate extent Great Extent Very great extent
   1 2 3 4 5

7. Your company has well trained and motivated manpower which leads to a superior workforce.
   Not at all Little extent Moderate extent Great Extent Very great extent
   1 2 3 4 5

8. Your company has systems and processes which drive all business functions optimally.
   Not at all Little extent Moderate extent Great Extent Very great extent
   1 2 3 4 5

9. Your company uses loss prevention systems to mitigate and investigate losses if they occur.
   Not at all Little extent Moderate extent Great Extent Very great extent
   1 2 3 4 5

Others: (Please specify)

Thank you for your co-operation.
Assessing the Mediating Role of Organization Learning Capability between the Relationship of Green Intellectual Capital and Business Sustainability

1Muhammad Rizwan Sabir, 2Muqqadas Rehman, 3Waheed Asghar,
1Ph.D. scholar, Superior University, Lahore, Pakistan, justrizig@gmail.com
2Director, IBA, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan, muqqadasrehman@hcc.edu.pk
3Director, TEVTA, Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan, waheedasgharpk@gmail.com

ARTICLE DETAILS

History
Revised format: November 2020
Available Online: December 2020

Keywords
Green Intellectual Capital,
Green Human Capital,
Green Structural Capital,
Green Relational Capital,
Business Sustainability,
Organization Learning Capability

JEL Classification
M10, M14

ABSTRACT

There has been a lot of debate on intellectual capital and its dimensions, except green intellectual capital (GIC). The economic benefit of business not only eliminates the neediness of the region but also invigorate the prosperity in the area; however, the heat of financial interest among business competitor causes social inequality and destruction of the environment. This paper is novel conception due to the lack in prior studies as many did not focus on the relationship between green intellectual capital (green human capital, green structural capital and green relational capital) and business sustainability (BS) in the context of a developing country; Pakistan to assess the mediating role organization learning capability (OLC) between the relationship of GIC and BS. The current study tried to link two theories, natural resource-based view and intellectual capital-based view (NRBV & ICBV), to conceptualize the intangible resources that lead to business sustainability by assimilating the "green" into conventional intellectual capital namely green intellectual capital. Data were collected from 154 SME manufacturing companies in Lahore, Pakistan. The simple random sampling technique used for data collection. SPSS and AMOS software is used for data analysis. The results show that all three dimensions of green intellectual capital effect on business sustainability. While discussing the mediation role of organizational learning capability, OLC mediates the relationship between human capital and business sustainability. Furthermore, OLC does not play a mediation role between structural capital, relational capital, and business sustainability. Finally, this study described limitations as well as future directions

© 2020 Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: waheedasgharpk@gmail.com

1. Introduction
The topic of Sustainability is getting more attention and interest in academics as well as practitioners. There has been seen extensive deliberation and discussion regarding the conception of Sustainability. A wide range of discussion is available on the significance of Sustainability along with the different ways and means which is used for achieving and retaining it. The profits which are concerned about the activities economically done in business is increasing the prosperity as well as the conditions of living all over the world; nonetheless, it is leading towards the destructing the environment along with inequality in society which is caused directly or indirectly (Sullivan et al., 2018). The research conducted by Gong et al. (2018), indicated that the destruction in the environment is taking place and it has measured that almost 60% of the environmentally friendly systems have been besmirched on a global level. There is a need to take the step for solving the problems which are existing in the environment; if it is not solved, then it will be increasing and continue to worsen the situation. On the other hand, several companies are not considering the problems by saying that these are not due to the activities of an organization which is impacting the environment, and they are just ignoring the issue. Moreover, all the firms were not agreeing on the concept of Sustainability. The backgrounds and scenarios of business are same as it was in the past, it has turned to be more different from the previous landscape of business because the resources are limited, the use of technology is increasing, the markets are developing, and the updated models used in the business is interfering the traditional methods (Sullivan et al., 2018). The concept regarding Sustainability was firstly applied to deal through the destruction and degradation in the natural environment along with its negative influence on the health of human beings, societal wellness, and the growth in the economy. The "World Commission has defined the term on Environment and Development (WCED, 1987)" which is pointing out that the concept of Sustainability is referred as to the "development that meets the needs of the present generation without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs." This is used in literature extensively and also applied to the three main results, named "economic, social, and environmental." The issue needs quick attention; it should be discussed in the different firms, countries, and regions because these all are changing a begun to use updated and diverse ways. They are vigorously observing the different and innovative ways out which should be implemented to minimize the negative influence of activities of humans on the environment along with improving the health of the public in which the citizens are living and reaping profit. Nevertheless, numerous firms are still not sure about the steps they need to take and what kind of strategies they should use to deal with it. The regulation and actions taken by the government are not sufficient and adequate for the implementation of Sustainability in firms. For dealing with the shift in the environment, the firms need to develop a strategy which is discretionary however it is compulsory and significant for all of the organization operating in the market (Ray and Grannis, 2015). In connection with the previous discussion, the different research studies have been undertaken by many researchers which includes adopting the eco-friendly innovation (Aboelmaged and Hashem, 2019), environmentally friendly management of human resource (Zaid et al., 2018), ecological supply chain (Jabbour and Jabbour, 2016), ecofriendly purchasing (Zhang et al., 2018) as well as low development of carbon (Ma et al., 2019).

The trend of research is increasing in the eco-friendly activities of the business. Besides this, investing in intellectual capital (IC) is also related to protecting the environment, which is indicated as "green intellectual capital (GIC)," which is taking into account both gaining and sustaining competitive edge and meeting the needs of environmental management. Additionally, according to the research study of Mårtensson and Westerberg (2016), the authors emphasized how the organization is developing for the in house skills and abilities with using the last characteristic and features of the strategy of environment. Disappointingly, the elements of in house skills and capabilities are absent in preventing the environment (Cleff and Rennings, 1999; Sharma and Correa, 2005). Intellectual capital is a mixture of all the intangible resources (Stewart, 1991), and these resources have the firm which is playing an important role in the organization more willingly than tangible nature resources (Allameh et al., 2010). In the new body of knowledge, the association in the IC, and the performance of the firm has been developed. Conversely, GIC is not much known in the researchers and practitioners. It is worth noting
that the conception of GIC is a probable and credible solution regarding the concerns of Sustainability, which has been debated in the above discussion. In 2008, Chen, in his research study, firstly acquaint with the conception GIC and the researcher mentioned that it would be used in making continuous improvements in the competitive advantage of the company. GIC is indicated as an entirety of the resources which is tangible or the association of knowledge, which is protecting the environment as well as modernization (Chang and Chen, 2012; Chen, 2008; Huang and Kung, 2011). The three key aspects of GIC are known as "green human capital (GHC), green structural capital (GSC), and green relational capital (GRC)."

The central theories of "Natural Resource-Based View (NRBV)," which is presented by Hart (1995) along with the "Capital-based View (ICBV)" developed by Reed et al. (2006), was used in the comprehensive research study. The theory of NRBV is complementing the theory, which is related to the resource-based view (RBV) presented by Penrose (1959). Hart, in his research, indicated that the resources and skills in the environment are essential for an organization in obtaining a competitive advantage is helpful for the firm in the present day as well as in the future. However, from Hart (1995), the theory of RBV is not taking into account the linkage in the natural environment and the firm. Apart from this, the resources of an intangible organization are playing a crucial part in valuing the strategic resources as well as the skills and abilities of the company.

On the other hand, there are some problems and issues in measuring the intangible resources of the organization, which is recognized by the researcher like Bontis (1998). The researchers tried to overcome the restricted assess on measuring the intangible side of the resources by presenting ICBV, which is identified as the models for measurement of capital (Reed et al., 2006). In the main, the model of ICBV focused on the resources which are intangible in nature or the resources that have intellectual nature, and these are divided into three main categories, which are named as "namely human capital, structural capital and relational capital." The current research study is trying to associate the said theories for conceptualizing the intangible resources, which is leading towards the sustainable business organization with using the integration of green intellectual capital in the traditional intellectual capital. The current study will be undertaken for accessing the links of green intellectual capital and the Sustainability of the business. This study was conducted to access the green intellectual capital-business sustainability linkage.

According to the research of Mishal et al. (2017) and Cavicchi and Vagnoni (2017), the researchers suggested that for enhancing the Sustainability of the firm intellectual capital is playing a vital role in the organization. On the contrary, earlier research scholars have also proclaimed that the intellectual capital of the firm is leading towards innovation (Allameh, 2018) and also improving the repute and productivity (Bontis et al., 2018). Chen (2011) claimed the popularity of the conception of green politics in the present corporate world. Numerous firms are trying their best to be a highly sustainable organization. Previous research studies observed that the GIC is providing a detailed insight, understanding, and information, which is helping the supervisors and owners of the organization in achieving the best financial performance (Erinos and Rahmawati, 2017) along with the eco-friendly competitive advantage (Firmansyah, 2017). As a result, it is very significant to create a link in the green intellectual capital and Sustainability of business.

2. Literature Review and Hypothesis Development
2.1 Green Human Capital and Business Sustainability
According to the point of view of Wright et al. (1994), the researchers recommended that the human capital of the organization is playing an essential role in sustaining the competitive advantage of the organization. From the viewpoint of Subramaniam and Youndt (2005), the capital-related with the human is a leading resource which is playing a crucial role in the success of the organization for the reason that the skills and abilities which are possessed by the employees of the organization are significant for sustaining a business organization in the corporate world that is changing rapidly.
Additionally, the theory of Human capital is stating that the skills and abilities which are possessed by the employees are directly related to the productivity of the organization (Davidsson and Honig, 2003). When the employee has a high level of skills and capabilities, it has more chances to be more productive as compared to the company in which the employee is less capable. As the current era is more focused on the knowledge, so it is requiring that the organization has the personnel, workforces, administrators, and individual who are solving the problems of the organization to be well-informed and experienced. When the employees are acquiring more knowledge, it will help them in improving their skills. It will be beneficial for the employee to be more productive and enhance their work quality, which will increase productivity (Luthans and Youssif, 2004). At present, the aspect of the environment cannot be ignored by the business. Therefore, GHC role and its impact on the Sustainability of business must be examined. The findings of the study of Yong et al. (2019) showed that GHC is positively influencing the eco-friendly management of human resources. Likewise, the study of Erinos and Rahmawati (2017) concluded that the relation between GRC and financial performance is positive. In the meantime, the study of Chen and Chang (2013) also found that the association in GHC and eco-friendly innovation performance is also positive. The study of Huang and Kung (2011) indicated that GIC is helping the business to follow the worldwide regulations regarding the environment and creating value for the company. Additionally, Akhtar et al. (2015) stressed that for achieving Sustainability, human capital is significant. Nonetheless, there is a lack of research that has examined the interrelation in GHC and Sustainability of business. The research hypothesis of the current study is that:

H1: The association in the green Human Capital and Business Sustainability is positive.

2.2 Green Structural Capital and Business Sustainability
The previous study of Widener (2006) proclaimed that when the structures and processes of any firm are weak, the organization cannot be successful. Likewise, when the organization has structural capital that is strong, then it has a more reassuring environment, which is motivating the personnel in learning new information (Florin et al., 2002). The previous studies indicated that structural capital is playing an essential role in the performance of the organization (Bontis et al., 2000; Hsu and Wang, 2012). Moreover, it is necessary for the business that they should develop a structure of environment that is stable and helping to resolve the challenges in climate. It consists of the inside policies (Lee et al., 2015), and practices used in managing low carbon (Raar, 2015; Singh, 2015). Additionally, the eco-friendly culture will help in improving the sales of the organization and decrease the cost (Mehta and Chugan, 2015). Much previous research showed that there is a positive and significant association in the ecological structural capital and the outcomes of the business. According to the study of Chen (2008) and Firmanosyah (2017), the studies found that there is an interrelation in the competitive advantage and green structural capital. In the study of Huang and Kung (2011), the results indicated that the link in the GSC and activities related to commitment and competency of the environment is favorable. The study of Delgado-Verde et al. (2014) revealed that the green capital of the organization is positively associated with the eco-friendly innovation of the product. The findings of Erinos and Rahmawati (2017) research showed that GSC is positively affecting financial performance. Furthermore, Akhtar et al. (2015) found that structural capital is playing a significant part in achieving Sustainability. Nonetheless, there is no research study conducted which has examined the interrelation of the GSC and Sustainability of business. So, the hypothesis of the present study is that:

H2: The interrelation in the Green Structural Capital and Business Sustainability is positive.

2.3 Green Relational Capital and Business Sustainability
By using the relational capital (RC), the information within the partners is shared. The stakeholders of the organization can provide vital information to the firm. Nelson and Winter (1982) stressed that when collaboration with the partners is high than the firm is likely to have better routine work. The theory of Social Exchange suggests that the link in RC and transaction is comprising of a sophisticated advancement of personal as well as the structure of organization within the company. According to MorganHunt (1994), one of the critical characteristics of the association in the social exchange is faith. When the relationship in partners is based on trust, then the stimulation and learning are enhanced (Doz,
1990), and it will increase the performance of the company (Bonner and Walker, 2004). Many companies who are operating manufacturing concerns are trying to build a strong relationship with the suppliers to develop the required skills and abilities, which will lead to decreasing the cost of product and also increase the productivity of the firm (Walter, 2003). Furthermore, strong links will help achieve the goals of the environment (Bicknell and Mcmanus, 2006). Niesten et al. (2016) indicated that the big corporation in the companies, government, and the other institutes is increasing the Sustainability of society. In the recent research of Dickel et al. (2018), it is stated that when the partners are collaborating using green practices, it is increasing the consciousness in many stakeholders that will lead towards minimizing the uncertainty of the environment. Yusoff et al. (2019) claimed that the sharing of knowledge and corporation in the stakeholders is playing a significant role in adopting the approach of Sustainability. Numerous studies highlighted that ecofriendly relational capital is positively connected with productivity. The study of Chen (2008) and Firmansyah (2017) also concluded that competitive advantage and GRC are closely linked. Correspondingly, the study of Huang and Kung (2011) examined that the GRC is has a positive association with the competency of the environment and activities of organization related to commitment. According to Erinos and Rahmawati (2017), the influence of GRC is positive on financial performance. From the research findings of Yong et al. (2019), it is highlighted that the relation in the GRC and ecofriendly management of human resources is positive. Further, Akhtar et al. (2015) revealed that for achieving Sustainability, the role of relational capital is vital. Nevertheless, there is no research conducted to examine the association in the GRC and the suitability of business. So the hypothesis is that:

H3: Green Relational has a positive influence on Business Sustainability

### 2.4 Organizational Learning Capability as a Mediator between Green Intellectual Capital and Business Sustainability

For examining the role of mediator of the variable of organizational learning capability (OLC), different research studies have been undertaken. The research studies of (Agostini et al., 2017; Akgun, Keskin & Bryne, 2007) is showing the work. According to the research study of Hsu and Fang (2009), the interrelation in IC, OLC, and the performance of the development in the new product was analyzed. The findings revealed that intellectual capital, as well as the human capital, is enhanced in the development of the new product by using the OLC. The study of Akgun, Keskin, and Bryne (2007) examined the OLC as a mediator in the emotional capability and innovation in the product. The results highlighted that the OLC is playing the role of partial mediator in the innovation of product and emotional capability. According to Nattrass & Altomare (1999), OLC is playing a significant role in enhancing the Sustainability of business. The ecofriendly intellectual capital will be influencing the Sustainability of business in a better way when the organizational learning capability will play the role of mediator. So the hypothesis is drawn from the literature is that:

H4: Organization Learning Capability mediates the relationship between GIC and BS.

### 3. Methodology:

The hypotheses that can be described as the relationships between variables in the proposed model will be evaluated using a quantitative method. The current research uses the survey research approach to address research issues during the discussion of research design. The time horizon for this analysis is cross-sectional since the data are collected once in a while. This principle of research was better considered because the mindset of the respondent does not change during the response. The simple random sampling technique used for data collection. The target respondents received a total of 550 questionnaires. There are two data collection phases in this study. The first stage of data collection was carried out by a self - administered questionnaire between January and March 2020. 154 SMEs manufacturing sector from Lahore, Pakistan, has been selected. The questionnaires were distributed among employees of SMEs accompanied by a cover letter. In two weeks, they were asked to reply and complete the questionnaire. The second data collection phase was distributed within a period of two months (April 2020 to May 2020) by an additional 320 questionnaires. The mailed and online techniques were used. The answer to the questionnaire was provided to the respondents for two weeks.
The total number of respondents is 341, who returned the questionnaire. However, 40 of the questionnaires were incomplete and deleted. For the final analysis, a total of 301 questionnaires have been included, with a 62% response rate.

3.1. Measurements
Green intellectual capital is composed of green human capital (GHC) and green structural capital (GSC) and green relational capital (GRC) with a total of 18 items, which have been adapted from Huang and Kung (2011). The measurement scale was measured on a 5-point Likert scale, ranging from 1 (strongly disagree) to 5 (strongly agree). This scale was used in previous studies (Firmansyah, 2017; Omar et al., 2017). Chow and Chen (2012) have introduced a scale of business Sustainability. The respondents were asked to evaluate the outputs of the company, which have a total number of items of 22, concerning three key aspects—economic, social and environmental. Organization learning capability has 15 items which are adopted by Chiva et al., (2007) and champs et al., (2011)

4. Analysis
4.1 Correlation Coefficient
The correlation coefficient provides a precise analysis of a particular variable. It will be from -1.00 to +1.00 this correlation coefficient. The value of the correlation coefficient of 0.5-1.0 is considered significant in line with Pallant (2011) and implies that there is a strong relationship between an independent and a dependent variable. Table 1 below indicates that the independent variables and the dependent variable have a strong correlation. This analysis thus reveals that green structural capital and green human capital has a clear positive relation, with a minimal association between 0.061.

![Table No 1: Correlation matrix](image)

4.2. Reliability
The reliability test alpha value is used for the measurement of internal coherence in each of the variables in each item. Alpha values above 0.7 are acceptable; however, the value above 0.8 is preferable (Pallant, 2011). Table 2 below shows that the alpha of Cronbach ranges between 0.704 and 0.817 each variable, which indicates a perfect internal consistency.

![Table No 2: Reliability analysis](image)

4.3 Multicollinearity
A multicollinearity measure of the multi-regression variables set is the variance inflation factor (VIF) and tolerance. VIF over 10 and tolerance value under 0.1 indicates that there are high multiple correlations with other variables and suggest multicollinearity possibilities (Pallant, 2011). Table 3 shows that all independent variables are below 10, and the tolerance is above 0.1, according to the following results from VIF. Diagnostic tests also indicate that the presumption of multicollinearity is not infringed.
Table 3: Multicollinearity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Tolerance</th>
<th>VIF</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Green Relational Capital (GRC)</td>
<td>.986</td>
<td>1.014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Green Structural Capital (GSC)</td>
<td>.989</td>
<td>1.011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organization Learning Capability</td>
<td>.682</td>
<td>1.467</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organization Human Capital (GHC)</td>
<td>.684</td>
<td>1.461</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.4 Confirmatory factor analysis (CFA)

The CFA is a particular form of factor analysis, most widely used for social research. Confirmatory Factor Analysis (CFA) is different from Exploratory Factor Analysis (EFA) since the measurements of a building consistent with researchers’ understanding of the nature of the building (or factor) are used. The goal of CFA is, therefore, to test if the data fit a hypothesized measuring model. CFA is a crucial element in the measuring model in SEM that is used before modeling the structural model to obtain an acceptable model fit. CFA ran in two ways: individual CFA and pooled CFA (Chong et al., 2014). Fitting model measures can be obtained to assess how well the proposed model has captured covariance between all items or measurements in the model. All unnecessary items are either removed or restricted in latent constructions. Loading factor, absolute fitness indexes, incremental, and parsimonious must reach acceptance level. Tables 3 and 4 demonstrate that loading factors for items of variables are far higher than the recommended values of 0.30. In the present analysis, 10 items of business sustainability have been omitted because of low weights in regression. 6 organization learning capability items were excluded due to low regression weights.

Factor loadings of business sustainability, organizational learning capability, and green structural capital

Table 4: Factor Loadings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Factor loading</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Factor loadings</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Factor loadings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BS1</td>
<td>0.369</td>
<td>OLC3</td>
<td>0.423</td>
<td>GSC1</td>
<td>0.334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BS2</td>
<td>0.558</td>
<td>OLC7</td>
<td>0.524</td>
<td>GSC2</td>
<td>0.451</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BS3</td>
<td>0.635</td>
<td>OLC8</td>
<td>0.560</td>
<td>GSC3</td>
<td>0.547</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BS4</td>
<td>0.568</td>
<td>OLC9</td>
<td>0.570</td>
<td>GSC4</td>
<td>0.562</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BS5</td>
<td>0.489</td>
<td>OLC10</td>
<td>0.392</td>
<td>GSC5</td>
<td>0.507</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BS6</td>
<td>0.576</td>
<td>OLC11</td>
<td>0.671</td>
<td>GSC6</td>
<td>0.653</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BS7</td>
<td>0.673</td>
<td>OLC12</td>
<td>0.639</td>
<td>GSC7</td>
<td>0.587</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BS8</td>
<td>0.488</td>
<td>OLC13</td>
<td>0.461</td>
<td>GSC8</td>
<td>0.644</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BS9</td>
<td>0.452</td>
<td>OLC15</td>
<td>0.439</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BS11</td>
<td>0.362</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BS13</td>
<td>0.305</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BS15</td>
<td>0.335</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Factor loadings of green human capital and green relational capital

Table 5: Factor Loadings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Factor loadings</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Factor loadings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GHC1</td>
<td>0.650</td>
<td>GRC1</td>
<td>0.536</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GHC2</td>
<td>0.782</td>
<td>GRC2</td>
<td>0.439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GHC3</td>
<td>0.361</td>
<td>GRC3</td>
<td>0.697</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GHC4</td>
<td>0.475</td>
<td>GRC4</td>
<td>0.515</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GHC5</td>
<td>0.384</td>
<td>GRC5</td>
<td>0.620</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5. Model fit indices

The fit indices are parsimonious and are tailored to most of the above. We can be modified to equate models with different dynamics (equal coefficient numbers). You penalize fewer slothful models,
making them superior to simpler models. The more intricate the model, the lower the index fit. Parsimonious indices include PRATION, PCLOSE, PGFI, PNFI, PNF2, PCFI, but Bollen (1989) reported that such a cut is arbitrary, although there are thumb-rules for acceptance of the model fit. Carmines and McIver (1981), for instance, state that CMIN should be acceptable in the 2:1-3:1 range. Kline (1998) says that 3 or fewer is acceptable, and others allow values of up to 5 to be considered to fit the model, whereas others emphasize 2 or lower. In the case of RMSEA, if its value is less than or equal to 0.05, it provides well if it exceeds or equals 0.08. However, RMSEA > = 0.6 as the cutoff or suit model suggested by Hu and Bentler (1999). A 0.85 CFI is more fitting when 0.70 suits the best model of the previous model. The GFI value is appropriate if, as suggested by (Kim, 2007; Yang, 2006), the cost is higher than 0.85. All the benefits that are given in the table below are in an acceptable range.

Table No 6: Confirmatory factor analysis (CFA)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Chi-square</th>
<th>CFI</th>
<th>GFI</th>
<th>RMSEA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Threshold values</td>
<td>&lt;3</td>
<td>&gt;0.90</td>
<td>&gt;0.850</td>
<td>&lt;0.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business Sustainability (BS)</td>
<td>2.601</td>
<td>.924</td>
<td>.956</td>
<td>0.057</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Green Relational Capital (GRC)</td>
<td>1.583</td>
<td>.997</td>
<td>.996</td>
<td>0.034</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Green Structural Capital(GSC)</td>
<td>2.323</td>
<td>.968</td>
<td>.980</td>
<td>0.051</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organization Learning Capability (OLC)</td>
<td>2.790</td>
<td>.949</td>
<td>.970</td>
<td>0.060</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Green Human Capital (GHC)</td>
<td>1.155</td>
<td>.999</td>
<td>.998</td>
<td>0.018</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6. Structural equational modeling (SEM)

SEM is a method for predictive testing and assessment of causal relations by integrating mathematical and qualitative variables (Wright, 1921). SEM enables confirmatory and exploratory modeling that is suitable for analytical and theoretical testing. Confirmatory modeling typically begins with a hypothesis expressed in a causal model. To determine the relations among concepts in the model, the concepts employed in the model must then be applied. The model is tested with the measuring data obtained to assess how well the model fits the data.

The causal assumptions in the model are often false and can be checked against the data. With an initial SEM theory, the corresponding model can be specified inductively, and the free parameter values can also be estimated using data. SEM 's strengths include the ability to build latent variables: variables that are not directly measured in the model, but estimated from multiple measured variables, each predicted to "tap" latent variables. The model can thus expressly capture measurement unreliability in the template, which theoretically allows precise estimation of structural relationships between latent variables. Exceptional cases of SEMs are factor analyses, path analyzes, and regression.

Table No 7: Structural equational modeling (SEM):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypothesis</th>
<th>Estimates</th>
<th>P-value</th>
<th>Result</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GHC → BS</td>
<td>.144</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GSC → BS</td>
<td>.141</td>
<td>.003</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GRC → BS</td>
<td>.071</td>
<td>.048</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

7. Mediation analysis

To confirm the type of mediation, Bootstrap is an essential part of structural equation modeling. It also enables researchers to evaluate the stability of parameter estimates, which can be used in cases where significant and multivariate typical assumptions are not supported. Two models must be built to implement this approach, one with the existence of a mediator and the other with the existence of a mediator. The form of intervention shall be checked according to the recording results explicitly and indirectly.
8. Discussion
To solve the issues prevalent in the environment, the ecofriendly strategies must be adopted quickly. Different researchers have recognized that the GIC will be very much beneficial (Huang and Kung, 2011). Nonetheless, the association in GIC and BS is not studied. So the study will be useful to fill the gap by examining the impact of "GIC dimensions, namely GHC, GSC, and GRC, on BS". For collecting the data, 154 SMEs in the manufacturing sector, which are operating a business in Lahore is selected. The findings revealed that the connection in the GHC and BS is significant. The result matched with the previous research of Chen and Chang (2013) and (Yong et al. (2019). As the results of these studies showed that the GHC is contributing to increasing the performance of the organization. Another finding revealed that the association of GSC with the BS is positive. The results are consistent with the past research by Chen, (2009), who concluded that the interrelation in competitive advantage and GSC is significant. The early research has also proved that the structural capital is contributing towards a sustainable business (Akhtar et al., 2015). The last results of the study showed that the influence of GRC on the BS is positively significant. The results are aligned with the numerous previous researches (Chen, 2008) that the contribution of GRC is significant towards the performance of the organization. Additionally, the researcher Akhtar et al. (2015) also concluded that there is a correlation in Sustainability and relational capital.

The mediating effect of OLC between GHC and BS is thus accepted. H4a was, therefore, accepted. Perhaps the plausible reason for manufacturing small and medium-sized companies to accept the challenges of protecting and retaining good human resources, especially for environmental protection. In the relationship between green structural capital (GSC) and BS, OLC has no mediating effect. H4b has therefore been rejected. Insignificant findings from this study show that accumulated environmental protection knowledge may be smaller as financial and physical constraints are lacking. This study finally found that OLC does not mediate the link between GRC and BS. The good relations between staff and other stakeholders are believed to bring a major change in sharing knowledge with them. The lack of funding may restrict the SMEs to build the relationship between employees and other stakeholders.

9. Limitations of the study
There is some limitation that has been faced by the existing research study. One limitation of the study was that it was conducted in a country that is developing and on SMEs in the manufacturing sector of Pakistan. So the generalization of the study is limited in scope. The cross-sectional data was used, which is not providing insight into the changes in the components of GIC over time. The size of the sample of the research was small, which is not providing a conformity of results. Despite the limitations, the study has provided some significant results which have provided insight into the GIC and the Sustainability of business in the SME manufacturing industries of Lahore, Pakistan. It is providing a direction to the
future researchers who are planning to examine the significance of GIC on the Sustainability of business.

10. Suggestions for future study
Notwithstanding a few limits of the study, this can be taken up in different directions. The future researcher can take up other sectors of the industry for examining the association in GIC and the Sustainability of business. The sector of services can be examined too in future research. The study can be undertaken in other emerging countries by taking up similar and different sectors. The study can be conducted using the approach of longitudinal study for investing the change in the variables with a period of time. It will be helpful for the researcher to improve the GIC role on the Sustainability of business. Other variables can also be added for getting the more extensive and wide perspective regarding the factors which is influencing the dependent variable of the study.

11. Conclusion
The model which is presented in the study is guiding for the SMEs in the manufacturing sector for determining the influence of different dimensions of GIC on BS. The new strategies of the environment will be used for opening up updated opportunities for the companies to achieve Sustainability. The model can be helpful for the firms to make improvements in their skills with which the cleaner manufacturing can be achieved along with using the different strategies of GIC the business can achieve Sustainability. Additionally, the findings highlighted that the GSC, as well as the GRC, is positively correlated with Sustainability. There the business should focus on these dimensions of GIC.

References


1299


Service Quality and Customer Retention in Malaysian Commercial Banks

1Chim Weng Kong, 2Maria Abdul Rahman

1PhD Candidate, School of Business, Universiti Utara Malaysia, 69.wkchim@gmail.com
2Senior Lecturer, College of Business, School of Business Management, Universiti Utara Malaysia, maria@uum.edu.my

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

This conceptual paper explores the contribution of service quality on banks’ customer retention. Customer is the core factors to any business industry and there is no exception for the banking industry. Customers will only retain with the same bank provided there is a quality service. Service comes in the form of how the bank’s employee treats the customers and from physical facilities and other tangibles used in banking transactions. Contribution of service quality is indefinite and without it, firm’s business will lose out to other banks. Banks not only compete with other banks but banks’ branches as well. The importance of the banking business cannot be neglected as it has contributed to Malaysia Gross Domestic Products in term of service industry. Service is not similar with goods or physical products as it is intangible and only can be experienced during the process of selling or buying. Good quality service must be prioritized in helping retaining customers even with the Industrial Revolution 4.0 where it is “a mechanism that is controlled or monitored by computer-based”. Contribution of human capital which is cannot be separated in term of knowledge, friendly approach and ethical help in delivering quality service. One of the methods can be applied by the bank is the commitment of monitoring and servicing customer requirements to deliver high levels of service quality for total customer satisfaction.

© 2020 Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: 69.wkchim@gmail.com


1. Introduction

For businesses, focusing on customers have a tangible benefit. Customers are the sources of revenue to the company to meet the bottom line. Moreover, if the company is able to retain the customers, the continuous stream of revenue can be generated. Looking back to 1990s, Dawkins and Reichheld highlighted the distinct of customer retention into one of the reputable marketing strategies. According to these authors customer retention strategies can be used not only banking but in a wide range of industries. Customer retention should be emphasized by the banking industry since bringing in new customers cost five times more compare to the cost of retained customers. According to Noel Yee, Tracy
Yun and Jackie Yau (2013) customer retention owing from the aggregate of satisfaction during the purchase process and company should keep on improving customer satisfaction. Only one out of twenty-five unsatisfied customers will express the dissatisfaction and happy customers will tell four to five customers about the satisfaction, but unsatisfied customers will tell nine to twelve customers about the unsatisfactory experiences (Hundre, Raj Kumar, and Dileep Kumar, 2013).

Mecha, Martin, and Ondieki (2015) the long-term effect of customer retention is on the customer value and firms capitalized on this phenomenon as it brings the firm profits. In the annual financial reports of Malaysia’s individual bank, profitability of the banks has been fluctuating for the past decade (appendix A). The effect of the bank’s mergers has automatically created an enlarged customer based where revenue should be increased or improved. As mentioned by Lai, Ling, Eng, Cheng, and Ting (2015), the merged bank has benefited from the increased economies of scale and therefore reduce its operation cost. Subsequently the merged bank is able to take in more profit and hence increase shareholders’ wealth. Regrettably, profit of some banks remains constant or even decreased as compared to the preceding year.

Aik, Hassan, Hassan, and Mohamed (2015) the conclusions of the study on merger exercise is the operating performance improve significantly after the merger compared to before the merger. Furthermore, from the preceding studies, the running cost to attract new customers is five to ten times more compared to maintaining an existing customer (Hundre et al., 2013; Mecha et al., 2015). Notwithstanding the outcome, banks should look beyond retaining customers, but also the need of attracting new ones to replace customers that left. With this, it will maximize the profits while minimizing the operating cost.

Arokiasamy (2013) put forward that service quality proves the firm’s ability to fulfil customers’ demand and want. Organization must improvise service rendered in order to meet customers’ demand since it is the vital point to compete in the market. On the other hand, Appannan, Doraisamy, and Hui (2013) state that banks are lagging in several areas, which include delay in answering customer calls, queuing time, how an employee greets the customers, whether information received by customers was accurate and adequate, and any follow-up by the bank’s employee. Some banks even outsourced their service quality survey to other professional companies while some are carried out itself to determine where the bank service quality stands.

Banks are competing intensely in this highly competitive environment to offer quality-oriented services according to customers’ expectations. Determining the level of service quality allows banks to understand customers’ needs and wants. Offering excellent quality service to customers nowadays in the business environment is crucial due to the intense competition. The add-ons of the advantages of quality service will boost the company’s image, enhance customer retention, attracting potential customers through word-of-mouth and in the long run increase the company profit (Osman and Sentosa, 2014).

According to Appannan et al., (2013), service quality is important to satisfy customers theoretically and, or empirically. This has been proven in various industries that comprise of service industries. In the banking industry, products are homogeneous and the only way for banks to differentiate is through outstanding service quality that satisfy the customers and leave an impression. They note that service quality is a vital factor to influence customers’ satisfaction level in banking. Quality in banking is a multi-variable concept which consists of convenience reliability, service portfolio and most importantly the employee delivering the service.

Service quality starts with relationship establishment before any delivering of business transaction. As mentioned by Al-Alak (2014) research, as the quality of relationship increases between the service provider and customers, it will have a significant influence on the customer’s behaviour in terms of continuity of the relationship and word-of-mouth promotion. Lau, Cheung, Lam, and Chu (2013)
globalization has changed customer behaviour about banking industry and the way of running the banking operation has become more dynamic and competitive. They highlight the introduction of new methods of delivering services such as automated teller machines (ATM), phone and internet banking. Alnsour (2013) the changes of recent environmental factors like the unexpected increase of competition and the changing of customers’ perspective, make marketing strategies change from “offensive marketing”, getting new customers as priority to “defensive marketing”, which concentrate on customer retention.

Customer satisfaction has been treated as a critical factor on holding customers in a long-term duration in relationship marketing literature. Thus, in any service failure encountered by a customer, the most important step to undertake is to restore the customer’s satisfaction (Siu, Zhang and Yau, 2013). Therefore, this conceptual paper will touch on the importance of service quality to be delivered in order to meet customers’ satisfaction that can help banks to retain their existing customers and prevent these customers from being attracted by competitors.

2. Literature Review
The cost of customer acquisition is much higher than customer retention and a small increase in retention rates could drive large profit increases (Chang and Zhang, 2016). As mentioned earlier, customer retention is a critical factor in achieving customer satisfaction (Alnsour, 2013). These statements are strong enough to describe the importance of customer retention to any firm. To these previous researches, customer retention plays a significant role not only in the banking industry but others as well, in terms of meeting the bottom line. For bank’s sustainability and performance improvement purposes, banks require the contribution of repeat purchase from customers that generate revenue. Thus, customer retention continues to be the dominant factor that allow any firm to be competitive in the business industry.

Banking business has been confronted by issues in customer retention due to establishment of banks branches, introduction of new service delivery, changes of customers’ need and the banking environment as whole. Mecha et al. (2015) customers are moving from one bank to another looking for one bank that fit their needs. It is a challenge for the manager to build close relationships to retain existing customers who are at the same time, being lured by other banks. Once the competitors are able to build a close relationship with the customers, the chances of getting back the customers will be low. Hence, customer retention has been one of the goals of relationship marketing where initial contact rely on the relationship to be continued.

Hettiarachchy, and Samarasinghe (2016) define customer retention as “the longevity of a client’s relationship with a product and/or service providing firm”. Once there is an establishment of relationship between bank and customers, banks’ employees are able to market additional products with quality service to retain the customers. Service quality must be felt by customers the moment they step into the banks and business transactions need relationship to be continued.

Relationship building champion the use of interaction between the service provider and customer through face-to-face communication. Added in with quality service, chances of competitors attracting firm’s existing customers will be minimized. Tan, Hamid, and Chew (2016) banks that able to provide quality service have the advantages in marketing activities since improved service quality lead to the increase of revenue, opportunity of cross-sell, expanded market share and lastly higher customer retention rates. Banks acknowledge that they must compete in a more efficient way through the satisfying service quality. Syaqirah, and Faizurrahman (2014) conducted a research on hotel’s room service quality using three stars hotels in Malaysia. They concluded that service quality is important as delivering exceptional service will bring customers a higher satisfaction, which denote the element of customer retention and thereafter increase the firm’s profit. Similar with the banking industry, where customers must experience its services during the purchase process, then they can judge the service.
There are numerous past researches on customer retention or on customer loyalty that examine different types of variables that contribute to customer retention in various service business industry, which include banking (e.g. Siu et al., 2013; Arokiasamy, 2013; Zeyad, and Wahab, 2013; Wang, Hsu, and Chih, 2014; Syaqirah, and Faizurrahman, 2014; Kandampully, et al., 2015; Mecha et al., 2015; Osman and Sentosa, 2016). Some of the exploration on customer retention include research on multichannel of service delivery, service failure recovery, service quality and impact of satisfaction to customers. According to these researches, banks are interested on providing new technology associated with service quality, rather than traditional delivery functions. The introduction of technology has changed retail banking significantly with the development of new ranges of products and improvement of delivery channels.

The contribution of service quality attracts many researchers due to its influence on the business industry since decades ago. Parasuraman, Berry, and Zeithaml, 1991 study (as cited in Bose and Gupta, 2013) proposed SERVQUAL as a measurement that evaluate the actual service quality rendered by service provider to the expected service quality by customers. According to the study, there are five dimensions to measure service quality foreseen by the customers. They also state the dimensions are related to three additional Ps of service marketing mix which include people, physical evidence, and process. Another fact pointed by them is “a general tenet in marketing and business holds that high-quality goods and services are favoured in the market”. High quality performance produces assessable benefits in terms of profit, cost savings, and market share.

SERVQUAL is a multiple-item instrument with five dimensions: tangible, reliability, responsiveness, assurance, and empathy. Physical facilities, equipment and appearance of personnel are classified as tangibles and the remaining dimensions are classified under customer-based performance measure. It is more on the human interaction that bank employee provides to the customers. They define service quality as the difference between customer’s expectations for the performance of a service before the service is endured and their perception on the service received. Intangible services are the most difficult to be evaluated due to customers’ various perception and satisfaction levels. A quality service accepted by one customer may not be perceived as good quality by another.

Khan and Fasih, (2014) research examine satisfaction and loyalty through service quality in the banking industry by applying only 4 dimensions of tangible, reliability, assurance, and empathy which exclude responsiveness. The research conclusion is that service quality and all the dimensions tested have a significant and positive linkage to customer satisfaction and loyalty. Their findings also state that service is a non-stop process interaction between service providers and customers in an intangible activity which arrange “premium solutions” to customers that include physical and financial resources. In fact, banks are providing physical services such as ATM for deposits and withdrawal and the convenience of brick and mortar services in rural areas or for customers who are not familiar with technology. Generally, the usefulness of ATM is it can be used by customers from different banks.

Osman and Sentosa (2014) research on the understanding of mediating effect of customer satisfaction on service quality and loyalty relationship in Malaysia commercial banks. The results showed that service quality enhances customer satisfaction in Malaysian commercial banking industry, which all the hypotheses testing was supported. The results translate into the relationship between customer satisfaction and profitability and is linked to customers’ satisfaction that influences customer loyalty. The research conclude that satisfied customers will make repeat purchases and a small percentage of customers will leave for the competitor.

Kandampully et al. (2015) define loyalty as attitudinal loyalty where it is the commitment of customers to perform any repeat purchase or visitation to the same providers in the future for chosen products or services, although there are influences from others. The definition is similar with the definition of customer retention where customers establish a continuous relationship with a product or service.
provider. Therefore, for this conceptual study it does not attempt to differentiate the two definitions.

It is of paramount importance to treat customer retention as the primary marketing strategy for the bank. Past literatures have supported that service quality indeed help the bank’s performance, but it is not responding or aligning with the increase of customer base due to the bank’s mergers. The inconsistence of bank’s performance if not due to service quality, it may possible due to other factors such as demography of customers especially in term of customer’s income.

3. Customer Retention
Edward and Sahadev (2013) the cost on capturing new customers is higher compare to the lower cost of retained customers which helps the profit of the firm. For service-oriented businesses like banking, a customer retention program is recommended due to the cross-sell opportunities and stream of revenue. One of the definitions by Hundre, Kumar, and Kumar (2013) customer retention is providing or meeting what customers want and as expected by them. Banks help customers meet their financial objective whether in term of investment or getting a loan. The banks need to exceed customers’ expectations in order to convert them into devoted loyalists to the banks.

Kandampully et al. (2015) generating and sustaining customers to be retained in the firms assists in creating long-term and mutually beneficial relationship. They also highlight that retained customers will not be easily attracted by competitors which display a firm commitment by customers. Customers agreeable to the higher price show great purchasing intention and unwillingness to switch to competitors. Thus, retained customers can produce continuous high revenue that help banks meet the bottom line. However, banks must acknowledge that customers’ expectations on service quality grow higher as the years pass.

There are several advantages when firms are applying customer retention in terms of economic benefits such as the customers’ tenure with the firm is longer, repeated purchases due to a longer tenure, and most of all is the referral by these retained customers (Coussement, 2014). Customers providing referrals through positive word-of-mouth are much stronger than banks’ self-promotions. However, if customers promote negative word-of-mouth, the impact is substantial. Therefore, the more customers and firms understand each other, it will result in the maintenance costs of their relationship to fall and hence, pushing up the net present value of retained customers. Accordingly, Mecha et al. (2015) pointed out that banks should intensify the customer retention strategies with more effective methods such as customer service and produce innovative products that are unlike the rest of the competitors.

From the past literatures on customer retention, it may describe that a low customer retention scenario is like “continue supplying oxygen to leaked tyre”. The goal will never be reached, and it will cause the bank’s operation cost to remain high which affect the bank’s profit. Hundre, et al. (2013) for a company with a small customers base, losing a few customers is tantamount to crippling the company. Banks with a huge customer base does not translate to the bank being about to make more profits if the bank’s customers continue to leave for their competitors because of the lack of consistent service quality from the bank’s employees.

Bank’s employees do not just sell the product, but they also develop relationships with the customers and educate them. Only then will the customers feel the service quality difference between the bank and its competitors. Banks that employ customer retention strategies often find it an efficient process due to the long-term relationship where customers already have the indication of interest on the products. Some customers may already have the impulse to buy and with a little force, the sales can be concluded. It is easier for the customers to make decision when they already capitalize on their purchase and service quality experience with the banks. Plus, Mecha et al. (2015) state firms need to distinguish its products to make competitors irrelevant and by carrying out such a move, sales will be increased and certainly survive in the market. Hence, it is important that banks treat customer retention as a sustainable business.
model which is in the arsenal for sustainable growth.

Customer retention is not only about the service products (Hundre et al., 2013) and they strongly feel that it is about how servicing existing customers and the way a reputation is created within and across the market-place. Additionally, customers expect to be treated on a more personalized or individualistic basis, given the demographic background and household income. Banks should not sell the products but the features instead.

Mecha et al. (2015) opine that service to the customers is one of the certain methods to apply customer retention. They explain to understand the customers and their needs with outstanding service is what they require where customers feel it is worth of the continuous relationship. Therefore, when customers have full confidence on the firm, their purchase intentions will be surged (Wang, Hsu, and Chih, 2014).

4. Service Quality

If customer satisfaction is the main reason of customer retention, banks should portray its products or service quality the moment a consumer walks into the bank’s premise. The first contact is critical to the consumer before they turn into customers. Siu et al. (2013) customer satisfaction is an accumulation over certain number of meeting experiences and the firm shall continue to improve customer satisfaction through service quality for customer retention. For that reason, service quality has become one of the major researches by academics to explore.

Definition of service quality defined by Paul, Mittal, and Srivastav (2016) is the differences of actual service performance received and customer’s expected service performance prior to the service. There is a positive effect on the performance of profit for the firm that lead to the competitive advantages due to the improved service quality. To enhance better service quality whether in term of employees’ service or technology, banks have introduced more technology to customers. Technology has significantly facilitated the creation of new service products like ATMs. Setting-up self-service terminals at one corner in the branch for 24-hours banking transactions are some of the enhanced banking facilities. Banks need to monitor these technologies equipment to avoid any break-downs that affect service quality. All these introductions have provided new methods of how banks deliver services to customers. Nevertheless, in internet banking services there is a “chat” function where customers can communicate online with bank’s employee. The traditional service that require human involvement is still needed, where financial matters are concerned.

Service quality is one of the crucial elements in building the success and becoming one of the rivals of any business organization. Osman and Sentosa (2016) banking business can be differentiated from the competitors by offering better service quality to the customers. And service quality is one of the reasons that will decide the success in the banking business. As defined by Osman and Sentosa (2016) service quality is an act or execution which make customers to receive the benefit. Banks must aware that it needs to portray different approaches when employees sells service products to customers.

The factor of service quality is where customer can feel the satisfaction and marketing textbooks have encouraged marketers to utilize this element to differentiate itself from the competitors and the competing brand (Appannan et al., 2013). It is impossible for the banks to be differentiated as every bank has homogeneous products. Hence, it is the bank’s management responsibility to differentiate itself or among the bank’s branches through service quality. Service quality is one of the critical substances that affect customers’ satisfaction level in the banking industry and providing service is not only from the front office employees or sales team but from the operation employees up to the manager. Each employee represents the company and should provide the best of quality service to customers.

To draw the attention and thereafter retain the customers, service quality is one of the crucial elements (Islam, Ahmed, and Razak, 2015). The research conducted by them is in Malaysia Islamic banking,
Service quality has been treated as a sensible requirement in this stiff banking competition and for the expansion of market share and profit, banks need to produce superior service quality. Lau et al. (2013) banks are spending more time on service quality for the purpose of getting competitive advantage in term of increasing revenue and customer retention or loyalty from the customers. Furthermore, service quality expected by customers is rising due to the easily available of information in terms of advertisement from any banks and this allow customers to compare. And Khan and Fasih (2014) research has stated that researchers from all over the world maintain that by providing quality service will lead to strengthening the competitive advantage to any business industry.

Service quality is a continuous effort and all employees should have the commitment to do the same. Lau et al. (2013) normally customers purchase from firm due to the service provided and being assured for certain privileges. Providing quality service is not only for short term periods but for future purchases as well. Khan and Fasih (2014) the competence of a firm to foresee the future needs of customers represents the service quality and this will enhance the satisfaction of customers and the retention rate of the firm. Paul et al. (2016) explains that if customers are satisfied with the service, it shows in their mental state, where customers make a comparison of their purchase expectation prior to the purchase with the actual perception on after the purchase process.

Osman, Mohamad, and Mohamad (2016) there are many past researches on banking industry such as Greece, India, China, Taiwan and Iran which indicate that service quality plays a great influence and one of the important roles that make customers loyal to the bank. Despite that, research by Sheng-Qiang and Xue-Mei (2010) (as cited by Osman et al., 2016) state that tangible in service quality dimension has no significant impact on loyalty. Therefore, researchers must be aware that different countries have different cultures.

5. Conclusion and Recommendation
Chang, and Zhang (2016) there are various studies that proved that a small increase of customer retention created a large increase on profits. It has been proven from the past researches, customer retention is indeed the main element for business industry to perform or can be sustained provided there is some infrastructure that helps. With customer retention, banks revenue will be increased due to the repeat purchase and this in turn increase the profit for the bank. Moreover, retained customers help in providing free word-of-mouth referral to attract new customers. Words from satisfied customers carry more weight compared to the influences activated by the employees of the firm.

Mergers between the banks have enlarged their customer base. With fewer banks in the market, competition is expected to lessen but it still exists, just that it has shifted from between banks to between branches. However, there is the possibility of customers shift to another bank due to other reasons. Hettiarachchy and Samarasinghe (2016) “a firm with effective customer retention have the capability to convinces their clients to stay with the firm”. Customer retention definition given by Syaqirah, and Faizurrahman (2014) is customers willingness to remain with the same service provider. Banks must utilize any marketing gimmicks and strategy as well as utilizing the manpower of the employees to retain any existing customers due to the advantages of customer retention are so great that banks and other business industries should implement it as soon as possible.

For performance improvement, banks need to provide the element of quality service by fulfilling the needs of customers. An empirical study by Osman et al. (2016) define service quality as what customer going to receive from what they are willing to pay for instead of what supplier enclosed. Regardless what type of customers, banks have the obligation to fulfil customers’ financial needs by providing quality service consistently or additional services. Khan and Fasih (2014) specifically for the banking business, additional or premium service quality act as a crucial role for customers to assess the performance of the bank and it is a critical point of customer satisfaction and loyalty.
The important issue of this conceptual paper is the contribution of service quality put forward to customers by the bank for the purpose of customer retention. Service quality, no matter how great the product and the benefits or how influential the seller, one of the matters that customers are most likely to remember is the direct communication they have with the firm, where human interaction plays a crucial part. As long as quality service provided exceeds customers’ expectations, customers will be satisfied, and this led to the intention of repeat purchase. As such, Syaqirah and Faizurrraham (2014) the consequence on assessment of service quality can be proven when a firm providing excellent quality service can leads to customers’ satisfaction and thereafter customer retention with higher profitability.

Revenue is generated through service quality where profit is concerned, and it is from retained customers. However, complaints cannot be avoided, and the management should handle the complaints process with care. The application of service recovery must be applied by the banks. During the service recovery process banks management collects additional information to be analysed and, fix the root cause to avoid re-occurrence. All the information collected will be utilized for future marketing purposes. Notwithstanding the above, management should investigate further if even service quality with premium has been implemented by the bank and each of the employee is giving the quality service and yet the profit still fluctuates, it is time to analyse the operation cost of the bank.

References:


Appendix A

Table 1, sample of commercial banks of Malaysia in term of profit performance for the past ten years.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Maybank</td>
<td>3,051</td>
<td>2,373</td>
<td>2,457</td>
<td>3,553</td>
<td>3,358</td>
<td>4,305</td>
<td>4,885</td>
<td>5,903</td>
<td>5,834</td>
<td>6,422</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>CIMB</td>
<td>2,793</td>
<td>1,930</td>
<td>2,786</td>
<td>3,500</td>
<td>4,030</td>
<td>4,344</td>
<td>4,540</td>
<td>3,106</td>
<td>2,849</td>
<td>3,564</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>HLBB</td>
<td>.547</td>
<td>.696</td>
<td>.659</td>
<td>.767</td>
<td>.807</td>
<td>1.247</td>
<td>1.450</td>
<td>1.590</td>
<td>1.775</td>
<td>1.604</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Affin</td>
<td>.180</td>
<td>.299</td>
<td>.295</td>
<td>.346</td>
<td>.388</td>
<td>.450</td>
<td>.508</td>
<td>.476</td>
<td>.261</td>
<td>.351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Alliance</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>.381</td>
<td>.237</td>
<td>.183</td>
<td>.321</td>
<td>.387</td>
<td>.507</td>
<td>.511</td>
<td>.483</td>
<td>.452</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note:
1) Figures in ‘Italic’ indicate the comparison between different bank – lower ranking bank perform better the higher-ranking bank.
2) Figures in bold indicate the individual bank’s performance comparing preceding year.
The Impact of Covid-19 Pandemic on Mental Well-Being of Health Care Workers: A Multi-Centre Study

Nabila Hassan, Hina Akmal Memon, Noreen Hassan, Shobha Luxmi, Farhat Sultana

1Assistant Professor, OBGYN, Liaquat University of Medical and Health Sciences (LUMHS), Jamshoro, Pakistan, hassannabila310@gmail.com
2Women Medical Officer, OBGYN, Liaquat University of Medical and Health Sciences, (LUMHS), Jamshoro, Pakistan, hinmemon@gmail.com
3Lecturer, Business Administration, Federal Urdu University of Arts and Technology, (FUUAST) Karachi, Pakistan, n.hassan@fuuast.edu.pk
4Assistant Professor, Infectious disease, Dow University of Health Sciences, Karachi, Pakistan, shaobha.luxmi@duhs.edu.pk
5Assistant Professor, OBGYN, Liaquat University of Medical and Health Sciences (LUMHS), Jamshoro, Pakistan, farhatsaleem64@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

The study determines the effect of fear of being infected on anxiety and influence of anxiety on the disturbance of their mental well-being and to analyze the indirect effect of anxiety between fear of being infected and mental well-being. Cross-Sectional study carried out in the month of July 2020, by conducting a survey from health care workers (Doctors, Nurses and Trainees) covering hospitals from the region of Hyderabad, Jamshoro and Karachi. Analysis of the data done using two-step method of Structural Equation Model (SEM) approach. The findings of the study supported the positive and negative relationship fear of being infected to anxiety and anxiety to mental wellbeing respectively. In addition, the indirect relationship of anxiety also supported. Numerous unanswered queries pertinent to COVID-19 pandemic, and dubious situation leads towards huge size of disturbance in the lives of health care workers across the globe, therefore literature entails the necessity for researchers to study various factors that could have influence on mental well-being of an individual. The majority of relevant literature focused on mental well-being is from China, Europe, USA and other developed countries, however, fewer studies focused on South Asian region in general, and Pakistan in particular. So, present study fills the gap to unearth the factors of well-being for Pakistani health care workers. Pakistan have so far lost the lives of 58 healthcare providers to COVID-19 in the country and still counting while 240 healthcare providers are hospitalized. So there is intense need to study effect of mental well-being on health care workers as there is a need to save the survivors.
Corresponding author’s email address: n.hassan@fuuast.edu.pk


1. Introduction

Human history corroborates that an outburst of any pandemic results in multiple human causalities, a large number of suspected patients, the wave of uncertainty and deep down fear. The outbreaks of infectious diseases have been greater threat on human health and wellbeing since ages (Duncan, Schaller, & Park, 2009). The emergence of a novel type of corona virus, named as COVID-19, initially from Wuhan, China in December 2019 later on involving almost the whole world evoked immense challenges. This sheer speed of both the land extension and the unexpected increment in quantities of cases astonished and immediately overpowered health and public health services (Wu & McGoogan, 2020).

COVID-19 caused by a beta coronavirus named SARS-CoV-2 that affects the lower respiratory tract (Sohrabi et al., 2020) transmitted through respiratory droplets taking equal time for incubation and generation as SARS Corona virus (Wilson & Chen, 2020). On 22 of February year 2020, World Health Organization (WHO) confirmed COVID-19, a Public Health Emergency of International Concern and afterward it declared as Pandemic and By July 23, 2020, globally more than 200 counties/regions have reported rising toll of infection, morbidity and mortality.

Situation in Pakistan is alarming as well as number of active cases has surged to more than 400 million cases with more than 8000 fatalities (Waris, Khan, Ali, Ali, & Baset, 2020). As this pandemic was new, many of the health workers were not ready for it (Haq, Shafiq, & Sheikh, 2020). Globally the Healthcare workers (HCWs) are facing different problems related to their physical health, mental health and safety (Li, Song, Wong, & Cui, 2020). It is true for Pakistan where economic problems, limited facilities and infrastructure, with lack access to personal protective equipment (PPEs) and proper training such as donning and doffing pose the health care workers at greater risk being infected. (Haq et al., 2020).

As a result, many healthcare workers are contracting infection and some others who remain in contact with those positive cases are going to self-quarantine creating pressure in hospital and tertiary care units. An initial report revealed, as many as 765 healthcare workers including doctors (440), nurses (111) and paramedics (215) have tested positive for COVID-19 up till June 2020. (Harris, Bhatti, Buckley, & Sharma, 2020). There are also reports that healthcare workers once contracting disease are also infecting other healthy patients. Situation becomes worse when news of deaths of healthcare workers due to COVID-19 reported. This led to nervousness and anxiety for health care workers while examining their patients with positive COVID-19, resulting in severe mental disturbance (Satici, Saricali, Satici, & Griffiths, 2020). This reflects that "The flare-up of Corona Virus illness 2019 (COVID-19) might be upsetting. Dread and nervousness, fear and anxiety about a disease can be overpowering for health care workers". (CDC-Report) Notably, research endeavors concerning COVID-19 pandemic needed to create proof driven methodologies to diminish unfavorable mental effects and mental indications (P. Li et al., 2020).

The development of COVID-19 pandemic might prompt psychological trouble, nervousness and fear may lead to harmful stereotypes (Bangalore et al., 2020). Hence, it is important to pay adequate attention towards the mental wellbeing of health care workers through actualizing ways to encourage it at numerous degrees of experience during this unprecedented time of COVID-19 pandemic (Huang et al., 2020). Overall, experts around the globe are emphasizing on uplifting the mental wellbeing of public suffered by rising magnitude and intensity of COVID-19 pandemic (Chen et al., 2020; Rajkumar, 2020) but there is a dire need to uplift the mental well-being of health care workers who are actually dealing with the patients. This pandemic situation worldwide is representing a genuine threat to wellbeing due to fear of being infected, economic downturn and unavailability of clinically affirmed vaccines or specific therapeutic medications accessible for COVID-19.
This scenario poses numerous unanswered queries pertinent to COVID-19 pandemic, and consequently, the dubious situation leads towards huge size of disturbance in the lives of Health care workers across the globe, which entails the necessity for researchers to study various factors that could have influence on mental wellbeing of an individual (Chen et al., 2020).

The contribution of this research towards relevant literature is twofold. Firstly, this study is first attempt to examine the underlying relationship between fear, anxiety and mental wellbeing in a single study in the context of COVID-19 Pandemic. Secondly, majority of relevant literature focused on China, Europe, USA and other developed countries, however, fewer studies focused on South Asian region in general, and Pakistan in particular.

Fear of being infected reflects people general tendency to perceive themselves vulnerable to infections and risk of being contaminated with viruses (Stürmer, Rohmann, Mazziotta, Siem, & Barbarino, 2017) suggested as Fear is an adaptive response in the presence of danger. However, when threat is uncertain and continuous, as in the current coronavirus disease (COVID-19) pandemic, fear can become chronic and burdensome. Chinese study finding indicates confronted with the COVID-19 epidemic, HCWs including doctors and frontline workers feel very anxious about getting infected and had a great psychological distress and anxiety. The nurses were more conscious about being infected at work than doctors, technicians and support personnel, which cause the sky-high level of anxiety, excessive fatigue, depressions and tensions. As a result quality of work found seriously affected. Moreover, the study studribly marked the acute level of distress and anxiety because of the fear of being infected apparently it seems that there are no significant difference in mental condition between HCWs with or without self-infection (Dai, Hu, Xiong, Qiu, & Yuan, 2020). Another study on Thai discovered same psychological impacts over mental health and work performance. Surprisingly most HCWs found overawed by a frightening nightmare to them, depression, lack of attentiveness and greater anxiety. These emotions proved somehow good, as they lead towards more appropriate infection prevention practices but still number of HCWs were not willing and were not satisfied to accept new patients infected by COVID-19 or to see them admitted. However, the most crucial part is that the HCWs are found vague for not giving reasonable attend towards their tasks and not putting their required concentration at their work, raising issues on patient’s safety and health.(Anucha Apisarnthanarak et al., 2020). (Jungmann & Witthöft, 2020) emphasized specifically on analyzing the factors related to anxiety and the similar relationship where COVID-19 pandemic sit for adverse behaviors. The existing situation of coronavirus (SARS-CoV-2) pandemic is becoming the reason of mental and physical anxiety and high fatality with major impact on quality of life. Therefore, on the ground of the preceding studies, it is hypothesized that:

**H1: Fear of being infected positively related to Anxiety**

World Health Organization define mental well-being as an ability to live, work and appreciate diversion in a network where one has a feeling of belongingness and support, and the capacity to make meaningful contributions. The study of (Roy et al., 2020)expressed the effect of massive anxiety during pandemic situation specifically on Indian population, reported the massive reaction by people of all domains. This situation was determined from the time when media was broadcasting constantly through borders to possess every one up-to-date about the pandemic situation, which affect mental health due to anxiety, depression, fatigue and distress. . A Study from China by (Ahmed et al., 2020) indicates that anxiety remains negatively associated with mental wellbeing. Lock down and self-isolation significantly raised mental health problem with hazardous and harmful alcohol use. The study further added that the youngsters showed lowest mental well-being and provided psychiatric treatment to improve the well-being. Another study on health care workers and frontline staff highlighted that as COVID-19 pandemic is generating a massive health care problem that can reflect in different ways affecting their mental well-being as depression anxiety leads towards excessive sensation of aloneness, injurious liquor and drug use, self-harm or suicidal activities (Zaka, Shamloo, Fiorente, & Tafuri, 2020).

**H2: Anxiety negatively related to mental well-being**

Corona virus is affecting the life of the people overall. It makes a feeling of fear and lead to stress,
nervousness and ultimately to mental issues. As indicated by Center for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) Fear and anxiety about a disease can be overpowering. Another study by (Desclaux, Diop, & Doyon, 2017), (Jeong et al., 2016) found the participants having fears about their own health or fears of infecting others including their family members. They likewise turned out stressed in the event that they encountered any physical symptoms conceivably identified with the disease and fear that the symptoms could reflect having the infection kept on recognized with mental results. The study of (Evanoff et al., 2020) deliberated professional and private issues linked with psychological comfort and acknowledged stress, anxiety, depression, work-exhaustion, burnout, and reduced comfort between faculty and staff at a university and academic medical center during the SARS-CoV-2 pandemic. The frequency of unease, melancholy, and work exhaustion slightly advanced amongst clinicians than non-clinicians. Between all employees, anxiety, depression, and high work fatigue autonomously related with community or clinical exposure to COVID-19 fear of infection. Additionally, age below 40 and a vast number of family or home with stress also allocated with just handful outcomes. The study suggests that the mental well-being and health negatively affected of clinical and non-clinical staff during this pandemic situation due to depression and anxiety created.

**H3: Anxiety negatively mediates the relationship between Fear of being infected and mental well-being**

Figure-1 demonstrate the conceptual framework of the present study

![Figure-1](Model of the study)

Source: Researcher

### 2. Methods and Methods

The present study carried out with Cross-Sectional Research Design whereby the data collected over the month of July 2020 by conducting a survey from health care workers (Doctors, Nurses and Trainees) covering 12 hospitals from the region of Hyderabad, Jamshoro and Karachi. The primary data collected using convenience non-random sampling technique. For this study the ethical standards were strictly considered while performing procedures in studies comprised of human participants. The 7-item scale of fear of being infected” adapted from the work of (Ahorsu et al., 2020). 5-item scale of Anxiety adopted from the work of (Lee, 2020). 14-item scale of Mental Well-Being adopted from the work of Warwick–Edinburgh (2007) (Tennant et al.). For testing the significance and relevance of path coefficients, partial least square (PLS-SEM) approach employed using SMART PLS 3.0 (Henseler, Ringle, & Sarstedt, 2015).

Table -1 indicate the demographic details of the present study

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1: Demographic Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>GENDER</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>AGE</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less than 28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28-35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36-43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Above 43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>HOSPITAL</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1316
3. Results

As the table-2 indicated, the outer loadings and Composite Reliability more than satisfactory as all the values are higher than 0.50 establishing indicator reliability (F. Hair Jr, Sarstedt, Hopkins, & G. Kuppelwieser, 2014) and 0.70 establishing internal consistency reliability (Hair, Black, Babin, Anderson, & Tatham, 2006) respectively. The average variance extracted values for all constructs are greater than 0.5 (Hair et al., 2006) and hence establishes the convergent validity.

Table 2: Reliability and Validity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONSTRUCT</th>
<th>ITEMS</th>
<th>OUTER LOADINGS</th>
<th>COMPOSITE RELIABILITY</th>
<th>AVERAGE VARIANCE EXTRACTED</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Anxiety</td>
<td>ANX1</td>
<td>0.767</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ANX2</td>
<td>0.845</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ANX3</td>
<td>0.793</td>
<td>0.912</td>
<td>0.674</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ANX4</td>
<td>0.860</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ANX5</td>
<td>0.836</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>FOI1</td>
<td>0.745</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>FOI2</td>
<td>0.752</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fear of being infected</td>
<td>FOI3</td>
<td>0.662</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.889</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>FOI4</td>
<td>0.787</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>FOI5</td>
<td>0.750</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>FOI6</td>
<td>0.830</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MWB1</td>
<td>0.670</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MWB10</td>
<td>0.720</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MWB11</td>
<td>0.633</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MWB12</td>
<td>0.613</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MWB13</td>
<td>0.727</td>
<td>0.925</td>
<td>0.934</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MWB14</td>
<td>0.757</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MWB2</td>
<td>0.710</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MWB3</td>
<td>0.691</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mental well being</td>
<td>MWB4</td>
<td>0.699</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Researcher
MWB5  0.749  
MWB6  0.743  
MWB7  0.788  
MWB8  0.718  
MWB9  0.704  

Source: Researcher  

Illustrated in figure-2 the measurement model (representing outer loading and beta coefficient) on SMART PLS software.

Source: Researcher  

As specified in table -3 all the HTMT values are below 0.85 (Henseler et al., 2015) ascertained discriminant validity  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Anxiety</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fear of being Infected</td>
<td>0.546</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mental Well-Being</td>
<td>0.366</td>
<td>0.119</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Researcher  

In the study the bootstrapping method with 5000 re samples (Hair, Hult, Ringle, & Sarstedt, 2017) via Bias-Corrected and Accelerated (BCA) Bootstrap with one tailed test where significance level is 0.05 employed.
### Table 4: Significance & Relevance of Path Coefficients

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Path Coefficient</th>
<th>Original Sample</th>
<th>(STDEV)</th>
<th>O/STDEV</th>
<th>P Values</th>
<th>5.00%</th>
<th>95.00%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fear of being Infected → Anxiety</td>
<td>0.481</td>
<td>0.054</td>
<td>8.955</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.387</td>
<td>0.563</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anxiety → Mental Well-Being</td>
<td>-0.352</td>
<td>0.062</td>
<td>5.701</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>-0.443</td>
<td>-0.237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fear of being Infected → Anxiety → Mental Well-Being</td>
<td>-0.169</td>
<td>0.031</td>
<td>5.516</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>-0.221</td>
<td>-0.12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Researcher

Table- 4 specifies that fear of being infected is positively and significantly associated to anxiety and anxiety of HCWs is negatively associated with mental wellbeing indicating increase in anxiety with reduce their mental well-being and significance presence of anxiety as a mediator between the relationship (F. Hair Jr et al., 2014; Preacher & Hayes, 2008)

![Figure-3 Inner Model (Smart PLS)](image)

Source: Researcher

From figure-3 it is clear that present study model explains 49.2% of total variance in anxiety and 35.7% in mental wellbeing exhibited moderate level of R-square. Study indicates the predictive relevance of the model.

### 4. Discussion

This finding is in line with literature that there exist psychological impacts of COVID-19 pandemic outbreak on healthcare workers. As stated in a recent study (Dai et al., 2020) that corona virus anxiety was lowest when individuals use adaptive emotion regulation strategies (acceptance and putting into perspective). Due to this pandemic situation, health care workers have a great fear of being infected leading to depression, anxiety and excessive fatigue. As stated by (Anucha Apisarnthanarak et al., 2020) that “Although these emotions are proved to be good, as they lead towards more appropriate infection prevention practices but still number of HCWs were not willing and were not satisfied to accept new
patients infected by COVID-19 or to see them admitted”. It is evident that there are a high number of HCWs affected by various psychological ailments however the most crucial part is that the HCWs are found vague for not giving reasonable attend towards their tasks and not putting their required concentration at their work, that can raise issues of patient’s safety and health.

The current study has found a negative relationship of anxiety and mental well-being. At the extent mental well-being expected to be improved by providing valuable supportive information related to self-quarantine and social distancing to overcome but this was not the case for health workers as they are continuously examining their patients with fear of being infected leading anxiety. They further confess sleeplessness and mental disturbance due to the resultant anxiety. A study on mental well-being identified that an indication of improvement in mental well-being showed peoples' willingness and positive response to follow governmental guidelines to cope up the difficult situation but an outcome in reality significantly affects mental health problem due to frustration, depression, anxiety and distress (Roy et al., 2020). Both the government and health care agencies are responsible for protecting the psychological well-being of health care communities all over the world and ensuring a healthy work environment. Since there is a high prevalence of psychological trauma consequences among HCWs due to this pandemic; it is imperative to invest resources to promote the mental health welfare of frontline professionals. Older participants experienced greater well-being and a lower level of stress compared to younger ones. Doctors reported more stress than trainee and nurses. Anxiety had a strong effect on the overall well-being of physicians. As it is stated (Zaka et al., 2020) that COVID 19 Pandemic creates mental illness, anxiety, depression, stress which reflect due to fear of being infected.

The current study has found a negative mediating relationship of anxiety between fear of being infected and mental well-being which is in line with literature. The HWC’s found afraid of less precautionary measures used by the patients and this non co-operative attitude of patients found leading further into a high level of depression, exhaustion and fear for the HWCs. As stated by (A. Apisarnthanarak et al., 2020) the HWCs who are suffering from pandemic situation are fenced by a fear of being infected with suspected or confirmed COVID-19 patients, as they are absurdly exposed reported psychological distress. Furthermore, we find out that this crucial situation is making the anxiety stronger in HWCs, as in lined by (Jungmann & Witthöft, 2020) that COVID 19 pandemic is becoming the reason of mental trauma. As an outcome panel(Ahmed et al., 2020)defined that this current situation significantly affects mental health problem like frustration, depression and distress.

5. Conclusion
Development and spread of COVID-19 prompt psychological trouble, nervousness, and fear so emphasizing on uplifting the mental wellbeing of health care workers. The findings of the study supported the positive and negative relationship fear of being infected – anxiety and anxiety – mental wellbeing respectively. This research has certain limitations; first, it is hard to measure hundred percent views of any health care workers. As the perception is the individual expression which in hidden as it inside view or state of mind of participant, this could be ascertain only through the responses attempted by individual in the pandemic situation. Further, the survey conducted considering certain geographical region that might reflect bias. The outcomes cannot be generalized so it is suggested for prospect scholars and researchers to include the other geographical sectors, with a larger population. Moreover the work can be broaden with additional moderating and mediating variables using other variables like emotional exhaustion, depression, mental illness, insomnia etc.

References


The Impact of China-Pak Economic Corridor (CPEC) on Pakistan Stock Exchange (PSX)

Muhammad Mudasar Ghafoor, Zahid Hussain, Muhammad Yasir Saeed,
1Director, University of the Punjab, Jhelum Campus, Jhelum. Pakistan, mudasar@pugc.edu.pk.com
2Faculty Member, FMS, National Textile University, Faisalabad. Pakistan, zahid@ntu.edu.pk
3PhD Scholar, Department of Management Sciences, Preston University, Islamabad, mr.yasirsaeed@gmail.com

ARTICLE DETAILS
History
Revised format: November 2020
Available Online: December 2020

Keywords
CPEC, Pakistan Stock Exchange, Stock volatility and One Belt One Road

JEL Classification
M0, M1

ABSTRACT
Purpose: The study aims to find out the impact of CPEC project on volatility and growth of Pakistan stock exchange PSX-100. The CPEC is a significant subset and southern corridor of (SREB) which consists of three economic corridors (Rana, 2015). The investment in CPEC projects not only accelerates Pakistan and Chinese economy but also anticipated to have significant effects on Pakistan stock exchange PSX. Design/Methodology/Approach: The methodology of event study proposed by Bremer and Sweeney (1991). The methodology of Cox and Peterson (1994) used to identify the effects of events related to CPEC projects and stock market returns. Findings: The results indicated that the volatility of PSX-100 has low in post CPEC as compared to pre CPEC era showing a positive effect of CPEC on PSX in the form of stable PSX 100 returns in post CPEC announcement era. Implications/Originality/Value: The results of this empirical study provide important implications to overseas investors, corporations and regulators.

© 2020 Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: mudasar@pugc.edu.pk.com


1. Introduction
In 2013, Chinese president Xi Jinping has announced a bigger regional vision of connecting Asia with Europe, Middle East and Africa known as “One Belt One Road” (OBOR) and Pakistan signed an MOU with china for the developmental project of CPEC (Ranjan, 2015; Benthany, 2015). China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) holds a significant portion of this initiative and the step towards actualization of this project was officially implemented in 2015 when Chinese president visit Pakistan and announce a $46 billion investment commitment for CPEC and signed. 51 agreements (Khan, 2015). CPEC consists of mega projects related to energy, road infrastructure, improvements in existing railroads along with development of new ones and optical fiber (OHK, 2015). CPEC is expected to strengthen
Pakistan and Chinese economy by speeding up both economies’ growth.

CPEC which is the southern corridor of second developmental proposal of China (SREB) will be consisting of road and rail infrastructure. It will start from Guangzhou, that is the third largest city of China and passes from the western area of china and finally after passing from xinjiang unite the Kashgar city of China with Pakistan’s Khunjarab Pass. From this place the china will connect its southern corridor with the Gawadar port which provides china a way forward to the Indian’s ocean, Arabian and Persian gulf (Rana, 2015; Sahgal, 2015).

Its impact on economy can be measured by volatility in stock exchange of Pakistan (Ghani and Sharma, 2018). According to (Economy Watch, 2019), stock market returns are the earnings that business person earns by investing into the stock market. Stock market returns can be in the form of direct profits or in the form of dividends and bonuses that are awarded by the company to its shareholders on the scheduled time. Further the website expresses that Return through the stock market can be earned through dividends awarded by companies by the fixed period of time due on announcement. Company offers dividend from the amount of profit they earn to their shareholders. Dividend is treated as the primary source of earning profit from Stock Markets. Another source, in the secondary market, shareholder can generate profit by purchasing shares a lower price and selling them at higher in the stock market. The returns in the stock market are not fixed. The returns vary according to the market conditions and its risk in the trading. It can be positive or negative which depends on various internal as well as external factors of locally or globally or both. The Stock market volatility represents the amount of vagueness or insecurity with respect to changes in stock value. In case of lower volatility, stock’s value does not swing intensely.

Very few academic studies have examined the effects of CPEC on stock market performance. (Bahoo, Saeed, Iqbal & Nawaz, 2018) has studied the impact of CPEC on stock market by taking four economic factors including trade, investment, energy and infrastructure and found that CPEC has positive impact on stock market. Sharma & Ghani, 2018 has studied the effects of CPEC on shareholders wealth by using standard event methodology and taking three key events of CPEC. On the basis of average and cumulative stock’s returns, they found a significant positive impact of CPEC agreement on KSE 100 index. Yeung, Pang and Aman, 2019 has examined the impact of CPEC on Pakistan and Shanghai stock exchange by using the methodology of event studies and found that the initial announcement has stronger and positive effects on the PSX than the subsequent announcements. Moreover, they found that the announcement short term effects are more significant in the PSX than the Shanghai stock exchange. The reason for the difference occurs due to the size of the economies of Pakistan and China. As per our best knowledge, very few studies have been conducted to examine the effects of CPEC announcements on stock exchange and market returns. So, this study is proposed to find the pre and post CPEC announcements effects on PSX 100 index volatility by using the methodology of event study proposed by Bremer and Sweeney (1991). The methodology of Cox and Peterson (1994) used to identify the effects of events related to CPEC projects and stock market returns.

The rest of the paper consists of four sections. Section 1 explains, Literature Review which includes GAR CJ and stock market volatility, OBOR, CPEC impact on other sectors. Further three sections comprised of research methodology, research analysis, results and finally conclusion and future recommendations.

2. Literature Review
2.1 GAR CJ and Stock volatility

Engle (1982) has proposed GARCH patterns which have been used by various researchers to examine conditional variances and volatility in earlier research. (Attari & Safdar, 2013) used this pattern to examine the volatility of stock market and macroeconomic variables. It has also been used by Ahmed & Suliman, (2011) to study market volatility. GARCH patterns can also be used to study market volatility
based on impact of an event or an announcement. Beta parameter ought to be invariant for that time period when constantly aggravated returns are figured. Progressively, be that as it may, the experimental confirmation demonstrating the change in each stock with the change in beta with the shift in the differencing interim (Hawawini, Cohen, Maier, Schwartz, & Whitcomb, 1993). (McCord & Tole, 1977) found that a high volatility fund, as measured by the slope of the relapse line (beta), is relied upon to accomplish higher rates of return when the market is up and greater negative rates of return when the market is down than would a fund with a lower beta. (Ali, Rafiq, & Gul, 2015) T-Bills are treated as the economic kit to sustain and retain liquidity in country. Liquidity has its own effect on business system and which makes it an important factor in the macroeconomic landscape. Treasury bills from SBP or Government performs dual function of maintaining the liquidity as well as it helps to control and make inflation low. Authors have considered macroeconomic variables to be more important in influencing offer rates and bid rates of treasury bills. The paper applied Risk Averse Preferred Habitat model (Heuson, 1998) by using term premiums as explained variables. The macroeconomic variable authors have chosen are price stocks, money supply, CPI and Prime rate. Authors have used theoretical framework and designed hypothesis. Data collected from secondary sources like, State Bank of Pakistan, IMF, World Bank, and PSX. Prime rate KIBOR is found to be the most major determinant of Treasury bills and rest of other variables found insignificant. (Nyawata, 2012) Study is about the role of Central Banks whether they should use T-Bills or Central Banks for irksome liquidity in the banking system. As being recognized the reason for using treasury bills by Central Banks, the research concludes T-bills are the best option to be utilized because of the macroeconomic favors for the economy as a whole. Author concluded that while making decision to choose T-bills, following suggestions should be keep in mind: a) Operational Independence of the Central Banks; b) Market Development; c) Strengthening the implementation of the monetary policy.

(Hussain, Zaman, & Ahmad, 2015) investigated the association between stock market returns and macroeconomic variables with reference to Pakistan. Authors have used the monthly observations from January 2001 to June 2011. To check the instability of stock returns, authors have applied heteroscedasticity. New impact cure graph describes that with negative shocks leads to high risks as comparison of positive shocks on the same degree. Researchers have concluded though ARDL model that stocks market instability rely on macroeconomic variables as are inflation. REER and oil prices. Whereas, supply of money and industrial output negatively impact the stock market.

2.2 China Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC)

OBOR (One Belt One Road) as it consists of transport and related infrastructure. CPEC’s is part of overall OBOR initiative. Total projects are of 54 billion USD, but overall worth is about $900 bn and more than 20 countries are contributors in China Pakistan Economic Corridor. OBOR consist of multiple corridors including following

- China and Pakistan (China Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC))
- China Myanmar Thailand Corridor

CPEC is treated as the game changes for Pakistan as well as for the region as well. Overall CPEC comprises of following main projects:

- Gwadar Port (Estimated Cost US $800 Million)
- Energy Projects (24) (Estimated Cost US $ 34.4 billion) Thermal and Renewable
- Infrastructure (4 projects) (Estimated Cost US $ 9.8 billion)
- 30 Special Economic Zones (SEZ)

The total estimated time for the completion of CPEC is 15 years. Analysis predicted that CPEC will boost Pakistan’s GDP by 2% or above and GDP growth rate by 5% (IMF). Because of higher exports
Balance of Payment will be accretive. FDI will increase due to import of heavy machineries to approximation of 10% or more (Hashmey, 2016).

2.3 Impact of CPEC on Different Sectors of Stock Exchange
Investment in Pakistan stock exchange and Shanghai stock exchange influenced by announcement of 54 billion USD by Chinese president for the implementation of CPEC (Wolf, 2016). Impact of CPEC on the different sectors of Pakistani economy has discussed below:

2.4 CPEC Impact on Banking Sector
Governor State Bank of Pakistan, Ashraf Mehmood said Chinese and Pakistan banks will work together to achieve their “financial mix” for the ease of availability of funds for investors under CPEC (SBP Annual Report, 2016). (Hashmey, 2016) $45 billion USD is usual to be financed through Chinese banks to Pakistan. Whereas, deposits of local banks are predicted to grow by 90 billion USD and their loans about 54 billion USD and loans to CPEC by local banks of Pakistan are 9 billion USD. Big banks of Pakistan especially HBL and UBL are expected to gain from CPEC. Habib bank of Pakistan as its MOU with industrial and Commercial Bank China and also is going to open its branches in China as well. Also ICBC has signed MOU with United Bank of Pakistan to use their banking expertise in Pakistan. (International, CPEC to Attract Banking Sector: SCB Chief, 2016) Bill Winters, SCB CEO announced to double their business due to the CPEC announcement. He stated that CPEC has huge potential to attract more investment and can benefit the banking industry as well.

2.5 CPEC impact on Cement Sector
Due to CPEC announcement, lots of construction work has been started which gave a boom to the cement industry of Pakistan (News, Aug 8, 2016). Experts/Analysts have predicted that China Pakistan Economic Corridor will boost cement demand by 1.5 to 3.0 million tons per annum. As internationally, the main ingredient’s cost of Coal in the cement production has been decreased by $50 per ton and decrease in electricity charges portrays a favorable picture for the boost of cement industry. In the first half of 2016, cement industry witnessed 15-16% growth of about 2 million tons and for the second half of 2016, experts have predicted that cement production will grow by 10 to 15% that is 4 million tons. Domestic market growth is also witnessed for cement, it is due to because of more private housing and commercial constructions, well maintain security and government spending on infrastructure and development. (Admin, 2016) According to CEO of Luck Cement Mr. Muhammad Ali Tabba, “CPEC is not a three but a ten year project and it’s not just road connectivity, there are Special Economic Zones, new industries, shifting of industries form China to Pakistan. As per capita level rises, people would demand more housing, more institutions, new schools, colleges, hospitals, because the buying power will increase which leads to higher demand of cement”. He further added that his company planned to increase their cement production form 7.5 million tons to 15 million tons by 2020. Lucky cement has invested $200 million for their new plant to meet their future needs.

2.6 CPEC impact on Automobile Sector
(International Auto Industry Eyes Production of 0.5 Million Units in Five Years, 2016). Now, the production of auto industry of Pakistan is about to 225,000 units of per year. Thereafter, the CPEC announcement, it is grown up by 500,000 units to the next five years. PAAPAM chairman gave example of motorcycle industry which witnessed boom of twenty two times growth from 87,000 units to 21,000,000 units. (Iqbal, 2016) Author concluded that OBOR, once continue its operations, the main receiver of CPEC should be the automobile industry. The cheap labor and Chinese Automobile companies can come to start its local production in Pakistan. The Government of Pakistan has worked to give huge tax concessions to Chinese companies to work in Gwadar, and will received tax exemptions up to 40 years. Representative from Foton group with Finance Minister and showed their keen interest in investing Pakistani auto industry. Another Chinese partner to German’s BMW Brilliance China Auto said that Chinese automobile companies are planning to invest in Pakistan and has designed plan to install assembly Plants there. It will benefit to explore more as it will provide easier access to local
market than operating it from China.

3. Research Methodology
The Bremer and Sweeney (1991) proposed methodology has been adopted to examine the events effects. The methodology of Cox and Peterson (1994) also used to identify the effects of events related to CPEC projects and stock market returns. Events with actual dates have been taken as a sample. Long and short term event windows of 41 days has been used (-20, +20), 21 days (0, +20), 11 days (-5, +5), 6 days (0, -5), 5 days (-2, +2), 3 days (0, +2), (-1, +1) and 2 days (0, +1) The event windows are used to assist and compare before and after situation in the event to draw a conclusion of the particular study.

Pakistan stock returns = LN (Cl/Pl)
The current adjustment at close of market (PSX) which are divided by previous adjustment at close of market (PSX). The Standard Deviation takes place and indicates the value of PSX returns from starting level of LN before the start of event window.

S.D = RI1: RI (cw)
The S.D meant for Standard Deviation and RI1 is the first value of PSX returns. The RI (cw) is the sign of RI (market return value of PSX before event window). This is the measure of the ratio in between the values occurring in this rang and Standard Deviation which is deviation the data from its standard. ER is an estimate of the expected returns of the data.

ER=Average ( RI: RIcw) / RI: RI cw
The expected return ratio of the PSX between the first value of PSX returns and also the first value in the event window. The ratio of the PSX between the second value of PSX returns and also the second value in the event window. Thereafter, the selection of Meta event AR can be calculated.

AR (Abnormal Return) = Actual returns–ER (expected returns) T-Stat =AR of every day in event window/S.D

| AAR = AR/ Number of days in Event Window T-Stat = AAR/ S.D |
|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| Hydro China Dawood Wind Farm (Gharo, Thatta) Estimated Cost (US $ Million) 112.65 and UEP Wind Farm (Jhimpir, Thatta), Estimated Cost (US $ Million) 250 |
| Financial Closed (FC) achieved on March 27, 2015 |
| Event Window | (-20, +20) | (0, +20) |
| AAR | -0.00074 | 0.0004049 |
| Sig | -0.0927 | 0.489582 |
| Event Window | (-5, +5) | (0, +5) |
| AAR | -0.00084 | 0.003482 |
| Sig | -0.1028 | 0.421025 |
| Event Window | (-2, +2) | (0, +2) |
| AAR | -0.00744 | -0.00524 |
| Sig | -0.90561 | -0.56654 |
| Event Window | (-1, +1) | (0, +1) |
| AAR | -0.02446 | -0.02982 |
| Sig | -2.97332 | -3.22611 |

Sachal Wind Farm (Jhimpir, Thatta), Estimated Cost (US $ Million) 134
Financial Closed (FC) achieved on December 18, 2015
<p>| Event Window | (-20, +20) | (0, +20) |
| AAR | -0.00221 | -0.00303 |
| Sig | -0.24055 | -0.32291 |
| Event Window | (-5, +5) | (0, +5) |
| AAR | -0.00127 | -0.00171 |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Event Window</th>
<th>AAR</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(-2, +2)</td>
<td>0.000892</td>
<td>0.095291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-1, +1)</td>
<td>-0.00075</td>
<td>-0.08011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-20, +20)</td>
<td>-0.001709</td>
<td>0.223035</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-5, +5)</td>
<td>0.003071</td>
<td>0.414219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-2, +2)</td>
<td>0.00038</td>
<td>0.515775</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-1, +1)</td>
<td>0.006494</td>
<td>0.881073</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-2, +2)</td>
<td>-0.00226</td>
<td>-0.32152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-5, +5)</td>
<td>-0.00208</td>
<td>-0.00267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-1, +1)</td>
<td>-0.001232</td>
<td>0.178861</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-2, +2)</td>
<td>0.001232</td>
<td>0.178861</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-20, +20)</td>
<td>-0.00285</td>
<td>0.388782</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-5, +5)</td>
<td>-0.00576</td>
<td>0.374737</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-2, +2)</td>
<td>-0.00412</td>
<td>0.050821</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-2, +2)</td>
<td>0.000892</td>
<td>0.095291</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Suki Kinari Hydropower Station, Naran, Khyber Pukhtunkhwa, Estimated cost (1707 US $Million)**

**Event Window**

Financial Close achieved on 31st December 2016

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Event Window</th>
<th>AAR</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(-20, +20)</td>
<td>0.001709</td>
<td>0.223035</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-5, +5)</td>
<td>0.003071</td>
<td>0.414219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-2, +2)</td>
<td>0.00038</td>
<td>0.515775</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-1, +1)</td>
<td>0.006494</td>
<td>0.881073</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CPHGC 1,320MW Coal-Fired Power Plant, Hub, Balochistan, Estimated Cost (US $ Million) 1912.2**

**Event Window**

Ground breaking ceremony held on 21 March 2017

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Event Window</th>
<th>AAR</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(-20, +20)</td>
<td>-0.00226</td>
<td>-0.32152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-5, +5)</td>
<td>-0.00208</td>
<td>-0.00267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-1, +1)</td>
<td>-0.001232</td>
<td>0.178861</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**300MW Imported Coal Based Power Project At Gwadar, Pakistan**

**Event Window**

LOI was issued on 26th May 2017

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Event Window</th>
<th>AAR</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(-20, +20)</td>
<td>-0.00285</td>
<td>-0.388782</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-5, +5)</td>
<td>-0.00576</td>
<td>-0.76673</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-2, +2)</td>
<td>-0.00412</td>
<td>-0.01047</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Sahiwal 2x660MW Coal-Fired Power Plant, Punjab Estimated Cost (US $ Million) 1912.2

Project Completed in 28th October 2017

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Event Window</th>
<th>AAR</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(-1, +1)</td>
<td>-0.00614</td>
<td>-0.00839</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(0, +1)</td>
<td>-0.80343</td>
<td>-0.90802</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AAR</th>
<th>-0.00136</th>
<th>-0.00116</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sig</td>
<td>-0.12637</td>
<td>-0.1034</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Event Window</td>
<td>(-2, +2)</td>
<td>(0, +2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-20, +20)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AAR</th>
<th>-0.00233</th>
<th>-0.0003</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sig</td>
<td>-0.20849</td>
<td>-0.02675</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Event Window</td>
<td>(-5, +5)</td>
<td>(0 , +5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-20, +20)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AAR</th>
<th>-0.0148</th>
<th>-0.01848</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sig</td>
<td>-1.32471</td>
<td>-1.9994</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Event Window</td>
<td>(-2, +2)</td>
<td>(0, +2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-20, +20)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AAR</th>
<th>-0.00187</th>
<th>-0.00384</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sig</td>
<td>-0.5019</td>
<td>-0.57862</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Event Window</td>
<td>(-1, +1)</td>
<td>(0, +1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-20, +20)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AAR</th>
<th>-0.00187</th>
<th>-0.00384</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sig</td>
<td>-0.5019</td>
<td>-0.57862</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Event Window</td>
<td>(-1, +1)</td>
<td>(0, +1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-20, +20)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 2x660MW Coal-Fired Power Plants At Port Qasim Karachi

Second Unit Commercial Operation Date (COD) 25th April 2018

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Event Window</th>
<th>AAR</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(-20, +20)</td>
<td>-0.00101</td>
<td>-0.00306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(0, +20)</td>
<td>-0.12637</td>
<td>-0.26148</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AAR</th>
<th>-0.00187</th>
<th>-0.00384</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sig</td>
<td>-0.5019</td>
<td>-0.57862</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Event Window</td>
<td>(-2, +2)</td>
<td>(0, +2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-20, +20)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AAR</th>
<th>0.001458</th>
<th>-0.00218</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sig</td>
<td>0.124278</td>
<td>-0.23618</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Event Window</td>
<td>(-2, +2)</td>
<td>(0, +2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-20, +20)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AAR</th>
<th>0.000829</th>
<th>-0.00435</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sig</td>
<td>0.070733</td>
<td>-0.47081</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Event Window</td>
<td>(-1, +1)</td>
<td>(0, +1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-20, +20)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Karot Hydropower Station Estimated Cost (US $ Million) 1698.26

Financial Close achieved on 22nd February 2017.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Event Window</th>
<th>AAR</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(-20, +20)</td>
<td>-0.00222</td>
<td>-0.0017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(0, +20)</td>
<td>-0.31335</td>
<td>-0.24304</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AAR</th>
<th>-0.00321</th>
<th>-0.00189</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sig</td>
<td>-0.45299</td>
<td>-0.26954</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Event Window</td>
<td>(-2, +2)</td>
<td>(0, +2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-20, +20)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AAR</th>
<th>-0.00321</th>
<th>-0.00189</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sig</td>
<td>-0.45299</td>
<td>-0.26954</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Event Window</td>
<td>(-2, +2)</td>
<td>(0, +2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-20, +20)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AAR</th>
<th>-0.00085</th>
<th>-0.00129</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sig</td>
<td>-0.12087</td>
<td>-0.13932</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Event Window</td>
<td>(-1, +1)</td>
<td>(0, +1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(-20, +20)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Rahimyar Khan Imported Fuel Power Plant 1320 MW

On April 28, 2017, the Cabinet Committee on Energy headed by Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif directed the Ministry of Water and Power to immediately initiate a process for inclusion of Rahim Yar Khan coal plant on the CPEC priority list with imported fuel.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Event Window</th>
<th>(-20, +20)</th>
<th>(0, +20)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AAR</td>
<td>0.000599</td>
<td>0.001048</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig</td>
<td>0.08651</td>
<td>0.142708</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Event Window</th>
<th>(-5, +5)</th>
<th>(0, +5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AAR</td>
<td>0.002509</td>
<td>0.003376</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig</td>
<td>0.347684</td>
<td>0.459878</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Event Window</th>
<th>(-2, +2)</th>
<th>(0, +2)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AAR</td>
<td>-0.00632</td>
<td>-0.00745</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig</td>
<td>-0.86229</td>
<td>-0.80581</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Event Window</th>
<th>(-1, +1)</th>
<th>(0, +1)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AAR</td>
<td>-0.00923</td>
<td>-0.00959</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig</td>
<td>-1.26086</td>
<td>-1.03698</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Gwadar East-Bay Expressway

Groundbreaking ceremony of Eastbay Expressway was held on 22nd November 2017 by Prime Minister.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Event Window</th>
<th>(-20, +20)</th>
<th>(0, +20)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AAR</td>
<td>-0.00131</td>
<td>-0.00175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig</td>
<td>-0.11724</td>
<td>-0.15673</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Event Window</th>
<th>(-5, +5)</th>
<th>(0, +5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AAR</td>
<td>-0.00266</td>
<td>-0.0034</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig</td>
<td>-0.23837</td>
<td>-0.30409</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Event Window</th>
<th>(-2, +2)</th>
<th>(0, +2)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AAR</td>
<td>-0.00276</td>
<td>-0.00229</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Pilot Project Of Digital Terrestrial Multimedia Broadcast (DTMB)

PC-1 of the Demonstration project approved by CDWP on 2nd May 2018.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Event Window</th>
<th>(-20, +20)</th>
<th>(0, +20)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AAR</td>
<td>-0.00135</td>
<td>-0.00255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig</td>
<td>-0.11444</td>
<td>-0.22091</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Event Window</th>
<th>(-5, +5)</th>
<th>(0, +5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AAR</td>
<td>-0.00289</td>
<td>-0.00594</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig</td>
<td>-0.2466</td>
<td>-0.5153</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Event Window</th>
<th>(-2, +2)</th>
<th>(0, +2)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AAR</td>
<td>-0.00373</td>
<td>-0.00667</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig</td>
<td>-0.32314</td>
<td>-0.72134</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Event Window</th>
<th>(-1, +1)</th>
<th>(0, +1)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AAR</td>
<td>-0.0055</td>
<td>-0.00785</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig</td>
<td>-0.47714</td>
<td>-0.8495</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Expansion And Reconstruction Of Existing Line ML-1
Table 1 indicates the test results of Event Financial Closed (FC) occurred on March 27, 2015 - Hydro China Dawood Wind Farm (Gharo, Thatta), Sachal Wind Farm (Jhimpir, Thatta), Suki Kinari Hydropower Station , Naran, Khyber Pukhtunkhwa, Karot Hydropower Station Estimated and Rahimyar Khan Imported Fuel Power Plant 1320 MW. The average daily abnormal returns (AR) around the -20 to +20, -5 to +5, -2 to +2 and -1 to +1 trading intervals at 1st event. The event was indicated at multiple days are highly significant at the significance level .05. The AAR abnormal average returns due to announcement of various events i.e CPHGC 1,320mw coal-fired power plant, HUB, Balochistan, 300mw imported coal based power project at Gwadar, Pakistan, Sahiwal 2x660mw coal-fired power plant, Punjab, 2x660mw coal-fired power plants at port Qasim Karachi to around various trading intervals are highly significant at .05 level of significance. The PSX-100 returns are highly significant and positive in reflection of abnormal returns over selective (-20, +20), (-5, +5), (-2, +2), (-1, +1) at level of trading intervals of the events. The Gwadar east-bay expressway, pilot project of digital terrestrial multimedia broadcast (dtmb) and expansion and reconstruction of existing line ml-1 have positive effects on expected cash flows of the PSX-100 returns.

4. Conclusion
This study focus to find that the growth rate of Pakistan stock exchange (PSX) stock market returns has been driven by CPEC factor. Study found that the stock market volatility has been reduced at time when Chinese president announced 54 billion USD investments for the implementation of CPEC project in Pakistan. We found that volatility has decreased in post CPEC compared to pre CPEC. In post CPEC era the volatility of Pakistan stock exchange (PSX) has been reduced and PSX market anticipated to become more stable in the long run. Pakistan stock exchange become more favorable and stable stock market to invest in for resident investors, overseas Pakistani, multinationals and corporations in post CPEC scenario. The result of CPEC announcement and other related events indicates the significance of trade agreements in OBOR developmental proposals. Furthermore, these agreements will provide landmark to invite other countries in the region i.e. India, Iran and other Central Asian states. The CPEC is actually the road map towards global perspectives. The South and central Asian region are less connected of the globe. The CPEC will open up the new avenues in between the South and central Asian region.

5. Limitations and Future Directions
This study has been conducted by taking data of only two years earlier than CPEC official announcement and two years after CPEC announcement. However most early harvest projects are expected to be completed by 2018. Future research needs to be carried out after early projects completion and study its relation with the stock exchange volatility. A comparative stock market analysis could be carried out in future to study the impact on regional stock markets and their volatility.

References


Allen-Ebrahimian, Bethany (22.4.2015), China Loves Pakistan … but Most Chinese Don’t, Foreign Policy (FP)


Extent of Integration in Agriculture Supply Chain: The Public Sector Stakeholders Perspective

Nadir Munir Hassan, Muhammad Nauman Abbasi

1Department of Business Administration, Air University, Multan, Pakistan, nadir.magsi@aumc.edu.pk
2Institute of Management Sciences, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, Pakistan, abbasimna@bzu.edu.pk

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

Purpose: Integrating network factors (i.e. Actors, Activities, and Resources), help organizations in achieving superior supply chain performance. Despite reasonable evidence on positive relationship between SCI and SCP, there exists sufficient contradiction on universal integration of chains. This paper is a qualitative exploratory study, which based on the network perspective intends to explore the current and required levels of supply chain integration among actors, activities, and resources in the agriculture supply chain of Pakistan.

Design/Methodology/Approach: The data was collected through in depth semi-structured interviews from public sector stakeholders of agriculture sector (i.e. From Thirteen wings of Ministry of Agriculture) across Pakistan. The current and required extent of supply chain integration was measured at three levels, i.e. strategic (long-term), tactical (medium-term) and operational (short-term) as suggested by (Childerhouse & Towill, 2011).

Findings: The research results indicate that the relationship between supply chain integration and supply chain performance is a contextual phenomenon and significantly varies among Network factors. This study and its findings are expected to add into the literature of supply chain integration and its impact on supply chain performance.

© 2020 Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: abbasimna@bzu.edu.pk


1. Introduction

The term ‘supply chain management’ reflects the flow of information, materials, money and products from both within and across the supply chains, starting from public sector stakeholders to final customers, in pursuit of achieving lasting performance (Mentzer, Flint, & Hult, 2001). Over the years,
managing supply chains have attained fabulous attention by both academicians and practitioners. Most recently, it has been defined as the set of tools and techniques used for managing supply chain activities for effective coordination to improve overall supply chain performances (Kusi-Sarpong, Sarkis, & Wang, 2016; Liu, Bai, Liu, & Wei, 2017). The significance of integration between actors, activities and resources of a supply chain has become indispensable for the survival of the firms. In today’s highly competitive world, it is evident that businesses compete as supply chains rather than as stand-alone companies (Christopher, 2016).

The concept of ‘integration’ is a vital facet of supply chain management. Surprisingly, the outcomes of previous studies does not authenticate the universal (only positive) relationship between SCI and SC performance. For example, (Flynn, Huo, & Zhao, 2010) and (Germain & Iyer, 2006) explained that there exists sufficient clarity on potential positives of SCI yet a number of researchers are of the view that there exists reasonable inconsistency in findings related to its impact on supply chain performance. Likewise, many researchers are of the view that the benefits generated from integration might not be generalized rather remained contextual in nature (Turkulainen, 2008; Wong, Boon-Itt, & Wong, 2011).

Interestingly, scholars have conceptualized and measured SCI differently, including strength, scope (Fawcett & Magnan, 2002; Flynn et al., 2010; Frohlich & Westbrook, 2001), duration and/or depth across the chains. Researchers have also identified that integration among the number of individuals on multiple hierarchical stages and from different corporate standings makes the integration work better (Barnes, Naudé, & Michell, 2007; Mackelprang, Robinson, Bernardes, & Webb, 2014). Furthermore, it also evident from the literature that for the exceptional gains, supply chains must be managed as networks. The network is a flat organization form, involving interaction among network partners rather than multi-layered functions (Cravens & Piercy, 1994). Networks as cited by (Harland, 1996), consist of factors like, actors, resources and activities, which if integrated properly can cause sufficient supply chain performance.

Most recently, Wong et al. (2011) recommended, the need for additional research on the interaction between supply chain performance and dimensions of SCI, and also the effect of additional contingencies on SCI. Similarly, Tarifa-Fernandez and De Burgos-Jiménez (2017) expressed that it’s time to understand and conduct research on SCI and its relation with performance concerning contextual factors, under which it will work more effectively. Accordingly, this study aimed to explore the variant levels of supply chain integration among actors, activities, and resources in agriculture supply chains. Based on the network perspective, this study identifies the role of agri-based public sector stakeholders in attaining the desired extent of integration with some of their key supply chain members, particularly, farmers and input suppliers. It is believed that knowing the desired extent (current and required) of integration will not only help to depute resources accordingly rather it will also help to maximize supply chain performance. To our utmost knowledge, no such research has been conducted earlier to address this critical gap especially with reference to Pakistan and hence the outcomes of this study provide valuable insights to all relevant stakeholders, i.e. academia, practitioners and policymakers.

2. Literature Review

Ever rising operational complexities for firms, shrinking product life cycles, and an increased desire for improved customer service has brought the attention of scholars and researchers towards understanding the concept of supply chain management (SCM) (Davis, 1993). Likewise, back in the 1990’s, companies started to identify their business environment from the supply chain perspective and to build effective supply chains that operate according to the best SCM practices (e.g. Stevens (1989). Since, the term SCM coined in the literature (Handfield & Nichols, 2002; Oliver & Webber, 1982; Stevens, 1989), researchers are consistently investigating its different aspects.

To proceed with, Bechtel and Jayaram (1997) categorized supply chain literature into four school of thoughts, which includes; The functional chain awareness school, The linkage school, The information
school and The integration/process school. Among these four, integration schools gain fabulous attention by the majority of the researchers. For example, (Mentzer, DeWitt, et al., 2001), while explaining integration school, have classified supply chains as direct, extended, and ultimate supply chains. It was anticipated that besides increasing supply chain alliances and integration, coordination initiatives are expected to move beyond internal linkages, towards the establishment of a connection between suppliers, customers and then supply networks. This reflects the origination of seeing supply chains from linear relations to more dynamic and complex relations like networks.

2.1 Network Perspective
A network is a system shaped by core factors (e.g. actors, activities and resources) that join the number of linked firms (Jraisat, 2016). A network is referred to as a set of links among a group of actors (Jarillo, 1988; Jarosz, 2000; Ritter & Gemünden, 2004), and these links cause connections with other network factors to provide with a two-way interaction for overall performance. Most of earlier researches, for example, (Anderson, Håkansson, & Johanson, 1994; Koops, Mollenkopf, & Zwart, 2002; Ritter & Gemünden, 2004) state the need for effective management of key network factors including actors, activities, and resources and interaction between these to generate even better positives. This depicts, to manage the supply chains successfully, one will have to see chains from the prism of network perspective. Moreover, to make the supply chain networks work proficiently, there is a definite need to observe the interaction among network components. For example, Wilson (1995), Mikkola (2008) and Sluys, Matthysssens, Martens, and Streukens (2011) considered value chains as supply networks and suggested it as a source of competitive advantage. However, research has been scarce regarding the appropriate extent of integration within supply chain networks, and that, networks without being integrated won’t generate the expected outcomes.

2.2 Supply Chain Integration (SCI) and Supply Chain Performance (SCP)
Supply chain integration (SCI) is defined as the extent to which a firm strategically collaborates with its supply chain members and collaboratively administrates intra- and inter-organizational processes (Flynn et al., 2010). SCI reflects the multi-organizational networks in sync with governing the flow of products, services, information and finances from top to bottom (Ellram & Cooper, 2014). Likewise, from the lens of information processing theory, SCI becomes the source of better quality, and well versed decision making, by making stakeholders within firms and across chains to communicate effectively (Hendijani & Saei, 2020). Without any doubt SCI has appeared to be the key theme (Lee and Billington (1992) and making the researchers to dig deep into the concept and to better understand its connection with SCP.

Interestingly, speculating what must be integrated, and how it must be integrated directs one to reason the difficulty associated with defining the given concept of SCI (Mohamed & Hassan, 2019). In literature, it is observed as a unidimensional (Cousins & Menguc, 2006) as well as a multidimensional construct (Morash & Clinton, 1998; Stank, Keller, & Daugherty, 2001). Furthermore, researchers have realized the strategic importance of SCI and have empirically observed the interaction between multiple aspects of SCI and several performance streams (Devaraj, Krajewski, & Wei, 2007; Frohlich & Westbrook, 2001; Schoenherr & Swink, 2012). In present-day business settings, integration is regarded as a viable strategy for individuals, firms and industries looking for sufficient performances (Li & Chen, 2018). While, to better implement, integration must widely be considered as a multidimensional variable (Flynn et al., 2010), because it incorporates cooperation, collaboration, information sharing and partnership, through functions, customers and suppliers.

Similarly, SCI is explained in terms of its scope, starting from the focal firm, internal processes, till external integration (Doering, De Jong, & Suresh, 2019). To develop a better understanding and theoretical realities related to the concept of integration, (Autry, Rose, & Bell, 2014) elaborates integration from operational coordination (i.e. activities in support of planning, information exchanges,
Keeping in mind the changing scope and intensity of integration within and across supply chain networks, it has become equally important to observe the connection between different extents of integration and its impact on supply chain performance. For example, its believed, that an integrated supply chain not only helps in reducing the cost for a focal firm, rather it causes notable benefits for its channel members as well. Considering the importance of SCI and its domains, in making supply chain networks perform better, it is observed that usually successful firms are those that align their internal processes with external channel members and customers within their supply chains (Frohlich & Westbrook, 2001; Graham, Zailani, & Rajagopal, 2005). Similarly, aligning processes, also means, that, firms, that can assemble resources in a comparatively, different manner, may reap an advantage over firms, which aren’t willing to do the same (Ganbold, Matsui, & Rotaru, 2020).

Moreover, (Leuschner, Rogers, & Charvet, 2013), based on a meta-analysis, observed a positive relationship between SCI and SCP whilst, other studies, witnessed inverse relationship. Similarly, to better understand supply chain performance, it is described as the strength of a supply chain to economically perform its activities, while reducing the cost of operations, with the ultimate goal of meeting customers and channel members desires (Green & Inman*, 2005).

From literature, it is evident that one cannot measure supply chain performance from any single perspective or context, rather supply chains need to be considered, as a system and networks. Considering, the performance of all these activities and elements, across supply chain network, will help in reaching out to the full potential of overall supply chain performance (Rehman, Khan, Kusi-Sarpong, & Hassan, 2018). In sync with these studies, (Zhao, Huo, Selen, & Yeung, 2011) suggested that intensity/span of SCI between multiple dimensions of SCP can differ, because, it is a contextual phenomenon, and need to be reevaluated across value chains. Even though, a handful of researches have propagated a positive relationship between SCI and SCP, still there exists a gap in the given stream (Song, Song, & Sun, 2019). Additionally, this study propagates that not all levels, extents and types of SCI are required to be made use of on all occasions. This understanding is in line with the research work of (Flynn et al., 2010), wherein, they suggested different configurations and arcs of SCI based on three broader dimensions, i.e. internal, supplier and customer integration.

According to a contingency perspective, manufacturers need to adopt a specific extent or arc of integration to synchronize specific dimensions of SCI with its environment (Visnjic, Wiengarten, & Neely, 2016). Consequently, the configuration perspective states that performance is a product of consistency between different configurations of SCI, and its environment to reach required performance outcomes (Flynn et al., 2010). There are industries and sectors, like agricultural, automotive, chemical, textile, pharmaceutical, etc. which have different down and upstream dynamics, so players in such sectors might use different (Frohlich & Westbrook, 2001) and unbalanced configurations of supply chain integrations (Flynn et al., 2010). Despite of considering the extensively worked, viewpoints on SCI and its impact on SCP, it is important to realize that results on the above given relationship are still relatively inconclusive. This lack of clarity is because of the different outcomes generated by selecting multiple dimensions of integration and performance (Wiengarten, Li, Singh, & Fynes, 2019). This is why the given study explores the appropriate extent of SCI among AVC’s channels members.

For the given purpose, this study incorporates, four primary elements & multiple extent of integration to measure the current & required level of integration among network components, i.e. actors, activities, and resources. The aim is to provide a theoretical foundation for measuring the benefits bestowed by optimal level of SCI on the overall performance of AFVC in Pakistan. Unfortunately, identifying an optimal level of integration remained a neglected area especially regarding network perspective, which
is assumed to be one of the identifiable reasons behind overall agricultural performance across the country.

2.3 SCI and Agri-Food Value Chain

Pakistan is an agriculture based country with 23.4 million hectares cultivable land and is among the largest producer and supplier of many agri-products, like, cotton, wheat, sugarcane, mango, citrus, oranges, oilseeds, rice, etc. During 2017-18, agriculture sector observed a remarkable growth of 3.81% as compared to previous years (2016-17; 2.07%) and (2015-16; 0.15%) (Economic Survey of Pakistan, 2017-18). This stemmed from higher yields, fertilizer take off, pest control, etc. however, the real credit goes to the government policies and initiatives, like, availability of quality seed, attractive prices, credit facilities, trainings and guidance, etc. Unfortunately, Pakistani agriculture/food supply chain is quite vulnerable and it lack innovation, value addition, new product development, packaging and marketing. Such, a fragmented structure sheds light on the need for the appropriate implementation of integration among agri-food value chain. Nonetheless, the presence of private sector is somewhat encouraging as they are striving hard to integrate activities related to collection, transportation, storage, assembling within and outside the country.

A number of scientific studies have favored the need for vertical integration of agribusiness activities, and its role in decreased production cost, among channel members of the agricultural supply chain (Birthal, Joshi, & Gulati, 2005). On the other hand, Porter (1985) states that competitive advantage within the agricultural supply chain is vested in networking by chain actors. The multi-dimensional performance of agri-food chains is purely a product of contextual supply chain configuration i.e. the insight into the type and where about of network factors and their integrated flow (de Keizer et al., 2017).

However, realizing the sufficient level of SC-SCI configuration for agri-food chains is a complicated issue, due to certain ingrained complexities associated with food products and processes (Soto-Silva, Nadal-Roig, González-Araya, and Pla-Aragones (2016). The availability of a number of agri-oriented resources including, fertile land, well-irrigated plains and a variety of seasons makes Pakistan favorable for the agriculture industry. Yet, Kahn and Mentzer (1998), arguments regarding, scarcity of integration among various stakeholders in agri-chains, results in overall inefficiency of agricultural system, resulting in high post-harvest losses, quality deterioration, and high cost of commodity transfer, information symmetry and lack of transparency cannot be unnoticed. The pace of adoption of SCI and responsiveness towards the needs of respective channel members of the agriculture chain in Pakistan, is passive in nature in comparison to prevailing trends elsewhere. That’s why the given study, propagates the idea of understanding the importance of integration among network actors of AFVC in Pakistan, and that blind and mindless implementation of SCI can also result in unidentified cost of stakeholders. It means that it is unavoidable to develop a consensus on the required level of integration across the agricultural supply chain in Pakistan. Because it has widely been acknowledged, that the proactive approach towards integrative relationships can act as a vital source of competitive advantage for overall supply chains across the globe (Power, 2005) and agricultural value chains are no different.

3. Research Methodology

The given study aimed to get insight into the current and required level of SCI between public sector stakeholders and some of their key supply chain partners, i.e. input suppliers and growers, etc. Considering the contextual nature of supply chain integration, and differences in industrial norms (Kostova & Roth, 2002), this study intends to conduct case study of agriculture public offices of Pakistan. Based on the network perspective, an attempt has been made to identify the role of agri-based public sector stakeholders in attaining desirous level of integration with their supply chain partners. The public sector stakeholders’ perspective was recorded and analyzed to build an understanding of the impact of varying extent of SCI on the overall performance of the agriculture supply chains.
As propagated by (R. Yin, 2003), case study method is frequently used as a data collection tool in practical fields like management. So, using the case study method, multiple participants of AFVC in Pakistan, were interviewed. The detail regarding participants is given in Table No. 1. Later on, interview data from one interviewee was triangulated with those from other interviews.

In the given study, SCI is operationalized and measured through information sharing, collaborative approaches, joint decision making and system coupling, as prescribed by (Ellinger, Keller, & Hansen, 2006; Flynn et al., 2010; Narasimhan & Das, 2001). Existing literature suggests, SCI as a multi-level longitudinal phenomenon and it evolves over an extended period. In this evolving process, supply chain partners interact with each other both in the internal and external business environment, which is also dynamic in nature. Therefore, there was a need to take into consideration the time orientation of the relationships (integration) which remained under observation. Hence, the case study method has been opted. It also helped us to present a detailed outlook of the phenomenon under study and also to describe the context in which it takes place (Halinen & Törnroos, 2005). By opting for the technique of triangulating the multiple data sources, the data collection and analysis cover up the longitudinal dynamics of the SCI.

While, the extent of integration is measured through three levels, i.e. strategic, tactical, and operational across three dimensions of network perspective (Autry et al., 2014), i.e. activities, resources, and actors, i.e. public sector stakeholders, input suppliers and growers.

4. Data Collection & Analysis

In line with the previous studies, R. K. Yin (2015), the respondents were thoughtfully selected to gain in-depth and diversified perspectives regarding the extent of integration between supply chain partners. The respondents were selected, only if he/she is directly involved and/or understand the organizational strategy regarding execution of integration with their channel members. In simple words, respondents of the given study can be labeled boundary spanners of the case offices. The normal time for each interview was around 60-90 minutes. Notes were taken to develop the interview reports. Ambiguous responses were clarified through a proper follow-up phone calls, and formal emails. Likewise, basic data was gathered from websites, news coverages and published material. The profiles of the companies, are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Public Office</th>
<th>Industry</th>
<th>Interviewee’s Position</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Directorate General Agriculture (Water Management)</td>
<td>Agriculture Department of Punjab</td>
<td>Deputy Director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Directorate General Agriculture (Field)</td>
<td>AD-GoP</td>
<td>Assistant Agricultural Engineer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Directorate General Agriculture (Research), AARI, Faisalabad.</td>
<td>AD-GoP</td>
<td>Assistant Director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Directorate General Agriculture (Pest Warning &amp; Quality Control of Pesticides)</td>
<td>AD-GoP</td>
<td>Assistant Director Agriculture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Directorate General Agriculture (Extension &amp; AR)</td>
<td>AD-GoP</td>
<td>Deputy Director Agriculture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Directorate General Soil Survey of Punjab</td>
<td>AD-GoP</td>
<td>Deputy Director General Soil Survey of Punjab</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Directorate of Agriculture (Economics &amp; Marketing)</td>
<td>AD-GoP</td>
<td>EADA (E&amp;M)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Directorate of Agricultural (Information)</td>
<td>AD-GoP</td>
<td>Assistant Agriculture Info. Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Federal Seed Certification and Registration Department (FSC&amp;RD)</td>
<td>Ministry of National Food Security and Research</td>
<td>Regional Director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture Policy Institute (API)</td>
<td>MNFS &amp; R</td>
<td>Director General</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan Agricultural Storage &amp; Services Corporation (PASSCO)</td>
<td>MNFS &amp; R</td>
<td>GM Field Wing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic Wing</td>
<td>MNFS &amp; R</td>
<td>Economic Consultant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Fertilizer Development Centre (NFDC)</td>
<td>MNFS &amp; R</td>
<td>Research Officer</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The content analysis was deployed for data analysis. Initially, data coding (an analytical tool, letting data indexed for analysis purpose, and linking it with the main research idea) was coupled with initial codes generated through themes extracted from literature review, observation, and by making use of interview manuscript. Likewise, the given process is followed by refinement of shortlisted themes, to avoid repetition.

Moreover, the process of coding and analysis resulted into 20 first order themes in order to measure the extent of SCI, which then resulted into even brief 15 second order themes, ending up into four aggregate dimensions. The comprehensive, dimensions extracted are the mechanisms/activities associated with SCI, helpful in forming theoretical relation with the given study. Table 2, presents snapshot of 1st order/sub-categories, 2nd order/generic-categories and aggregated/main categories of SCI.
Table 2. Data Coding: 1st, 2nd Orders and SCI Themes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>First-Order/Sub Categories</th>
<th>Second-Order/Generic Themes</th>
<th>Aggregate/Main Themes (SCI)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Integrated Information Sharing on new Agricultural Varieties.</td>
<td>Creating Varieties &amp; Exportable Surplus</td>
<td>Information sharing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information Exchange regarding Sustainable Generation of Exportable Surplus.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educating Stakeholders on Conservation of Natural Resources.</td>
<td>Sustainable Value Addition</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shared Technology, for Smooth flow of Information.</td>
<td>Shared Communication Technology for Information Sharing on Researchable Issue</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To Generate follow up on Researchable Issues/Problems.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improvement &amp; Transfer of Water Management Technology.</td>
<td>Water Management</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joint Development of Objectives and Responsibilities.</td>
<td>Policy Making for Agricultural Growth</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joint Improvement of Marketing System to Ensure, Agricultural Growth.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coming Together with Farmers in Regulatory Aspects.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collaborative Conduct of Research &amp; Development</td>
<td>Research &amp; Development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutual Adaption of Modern Agricultural Technology.</td>
<td>Technological Adaption</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procurement, Processing, Production, Multiplication, Marketing and Distribution of Quality Agricultural Inputs.</td>
<td>Provision of Quality Inputs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joint Development of Logistics processes.</td>
<td>Logistics Management</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anticipating &amp; Resolving their Operative/Emergent Field Problems.</td>
<td>Advisory Services</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conservation of Resources through Renewable Tools.</td>
<td>On Field Sustainability</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To Contribute towards the Cost of any Experiment or Technical Research related to Agriculture.</td>
<td>Research Financing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harmonized Data Sharing to Manage Produce.</td>
<td>Strategic Reserves Management</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collaboration on Price Control of Agricultural Produce.</td>
<td>Pricing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision of Facilities, &amp; Establishment of New Markets.</td>
<td>New markets Development &amp; management through Market Committee’s</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Governance Initiatives through on market committee’s.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5. Findings and Discussion
This study intends to explore the current and required extent of SCI among actors, activities, and resources in the agriculture supply chain. Based on the network perspective, the given study explains the role of agri-based public sector stakeholders in attaining integration with their supply chain partners, i.e. growers and input suppliers.

5.1 Supply Chain Activities: Extent of Integration with Farmers and Input Suppliers.
As described earlier, the extent of SCI was measured among four supply chain activities, i.e. information sharing, joint decision making, collaborative activities, and system coupling. Next section, present a brief overview regarding the extent of integration on each supply chain activity.

5.2 Information Sharing: Current & Required Extent of SCI
The information-sharing has always been at the cornerstone for achieving the required level of performance. Interviewers were asked to explain the current and required level of integration (in the context of information sharing) with growers and input suppliers.

It was revealed that different public sector stakeholders use different information sharing tools, however, commonly used are; regular seminars & workshops, village-level training programs, published material, dedicated TV and Radio programs (3000 talks, 1500 agricultural messages, & 2000 agricultural news bulletins/ per annum), documentaries (normally broadcast on a special event, like, agri-festival, Kisan-Dost Mela, etc.), Agriculture Help Line (0800-15000 and 0800-29000), SMS-Email Alerts, Websites/Portals, and Social Media (Facebook, WhatsApp, YouTube, Twitter), etc. Furthermore, type of information sharing include, harvesting and post-harvest issues, pest control, yield output per hectare, irrigation related issues, agri-loans/agri-financing, marketing, agri-research related issues, and issues associated to execution of research output, etc. Additionally, it was pointed out that contact through relevant staff, including, field officers, agricultural engineers and agriculture researchers are maintained on a regular basis. To ensure smooth flow of information, public sector stakeholders schedule meetings of the Technical Advisory Board and Agriculture Task Force with farmers and input suppliers, once in three months and once a month respectively.

During interviews, Director of Agriculture Research, explained that;

“we share information regarding emerging varieties of crops, vegetables and fruits with relevant stakeholders quite frequently”.
Likewise, Deputy Director at the Department of Agriculture Extension, disclosed that;
“….. our responsibility is to ensure seamless flow of information [on protecting plants from all forms of impure infringements to increase the yield for local consumption and export]”.

Educating growers and input suppliers regarding adoption of emerging ways of plowing, use of appropriate inputs, and adoption of new technologies, like, use of plastic bags, cardboard, cushions, proper hygienic and insect-proof stores, environment-friendly logistics etc. were marked as mandatory activities for information sharing.

Similarly, Assistant Director, Department of Pest Warning & Quality Control, comment that;

“they guide growers & agri-dealers, on right selection, safe handling and effective use of suitable agricultural inputs, adoption of proper spraying method and integrated pest management techniques in collaboration with National Fertilizers Development Center, and Punjab Seed Corporation”.

In a similar tune, while explaining the role of the Department of Agriculture Marketing Information Service, Marketing Officer told that;

“we have been successful in establishing Agriculture Marketing Information Service (AMIS) to enhance the efficiency of agriculture marketing system through the provision of timely reliable and useful market
Based on the above stated information and remarks of the interviewer’s public sector stakeholders are successful in establishing integration at the Tactical level with growers, however, they feel it should be extended to the strategic level. Amazingly, integration with input suppliers was marked at a strategic level and recommended to be maintained.

5.3 Collaborative Activities & Joint Decision Making: Current & Required Extent of SCI

According to (Kahn & Mentzer, 1998), collaboration, interaction and joint decision making are a couple of basic ingredients of integration, wherein, joint decision making is a shared settlement by which multiple departments and parties within and across the chain reflect their readiness to deal in inter-organizational collaboration (Shou, Li, Park, & Kang, 2017).

Encouragingly, public sector stakeholders involve growers and input suppliers in collaborative projects. Moreover, they engage them in decision making in areas like, procurement, processing, production, multiplication, research output, marketing and distribution of quality seeds. Some of the common collaborative projects include, National Program for Improvement of Watercourses in Pakistan (Phase-II), Pilot Testing of Innovative Technologies to improve Water Usage, Virtual Meetings, Crop Insurance, Establishment of Small Tree System (STS), etc.

In this regard, Regional Director FSC & RD, told that;

“The Department of Federal Seed Certification & Registration in collaboration with Department of Punjab Seed Corporation, has established 27 field offices and laboratories throughout Pakistan ….. we welcome our partners [farmers and input suppliers] to visit these facilities and maximize their agri-output”.

FSC&RD is a third-party service provider and has the mandate to regulate the quality of seeds of various crops under the legal provisions. To promote water stewardship, Federal Water Management Cell and Directorate General of Water Management collaborate in policy formulation regarding land/infrastructure development.

During the interview, Deputy Director, Department of Agriculture Water Management revealed that;

“….. with various small farmers, we are working together (especially in Punjab province) for the adoption of modern technology, that include, drip/sprinkler design, lift irrigation system design, LASER land leveling, tunnel farming, watercourse designing, irrigation scheduling, etc.”.

Adding further, he stressfully claimed that;

“….. togetherness will lead to the accomplishment of our core objective, i.e. more crop per drop ….. however, we [all partners] have to overcome our [financial and operational] constraints”.

It is also worth noting that at the market level, the Department of Agriculture Economics & Marketing has successfully introduced the digital rate board at 27 different locations in Punjab.

While, illustrating, one of the public officer comment;

“….. to help them [farmers] to better manage their operative problems, we [Department of Adaptive Research] use outcomes of applied research”.

For this purpose, eight Adaptive Research Farms and six adaptive research stations were established. As cost remained the major concern in applied research, public sector institutions like, Punjab Agriculture Research Board, Directorate of Agriculture Field and Research collaborate with private sector input suppliers and they jointly sponsor many research projects.

The above stated examples of joint decision making and co-investments (in some key projects) reflect
strategic collaboration between public sector stakeholders and their supply chain partners, including some growers and input suppliers. Likewise, such success based stories demands a similar level of integration to be attained in other core areas like, transportation, storage, etc. as the same was highlighted during interviews.

5.4 System Coupling & Incentive Alignment: Current & Required Extent of SCI
To maximize the gains, coupling of production processes, such as continuous replenishment between manufacturers, just-in-time (JIT), and Kanban between manufacturers and their external partners have been frequently suggested. Such relation oriented spending in system coupling doesn’t only enable the integration of both information and physical flows, rather it helps in increasing the trust and commitment between channel members, and resultantly intensifies the cooperative behavior (Lui, Wong, & Liu, 2009).

When asked, about harmonized data sharing, for helping stakeholders in managing their produce, General Manager Field Wing, responded; “we at the department of agriculture, storage and service corporation and agriculture economic wing, deal in the collection, compilation and dissemination of agricultural statistics in its quest to ensure national food security by maintaining strategic reserves of different food grain commodities providing the same to deficit provinces”.

Adding further, he pointed out;
“…. it is our prime responsibility to ensure consistent supply [of food] to armed forces and maintain international food bank on behalf of the federal government”.

In this regard, one of the exemplary initiatives is the establishment of “Agro Food Processing (AFP) Facility”, wherein, departments help growers in finding markets for their crops/grains. They even engage the private sector to ensure its plausible distribution and consumption and to take all necessary measures to minimize agri-food wastage.

Similarly, Deputy Director, Department of Agriculture Economics and Marketing, shared that they have established market committees with the mandate to regulate the sale and purchase of agricultural produce, collection and dissemination of market information, provision of facilities to all stakeholders, enforce price control mechanisms, establish new markets (wherever required), guide and help farmers and input suppliers in adopting international food standards.

Despite of such efforts, still the current extent of integration stands at the tactical level with growers and operational with input suppliers. For better supply chain performance, strategic level has been recommended. Generally, it is believed that a higher level of integration can help to reap the real benefits. However, it can only be achieved, if all parties will willingly cooperate. Conversely, with input suppliers, both operational and tactical levels of integration were declared sufficient.

5.5 Resource Sharing: Extent of Integration with Farmers and Input Suppliers
The extent to which resources are joined by the channel members affects the overall performance and its outcomes across the chains (Christensen & Klyver, 2006). In literature, resources have been classified into four groups i.e. physical resources (i.e. includes facilities that help the internal and external exchanges), financial resources (e.g. monetary support and new resources), personnel resources (e.g. expert opinions and guidelines) and informational resources (e.g. information dissemination both within and across channel members) (Ritter, 1999). It has been observed that actors share their resources in a way, which inspires the channel members in their relationship and helps them to reach their objectives and develop useful connections within the network (Jraisat, 2016).

During interviews, it was revealed that multiple resource sharing mechanisms have been established. For
example, the Department of Agriculture Extension, under the “Kitchen Gardening Program” provide subsidized seed kits to growers at approachable places. Similarly, the Department of Agriculture Extension & Adaptive Research provides trainings on different topics to both growers and input suppliers for their capacity building. Likewise, state-of-the-art and well-equipped laboratories with the latest technologies have been established in eight (08) divisions and twenty-eight (28) districts of Punjab. Farmers and input suppliers can avail laboratory facilities for various analyses regarding plants, pests, soil and water resources. In addition to advisory services, agri-equipment, like, land levelers, bulldozers and other agri-utensils are being provided to growers under the Directorate of Agriculture Field. To strengthen collaboration, the Department of Farm Water Management guide efficient usage of water reserves, reduction of water evaporation, control on operational losses and water seepage, etc. Another valuable contribution is the installation of Digital Rate Boards in twenty-seven (27) different markets.

Table 3. Portray interesting insights regarding the extent of integration between public sector stakeholders, farmers and input suppliers.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NATURE OF RESOURCES</th>
<th>PHYSICAL</th>
<th>FINANCIAL</th>
<th>PERSONAL</th>
<th>INFORMATIONAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SHARED WITH FARMERS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current level of SCI</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Required level of SCI</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SHARED WITH INPUT-SUPPLIERS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current level of SCI</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Required level of SCI</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: S: Strategic Level, T: Tactical Level, O: Operational Level
Despite of above measures, the management of public sector stakeholders believes that at present resource sharing with farmers and input suppliers is restricted at the tactical level. While, answering the question that integration should be extended to the strategic level? The majority of respondents were of the views that the desired results can be attained by engaging farmers in collaborative projects, however, they seem satisfied with the level of integration with input supplier Commenting further, Assistant Director [AE&AR], pinpointed;

“that directorates and the connected departments working under the Department of Agriculture, Punjab desire to strengthen weaker partners, i.e. farmers as compared to established input suppliers. However, any worth mentioning collaborative project by input supplier can be welcomed”.

In addition to physical resource sharing, the debates regarding integration for financial resources depict that due to financial constraints, farmers are far away from research initiatives. Though, Punjab Agriculture Research Board provides funds for research activities still the management believe that funding is not sufficient to fulfill the need of the farmers across the province. However, to increase agri-input, soft loans are being provided to farmers along with necessary information/education to adopt emerging technologies including drip irrigation, tunnel farming, etc.

To gain success, the Punjab Government sponsor 10,000/- rupees per acre for water storage ponds. Additionally, some projects, like, Punjab Irrigated-Agriculture Productivity Improvement Project, National program for improvement of watercourses in Pakistan, High-Efficiency Irrigation System (government subsidizes 60 percent of total system cost for installation of HEIS on up to 15 acres, while, the remaining costs are contributed by the beneficiary farmers) are hallmark projects and reflect the tactical level of integration between public sector stakeholders and farmers. On the other hand, agri-input suppliers also seem active. They sponsor basic farming (limited level), offer discounts to farmers, conduct seminars, organize workshops and festivals and take research initiatives. Additionally, logistics support, stocking, dealing and negotiation with wholesalers are some other financial support extended by input suppliers. Such financial collaborations between AFVC helps in generating overall supply chain performance. It is further revealed that designated employees including, directors, assistant directors, agriculture officers, agricultural engineers, field officers/staff remain in touch with key players on multiple levels and layers of the agriculture value chain. For example, agricultural officers and field assistants engage farmers on a daily basis for training, advisory services, sample collection for soil and water, pest scouting, distribution of seed kits, etc. One of the Director added;

“….. they ensure a seamless and consistent flow of information with their key users. They believe their success heavily relies on on-time information dissemination regarding research activities, market rates, proper stock places and other infrastructural requirements.

Adding further, he said;

“….. we depute inspectors to maintain farmer’s registration, test quality, price check and delist firms engaged in low-quality fertilizers, pesticides and seeds”.

All these measures are to extend services and to facilitate local farmers and agri-input suppliers.

5.6 Constraints in achieving the Desired Extent of SCI

Once it was probed that why public sector stakeholders remained unable to attain the desired extent of integration, three major hurdles were emphasized, i.e. scarcity of resources, limited access to updated technologies, and lack of willingness on the part of both the growers and input suppliers to make use of the facilities provided by the Government of Pakistan. Additionally, lack of trust and motivation, high illiteracy, communication gap, limited funds, etc. were highlighted as hurdles to attain desired results.

5.7 Supply Chain Integration and its Impact on Supply Chain Performance

The performance management index proposed by Dweiri and Khan (2012) was used to measure the impact of SCI on SCP. To comprehend the picture, few glimpse are presented below;

“….. efforts are paying off and the same is evident from the quality and surplus production of multiple
crops, fruits and vegetables” [Director General Agriculture Policy Institute (API)].

“….. I can confidently claim that [due to consistent trainings], today, our growers are capable to meet international standards, rejection rate [has] significantly reduced, and our exports increased [Assistant Director Agriculture (Research)].

“…… logistical protocols are independently managed, so it sometimes, affects the profits inversely”[Deputy Director, Agriculture (Extension & AR)].

“….. farmers in Pakistan, don’t stock much, as they can’t afford [due to perishability], hence, serious efforts needed to build storage [cold chains] to avoid wastages, ensure inventory turnover and to reduce lead time [GM Field Wing (PASSCO)].

“Despite of all efforts, channel members inability to comply and/or distrust [on public offices] surely damage overall performance [Economic Consultant, Economic Wing]”

Though, above comments give some insights, however, financial gain is the ultimate predictor of the overall performance. Unfortunately, no solid (quantitative) or measureable outcomes can be extracted from the discussions, however, general statistics (like, 3.81% growth for the year 2017-18 compared to previous year’s 2.07% & 0.15% for the year 2016-17 & 2015-16, speak favorable.

6. Conclusion

To our utmost knowledge, this study is among rare studies, wherein, the role of public sector stakeholders in collaborating with their supply chain partners, i.e. growers/farmers and input suppliers has been identified. Based on inputs from the interviewers, this study provides some significant and useful insights. Firstly, to attain desirous performance, SCI across AFVC is inevitable. Secondly, SCI is observed as a contextual phenomenon, and it’s not less than a theoretical myth that only the utilization of higher intensity of SCI leads to higher supply chain performance. Thirdly, the extent of SCI can practically be measured on three possible extents, i.e. strategic, tactical and operational. Lastly, desirous performance can be attained through active involvement of supply chain actors, activities and resources.

Furthermore, the results highlight that public sector stakeholders are using multiple means to share all possible resources, including, personal, financial, physical and informational with their supply chain partners. Despite of limitations, there are a number of agri-based collaborative projects which can be marked as ‘integration landmarks’, for example, the Kitchen Gardening Program, Punjab Irrigated-Agriculture Productivity Improvement Project, National Program for Improvement of Water Courses, High-Efficiency Irrigation System, etc. Similarly, the efforts of public sector stakeholders are highly appreciable especially for establishing mechanisms for sharing useful information and research output both with growers and input suppliers. The efforts are not limited to information sharing rather agri-partners are collectively engaged in joint decision making and collaborative projects. Interestingly, the extent of integration varies significantly among activities, resources, and actors, and that’s how the outcomes of this study add valuable insight in the existing series of supply chain literature especially regarding network perspective.

Considering the significance of networks, most of the researchers, like, (Anderson et al., 1994; Koops et al., 2002; Ritter & Gemünden, 2004) have stated the need for effective management of key network factors and interaction between these to generate better positives. The outcomes of this study confirms that different extents of integration are required along various supply chain activities to generate overall supply chain performance. This understanding is somehow in line with the research work of Flynn et al. (2010), wherein, different configurations and arcs of SCI have been suggested. Similarly, as per contingency perspective, where manufacturers make use of a certain extent of integration with a desire of harmonizing the particular SCI and the environment in which it is utilized (Flynn et al., 2010; Wiengarten et al., 2016), this study also advocates that blind use of high level of SCI, without considering contextual factors, may not generate desirous performance. Finally, this study considered the need for implementing the required extent of SCI beyond the dyadic level, to the network level. This was prescribed, because of the ever-rising need for establishing the productive AFVC’s specifically in developing countries in a desire to expand agriculture output.
The comparison of given studies’ results with those of others, clearly revealed that one can’t overestimate the role of SCI in causing SCP. The effect of SCI on performance can only be examined, if all the contingencies and configurations are kept under consideration. Else, the use of SCI can backfire, in the form of unprecedented cost, resulting in losses for firms in particular and overall supply chains as a whole. Moving forward, the outcomes of this study strengthened the preposition that SCI is a contextual phenomenon. This study considered AFVC of Pakistan, with an assumption, that it is one of the most segregated and critical value chains of all, and universal (high level) implementation of SCI must not be useful in all cases. A number of contextual factors, like a variety of players involved, perishability and nature of the product, the unpredictability of weather and instability in governmental policies, etc. may demand different extent of integration among actors, activities and resources of the supply chain network.

This study extends managerial understanding regarding appropriate levels of SCI among supply chain partners. More specifically, understanding the required extent of SCI can assist firms and supply chain partners to save their energies and resources for future gains. Like others, this study also has some limitations, which set the tone for futuristic researches in the field of SCI. Future researchers can consider a longitudinal data, which may give them more comprehensive insights. The geographical (Pakistan) and sectorial (agriculture) scope may raise questions on the generalizability of the results. Hence, knowing the current and required extent of integration by studying diversified sectors across multi-echelons supply chains can help to generalize the results. Similarly, quantitative frameworks grounded from literature, hypothesizing SCI and SCP and empirical verifications can produce deeper and valuable insights.

References


Police Brutality and Reforms in Pakistan

Najma Sadiq1, Ume Laila2, Tahir Mehmood3, Tooba Rehan Haqqi4

1Assistant Professor, Head of the Department, Department of Mass Communication, School of Social Sciences and Humanities (S3H), National University of Sciences and Technology (NUST), Islamabad, Pakistan, najmasadiq@gmail.com

2Assistant Professor, Government & Public Policy, School of Social Sciences and Humanities (S3H), National University of Sciences and Technology (NUST), H-12 Sector, Islamabad, Pakistan, dr.umelaila@s3h.nust.edu.pk

3Assistant Professor, Department of Communication studies, BahaUddin Zakariya University, Multan, Pakistan, tahirmahmood@bzu.edu.pk

4Graduate Public Administration, Department of Government & Public Policy, National University of Sciences and Technology (NUST), H-12 Sector, Islamabad, Pakistan, Tooba.bpa16s3h@s3h.nust.edu.pk

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

Police Brutality has become one of the most important highlight around the globe. This study qualitatively investigates the form of police violence existent in Pakistan and also how this violence is related with the reforms enunciated. Through investigation it has been seen that the police of Pakistan are more into bribery and misuse of power than it is there to serve the nation and provide national security. This study shall highlight important issues prevalent and will also provide recommendations through which issues can be resolved.

© 2020 Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: najmasadiq@gmail.com


1. Introduction

Police department is an integral department in any state in order to maintain law and order in the country. Pakistan being a democratic state has established a separate police department in order to protect the citizens of the country. Specialized training schools have been established which train the police officers in a way that they can sustain any danger and face challenges with bravery; not only that highest standards of merit are maintained in recruiting along with numerous perks and benefits endowed to the police personnel at all levels. The personnel are also given on-the-job training to keep them up to date. The force is fully equipped with latest machinery and are fully technologized in order to curb any violence prevalent in the society.

When the police department was discovered, it was believed that through this modern criminology shall advent and through this new horizon the old forms of policing shall be laid to rest (Alan, 2005-2006). It
was believed that the department is of local nature meaning it shall by all means work for the common good but never it had been thought that this essential department would one day rise and become a robust institute that shall only be working for the elites and power. Despite investing abundant resources in this department, the results are not satisfactory. The police in here has become a violent force rather than a discipline maintaining department. Violence in police is a contradictory term, yet this ferocity is growing at a reckless speed. Such a type of violence in easy words can be referred to as misuse or mal exercising of power. The situation prevailing in United states has opened eyes of Pakistani people who have now started to talk and investigate about the ongoing brutality in Pakistan. George Floyd’s video has caused a rage all around the world and this is the first time ever when people in Pakistan have started to support this issue through social media and thus have participated at international forum. This incident has exposed the real face of police and has led people to rethink the need for constabularies. Tip top preparing schools have been built up for the cops. Despite the courses of action fit as fiddle up these officials as the gatekeepers of the general population, the country is at times rewarded to the updates on a hardhearted killing on account of these very men.

It might not be wrong to say that the police department needs well trained, and physically and mentally perfect officers. Apart from these qualities, morale must be the topmost priority while selecting the officers (Gockce, 1945). A lot of time is required to inject high moral standards into a person. The then, it was deemed and believed that a moral person is a just person but now, the modernized world has thrown back this quality and which can easily be seen in the police department also. It was once a time when police constables had the best of attitude and behavior, but all of the essence is now lost and seems like can never be restored back.

1.1 Research Focus
This essay shall investigate following important factors behind this violence
1. Relevance between different brutality cases
2. Factors behind police violence in Pakistan
3. Fate of police reforms enunciated in 2002

The purpose of this research is to evaluate the factors that are hyping the police violence and the significance of topic lies in the fact that no such research has been yet carried out to draw out the relevance between the reforms enunciated and how well did these reforms contributed to reduce the prevailing brutalities.

2. Literature Review
Police incarceration has become a norm in United States. Many black Africans are laid to rest due to immense culture of racism amongst white people and it might not be wrong to say that the U.S. criminal system is almost always silent on such issues and have had never supported the black Africans against this brutality (Taylor, 2013). The question then arises has there any reforms been initiated in order to curb this brutality or not? The question does stands out and it can easily be stated that no such reforms have come to light. The US department of Justice should consider the fact of humanity and start working against this brutality and should work hard enough to pledge rights for the black Africans (Chaney & Robertson, 2013).

Terrorizing poor has become quite easy and a normal thing especially for the police officers. The protest carried out by Tamil-Nadu fishermen against the installation of nuclear power plant at the coastal lines was subjected to serious torture and anguish that by any means they had to back off from the protest (Kumar, 1985). But can all this brutality and homicide against poor and mostly the religion of Islam justifiable? Can the events of 1962 in Los Angeles be justifies when 7 of the Muslims were laid to rest by the police when they had not even committed the slightest of the slight crime. But its clearly evidential that the political authorities were quiet powerful in overcoming and shadowing these events and till date no such effort has ever been made to give due rights to those innocent Muslims (Knight, 1994).

In some cases like China, police department is the most loyal where they work day and night to administer and resolve the cases, but here in China the work load on police officers is so vast that this
has become the matter of frustration and has become difficult for them to accomplish set goals (E. SCOGGINS & O'BRIEN, 2016). Unlike this in Japan it is believed that the police department might be much worst than it even appears to be. Three most galvanizing corruptions have been observed in this department which requires a lot of attention (Johnson, 2003). Little to no research has been carried out in Pakistan to evaluate and find the reasons behind the prevailing conditions in the police department. In a research carried out by Mukarram Ali Khan, he has pointed out the police brutality in Pakistan explaining the different forms in which it exists and has justified by giving reasons and pointing out incidents which has led to such circumstances. On taking interviews, the stakeholders jagged out different states and forces which have started to worsen the police department conditions (Mukaram, 2014). In another research chapter, by Zubair Nawaz Chattha and Sanja KutnjakIvković, they have highlighted police misconduct and have justified the prevailing condition by mentioning certain socioeconomic and political conditions which are heeding the viciousness (Zubair & Sanja).

In an article named “Police and Policing in Pakistan” by Fasihuddin, the researcher has pointed out the effects of Police Order 2002 and to what extent it has created drastic changes in the police sector. The author has also explained the structural problems still prevalent in the organization. Comprehensively, the author believes that apart from 1886 police order no reforms have created a positive impact or has improved the police sector. Certain suggestions are also presented which can easily be incorporated in order to improve and enhance the functional capacity of this important sector (Fasihuddin, 2019).

Abbas Ahsan in his article “Police Reforms: Public Perception and Introspection” clearly mentions that there is a dire need of reforms in the police sector of Pakistan. He believes that integrity and accountability are the two missing factors in this sector and hence require a lot of attention. The author believes that the reforms shall not be fruitful unless and until the perception of public related to the police is known. He confidently points out that the negative perception of people regarding the police sector truly reflects the reality of this sector and unless and until the policy makers truly understand the insight of public no such reforms can be enunciated (Ahsan, 2019, pp. 155-162).

Aftab and Baloch have investigated the nature of the foundations on which the Sindh Policing system has been laid. In their article “Policing Colonization The Evolution and Role of Sind Police and the Views of Sir Charles Napier on the Administration of Criminal Justice in Sind” evaluates the working capacity of the Sindh Police prior to the formation of Pakistan. They believe that the British policing system did had some drawbacks including the operational deficiencies as well as a lot of influence of the jagir system has been seen. The authors believe that the present Sind Police system still has these deficiencies and thus a lot of improvement is required (Aftab & Dost, 2019).

Paul Petzschmann in his brief article point out the major institutional setbacks after carrying out a survey. The Author in his article “Police Reform in Pakistan A Victim of Foreign Security Aid?” claims that the police sector started to deteriorate after the reforms enunciated by former President Musharraf. He believes that the only thing Pakistani police is good at is to combat Talibianization or to fight war against the terror. he also puts a question before the government that whether the police reforms were implemented to modify the sector or to attract the foreign aid. He articulates that the true essence of police department has been lost and that essential reforms are required in terms of training so that the officers get to know that the main thing is to provide security to general public and not to protect the politicians and borders (Paul, 2010).

3. Research Methodology
This research follows qualitative approach and investigates into different scenarios reported in news and other articles talking in detail about the police brutality. Also, posted documents of Police Ordinance have been obtained from the website of Law Enforcement Agencies. The documents have been reflected and studied thoroughly before framing a contextual relationship between how the fate of PO 2002 has been subjected to threat.
4. Analysis
The following part now discusses in detail the three objectives of this research. The analysis is purely descriptive in nature, followed by relevant examples and cases where necessary.

4.1 Police Reforms and its Fate
After independence Pakistan had established a criminal justice system under which police department was destined to provide security to the nation. With the passage of time this division started to come under different influences, majorly the political influence. With the interference of ruling political authority corruption and red tapes began to increase and thus police department’s efficiency began to diminish. Till date this department is sheerly involved in crooked activities. Upon considering the diminishing health of the department the federal government decided to introduce certain reforms in this department. The police reforms 2002, enunciated on 14th August 2002, were the hallmark as officials along with nation though that this decision will finally allow them to put trust on the constabularies. The police order at that time imposed legal obligations on the police authorities to execute and exercise their powers justly and that they were destined to exhibit highest standards of morality, professionalism, nationalism and of course justice. Perceiving that these officials shall remain friendly certain autonomies and immunities were also granted to shelter police officials. But soon after provinces were given autonomy to make their own decision except Punjab the remain three provinces drafted and implemented their own Police orders. This created a rift in the police officials all over the country who were not bound by one contract rather subjected to different regulations.

The legitimacy of the Police Order 2002 (CDPL, 2013) became questionable soon after the 18th amendment. The authorities tried their level best to restore uniformity in police regulations all over the country but failed to do so. However, it was then decided that Model Police Law 2018 should be applicable in provinces was flexible enough to accommodate the requirements of the provinces and the Police Order 2002 be applicable only on Islamabad. But things stand out very clear; there was an absolute lack of political will due to which these reforms could not be enforced. Without having a uniform codified system applied all over the country efficiency, effectiveness and justice cannot be achieved in the criminal justice system. Recently, Islamabad High Court called a hearing in which the matter of non-implementation of PO-2002 was discussed. Chief Justice Minhalah demanded reasons along with evidences regarding why this reform had not been enforced despite promulgated 18 years ago, but to utmost surprise they authorities very cleverly shifted the blame onto the civil government claiming that such reforms do not cohere with the thinking and requirements of general public. Having said that they also demanded to abolish this reform constitutionally and let provinces decide the fate of police department on their own. But in my opinion, this is not a way to deal with issues. The constitutionally promulgated reforms should not be called off this easily only because the political authorities cannot have their personal motives fulfilled. It should be noted that until and unless politics is separated from police department nothing can be changed.

Moreover, the 2002 and other so-called modernized police reforms failed due to antagonism and hostility of Civil Bureaucracy. These reforms restricted the control of district magistrate over the police and hence faced unwarranted backlashes. The bureaucracy then made serious efforts not to implement such reforms and exerted extreme pressure on the political elite and other concerned agencies to amend the new legislation. Hence here the point is raised that if such kind of corrupt officials keep on enjoying the positions falsely and disregard the true essence of bureaucracy then the departments under establishment can never be reformed and can never be corruption free.

4.2 Relevance between Different Brutality Cases
Police brutality has now become a global phenomenon. Every day almost new cases related to police harshness emerge. From the video that went viral of George Floyd numerous questions have cam forward in the domestic media calling out and challenging the concerned authorities to look for the rampant police brutality here in Pakistan. It is evidential form the incidents that police authorities have had disregarded the norms and values of justice system and have shown inhumane attitude while subjecting the common man to the brutal behavior letting it be verbal abuse or torturing in-custody
criminals to death. Not only that they have also defied and disregarded the constitutional and fundamental human rights but there exists no law which would subject them to inquiries.

Such frequencies have shown the real face of the police department and have indicated that the police have started to misuse the brand or name which they should be using to serve the people. an inflexion point and many Americans can completely relate. The ongoing protests in America do have a 100% relevance to what is happening here in Pakistan but the difference lies in a way that there people took the case onto the streets while here in Pakistan nobody has that freedom to go against the police brutality and speak openly on media. Staring from the incident that occurred in 2018, when Naqeebullah Mehsud was killed by super intended in Karachi claiming that he was involved in certain terrorist activities. A wave of anger had swept around the country at that time, but nobody was able to acquire justice for the young lad because police had started to threaten deceased’s family. Many NGO’s and other human rights organizations called for investigations but of no use; soon after the case was closed, and no interrogations were carried out on the part of SP police Karachi. Another incident which occurred in Lahore where police constables tortured a mentally challenged person to death and again despite many efforts those constables could not be held accountable. Recently, in Karachi a frontline doctor was shot twice by a policeman and upon confrontation with the higher authorities they claimed that, the policeman had some psychic problem so he cannot be dragged into the court of law of inquiries. So here comes the question if he had been a mentally ill person what he was doing in the police department. Again, law remained silence and could not stand up for the frontline doctor who risked his life in this pandemic.

Certain relevance can be drawn in these cases. In all the three scenarios its clear that the police had misused the power and immunity endowed upon them and simultaneously the weak justice system was unable to held accountable these people. In almost 90% of the cases it’s a weak or person belonging to marginalized groups who are subjected to the police violence. In the remaining 10% the police mal-used their powers. Here in Pakistan police considers themselves above law and that they have power to do ANYTHING without being accountable before the law. These situations arise because of the weak judicial system which just plays a puppet show and remains silent before the political influences and other powerful establishments.

4.3 Factors behind Police Violent in Pakistan
The police brutality prevalent in USA is because of the racial differences. Almost 99% of people subjected to this violence are the black Americans. But here in Pakistan there are numerous other factors which gave rise to the police ferocity. Upon investigation the results turned out to not so surprising. The main factors which have heeded up the situation include:
1. Lack of proper training, knowledge and resources
2. Lack of proper funding, which leads to low salaries and thus enhancing the frustrations.
3. Meager working; which means that the people working in police department are not been provided with certain way outs, only they must do is to listen to orders of their bosses.
4. Absence of coordination between the law enforcement agencies which makes the police department all in all. Lack of synchronization also leads to no controlling agency/power over the department.

5. Recommendations
As things can never be left out alone similarly this vicious department of the society cannot be left out to erode on its own. Frequently, police are part of the problem, as opposed to be its solution. Similarly, in most cases the police officers turn out to be way too corrupt defying and disregarding all sorts of requirements of justice. In other circumstances the nation does not trust the constabularies; but every problem has a solution. There exist some opportunities through which things or moreover department can be revamped. Following are some recommendations through which police department can be set on the road to progress.

FIRSTLY, the government should restrict the powers of police by enforcing the already present Article 14 of constitution which decrees that "no action detrimental to the life, liberty, body, reputation or
property of any person shall be taken except in accordance with law” and that no person "shall be
deprived of life or liberty save in accordance with law” (GOP, 1973) . Through administering this
provision police department will be considered under law and not above the eyes of law. “Criminal
Procedure Code (1898), the Maintenance of Public Order Ordinance (1960), and the recently enacted
Protection of Pakistan Act (2014), all contribute to a legal framework that protects the police from
accountability” moreover, QUALIFIED IMMUNITY, which gives them an escape goat to misuse
designated powers and no one will be questioning them. In my opinion this should be eliminated from
the system as it makes the police different from all of us and it must be made sure that any person who
does bad should reap the fruit of his doings.

SECONDLY, the police department here in Pakistan should be demilitarized. By demilitarize it means
that the department must be restricted, and it should be made sure that none of the officials are using
federal funds to buy equipment that are out of the scope for the department. For instance, police raid
houses with heavily equipped guns, they should be restricted to baton; charge and pistols not more than
that. Also, enough instruction should be given to them so that they know when and how to use such
things. THIRDLY, any police officer who comes across such heinous crime of brutally killing and
torturing a criminal or as stated in the above examples these police officers must be prosecuted, dragged
in the court of law, charge them as hard as the prosecutor can and then finally should be given
punishment in accordance to what the penal code says regarding the murder/torture to death. Unless and
until such actions are taken in the past cases, no police officer shall abide by misusing the powers. It’s
now in the hands of the criminal justice system either it decides to feed the officials or serve the nation
without any discrimination. FOURTHLY, although the following recommendation should be employed
on all departments but particularly in the police division. This sector should be made free from the
political influence and interference. For so long politicians have started to fuel and bribe police officials
and have for so long kept them as their pets. Such misdealing inhibits the common man to completely
trust the police and acquire any sort of help.

FIFTHLY, the criminal justice system should be revamped at priority basis and should be made more
responsive to the victims. In order to revamp this system a quantitative approach of statistical analysis
should be adopted which will, through surveys, allow the judiciary to investigate the reasons behind the
violence and the trend. Moreover, the justice system should be strong enough to held accountable
officials and must not fear someone because of the position the hold in the society. If a case of brutality
comes forward the justice department should compel the police authorities to provide data of the official
attempting such brutality and then the trial should be carried out. If in case the justice system fails to do
so a condition should be levied that the justice department shall not be receiving any sort of federal
funding to run the department.

6. Conclusion
This essay does not aim to highlight and spread negativity about the police department; but the reason
behind writing this essay is to make sure that the concerned authorities find a way forward and get a
chance to restore this subdivision. “The strength and legitimacy of the police forces depends upon how
morally they perform the duty; one such is the example of the police force of Georgia. People living
there do not abide by the rules and regulations just because of the fear that they might lose their lives
instead, they listen to a traffic warden, or a constable, or a senior official, out of respect for the law, and
respect for the symbol of the State that their uniform represents. Unfortunately, in Pakistan, this ethical
dilemma of the police department has worn out. For now, the people of Pakistan are at war: with the
militant, and with a police force that frequently acts in the same manner that militants do. This model is
as unjustifiable, and it is time for meticulous members within the police force to retrieve the promise of
their profession and restate themselves as sympathetic and empathetic guardians of nation”. Moreover, if
we really want to make the police department really effective we need to incorporate three things;
measuring the performance of the department against a set criterion, maintain completely audited
records which may be used at any time in order to measure the performance, and lastly methodologies
which must be adopted by each and every individual of the department to make things possible (D.
Parrat, 1938).
References
Horrors of Class System: A Marxist Critique of Mansfield’s Doll’s House

Sidra Ahmad, Selina Aziz, Salman Amin

1Department of English, Foundation University, Islamabad, Pakistan, sidra.ahmad@fui.edu.pk
2Department of English, Foundation University, Islamabad, Pakistan, selina.aziz@fui.edu.pk
3Department of Arts and Media, Foundation University, Islamabad, Pakistan, salman.amin@fui.edu.pk

The current paper talks about the horrors of the inescapable class system that has us hooked blindly. The basic issue lies in the fact that the society we live in and grow operates on the system of class consciousness. The rich /bourgeoisie class uses and abuses the low or poor class to attain maximum benefits from them, whereas the poor or the proletariat have no choice except to be manipulated by the rich class for the cost of labor, for they know that it is the only step towards survival and it lies in manipulation. The rich class has become totally dependent on the proletariat and they know they cannot move without and out of it. As the society is designed and planned on unequal footings so, on the one hand, the rich class has found a medium to exploit the labor class but at the same time the proletariat are not allowed to interact with them and furthermore there are bleak chances of unification as the lower/labor class is itself a stigma in the eyes of the bourgeoisie.

1. Introduction
Karl Marx is attributed to the formulation of his revolutionary theory which is termed as Marxism. Marx was curious in knowing that how human beings are shaped and how relationships in the society formed. According to Barry (1995), “The aim of Marxism is to bring about a classless society, based on the common ownership of the means of production, distribution, and exchange” (p. 106). One class is getting maximum benefits and enjoying all the facilities of life and is getting richer day by day while the other class is deprived of all the basic needs and have to face continuous exploitation of the controllers. As quoted by Barry (1995) “Marxism sees progress coming about through the struggle for power between different social classes” (p. 108).

2. Statement of the Problem
It has become the order of the day to exploit the proletariat and attain maximum benefits from them as they belonged to the suppressed strata of society. The proletariat are in the continuous struggle mode and both of the antagonistic forces cannot get along with each other because of opposing interests.

3. Objectives
The main objective is:

1. To determine whether the bond of unification exists between the bourgeoisie and the proletariat.

4. Research Question
The question that will be explored in the analysis part is
Q. Can the bond of unification exist between the proletariat and bourgeoisie?

5. Literature Review
Dr. L. Amutha in the article “Class Consciousness with reference to Katherine Mansfield’s The Doll’s House” has talked about the class consciousness which complicates and upsets the balance of society. According to Amutha the class in which a person is born becomes his permanent identity and it gets really difficult for him to maintain his social prestige in society if he is born to a lower class. The malpractices become evident from the character of Aunt Beryl as she contemplates the Kelvey sisters not fit for sighting the dazzling and attractive things in life as they are the daughters of a washerwoman and a jailbird so they are subject to hatred and victimization. As Amutha (2018) portrays the behavior of Aunt Beryl by writing “Her behavior clearly expressed that she viewed the Kelvey sisters as poor and unworthy of viewing something as beautiful and expensive as the doll’s house” (p.14).

Sahin Kiziltas while writing about The Review of The Doll’s House by Katherine Mansfield through the Philosophy of Louis Pierre Althusser states that it is only the prerogative of the governing body to construct boundaries around the better sort and the excluded ones by means of ideological apparatuses. Kiziltas (2014) quoted Althusser and states that “…an ideology always exists in an apparatus and its practice or practices. This existence is material” (p.128). The elites set the roles for the working class and they are not allowed to break, reshape and navigate the roles. The ultimate destination of the working class is to remain there where they are since ages because their identity is fixed and they cannot climb the corporate ladder because of the social structures and the stereotyping of the society towards them. The so-called high gentry of the society does not absorb the fact that the member of a working-class can have beautiful articles/items and is in the same position as that of the elites. They deny the working class the right of intermingling with the rich class as has been witnessed and that because of established ideologies. Aunt Beryl banned the Kelveys from communicating with the Burnell’s and restrict them to enter their house and on the other hand the mother of Kelveys forbade them to fuse and get along with the Burnells as she is very much well aware of her boundaries which exerts a negative impact on the personalities of the Kelveys making them alienated, shaky and fearful from society. Kiziltas tried to establish the fact that due to the undue and unreasonable burden and stress exerted on the working class by the elites, the working class is bound to follow the philosophy of the governing bodies. Kilitaz stated that “The society takes the shape through the goals of the class” (136).

Altinay Ozan in his article “Althusser’s Ideological state apparatuses and literary criticism” suggests that ideological state apparatus functions simultaneously with the repressive state apparatus. As Ozan states about Althusser that for him, people are the by-product and commodity with no harmony and identity of their own. Talking about Karl Marx, Altinay is of the view that for Marx the poor class is determined by the bourgeoisie. Ozen quoted Althusser (1970) and writes in Ideological State Apparatuses and Literary criticism that “superstructure is determined by the base” (p.1). For Althusser, there are other factors besides superstructure and base and he gave the term “interpellation” for it. Ozen while reviewing Althusser's perspective commented that every human/person is not a commodity but possesses their own individuality and existence.

6. Methodology
The research would be a qualitative one. The text of the Doll’s House will be explored for content, themes and context. It will be carried out with the help of books and material available on the internet. Marxism would be the model of study. The paper is written to highlight the most pertinent fact that domination and dictatorship of the capitalist lead to the conflict between the two opposing forces. Many researchers have explored ideology, class consciousness and ideological apparatus, I will be analyzing “The Doll’s House” in totality and loopholes in the economic system as viewed by Marx.
7. Analysis

It is true that the class struggle has been observed since time immemorial. The story, “The Doll’s House” seems to be the reflection of Mansfield’s own life. Barry (1995) found “A writer’s social class and its prevailing ideology (outlook, values, tacit, assumptions, half-realized allegiances, etc.) have a major bearing on what is written by a member of that class (p. 107). She was born to a middle-class family at the time when the class distinction was common and had a closer glimpse of that aura. Dobie (2012) commented, “Named for the assumption that a text will reflect the society that has produced it” (p. 80). Society is a social construct that can be shaped and reshaped by humans. Barry (1995) beautifully explained such phenomenon by writing, “To Tennyson the Keatsian world of romance, to Browning the Italian springtime; both are revolting backward, trying to escape from the contradiction of the class for whom they speak” (p.105).

The Doll’s House, reflect the clear-cut division of two classes’ i-e between bourgeois and proletariat and stressed the fact that all the bounties are for the elites. The text informs us about the children of two classes, Burnells and Kelveys. The Burnells are the children of the upper class while the Kelvey’s belonged to the lower strata of society which truly conveys the idea that the superstructures are the parasite on base. They do the work for the elite class but still denied the basic needs and rights which is the structured view of reality. The Burnell girls because they belonged to the upper class and due to their social status are proud, show off and cruel. They are used to of the elegant life-style and fond of glamorous items. Mansfield (2012) shares even the slightest of the details regarding the doll’s house and writes, “There stood the doll’s house, a dark, oily, spinach green, picked out with bright yellow. It’s two solid little chimneys glued on the roof, were painted red and white, and the door, gleaming with yellow varnish, was like a little slab of toffee” (p.135).

It is rightly said that powerful people are occupying the sources of the universe. Karl Marx gave importance to the socio-economic class. As Tyson (2006) found “Marxists analysis of human events and productions focus on relationships among socioeconomic classes, both within a society and among societies, and explain all human activities in terms of the distribution and dynamics of economic power” (p. 54). As the upper class is privileged and can afford to buy things that the other people or the poor people cannot even dream of. The gifts presented to the Burnells even are so gaudy and expensive which is depicted in the story, where the doll’s house is opened and the children were amazed to see the beauty of the doll’s house. Mansfield (2012) quoted “All the rooms were prepared. There were pictures on the walls, painted on the paper, with gold frames complete. Red carpet covered all the floors except the kitchen” (p. 136).

The story can be aptly rated as the story of the capitalistic society where the cruelties of the upper class are exposed. The Burnells are believed to be active, superior, cultured, sensible and energetic while the Kelveys are believed to be strange, dirty, lazy, uncultured and backward. Mansfield has made every effort to show Kelveys as inferior or othered because they belonged to the working class. A rigid sort of class distinction is seen where the working class is seen suffering because of the weak status. As Mary Shelly pointed out in Frankenstein the attitude of the rich class and aptly described them as monsters. The law of living requires and demands that if you want to interact with people, you need to be belonging to the same class, otherwise you will be rejected. The same situation is faced by Kelveys as they belonged to the lower class and could not have those attractions or the socioeconomic conditions which the Burnells enjoy so they were rejected and out-casted by everybody. Nagarajan (2006) highlights “People are divided primarily by their differences in socioeconomic conditions” (p. 225). It is the requirement of surviving in the world full of the bourgeoisie, that if you want to compete with somebody, you need to be in the same position. As the Kelveys were living below the poverty line so they were bound to suffer and faced isolation in the school from everyone. Mansfield (2012) highlights the situation of Kelveys by saying, “And the only two who stayed outside the ring were the two who were always outside, the little Kelveys (p. 137).

The text indicates that power is based on wealth and material possessions. People in society are attracted
to wealth and material possessions. The wealthier or rich a person is, the more respect, he has in society. People are impressed by outward appearances. If somebody has wealth and enjoying the facilities of life, then he thinks that he is superior and undermines others. Burnells are enjoying such power because they have been given a big doll’s house. It’s the doll’s house that makes the Burnell girls powerful and raises their economic conditions. Nagarajan (2006) quoted “Economic power is behind all institutions” (p.223). The doll’s house has become a reason for domination by the Burnell girls. The house is responsible for creating the gap between the rich and the poor which can never be abridged. By showing the doll’s house to other students or to other girls in their social circle, they can boast about their class and wealth in front of the people. Dobie(2012) states “Those who control production have a power base; they have many ways to ensure that they will maintain their position” (p.82). As economy functions as a base which can be observed where the Burnell children could not resist telling others about their doll’s house. Mansfield (2012) found “They burned to tell everybody, to describe, to…well…to boast about their doll’s house before the school bell rang” (p. 136).

The commodification of things is observed, as Marx is of the view that it’s the attitude of things not for the purpose of utilizing but to impress others. The Burnell girls are a victim of society’s emphasis on significant value. They were always in a race to impress the people belonging to their class. They do this in order to be get noticed by the people and to remain in limelight. The Burnell girls want to boast about their economic and social standing in front of the other girls. They had to follow the norms of society in order to exist in that social set up. The Doll’s House is the medium to show off their wealth and ownership. They cannot live without doing this. The phrase “The girls of her class” is used by Mansfield to highlight that the Burnells really belonged to the high social order. The Doll’s house was the focal point of all eyes. Seldon, Widdowson, and Brooker (2005) pointed out “Human history will in some sense determine the whole cultural life of the society” (p.83).

A sort of double marginalization is observed in the text. First of all, the Kelveys are poor and secondly, they belonged to the lower strata of society so they are alienated from society which shows the unjust ways of the world and society. As the Burnells belonged to the upper class so they think that everything is made for them. They can enjoy all the luxuries because they are only made for them. The Burnells are of the opinion that as they are born in the privileged class, so they deserved the best of everything and the Kelveys because of their social status or position deserved to be outlawed and have no ownership of anything. They will be controlled by the rich class. According to Karl Marx, it’s the elite or the upper class that has become usurpers and blackmailers. The upper class in the text have their own circle and shell and they only liked to interact with the girls who are from the capitalist background as that of them. They do not like to intermingle with the lower class as they are forbidden and eventually, Mansfield (2012) noticed that state and portrays in her short story as “The line had to be drawn somewhere. It was drawn at the Kelveys (p. 137). According to Marx, it is not fate but the economic conditions that has played a part to make them helpless, powerless and defenseless to enjoy the status as the Burnell’s were enjoying.

Reading of the story indicates pride and prejudiced against the lower class. The Burnells took pride in belonging to the upper class and owning a doll’s house. They are prejudiced towards Kelveys as they do not belong to the same class. Seldon, Widdowson, and Brooker (2005) opined in the book “The material interest of the dominated social class determines how people see human existence, individual and collective” (p.62). From the text it can be easily noticed that the Kelveys are misrepresented. They are believed to be the tabooed subject by everyone. They were thought of uncultured, spoilt and ill-mannered.

It is true that the tools of production determine value. As written by Dobie (2012) “The moving force behind human history is its economic systems, for people’s lives, are determined by their economic circumstances (p.82). We can see in the story that the proletariat is repressed and oppressed by everyone. Although these proletariat work for the bourgeoisie still they have to bear the contempt of the elites. The bourgeoisie is dependent on proletariats and have their own material gains or benefits. They are forced to work for the bourgeoisie but still are hated by the elites and treated as if they are not acceptable in
society. Dobie (2012) commented, “As they take on less attractive jobs to pay back what is owed, they are even less acceptable in the corridors of wealth and power” (p.84).

The Marxist critics noticed some serious loopholes in the economic system. A harsh reality is observed which is quoted by Mansfield (2012) in her short story as “The truth was that they were dressed “in bits” given to her by the people for whom she worked” (p.137). The Kelveys were bound to wear the tits or bits given to them by the people. The problem is that there is a socioeconomic gulf between haves and have-nots that can never be abridged which proves Nagarajan’s (2006) concept of class struggle which he has highlighted “History is a class struggle” (p.225). The Kelveys belonging to the proletariat were stereotyped and had to face severe criticism from the elites and were badly tortured. They were given the lesson by the bourgeoisie that they deserved to be oppressed and suppressed and had to face the inequalities created by the capitalists. They were believed to be insignificant or mere dots having no value. As Lena targets the Burnells which Mansfield (2012) quoted “Is it true you’re going to be a servant when you grow up, Lil Kelvey” (p.138). The bourgeoisie thinks that as their parents have done manual labor, the next generation would do the same which depicts that they in a way are snatching their rights to progress. Dialectical materialism comes to play here and according to which people’s actions and reactions are the results of the materialist society, they live in. Dobie (2012) writes, “An imbalance of goods and power among people or manipulation of the worker by the bourgeoisie and will point out the injustice of that society” (p.87). The working class is controlled by the elites. They are used and misused by the people in their own ways with the result that the outcome of it leads to the naming of the working class as the commodity for the bourgeoisie. As Barry (1995) explains “People become things” (p.105). The proletariats have to suffer at each and every step and are exploited by the upper class badly which results in alienation. They are alienated from society and the elites are usurping their chances of survival. The circulation of money and power remain in the hands of one class which leads to classism and alienation in society. As the Kelvey girls belonged to the working class, they were considered to be inferior and given a shut-up call by everybody. Mansfield (2012) quoted their situation as “The Kelveys were shunned by everybody” (p.139).” Their economic conditions differentiate and forced them to disconnect with society and suffer for nothing. Tyson (2006) writes, “The majority of the global population who lived in substandard conditions and have always performed manual labor” (p.54). Had the Kelvey sisters been enjoying the luxurious items and have no disgracing marks like that of incompatible economic conditions, they would definitely be in a better position which means that it is the game of socio-economic conditions. The more sound and financially stable you are and can afford material possession, the more respectable and honorable you become in the eyes of people.

The society depicted in the text has taken all the chances and opportunities from the proletariats which resulted in the unending sufferings especially when it comes to Kelveys. The goods and the wealth are unevenly distributed between two strata of society which is a negative consequence and results in repression of many. Aunt Beryl gets annoyed when Kezia tried to abridge the gulf between the rich and the poor. Aunt Beryl could not stand this and seems to be burning with anger. Mansfield (2012) quoted their situation as “You are not allowed to talk to them” and “She stepped into the yard and shooed them out as if they were chickens” (p.142). The bitter comments of Aunt Beryl are enough to identify the type of society in which they were living where cruelty and snobbery are regarded as acceptable behavior. As quoted by Selden, Widdowson, and Brooker (2005) “The proletariat and the working class are always subjugated by the bourgeoisie. The rich control the resources, and the wealth of a nation” (p.225).

The ideology presented in society is that of powerful people. The exploitation of the upper class leads to the formation of ideologies in society. According to Marxist critics like Selden, Widdowson and Brooker (2005) found “Ideology in Marxism means a system of beliefs using which human beings make sense of the world they live in” (p. 225). The text seems to be glamorizing the powerful people to show their standing and place in society. The working class is strictly controlled by the bourgeoisie, giving them the message that they are not free in any case. The text supports the values of capitalism that the cruel controlling class or bourgeoisie is always there to rule over them. The Kelveys were the scapegoat of the class distinction. They are described with animal images at every stage. They were not allowed to live in the society in a respectable way with their heads high rather had to face public humiliation by the
elites. Dobie (2012) commented, “An ideology, dictated by the dominant class, functions to secure its power” (p.86). They were called by animal images. Our Else was called little white owl which reflects the social behavior of people and in a way, it also denotes that they are not welcomed in their social scale. There are occasional associations when the animals are connected with the two Kelveys. Once “Else” is compared with little “white owl” and another time, both are said to be “little two stray cats” and Aunt Beryl treats, “Those little cats as if they were chickens” (Mansfield,2012, p. 139).

The Doll’s house represents the ideology of the bourgeoisie that the working class deserves the luxurious items and the proletariats deserved to be oppressed. As Marx is of the opinion that powerful people keep their positions in society and try to suppress and oppress the working class and believed that they deserved oppression. The inside view of the Doll’s House determines that it is not at all to be used by the proletariats, rather the rich (The Burnells) should have them because it matches their personalities. Nagarajan (2006) explains, “life is not determined by consciousness but consciousness by life” (p.223).

It is true that society has the potential to be treated equally and unified, though at the start of the story we could see that the Doll’s house was freshly painted and giving a smell. The child narrator says, “And perhaps the smell of paint could have gone off by the time it had to be taken in” and the smell of the paint was quite enough to make anyone seriously ill. The smell of the paint basically reflects the sting or the hatred of the bourgeoisie towards the proletariat. It also determines that the bourgeoisie are a misfit in society that’s why they had to suffer alienation at the hands of modern society and don’t deserve to be happy. As Nagarajan (2006) explains “The personality of man is represented as disintegrated; he is shown to be solitary, asocial, and unable or unwillingly to enter into a happy communion with fellow human beings” (p.227).

It’s the lamp and Kezia that tries to shake off all the inequalities. The lamp being a particular item brought meaning to the story because due to the historic background these lamps were manufactured by hardworking laborers and are purchased by wealthy, so the lamp represents the division between the classes even though its beauty is appreciated no matter what social class you belonged. According to Marx, these working proletariats are individuals who sell their labor power for wages and who do not own the means of production and argues that they were responsible for creating the wealth of society but ironically treated with contempt and disdain by society. The remark of “Our Else” at the end “I seen the little lamp” (Mansfield,2012, p. 143). When the others kept reminding her of class status, Kezia insists on her thought of equality to the prejudiced views of the members of her social class and by doing so she is trying to break the social hierarchy of class inequalities. The innocent world of a child who does not really understand the reasons and the deeper social meaning of all this stand opposite the rule-governed the world of the adults. The lamp becomes the harbinger between Kezia and Our Else. The lamp is the ray of hope between two classes so that they can be treated on equal grounds. The girls admired and appreciated the innocent lamp which put both of them in the same situation and similar status which is a direct hint or a hit on society that how it is unbalanced and dissimilar but it does have the unifying power and characteristics. It is a social leveler. As quoted by Nagarajan (2006) “The power structures can only be altered by the coming together of the proletariat, forgetting its division”(p.225).

8. Conclusion
Kezia says at the end of the story, “You can come and see our doll’s house if you want to,” and Lil answered, “Your ma told our ma you wasn’t to speak to us.” It reflects social distinctions and unfairness on the part of society where because of the status, the children are not allowed to talk to the higher class or Burnells. They knew better than to come anywhere near the Burnells” (Mansfield, 2012, p. 137). It is the ideology that promotes false consciousness. From the story, Mansfield tried to established that power is based on wealth and material possessions. Society has the power to be unified but the bourgeoisie never liked this to happen because if there is a concept of classless society then both will be judged on equal grounds and this is not possible.

References

1Shahid Iqbal, 2M. Nabeel Ehtisham, 3Syed Farqaleet K. Bukhari, 4Shahid Mahmood
1Assistant Professor, Management Studies Department, Bahria University, Islamabad Campus, Pakistan, siqbal.buic@bahria.edu.pk
2Managing Director, All Seasons Seed Corporation, Sahiwal, Pakistan, nabeelehtisham@gmail.com
3MS (Project Management) student, Management Studies Department, Bahria University, Lahore Campus, Pakistan, syedfarqaleet@gmail.com
4Lecturer, Institute of Aviation studies, University of Management and Technology, Lahore, Pakistan, shahid-mahmood@umt.edu.pk

ARTICLE DETAILS
History
Revised format: November 2020
Available Online: December 2020

Keywords
Project Risk Management; Engineering Management, Project Planning; Construction Project Success

JEL Classification
M10, M11

ABSTRACT
Project Risk management is known as an important workout for the achievement of desired objectives for the construction projects. Success in construction project is quantified by attaining its enactment in terms of project quality, project cost, project time, project safety. Construction projects in Pakistan, typically in the whole world have a high risk of being pointedly late and over budget. However, a bit of schedule and cost related risks are unavoidable in any construction project around the world. It was found out that the engineers were generally nominated earlier the design phase of any project. Due to this reason maximum projects did not get the advantage from SMEs at the planning stage of the project. This study also supports that project managers who are engineers be involved in construction projects site selection, in preliminary budget and schedule development by using good Engineering Management Practices.

© 2020 Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: nabeelehtisham@gmail.com

1. Introduction
The motivation for this research is to have an in-depth analysis of a relationship between Risk management and project Performance. Focused area of research was risk management at planning phase and its overall effect on Construction Projects in Pakistan. A lot of work has already been done on the field of risk management related to performance of construction projects. Mostly the managing risks on construction projects is consider as part of project execution. But effect of Risk Management at planning stage is yet the area in Pakistani construction projects which need more intensive research in order to accomplish momentous performance. Due to the reason that the construction industry is one of the fastest growing industry of Pakistan with rate of 12.1% & contributing 2.4% to the GDP of the country [State Bank of Pakistan (SBP) 2018], so the risk management at planning stage should be examined exploited to see the effect on project performance (Haider & Kayani, 2020). Therefore, there
is huge room of improvement and research gap is present to increase the performance of construction projects by analyzing the effect of risk management at planning phase of projects in Pakistan. Planning is actually vital part of a project concerning performance of project & project success (Ahsan et al., 2020). It is a continuous and repeatable course throughout project life cycle. (Idoro, 2012). Previous research recommended that the companies must expand the performance by keeping this core phase of planning in mind (Lemma, 2014). Risk identification is an iterative process throughout the project lifecycle that includes the project team, project stakeholders and senior management affected by or who may affect the project outcome, and lastly external entities who can comment on the process of the risk identification on the basis of their past experience (Wysocki, 2004). Early identification of risks at planning phase or a tender of construction project and evaluating their comparative importance, the project management may be improved to decrease the risks and allot them to the groups who are best able to control them or engage them should they happen (Iqbal et al., 2020). Studies must be carried out at initial phases in the project life cycle, earlier choices are made to remain with the project (Thompson and Perry, 1992).

2. Literature Review
2.1 Project Risk Identification
Project Risk management is one of the 9th “knowledge areas” disseminated by the PMI - “Project Management Institute”. PMBOK® Guide identifies the 09 “knowledge areas” distinctively for almost all projects. Risk Management is a difficult/crucial feature of the project management.

![Fig 1: Project Risk Management overview](image)

The Management of risk in the construction project setting is a complete & systematic method for the categorizing, scrutinizing and retorting to risks to accomplish the project aims & objectives (PMI, 2008; ICE, 2005). Main choices and influence on the high-quality of preparation and choice of construction should be complete at the initial phase of a project, Using the risk management and Engineering Management Practices at this initial phase of the project is very imperative (Eskesen, Tengborg, Kampmann, & Veicherts, 2004).

The risk inspection & Engineering Management methods have been defined by numerous authors (Cretu, 2011; Chapman C, 2003; Ahmed, 2007, Klemetti, 2006; Smith NJ, 2006). The identification of Risks contains the appreciation of likely risk event in the construction project & clarification of the risk accountabilities (Wang, Dulaimi, & Aguria, 2004). To identify & restraint any project risks is so critical phase in controlling of the efficacious projects (Iqbal et al., 2020). According to “Practice Standard for Project Risk Management” (PMI,2009, p. 25) “risk cannot be succeeded except it is first renowned. So, afterward risk management process targets to classify all the intelligible risks to project objectives, though, it is very difficult to distinguish/find out all the risks at the start of a project”

2.2 Engineering Management Practices
The Engineering Management (EM) practices had been used all over the world from hundreds of years, Though, the academics and construction industry had used the practices Engineering Management (EM)
for the last forty years. Engineering Management (EM) is usually linked with Industrial Engineering as a common discipline. (Blanchard, B. S. 2004). The Strategies for Engineering Project Management is to systematized & on time is critical for engineering project management. The greatest way for the ensuring that your project team might stay within the time limit i.e. schedule is by inferring ahead of time line how long each activity/milestone of project should execute. (Allen, et al., 2004). Engineer selection is ranked as 5th major cause of construction projects failure out of 33 major causes identified (Dr.Manzoor.A.Khaldi, Causes of Construction Project Failures in Pakistan). Most of the time engineer is involved in design phase of the projects & planning phase cannot get value input from expert engineer. Same observed in the case study of 1st Panama Canal (H.Jng, J.C. Critn, & M. Xu. M colocation (Meeting) on 16-12-2009).

![Fig 2: Engineering Management Practices in construction project management](image)

2.3 Project Site Selection
In Pakistan site selection in many mega projects becomes difficult due to lack of early stakeholder engagement in projects like metro bus, orange line, & past controversial projects like kala bagh dam. Site selection is considered as one of the main factors which effects the project performance in all three aspects time, cost, scope. Site selection is ranked as 8th major cause of construction projects failure out of 33 major causes identified (Dr. Manzoor.A.Khaldi, Causes of Construction Project Failures in Pakistan). The selection of site disturbs the organization, the visual qualities of a building; sustainability; massing; functionality; security; and lastly operation and economic efficiency (GSA, 2001, AlKahtani et al., 2020). The problem solving & decision-making for site of venture is multifaceted (Ja, Bi, & Adjuk, 2013).

2.4 Projects Preliminary Budget & Schedule
For the development of an appropriate budget for the projects and its scheduling is a very important phase for the success of any construction project. Customers & designers need to be come to an agreement on the expected price at early planning stage. It is so precarious phase as for as the cost management process is concerned. subsequently an erroneous budget can lead to meager project performance.

It is a common mistake at the “planning stage” to use a schedule of housing with areas & apply some past costs without making adjustments for the numerous “factors” which disturb the construction costs i.e, the size of project, its location, price of the project upsurges due to the reason that the date of the data was used and procurement method just like outsourcing ("WBDG, 2011").

2.5 Project Time Performance
The schedule of project can also have represented graphically by means of milestone charts, histograms, schedule network diagrams and bar charts of the project. The baseline of schedule is established from the network study of the schedule that was documented & acknowledged by the project manager and its
team as the baseline with start dates and end dates. The baseline is an important component in controlling and managing schedule.

The performance is assessed using techniques such as “SV - schedule variance”, “SPI - schedule performance index” & EVM - earned value management. These methods support to weigh the degree of “SV - schedule variance”. The “CCM critical chain method” associates the sum of buffer outstanding to the amount of buffer needed to protect the delivery date (PMI, 2008).

2.6 Project Cost Performance

“Cost is very significant factors of a project success throughout the life cycle of project management” (Azhar et al., 2008). Gido & Clements (2003) stated cost as the most important parameter in project management and widely accepted in industry and literature. Earned Value Analysis (EVA) is used to analyze the cost performance of projects.

The task spending which originates from the arranging cycle must be practical, feasible, and developed on authoritatively arranged expenses and articulation of work. The financial backing ought to incorporate best gauges, chronicled expenses or modern designing measures as premise. The budget must recognize planned necessities of manpower, “MR - management reserve”.

Execution results measures are quantitative dimensions & include such things as, working cost, working amount, working nature and time-to-finish (Kerzner, 2009). It can be very easy or very complex when monitoring the project cost. In project management, one should also study the desires of all project stakeholders related to cost of project (Gido and Clements, 2003).

Execution results measures are quantitative dimensions & include such things as, working cost, working amount, working nature and time-to-finish (Kerzner, 2009).

![Research Model](image)

Figure 3: Research Model

H1: Project Risk identification at project planning phase is (+ive) positively related with Project success.
H2: Engineer Management Practices are (+ive) positivity associated with Project Success.
H3: Project Site Selection is (+ive) positivity associated with Project success.
H4: Project Preliminary Budget and Schedule is (+ive) positivity associated with Project success.

3. Research Methodology

The proposed study is design to get opinions from project managers, consulting engineers, architects, quantity surveyors & contractors with respect to project risk management and schedule and cost performance in project planning phase. In order to collect primary data, questionnaire was adapted. Online survey was used out of various available approaches to collect data for the research study. Online questionnaire was distributed to the respondents through Email and WhatsApp. A survey method has
been used extensively prior as well, so the respondents are comfortable in answering survey questions. All responses are collected through online questionnaire as respondents were uneasy to fill the hardcopy of the questionnaire.

3.1. Population
The population of the research study consist of registered engineers, project managers and professionals related to construction industry in Pakistan. The key clients in construction industry are Water and Power Development Authority of Pakistan (WAPDA), Planning and Development (P&D) Punjab, Sindh, KPK, Baluchistan, Azad Jammu Kashmir & Gilgit Baltistan (AJ&K, GB) and Irrigation Department of Pakistan. The main contractors working in construction industry of Pakistan are Descon Engineering ltd, Banu Mukhtar Contracting ltd, Frontier Works Organization and many more. The main consultants in construction industry of Pakistan are Descon Engineering ltd, SMEC Pakistan, Pakistan Engineering Services (PES), Mott MacDonald Pakistan (MMP). The regularity authorities are Public Procurement Regulatory Authority PPRA, Provisional Government Regulatory Authorities.

The sampling frame consist of engineers/ architects, project managers, and senior managers working at mega construction projects. The targeted population for sampling of data involves client, contractor and consultant of the following Projects Gulpur Hydro Power Project (AJ&K), Kurram Tangi Multi-Purpose Dam (KPK), Guddu Barrage (Punjab). Karot Dam Project (AJ&K), Wind Farm (Sindh) Six to Twelve Mega Projects of Pakistan’s Construction Industry.

3.2. Place of Study
The research study was conducted on five to ten mega construction projects of Pakistan. Almost one mega project from each region of the country.

3.3. Sample Size
Hair et. al. (2006)” the choice of sample size is representing of your target respondents effectively as it is difficult for the researcher to get the sample from whole population”. Some researchers think that sample size should not be very small or very large and should be within suitable range of 100 to 200 samples for proper data analysis. Green (1991)” sample size may be identified from the number of independent variables used in the research study”. Cohen (1968) says that “larger is better”. “Some of the researchers have developed the rule of thumb for selecting 10-15 samples collection for each independent variable” (Field 2012). So therefore, a sample size of 5 to 10 mega construction projects with overall 200 samples was proposed for the research study. A total of 215 responses were received with 100% background from construction industry.

3.4. Data Collection Tool
Survey technique was adopted for the collection of data. Questionnaire was made accessible in hard printed formatted as well as electronically for respondent convenience. Instruction regarding the questionnaire were mentioned on it to remove any ambiguity. The questionnaire did not contain identity, personal contact information, information related to company confidentiality so that the research respondents do not feel hesitation to fill the online questionnaire.

3.5. Data Processing and Analysis
Analysis is a collaborative process by which answers are studied to see whether the results are related to each research question (Backström & Hursh-Cesar, 1981). Data Analysis is a technique of gathering, converting, validating, and modeling the data with purpose of determining the required information. The results so acquired are communicated, proposing conclusions, and supporting decision-making. Quantitative analysis of data contains the calculation of frequencies of variables and variances between variables. A quantitative approach is usually related with discovering evidence to either accept or reject the hypotheses we have framed at the former phase of our research process. Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) was used to perform quantitative statistical analysis for questionnaire. Regression and correlation tests were performed to examine the connection between the independent and dependent variables involved in the research study.
A Sample size of 6 to 12 mega construction projects with overall 250 samples was proposed for the research study. A total of 215 valid responses were received with 100% background from construction industry as shown in the table below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Response Table (a) Stats</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>N Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missing</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.6. Data Analysis Technique
The method of data analysis includes gathering of the data, its arrangement, descriptive statistics, frequency statistics and analysis of respondent’s demographics, calculating reliability measures, and performing the correlation. SPSS was used for the analysis. Hypotheses were verified and tested by applying regression and correlation analysis.

3.7. Project Risk Identification and Project Performance
The below given data indicates that “Project Risk Identification: was a good independent variable for Project Performance. In this analysis where variable “Project Risk Identification” is independent variable and dependent variable is “Project Performance”, the value of adjusted R square is (.174) which shows the fitness of this model. β value is (.425) which implies that 49.4% of variations occur in the dependent variable due to 1% change in the independent variable. The “F” Value (30.606) shows that the hypothesis is acceptable because the value of “T” is greater than “2” which is 4.528. Model is fit because significance value is 0.00 which shows the significant relationship of both variable i.e. Independent variable and dependent variable. β value is also in permissible range. So, the model is an excellent depiction of result. Hence, therefore hypothesis H1 is accepted.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mod Summary(RI)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Predic: (Const), RI

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mod</th>
<th>Sum of Squr.</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean Squr.</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Reg</td>
<td>176.730</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>177.730</td>
<td>20.505</td>
<td>.000*b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resi</td>
<td>868.108</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>8.668</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1055.691</td>
<td>250</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Depend Vari: PRJPER
b. Predic: (Const), RI

shows the results of reliability test, which shows the value of Cronbach’s (α) .763 for the no of items 13 used, which is in threshold limit and validates that the data is reliable. Table highlights the descriptive Statistics of engineer/architect selection (EAS), as shown in the table engineer/architect selection achieved mathematical mean of 3.9013 and standard deviation of .49765. Skewness and kurtosis are also in permissible range.
### Table (a) Reliability Stats(EAS)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cronbach's (α)</th>
<th>No of Items</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>.763</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table (b) Descr. Stats (EAS)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>N</th>
<th>Min</th>
<th>Max</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Devi</th>
<th>Skewness</th>
<th>Kurtosis</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Stats</td>
<td>Stats</td>
<td>Stats</td>
<td>Stats</td>
<td>Stats</td>
<td>Stats</td>
<td>Stats</td>
<td>Stats</td>
<td>Stats</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engineer Architect Selection No</td>
<td>215</td>
<td>1.93</td>
<td>5.10</td>
<td>3.9013</td>
<td>.49765</td>
<td>-.173</td>
<td>.249</td>
<td>2.265</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 3.9. Correlation
The correlation analysis indicated a strong correlation between the Engineering Management Practices and project performance. It is identified that the relationship is significant at 99% level of confidence, which shows that variables are strongly connected with one and other. Variables functionality, time, cost and communication are positively related with method and time of Engineering Management Practices with strong relation at significance level 0.01, which is also depicted in the table below. All the variables are positively related with each other. All results depict the variables are related with each other and with project performance parameters. The Engineering Management Practices is positively related to project success is in line with the previous literature and research.

### 3.10. Project Site selection
Table shows the results of reliability test for site selection variable data, which shows the value of Cronbach’s (α) .798 for the no of items 8 used, which is in threshold limit and validates that the data is reliable.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cronbach's (α)</th>
<th>No of Items</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>.758</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table Case Summary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Per%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td>211</td>
<td>97.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exclu²</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>215</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table highlights the descriptive Statistics of engineer/architect selection (EAS), as shown in the table engineer/architect selection achieved mathematical mean of 3.4938 and standard deviation of .63624. Skewness .040 and kurtosis .484 are also in permissible range.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>N</th>
<th>Min</th>
<th>Max</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Devi</th>
<th>Skewness</th>
<th>Kurtosis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Stats</td>
<td>Stats</td>
<td>Stats</td>
<td>Stats</td>
<td>Stats</td>
<td>Stats</td>
<td>Stats</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.11. Project Preliminary Budget and Schedule
The below given data indicates that “Preliminary Budget and schedule development” was weak independent variable for Project Performance. In this analysis where variable “Preliminary Budget and schedule development” is independent variable and dependent variable is “Project Performance”, the value of adjusted R square is (.131) which shows the fitness of this model. β value (.390) which implies that 37% of variation will be observed in the dependent variable because of 1% change in the independent variable. The “F” Value (15.046) Shows that the hypothesis are acceptable because the value of “T” is greater than “2” which is 3. 879. Model is fit because significance value is 0.00 which shows the significant relationship of both variable i.e. Independent variable and dependent variable. β value is also in permissible range. So, the model is an excellent depiction of result. Hence, therefore hypothesis H4 is accepted.

Table Mod Summary (BSD)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mod</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>R Squ.</th>
<th>Adjusted R Squ.</th>
<th>Std. Error of the Estimate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>.390a</td>
<td>.137</td>
<td>.131</td>
<td>3.06071</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Predic: (Const), BSD

Table F² (BSD)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mod</th>
<th>Sum of Squar.</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean Squar</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>140.950</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>140.950</td>
<td>15.046</td>
<td>.000a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resi</td>
<td>889.957</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>9.368</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1030.907</td>
<td>96</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Depend Vari: PRJPER
b. Predic: (Const), BSD

4. Conclusion and Recommendations
The research study showed that Project Risk Management Practices & Engineering Management Practices at the stage of the “planning phase” had an influence on project performance. This study also demonstrates that the construction projects in Pakistan had some input from a skilled architect and engineer. Though, most of the participants had not studied the subject of risk management. Pakistan’s construction industry is the major industry of the country contributing significantly to the social and economic development growth of Pakistan. The expenses on development schemes in Pakistan for year 2018-2019 is projected at Rs 1,152.1 billion Pakistani Rupees, which is equivalent to 19.4% of total budget. Extensive research is required in the field of risk management with respect to construction industry to better optimize the allocated budget. Very little research evidence is available in context to Pakistan’s construction industry. The researcher recommends the similar study including more projects with increase sample size. It is also recommended to conduct longitudinal study instead of cross-sectional to increase the accuracy and updating of data collection.

References


Hyunju Jeong, John C. Crittenden, and Ming Xu Messner Meeting on Dec 16, 2009. Panama Canal case study.


Murphy, D. C., Baker, B. N., & Fisher, D. (1974). Determinants of project success, Grant No. NGR 22-003-028 for National Aeronautics and Space Administration, Management Institute, School of Management, Boston College, Boston, MA.


Pre and Post Covid-19 Lockdown: How the Aqi of Three Major Cities of Pakistan will Change?

Ume Laila¹, Najma Sadiq², Tahir Mehmood³, Tooba Rehan Haqqi⁴

¹Assistant Professor, Government & Public Policy, School of Social Sciences and Humanities (S3H), National University of Sciences and Technology (NUST), H-12 Sector, Islamabad, Pakistan, dr.umelaila@s3h.nust.edu.pk

²Assistant Professor, Head of the Department, Department of Mass Communication, School of Social Sciences and Humanities (S3H), National University of Sciences and Technology (NUST), Islamabad, Pakistan, najmasadiq@gmail.com

³Assistant Professor, Department of Communication studies, BahaUddin Zakariya University, Multan, Pakistan, tahirmahmood@bzu.edu.pk

⁴Graduate Public Administration, Department of Government & Public Policy, National University of Sciences and Technology (NUST), H-12 Sector, Islamabad, Pakistan, Tooba.bpa16s3h@s3h.nust.edu.pk

 ARTICLE DETAILS

Revised format: November 2020
Available Online: December 2020

Keywords
COVID-19 Lockdown, Air Pollution, Air Quality Index, Karachi AQI, Islamabad AQI, Lahore AQI

JEL Classification
M0, M12

ABSTRACT

Pakistan being in the list of developing countries has shown tremendous response towards the control of pandemic COVID-19. This paper evaluates the pre and post COVID 19 lockdown situation of air quality and provides an evidence of the air quality amid the lockdown and how it started to improve. The air quality indexes of three major cities of Pakistan i.e. Karachi, Islamabad and Lahore are compared, taking into account the indexes before and after the imposition of lockdown. The city wide presence of major pollutants like Sulphur Dioxide and Nitrogen Dioxide also reduced. The results show how taking serious measures can help in reducing the air pollution and help the environment to restore. Following analytical approach and situational analysis certain inferences have been drawn that the air quality index has worsen, and the atmospheric condition have turn out to be shoddier than the pre-pandemic situation. In the last section certain policy recommendations have been provided in order to maintain a healthy air quality.

© 2020 Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: dr.umelaila@s3h.nust.edu.pk


1. Introduction

The new year 2020 came along with Global Health Emergency due to the Covid-19 (coronavirus) pandemic. With the reckless spread of the virus, countries started to observe lockdowns, and obviously, Pakistan also had to do so. Starting from Karachi in late February the major cities like Islamabad, Lahore Peshawer, etc imposed curfews and lockdowns. With this decision, nearly all production houses were shut down, air transport was restricted, the commercial sector dumped, people started to work and
school from home which meant no traffic on roads. The environmental revamping has become a by-product of this pandemic and the major component of this is the improving air quality index of a country like Pakistan, the catalog of which had fallen to hazardous levels (Pakistan Air Quality Index and Air Pollution Information, 2020). The case of improvement is not only in Pakistan but all over the world. This study shall keep in focus the three main cities of Pakistan which happen to be the busiest and the most polluted cities of Pakistan. The research shall focus on the comparison of pre and post AQIs of the three cities.

2. Literature Review
Various authors have tried to investigate how lockdowns due to COVID have impacted the environmental conditions of either the specific area or the impact is worldwide. Saeida, Deepak and Mustansar have explained in their article, Environmental Perspective of COVID-19, that due to the reduced economic activities the condition of water and air is improving day by day. Quoting directly from the article, the authors have used the following words to explain the situation prevalent around the world "All over the world, flights have been canceled and transport systems have been closed. Overall, the economic activities have been stopped and stock markets dropped along with the falling carbon emission. However, the lockdown of the COVID-19 pandemic caused the air quality in many cities across the globe to improve and drop in water pollution in some parts of the world" (Saeida, Deepak, & Mustansar, 2020). Not only this Rui and Acheng in their article "Does Lockdown reduces Air Pollution?" have discussed the atmospheric condition of 44 cities in Northern China. They claim that due to the travel restrictions imposed the concentration of pollutant gases has declined by 24% (maximum). Apart from this other factor which proved beneficial for atmospheric restructuring include less human mobility and reduced consumption and production. After careful analysis, the study revealed that the Air Quality Index of Northern China decreased by 7.80% during the lockdown period (Rui & Acheng, 2020). In a separate article named “Air Quality Change In Seoul, South Korea Under Covid-19 Social Distancing: Focusing On PM2.5” by Beom-Soon Han and others, have augmented the reduction of PM2.5 particles and other air pollutants within 30-day time period. They have compared these results with that of 5-yeared data and concluded that social distancing has contributed in reducing the long-range pollutants transmission (Han, et al., 2020). Chang and Gong have discussed the Air Quality variation in different regions. In the article “Air Quality Variation in Wuhan, Daegu, and Tokyo during the Explosive Outbreak of COVID-19 and Its Health Effects” have iterated the positive effects due to the pandemic. The have proclaimed that the air quality of these three places have improved by analyzing the health conditions of 10-year old children, which is evidential from the fact that the time period of allergic airway infection in children has increased, meaning now it takes a lot of time to reach to the acute level (Ma & Kang, 2020). If at one point COVID 19 has had negative implications on the humanity it has for sure created some positive impacts for the mother nature. Considering the atmospheric conditions of India alone it has been observed that the atmosphere has revived due to the restricted human activities and reduced emissions (IShubham, Jingsi, Hongliang, & Sri, August 2020) (Jain & Tanya, 2020) (Kumari, 2020). European countries began to monitor the NOx composition over the region and found out vast difference of concentration of nitrogen oxides in atmosphere during lockdown and without lockdown (Menut, Bessagnet, & Siour, Nov 2020). Similarly, Spain and Barcelona carried out the largest experiment of time during the covid lockdown and experienced 75% reduction of pollutants in the environment which resultantly has improved the AQI of the two cities (Baldasano, Nov 2020).

2. Methods
2.1 Location Description
Islamabad is the capital of Pakistan and is the federally administrated capital. It is the 9th largest city and has a population of around 3.1 million. It covers an area of 906.5 km2 and has a humid subtropical climate with five seasons and heavy rainfalls. Islamabad is the port for immense air traffic and normal road traffic (Pak, 2017).

Karachi the largest city of Pakistan is the capital of Sindh province. It is a cosmopolitan city covering an area of 3780 km2 and has a total of 1.4 million population. It is the coastline of Pakistan and has hot
desert climate and receives little to no rainfall. The Jinnah Intl. Airport Karachi is the busiest airport and receives a total of 7.2 million passengers. same is the situation of the road network, where thousands of vehicles remain on the road and thus creating traffic problems (Gov, 2016).

Lastly, Lahore, the Metropolitan city of Pakistan is the capital of Punjab province and is the 2nd largest city after Karachi. Lahore covers an area of 1772 km2 with 1.1 million population and has a semi-arid climate with heavy rainfalls and thunderstorms. the city of Lahore receives average rate of air and road transport, and is a home for most of the VIP flights (GOV, 2014).

3. Results and Discussion
3.1 Pre Covid Air Quality Index
Air Quality Index tells the number of intoxicants present in the air and how to fit or unfit is the air to breathe. According to WHO, nearly 4.2 million people around the globe lose their lives due to inhalation of unhealthy air and in the past 1 year Pakistan has recorded 2000 deaths due to lungs disease which the people contracted by inhaling unhealthy air (Global Health Observatory Data, 2020). Talking about the situation of Air Quality Index December 2019 (US Consulate Air Pollution Pakistan, 2019-2020) of three major cities of Pakistan i.e. Islamabad, Karachi, and Lahore, when every sector was working at an optimal level the maximum and minimum levels of Air Quality Index were as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CITY</th>
<th>Islamabad</th>
<th>Lahore</th>
<th>Karachi</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MINIMUM INDEX</td>
<td>78 MODERATE LEVEL</td>
<td>171 UNHEALTHY LEVEL</td>
<td>102 UNHEALTHY LEVEL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAXIMUM INDEX</td>
<td>213 VERY UNHEALTHY LEVEL</td>
<td>478 HAZARDOUS LEVEL</td>
<td>210 VERY UNHEALTHY LEVEL</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: Air Quality Index of Islamabad, Lahore, Karachi December 2019 (Source: Real-Time Air Quality Index)

The above table clearly shows how bad was the air condition in December 2019, the index reaching the hazardous levels. But the situation did begin to improve after the lockdown was imposed. The indexes dropped drastically, and the Quality of Air began to improve. The level of air pollutants in the atmosphere began to decline as no more factories were emitting hazardous SO2, neither the aircraft and vehicles were combusting their fuels and producing NO2 and other sources of carbon footprints were minimized. This improvement was traced by the real-time satellites. According to the Real-Time Index, the air quality of the cities Islamabad, Lahore, and Karachi has improved in April and May, when the lockdown was at the peak point. For simplicity of this graph maximum values of PM 2.5 have been taken, which reveals a sharp improvement in the air Quality Index. Furthermore, it should be noted that before the lockdown, the unhealthy levels of Air Quality used to remain for 10to15 days but after the imposition of the lockdown the maximum level reached was only for one day (US Consulate Air Pollution Pakistan, 2019-2020).
3.2 Post Lockdown Air Quality Conditions

Despite this revamping, the real question comes "will the situation be the same after the lockdown is hauled up?" the answer is NO. There are numerous reasons behind this answer which shall be discussed in detail. Firstly, after calling off this lockdown, the production houses will resume their work. By production house, it means all sorts of factories from textiles to steel mills to brick kilns every workshop. This is fine because economic activity must resume now and then, but the thing which is alarming for us is the factories that will be operating and producing commodities at a faster rate. More production means more combustion of fuel to run the machines and thus increased the dumping of wastes and by-products. Not only that, recently the factories are working day and night to meet the loss incurred by them from February till May which means extra power consumption and hence again a shortage of electricity. The shortage of electricity in Pakistan is a different subject hence keeping it aside, but the main problem which needs not to be ignored is the pollutants released in the atmosphere by the factories.

3.3 Increased SOx Presence in Atmosphere

The textile industry in Pakistan has resumed its production. To meet the online orders and other demands in the market, the factories are functioning for up to 14 hours thus emitting dangerous chemicals into the air. The major proportion is of Sulphur Dioxide, other toxins include Nitrogen Dioxide and Suspended Particulate Matter (SPM) (Various Pollutants Released into Environment by Textile Industry, 2012). These pollutants are the major reason that spikes the air pollution. The enhanced proportion of Sulphur dioxide does not only decline the quality of air index but also imposes the threat on the people prone to asthma and other diseases related to the lungs. This situation is witnessed in China too after the lockdown was lifted and the economic activity was resumed. Through the following picture, captured from NASA’s official website, the SO2 presence over China's North region shows the emission due to resumed factory production. The three pictures below demonstrate three different days and similarly three different cases of SO2 presence over the Pakistani Region. It should be kept in mind that the complete lockdown was only called off in the region of Islamabad and Lahore but not in Karachi. The first picture illustrates blue covering which is the minimum level of SO2 presence in the atmosphere (Atmospheric Composition of Sulphur Dioxide, 2020). This is the accepted levels of Sulphur Pollutant which at minimum effects the Air Quality Index. But the situation started to deteriorate once the factories started operating and the color suddenly changes from blue to green. Although up till green the Sulphur presence in the atmosphere is deemed not to be dangerous the inference here which can be drawn is that within 10 days the concentration is increasing radically hence I assume that within a month or so the Sulphur concentration will again reach the hazardous concentration that is 3.85 Column Mass and above; this concentration of Sulphur has been reached by
China. The Centre for Research on Energy and Clean Air (CREA) in China has published a report showing a sharp increase in the SO2 presence over the region where the factories are operational. CREA claims that by comparing the accumulation of SO2 in May-June 2019 and May-June 2020 revealed that the levels have exceeded the pre-pandemic era. CREA now fears that if some controlling policies are not implemented the situation might go worse which may prove to be alarming for the people living in there (Lauri, 2020).

![SO2 Column Mass Map](image1)

![SO2 Column Mass Map](image2)
3.4 Increased NOx Presence in Atmosphere

The Prime Minister of Pakistan has issued a notice to lift all air travel restrictions by June 15th, which means that from then onwards all the airlines will be operating their respective flights and not only the national flag carrier. Like other industries, the airline industry is the most affected one and has seen a major financial setback. After the restrictions are called off, airlines will be operating many flights to fill the fiscal deficit. Not only that people stranded all over Pakistan especially shall continue their travel. Aircraft emit various pollutants due to the combustion of various fuels and mainly diesel. This combustion releases toxic pollutants which include Carbon Dioxide, Oxides of Sulphur, Oxides of Nitrogen, unburnt Hydrocarbons, Carbon Monoxide, and Particulate Matter (European Aviation Environmental Report, 2017) . Carbon Dioxide and Oxides of Nitrogen are the two pollutants that form the major proportion of emission by combustion. But the recent studies reveal that percentage of Nitrogen Oxides emitted by aircraft in the atmosphere is increasing incredibly as compared to Carbon Dioxide. For the past three months from 23rd March 2020 till 15th June 2020, all the domestic flights were canceled, only the chartered international flights were being operated by Pakistan International Airline and all other airlines were shut down. In this period at most 35 flights had been operated, which is only 10 percent of the flights which come in and out of Pakistan in a day. It should be noted that in this period the levels of Nitrogen Oxide had been reduced as revealed by the satellites of NASA, but once all airliners are operating the situation won't be the same. The levels of Nitrogen Oxide will increase sharply and thus the Air Quality Index of each city might face an alarming situation.

But this pollutant is not only restricted to the aircraft or jetliners. It is also released by the combustion in vehicles. After the lockdown is elevated, all business activities and corporate sector will resume working. Since 26th February in Karachi and from 13Th March 2020 in Islamabad and Lahore, everyone was working from home and people were going out only to buy necessities. Least intercity travels had been observed with many people quarantining themselves at home. But once the offices reopen and the corporate sector continues its working, people will have to rejoin their offices. Not only
that, due to the fear of contagion pandemic virus, but many people will also avoid using public transport and will surely be using their private conveyance. Which means more vehicles on the road with more traffic jams. This is what Kate Abnett has discussed in her article regarding the situation of pollutants in China after the lockdown is called off. She says that the concentration of some pollutants has risen way above what China had in the same days last year. She says that the situation of air quality in China began to worsen when the people started to drive their private cars to work instead of using the monorails and other public transport. The traffic jams in densely populated areas are causing threats and reports claim that over 1500 people are vulnerable to death due to the inhalation of intoxicants mainly nitrogen oxides (Kay, 2020).

Moreover, the satellites of NASA have revealed a sweeping of NO2 present in the troposphere above Pakistan. The environmentalists of NASA claim that this reduction in the pollutants is merely due to the reduced use of aerosols, and combustible liquids (Global Nitrogen Dioxide Monitoring, Pakistan, 2020). But the following figures retrieved from NASA’s official websites explain the situation of Nitrogen Dioxide present in the troposphere of 3 major cities. The graphs present below each satellite image shows the increasing trend on Nitrogen Oxides in the atmosphere post-travel (both air and ground) restrictions are lifted, for the ease of understanding and purpose of comparison, the time between April and June has been highlighted.

![Satellite Capture of NOx Presence Over Lahore City (Source: NASA)](image1)

![Graph of NOx Emissions in Lahore City (Source NASA)](image2)
On comparing the NOx condition of all the three cities, it is evidential that due to lifting of lockdown...
and allowing air travel to and from Lahore and Islamabad the emissions have an increasing trend, whereas by looking into the case of Karachi the emissions are at a constant rate as the smart lockdown is still in place.

4. CONCLUSION
These arguments are only valid to the point if no radical step is either taken by the relevant authorities or the individuals themselves. It should also be noted that these are mere projections based on the past track record of what the air quality was in Pakistan and a collar drawn while considering the post-lockdown atmospheric situation in China. But nothing is impossible in this world. Pakistan has a lot more potential than other countries to make it a better place to live and a region having a healthy atmospheric condition. For this, the environmental agencies along with the relevant ministry must work hard and draw certain policies that shall prove beneficial for the country and our future generations. Certain policy recommendations are given below:

Policy#1: All Commercial Activities to Be Restricted Between 9 Am. To 5 Pm.
If the government restricts all the commercial activities (including malls and other shopping arcades) between 0900-1700 hrs, this will be beneficial for Pakistan not only in the environmental aspect but economically also. By restricting the activities in these hours, the energy consumption will be least as daylight illuminates and reduces the need for electricity to 10-20%, in return Pakistan shall not be facing any sorts of “Electricity Shortfalls”. Not only that the traffic jams in the peak hours can be avoided as the traffic shall be evenly distributed all over the day.

Policy#2: Controlling the Air Traffic
The air traffic should be restricted. This can be done by limiting the number of international flights landing in and taking off from all over Pakistan in a day. For instance, if 100 aircraft of international airlines land here in Pakistan, reduce the traffic by permitting let's say only 50 flights in a day. This will not only be helpful for the domestic airlines as they will get a chance to operate flights but will also reduce the combustion emissions from the aircraft.

Policy#4: Turning Towards Renewable Energy
Finally, is moving towards renewable energy, moreover solar energy. Pakistan has the potential of producing 100,000 MW of electricity from solar energy. Islamabad is in the province of Punjab where it experiences about 5.0-5.5 kWh/m2/day of normal solar radiations that are considered best rays to operate solar cells. If in Islamabad alone solar panels are installed it can operate about 500,000 streetlights of 400 MW which can replace the sodium lights mounted. Apart from this many small localities that are far from the national grid can be facilitated by solar energy. According to a given estimate, if solar panels are installed in the outskirts of Islamabad, they can lighten up to 40,000 villages 24/7 that are not provided with electricity even for about 10 hours in a day (Intikhab, F, F, & Fayyaz, December 2012). Pakistan has a capacity to fight against any difficult situation. If proper remedies are taken the good air quality can be maintained even after all economic activities are resumed. As this paper has taken a situational approach thing might turn out to be different than the analysis but still in order to provide a habitable place for the future generation certain remedial actions must be taken by the government and by the individuals themselves.

References
Global Health Observatory Data. (2020). Retrieved from World Health Organization:
https://www.who.int/gho/phe/outdoor_air_pollution/burden/en/


Pakistan Air Quality Index and Air Pollution Information. (2020). Retrieved from Empowering the World to breath clean air- IQAir: https://www.iqair.com/pakistan


Money Demand Balances and Exchange Rate Policy in Pakistan: An ARDL and Non-ARDL Analysis

Shazia Sana, Shahnawaz Malik, Muhammad Ramzan Sheikh, Muhammad Hanif Akhtar
1PhD Student, The Women University Multan, Pakistan, shaziasana1@gmail.com
2Professor (Rtd), Department of Economics, The Women University, Multan, Pakistan, shahnawazmalik@bzu.edu.pk
3Associate Professor, School of Economics, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, Pakistan, ramzansheikh@bzu.edu.pk
4Professor, Department of Commerce, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, Pakistan, haneefakhtar@gmail.com

ABSTRACT
This paper investigates the impact of exchange rate changes across money demand balances in Pakistan by applying the linear and non-linear ARDL approaches. The study not only examines the impact of exchange rate changes across demand for money but also attempts to analyze whether demand for money is stable or not? For an estimation of money demand function, yearly time-series data have been used from the year 1972 to 2019. Findings of the linear ARDL model disclose that exchange rate and demand for money balances are positively and significantly associated with each other. Moreover, results of the non-linear ARDL model reveal that positive and negative exchange rate shocks have mixed effects on money demand. The results of the asymmetric test also demonstrate that exchange rate changes have symmetric effects on money demand while stability test results propose that money demand remains stable in Pakistan.

Keywords: Exchange rate, Money demand, ARDL, NARDL

JEL Classification: E41, O24

1. Introduction
Nominal exchange rate is defined as the rate at which one currency is exchanged for the other. Exchange rate, which is fixed by monetary authorities, using the foreign exchange reserves, is called fixed exchange rate while the one determined through the supply and demand for currency in foreign exchange markets, is called flexible exchange rate. Countries, especially developing countries have aim to stabilize the exchange rate because stable exchange rate is very meaningful for the achievement of sustainable progress (Edwards, 1989; Berka and Devereux, 2010) while the unstable exchange rate caused the distortion in the trade, investment, inflation and trade balance (Xiaopu, 2002; Eichengreen, 2008). Exchange rate is regarded as an intermediate policy variable that affects the economy through its impact on the domestic currency and inflation, capital flows, financial stability, external sector and exports and imports of the country. Exchange rate changes may affect the comparative prices and the spending level of the persons and firms if the wealth has a large share of foreign currency. Exchange rate

© 2020 Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0
may affect the economy via two different ways: depreciation and appreciation (Hanif et al., 2016).

Pakistani rupee was connected with the Pound in early 1971. In 1971, Pakistan pegged its currency with US dollar. Pakistan adopted the managed floating exchange rate that was helpful to minimize the difference between official and market rate. In Pakistan financial sector transformation improved the banking system by increasing the share of private sector in the banking business in 1991. Multiple exchange rate system has adopted by Pakistan in 1998 through three different exchange rates, official exchange rate\(^2\), Floating interbank rate\(^3\) and Composite rate\(^4\). In 1999, Pakistan was integrated multiple exchange rate system in which rupee is fixed with US dollar and flexible within some limits. But in 2000, Pakistan had adopted the freely floating exchange rate by removing the limits on the exchange rate. Banks had adopted their own exchange rate. Managed floating exchange rate was adopted by the Pakistan during the period 1982 to 2010 and Pakistani rupee was continuously depreciated about 700% from its start against the US dollar. So, Pakistani rupee’s value continuously decreases. The exchange rate among rupee and US dollar was 10.39 in 1982 that reached to 85.75 in 2010 that was considered about more than 700% decline in the value of rupee. That showed the large variation in the rupee dollar exchange rate. There were two main point of views of exchange rate determination and forecasting. First view is concerned with the determination of exchange rate through the demand and supply of the currency by using the balance of payment information. Second view is concerned with the relative stock of financial asset means financial asset of one country in terms of other country. The previous research work of exchange rate is based on the balance of payment approach and monetary approach including interest rate parity, QTM and money demand function (Saeed et al., 2012). Demand for money is very important function of the monetary policy. So monetary authorities control the monetary aggregates for the effective monetary policy. In small open economy like Pakistan, foreign interest rate and exchange rate determined the demand for money domestically under floating exchange rate system. Mundell (1963) was the first who introduced the relationship among the exchange rate and demand for money and explained that changes in the capital flows and foreign trade may cause to the changes in the demand for money function (Anwar and Asghar, 2012).

Theoretical background on money demand was started from the classical tradition. Classical view about the concept of money demand is divided into different parts, such as Pigou and Cambridge University economists. According to the Cambridge University economists, demand for money is defined as the people demand for money holdings. They explained choice determined determinants of real demand for money and it is called cash balance approach of money demand. Keynes determined the demand for money with additional variable of interest rate with negative relation. Post-Keynesian provided the various explanations about the money demand. Money as a medium of exchange function explain the transaction purpose of money demand with certainty whereas the precautionary demand for money introduced the transaction demand for money with uncertainty. Cash-in-advanced function also explain the medium of exchange function. Asset function investigates the role of demand for money in the portfolio management. Asset role of demand for money was advocated by the overlapping generations models. Money is considered as consumer goods like other goods in the consumer demand approach (Sriram and Adams, 1999).

Money demand is positively related to the exchange rate and the reason behind the positive relation between money demand and exchange rate is that if there is excess supply of money, this excess supply results in form of deficit in the balance of payments. Then there will be an automatic depreciation of the nation’s currency. It will lead to increase the prices and thus demand for money will also increase. To absorb the excess supply of money, the demand for money increases sufficiently to absorb this excess supply. According to the Monetary Approach of exchange rate\(^5\). Exchange rate have positive impact on

\(^2\)Exchange rate in which Pakistani rupee was pegged with US Dollar in fixed rate
\(^3\) Commercial bank estimates its exchange rate first time
\(^4\) It is the combination of official exchange rate and floating interbank rate
\(^5\) Monetary approach under Exchange rate was presented by Robert Mundell and Harry Johnson at the end of 1960 and it was fully developed during 1970.
the demand for money. Empirical studies also advocate the positive relation among ER and money including Megibany and Nourzad, 1995; McNown and Wallace, 1992; Bahmani-Oskooee, 1991; Bahmani-Oskooee et al., 1998.

The study is organized as: section 2 explains the review of literature, section 3 investigates the data, model and methodology. Section 4 illustrates the results and discussion. Section 5 concludes the whole study.

2. Review of Literature
This section illustrates the review of literature on the relationship between exchange rate and demand for money in Pakistan and rest of the world. Bah et al. (2019) pointed out that dollar appreciation had long lasting impact than the dollar depreciation. Study also determined that exchange rate had short-run impact on the demand for money rather than long run in Gambia. Vargas-Silva (2009) by using structural VAR model concluded that shocks in remittances was positively related to the demand for money. Remittances and exchange rate had bi-directional relationship. Exchange rate was negatively related to the positive shocks in the remittances. Hsing, (2007) explained that real demand for money balances had positive impact on real output. Real effective exchange rate had positive impact on the deposit rate and WIR. Moreover, depreciation in Poland currency and lower world interest rate increased the real output.

Kang et al. (2005) used VAR model and variance decomposition to explore the impact of pre-crisis and post-crisis period in industrial production in Korea. During pre-crisis, industrial production in Korea was not responded due to the depreciation of yen against dollar but after crisis period industrial production significantly declined. Nyumuah, (2018) explained that exchange rate volatility and interest rate volatility did not significantly impact demand for money in developing countries. Money demand of these countries had unstable function. The study suggested that the monetary authorities should have adopted the interest rate as a policy instrument. Megibany and Nourzad (1995) pointed out that fluctuations and instability in the exchange rate was negatively related to the demand for money. Hsing (2008) investigated that real demand for money balances had positive impact on the peso depreciation and real output whereas it had negative relationship between deposit rate, inflation expectation, foreign interest rate and demand for money. Marquez (1987) probed that domestic money and foreign money were both substitutable and elasticity of substitution of currencies was high. Foreign exchange consideration had significant impact on the demand for money in Venezuela. Bahmani-Oskooee and Malixi (2013) analyzed that short-run impact of the depreciation on the demand for money was not sure but the long run impact of the depreciation had negative impact on the demand for domestic money. Alsamara and Mrabet (2018) inferred that long-run negative impact of exchange rate was stronger than the short-run impact. Money demand was strongly influenced by the currency appreciation than currency depreciation because people of Turkey expected further appreciation after the appreciation occurred. Bahmani and Bahmani-Oskooee (2012) concluded that exchange rate in Iran had long-run as well as short-run influence on demand for money. Nyumuah (2018) found that demand for money functions in developing countries were verified to be unstable and that was why the impact of interest rate and exchange rate volatility on the money demand function in the developing countries was insignificant. The study suggested that monetary authorities should have imposed the inflation targeting monetary policy and used rate of interest as a policy instrument. Bahmani and Oskooee (1996) analyzed that black market exchange rate’s depreciation had positively related to the demand for money. Rehman and Afzal, (2003) concluded that demand for M² increased if black market exchange rate increased. M² was appropriate monetary aggregate for the effective policy construction. The study also highlighted the impact and importance of black-market exchange rate on Pakistan’s economy. Ghumro and Karim (2016) pointed out that exchange rate had positive and long run as well short run impact of exchange rate on the demand for money in Pakistan by using the linear ARDL approach. Various empirical pieces of research have been conducted on the relationship between demand for money and exchange rate in
different groups of countries like developed and developing countries and provided different results. Rest of studies apply various econometric techniques mostly simple linear ARDL technique. However, these previous studies have not applied non-linear ARDL to examine the results of positive and as well as negative shocks effect of exchange rate on the demand for money which has been applied in this paper.

3. Model Data and Methodology
The following model is money demand and exchange rate model, which estimates the impact of official exchange rate on the money demand with other independent variable which are GDP per capita growth, lending rate, inflation, federal fund rate.

\[ M_G = f(GDP, LR, INF, FFR, ER) \]

The econometric representation of the model is:

\[ M_G = \phi_0 GDP + \phi_1 LR + \phi_2 INF + \phi_3 FFR + \phi_4 ER + \epsilon \]

Where:
- \( M_G \) = Broad money (% of GDP)
- \( GDP \) = GDP growth (annual %)
- \( LR \) = Lending interest rate (%)
- \( INF \) = Inflation, consumer prices (annual %)
- \( FFR \) = Federal Fund Rate (annual %)
- \( ER \) = Official exchange rate (LCU per US$, period average)

To estimate the money demand function time series data are used from 1972 to 2019 for Pakistan. Data on GDPG, INF, M2G and ER are collected from World Development Indicators. Data on LR are collected from Handbook of Statistics on Pakistan Economy and data on FFR are collected from Federal Reserve System, USA. Linear and non-linear ARDL methodology is used for the estimation.

4. Results and Discussion
To explore the relationship between exchange rate and money demand balances, some empirical results have been discussed.

4.1 Descriptive Statistics and Correlation Analysis
This section explains descriptive statistics and correlation analysis of money demand and other variables. Descriptive statistic is very beneficial for explaining the basic characteristics of the data. Descriptive statistic is helpful for the handling and describing the large data. Descriptive analysis describes about the central tendencies like mean and median, measure of dispersions through max, min value and standard deviation. Measure of symmetries are skewness and Kurtosis. Descriptive statistics of key variables is presented in Table 1.

Table 1: Descriptive Statistics of Money Demand Balances and other Selected Variables (1972-2019)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Median</th>
<th>Max</th>
<th>Min</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Skew</th>
<th>Kurt</th>
<th>JB</th>
<th>Prob.</th>
<th>Obs.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>M2G</td>
<td>45.66</td>
<td>44.86</td>
<td>59.04</td>
<td>34.00</td>
<td>6.82</td>
<td>0.40</td>
<td>2.21</td>
<td>2.54</td>
<td>0.28</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDPG</td>
<td>4.79</td>
<td>4.84</td>
<td>10.22</td>
<td>0.81</td>
<td>2.10</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>2.75</td>
<td>0.21</td>
<td>0.90</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LR</td>
<td>11.59</td>
<td>11.41</td>
<td>15.42</td>
<td>6.99</td>
<td>2.06</td>
<td>-0.28</td>
<td>2.54</td>
<td>1.04</td>
<td>0.59</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INF</td>
<td>9.01</td>
<td>7.88</td>
<td>26.66</td>
<td>2.53</td>
<td>5.21</td>
<td>1.50</td>
<td>5.43</td>
<td>29.77</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FFR</td>
<td>5.13</td>
<td>5.05</td>
<td>16.49</td>
<td>0.09</td>
<td>3.92</td>
<td>0.66</td>
<td>3.10</td>
<td>3.46</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ER</td>
<td>46.55</td>
<td>33.86</td>
<td>150.04</td>
<td>8.68</td>
<td>37.01</td>
<td>0.83</td>
<td>2.74</td>
<td>5.64</td>
<td>0.06</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Authors’ calculations

The central tendencies of M2G mean value is 45.66 and median value is 44.86 which are approximately same because both represents the average values of M2G. GDPG’s mean value is 4.79 and median value is 4.84. Maximum value of M2G is 59.04 and minimum value is 34.00 and the range is 25.04 which is difference between the maximum value and minimum value. Same as the GDPG’s maximum value is
10.22 and its minimum value is 0.81 and range is 9.41 and same will be the case with the other variables like LR, INF, FFR and ER. Standard deviation shows the measure of dispersion from its central value. Measure of dispersion of variable is M₂G is 6.82 and GDPG is 2.10 and measure of dispersion of LR, INF, FFR and ER are 2.06, 5.21, 3.92 and 37.01 respectively. The value of skewness of M₂G is 0.40 and GDPG is 0.10 that is greater than zero that is the symptoms of positively skewed. According to the criteria M₂G, GDPG, LR and ER are the leptokurtic and INF and FFR are Platykurtic. The p values of JB shows the normality of the variables. According to the criteria INF and ER are not following normal distribution.

Correlation Matrix represents the degree of association between two variables. Table 2 shows the correlation analysis. Correlation among M₂G, GDPG, LR and INF is weak and negative. Correlation among the M₂G and FFR is moderate and negative. Correlation among M₂G and ER is strong and positive. Correlation among M₂G with its own value is perfect.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>M₂G</th>
<th>GDPG</th>
<th>LR</th>
<th>INF</th>
<th>FFR</th>
<th>ER</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>-0.26 (0.07)</td>
<td>-0.04 (0.80)</td>
<td>-0.12 (0.40)</td>
<td>-0.59 (0.00)</td>
<td>0.76 (0.00)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDPG</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>-0.42 (0.00)</td>
<td>-0.14 (0.36)</td>
<td>0.45 (0.00)</td>
<td>-0.34 (0.02)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LR</td>
<td>-0.04 (0.80)</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>0.33 (0.02)</td>
<td>-0.01 (0.93)</td>
<td>-0.05 (0.74)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INF</td>
<td>-0.12 (0.40)</td>
<td>-0.14 (0.36)</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>0.19 (0.20)</td>
<td>-0.21 (0.16)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FFR</td>
<td>-0.59 (0.00)</td>
<td>0.45 (0.00)</td>
<td>-0.01 (0.93)</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>-0.77 (0.00)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ER</td>
<td>0.76 (0.00)</td>
<td>-0.34 (0.02)</td>
<td>-0.05 (0.74)</td>
<td>-0.21 (0.16)</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Authors’ calculations

Correlation of GDPG with LR, INF, FFR and ER is weak and negative except FFR. Correlation of LR with INF, FFR and ER is weak and negative except INF which is moderate and positive. Correlation among INF and FFR is weak and positive whereas INF and ER is weak but negative. Correlation among FFR and ER is strong and negative. Correlation among ER with its own value is perfect.

4.2 Unit Root Analysis

Unit Root test is used to examine the stationarity or non-stationarity. The ADF test results are presented in Table 3.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Intercept</th>
<th>Lags</th>
<th>Intercept and Trend</th>
<th>Lags</th>
<th>None</th>
<th>Lags</th>
<th>Conclusion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>M₂G</td>
<td>-1.4285 (0.5604)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>-4.5707 (0.0034)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.1250 (0.7174)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>I(1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDPG</td>
<td>-5.2157 (0.0001)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>-5.9021 (0.0001)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>-1.6300 (0.0966)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>I(0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LR</td>
<td>-3.1778 (0.0278)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-3.1518 (0.1070)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-0.3260 (0.5624)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>I(1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INF</td>
<td>-3.2131 (0.0263)</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>-3.1688 (0.1049)</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>-1.4181 (0.1435)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>I(1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FFR</td>
<td>-0.7131 (0.8326)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>-3.9610 (0.0171)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-0.9248 (0.3103)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>I(1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ER</td>
<td>3.0558 (1.0000)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.6867 (0.9995)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.7964 (0.9999)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>I(1)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Authors’ Calculations

Table 3 explains the results of ADF test for the M₂G and other variables such as GDPG, LR, INF, FFR and ER. Table 3 indicates three equations with intercept, with intercept and trend and without intercept.
and trend that is none. All the variables are non-stationary except GDPG. In next section, ARDL analysis is applied on the behalf of ADF test.

4.3 Linear ARDL
ARDL approach is very useful to explain the long-run and short-run results in the single equation at a time. Under ARDL cointegration technique, the results are efficient and unbiased. ARDL does not care about the small sample size and provides best results when sample size is small as compared to the Johansen-Juselius cointegration approach which deals with large sample size (Sheikh and Chaudhry, 2013; Narayan and Narayan, 2008; Pesaran and Shin, 2001).

4.3.1 Bounds Test Analysis (for Linear ARDL)
Before estimating the long-run relations and ECM model, it is very important to test the existence of long-run relations among variables, whether the long-run relation among variables exists or not. Table 4 the upper segment shows the value of F statistic and Lower segment of Table 4 shows the critical values of bounds at different level of significance.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Test Statistic</th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>K</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>F-statistic</td>
<td>6.297136</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Critical Value Bounds

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Significance</th>
<th>I0 Bound</th>
<th>I1 Bound</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10%</td>
<td>2.26</td>
<td>3.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5%</td>
<td>2.62</td>
<td>3.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5%</td>
<td>2.96</td>
<td>4.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1%</td>
<td>3.41</td>
<td>4.68</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Authors’ calculations

According to Table 4 the value of F-Statistic’s lies above the I1 bound at different level of significance. that shows the existence of long-run relationship among the variables. After diagnosing the existence of the long-run relationship among the variable the next step is long-run and Error Correction estimation for the linear ARDL.

4.3.2 Long Run and Error Correction Analysis (for Linear ARDL)
This section explains the long-run and error correction results that are estimated by the ARDL approach to analyze the impact of exchange rate on the money demand. Error correction analysis is estimated for the short-run results. So, Table 5 explains both long-run and short-run results.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Coefficient</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>t-Statistic</th>
<th>Prob.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>22.534</td>
<td>5.996</td>
<td>3.757</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDPG</td>
<td>2.993</td>
<td>0.839</td>
<td>3.567</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LR</td>
<td>0.809</td>
<td>0.347</td>
<td>2.329</td>
<td>0.027</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INF</td>
<td>-0.099</td>
<td>0.194</td>
<td>-0.510</td>
<td>0.613</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FFR</td>
<td>-1.131</td>
<td>0.469</td>
<td>-2.409</td>
<td>0.023</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ER</td>
<td>0.113</td>
<td>0.031</td>
<td>3.641</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Error correction Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Coefficient</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>t-Statistic</th>
<th>Prob.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>D(M2G(-1))</td>
<td>0.458</td>
<td>0.161</td>
<td>2.839</td>
<td>0.008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(M2G(-2))</td>
<td>0.256</td>
<td>0.157</td>
<td>1.626</td>
<td>0.115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(GDPG)</td>
<td>0.281</td>
<td>0.245</td>
<td>1.146</td>
<td>0.261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(GDPG(-1))</td>
<td>-0.818</td>
<td>0.237</td>
<td>-3.441</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(GDPG(-2))</td>
<td>-0.682</td>
<td>0.234</td>
<td>-2.910</td>
<td>0.007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(LR)</td>
<td>0.589</td>
<td>0.260</td>
<td>2.264</td>
<td>0.031</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(INF)</td>
<td>-0.352</td>
<td>0.127</td>
<td>-2.767</td>
<td>0.010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(INF)</td>
<td>-0.481</td>
<td>0.139</td>
<td>-3.449</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(INF)</td>
<td>0.242</td>
<td>0.107</td>
<td>2.262</td>
<td>0.031</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(FFR)</td>
<td>-0.356</td>
<td>0.289</td>
<td>-1.231</td>
<td>0.228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(FFR(-1))</td>
<td>0.249</td>
<td>0.424</td>
<td>0.587</td>
<td>0.561</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(FFR(-2))</td>
<td>0.318</td>
<td>0.240</td>
<td>1.323</td>
<td>0.196</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
GDPG has meaningful and positive impact on money demand. The reasons behind the positive relation among GDPG and money demand are as follows: Firstly, as GDP increases it leads to increase transactions demand for money that is the part of total money demand so, demand for money increases. Secondly, due to increase in GDP, people become more wealthier and want to hold more assets in their portfolio so, demand for money increases. The positive relation among GDPG and money demand is explained by various theories of demand for money including Classical, Cambridge approach, Keynes’ liquidity preference theory, Friedman’s modern quantity theory of money\textsuperscript{6} advocated the positive relation of income level with demand for money. It is also empirically justifiable in many studies like Marquez,1987; Mousa, 2010; Magibany and Nourzad,1995; Bahmani-Oskooee and Malixi,1991. Lending Rate is also significant and positively related to the demand for money. Interest rate is positively related to the demand for money if individuals has interest-bearing portfolio that found the most important part of monetary aggregate Doornik et al. (1998). Many studies have presented the positive relation among the interest rate and demand for money see for example Qayyum, 2001, 2005; Arestis and Demetriades, 1991; Leeper and Gordon, 1992.

Table 5 shows the negative impact of inflation on money demand. The reason behind the negative relation among the inflation rate on the demand for money is if inflation increases, it decreases the in the real value of money and in this situation, people do not want to hold money in their portfolio so demand for money decreases. Qayyum, 2001, 2005 found the negative association between inflation and money demand. Federal Fund Rate represents the negative but significant impact on money demand. It reflects that an increase in the foreign interest rate leads to decrease in the demand for money. The reason behind the negative relation among them is that when the Federal Fund Rate increases, foreign currency become more profitable so, demand for foreign currency increases and demand for domestic currency decreases. The results are verified by Mousa, 2010.

Exchange rate has also significant and positive impact on money demand. The reason behind the positive relation between exchange rate and money demand is that if there is excess supply of money, this excess supply results in form of deficit in the balance of payments. Then there will be an automatic depreciation of the nation’s currency. It will lead to increase the prices and thus demand for money will also increase. To absorb the excess supply of money, the demand for money increases sufficiently to absorb this excess supply. According to the monetary approach of exchange rate, exchange rate has positive impact on the demand for money. Empirical studies also confirm the positive relation among ER and M2G including Megibany and Nourzad, 1995; McNown and Wallace,1992; Bahmani-Oskooee,1991; Bahmani-Oskooee et al.,1996.

Error correction results describes the speed of adjustment and short-run results. the coefficient value of error correction term is -0.728 which is significant and indicates that seven months are required for the adjustment process in short run to restore equilibrium.

4.3.3 Stability Tests (for Linear ARDL)
Stability test investigates about the stability of the model. In order to examining the stability of the model CUSUM and CUSUM of Squares have used with 5 % level of significance. The model is stable if the values lies within the bands and if the values crosses the bands means data have large variations and model is not stable.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>D(ER)</th>
<th>0.082</th>
<th>0.034</th>
<th>2.392</th>
<th>0.024</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CointEq(-1)</td>
<td>-0.728</td>
<td>0.152</td>
<td>-4.769</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Authors’ calculations

\textsuperscript{6}See Friedman (1995).
According to Figure 1, the model is stable in the first figure of CUSUM at 5% level of significance, because the values lies between the upper and lower bands from 1980 to 2015. The second figure of the CUSUM of squares shows that model is stable because the values fluctuate between the upper and lower bands from 1980 to 2015. In year 2003, negligible instability is observed but overall model is stable.

4.4 Non-Linear ARDL Analysis

Granger and Yoon (2002) presented the concept of hidden cointegration in time series. Hidden cointegration means two time are cointegrated with their negative and positive aspect. Standard linear form of cointegration (symmetric) is the special case of the hidden cointegration and hidden cointegration shows the asymmetric or non-linear cointegration. After that Schorderet (2003) introduced the bivariate asymmetric cointegration regression to examine the hidden cointegration. Furthermore, in recent research, Shin et al. (2011) presented the asymmetric ARDL used negative and positive partial sum to diagnose the asymmetric impact in long and short run.

Asymmetric ARDL like symmetric ARDL have same assumptions such as, ARDL gave accurate result in small sample size as compared to the other econometric technique, ARDL can’t apply if any variable have I(2), ARDL can apply when variables are I(0) or I(1), and even mixture of I(0) and I(1), appropriate lag length, serially uncorrelated error term and model must be stable (Katrakilidis and Trachanas, 2012).

4.4.1 Bounds Test Analysis (For Non-Linear ARDL)

It is very important to test the existence of long-run relations among variables, whether the long-run relation among variables exists or not. Bounds test is used to diagnose the existence of the long-run relation among variables. Bound test is same for linear and non-linear ARDL.

Table 6: Bounds Test (Non-Linear ARDL)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Test Statistic</th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>K</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>F-statistic</td>
<td>3.513672</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Critical Value Bounds

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Significance</th>
<th>I0 Bound</th>
<th>I1 Bound</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10%</td>
<td>1.83</td>
<td>2.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5%</td>
<td>2.06</td>
<td>3.24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5%</td>
<td>2.28</td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1%</td>
<td>2.54</td>
<td>3.86</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Authors’ Calculations

Table 6 explain the detection of long-run relationship existence. According to the table, the long-run relationship among variables exists as F statistics is greater than the upper bound.

4.4.2 Long Run and Error Correction Analysis (For Non-Linear ARDL)

This section explains the results the long-run and error correction estimate that is estimated for the Non-linear ARDL model approach.

Table 7 explains the long-run and short-run results of non-ARDL. Both a 1% positive and a 1% negative shock to GDPG have positive and significant impact on the demand for money. It means that when 1 percent positive shock is given to GDPG, demand for money rises by 9.5 percent and while 1 percent negative shock to GDPG increases the demand for money by 3.6 percent. That clearly explains that the magnitude of
coefficient of positive shock in GDPG is greater as compared to the negative one.

Lending rate also shows the positive and negative asymmetric impacts on demand for money. A 1 percent positive shock in LR enhances 7.3 percent increase in demand for money while a 1 percent negative shock in LR decreases the demand for money increases 5.9 percent that shows the inverse relationship among the negative shock in LR and demand for money. Positive shock in the LR describes the larger contribution in the demand for money as compared to the negative shock in the LR and both are statistically significant. A 1 percent positive shock in inflation rate increases demand for money by 0.5 percent whereas the 1 percent negative shock in inflation rate decreases the demand for money by 0.2 percent. The value of the coefficients expresses that the positive shock has larger contribution in the demand for money than the negative shock in inflation.

Both a 1% positive and a 1% negative shock to FFR have negative impact on demand for money. It exhibits that when 1 percent positive shock is given to FFR, demand for money falls by 8.9 percent and while 1 percent negative shock to FFR decreases the demand for money by 0.5 percent. It explains that magnitude of coefficient of positive shock in FFR is greater as compared to the negative one.

At the last we explain the exchange rate positive and negative shocks. A 1% positive shock in ER leads to the 2.4 percent decrease in demand for money while a 1 percent negative shock in exchange rate increases 2% demand for money. Positive shock in exchange rate have larger contribution in the demand for money than the negative shock in the exchange rate in the demand for money.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Coefficient</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>t-Statistic</th>
<th>Prob.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Long Run Results</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDPG_POS</td>
<td>9.528</td>
<td>3.287</td>
<td>2.898</td>
<td>0.012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDPG_NEG</td>
<td>3.646</td>
<td>1.351</td>
<td>2.697</td>
<td>0.018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LR_POS</td>
<td>7.301</td>
<td>2.074</td>
<td>3.520</td>
<td>0.003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LR_NEG</td>
<td>-5.980</td>
<td>2.079</td>
<td>-2.876</td>
<td>0.013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INF_POS</td>
<td>0.518</td>
<td>0.647</td>
<td>0.800</td>
<td>0.437</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INF_NEG</td>
<td>-0.228</td>
<td>0.542</td>
<td>-0.421</td>
<td>0.680</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FFR_POS</td>
<td>-8.993</td>
<td>3.312</td>
<td>-2.714</td>
<td>0.017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FFR_NEG</td>
<td>-0.522</td>
<td>0.793</td>
<td>-0.659</td>
<td>0.521</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ER_POS</td>
<td>-2.412</td>
<td>0.723</td>
<td>-3.333</td>
<td>0.005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ER_NEG</td>
<td>2.019</td>
<td>1.855</td>
<td>1.088</td>
<td>0.296</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>17.448</td>
<td>13.555</td>
<td>1.287</td>
<td>0.220</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Error correction Results</strong></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>D(GDPG_POS)</td>
<td>1.642</td>
<td>0.508</td>
<td>3.227</td>
<td>0.006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(GDPG_POS(-1))</td>
<td>-0.010</td>
<td>0.389</td>
<td>-0.027</td>
<td>0.978</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(GDPG_POS(-2))</td>
<td>-2.053</td>
<td>0.530</td>
<td>-3.868</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(GDPG_NEG)</td>
<td>-0.672</td>
<td>0.376</td>
<td>-1.786</td>
<td>0.097</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(GDPG_NEG(-1))</td>
<td>-1.330</td>
<td>0.380</td>
<td>-3.494</td>
<td>0.004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(LR_POS)</td>
<td>2.847</td>
<td>0.822</td>
<td>3.461</td>
<td>0.004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(LR_POS(-1))</td>
<td>2.704</td>
<td>0.987</td>
<td>2.740</td>
<td>0.016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(LR_POS(-2))</td>
<td>-3.688</td>
<td>0.978</td>
<td>-3.768</td>
<td>0.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(LR_NEG)</td>
<td>-3.092</td>
<td>0.934</td>
<td>-3.307</td>
<td>0.005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(INF_POS)</td>
<td>-0.703</td>
<td>0.232</td>
<td>-3.020</td>
<td>0.009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(INF_POS(-1))</td>
<td>-0.906</td>
<td>0.245</td>
<td>-3.689</td>
<td>0.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(INF_NEG)</td>
<td>0.032</td>
<td>0.299</td>
<td>0.108</td>
<td>0.915</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(FFR_POS)</td>
<td>-4.344</td>
<td>1.035</td>
<td>-4.197</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(FFR_POS(-1))</td>
<td>2.106</td>
<td>0.746</td>
<td>2.823</td>
<td>0.014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(FFR_NEG)</td>
<td>0.272</td>
<td>0.652</td>
<td>0.417</td>
<td>0.682</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(FFR_NEG(-1))</td>
<td>-0.245</td>
<td>0.506</td>
<td>-0.485</td>
<td>0.635</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(FFR_NEG(-2))</td>
<td>0.599</td>
<td>0.348</td>
<td>1.720</td>
<td>0.109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(ER_POS)</td>
<td>0.189</td>
<td>0.115</td>
<td>1.635</td>
<td>0.125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(ER_POS(-1))</td>
<td>0.020</td>
<td>0.235</td>
<td>0.085</td>
<td>0.932</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(ER_POS(-2))</td>
<td>0.573</td>
<td>0.263</td>
<td>2.177</td>
<td>0.048</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(ER_NEG)</td>
<td>1.043</td>
<td>0.988</td>
<td>1.056</td>
<td>0.310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CointEq(-1)</td>
<td>-0.517</td>
<td>0.162</td>
<td>-3.183</td>
<td>0.007</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Authors’ Calculations
4.4.3 Presence of Asymmetry based on Wald Test
This section investigates the presence of Asymmetries of variables based on Wald test. Table 8 examines the asymmetries of independent variables GDPG, LR, INF, FFR and ER for the non-linear ARDL.

Table 8: Wald Test

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Null Hypothesis</th>
<th>F-Statistic</th>
<th>Prob.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GDPG_POS = GDPG_NEG = 0</td>
<td>9.6259</td>
<td>0.006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LR_POS = LR_NEG = 0</td>
<td>0.4727</td>
<td>0.628</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INF_POS = INF_NEG = 0</td>
<td>5.069</td>
<td>0.023</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FFR_POS = FFR_NEG = 0</td>
<td>9.597</td>
<td>0.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ER_POS = ER_NEG = 0</td>
<td>2.049</td>
<td>0.168</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Authors’ Calculations

Table 8 presents the results of Wald Test to diagnose the presence of asymmetric effects on dependent variable. GDPG, INF are FFR are asymmetric because we have rejected the Ho which shows that there is no asymmetry while for LR and ER we have found symmetric effects because we are unable to reject the null hypothesis.

4.4.4 Stability Tests (For Non-linear ARDL)
Stability Test for non-linear ARDL, which explains that the model is stable or not. To check the stability CUSUM and CUSUM of Squares test is used

Figure 2: CUSUM and CUSUM of Squares test

According to the CUSUM and CUSUM of Squares test the model is stable at 5% level of significance because the values lies between the upper and lower bands.

5. Conclusion
This paper investigates the determinants of demand for money in Pakistan by using time series data from 1972 to 2019. The study has applied linear and non-linear ARDL techniques to explore the impact of exchange rate, GDPG, lending rate, foreign interest rate and inflation rate on money demand. Long-run results extracted from linear ARDL technique show that the impact of GDPG, lending rate and exchange rate are significant and have positive impact on money demand whereas the inflation is insignificant and have negative impact on the demand for money. Moreover, foreign interest rate is significant and have negative impact on money demand. The results divulge that the money demand function is stable in Pakistan and exchange rate changes have positive and strong impacts on demand for money. Results of the NARDL exhibit that positive shocks in exchange rates decrease the money demand while the negative shocks tend to augment the demand for money. Furthermore, the asymmetric test shows that exchange rate changes have symmetric effects on money demand.

References
Asymmetric or Symmetric Effects on the Demand for Money in the Gambia.
Bahmani, S. (2013). Exchange rate volatility and demand for money in less developed countries. 


International ESL Students’ Experiences and Perceptions of Effective and Constructive Feedback Practices on their Academic Writing in MA Programme

1Marukh Shakir, 2Mujahid Shah, 3Munir Khattak
1Assistant Professor, Abdul Wali Khan University Mardan, Pakistan
2Assistant Professor, Abdul Wali Khan University Mardan, Pakistan, mujahidshah@awkum.edu.pk
3Assistant Professor, Department of English, University of Labella, Pakistan

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT
This paper investigates students’ experiences, perceptions, understanding and interpretation of different types of feedback. For this purpose, qualitative interviews were conducted from ten ESL (not having English as their native language) students regarding different types of feedback that they received on their academic assignments; the effects and potential of those feedback on their learning and writing, and the factors causing difficulties in their effective use of those feedback. According to the findings, all participants expressed their satisfaction with support in the form of feedback in improving their academic writing but also showed some reservations in effectively exercising them. The findings revealed that the interviewees received feedback in varied modes, however, mostly in written form; from tutors; and after the submission of assignments, and less in oral form; from peers; during the writing processes; and before the submission of assignments. Conclusions are drawn and limitation and suggestions for future research are addressed in the light of the findings.

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT
This paper investigates students’ experiences, perceptions, understanding and interpretation of different types of feedback. For this purpose, qualitative interviews were conducted from ten ESL (not having English as their native language) students regarding different types of feedback that they received on their academic assignments; the effects and potential of those feedback on their learning and writing, and the factors causing difficulties in their effective use of those feedback. According to the findings, all participants expressed their satisfaction with support in the form of feedback in improving their academic writing but also showed some reservations in effectively exercising them. The findings revealed that the interviewees received feedback in varied modes, however, mostly in written form; from tutors; and after the submission of assignments, and less in oral form; from peers; during the writing processes; and before the submission of assignments. Conclusions are drawn and limitation and suggestions for future research are addressed in the light of the findings.

1. Introduction
The significant, central and decisive role of feedback in L2 writing field for the development of student learning process, their motivation and writing skills related to L2 has been widely recognised in L2 writing field (Hounsell, 2003; K. Hyland & F. Hyland, 2006). Ramsden (2003) opines that effective comments on students’ work are indicative of quality teaching. Hounsell (2003: 67) states that we learn faster, and much more effectively, when we have a clear sense of how well we are doing and what we might need to do in order to improve’. Gibbs & Simpson (2004) highlighted the significance of feedback being timely, understandable and acted upon by students.

Feedback is a significant and primary aspect of EFL/ESL writing programs around the world. The research studies are not clearly positive regarding the role of feedback in L2 writing development (K.
Hyland & F. Hyland, 2006). It is usually viewed by teachers that its full potential is not made use of by them (ibid). Students are mostly dissatisfied with the feedback they get because they either find it difficult to interpret it (Chanock, 2000), lacking specific advice to improve (e.g. Higgins et al., 2001), or it has a potentially adverse effect on students’ confidence and self-perception (James, 2000). Inspired by such feedback-oriented research and a recommendation by Poverjuc (2011) for future research to investigate the students’ perceptions of effective feedback practices on academic writing, I conducted a small-scale empirical research based on the students’ interviews (explained in detail later). This provided me with an opportunity to compare my findings with the previous feedback oriented research, and thus offered the basis for stronger conclusions and suggestions for improving students’ long term writing skills. It also helped me in examining the relevance of feedback in another context (Higher Education context in UK). Moreover, it helped me identify new variables that may affect them. It must be kept in mind that this paper only deals with feedback for writing tasks; so wherever feedback is mentioned, the context is exclusively that of written work.

1.1 The Current Study
Feedback is a social process that may be interpreted in different ways (Carless, 2006). This study examines the value of feedback in terms of informing students about their academic performance (though not in terms of correcting their writing), in terms of students’ experiences and perceptions of different types of feedback they receive in different modes during their master’s course, in terms of the difficulties they faced while they have engaged with those feedbacks, and in terms of their perceptions of effective feedback for improving their writing skills. In other words, to explore and exemplify how international ESL students experience, perceive, understand and interpret the assignments feedback process, the different modes of feedback in this study refers to the input and responses that students receive on or about their academic assignments from their tutors in the form of:

- Written remarks on the drafts or finalised assignments.
- Any verbal feedback (e.g. during the development of ideas) prior to or after the submission of assignments.
- Feedback in different modes such as explicit/implicit, oral/written, and specific/detailed.

The motivation for this study also comes from my personal experiences during my M.A in Applied Linguistics, from feedback I received about assignments, and from talking to peers about it. I experienced that in majority of cases in M.A, students do not get feedback, which has the potential to allow them to revise the draft paper. Mostly they get feedback after the submission of assignments which may undermine the basic purpose of feedback. Most importantly, in my opinion, the value of feedback lies in utilising the feedback constructively for development e.g. when students get feedback what do they do with that feedback? Where does it go? What is its value for them? What do they think of it?

2. Literature Review
Feedback, in educational context, is usually conceptualized as fulfilling both ‘evaluative’ and ‘educative’ functions (Dochy & McDowell, 1997). From an evaluative perspective, feedback provides students with information regarding her/his performance attempt at a task (Hounsell, 1987). In terms of educative function, feedback supports students’ development and facilitates task improvement (Hester, 2001). Fleming (1999) contends that marking student scripts is an important quality event in students’ lives. Such feedback can have various functions such as an advice for improving the current assignment, advice for improving the following assignments and justifying or explaining a grade (Carless, 2006). Tutors invest quite a lot of time in the feedback of this nature but the important point is to ask: what are the impact of such feedback on students and how might they relate to further learning? (ibid). According to Carless, students are usually motivated by and interested in marks and they do not bother much about the written feedback they get on their papers after submission of assignments (Carless, 2006). Feedback on assignments might have quite variable and mostly unpredictable effects on students (Lizzio & Keithia, 2008). Young (2000) has identified the “potentially problematic nature of students’ personal reactions to feedback on assignments” (e.g. decrease in self-esteem, academic confidence) in higher education context.
2.1 Students’ Perceptions of Feedback on Academic Assignments

Students acknowledge feedback on assignments as important in the identification of their weaknesses and strengths, enhancement of motivation and improvement of their future grades (F. Hyland, 2000). Research reveals significant findings with regard to the nature of feedback which encompasses direct versus indirect feedback, written versus oral feedback, form versus content, combined and detailed feedback as explained ahead.

Regarding direct versus indirect feedback, in a study Ferris (2006) discovered that students used direct feedback more effectively and consistently than indirect feedback, possibly as it simply involves copying the tutor’s suggestions into the next draft of their papers(K. Hyland & F. Hyland, 2006). Robb et al. (1986) found minimum long-term gains in case of indirect feedback as compared to direct feedback practices. Williams (2004) found more uptake of teacher’s advice in terms of revisions when teacher’s suggestions were explicit.

With regard to written and oral feedback, findings on students’ feedback preferences mostly reveal that ESL students greatly value tutor’s written feedback and continuously rate it more highly than oral feedback (Leki 1991; Enginarlar 1993; Ferris 1995). Gibbs and colleagues indicate, for instance, that students might not consider oral comments as feedback as much as they do written comments (Gibbs et al., 2003).

In case of form and content feedback, although some findings indicate that students want tutor’s feedback on their grammatical errors, most studies show that they want tutors to give them feedback on the ideas and content in their writing as well (Hedgcock&Lefkowitz, 1996). Students also favour receiving written suggestions in combination with other sources such as conferences (Hedgcock & Lefkowitz 1994).

When it comes to detailed feedback, Leki (2006), for instance, while looking at feedback received by L2 graduate students in a US university, interviewed students to seek their opinions regarding the value of written feedback in development of their academic literacy. Most students showed their desire to have even more detailed feedback, particularly one helping them in identifying problems and giving them information about academic expectations.

2.2 Difficulties in Using Feedback and Constructive and Effective Feedback Practises

Feedback contribution both in terms of its immediate effect on revisions to drafts and of students long term development of writing skills is still not very clear (K. Hyland & F. Hyland, 2006). Some difficulties might pertain to the following reasons;

2.3 Incomprehensibility of Feedback

Students may misunderstand, misinterpret or ignore tutor’s comments when revising drafts (Ferris 1995; Conrad & Goldstein 1999). It might also happen that they may have understood the issues pointed out but are incapable of coming up with an appropriate revision(Ferris 1997; Conrad & Goldstein 1999), sometimes causing them to simply delete the offending text to avoid the problems pointed out (F. Hyland 1998).

2.4 Tutor’s Language

Higgins (2000) argues that mostly students are unable to understand and correctly interprets feedback comments. Feedback is usually delivered in an academic discourse (language in which teacher’s comments is encoded) that is not completely accessible to students.

2.5 Negative Feedback

Negative feedback may have harmful effect on writer’s (students) confidence (F. Hyland & K. Hyland 2001). However, mostly tutors try to mitigate the impact of their comments and criticisms by using question forms, hedges which might promote a supportive pedagogical environment, though its indirect approach carries the risk that students may misinterpret or miss the point of the feedback (K. Hyland &
2.6 Cultural Issues
It has been argued that some L2 learners experience cultural constraints about their “engaging informally with authority figures” such as tutors or critically analysing tutor’s remarks, which might result in students unreflectively and passively incorporating the tutor’s suggestions into their work (Goldstein & Conrad 1990).

2.7 A Review of Literature Identifies Certain Features of Effective Feedback Messages Such as

2.7.1 Feedback on Drafts
Commentary on drafts might serve more immediate pedagogical goals i.e. development of writing as compared to that given on the final version (K. Hyland & F. Hyland, 2006). Feedback on the drafts was utilised more by the students who tended to improve their papers, a conclusion reached by Ferris (1997) while looking at ESL students’ first and second drafts of papers during his investigation into the relationship between teacher feedback and student revision. Zamel, for example, also endorses teachers’ comments on ideas in earlier drafts (Zamel 1985). Higgins et al. (2002) contends, ‘feeding forward’ increases the effectiveness of ‘feeding back’ as ‘feeding forward’ provides an immediate chance of acting on advice. Thus, comments on drafts were more helpful than feedback on the final version after submission (ibid).

2.7.2 Detailed Comments
Detailed and longer text specific remarks were discovered resulting in more positive revisions (Ferris, 1997). Conrad & Goldstein (1999), in their research on students feedback, discovered that comments dealing with details in the content were revised successfully by the students about half the time as opposed to superficial corrections such as spelling and formatting.

2.7.3 Combined Feedback
Conrad & Goldstein (1999) & F. Hyland (1998) noticed a close link between written and oral feedback observing that the points in written feedback can be better reinforced in student-teacher oral interactions. For many learners oral feedback following written feedback has the potential to allow for negotiation and interpretation of feedback (Hyland & Hyland, 2006). Master (1995) found that feedback was effective when complemented with discussions. Goldstein and Conrad (1990) discovered that students who negotiated meaning in conferences were able to carry out better and extensive revisions to their writing than those who did not. Williams (2004) who found more uptake of teacher’s advice when students negotiated and actively participated in the conferences also supported this finding.

2.7.4 Negotiations and Interaction
Williams (2004) points out that negotiation are crucial for text-based revisions. Patthey, Chavez & Ferris (1997) examined some teachers’ writing conferences with eight students and found a link between the topics discussed in the conferences and students subsequent revisions of their drafts. They discovered that all eight students utilised the tutor’s suggestions in their revisions.

2.7.5 Positive Feedback
It is commonly proposed that feedback, including both positive and negative elements, will be more effective, with the former i.e. the positive comments enhancing the possibility of accepting the latter, i.e. the negative comments (F. Hyland & K. Hyland 2001). The inclusion of a positive component (e.g. encouragement, praise) in a feedback has been asserted to contribute in mitigating the potentially negative impact of a negative feedback on motivation and self-esteem (Lizzio et al. 2003).

2.7.6 Clarity of Feedback
At the basic level, feedback needs to be clearly understood by the students if they are to make use of it (Lizzio & Keithia, 2008). Students sometimes report difficulty about ‘making sense’ of comments (Norton & Norton 2001) or ‘translating’ academic language (Chanock 2000). Besides, there is also some
evidence suggesting a potential discrepancy between the meaning or intention of academics’ feedback on assignments and its interpretation by students (Lea & Steirer 2000).

3. Methodology
The data for this study data was collected within the Higher education context in UK. The study revolves around ten mixed international non-native ESL students doing M.A in modern languages in the Humanities Department belonging to different Asian and European countries.

The data was collected through “Qualitative interviews” (Rubin & Rubin, 1995) in order to probe deeply into “people’s more personal, private, and special understandings” (Arksey & Knight, 1999: 4). Semi-structured interviews were used with the participants with an interview guide prepared beforehand (see Appendix A). Students were chosen by using convenient sampling method where “a certain group of people [were] chosen for study because they [were] available” (Fraenkel & Wallen, 2003: 103). The interviewees were on the same course as mine and so were easily accessible to me. Secondly, I had already established good rapport with them required for interviews to effectively engage them in a reasonable discussion.

Detailed contextual and educational background of these students was not felt important to be provided because the purpose of the study is to elucidate the different perceptions held by these students about feedback practises and their background information might make them easily identifiable which goes against the ethics of research.

Students were requested to participate on the basis of their willingness and my understanding of their ability to contribute insights to the study. Interviews were then scheduled for a day and time according to the participant’s convenience. The interviews were audio recorded with participants’ permission. Consistent with the purpose of the study, questions in the interview guide focused on students interpretations of tutors’ feedback, how they reacted toward those, which type of feedback practises they found useful in terms of informing their writing, what problems they confronted in processing those feedback. As is a common practise with semi-structured interviews, the sequence and exact phrasing of the questions were not fixed (Zhu, 2004). The general and already set up lead questions were asked first mostly followed up by more specific questions in order to elicit further information. At the end of each interview, interviewees were asked to comment, share or suggest anything they believed could be relevant to the study.

A total of ten interviews were collected, one from each respondent, each of which lasted from around 30 to 40 minutes. My role during the interviews was “to raise questions, rephrase the questions if necessary, listen to the responses, prompt for further information, ask for clarifications, check with the interviewees my interpretation of their responses, and answer respondents’ questions (ibid: 33).

4. Data Analysis
The audio-recorded interviews were then transcribed and analysed followed by coding and categorisation of data. The prominent themes and patterns were identified. The interview data were analysed by utilising procedures recommended by Arksey & Knight (1999) for analysis of qualitative interviews. First, a representative sample of two interviewees comments were analysed and initial coding content categories were developed. The resultant initial coded categories were then applied to the rest of sample i.e. to the comments of the other three students. I would analyse each theme followed by comparing evidence from the other data sets. In order to create sense of the themes, I followed the recursive “process of interpreting data, drawing tentative conclusions and returning to the raw data to seek evidence which confirmed or disconfirmed a particular line of thinking” (Carless, 2006: 222). Several categories emerged as a result of transcripts coding which is mentioned and explained below in discussion. After having developed an argument from the themes, I reported to the respondents aspects of the data that I found surprising, puzzling, or interesting asking them to judge my interpretations or elaborate their views thus using their point of views to increase the authenticity of my research findings (ibid).
5. Findings and Discussion
The analysis of the interviews transcripts revealed that interviewees, similar to the previous research findings (e.g. Poverjuc, 2011) received feedback in varied modes. However, in this study feedback was received mostly in written form from tutors and after the submission of assignments and less in oral form, from peers, during the writing processes and before the submission of assignments. Further, these transcripts indicated that the feedback aimed at mainly providing comments on their weaknesses in the current assignment. Three main themes emerged from the above-mentioned analytic procedures. These were; students’ perceptions of different types of feedback practises, difficulties confronted by them in its successful use, and their perceptions of effective feedback practises. These themes have been “discussed separately for convenience of exposition, but there is also considerable interplay between them, with some points carrying relevance for more than one theme” (Carless, 2006: 223) also reflecting few concerns recognised in the broader feedback literature. In order to maintain participants’ anonymity, they have been identified with capital alphabets. Although, the transcripts contain a lot of other useful insights about feedback practises all of which are not possible to be mentioned and discussed here on account of space constraints and so a much focused discussion is provided here. Thus, few quotations relevant to the research focus have been included at relevant places instead of the whole transcription.

5.1 Students’ Perceptions of Feedback Practices on Academic Assignments
Consistent with the previous research findings, all the ten participants in this study showed their satisfaction with the idea of feedback practises in terms of indirectly improving their writing in the long run by informing them of their shortcomings in the current assignments. According to them, they would revisit their assignments particularly when the current assignment would have a similar requirement or section to that of the previous one. One student reported that in order to improve the current work, if he had performed well in a specific area in some previous assignment, he would try to use it in another assignment. For instance, one he obtained a useful feedback from his tutor regarding referencing, and he then used that assignment as a sort of template for future trials at referencing.

Definitely yes they [comments] were useful because they showed me what mistakes I did and what I forgot about and what would help me to avoid committing the same mistakes in the next assignment. Once I got a comment on how to make reference so […] in my following assignments I was very careful about referencing and did correct referencing (A).
Feedback helped me in future assignments. When you do the next assignment, you remember that it was incorrect in previous assignment; so you avoid repeating it again just as I gave you referencing example. (A)

Another student reported that her old assignments had helped her a lot in improving her subsequent assignments.

Of course the feedback has helped me a lot in my other assignments. I have a clear idea about what my tutors are looking for and want of me. (D)

These excerpts reveal that students learnt to extend their current competence through the guidance of a more knowledgeable expert (Vygotsky, 1978). All the ten students (just three students are quoted for special reasons) acknowledged the fact of using their written feedback for feed-forward purposes in subsequent assignments such as regulating their writing behaviours and informing their following assignments in the light of previous feedback (Poverjuc, 2011).

In terms of type, mentioned below are few quotes from participants which along with their perceptions about feedback practises in general also show their preferences for and satisfaction with direct, written, detailed and content focused tutors’ feedback consistent with the previous research findings. These types are categorized separately for greater readability.

Direct feedback: By direct feedback, I mean feedback which explicitly highlights and criticizes the problem whilst indirect feedback suggests reconsiderations or hedges criticism. Two students exhibited their liking for direct feedback as they felt it easy to process it and does not require many efforts to
I always liked direct feedback. I don’t like feedback which requires lot of thinking as comments in question form provided by some tutors as I found it hard to reach to the right answer; so it would be better if tutor directly tell me the point. (D)

I will go for direct feedback as I don’t want to be left wandering about issues in the writing (E). The words “wandering” and “lot of thinking” suggest their avoidance of mental exertion required in reflection on feedback.

Written: Two students’ favoured written feedback more, possibly due to the fact that oral feedback is hard to remember as evidenced from the following quote. For example;

I will not go for it [oral feedback] because sometimes you change your mind during writing up of assignments and sometimes you forget what the guideline is, what the teacher wants you to do exactly (B).

Or possibly because they can relate written feedback with their written work recursively at any time as it stays permanently as verified below by a student;

Written feedback for me is better as I can go through and check my assignments and see what I did was ok or not (A).

Negotiation: Two students showed their desire for discussion on feedback they receive. For example one student reported;

For me oral feedback is good as I can discuss my ideas with them [tutors] (B).
Here I will interpret ‘Oral’ to mean discussion based on the meaning in this sentence.

The other said;

Feedback makes a sense and is more fruitful when you discuss it thoroughly (C).

Detailed: Most students showed their desire to have even more detailed feedback, particularly feedback helping them in identifying problems and giving them information about academic expectations. Two of my participants affirmed the same fact as revealed in their responses such as;

Those with more details will be helpful which could tell me some solution about how to correct and improve my mistake (A).

I go for detailed comments which could give me some idea how to remove my mistakes and how I can improve (B).

Content: One of my interviewee regarded content feedback more valuable for her as is visible from her quote;

For me the most important thing is the content feedback. It is something that makes sense actually for improving my writing and teaches me writing skill (E).

By content, when asked, she meant relating to structure and ideas.

5.2 Difficulties in Using Feedback
Also, my research findings confirm the research findings regarding difficulties. But here again the findings are divided into more detailed categories for clarity though the results are almost similar. In response to the questions asking students to identify problems or hurdles in using feedback, students indicated some feedback aspects as representing barriers in its effective use such as;

5.3 Lack of Sufficient Feedback
Two students described their experience of feedback mostly as limited which does not tell them much about their weak areas.

Comments on the assignments seem more of assessment and less of a tool to help us to improve our writing. Comments are to the point and limited (D).

Those with more details will be helpful which could tell me some solution about how to correct
and improve my mistake (A).

This might be due to institutional constraints and responding to the assignment in terms of assessed piece of work that students hardly receive feedback other than a grade (Carless, 2006).

5.4 Nature of Feedback
Three students found it harder to grasp what the tutor meant by a certain comment because of the language and handwriting. For example, one student expressed it as follows:

I try to make sense of the comment but sometimes it’s so vague and general that I can hardly understand what they want to say. It’s very disturbing. (A)

Sometimes I cannot read some written comments that the marker writes, so I don’t know and don’t understand what the marker wants me to do, the language is not clear […] In order to find them helpful, I should be able to read and understand them so the language should be clear to me in order to get benefit of those comments (E).

I at times found the handwriting incomprehensible when feedback was given on the hardcopy. (D)

5.5 Variation in Tutors’ Preferences
Two students showed strong reservations about different tutors marking things differently.

Sometimes one tutor says why I quoted old sources, and when I use recent sources in another assignment then the tutor says why I did not make any reference to some old source (C). Once one tutor gave me feedback to pay attention to structure. The other said structure is not that important but the ideas (E).

5.6 Lack of Connection between Assignments
Two students commented that tutors’ comment had not really helped them much in improving their writing as they were specific to the current assignment and so was not of much use to provide support for doing better in other assignments for different modules. One student’s quote is presented here as example;

Well every assignment is different from the other. I didn’t find that feedback useful which talks just about assignment that is checked. Most comments I have got were about the ideas in my current submitted assignment and not about the organisation, layout, logical sequence which could improve my writing in the long run as feedback about ideas are just limited to that particular assignment and ends with that (C).

5.7 Unavailability of Feedback on Drafts
When asked whether they approach tutors on their own, one student responded that

Initially I had been trying to get tutors consultation on drafts assignments but they showed little interest, I feel them usually avoiding. May be they are very busy; so they stop trying then or they may think that few students are receiving more support than others. (B) Tutors are usually busy to allow us to discuss our ideas before submitting assignments (C).

Providing detailed feedback might be difficult because of large class sizes and lack of sufficient time (Carless, 2006).

5.8 Students’ Perceptions of Effective Feedback
Effective feedback was perceived in four main forms: Comments on drafts, related to transferable skills, combined feedback, some positive comments when providing critical comments and recognizing effort invested by students. Respondents associated positive feedback to their resultant motivation level. Tutors’ advice on draft assignments were believed by these students as a particularly significant source of ‘feed forward’ (Higgin et al., 2002) as providing an immediate chance of acting on advice. They
further argued that comments on drafts were more helpful than feedback on the final version after submission. This belief was expressed in the following comment made by a student.

Feedback before the submission would be better as I can go through those comments and will take care of them and will take them seriously [……]. I will use all comments during the assignment [……]. (B)

One student mentioned below also stated that if a teacher had spent some time commenting on drafts before the submission, they would expect briefer feedback to be given on the final version which proves utilisation of feedback on the part of student.

If I get feedback before submission, then I expect just few comments after the submission because I will use all comments, all feedback during doing my assignment; so I will not expect many comments after the submission of my assignments (A).

End or sign the significance of feedback supporting transferable learning, one student remarked that feedback could be more beneficially directed to general skills which can be transferred to other contexts such as paragraph development, cohesion and coherence, logical organization, clarity and conciseness, sentence structure, mechanics, citations and referencing. This supports a point forwarded by Knight and Yorke (2003), that although many tutors give a lot of feedback on specifics, it is the general feedback that has more power to stimulate learning. Such feedback possesses the potential to ‘feedforward’, into following tasks instead of feeding back into the completed assignments.

I didn’t find the feedback useful as I rarely found comments about the organisation, layout, logical sequence which could improve my writing in the long run as feedbacks are just limited to the topic in that particular assignment and ends with that (C).

5.9 Combined Feedback
Three students favoured consultations and discussions after they got marks on final assignments. For example,

It would be valuable if the tutors talk to us and discuss about our assignments after marking. I think it would be more effective for our development and learning (C).

5.10 Positive Comments
Regarding positive comments two students reported;

I really appreciate some positive comments even if my assignment is not completely up to their expectations as it really keeps my motivation intact as I have invested a lot of time on it and definitely expect at least some reward (E).

I do a lot of hard work on assignments and do expect some acceptance of it in return (D).

Higgins et al. (2001), points out that ‘the student makes an emotional investment in an assignment and expects some “return” on that investment’ (p. 272) and negative feedback can be threatening to students’ motivation.

The data gathered and analysed in this study echo confirmed most of the findings highlighted in the previous research in respect of students’ appreciating the practises of feedback and facing almost the same issues with regard to the sources of difficulties in processing feedback. This includes the nature of feedback, language employed by the tutors, appropriate timings, individual differences and variations in tutor’s preferences for marking. However, unlike previous research, my findings did not suggest cultural differences as a hurdle for the participants.

This might possibly be because my study was not in depth enough to reveal such concerns or it might be due to the small sample size to attribute differences to culture. Beyond that, my research findings also
illuminated students’ perceptions regarding effective feedback practises not addressed previously (to my knowledge). So, my study revealed some perspectives of students concerning effective feedback practises such as comments on drafts, combined feedback (written feedback followed by discussions), positive feedback and feedback related to transferable skills.

6. Conclusion
Interested by significance of feedback practices in improving students’ writing and written texts, their development as academics and the issues regarding effectiveness of feedback and driven by my personal motivation, this small scale empirical study was carried out in order to analyze the perceptions and experiences of M.A international ESL students in a master’s programme An argument was made on the basis of this study’s findings about how the process of feedback could be possibly made more constructive, useful and effective. All participants expressed their satisfaction with such support (feedback) in improving their academic writing though they also showed some reservations in effectively exercising them.

These results raised tutors’ awareness, to some extent: 1) of the potential difficulties, attached with feedback practises, in the light of above mentioned students’ experiences with different types of feedback and 2) the significance of creating various opportunities to make feedback practises more valuable by bearing in mind the above-mentioned students’ perceptions of effective feedback practises. Results suggest that only one type of feedback in a single mode should not preferred rather multiple types of feedback adapted to individual students needs and context could be useful for students. Although, this is a very small-scale study with few participants providing just a glimpse regarding feedback practises so generalizations and big conclusions cannot be drawn from it. However, the study still provides useful insights, which becomes the basis for some of the following implications for practice.

6.1 Some Implications for Practice
Generally speaking, the present findings may offer some guidance about students’ expectations of effective feedback practises which might serve to sensitize tutors regarding potential of valuable feedback. Some specific points worth-mentioning could be those of the tutors;

- The ones who aim at providing developmental feedback should try to balance ‘assignment specific’ comments with more ‘transferable’ feedback (Lizzio & Keithia, 2008)
- The ones who aim at encouraging students might try not just to acknowledge achievements, but also to recognize the effort invested, regardless of outcomes (ibid).
- If tutors are constrained by time and workload, instead of organising one to one discussion session, could arrange about 30 mins whole-class optional tutorial for general feedback on the assignments which would possibly be more interactive and thus more useful (Carless, 2006).
- Regarding tutors choice of appropriate style and language in their feedback which can facilitate students’ writing development, tutors require to weigh their selection of comments (K. Hyland & F. Hyland, 2006).
- If possible teachers should tailor their feedback to suit each student preferences and needs(Ferris et al., 1997; F. Hyland 2001).
- If tutors could spare some time and organise opportunities where feedback on assignments in progress may be provided, this would definitely be a valuable form of feedback such as those provided in LING 6001 at group level and in LING 6011 at individual level in my M.A course. This may invite further research seeking students’ perceptions, who have received such support, regarding the effectiveness of such practises. There is also a need of carrying out in depth research on the said issues regarding feedback to reach some sound conclusions.

References:


Zhu, W. (2004). Faculty views on the importance of writing, the nature of academic
Corporal Punishment Act in Public Schools: A Phenomenological Analysis of Perceptions of Practitioners

1Nargis Abbas, 2Beenish Ijaz Butt, 3Uzma Ashiq
1Assistant Professor, Department of Education, University of Sargodha, Pakistan, nargis.abbas@uos.edu.pk
2Assistant Professor, Department of Social Work, University of Sargodha, Pakistan, beenish.ijaz@uos.edu.pk
3Lecturer, Department of Social Work, University of Sargodha, Pakistan, uzma.ashiq@uos.edu.pk

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

Corporal punishment (CP) is a conspicuous and serious matter of Pakistani schools. In response to this prevalent social problem the government of Pakistan like other countries has legislated against corporal punishments through Corporal Punishment Act, 2010 which restricts CP of every type in all educational institutes of the country. The said policy was promulgated to secure the child rights in the country but the flip side of the policy presents a different picture. This paper aims at investigating challenges faced by of the elementary public-school teachers as policy practitioners about the ban on corporal punishment by the government. This paper is based on qualitative social research methodology and used phenomenological research approach. Phenomenological interviews were used to collect the data until data reached at saturation. The data was analyzed by following the overall process guided by Creswell. Major derived themes from data were Perceptions of teachers regarding ban on Corporal Punishment, Post Corporal Punishment Legislation Challenges and Opinion of teachers regarding Government policy on CP followed by several sub-themes. It was concluded that the state vision to promote child welfare is hardly seen through its policies as at the end the welfare of the target group must be assured not doubted.

© 2020 Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0

Keywords
Corporal punishment, teachers, students, discipline, state

JEL Classification
M10, M12

1. Introduction

Corporal punishment is a documented problem of several societies around the globe. In schools, corporal punishment (CP) considers to be an effective solution for children for the sake of guidance. The cane is most common gadget in this regard of child betterment. In Asia, Europe and the European colonies this cane was also known as junior or light cane that used to be compulsory in the classroom in the 19th to 20th centuries, to oversee young school children. Another term “spanking” is also found in
literature which means “hitting a child on their buttocks or extremities using an open hand” (Gershoff & Grogan-Kaylor, 2016, pg. 453) However, in Human Rights Activists’ vision, corporal punishment is a torture. In their observation physical punishment is a form of domestic violence as well as child abuse to defend human rights. While, for South Asian children, the corporal punishment is a usual concept in their routine life of at domestic level, in institutes, at work and in neighborhoods. Although, the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) states that young ones are respectable having equal right to honor and respect. Whereas, in South Asian countries CP is thought to be mandatory for child’s development, to aid in cognition and to maintain order (UNICEF, 2012). Such is the commonly observed belief in public sector schools of this region like India, Pakistan, Bangladesh, Nepal and Afghanistan. In contrast to the above said situation, defenders of physical punishment assert that utilization of sticks is responsible for extraordinary outcomes in children. Absence of corporal punishment, when students will reach till high school, they will be more rebellious and the school would slide into chaos (Mararike, 2005). Fournier (2004), a French educational expert, supported physical punishment by saying that spanking should alone not be used in education. The USA Criminal Code explains power to be used by a parent, a guardian or any other responsible person consider in their honest opinion when it is gravely needed for looking after or advantage of that young one in order to rectify his/her misconduct. Moreover, defenders of corporal punishment claim that those students give best who receive corporal punishment and they believed without corporal punishment pupils become more disrespectful by the time that come to high school level (Marairke, 2005). It is believed that teacher's corporal punishment is a source of maintaining discipline and shaping the behavior of children. Customary ways of life provide conformity to the effectiveness of corporal punishment (Raj, 2011). Traditional believe about the concept of corporal punishment confirmed that it is the best way to shape the behavior of children (Shmueli, 2010).

On contrary, an extensive body of research also revealed corporal punishment as an ineffective way of handling the matter rather it is detrimental, destructive and injurious to the personality of the child. Corporal punishment or canning in earlier years of school causes high level of aggression, anxiety, depression, anger and sometime serious psychological issues with the students in later years of school and even in their practical life (Gershoff et al., 2018, Gershoff et al., 2019). Corporal punishment makes the children aggressive, anti-social and lemmatizes their internal skills. Further, these effects persist across the cultural, familial and geographical boundaries. As Gershoff (2002) concluded about the long-term effects of corporal punishment. Corporal punishment increased child delinquency, moral internalization, as well as antisocial and aggressive behavior among children.

Pakistan has signed the UN pact on the entitlement of children, mentioning all judicial and management steps should be taken to assure law making for providing defense of children (UNCRC, 1990). However, in case of Pakistan, corporal punishments have occupied schools for nearly more about one and half century. In this case, multiple incidents had been reported from government/non-government schools, (maracas) wherever punishments are institutionally deep-seated. Moreover, it is estimated that due to CP nearly 35,000 Pakistani students are unable to continue their education and out of every five students, four are susceptible to fathers/mothers, instructors and elders (Hadi, 2014).

Corporal punishment is a conspicuous and serious matter of Pakistani secondary institutes. It is obvious from documented report as, “Corporal punishment remained dominant in enormous number of secondary institutes with sticks, shoes, scales, iron bars and poles. For most of times this beating resulted in complicated injuries and the reason behind this punishment was unavailability of required textbook, mistaken answer to a question and incomplete assigned work (Human Rights Commission of Pakistan, 2003, p. 308).

In response to this prevalent social problem the government of Pakistan like other countries has legislated against corporal punishments through Corporal Punishment Act, 2010 which defines corporal punishment under section 3.2 as

**Corporal punishment of every type is outlawed in all educational institutes either formal or informal, government or non-government institutes, and in government based or non-government children supervision centers such as foster homes or any of such sorts.**

But in the next section 3.3 it is stated that
Disciplinary steps and reforms that concerning the children must be carried out without influencing that child’s self-esteem and never should any action of corporal punishment be taken that demolishes a child’s physical or psychological well-being or sentiments of a child.

The private sector schools, prior to this act, have already taken actions and prohibited the physical punishment to the students in order to maintain their standards with American and European system of education. While, there are mixed views of teachers on the ban of corporal punishment in schools, especially in public schools running under the supervision of government. Some of the public-school teachers favored this ban and they felt that it is a good sign because it reduces fear among student and enhances their critical and analytical thinking. It also reduces drop out ratio because many students leave school due to the fear of punishment. On the other hand, some of the participants were against this ban. According to them, it is needed because without the fears of punishment student don’t obey the rules and regulation, it also has negative effects on their study.

The government of Pakistan has taken social and administrative measures to ban corporal punishment in all educational institutions and raise the slogan “Maar Nahi Piyar” to secure the right of children against corporal punishment. In this regard, various efforts were made. A bill was presented the National assembly of Pakistan to make the provisions for the prohibition of the Corporal punishment against children entitled “Prohibition of Corporal Punishment Bill, 2014”. On the provincial level, provincial governments of provinces of Pakistan also took the initiatives to stop the corporal punishments in the schools. For example, in 2016, government of Sindh passed the bill of corporal punishment which later promulgated as an Act No. VII of 2017 “Sindh Prohibition of Corporal Punishment Act, 2016”. Similarly, the government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa also initiated the decision to ban on the corporal punishment and enforced the act “The Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Child Protection and Welfare Act, 2010” (Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Act No. XIII of 2010).

Corporal punishment is a matter of concern for the students, teachers, school administration and the policy makers. As it is a common practice of schools to punish the students when their discipline and academic achievement is in danger. But to secure the physical, social and psychological rights of children, CP has been banned by the Government of Pakistan like other countries. But the flip side of this situation may present a different picture. When the said policy is seen in case of school discipline, it is prohibited to a teacher to physically punish a student and at the same time they have to develop them as disciplined and civilized member of the society. Such situation has created a challenge for the teacher, as his perception and belief may affect his commitment to practice this ban in true letter and spirit. This arises the question that how do policy practitioners perceive the ban on corporal punishment? What problems are related to policy practitioners regarding corporal punishment ban in secondary education institutes? To answer these research queries, the present work explained and explored the efficiency of Corporal Punishment Policy in district Sargodha.

2. Objectives of the Study
The research work was comprised of following objectives.

1. To investigate the perception of the teachers as policy practitioners regarding ban enacted by the government on corporal punishments in schools.
2. To explore the factors which hindered the policy practitioners to implement the corporal punishment.

3. Methodology
To explore the said issue, a qualitative phenomenological research approach was used. Therefore, a criterion sampling technique was adopted for this study because it is the suitable strategy to get rich information from a smaller number of participants which are selected on the predetermined criteria. Here in this paper, the predetermined criteria was the ten years of working experience in public elementary schools. There are seven tehsils in the Sargodha district, therefore, at first stage three tehsils were selected which were having greatest number of elementary schools, these were Sargodha (141 schools), Silanwali (57 elementary schools) and Kotmomin (40 elementary schools).
Afterwards, 10 teachers fulfilling the criteria of the study from ten schools from each tehsil were selected. Total 30 teachers were interviewed till the saturation of the data occurred. These phenomenological interviews were primarily based on open-ended questions. The duration for each interview was 40 to 50 minutes, and a prior permission from the school heads and consent of the interviewees were obtained.

The data was analyzed by following the overall process guided by Creswell (2013). The similar ideas and themes were generated from the data and was presented through the major themes.

4. Results & Discussion

The themes were emerged from the 30 interviews collected from the public sector elementary school teachers. The interviewees were requested to express their perception about the ban on corporal punishment. The major themes and the sub theme emerged from collected data are explained in this section.

4.1 Theme 1: Perceptions of Teachers regarding Ban Corporal Punishment

Before the ban on corporal punishment, it was considered as a method of discipline that creates fear among child and increases a child's capability to be an independent and responsible individual. In the public elementary schools, corporal punishment was the major tool to keep the children in control. Conventional corporal punishment is not in practice now a days as the disciplinary actions in most of the schools. It has been replaced by the alternative forms of the punishments such as; community services, additional study assignments after school time, in-school suspension etc.

4.2 Sub Theme 1: Behind the Curtain: Practice or Ban

It was found that most of the teachers of the public elementary school applying corporal punishment instead of its ban to control the class. In their view, without corporal punishment they cannot maintain the class discipline means. Although corporal punishment is banned in schools, there are no hard and fast rules to monitor this in our schools. There are many other ways to punish the children e.g. gives them mental stress, discriminatory behavior, slapping, and abusing, etc. In Pakistani cultural context, there are many laps in the socialization of children in the household and society level. Children are trained in a say they don't bother anything without the fear of punishment at both household and school level. When were asked about the practice of corporal punishment in their school, most of them were of the view that;

Yes, sometimes, I practice corporal punishment because we cannot handle the students in the class so I prefer to use mild corporal punishment. It is done on school’s directions which permit us to punished students without any harm.

Another participant explained

Yes, it is practiced in our school and I had also practiced it because it used by the teachers when all method became fail to improve the academic performance of students, so I prefer to use corporal punishment for some students.

Some other stated as,

No, there is no use of corporal punishment in our school and all of the teachers in our school are restricted to treat with students in a lenient way.

Although many teachers explained their practice of using corporal punishment, others are following the ban.

4.3 Sub Theme 2: Personal Views of Teachers about Corporal Punishment

It has generally assumed that corporal punishment is essential to for students to learn discipline and helps them to achieve educational tasks during the academic session. The discipline is considered as a branch of teaching that improves self-discipline and helpful in personality development. However,
corporal punishment is necessary or not necessary for discipline maintenance, in this context participants gave their personal views and explained that

Yes, I think corporal punishment is necessary to maintain the discipline because students do not obey the teachers without punishment that's why punishment is necessary to control the harsh behavior of students. When schools paddled children who misbehave, the children behave better. Therefore, I believed if teachers will leave corporal punishment it will spoil the students.

Another opined that,

According to me up to some extent, it is necessary to maintain the discipline at school because sometimes you cannot control the student behave accordingly. They don't understand your point and don't obey you so; I consider corporal punishment is necessary for some times.

Another explained that

No, I never ever think that corporal punishment is necessary for any institution to maintain the discipline not only for our institution but all other educational institutions or madrassa physical punishments do not fit properly, but, I believe we use alternative method of discipline instead of corporal punishments so, as it is in Islam against the use of physical force and our Holy Prophet PBUH also used the way of love to convince people and our religious also teach this thing. If we use physical force to maintain the discipline it creates a negative impact on children and they teach this thing or practice at home that's why I have never favored the use of corporal punishment in any institutions.

Another clarified that

Corporal punishment is not needed because it damages the personality of student and students are discouraged when teacher or give any other kind of punishment. I know that it is difficult to maintain discipline without punishment, but I use different strategies to manage it. I think that it is the right decision of the government for the welfare of students. It is good because due to corporal punishment students become rebels and it affects their study so I believe that you can teach moral values; ethics to students instead of punishment’ ever since punishment is most dangerous for the student's career and also for the nation.

Another teacher explained that

It is a good step and it also encourages the slogans of "Maar Nahi Pyaar" because sometimes teachers used so much punishment to handle students because they think the punishment is the only way to control the students and it also effects on the student mind, as a result, they even deviate from their goal in spite of being better.

Most of the teachers replied that corporal punishment is necessary to improve the condition of students. They also said that it should be applied only when all other alternative disciplinary measures are failing to improve the discipline condition.

4.4 Sub Theme 3: Corporal Punishment Ban and Practitioner’s Awareness
When respondents were asked about the Corporal Punishment Act, 2010, they stated that,

Yes, I know about the corporal punishment Act 2010 that imposed ban on corporal punishment. The punishment was banned for students because at that time a lot of incidences happened related to child’s corporal punishment. Even some children died due to the excess of corporal punishment. So, the government passed the rule and make this
Act for child protection, and according to this act, teachers follow the "Maar Nahi Piyar" policy to deal with students in school.

Another opined,

Yes, I am aware of this I have read many times this slogan" Maar Nahi Piyar" (love instead of punishment) written on the walls and boards of schools. But I am not aware of enacted law by the government.

Another participant explained that

I know about in the news that corporal punishment is outlawed. But, I do not have any exact evidence of the prohibition.

Another respondent said,

The law passed by the National Assembly could not apply in every context.

I have seen in an update that corporal punishment is not allowed, but, our school administrator had not given any information on the prohibition of corporal punishment. We use corporal as usual.

Most of the participants stated that they have no clear information about the ban and very few participants are aware of this law.

5. Theme 2: Post Corporal Punishment Legislation Challenges
The data from the interviews revealed that there is a lot of problem and challenges faced by the teachers for the implementation of the ban on corporal punishment.

5.1 Sub Theme 1: Post Corporal Punishment Legislation Problems of Teachers
The ban on the corporal punishment create problems for teachers as they cannot maintain discipline or enhance the performance of students as compared to before the ban so it also affects the teacher's performance as well. Some teachers indicated that,

I also perceived various challenges in the implementation of the policy because after the ban on corporal punishment I face negative attitude of the students in form of misbehavior and get poor performance because the students have no fear of punishment or they become careless.

I think teachers feel powerless after the ban. The rule that we cannot expel students has created so much disorder in schools that we cannot perform our essential duties. Further, they consider that the new discipline pattern is not in the best interest of students. It has become increasingly difficult for teachers to discipline and motivate students to work hard in their studies.

Many participants explained that in our society the ban of punishment created many problems regarding discipline and education performance of students. But now the problem is fear of school administration revolves around FIR and fine in case of using corporal punishment. In this context, some teachers indicated that

They avoid corporal punishment to protect the positive image of their school because they are afraid about police involvement on the school campus as the news spread rapidly on mass media.

Another explained that
I think alternative measures are good, but the problem is that teachers are not properly applying these alternatives as compared to corporal punishment because this was simply presented to educators without training.

Another teacher indicated that

Ban on corporal punishment is not fruitful for students’ personality grooming in schools. As I notice that after the ban of corporal punishment, students use to talk to us in a frank manner which was not observed previously. Even some students make fun of teachers and they cannot say anything due to this ban. Teaching is the most respectful profession and as teachers we are used to receive respect always so on such moments we feel, helpless, disgraced and angry. But we have to control over anger because no such complaint is received by the school administration. We are teachers but we feel as students of this generation lead us.as a result, students are missing the required socialization f their time.

5.2 Sub-theme 2: Current Discipline Condition in Public Elementary Schools

Corporal punishment is given to the students to maintain discipline and their performance. The purpose of corporal punishment is also to correct the behavior of children and maintain and order in the school. Many participants explained that after the ban of corporal punishment a lot of issues regarding discipline occurred. In this context, a teacher explained that

It is very difficult for me to maintain discipline in class and I have faced serious cases of indiscipline by the students. There are a lot of cases of student's misbehavior and they beat another innocent fellow student when I go out the class. Now they have no fear of punishment thus maintaining the discipline is quite difficult in the class.

It is clear from the above statement by the teacher that it is difficult to maintain discipline in class in the absence of corporal punishment. Other teachers opined that

"I think before this ban students were paying more attention to their studies and were well-disciplined because they have a fear of punishment, but after the ban, they feel free from punishment and not attend a lesson attentively or do not perform better in the class. But now the students misbehaved with teachers because they know the teacher cannot punish them. This behavior of students is very bad for the student's future".

"I perceived that before the ban teachers were freely punishing their students, how much they want they punish, and sometimes some teachers used very worst methods for discipline, but after the ban, I use alternative strategies of discipline to maintain and one rule the students. Because now teachers cannot easily just a slap to students because they have a fear that they can be arrested in case of corporal punishment".

No, but sometimes if any student behaves rudely, I can handle this situation with different techniques like counseling. Children in the primary section are in search of love. If they do not find love, or if they find harsh words or harassment from someone then they show misbehaved sometimes. So, I handle this situation very calmly. I show them care, love and benevolence. Because I think the teacher should handle this situation very carefully.

Most of the participants indicated that they are facing difficulties to ensure discipline in class after the ban on corporal punishment. Some teachers were frustrated to give up the responsibility of maintaining discipline in class because they think the alternative discipline measure is not working effectively as corporal punishment. On the other hand, some public elementary school teachers mentioned that their class discipline is good because they use small curriculum activities to engage the students in class.
5.3 Theme 3: Opinion of Teachers regarding Government Policy on CP
The majority of the participants did not support the ban on corporal punishment as they were of the view that this ban increased indiscipline in schools. Consequently, all of the participants specified that light punishment should be needed enough to change unwanted behavior. But they also argued that punishment should never take a severe form.

5.3.1 Sub Theme 1: Perceptions of Teacher’s towards Policy Implementation
The purpose of this theme is to explain the teachers’ perceptions about the policy which imposes ban on corporal punishment. The data revealed that most of the teachers were not contented with the ban on corporal punishment. As many of them mentioned that,

No, I am not satisfied with the government policy and government should not ban it totally because if the child has no fear of punishment they cannot take an interest in the study so I believe that rules must be flexible that teacher would not beat the student harshly but they create fear of punishment in their heart through light punishments.

I think government policy regarding the ban on corporal punishment is not suitable for existing situations because now students become spoiled due to social media so sometimes teachers required punishing them but it should not exceed to beating.

The participants revealed that policy to ban corporal punishment is creating difficulties for teachers to maintain discipline because some of the teachers are not trained to use another alternative method of discipline.

Some other public elementary school teachers pointed out that present corporal punishment policy is a good initiative by the government. They further explained that

Yes, I am satisfied somehow because it is good for those government schools where teacher taking extra advantages or badly beat; thus creating a bad effect on student’ health.

Teachers opined that government policy on corporal punishment ban is one-sided because it only favors students. They think that before the ban on corporal punishment they can easily tackle students' learning and behavior problems. Though after this legislation, now they are facing many problems regarding discipline management in class. So they believe it has affected the whole school environment.

5.3.2 Sub Theme 2: Participants' Opinion regarding the Modification of Policy
When teacher as policy practitioners were asked about the modification of policy, they opined that

Yes, according to my opinion, it should be modified because every policy has some positive or negative impact after its implementation so its non-beneficial aspects should be modified. Moreover teachers’ opinion should also be included in policy formulation.

Another said that

Government should modify such policy and should not generalize it. The action should be taken for only those teachers who physically injure the student, but not for those who use such light punishment that enhances the performance of the student”.

Some other participants mentioned that

Yes, I think it should be changed and punishment should allow during the school because nowadays children become spoiled so light punishment should be allowed for their rude behavior

Some participant favored such corporal punishment policy as they explained
No, I think, so it is good policy or never change it because it helps me to establish a positive learning relationship with students that based on mutual respect and respect for the right of the other.

Teachers are in the favor of modification of policy and they also wanted to be a part of policy formulation.

5.3.3 Sub-theme 3: Participants Suggestion regarding the Policy Implementation and Modification

When teachers were asked to give suggestion regarding the policy implementation and modification most of them presented the following suggestion

I suggest that mild corporal punishment should be allowed in schools and must be applied by the teachers because students do not pay attention in their studies without punishment.

I think the mild corporal punishment is an effective and successful way of maintaining discipline and strengthening students’ academic achievement because the students complete their homework and perform well in daily/weekly inspections as a result of light corporal punishment. Therefore, I believe that mild corporal punishment should be applied.

I suggested that policy implementation should be in such a manner that students and teacher do not feel humiliation in adopting such polices or teacher must be guided how to face learner or behavior problem of students.

I would like to suggest that the government should build a practical mechanism to follow the practice of educational policies in school. Further, I believe a teacher should be taught in a humble and lenient way and avoid harsh punishment because which thing is possible, that can be done by the lenient way so why we use harsh and hard way. There should be legal action against those and schools where harsh punishments constantly used.

Another participant suggested that

I think after the ban on corporal punishment government should invest more for the training of the teachers to raise their knowledge on making their teaching effective and attractive through the use of other alternative discipline methods to cope up with this serious problem.

The most of the teachers recommended that corporal punishment should be reduced, but not be banned because teachers generally felt disempowered in their ability to handle the class. In explaining the reason of it, they opined that the mild punishment may provoke fear and respect for teachers among them which will help in improving the learners’ academic achievement. Furthermore, they added that remedial classes, additional work assignments, daily or weekly assessments would be in practice as an effective strategies to tackle the behavioral issues of the students and those who show poor performance. Moreover, the government should implement policy in such a way that is acceptable for both students and teachers. They believed that the use of mild corporal punishment to manage class discipline does not go against any law and it played an important role in increasing the performance of students at the primary school level.

7. Conclusion

Corporal punishment of students in different countries has been perceived as a serious concern of the governments resulted in the implementation of corporal punishment policy which strictly bans such punishments. The same scenario was observed in Pakistan when it banned corporal punishment under Corporal Punishment Act, 2010. Though the policy was implemented to save children from cruel punishments at different places, we discussed it at primary school level. The purpose of this article was to study the perception and the problems faced by the teachers as policy practitioners with regard to ban on corporal punishment. They confront certain challenges and face problems in its implementation. The
conclusion of this paper reveals that the said policy was implemented by the state as rights-based principle. As Pakistan was a signatory of international treaties so it had to implement such policies under the international umbrella. It followed the pattern of other countries that banned CP without realizing the consequences. Moreover, the pressure groups like child welfare non-profit organization lays a great stress on state to pass such laws. Some groups consider media as a pressure group; but it has just a catalytic action in the society. To be more concise, the state vision to promote child welfare is hardly seen through its policies as at the end the welfare of the target group must be assured not doubted.

During the policy formulation, the policy stakeholder’s opinion is always welcomed to secure the chances of its success; but it was not the case in corporal punishment policy. Teachers as one of the stake-holder are of corporal punishment policy; are seen mostly reactive with corporal punishment policy. It is an imposed model which does not include teachers’ opinion as they are the policy practitioners and have to face the consequences of the policy first. If by chance there is teachers’ inclusion for some policy discussions, teacher’ union representatives are called who are selected on votes not due to teaching performance. Despite the fact physical social and mental torture should not be allowed, teachers are vulnerable when they have to deal with a group of students without the authorization of discipline maintenance. Their authorization in the public elementary schools is restricted to a level that they are not allowed to socialize the students against their will. This creates desperateness in this auspicious profession. In the light of these conclusions, it may be suggested that government might address the problem of corporal punishment in school by having a broader recognition of the problem. The cases of different children might be dealt differently by a collaborative group of teachers, parents and administration. The policy should deal the school students in different manner to secure their future. The policy should be amended to facilitate the teachers and maintain the discipline of the schools.

References

Assessing Mathematics Teachers’ Dispositions

Khadijah Batool, Muhammad Anwer, Muhammad Shabbir

Phd Scholar, University of Education Lahore, Pakistan, Khadijah.syedd@gmail.com
Assistant Professor University of Education Lahore, Pakistan, dranwer@ue.edu.pk
Assistant Professor, Govt. College University Faisalabad, Pakistan, mskhalid606@yahoo.com

ABSTRACT
The study was aimed at comparison mathematics teacher’s dispositions at secondary level. The research was conducted to distinguish the difference of disposition among teachers on male and female basis as well as on their academic qualification base. One hundred and twenty teachers who were teaching mathematics at secondary level were selected. Data were gathered through stratified sampling technique by administering the questionnaire. The results indicated a statistical difference exist among mathematics teachers on gender basis and also with respect to their qualifications as well within groups. When comparing the mean scores results of the study depicted a significant effect of gender and qualification on teacher's dispositions towards mathematics. (p<.05). The results of this research indicated that bulk of teachers had significant difference of dispositions towards self, students and insignificant difference of dispositions towards colleagues. In addition, the in-service teachers’ DIPS vary and also significant on the basis of their qualifications. It is recommended that larger sample should be taken from public and private school to check and improve teacher’s dispositions. This study should also be carried out on college and university level to assess and enhance teachers’ dispositions.

1. Introduction
Disposition can be defined in terms of trust which motivates someone to act and react (Biber, Tuna, & Incikabi, 2013). Mathematical disposition identifies an individual's psychological capacity. According to Beyers (2011) Mathematical disposition is divided into 3 perspectives (1) Cognitive, (2) Affective, and (3) Conative. The National Research Council explains mathematical disposition as the inclinations towards mathematics and consider it both valuable and advantageous, to accept that getting mathematics knowledge is profitable, and to help an individual to consider himself as an oneself to be a powerful student and practitioner of math” (2001, p. 131) dispositions of teachers most probably reveal educators professional skills and techniques. It shows instructors' frames of mind, conduct and set of qualities is reliant on their expert learning. The National Accreditation Council for Teacher Education (2001)
describes "beliefs, potentials, responsibilities, and expert morals that impact practices toward pupils, families, partners, and organizations that influence pupils learning, inspiration, and advancement and also the teacher's very own proficient development". “Qualities of people, such as frames of mind, convictions, interests, appreciative nature, qualities, and abilities to modify according to change”(Taylor and Wasicsko, 2000). Disposition is a framework of conduct which is often shown in the nonattendance of stress that is a conscious and unconscious one.

A report from European Commission highlights (Eurydice, 2011) Change activities in mathematics are an immediate reaction to the manners in which subject was being taught (Cobb, Wood, Yackel, 2012). Researchers depicting an old mathematics classroom, in which procedural type issues are both taught and learnt. Cobb (2012) expressed that "mathematics in institutions regularly has the nature of guidelines or principles and rules for some pupils,” rather than an attention on understanding mathematics ideas. Additionally, Boaler (2016) who did research on two schools that utilized various instructional practices, in the school that engaged with old practices, critical thinking in classrooms. Researching on non-contextual reading material issues may likewise pupils are occupied with study related material.

It is proposed that these kinds of procedural mathematical exercises center around low level intellectual abilities, for example, reviewing, , or recognizing numerical figures. Such exercises infrequently request that pupils to go beyond the techniques so they might be difficult to understand conceptual things (Bushman and Bushman 2004).

Besides, Boaler's (2016) research featured, pupils in the conventional study hall frequently pay attention to teachers’ lectures and afterward rehearsed the issues that were displayed by the instructor. In such sequence such as questions, and assessment, pupils don't generally examine arithmetics thoughts, nor do they build mathematics conceptual understandings, yet are associated with what Richards (2011) called such a number talk which includes the discourse.

Sometimes students may not involve in classroom discussions. In this way they cannot get the advantages that can be achieved by communicating, for example, to get a chance to explain one's mathematical thinking. The responsibility of a teacher in classrooms is to deliver knowledge clarify thoughts, explain processes and give them time to rehearse the methods (Hiebert, 2007).

It is stated that educators in such customary classrooms show strategies or calculations by demonstration methods for pupils (Bushman and Bushman, 2014). In these study halls, pupils frequently have to listen carefully what is said by teacher while the instructor is the practitioner (Lockhead, 2011). This may be called as educators are just delivering knowledge while pupils get it. In Boaler's (2002) study, despite the fact that the instructors in conventional study halls knew the courses, they were committed also. Old mathematical study halls are portrayed by instructor focused action, (for example,) utilizing strategies, rules, or methods to tackle issues.

1.1 A Critique of Traditional School Mathematics
Teachers of arithmetic criticized the old method of teachings mathematics (Boaler, Wiliam, & Brown 2007). They have utilized such terminology as process related comprehension and theoretical understanding to allude to the information probably created in conventional and change conditions. This part intends to clarify what analysts think by theoretical and practical agreement and it was necessary to comprehension and applied comprehension for thinking chances.

Developing teachers’ teaching techniques in analytical thinking, to improve students’ dispositions towards arithmetic reasoning.

1.2 Switching Process Comprehension to Conceptual Understanding
It is recognized the "cycle of comprehension” as connecting mental portrayals through thinking (Sierpinska, 2014). Skemp (2006) contended for two sorts of comprehension in arithmetic, "social
comprehension" (reasonable) and "instrumental comprehension" (procedural). It would be "depicted as 'rules short of reasons', short of understanding for some pupils, educators consider such regulations, and capacity to utilize it, was what they implied by 'understanding'. Skemp (2006) explained about learning social science, expressing it "comprises of working up an applied structure (diagram) from which its holder can (on a fundamental level) produce a boundless number of plans for getting from beginning stage inside his pattern to any completing point"

2. Theoretical Models and Definitions
The inclusion of disposition evaluation in the NCATE standards created a rush to assess a quality not yet fully operationalized. While this rush may have clouded efforts to establish a coherent understanding of the concept, it also initiated a discussion in which all schools of education have a vested interest (Borko, 2007). Grounding this discussion is a body of literature establishing various theoretical approaches recommended for teacher education institutions to consider in developing definitions, educational experiences, and assessments of dispositions.

2.1 Theoretical Models
Some arguments about the nature of dispositions vary along a spectrum between dispositions characterized as innate and immutable traits, and dispositions characterized as subject to growth and development. The existence of an identifiable set of traits and that all students, who represent the entire spectrum of personality traits, will benefit academically from a homogeneous set of teachers possessing that one limited set of traits (Burant et al., 2007). At the other end of the spectrum, the adoption of disposition assessment assumes that teacher education practices influence teaching dispositions (Koeppen & Davison-Jenkins, 2006).

Another conceptual struggle is between characterizing dispositions as a distinct construct, versus seeing them as interwoven with knowledge and skills. Knowledge and skills are believed to influence dispositions because individuals avoid activities and environments, they believe exceed their capabilities, while they readily undertake positively challenging activities and select environments, they judge themselves capable of managing (Bandura, 1997; Hasslen & Bacharach, 2007). While expanding the knowledge and skills in teacher candidates can influence their dispositions, pre-existing dispositions may be what motivates them to seek professional knowledge and skills (Diez, 2007).

2.2 Defining Dispositions
While opponents to the inclusion of disposition assessment in teacher preparation claim there is no agreed upon definition of dispositions, and that existing definitions developed for NCATE requirements are vulnerable to each academy’s biases (Borko et al., 2007), there are several definitions in use which do not vary greatly.

Dispositions are qualities which are rooted in 13 qualities such as behaviors, attitudes, standards, and dogmas thought to be taken as practices we select (Eberly et al., 2007). Similarly, dispositions tend to be defined at the teacher education level as characteristics associated with desirable attitudes and beliefs, especially those associated with the desire to teach diverse learners equitably and effectively. As mentioned in an earlier discussion of the limitations of previous studies, definitions of dispositions vary in their balance between actions or observed behaviors, and the beliefs and attitudes presumed to be the motives behind those behaviors (Covaleskie, 2007).

Definitions of dispositions are linked to definitions of effective teaching, such as caring, fairness, respect, enthusiasm, and reflective practice (Edwards & Edick, 2006). In any case, dispositions involve awareness, inclination, and reflection on thinking and behavior, not just thinking, or just behavior (Schussler, 2006). An early definition of disposition considered it a summary of observed behavior and the likelihood of its continued occurrence (Katz & Raths, 1985).

This definition did not characterize dispositions as a root cause of behaviors, but as a description of behaviors and their relative incidence in certain situations. These behaviors included dispositions to
suspend judgment, seek help when needed, and accept professional advice, and were recommended as goals for teacher education programs. Katz and Raths called them habits of mind, meaning these behaviors were so well practiced that responses were automatic, no longer requiring 14 concentrated thought. Such dispositional goals should be focused exclusively on behaviors related to effective teaching in the classroom (1985). Aligned with the moral perspective is the definition of ethical teaching as the demonstration of specialized attitudes and values which certify equality and impartiality in interactions towards pupils, people, colleagues, and participants of the community (Sileo et al., 2008). Defining disposition in the context of developing an educational philosophy (Brown, 2007) presents its own set of complications. Disposition can be defined as the nature of responses to diverse learners, and the skill demonstrated in those responses, or as the underlying set of beliefs and attitudes held by that teacher, that presumably cause the desired responses. In practice, however, no reliable inference can be made either way.

A teacher may have the desired beliefs and attitudes, but simply lack the skill to realize goals for equitable academic gains. Another teacher may not have the desired attitudes or beliefs, but teach skillfully in response to the fact that such behavior forms a basis for evaluation. So the disposition to respond in a particular way does not necessarily imply a particular philosophy, nor does a particular philosophy necessarily predict the disposition to respond to students in desired ways (Covaleskie, 2007). An exploratory study of teacher beliefs casts dispositions in a construct of academic optimism, a general construct grounded in positive psychology. Academic optimism is composed of efficacy, trust, and academic emphasis (spending more time on educational responsibilities), is positively connected with student achievement. The related teacher behaviors were dispositional optimism, student-centered actions, beliefs and classroom management, and willingness to work beyond contract hours.

Academically optimistic teachers believe they can contribute in students’ effective learning by giving students on their own capacities of solving problems and to work hard to get success. (Hoy, 2008) The cognitive, cultural and experimental approach to dispositions leads to a definition of dispositions as the cognitive and affective attributes that filter one’s knowledge, skills, and beliefs, and influence the actions a teacher takes in the classroom or professional setting. These attributes are differentiated from factors and qualities of effective teaching, which may be due to dispositions, but are not dispositions themselves (Thornton, 2006). Preparing teachers to respond to diverse student populations cannot be reduced to a set of dispositions; it requires a broad approach including knowledge, understanding how children learn, pedagogical expertise, the abilities to diagnose difficulties and tap into resources and strengths, and proficiency with assessments. These qualities compose the disposition to teach all learners equitably (Villegas, 2007). The three descriptors that arise frequently in the InTASC and NCATE documents – 1) fair-mindedness, 2) the faith that every student could study, and 3) respect for diversity – tend to be the foundation for most working definitions of disposition.

Teacher education units are permitted to add other professional dispositions, but must articulate them in their frameworks, and systematically assess them based on observable behaviors in educational settings. These dispositions must have merit in educational practice (Koeppen & Davison-Jenkins, 2006); 16 consequently, disposition definitions draw heavily on characteristics of effective teaching. They draw particularly on observable teaching behaviors. Because belief statements have little link to efficacy, and personality traits are relatively immutable, attempting to directly assess dispositions themselves is unhelpful and potentially risky. Additionally, the inference of particular beliefs based on observed behavior is questionable at best (Burant et al., 2007; McNight, 2004). Finally, restricting definitions of dispositions to observable behaviors could prevent legal problems resulting from unfair biases.

2.3 Standards for Teacher Dispositions

Literature in the educator disposition consists of individual institutions reporting their process in operationalizing these dispositions, designing instructional activities for their development, and implementing assessments. These reports suggest some similarities in processes experienced around the country. Once a faculty agreed upon a working definition of dispositions, teacher education programs generally chose specific dispositions for course goals. These goals led to assessments of behaviors
ranging from those believed to be indicative of general professionalism, such as punctuality, meeting deadlines, and dressing professionally (L’Allier, Elish-Piper, & Young, 2007), to behaviors believed to be indicative of less tangible ideals, such as an orientation toward social justice (Villegas, 2007). Once items were selected for instruction and assessment of pre-service teachers, then studies were conducted in attempts to validate either the items themselves as constructs of disposition, or to validate measurement instruments. This section summarizes these reports, working from a framework of the applicable principles in the InTASC draft standards, and looking at three general areas: the desired dispositions, the teaching skills or behaviors that exemplify those dispositions, and the teacher education instructional practices being developed to foster growth in both skills and dispositions. (There are ten standards in all, but this review omits those that are not represented in the literature.)

3. Objectives of the Study
This study will be conducted:
1. To assess dispositions of mathematics teacher’s at secondary schools.

4. Research Questions
The research questions will be investigated given below:
1. What is the level of teacher’s dispositions?
2. Do the teachers differ in their dispositions on the basis of gender?
3. Do the teachers differ in their dispositions on the basis of their qualification?

5. Research Methodology
The nature of the research is quantitative. Data was gathered by using survey. The sample was selected in quantitative phase. The population for this study was more than 800, therefore, selected sample was 120 teachers.

5.1 Quantitative Phase
For quantitative phase, two stage stratified random sampling technique was used. At first stage, the schools were selected randomly from different districts. From each district twenty male and twenty female schools were selected. Therefore, one hundred and twenty teachers from secondary schools were selected.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Groups</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean Score</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>t-value</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Disposition</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>117.18</td>
<td>15.364</td>
<td>-3.238</td>
<td>.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>123.79</td>
<td>16.282</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>50.03</td>
<td>7.864</td>
<td>-3.605</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>53.66</td>
<td>7.712</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colleagues</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>15.16</td>
<td>2.846</td>
<td>-.605</td>
<td>.546</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>15.39</td>
<td>3.123</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>51.98</td>
<td>7.150</td>
<td>-2.860</td>
<td>.005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>54.74</td>
<td>7.780</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

P<0.05, P>0.05 for colleagues

Above table shows that there was significance difference in the mean score of male of (M=117.18, SD=15.364) and female (M=123.79, SD=16.282) at p<0.05. It shows that, both groups have significance difference between mean scores of gender. So it can be concluded that male and female have significant difference mean scores on disposition. Whereas there was no significance difference in the mean score
of male (M=50.03, SD=7.864) and female (M=53.66, SD=7.712) at p<0.05. It shows that, both groups have no significance difference between mean scores of gender. So it can be concluded that male and female have no significant difference mean scores on self. Above table shows that there was no significance difference in the mean score of male (M=15.16, SD=2.846) and female (M=15.39, SD=3.123) at p<0.05.

It shows that, both groups have no significance difference between mean scores of gender. So it can be concluded that male and female have no significant difference mean scores on self. Above table shows that there was no significance difference in the mean score of male (M=15.16, SD=2.846) and female (M=15.39, SD=3.123) at p<0.05.

So it can be concluded that male and female have no significant difference mean scores on self. Above table shows that there was no significance difference in the mean score of male (M=15.16, SD=2.846) and female (M=15.39, SD=3.123) at p<0.05.

It shows that, both groups have no significance difference between mean scores of gender. So it can be concluded that male and female have significant difference mean scores on colleagues. There was significance difference in the mean score of male (M=51.98, SD=7.150) and female (M=54.74, SD=7.780) at p<0.05. It shows that, both groups have significance difference between mean scores of gender. So it can be concluded that male and female have significant difference mean scores on students.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Groups</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean Score</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>t-value</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Disposition</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>117.18</td>
<td>15.364</td>
<td>-3.238</td>
<td>.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>50.03</td>
<td>7.712</td>
<td>-3.605</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

P<0.05

Whereas, above table summarizes the results of disposition (Df=12.59) and self (Df=.238). Results indicated a significant association was found between them.

ANOVA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>Df</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Between Groups</td>
<td>.729</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>214508.14</td>
<td>8.274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within Groups</td>
<td>56338.205</td>
<td>236</td>
<td>238.721</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>62263.933</td>
<td>239</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* p<0.000

The F value (8.274) for all subjects of four levels of qualification was significant at p<0.000. It is indicated that dispositions were significantly different between and within groups.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Qualification</th>
<th>Qualification</th>
<th>MD</th>
<th>Standard Error</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BA/BSC</td>
<td>MA/MSC</td>
<td>13.473</td>
<td>3.281</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MPhil</td>
<td>8.904</td>
<td>3.699</td>
<td>.017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PhD</td>
<td>23.923</td>
<td>5.749</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MA/MSC</td>
<td>MPhil</td>
<td>-4.569</td>
<td>2.467</td>
<td>.065</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PhD</td>
<td>10.450</td>
<td>5.045</td>
<td>.039</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MPhil</td>
<td>PhD</td>
<td>15.019</td>
<td>5.327</td>
<td>.005</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* p<0.01

The mean difference (13.473 & 8.904 & 23.923) among respondents of MA/MSC, MPhil, PhD on disposition were significant at p<0.01 respectively.
Table 5. Difference of dispositions among different levels of qualification

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>Df</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Between Groups</td>
<td>1578.931</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>526.310</td>
<td>2.047</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within Groups</td>
<td>60685.003</td>
<td>236</td>
<td>257.140</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>62263.933</td>
<td>239</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* p > .108

The F value (2.047) for all respondents of four levels of qualification with dispositions was significant at p > .108. It is evident that post-hoc test was used on it.

6. Results and Discussion

This research discovered teachers’ dispositions towards arithmetic’s with respect to their four sub-scale. Also, the study aimed at comparing the results of this study with previous similar study there were noticeable variances between men and women in their dispositions towards mathematics. Therefore, educators might undervalue women’s arithmetic skills by means of to display additional arithmetic anxiety than men if they have extraordinary capacity (Kyriacou & Goulding, 2006). In the US, study suggestion specifies that gender break in arithmetic accomplishment were being thinning (Perie, Moran, & Lutkus, 2005) so females touched uniformity with males in arithmetic and calculations (Hydea & Mertzb, 2009).

The non-significant male and female variance in numerical capability on other side in concurrence with past investigation discoveries (Awofala and Anyikwa, 2014; Fatade, Nneji, Awofala and Awofala, 2012) in up-to-date arithmetic among prospective mathematics instructors and grown-up students however negated other past discoveries (Awofala, 2011; Ozofor, 2001; Ogunkunle, 2007) which uncovered the presence of huge male and female contrasts in mathematics. Then again, the critical male and female variance impact on school students’ presentation in arithmetic’s re-repeated the deteriorating speech that guys were preferable in arithmetic over females.

Samuelsson (2010) found that there was no critical impact of male and female on every one of the elements of numerical capability. The suggestion of the current investigation discoveries with respect to sex is that male and female orientation contrasts in numerical capability are not, at this point significant yet that ordinary contrasts may in any case exist in execution in arithmetic. This distinction may be the variance in study on gender basis as a rule supported the male and female study in the arithmetic lecture hall.

In this piece of research there was also seen a difference between of dispositions on gender basis. Furthermore post hoc results signifies difference among teachers qualification such as BA/BSC, MA/MSC, MPhil, PhD. This concurred the discoveries of Wu (2008) that appeared the theoretical comprehension, practical familiarity, key competence were related. The little relationship between the measurements of numerical capability appeared unique. The findings coincide by the conclusion of Samuelsson (2010) which shown little and noteworthy associations relationship between such abilities but relationship among theoretical comprehension and vital competency were extraordinary.

Attitude plays a vital role in teachers practices in a way what one belief or thinks he does the same. Behavior means how a person thinks, acts and reacts which also has positively and negative influence on teacher’s performance, his strategies, lesson planning and pupils achievements (Omolar & Adebuokola, 2015). It was further revealed that there was significant strong positive correlation was existed between teachers’ disposition and teaching methods at p ≤ 0.05 level of significance. Disposition is an important thing of 21st century higher order thinking abilities required for critical thinking and in favor of its procedure (Beyer, 1987; Facione, 1998).

More emphasis is on enhancing dispositions qualities should be given prime importance (Çubukçu,
The aim of research to find out mathematics teacher’s disposition with four subscales. Research identified arithmetic teachers have found significant statistical difference towards dispositions self and students except colleagues. The results were quite similar with the finding of Çetinkaya (2011). But there were some researchers who have different finding such as Tümokay (2011), found experienced had significant high scores than new ones on self-assurance. Whereas, Akgün and Duruk (2016) found that any significant association among male and female basis, grade institutions factor with dispositions.

Comparable outcomes were apparent with the results (Zayif, 2008). Çetinkaya (2011), stated that feminine understudies are altogether greater than boy’s understudies on liberality reality-chasing scales scores. Additionally set up that administration mathematics educators’ manner levels show huge contrast dependent on sex for female understudies in receptiveness subscale (Yenice, 2011).

7. Recommendations
Research looked at mathematics teachers dispositions at secondary level in Govt. schools in Pakistan. It is suggested that population could be size larger for forthcoming researches and it could be applied to other level of teachers in different subjects as well as in private and public schools as well. Researchers should investigate further factors that may enhance development of dispositions in mathematics teachers.

References


Interrelation of Multiple Intelligences and their Correlation with Linguistic Intelligence as Perceived by College Students: A Correlation Study

1Wajiha Kanwal, 2Quratulain, 3Iffat Basit
1Assistant Professor, Department of Education, University of Wah, Wah Cantt, Pakistan, dr.wajihakanwal@uow.edu.pk
2Assistant Professor, Baluchistan University of Engineering and Technology, Khuzdar, Pakistan
3Assistant Professor, Baluchistan University of Engineering and Technology, Khuzdar, Pakistan

ARTICLE DETAILS
History
Revised format: November 2020
Available Online: December 2020

Keywords
Multiple intelligences, logical-mathematical intelligence, Visual-spatial intelligence, Bodily-kinesthetic intelligence, Interpersonal intelligence, intrapersonal intelligence

JEL Classification
M11, M12

ABSTRACT
The present study was concerned to determine Interrelation of Multiple Intelligences and their correlation with linguistic intelligence as perceived by college students. All the students of intermediate level studying in Islamabad Model Colleges was the population of this study. The 1000 students were selected as sample by using simple random sampling technique Questionnaire for students was used to collect the data. Experts were involved for validation of research instrument. The reliability was measured through pilot testing on 100 students. Researcher used SPSS advanced version to analyze the quantitative data. Mean, Standard Deviation, and Pearson Coefficient Correlation were used to analyze the data. The results of the study showed that moderate inter-correlation exists between verbal/linguistic and logical/mathematical intelligences and. It was suggested that teachers may use all the Multiple intelligences during the teaching-learning process to promote their development.

© 2020 Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: dr. wajihakanwal@uow.edu.pk

Recommended citation: Kanwal, W., Quratulain, & Basit, I. (2020). Interrelation of Multiple Intelligences and their Correlation with Linguistic Intelligence as Perceived by College Students: A Correlation Study. Journal of Business and Social Review in Emerging Economies, 6(4), 1439-1447

1. Introduction
With the technique of mental cerebrum technology as the ones accepted norms to training, teachers carry discover a top tempo charmed via way of means of serving understudies make considering techniques. How college students envision want rework into Pretty a lot this is only a glimpse of something large large over what they consider. MI concept offers an Ideal affiliation with selecting getting a manage on approximately understudies' highbrow aptitudes. The 8 insights with inside the version want assist themselves highbrow limits.

Thus, to make any or at for them with inside the guides delineated to beyond components might be on empowering the ones enhancements of understudies' capacity to think. MI may also an possibility to be useful, in any case, on gander this is only a glimpse of somthing large, particularly In how mi tenet applies of the zone's (Bowell, 2004; Chen, 2007) This studies changed into designed as Relationship of Linguistic intelligence with Multiple Intelligences: A Correlation observe at Collage college students
Actually studies to test the connection among a couple of intelligences with linguistic intelligence. The main objectives of the study were to determining students perceived levels of multiple intelligences and Identifying the correlation between Linguistic Intelligence with other multiple intelligences

**Hypotheses**

1. $H_01$ “There is no significant relationship between Linguistic Intelligence and Logical Mathematical Intelligence of students at higher secondary level”.
2. $H_02$ “There is no significant relationship between Linguistic Intelligence and Bodily/kinesthetic Intelligence of students at higher secondary level”.
3. $H_03$ “There is no significant relationship between Linguistic Intelligence and visual/Spatial Intelligence of students at higher secondary level”.
4. $H_04$ “There is no significant relationship between Linguistic Intelligence and Musical Intelligence of students at higher secondary level”.
5. $H_05$ “There is no significant relationship between Linguistic Intelligence and Intrapersonal Intelligence of students at higher secondary level”.
6. $H_06$ “There is no significant relationship between Linguistic Intelligence and Interpersonal Intelligence of students at higher secondary level”.

2. **Review of Related Literature**

The phonetic Knowledge embarrasses verbal articulation via numerous dialects, so that it will speak round your thoughts similarly because it desires to apprehend others. (Checkley, 1997) The etymological perception lets in humans to speak with the universe via language via vernacular. Specialists epitomize this velocity over it is made structure. Students who exhibits hobby in rhymes, making jokes etc. surely tents to talk their inward notion via way of means of the use of languages. It consists of verbal exchange through gestures to illustrate linguistic highbrow competence. (Gardner, 1919).

Reasonable logical know-how permits people to apply and understand dynamic relations. Researcher, mathematicians, furthermore scientists all rely in advance this insight. Individuals with an astoundingly generated shrewd numerical know-how draw close the essential standards which leads them to nation each a part of a comprehensive causal framework, like a researcher or an analyst does. This kind of intelligence may also facilitate mathematicians to manipulate numbers, quantities and different comparable activities. (Checkley, 1999).

Musical intelligence refers back to the capacity to ruminate in track, functionality to listen melodious patterns, distinguish among numerous musical melodies, reminisce them, and likely manage them. People with resilient musical intelligence can't simplest keep in mind track without difficulty however they even can not get it out in their minds, it is very pervasive. Remarkably, there's commonly an affective affiliation among feelings and the track; likewise musical and mathematical intelligences might also additionally stake not unusualplace philosophy.

Young people having this type of intelligence are commonly interested by making a song an gambling musical gadgets like beating drums etc. They are frequently particularly greater aware about sounds and descants that others might also additionally neglect. People with musical intelligence relatively greater respect track and musical composition and performance. Melodic awareness is the potential to suppose in track, have to have the capacity to concentrate designs, apprehend them, evaluation them, and possibly manage them. 

Campanulated (1997) recommends that teachers who want to enhance melodic highbrow competence camwood sing a rap or a song that explains the ones topics (Checkley, 1997). Portrays melodic quickness the "track keen" people experience approximately track, tuning in for examples, perceiving, recalling, and controlling them. They are first-class thru resonances for remembering tuning for moreover making resonances for instance, to such an volume that melodies, rhythms, designs, what greater numerous varieties of sound associated outpouring. They have the capacity to apply inductive moreover deductive reasoning are greater understand institutions up data (Lazaer, 2002).
Spatial intelligence joins the restrict need to understand the visible fact impeccably and to carry out modifications likewise changes upon one's very own beginning acknowledgments via intellectual imagery. Down to earth views from ensuring spatial cleverness consolidate tasteful structure, map perusing, moreover an terrific clothier would require each the modern capacities and also specific foul accomplishing.

An car laborer or clothier, then again, does not convincing clarification modern What's steadily tasteful capacities need to discover the final results need to a stalling engine (Gardner, 1999). Spatial awareness pastime the "photo keen" relatives want the restrict will cope with the spatial globe over their minds. In this way, they growth satisfactory seemingly what is steadily have a tendency need to sift via their thinking about spatially (Lazaer, 2000).

Portrays that significant sensation perception licenses people to apply all alternatively and simply the ones particular figures to make outcomes or take care of problems. Competitors, specialists, artists, choreographers, and specialties people constantly on the use of physical sensation perception activity. The ability is also disposed towards must do population endeavors Inevitably Tom's investigative manufacture fashions as confined forming reports, who toss deteriorated piece of a paper with repeat in addition to precision under waste baskets in extra of these space (Gardner, 1999).

Gardner (1999) Relational understanding engages people should apprehend exasperate differentiations, some thing like others aims. Instructors, guardians, legislators, clinicians and gives people rely investigating relational acumen pastime. Researchers display this acumen pastime once they prosper as for little collecting effort, at what time they come to be aware about react of the temperaments because putting forward their companion's in addition to schoolmates, through their thoughtfully persuade people teacher's affirmation concerning their convincing motivation in the direction of more second be meant to finish the ones schoolwork obligations. Relational astuteness comprehends diverse people. It's a capability we at want, regardless are a top rate at the off risk which you could an instructor, clinician, income rep, or lawmaker. Any character who can wish for others want have to an possibility to successful of relational encircle (Checkley,1997).

Intrapersonal means what your identification is, the issue that you can do, what you need to do, the way you react ought to matters, which matters to hold away from, moreover which matters will skim towards (Gardner, 1999), gift one of the maximum clean preparations of phrases. Those taking in fashion composing suggests an awesome display for phrases that want assist comparable, but without a doubt unique. Explanation from affirming that is critical to a comprehension for problems in steerage arrangement. Those an considerable phase putting length that separates the ones phrases slanting fashion, taking in approach, taking in tendency highbrow fashion is that degree on which they will be considered clarified. Styles: Classifications, thoughts (Curry,1991, Riding and Cheema, 1991).

MI principle facilities around a first rate type of understudies' perception underlined via way of means of Davis, (1991) expressed that it elevates diverse techniques to learn. Due to rigid instructional plan, great numbers college students lose redirections to in a direct outcome. Every child has inherent abilities, be that during our informational establishment's instructive module first-class fixated on verbal/phonetic and consistent/medical cleverness. Instructors ought to have the ability of examine the ones inward global approximately every person, in order make on the other hand increase every youngster's distinctiveness with accommodating them a perfect approach for education. Additionally see distinctiveness likewise reliably convincing motivation to make cautious for every thrilling difference.

Different intellectual capacity hypothesis is robust to instructors to get it contrasts from ensuring each character makes every one's capacity and plausibility and get-togethers supply becoming mindfulness regarding the individuals who are being all through peril starting with educational dissatisfaction.
Instructors’ idea might also additionally make him is land at perceiving some thing like differentiation to understudies' learning, and the one-of-a-kind knowledge (Zepke, 1997).

3. Methodology
3.1 Participants
Sample of the study was extracted by using simple random sampling technique hence twenty Federal Highr Secondary Colleges were selected. Amongst 48000 students enrolled in these colleges total 1000 students (50 students per college) were chosen in order to collect data for the study.

3.2 Instrumentation
Howard Gardner’s multiple intelligences test was selected as data collection instrument. It was adapted according to study requirement therefore it was presented to three experts to ascertain its validaty. Research tool was then pilot tested and after that it was administered to the selected sample Questionnaire of this study was consist of 44 statements. Gardner’s seven multiple intelligences 5 on LI, 10 on L/MI, 6 on V/SI, 6 on B/KI, 3 on MI, 4 on IPI (intra personal intelligence), 10 on II (interpersonal intelligence). Pearson ‘r’ Correlation was employed to analyse data.

4. Findings

Table 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cognitive Styles</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Linguistic Intelligence</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Logical/ Mathematical Intelligence</td>
<td>0.26*</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bodily/kinesthetic Intelligence</td>
<td>0.16*</td>
<td>0.25*</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vision/Spatial Intelligence</td>
<td>0.23*</td>
<td>0.17*</td>
<td>0.41*</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Musical Intelligence</td>
<td>0.15*</td>
<td>0.03</td>
<td>0.26*</td>
<td>0.20*</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intrapersonal Intelligence</td>
<td>0.16*</td>
<td>0.18*</td>
<td>0.18*</td>
<td>0.17*</td>
<td>0.25*</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interpersonal Intelligence</td>
<td>0.26*</td>
<td>0.16*</td>
<td>0.38*</td>
<td>0.30*</td>
<td>0.23*</td>
<td>0.30*</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level

Table 1 describes the inter-correlation among various multiple intelligences as perceived by students. The highest correlation exists between Bodily/kinesthetic Intelligence and Vision/Spatial Intelligence (r = 0.38, p ≤ .01). The lowest correlation exist between Logical Mathematical Intelligence and Musical Intelligence (r = 0.03, p ≤ .01).

H01: “There is no significant relationship between Linguistic Intelligence and Logical Mathematical Intelligence of students at higher secondary level”.

Table 2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Pearson ‘r’</th>
<th>Sig (2-tailed)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Linguistic</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>16.81</td>
<td>3.678</td>
<td>0.261</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Logical Mathematical</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>38.23</td>
<td>6.841</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

“Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed)”
Table 2 describes the value of correlation coefficient “(Pearson ‘r’ = 0.261)” between Linguistic and Logical Mathematical Intelligence as perceived by college students. Result indicates positive correlation between Linguistic and Logical intelligence.

**H₀2:** “There is no significant relationship between Linguistic Intelligence and Bodily/kinesthetic Intelligence of students at higher secondary level”.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Pearson ‘r’</th>
<th>Sig (2-tailed)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Linguistic</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>16.81</td>
<td>3.678</td>
<td>0.157</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bodily/kinesthetic</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>21.88</td>
<td>4.391</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

“Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed)”

Table 3 indicates the scale of correlation coefficient “(Pearson ‘r’ = 0.157)” between Linguistic and Bodily/kinesthetic Intelligence. From the table it appear that positive correlation involving Linguistic Intelligence and Bodily/kinesthetic Intelligence here is no significant relationship

**H₀3:** “There is no significant relationship between Linguistic Intelligence and visual/Spatial Intelligence of students at higher secondary level”.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Pearson ‘r’</th>
<th>Sig (2-tailed)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Linguistic</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>16.81</td>
<td>3.678</td>
<td>0.231</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>visual/Spatial</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>21.79</td>
<td>4.446</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

“Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed)”

Table 4. reflects the level of correlation coefficient “(Pearson ‘r’ = 0.231)” which indicates strong positive relationship between Linguistic and visual/Spatial Intelligence.

**H₀4:** “There is no significant relationship between Linguistic Intelligence and Musical Intelligence of students at higher secondary level”.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Pearson ‘r’</th>
<th>Sig (2-tailed)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Linguistic</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>16.81</td>
<td>3.678</td>
<td>0.148</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Musical</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>10.33</td>
<td>3.556</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

“Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed)”

Table 6 displays degree of the correlation coefficient “(Pearson ‘r’= 0.148)” between Linguistic and Musical Intelligence. It reveals positive correlation and insignificant relationship between LI and MI.

**H₀5:** “There is no significant relationship between Linguistic Intelligence and Intrapersonal Intelligence of students at higher secondary level”.

Table 7
Table 7 clarify that the degree of correlation coefficient “(Pearson ‘r’ = 0.156)” shows strong positive correlation with Linguistic and Intrapersonal Intelligence as perceived by college students. They have no significant relationship between LI and Intrapersonal Intelligence.

**H06:** There is no significant relationship between Linguistic Intelligence and Interpersonal Intelligence of students at higher secondary level.

Table 8

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Pearson ‘r’</th>
<th>Sig (2-tailed)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Linguistic</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>16.81</td>
<td>3.678</td>
<td>0.156</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intrapersonal</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>14.98</td>
<td>3.240</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

“Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed)”

Table 6 specify that level of correlation coefficient “(Pearson ‘r’ = 0.264)” discloses positive correlation between Linguistic and Interpersonal Intelligence.

5. Discussion

College students have special stage of intelligence which distinguish them from every different. A comparative and essential stance on outcomes and findings of the observe said that LI and B/KI have superb correlation however no great courting exist among each classes of intelligence. Research with the aid of using Deary, et al., (2007), helps the result of prent observ It is likewise inconsonance with the outcomes of who observed sturdy and superb courting among logical/mathematical intelligence and educational success. Furnham, Hosoe, & Tang (2002), observed of their studies, that the respondents taken into consideration that verbal, logical and spatial intelligence exemplify proper intelligence. Therefore the null speculation rejected. Both don't have any great relation at the bases of statistical analysis. Here the outcomes of the observe showed the declare of Gardner. He says that despite the fact that a couple of intelligences are separate gadgets however they assist every different on every occasion a process is performed. The researcher additionally observed a slight affiliation among verbal/linguistic, logical/mathematical intelligence and educational success.

Result of the observe is in consonance with, Siti, M. et al (2013), he observed in his observe a great superb correlation among verbal/linguistic, logic/mathematical intelligences and educational success of the college students. It is proved from the findings of this studies that there may be a great courting among Linguistic Intelligence and Bodily/kinesthetic Intelligence. Therefore the null speculation that right here isn't any significant courting among Linguistic Intelligence and Bodily/kinesthetic Intelligence of college students at better secondary stage become customary at the bases of statistical analysis.

Our findings are supported with the aid of using the preceding researches that have been performed on same variables which gift observe focused upon. The outcomes of Deary, et al., (2007), who observed a
great superb correlation among perceived verbal-linguistic intelligence and bodily/kinesthetic intelligence. As said above the findings of the studies that there may be great courting among Linguistic Intelligence and visual/Spatial Intelligence. Hence, the null speculation that right here isn't any significant courting among Linguistic Intelligence and visual/Spatial Intelligence of college students at better secondary stage became rejected at the bases of statistical analysis. Furthermore, there may be great courting among Linguistic Intelligence and Musical Intelligence. Thus the null speculation that right here isn't any significant courting among Linguistic Intelligence and Musical Intelligence of college students at better secondary stage became rejected at the bases of statistical analysis.

Moreover, the findings of this studies suggests that there may be great courting among Linguistic Intelligence and Intrapersonal Intelligence. So the null speculation that right here isn't any significant courting among Linguistic Intelligence and Intrapersonal Intelligence of college students at better secondary stage became rejected on the idea of statistical analysis.

The findings of this studies additionally proved that there may be great courting among Linguistic Intelligence and Interpersonal Intelligence. therefore the null speculation that right here isn't any significant courting among Linguistic Intelligence and Interpersonal Intelligence amongst college students at better secondary stage became customary on the idea of statistical analysis.

6. Conclusions and Recommendations
Overall the study was conducted to examine self perception of college students of both science and arts group studying at higher secondary level, about seven multiple intelligences proposed by Harward Gardner.

The degree of correlation coefficient among Linguistic Intelligence, Logical Mathematical Intelligence, Bodily/kinesthetic Intelligence, Spatial Intelligence, Musical Intelligence, Intra Personal Intelligence and Inter Personal Intelligence mean score was significant. It was concluded that positive correlation exist among all multiple intelligences as perceived by higher secondary school students.

As present study explored that all categories of intelligence may have positive impact on academic achievement of students so it is recommended that teacher may consider these intelligences while planning their lessons.

Further more, experimental studies may possibly be carried out study in perspective of diverse demographic variable like age groups, geographical area, academic programs etc. in order to explore actual interelation among all multiple intelligences with each other and their correlation with linguistic intelligences.

*Respected Editor
The following article is taken from chapter-4 from thesis work of Dr.Qurat Ul AIN., which was submitted to the Higher Education Commission of Pakistan due to which the similarity index is above from the required, it is also mentioned that the following work was not published in any journal before.

References
Beishuizen, J. J., & StoutJ'csdiJ'k E T (1999) Study strategies In a computer assisted study environment. Learning and Instruction, 9(3), 281-30 I.
Bloomington, IN: Phi Delta Kappan Educational Foundation, (ED 356 277) (highly recommended )
Campbell ,L & Cambpell (2000)' Multiple Intelligences and student achievement: Success
Stories.
Clark, (2001) Learning styles vary for adult student. Lana Ivanitskaya Executive Director, Organizational Research.
Curry, L, (1991), Patterns of learning style across selected medical specialties Educational Psychology, 11,247-278.
Early Marriage in Pakistan: So Little Done, but So Much to Do

Uzma Ashiq, Nargis Abbas, Amir Zada Asad

1Lecturer, Department of Social work, University of Sargodha, Pakistan, uzma.ashiq@uos.edu.pk
2Assistant Professor, Department of Education, University of Sargodha, Pakistan, nargis.abbas@uos.edu.pk
3Department of Social work, Univerity of Peshawar, Pakistan,

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

Marriage is a human social institution which lays the foundation of a family as a unit of a society. It has been happening in human societies since the dawn of the creation but with varying degree of cultures, customs, religious norms, traditions etc. These various elements further vary from region to region, tribe to tribe and sometimes family to family. Generally, marriage age of a girl is related with the commencement of her puberty, which may be variant in different parts of the world. For example, in Asian countries usually girls attain their puberty before their teenage due to climate and racial factors (Butts & Sheifer, 2010). In addition, due to religious obligations against premarital sexual relationship, marriage of the girl is preferred as soon as she attains her puberty. However, marriage at this age before adolescence is considered as the early marriage. To have a clear idea of what constitutes an early marriage, it is important to have a valid definition of the term. Internationally, an early marriage is
understood as said by United Nations (1998),

“a marriage or wed lock wherein one or both of the marrying partners are a ‘child’ and internationally a child is understood as a person less than eighteen years of age unless the law applicable to the child, majority is attained earlier”.

In Pakistan, however, under the century old law known as The Child Marriage Restraint Act 1929

“A marriage is a child marriage if the male is under eighteen years of age and/or the female is under sixteen” (Shaukat, 2015, p. 201).

Therefore, the practice and concept of a child and early or child marriage differs from one country to another. Moreover, according to a UN report, six hundred thousand children-brides/ groom in Pakistan are married every year or 1650 children per day (United Nations Organization, 2013). Quoting a report of a national NGO the Blue Veins, the Express Tribune, an online daily reported that;

“About 60 million children were married around the world during 2014 which were under the age of 18 years. Out of this number 24% (144,000,00) were from rural Pakistan and 18% (108,000,00) from urban Pakistan” which means a total of 2,520,000 children in Pakistan were married (Express Tribune, 2013).

Another report confirms these statistics and says that 21% of the brides in Pakistan are married before eighteen years (United Nations, 2015), while another report of this International Organization marking the nineteen years period (from 1987 to 2005), reported that in urban region of Pakistan total child marriages reaches to 21% of the children population, while in rural areas, the figures go well above 37% giving an average of 32% of all the marriages of the underage population (GOV, 2015).

A United Nation report quoted by The Dawn Newspaper reported that in ten years (marking 2011-2020) over 140 million children will become child-brides and grooms. It is apprehended that if this level of child marriages remains constant, 14.2 million children annually or 39,000 daily will be married out in their childhood. The same report also has estimated that out of the 140 million children who will be married out, 50 million will be less than 15 years of age (Dawn, 2015).

In 2012, print media in Pakistan reported 75 such cases and out of this number, 43 per cent children were 11-15 years old while 32 per cent were too young for marriage that were between the ages of 6-10 years. In 2008-2009, 24,228 children of 10-14 years and 10, 29,784 children of 15-19 years were reportedly married. This is a tip of the iceberg as mostly, such marriages are never reported (Express Tribune, 2015). Even the approximate numbers of such weddings cannot be made available due to poor official statistics compilation and data collection. A best example of this official negligence can be that Pakistan could not conduct population census for the last seventeen years (since after 1998) which could help to comprehend the issue. Moreover, the Pakistan Demographic and Health Survey 2006-07, mentioned that that 50 percent of the girls at age of 15-18 years were either expecting or already mothers (Government of Pakistan, 2007).

In the most report of Save the Children recent statistics reported by Tribune Express (2020); it was stated that;

“Pakistan is ranked 88th out of the 144 countries where underage marriages, compounded by discriminatory social norms, affect large numbers of girls. In Pakistan, because early marriage is attributed to poverty and the lack of education, women suffer at multiple stages of their lives”. (Seema Shakeel, 2020).

1.1 Province Wise Practice of Early Marriages

According to a UNICEF report, the early marriages practice in Pakistan is concentrated in the country-side as compared to the cities so much so that 58% females and 18% males of the country-side marry before 20 years, while 27% girls and 5% boys get marry in the cities. Not only there exists a difference between rural and urban areas, there is marked difference in the statistics of early marriages between the four federating units of Pakistan namely Punjab, Sindh, Kheber Pakhtoon Khwah (KPK) and Baluchistan.
The regional statistics shows that Sindh province on the top of the pre-20 marriages with 72% females and 26% males in the selected sample (Government of Pakistan, 2015). Similarly, Baluchistan is the second after Sindh in terms of pre-20 year marriages in the rural set up with 22% males and 63% females. Moreover, urban areas of Baluchistan have a lead in early marriages with 9% males and 56% females for the same age group (Government of Pakistan, 2015).

Meanwhile, KPK is the third in this regard, as 63% rural women are married out before attaining 20 years age. In this province, the rural men of the same age group have the least figures of 8% who are married. Punjab province has a record of having most males and females who get marry in their post-20 both in urban and rural set up (Government of Pakistan, 2015). While the pre-20 figures for such marriages are 50% for rural and 20% for urban areas of Punjab. As a trend, men in cities of Punjab marry even in their thirties. A little number (4%) marry in their pre-20 (UNFPA, 2012). These figures are blurred by the custom of “Pet Lekhai” in southern Punjab where a girl child is betrothed for exchange before she is born or still in the womb, a consequence of the custom of exchange marriage or marriage by purchase (Shaukat, 2015).

1.2 Causes of Early Marriage
Early marriages in Pakistan are based on cultural customs, traditions and the customary practices. Culturally, there is a number of modes of marriage including marriage by exchange, marriage by purchase (to settle debts and disputes), arranged marriages, elopement or court marriages etc. In the exchange mode (Vani or Watta Satta) of marriage a young daughter or sister is mostly exchanged for a women (wife) irrespective of the age of the bride-groom or number of already existing wives and such marriage can take place without any publicity, sanctioned by a Jarga or Panchayat (A local judiciary system in pakistan). Other reasons include the traditional tribal and feudal structure and social organization of the society, unawareness of the general masses about the corrosive effects of early marriages and the extreme poverty (Tremayne, 2006). Again, Child marriage is a subject of morality and not legislation (Stevenso11n, 2017). How come morality be legislated?

The ongoing controversy among the clergy, the civil society and the state has made an issue out of a problem. Mostly, it is misinterpreted that religion and the clergy is on the back of the problem and perpetuating it but it should be noted that Islam has nothing to do with minor things like child marriage (Lau, & Ho, 2018; Liepert, 2011). At least it has declared a rule of marriage that is puberty and that is it. Islam does not say how long after the onset of puberty a marriage is valid or invalid. The other important reason is poverty. If we examine the causative factors of early marriages in Pakistan, poverty emerges as another major cause effecting the child/early marriage situation in a number of ways viz-a-viz the mode of marriage particularly (Ogwumike & Ozughalu, 2018). Here are listed some of the major causes below.

1.3 Economic Constraints due to Poverty
Feeding a mouth by a poor father or mother is extremely difficult for a family. The best way to adjust such a situation is the early marriage of the daughter so that the family can save rather than spending on her living and education. In many poor families, the marriage by purchase or sale and exchange is prevalent. In marriage by purchase a human being becomes a ‘slave’ than a wife and she is subjected to all forms of violence including sexual relations. If, for example, poor family wants to marry a son, they have either to pay the bride price or will exchange a daughter for a daughter-in-law. The exchange marriage is also means of acquiring wife by a widower or a person want to have a second or third wife irrespective of the age differentials. Not only the purchase mode becomes a family matter but in some cases in southern Punjab like, in Cholistan desert, it becomes a clan’s responsibility to acquire a wife for a young male member. In this case, the entire clan contribute towards the cost of the bride price and the custom is known as Phorhi (Shaukat, 2015).

1.4 Honour and Safety of the Grown Up Girls
In poor families, if father and mother or both go for work, it is difficult for the family to leave such a grown up girl at home unattended. In such cases, either the girl has to be put to child labour or be
married out earlier to safeguard her chastity. In this aristocratic and feudalistic culture, it is difficult for poor people to save their girls from exploitation by the upper class. We read every day these like stories in newspapers and can infer that there is a relationship between female chastity and family honour which conditions the poor parents in particular to marry out girls child earlier to avoid sexual molestation of a girl and the resultant loss of family honour (SPARC, 2013).

1.5 The Phenomenon of Child Mortality
Some years ago, in Pakistan, child mortality was rampant and it is still nearly 314/1000 live births in interior Sind (UNICEF, 2015). Parents were never sure of the survival of their children particularly the male children. In order to satisfy their internal love and affection, parents use to marry their male children in particular very early to see them in the wedding dress or SEHRA ON THEIR HEADS. Now a days due to slow down of the child mortality, the trend of early marriage has also slowed down.

1.6 Consequences of Child Marriage
We have discussed the causes and said that parents consider cultural, social and financial aspects to wed their daughters at an early age. Unfortunately, what is not considered, are the consequences that such early marriages can have on young girls. Over the last few decades, a decrease has been observed in the frequencies of early marriages but this decrease is less for girls than boys (Bhattacharyya, 2016). The consequences of child marriages are many and disastrous in terms of the physical and psychological health of the girl in particular, literacy level among the school age children, school drops outs etc (Liu, Holmes & Zhang, 2018). The following are some of the negative aspects of early marriages with respect to Pakistan.

1.7 Child Mortality
One such consequence is that of early childbirth which, directly results in greater vulnerability related to biological and physiological complications. Researches show that for a mother under the age of 18 the fatality rate of her child is 60 percent greater than those of a child whose mother is above the age of 19 (UNFPA, 2012). Even if such children survive, they will have low birth weight and are mal-nourished. This will cause the stunting of the child's physical and mental growth.

1.8 Deprivation from Childhood
The age of 8-12 years is the age of plays and enjoyments for the children irrespective of the financial status of the family and parents. By forcing such children into a wed lock means they are assigned ‘adult roles’ and they are no more children. This is unnatural and is tantamount to snatching the God gifted childhood from the innocent children who are not yet ready to shoulder the hard facts of life. The young girls are separated from their familiar surroundings, and are isolated and alienated.

1.9 Maternal Mortality
There has been a close relationship between early pregnancies and the increased risk of premature abortions and complicated labour, low birth-weight and a higher chance of child and maternal mortality (Judith, 1995). Pakistan has already highest child and maternal mortality rate in the region. This high rate can only be attributed to Pregnancy-related complications among 15-19 year-old girls in particular. According to experts there is a 20 to 200 percent greater chances of maternal deaths among women aged 15-19 than women who marry in the age between 20 and 24 years (Express tribune, 2013). According to Center for Reproductive Law and Policy (1999) the main causes of these maternal deaths are: “hemorrhage, sepsis, pre-eclampsia/eclampsia” and obstructed labour. Unsafe abortion is the other major risk for teenage women – most of those affected are unmarried”

The World Health Organization and the UN department of Economic and Social affairs have explained the relationship between early marriages and maternal mortality as “Child wives fall ill and frequently die which explaining the highest maternal deaths in many countries” (United Nations Organization, 7 In gynecological terminology a Fistula is a rupture or hole or passage between organs specifically between the feminine vagina and the rectum or between the vagina and the urinary bladder mostly caused by an obstructed or delayed labor. This is a very troublesome problem where women have no control over the urine or stool
It is now proved that young girls, who gestate before 15 years of age, are at risk of death five times greater than girls gestate after 20 years of age.5

1.10 Gynecological Complications
Teen pregnancy, particularly below 15 years of age, brings disastrous consequences for young women. In the teen early or pregnancies, there is every likely hood of an increased risk of Obstetric Fistula as their small pelvis and the tender birth canal obstructs the smooth delivery or labour. Such pre-15 years mothers have 88% chances of such fistula (Nour, 2006). Fistula is a very painful, infectious complication wherein the victim has no control over urine and stool, a disability not only causing physical agonies but socially a shame as the patient cannot stay with people due to unbearable smell. In most cases such women are shunned not only by the community but by the husband as well, if not repaired through a prolonged surgical procedure (Cook et al., 2004).

1.11 Emotional and Mental Effects
Like adult women, a teenager girl is not able to fulfill the expectations of her husband and in-laws effectively which leads to domestic discords in the form of verbal, psychological as well as physical abuse of the girl. Mental health of the girls here becomes a huge cause of concern, as the victims of such torture often become hysterical. These young girls who are either sold or exchanged for marriage in particular, are not allowed to meet their parents or visit their maternal houses and end up feeling estranged in their new surroundings. There is no psychological support and consolation to these mentally estranged victims. These circumstances take a turn for the worst when the uneducated and traditional mind-set of the communities misunderstand the girl's plight and take it as some form of paranormal influence. Girls are often thought to be possessed by Jinn's (evil spirits) and are taken to local traditional healers Aamil or Mulla or soothsayers who mostly, inflict severe physical torture upon these young girls to drive out the evil spirit or Jinns (Baig, 2010).

Early marriages also hinder personality development and physical growth of the teen ages as a child has to undergo constant physical, intellectual and emotional changes before attaining mental adulthood. In Pakistan the differential in marriages is high and child brides are sometimes married to much older men and making the girls are subjected to submission towards their older husband as towards father and mother in own home. Consequently, intimacy between them may be a joy and satisfaction for the husband but may be a labour for the young girl.

Another associated problem with this mismatch is the risk of becoming widow in a very young age is also writing on the wall as the older husband has to leave this world earlier as a natural phenomenon (Abbas et al., 2020). Resultantly, the young widow girl may face many socio-economic challenges. This means a widow is left with her orphan children. Such young widows remain unhappy due to their long inability to support the family and make such girls to attempt suicides or elopement with young males which ultimately lead to their killing known as “honor Killing” and even unhappy after remarriage.

1.12 Illiteracy, Drop-Out and Low Education
The most disastrous effect of such marriage is the low literacy level of women. In Pakistan, the women literacy rate is already deplorable and we are constantly adding un-educated women to the existing lot. Early marriages leave the young girls dropped-out from the school or compel her to leave her education incomplete (Wahab et al., 2018). Mentally capable and intelligent girls, who can do well in academics and can have a rewarding career in life, are forced to drop out. It is now established that there correlation between child marriages and a low literacy level. It is a matter of common observation that in both, rural as well as urban Pakistan, 60% girls who never attended a school are married before their 20th birth day. There is always a decrease in early marriage with increase in educational level. Sample surveys reveal that even primary level of education decreased the intensity of early marriage by 19% (from 68 to 49
percent) for girls while nine years of education decreased the intensity of early marriages up to 33% and over ten years or secondary and higher secondary level education reduced early marriages to 13%. Similar can be the case for boys as well. It is researched that 29% boys who never attended school married before 20 while primary level of schooling reduced the percentage of early marriages of males to 14% and high school or college level education reduced the intensity of early marriages among boys to 8% (Population Council, 2015).

1.13 Population Growth
Child marriage are also a cause of higher rate of population growth as the teenage brides are in a more fertile age and start to bear children from a young age till late age. Early marriages lead to higher fertility rate and hence higher population growth rate.

“The earlier they [young girls] get married, the more child-bearing years they have” (Dakuyo & Jean, 2010) Girls who are married early, are mostly unaware of contraception methods nor can discuss it with husband or mothers-in-law because producing more children is always the choice of the parents-in-law. Consequently they have mostly unplanned gestations. This contributes towards Pakistan’s already burgeoning population.

2. Conclusion and Recommendations
The trend of early marriages in Pakistan encompasses the factors like; physical & socio-cultural security of girls, and girl child. It produces the fear among the parents of daughters in terms of girl child abuse, rape, late marriages or unmarried old age daughter. Socially, value system of Pakistani society demands sex segregated society and any kind of sexual or emotional involvement of girls before marriage is strictly punishable in the society. Keeping these circumstances in view, parents prefer early marriages of their daughters. Amongst the physical issues, the cases of girl rape are still prevailing in the community around us. When such incident happens, it ruins the reputation of the whole life of a girl as well as of her whole family, and in result, no one is willing to marry her. Culturally, raising a daughter is considered as ‘watering a neighboring tree’ (Malik, 2005) hence she is thought of an economic burden and consequently she needs to be married as she reaches puberty. On the other hand, the parents’ decisions of their daughter’s early marriages is resulting in increased chances of many health hazards and sexual transmitted diseases among the families.

The solution of this trend is, firstly to render awareness about health believes and concerns of the people regarding overall health issues due to early marriage. The organizations working for this issue, scholars and govt may have necessitation’s to amend these issues. To address this issue of early marriage due to economic burden, poverty prevention/reduction strategies among girl child families’ may be another way out. This idea may be achievable through the introduction of small business, entrepreneurship and cottage industry which will ultimately not only empower to the families of girl child but also to the girls in itself in the long run.

In nut shell to attain this goal step by step programmes can be introduced, like at first hand there is need to deal with belief system of families for the girl child as a burden and source of threat to the respect of family in case of any miss happenings. Secondly, there is immense need of inculcating awareness of rights of the girls among the parents. Thirdly, skill development and enhancement programmers for girls and fourthly, small loans strategies for small business and entrepreneurship should be provided by government especially in remote areas. Last but not the least we can connect the families of girl child to outer developed world through social media and motivate them properly to tackle the prevailing early marriage problem. If the issue should not be deal at earliest and urgent bases it may lead to a voluenarable group of child wife’s and potential mothers of mentally and physically disordered new borns.

But the flip side of the picture has another angle which reveals the measures taken by the government of Pakistan to deal with the security of early girls’ marriage issue. Keeping in view the severity of physical
and socio-cultural security of girl child, the government has promulgated legislation like Hudood Ordinance (rape), 1979. Further it has fixed the marriage age as 18+ to empower women and to secure women health issues through Muslim family Law Ordinance, 1961. But the good governance of the policy and implementation of law in its true soul are still lacking in the country and no serious actions are taken in all the cases of early marriages. There is a strict need to create awareness among the citizens by the Government organizations (GOs) and NGOs. Further the rule of law in case of rape crime need to be enforced in the country.

References


The Socio-Political Obstacles behind the Scanty Political Participation of Women Parliamentarians

Hamida Bibi

1Lecturer in Bacha Khan Medical College Mardan, Khyber Medical University Peshawar, KP, Pakistan, tazkiasayed@gamil.com

ABSTRACT

The current study was conducted to indicate the numerous factors active behind the scanty political participation of women parliamentarians in parliamentary processes. For the collection of data for the current study, women parliamentarians and women’s rights activists were interviewed. Semi-structured in-depth interview was used as research tool for data collection. For the analysis of data, the tool of Thematic Analysis, developed by Braun and Clarke (2015), was used. The findings of the study highlight some socio-political obstacles such as the lack of educational aptness and political shrewdness, representing minority or reserved quota, the patriarchal and male-dominant model of politics, party politics, etc. are impeding the effective participation of women parliamentarians. All this has upset to work freely and securely dissuading women’s political achievements. In the light of the findings of the study, the author recommends society changing its attitude towards women politics. Women participation in politics ought to be encouraged at the cost of the abolition of patriarchy in politics. The government should help women parliamentarians. In order to be adept and astute, special trainings and sessions shall be arranged for women parliamentarians. Political parties should clearly policy in this regard avoiding party politics and the supremacy of some political figures.

ARTICLE DETAILS

History
Revised format: November 2020
Available Online: December 2020

Keywords
Politics, Participation, Patriarchy, Parliament, Women

JEL Classification
M10, M14

© 2020 Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: tazkiasayed@gamil.com


1. Introduction

Political participation as a voter entails a variety of activities, viz. political thinking, political propagation, political campaigning, multitudes’ mobilization and political proselytization, funds’ donation, joining political parties, and, above all, vote cast in an election. (Teorell, Torcal & Montero, 2007). All this is performed to make a hey in the formation of public policies. On the contrary, political participation — as a parliamentarian — means presenting rhetoric on issues of public interest, initiating bills, questioning and raising objections on bills, moving resolutions, forwarding motions, calls on the government, petitions, etc. on the floor of parliament.

Since the inception of the organized–cum-political human society and parliamentary government,
despite an immensurable swell in their populace, women’s political participation — both as parliamentarians and voters — is minimal (Lawless & Fox, 2001). According to Zardari (2018), in 2015, around the world, only 22.1% women became part of parliament. It took immensurable efforts on behalf of women populace to achieve suffrage — the right to vote. Philosophers, feminists, and women rights activists have time and again reiterated the significance of women’s participation in politics, government and policy making for the mitigation of their grievances in numerous spheres of life. Different socio-economic-cum-statal factors impede women’s political participation. The socio-cultural division and dissemination of power, resources and activities between men and women is uneven and partial tilted towards men. This predilection has anchored women’s mobility, education, political participation and economic activities ensuing women’s dependency and men’s power in social, political, and economic arenas (Paxton, Hughes & Barnes, 2020).

Contrariwise, besides these frequent impediments obstructing women’s political participation as voters, sundry encumbrances thwart political participation of women parliamentarians on the floor of assembly. According to Lodhi (2019), lousy education and unripened political skills shrink political participation of women parliamentarians. Quality education, critical thinking, rhetoricalness, and highly ripened-cum-polished political skills are the prerequisites for satisfactory parliamentary performance. Weak self-image deluges women parliamentarians mulling over their political views, initiations and performances causing the psychiatric condition of inferiority and insignificance.

According to Bano (2009), women’s participation in parliamentary affairs is minimal. In the parliamentary session of 2003-2004, women parliamentarians raised only 7% questions, moved only 12% resolutions, and passed only 7% motions out of the total parliamentary questions, resolutions and motions. For the authoress, party politics is all that subdues auspicious participation of women parliamentarians. The stage is always sabotaged by some eminent politicians of a party peripheralizing the women legislators.

A study titled “Sexism, harassment and violence against women in parliaments in Europe” was conducted by Union (2018) to indicate the different impediments women face in parliament. Data for the study was collected from 123 women — 42 parliamentary staff and 81 MPs — from 45 countries in Europe through vis-à-vis interviews. The findings of the study show that out of the 123 women:

1. 85.2% suffered psychological violence
2. 49.6% received threats of battering, rape and death
3. 58.2% received cyber attacks on social media
4. 67.9% suffered sexist, gendered, stereotypical and abusive comments on their posts on social media
5. 24.7% suffered sexual harassment
6. 14.8% suffered physical harassment.
7. 13.5% faced economic violence — the denial of funds, salaries, allowances, etc.

The melancholic part of the findings were knowing the fact that out of all these anti women crimes, 69.2% were perpetrated by male parliamentarians. As the repercussions of these crimes, 33.3% of these women parliamentarians stated that these acts of violence have mitigated our freedom of expression making us more cautious in our parliamentary sayings and doings. Because of the online cyber attacks, women parliamentarians have reduced — if not ended — sharing political ideas and achievements on social media. Above all, these acts of violence have drastically reduced women’s participation in parliamentary affairs. Besides affecting women parliamentarians, these acts of violence have discouraged neophyte politicians impeding their way unto politics and parliament. Sexism, harassment and violence against women in parliament are, maximally, politically motivated aimed at mitigating women’s political participation.

According to Khan and Naqvi (2020), after entering into the parliament on reserved seats, women parliamentarians no more remain public representatives. They have to discuss party agendas ignoring women’s issues. Party politics hinder women’s participation in parliament. Women — those entering
into parliament through reserved quota — lack their own constituencies. Henceforth, they are the de facto representatives of political parties not masses. This lack of constituency and entry to the parliament on reserved quota devalues women parliamentarians. Having their own constituencies, the elected parliamentarians, in comparison to those entered to parliament through reserved quota — consider themselves more entitled to participate in parliamentary processions. Besides, Environment for women parliamentarians is hostile and unfriendly. As per statistics by the authoresses, 30% of women parliamentarians were forced to silence by their male counterparts, 11% suffered verbal abuse, 6% received physical threats, and 26% suffered cyber attacks and defamatory remarks on social media.

In her article titled “Empty women seats in parliament” Zardari (2018) has limelighted the misogynistic demeanor and comportment of our parliament upsetting the participation of women parliamentarians. With the sparse representation of 20% — inclusive of the 17% reserved quota — women parliamentarians have invariably tholed misogyny and sexism. The instances are frequent: in 1993, Sheikh Rasheed passed derogatory remarks against Benazir Bhutto. In 2016, Shireen Mizari suffered defamatory remarks from Khwaja Asif. The abusive language of Maulana Fazlu Rehman and his party against PTI women is yet prevalent. All these hardships have barred the active participation of women parliamentarians.

In its study titled “Sexism, harassment, and violence against women parliamentarians”, Union (2016) claims psychological, sexual, physical and economic violence against women prevailing in parliaments. The contributing factors are political rivalry, women rights activism, being in opposition, being young, and belonging to minority or reserved quota. These acts of violence have multifaceted impact. Majority of the victims are distressed fearing their safety and that of their family. Besides, these acts of violence impede one’s ability to properly execute mandates and openly express opinions drastically mitigating the participation of women parliamentarians in parliamentary processions.

In her study titled “causes of meager participation of women parliamentarians in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa assembly; and the way out”, Bibi (2019) has indicated numerous efficacious political, socio-cultural, economic and statal factors extenuating women parliamentarians’ active participation in the parliament. The lack of own constituencies, the poor strength of women in parliament, economic dependence and hurdles, socio-cultural constraints, lack of political skills, and the patriarchal-cum-male-dominant politics bar women’s active participation in the parliamentary processions.

2. Objectives of the Study
Following are the objectives of the study:
1. To know the different socio-political reasons behind the scanty participation of women parliamentarians in the parliamentary processions.
2. To suggest ways to improve the participation of women parliamentarians in the parliamentary processions.

3. Research Methodology
The current study was conducted to indicate the numerous factors active behind the scanty political participation of women parliamentarians in parliamentary processions in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan. For the collection of data for the current study, 10 women parliamentarians and women’s rights activists were interviewed. Semi-structured in-depth interview was used as research tool for data collection. For the analysis of data, the tool of Thematic Analysis, developed by Braun and Clarke (2015), was used.

4. Findings and discussion
4.1 Reserved Quota and the Lack of Constituency
Providing a sense of ownership, reasonability and utility, a constituency is considered a power base for parliamentarians legitimizing their parliamentary endeavors. The findings of the study show that being a minority or a reserved quota parliamentarian bars one’s parliamentary participation. The reserved quota parliamentarians are disposed at the directives of the party politics. They are manipulated to vindicate
the vested interests of the political parties. Having no constituency to represent, the minority and reserved quota parliamentarians have little why to engross in parliamentary processions. This political impedance has downright upset women’s parliamentary participation further exacerbating the anterior aggravated situation.

4.2 Patriarchal and Male-Dominant Politics
The findings of the study show that the patriarchal model of politics and male dominance in parliament have dismally lowered the participation of women parliamentarians in parliamentary processions. Around the globe, figures infer that men enact an overall 81% of the parliamentary populace. In the political spheres, men are overrepresented outnumbering women populace. Besides, the patriarchal model and mindset of politics persist in our political structures. It is a socio-political structure that determines women as subservient to men adjudging them incapable of wielding liability and power. This portrayal of incompetency, unintelligence, subserviency and submissiveness has been hampering women’s efficacy in political arena. Domestic labor and restrictions and regulations from males have also barred women’s political endeavors.

Besides the alleged perception of submissiveness and incompetency, the scarce women populace in parliamentary rows find it hard to partake in parliamentary processions which has, in turn, downright subdued women’s political profiles. The patriarchal-cum-prejudiced disposition and demeanor of the peers discourage and bar the political endeavors of women parliamentarians the impact of which echoes in a chain. Dejected over this elegiac political performance, the masses, in turn, resultantly, avoid patronizing women’s candidature.

4.3 Socio-Cultural Barriers and Non-Formal Institutions
The findings of the study imply that socio-cultural taboos, expectation and norms are downright subduing the political participation of women parliamentarians in parliamentary processions. For a woman, going to the outdoor male dominant venues and partaking in the gendered political endeavors are all deemed culturally tabooed. Adopting their standards of demeanor according to the societal expectation upsets and interdicts the political endeavors of women parliamentarians. Besides, the combined segregation of male and female parliamentarians has also been questioned. Besides, some informal-institutionary gatherings and efforts precede parliamentary sessions. Being arranged and held in the non-formal institutions like Hujra, Masjid, hotel, etc. religion and the socio-cultural norms forbid the participation of women parliamentarians in these gatherings. Summarily, owing to the fact that they have to heed both their political profiles and societal expectation, women parliamentarians teeter about parliamentary political endeavors and the fulfillment of social codes of conduct.

4.4 Poor Education and the Lack of Political Skills
The findings of the study show that poor education and the lack of political astuteness hamper the effective participation of women parliamentarians in parliamentary processions. According to Ferris, Kolodinsky and Treadway (2007), “political skills are the ability to effectively understand others and use knowledge to influence others enhancing the achievement of objectives”. Having strong political skills enables one to perform effectively valuing political profiles in turn. Parliamentary rhetoric, bills initiation, raising objections, questioning, moving resolutions, etc. require knowledge and strong political dexterity. The findings infer women parliamentarians’ lack of education and political shrewdness upset their partaking in parliamentary sessions. As grave national issues are presented on the floor of the House, they require resourceful scholarship and political competency. This gap of scholarship and political proficiency prompts many parliamentarians to silencing and few to occupy the stage.

5. Conclusion and Recommendation
Inefficacious and scanty political participation of women parliamentarians is prevalent around the globe with varying obstacles behind. Women parliamentarians’ role and participation is observed as less significant in comparison to their male peers. In the current study, women parliamentarians’ experiences
have been gauged to assess varying socio-political factors hampering their effective political performances. The findings of the study highlight some socio-political obstacles such as the lack of educational adeptness and political shrewdness, representing minority or reserved quota, the patriarchal and male-dominant mode of politics, party politics, impeding the effective participation of women parliamentarians. These findings are based upon the interviews of women parliamentarians and women’s rights activists. All this has upset to work freely and securely dissuading women’s political achievements. Benefiting from politics and the redressal of women-related issues, viz. gender discrimination, women illiteracy and violence against women, require women empowerment and maximal political participation. With the current outlook and demeanor towards women, modernization’s tag would be unfit on our shoulders.

In the light of the findings of the study, the author recommends society changing its attitude towards women politics. Women participation in politics ought to be encouraged at the cost of the abolition of patriarchy. The government should help women parliamentarians. In order to be adept and astute, special trainings and sessions shall be arranged for women parliamentarians. Political parties should clearly policy in this regard avoiding party politics and the supremacy of some political figures.

References
Bibi, H. (2019). “Causes of Meager Participation of Women Parliamentarians in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Assembly; and way out”. Central Asia, 84(Summer), 125-136
Violent Behavioral Outcomes: An Empirical Examination of Perceived Parenting Rejection Practices in Lahore, Pakistan

Hassan Raza, Saif-ur-Rehman Saif Abbasi, Nazneen Habib

1&2 Department of Sociology, International Islamic University, Islamabad, Pakistan, raza.hassan04@gmail.com

Department of Sociology, University of Azad Jammu & Kashmir, Muzaffarabad, Pakistan

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

Across the cultures, parenting or child-rearing practices are considered as the concrete behaviors towards the developmental process of rearing or socialization of the children. The study splits the conception of parenting practices among two domains as parental acceptance and parental rejection, depending on the behavioural outcomes under investigation. The cross sectional research was conducted on young males attending colleges in Lahore, Pakistan to understand that how parental rejection dimensions of parenting manifest the violent behavioral outcome among male college students. The research within the Pakistani indigenous culture on parenting practices and its inter-relationship between youth violent behavioural outcomes provide stems from the theoretical anchorage in the socio-psychological works. The sample of 816 male students from public colleges of Lahore was included to collect the responses through self-administered questionnaire as a tool of the study. The results indicated that measures of perceived parental rejection accounts variations in the violent behavioural outcomes of the young male students for 26.2% (R2 = 0.262). The study suggests that positive parenting interventions may cause to reduce the risk factors (i.e. violent behavioral practices) among youth.

1. Introduction

Researchers highlighted the significance of the inter-relationship between perceived parenting rejection practices and behavioural outcomes among children (Peterson & Hann, 1999). However, the debate on the adaptive and maladaptive parenting practices for one’s cultural context has been linked to operationalize the conceptions (Barnhart et al., 2013). For instance, the researchers argued the linkages between harsh/strict parenting (i.e. maladaptive in Europe and America) and maladaptive behavioural outcomes among the children (Maccoby & Martin, 1983), while association of such parenting practices with risk behavior in Asian families (Leung et al., 1998; Rudy & Grusec, 2006).

Researchers in the family studies have recognized that parenting practices are expected to contribute in the process of developmental behavioural outcomes among children (Peterson & Hann, 1999; Kotchick
& Forehand, 2002). Parents, as major agents in the process of socialization, have been considerably significant to rear or socialize their children to adapt with the prevalent and acceptable values and normative practices in the society (Aneshensel, 2005). Scholars have studied parenting practices with violent behavioural outcome extensively (Campaert, Annalaura, & Menesini, 2018; Manzoni & Schwarzenegger, 2018; Acar, Uçuş, & Yıldız, 2017; Knerr, Gardner, and Cluver, 2013; Gilbert et al., 2009; Howells & Rosenbaum, 2007; Gershoff, 2002; Chang et al., 2003; Pianta & Harbers, 1996). Nevertheless, the study explores the uncovered or neglected aspect of parenting dimensions especially within the reference of South Asian heritage and Pakistani cultural context.

Across the countries, the studies have highlighted numerous factors that lead to the prevalence of violent behavioural outcomes among youth members in the society. For instance, the study conducted in six countries has significantly associated parental mal-practices in the child-rearing process and violence as the behavioural outcome among children (Manzoni & Schwarzenegger, 2018; Howells & Rosenbaum, 2007; Durant et al., 1999). The researchers have also documented the use of physical punishment or harsh parenting practices could become more consistent predictor of violent behavioural outcomes among children especially young males (Acar, Uçuş, and Yıldız, 2017; Pianta & Harbers, 1996; Loeber et al., 1990).

The current study attempts to see the linkages of parental rejection measures (i.e. –ve reinforcements) and the violent behavioral outcomes among young male students. However, it has been very keenly observed within the Pakistani cultural context that parents right after the matriculation level of education (i.e. 10th grade students) of their children lose their monitoring and control as compared to school level. This developmental stage could arise questions on the parental creditability for the rearing process of their children. This study is particularly designed to address those questions which linked violent behavioural outcomes of the male youth members and parenting rejection practices measures.

2. Methodology

The study was conducted on the sample of 816 male students at public sector colleges of Lahore with 97% C.I and 3% margin of error for the calculation of sample. The study used a standardized Parental Acceptance and Rejection Questionnaire (PARQ) as a tool after validation in the local context. The list of boy’s public colleges was collected by the office of Director Colleges, Lahore. The students at intermediate level of education through filled out the questionnaire with standard instructions written on it, administered in the class timings by their teachers. Moreover, the reliabilities of the scales used were reported as high cronbach scores i.e. greater than 0.70 in all scales.

3. Results

Table 1: Demographics of male students at public sector colleges of Lahore, Pakistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>N (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Study year at college (Higher Secondary)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1st year</td>
<td>451 (55%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2nd year</td>
<td>365 (45%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residential pattern</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>502 (62%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>314 (38%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family System</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nuclear Family</td>
<td>368 (45%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joint Family</td>
<td>448 (55%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monthly Family Income (in Pak. Rupees)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Up to 20,000</td>
<td>323 (40%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20,001 to 40,000</td>
<td>310 (38%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40,001 to 60,000</td>
<td>113 (14%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Above 60,000</td>
<td>70 (8%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1 depicts the demographics of male students at public sector colleges of Lahore, Pakistan. There were more than half of the respondents (451, 55%) who got them enrolled in the 1st year of higher secondary school level and slightly less than half of the respondents (365, 45%) were enrolled in 2nd year at higher secondary school. The significant majority (502, 62%) of the respondents who belong to
urban residential pattern and little less than two fifth of the respondents (314, 38%) were living in the rural areas at the time of enrollment at public sector colleges of Lahore. In addition, there were 368 (45%) of the students were from nuclear family system and 448 (55%) were extended or joint family system. The results illustrates that more than three fourth of the sample consists within the monthly family income group having Rs. 40000 or less income. However, there was very minute sampled population having more than Rs. 60000 income.

Table No. 2: Relationship between –ve parental Rejection practices and violent behavioural outcomes among male students in public sector colleges

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Violent Behaviour</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hostility/Aggression</td>
<td>0.459**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indifference Neglect</td>
<td>0.470**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Undifferentiated Rejection</td>
<td>0.457**</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Correlation significant at 0.01*

Table 2 showed the relationship between parental rejection measures with the violent behavioural outcomes among male students. The findings illustrate positive and significant relationship among perceived hostility/aggression parenting practices and violent behavioural outcomes among young males at public sector colleges of Lahore (r=0.459, p<0.01). Moreover, there was a statistically significant relationship between perceived indifference neglect practices for child-rearing and violent behavioral outcomes among male students (r=-0.470, p<0.01). In addition, the positive and statistically significant correlation was reported among perceived undifferentiated parenting rejection practices and violent behavioural outcomes among male students (t=0.457 p<0.01).

4. Main Effect Model

To see the effect of parental rejection measures on the violent behavioural outcomes among make students of public sector colleges of Lahore, simple linear regression was applied to observe the variations among the variables. The results indicated that parenting rejection measures, altogether accounts for 26.2% ($R^2 = 0.262$) variations in the violent behavioural outcomes of young males at public sector colleges. However, beta ($\beta$) values among the three measures of parenting rejection practices were statistically significant with violent behavioural outcomes.

Table 3: Effect of Parental Rejection measures on the violent behavioral outcome among students

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Beta (Standardized)</th>
<th>Sig. Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hostility/Aggression</td>
<td>0.459</td>
<td>0.001***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indifference Neglect</td>
<td>0.470</td>
<td>0.001***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Undifferentiated Rejection</td>
<td>0.457</td>
<td>0.007**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F-Value</td>
<td>8.322</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$R^2$</td>
<td>0.262</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adjusted $R^2$</td>
<td>0.260</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note ***=p<.001, **=p<.01

5. Discussion & Conclusion

The present study examines the effect of parenting rejection practices on the youth violent behavioural outcomes among male students in Lahore, Pakistan. Major study hypothesis of the study states the parenting rejection measures contributed towards the violent behavioural outcomes among young male students in public sector college of Lahore. The study splits into three measures of parenting rejection practices (i.e. hostile, indifference neglect, and rejection practices), as they are considered to be more significant dimensions for the development of violent behaviors among young one’s especially emerging adults (Grusec 2011; Patterson 2002).
The results of the study reported that there is a significant effect of parenting rejection measures on violent behavioural outcomes among male youth students. The current study supports the notion that children learn violent behavior from their parents while disengaging them morally by the result of poor parenting practices such as aggressive, neglecting, and rejected parenting practices. Whenever children experience harsh disciplinary parenting practices, they may learn to believe that victims can be punished for their own misconducts and wrong doings. The study also supported the view of linkages between poor parenting practices and moral disengagements among young or adolescents, where harsh discipline or parental rejection/neglect may socialize children with more likely to appear moral disengagements among them and resultantly aggressive or violent behaviors emerge due to these engagements (Maas, Herrenkohl, & Sousa, 2008).

The findings of the current research depict that parenting rejection measures accounts for 26.2% variations for the developmental outcomes of violent behavior. There is a significant and consistent need to improve the parenting interventions which may diminish the risk factors in developing violent behavioural outcomes. However, the interventions may particularly be enhanced within the domain of parental awareness (knowledge), parental attitudes, and parent-child interactions for better outcomes. Furthermore, more rigorous parenting programs in terms of contextualization, especially within problem families, at the local and national level to prevent the risk behavioural outcomes which could be more effective, acceptable and feasible to strengthen the family structures. Nevertheless, the process that links parenting rejection and violent behavior among youth and how other mediators and moderators become relevant for studying needs to be better understood for developing the violent or aggressive behaviours among young or adolescents.

References


Nigeria’s First Republic and Post 1966 Federalism: A Comparative Study

1Isah Shehu Mohammed, 2Muhammad Fuad bn Othman, 3Nazariah binti Osman

Chief Lecturer, Head of General Studies Department, Federal Polytechnic, Bauchi - Nigeria
zababa72@yahoo.com

2Professor, Assistant Vice Chancellor and Dean, School of International Studies, Universiti Utara, Malaysia, mfuad@uum.edu.my

3Senior Lecturer, Deputy Dean, School of International Studies, Universiti Utara, Malaysia nazariah@uum.edu.my

ARTICLE DETAILS

Objective: The objective is to make a comparative study of the Nigeria’s First Republic (1954-1966) and the post 1966 federalism. The two periods saw Nigeria practicing federalism with different power sharing and governmental components arrangements. The study is significant at this time of search for a viable federalism, incessant agitations for restructuring the Nigerian state, and increasing threats to her unity and cohesion over the federal arrangement. Methodology: The study used non-numerical, secondary and historically documented sources to collect data and also used the historical method and practical events in Nigeria’s journey of federalism to analyse the data. Result: In the First Republic, it was a fiscal federalism with greater regional autonomy and limited constitutional powers to the Central Government, while the post 1966 federalism had more and strategic powers constitutionally allocated to the Central Government. First Republic federalism was more disciplined in financial and residual matters and power with greater autonomy and competition between regions which greatly fostered development and accountability among them, with less constitutional frictions between the Central and Regions. Implication: The study fills an existing gap in the study of Nigeria’s federalism viz-a-viz more calls for restructuring and or true federalism, number of units and devolution of constitutional powers, corruption, slow and discouraged development, which result in over reliance on statutory allocations from the Centre, and intensifies struggle for resource control, although it on the other hand controversially guarantees the unity of the Nigerian state.

Corresponding author’s email address: zababa72@yahoo.com

© 2020 Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0

1. Introduction
States and nations have historically been characterized by the search for, evolution, adoption or adaptation of varying and systems of government relative to their socio-economic, political, geo-physical and historical peculiarities. For Nigeria as well, the search has also been determined and influenced by these factors, but gruesomely affected by colonialism (1861-1960). Colonialism not only affected the search, but made a significant impact on the state, political system and the society in such a way that departure from it has become near impossible, especially with regards to the burdens of colonial history (Unegbu 2003:41-48), experience and engravings which Nigeria has been battling with since her amalgamation - British colonialism and in the post independence era. One of such burdens is the federal system of government which became imperative to both the colonialist and Nigerian nationalists on the eve of and after the independence in 1960.

From 1954 to date through the battle and carrying the burdens of the colonial history, Nigeria has since October 1954 been under the federal system, (except for General Ironsi’s regime, January-July, 1966), but still battling with choice of the most feasible federal arrangement for its heterogeneous make-up. With those - colonialism, independence and heterogeneities of the Nigerian nation have altogether been shaping the post independence era and destiny (Suleiman & Maiangwa, 2017:262). The past 64 years have been experimental in the practice of federalism, yet not a single mode of its adoption or adaption has been commonly reached by the stakeholders.

This study explores and compares the two major periods of practicing federalism in Nigeria – the 1954-1966 (late Colonial period, First Republic, early independence and Republican era), and the post 1966 federalism largely determined and influenced by the Nigerian military in addition to other factors.

1.1 Statement of the Problem
Nigeria federalism is confronted with varying challenges which are more often not based on the conception and or traditions of the conventional federalists, and which therefore, require contemporary, situational and unique approaches and actions other than those conventional principles (Othman, Osmand & Mohammed, 2019; Mohammed & Aisha, 2020; Adedeji & Ezebasili, 2018:167); Adoption or adaption of feasible federalism, including states creation and revenue allocation have been the main challenges confronting the growth and development of Nigeria (Ahmed, Falaye, Oloni, & Okeke, 2017:1; Shagari, 2001; 273 & 276); The failure to address, arrive at compromised and popular federal structure has led to ‘tragic policy failure’ in Nigeria, while openness, responsibility and responsiveness among the levels of the Nigerian federalism have remained only elusive and poorest in performance ranking (Friedman, 2018:165; Anderson, 2012).

With the much bound colonial heritages, Nigerians have failed to forge ahead and resolve disunity, ethno-regional and religious antagonism and conflicts (Saidu, Rasheed, Zaku & Yusoff, 2019; George, Yusuff & Cornelius, 2017; Suleiman & Maiangwa, 2017:273; Fessha, (2017; Mohammed & Aisha, 2020); British colonial legacies have resulted in transformed religious, ethno-regional and political identities for the Nigerian state, and the greatest challenge to federalism and nation-building; Although ethno-federalism was initially regarded as the solution to Nigeria’s heterogeneous composition, it is still responsible for the ethno-religious sentiments in the later Nigeria, particularly among the common men (Suleiman & Maiangwa, 2017:269; Ejobowah, 2010); The minority issue is also key to discussions on Nigerian federalism, but has lingered on and hit the federal structure and operation since the inception of the Nigerian state system (Usuanlele & Ihawoh, 2017:2). The conglomeration of these problems have resulted in calls for restructuring (centred on fiscal federalism) the country, as well as the attendant manipulation and hijack of the calls by the ethno-religious, regional elites and politicians, among others.

1.2. Background of the Study
The controversial, but un-ignorable statement by Verjee (2017: ix) that ‘anyone who claims to understand Nigeria is either deluded, or a liar’ has a significant impact. Nigeria, the leading West African and African
state is also the largest single black federal democracy in the world. It is strategic in both the regional, continental and world affairs, especially for its political significance to the regional security, the Commonwealth, global oil market and economy, and its large population of over 193m people (Idris, 2018; Mohammed & Aisha, 2017; NBS, 2016). Nigeria is the result of the amalgamation of numerous heterogeneous, geo-political, ethno-religious and political entities by the British colonial masters in 1914. Hence the earlier admission that the name Nigeria ‘is only an English expression of which has been made to comprehend a number of natives covering about 500,000 square miles of territory of the world’ (Lugard, 1906:7). All these however, began when Africans (who then had no say) and their lands were apportioned among the then world imperial powers at the Berlin Conference, 1884-1885 (Usuanlele & Ibhawoh, 2017:1). The composition of the amalgamated Nigeria transcends beyond ethnicity and religion, but also geography, history, culture, civilization and worldview, among others.

From the first day of its amalgamation, Nigeria has deliberately and otherwise, been engaged in the search for the popular and feasible means of being together and nationhood amidst the heterogeneities and colonial bondage. One of such has been the adoption of federalism in the mid 1950’s, which is a means of resolving conflicts among citizens and levels of government, especially in heterogeneous states (Amusan, Saka & Omede, 2017:3; Deng, Deng, Deng & Jiménez, 2008). It has therefore not been an easy journey for Nigeria through the nationhood through the over 106 years of amalgamation. However, despite the challenges, as maintained, ‘the construction of Nigerian nation, its resilience in the face of historical and geographical adversity, and its progress following the unexpected traumas of the post-independence era, are enduring testaments to its people and proof of its promise’ (Levan & Ukata, 2018:1). Furthermore, the British policy of indirect rule required homogeneity and establishment of tribal hierarchies and those resulted in the post-colonial bond and reconfiguration of ethno-religious and geo-political problems in the former colonies. This necessitates the continuous battle with the challenges of unity and cohesion among the former colonies, especially Nigeria (Usuanlele & Ibhawoh, 2017:2).

Many instances influenced the choice of federalism for Nigeria, including the colonialists themselves and the 1953/54 London/Lagos Constitutional Conference which agreed to among others to institute fiscal arrangements in a new constitution and a federal system of government for Nigeria (Shehu & Buba, 2016:89-90). Similarly, Sir Tafawa Balewa (Tafawa Balewa, 1962:2) had in that respect maintained that:

I am pleased to see that we have all agreed that the federal system is, under the present conditions, the only basis on which the Nigeria can remain united. We must recognize our diversity and the peculiar conditions under which the different communalities live in this country. To us in Nigeria therefore unity in diversity is a source of great strength, and we must do all in our power to see that this federal system of government is maintained and strengthened.

Although from the late 1940s and early 1950s, political organisations and parties were formed mainly based on ethno-regional lines which greatly influenced and shaped the political atmosphere of the Nigerian state, the ‘tenuous consensus’ was reached by both colonial masters and the then Nigerian politicians/regional leaders that federalism would be the best for Nigeria, especially with respect to its heterogeneous character (Usuanlele & Ibhawoh, 2017:5).

Similarly, the 1994/95 Abacha Constitutional Conference Committee in its final Report observed and recommended that Nigeria should adopt a federal system with central government having substantial distribution of powers and autonomy with coordinate functions/powers in order to maintain unity and autonomy among the Nigerian communities, and also beneficial to the heterogeneity of Nigeria and sustain its unity in diversity; ensure participation in governance; minimize fears of domination; and foster development. The Conference also recommended operation of federalism with clear demarcation of the powers, equitable distribution of economic and political powers between the centre and the other units, strong and independent Judiciary, and economically viable components units that would not be so much dependent on the Centre and central resources (Dinneya, 2006; THISDAY, 1998. November 17, pp. IXLIV).
On the other hand, the history and practice of federalism in Nigeria has been both dominated and hit by the Nigerian military. Despite the political scientists submission, especially from the Western world, that military rule is incompatible to federalism because of the absence of popular participation in governance, non-democratic character and unbinding and less accountability to the electorate. However, all the Nigerian military regimes, but one (Ironsí) have adopted federalism and sought to improve its practice at varying levels and degrees (Elaigwu, 2017:11-12). This means the Nigerian military have despite their authoritarian character, been able to work with federalism at varying degrees.

1.3 Conceptualisation and Review
Despite the existence and usage of theories on federalism (Mohammed & Aisha, 2020), it has no any universally accepted and full pledged theory and no state has been able to practically adopt all the principles of federalism in its traditions (Mohammed & Aisha, 2020; Elaigwu, 2017:7; Burgess, 2006:1). Thus for Ayoade in Elaigwu & Akindele (1996:40), ‘Federalism is dialectical. It is necessitated by the emotions of love and hate. The success of federal experiment is a function of equilibrium between both feelings’. However, Wheare (1963) identifies the basis of federalism as the existence of a written constitution, constitutional division of powers, and autonomy of the respective units in exercise of powers and functions. In reality, Nigerian federalism and its inherent characters have raised and encouraged springing and proliferation of ethno-religious militia groups that threaten the sustenance and prosperity of both the federal arrangement and the state system (Babawale, 2001). Similarly, the desire and clamour for fiscal federalism has in addition to corruption and elite manipulation, been also a generator and determinant of resource control conflict, heated debates, and eruption of violent struggles, especially in the oil producing areas of Nigeria (Aka, 2017; Charles, 2013; Salami, 2011; Arowola, 2011).

For Nigeria, fear of domination has since the inception of the federalism and later the creation of 12 states in 1967, generated fear, mistrust and suspicion among the majority groups on one hand, and on the other, the Niger-Delta region composed of numerous and ethnic groups in a complex environmental set-up stricken by fear of domination of one another and resource conflict (Othman, Osman & Mohammed, 2019; Mohammed, Othman & Osman, 2019). So also to the Middle-Belt/Central Nigerian minorities on the Northern part and those have been a thorn to the Nigerian federalism (Levan, 2018). For Elaigwu & Erim (1996:1), there are 5 contrasting perspectives on Nigerian federalism as: the federalism was imposed on Nigeria by the British, it was British policy of divide and rule, that federalism or confederalism is invariable to Nigeria’s heterogeneous composition, federalism is a compromise among Nigerians, and a mixture of centrifugal and centripetal factors. The military has similarly been dominant in the Nigerian federalism ever since the January 1966 coup and hand hence, played the most significant role in shaping the federalism through Decrees, Edicts, States and Local Government creations, and revenue allocation among others. Thus resulting to and entrenching what Elaigwu (2017) terms as Military Federalism.

1.4 Perils of Nigerian Federalism
The peculiar perils of Nigerian federalism have from pre-independence to date characterized and complicated it with several instances, occurrences and recurrences – oil rent dependent economy, difficult colonial burden of history and heritages, ethno-regional politics, recurrence of violence, rise of ethnic militias and separatist tendencies, and elites’ competition and manipulation of state power and resources (Levan, 2013; Mohammed, et al, 2019). Added to that, Nigeria is a resource rent dependent federation with over dependence on oil which is explored from the Niger-Delta – an area already heated with minorities’ suspicion, fear and resentment of the majority apart from resource conflict (Amusan, et. al., 2017:3). Although substantial revenue has been realized over the years since the discovery and exploration of oil in Nigeria, not much in commensurate with the generated revenue has been achieved in terms infrastructural, and socio-economic development. Instead, only few and privileged elites have access to the oil resources and what accrues from it thereby resulting in violence, pervasive corruption and negligence and near crash of the non-oil sectors, and mortgaging the oil resources and revenue at the expense of stability, development and prosperity of Nigeria (Mohammed, Saidu & Aisha, 2018; Amusan, et. al, 2017:18).
The search for a popular federalism in Nigeria is greatly influenced by the desire of the resource-rich areas, communities and regions that largely depend resource rent in order to control such resources endowed in their areas, especially oil (Othman, et al., 2019; Amusan, et. al., 2017:4). Thus federalism and oil resource constitute a volatile mix, as there often arise tensions (vertical and horizontal) over the distribution and management of rents accruable to the state from crude oil (Anderson, 2012). This is in company of the fears of the minority groups under the Nigerian state and federalism as the Willink Commission (1958) outlined and included the domination of government by the ethno-regional majorities; social fears and grievances; economic discrimination; discrimination in public recruitments, posts, and services; changes in regional legal systems; maintaining public order and the individual citizens’ freedom; religious intolerance; and native authorities and traditional rulers (Usuanlele & Ibhawoh, 2017:2; Elaigwu, 2017:46). These are in addition to two other critical perils to Nigerian federalism – imbalanced political structure between the Northern and Southern regions which results in mutual fear, suspicion, rivalry and ethno-regional nationalism; and the fear between the major ethnic groups on one hand and the minority groups fears of the majority (Hausa/Fulani, Igbo and Yoruba) on the other (Elaigwu, 2017:46).

One of the central fears of domination lies in the North’s dominance in terms of population, geographical size, endowed material resources (apart from oil), and its pre-colonial historio-religious civilisation and political background, and prominence over the Southern region during colonialism, despite being (the North) late in colonization and considered educationally backward (Mohammed, 2018; Othman, et al., 2019). Suffice to say that for over two millennia, Northern region of Nigeria has been politically, commercially, and intellectually on the outer peripheries of the Mediterranean and the Middle-East. There were routes through the Sahara which linked the Coptic speaking Egypt, Phoenician Carthage, and the Roman Empire to peoples around Lake Chad and on the Great Plains to the West and the East of the Lake. While the then shores of the Sokoto Caliphate extended to as far and wide as Dori and Liptako in Burkina with commercial, religious and diplomatic relations (Last in Levan & Utaka, 2018:19 & 22).

The other perils of federalism in Nigeria revolve around over dependence on oil resource as a means of revenue, dominance of the central government with lion’s share from the allocation of the revenue accruing to the federation, incessant disagreements and conflicts over revenue allocation, and poor fiscal relations among the units, North-South fear of hegemony, and failure to adhere to the established constitutional provisions in the practice of the federalism (Mohammed, et. al., 2018; Ewetan, 2012:1084). As a result of the above, the various Nigerian regimes have used granting autonomy to the 3 later 4 regions of Nigeria, more States and Local Governments, re-distribution and review of revenue allocation formula, bi-cameralism, among others, in order to absorb the shocks of the federalism (Levan, 2018; Friedman, 2018:165).

The operation of Nigerian federalism can be practically divided into phases of the pre and First Republic (1954-66); and post 1966 which also extends to the present (2020), and including the military eras. Although the First Republic federalism under this study also covered the last part of pre-independence (1954-60), the January 1966 coup had disrupted not only the federal system, but also the proscribed democratic First Republic itself. For the post 1966 federalism, it was largely an imposition of the military regimes of Generals Gowon, Murtala/Obasanjo, Buhari, Babangida, Abacha and Abdussalam, except for the civilian Shehu Shagari’s Second Republic (1979-1983). The Shagari’s Second Republic/regime itself inherited all its structures of federalism from the ousted military regime of Generals Murtala/Obasanjo who successfully built on what General Gowon’s military regime had earlier established – a federalism with strong Centre and weak 12 States each with their Provinces and later 19 States and 301 Local Government Areas (Mohammed & Aisha, 2020; Mohammed, et al., 2018).

The 1954-66 federalism was the result of the various constitutional conferences, in Lagos, London, Ibadan, compromises and colonial influences driven by the desire for independence, regional political, economic, geo-ethnic security and autonomy, but the military was not part of the negotiations. Under the
1954-66 federalism/constitutional power sharing in Nigeria, there were three Lists - Exclusive, Co-current and Residual Lists for the Federal/Central Government only, the 3 (later 4) Regions and the Federal Government together, and the for the Regions only and respectively. There were altogether 44 items under the Exclusive List as: Aviation, Currency, Extradition, Accounts of the Federation, Defence, Customs and Excise, among others. There was also the Con-current List with 28 items which included: Arms and Ammunitions, Registration of Business names, among others. The Residual List for the Regions (each) comprised of any matter not included in the 44 and 28 Exclusive and or the Con-current legislative Lists. The constitutional arrangement of power-sharing was with weak Central Government with limited exclusive powers and Strong Regions with enormous Residual powers. Therefore, Nigeria was a federation with Federal/Central Government and 4 Regions among whom the constitutional powers were allocated and devolved.

The 1954-66 federalism was operated with Parliamentary Democracy with offices of Prime Minister and Ceremonial President; a non-Republican Constitution, until October, 1963; three and later four Regions – West, East, and North, and later the Mid-West; Premiers and Ceremonial Governors for each Region; constitutional power-sharing which granted greater autonomy to the Regions; division of constitutional powers/legislative lists into the Exclusive (Federal or Central Government only), Con-current (Federal and Regional Governments together), Residual (Regions only). It was also federalism operated with Collective Responsibility, Fusion of Powers, Dissolution of the Parliament, no cross-carpeting for the legislators; each Region had a Premier and an Executive Council, a Ceremonial Governor and Bicameral Regional Legislature (Houses of Chiefs and Assembly) comprising of nominated and elected members respectively; the tenure for the Executive and Legislators was 5 years at both the Central and Regional levels (all tenures were renewable after every 5 years, but without limit).

The federal Prime Minister, Regional Premiers, and the parliamentarians could be removed from office through Vote of No Confidence and or Dissolution of the Parliament; there was no Separation of Powers between the Executive and the Parliament at the Central and Regional levels; the 1959 and 1964 Central Governments were both formed through Coalition and or Alliance between the Northern Peoples Congress (NPC) and the National Council of Nigerian Citizens NCNC in the famous 1959–1964 NPC/NCNC Coalition; and the Northern Peoples Congress NPC and Nigeria National Democratic Party (NNDP) Alliance of 1964 popularly known as the Nigeria National Alliance (NNA) respectively (Mohammed, Aisha & Saidu, 2018:59, 66, 68). The military had no role/influence in making/enacting the Constitution/federal system between 1954 and 1966, but strictly colonial and indigenous politicians’ makings. Similarly, the 1954-1966 federal arrangement gave both the Central and Regional Governments the autonomous powers to each, have Central and Regional Constitutions, Coat of Arms, Police, substantial of their respective control resources, revenue generation and expenditure (Mohammed & Aisha, 2020).

The federal powers were exercised together by the federal Prime Minister as the Executive Head of the Government, the Governor-General (later) Ceremonial President as the Head of State and Commander in Chief of the Nigerian Armed Forces, and the Federal Parliament which comprised of bi-cameral legislature from December 1959 with 312 (later 320) Representatives and 44 Senators.

5. The Post 1966 Federalism
For the post 1966 federalism, it was wholly a making and an imposition by the Nigeria Military resulting from the circumstances and events of the January and July 1966 coups, the abrogation of the former Federal System and Constitution, imposition of a Unitary Government, the assassination of General Ironsi and the Nigerian Civil-War. Thus there were Decrees No. 24 of May 1999, No. 14 of 1988, No. 3 of 1994, etc. It was military and centralist federalism (Elaigwu, 2017), with dominance of the Nigerian Military in both the political process and activities, and governance. Instead of the former 4 Regions (North, East, West and the Mid-West), 12 States and Provinces, 19 States and 301 Local Government Areas (LGAs), 21, 30 and 36 States with 768 LGA and 6 Area Councils (AC); three tier federalism with Federal/Central, States and Local Governments as units/levels of the Nigerian federation (Section 3 [1-4], 7[1-6], First Schedule [Part I], & II of the 1999 Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria). It has been a Presidential System of Government with tenure of 4 years and renewable once (Section
130[1] of the Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria, 1999); the President is the Head of State, Government and Commander in Chief of the Armed Forces of the Federal Republic of Nigeria and can be removed from office through Impeachment (Section 130[2], 135, 143 of the Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria, 1999).

Although it is a general position in the post 1966 federalism that with allocation of most and strategic powers (Exclusive) to the Central Government, the States are rendered weak and then dependent on the Centre for funds allocations, strategic legislations, among others, stability of income from the statutory allocations to the states has empowered the States in such ways that they exercise substantial influence and control over national resources and revenue distribution (Levan, 2018; Section 162 (3 & 4) of the Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria, 1999).

The 1999 Constitution of Nigeria comprises of 68 items under the Exclusive List for the Federal/Central Government as well as any other matters that incidental and or supplementary to those in this List on which the National Assembly has jurisdiction to make laws on; 30 items under the Con-current List and the Residual List (matters not covered in the Exclusive and Con-current Lists) for the States (Second Schedule [Section 4], Part II; Fourth Schedule [Section 7] of the Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria, 1999). Similarly, in the provisions of the 1999 Constitution of Nigeria, there exists a hierarchical order of levels and relations among the Central, States and the Local Governments which then confers enormous constitutional (Exclusive) powers on the Central Government over the States and Local Governments (Adedeji, 2017). There are currently 768 LGA; and 6 Area Councils for the Federal Capital Territory, Abuja (Section 3 [1-7] & First Schedule [I & II] of the Constitution of Nigeria, 1999).

The post 1966 federalism has been wholly Republican (including such acclamations by the Military), bearing the name of the Federal Republic of Nigeria during both the Military and civilian democratic regimes. For the civilian democratic regimes (Presidents Shagari, Obasanjo, Yar’Adua, Goodluck, and currently Muhammadu Buhari), the federalism operates with the principles of Separation of Powers, Independence of the Judiciary, Checks and Balance and a more centralist tendency in constitutional allocation of powers, among others. Similarly, that federal system has federal powers exercised by the offices of the President (Head of State and Government/Chief Executive Officer, and Commander in Chief of the Nigerian Armed Forces), and the National Assembly. The post 1966 National Assembly comprised of 1979-1983 – 96 Senators and 450 Representatives (Shagari, 2001:249); 1989-1993 – 91 Senators and 589 Representatives; from 1999 to date, 109 Senators and 360 Members for the Federal House of Representatives (Sections 49 & 77[1] of Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria, 1999).

By comparison, the Legislative items under the Con-current Powers in the 1954-66 Federalism and Constitution, but moved to Exclusive Powers in the post 1966 federalism include: Arms and Ammunitions, Bankruptcy and Insolvency, Drugs and Poison, Finger Prints, National Parks, Prisons, among others (Second Schedule [Part II, 1999 Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria]). While the pre 1966 federalism and Constitution allocated those to the Con-current Lists/powers which conferred enormous powers on the three and later four Regions in addition to the bulk of Residual Powers not covered by the Exclusive and Con-current Lists. By implication, in the 1954-66 Nigerian federalism, there were 44 and 28 items for the Exclusive and Con-current powers, and for the post 1966, especially the current 1999 Constitution, 68 and 30 items are respectively under the Exclusive and Con-current lists, while all the others are reserved for the Residual List. Furthermore, the 68 items covered all the strategic and grey areas of Mines and Minerals, Revenue, Military, External Affairs, Security, Defence, International Relations, Arms and Ammunitions, Census, Internal Affairs (Prisons, Immigration, Customs, and Police), Labour and Trade Unions and Minimum Wages, among others.

6. The Way Forward
Although Nigeria has been practicing federalism for over 66 years, it is yet to arrive at any nationally agreed arrangement of the federal structure. It is imperative that Nigerians must first understand that different countries practice federal system based on their peculiar differences and as such make unique arrangements for the practice of same. Issues of transparency and good governance are key to achieving
success in the practice of whatever federal arrangement arrived at. It would certainly not be much easy to return to the First Republic federal structure, but its certain elements are still relevant and can be used to arrive at a popular structure for the present. While differences have to be accommodated in the federal set up, insignificant differences should be de-emphasised so as to give way forward. The tendency of the Central Government taking up much of the strategic powers should also re-directed so that the component parts may also have significant power exercise in the system. States should also enjoy further autonomy in control of their resources so as to reduce the extents of corruption and over dependence on the allocation from the Centre. The Central Government should largely concentrate on powers that have to do with ensuring and consolidating the unity of Nigerian state such as Census, Citizenship, and Passport among others, thereby leaving other powers to the components for better management and services delivery.

7. Summary and Conclusion
There is no doubt on the position of politicians, scholars and other stakeholders that the only system that could hold Nigeria as one and united entity at the moment is federalism. The choice of the federalism and its character, however, largely depend on a common stand reached by Nigerians. Two major federal arrangements were each tested and each has its both sides of strength and weaknesses. The First Republic and post 1966 federalism are on the opposite sides in terms of power (Weak Centre and Strong Regions; Strong Centre and Weak States), Resource Control and Allocation. On the aspects of other auxiliary parts of federalism, the two have also been on opposite sides – Parliamentary Democracy, among others. However, there is a greater peril of failing to comply with the principles establishing the federalism more in the post 1966 than the First Republic federalism, although such are at varying degrees dependent upon circumstances and geo-political and economic settings as well as the leadership commitment.

As far as revenue generation and allocation is concerned, the First Republic Regions were more viable and accountable in generation and management of their resources than the post 1966 federalism characterized by over dependence on the Centre, slow development, incessant resource conflict and corruption. For the post 1966 units of federalism, and especially the States and Local Governments, there is little or no difference in terms of quality service delivery to the people between the resource rich States and Local Governments on one hand, and the other considered to be poor or not oil producing States.

Nigerians have the choice of the federal arrangement to make. However, what determines the success or failure largely depends on compliance with the established principles guiding the operation of the federalism in relation to constitutional provisions. At any rate, those virtues of federalism – tolerance, accommodation, compromises, and heterogeneity must be wholly embraced and upheld for Nigeria to move on as one united entity.

References

1476


The Impact of Economic Growth, Foreign Direct Investment, Urbanization, Fossils Fuel Consumption on Environmental Degradation in Emerging Asian Economies

1Muhammad Waqas Ashraf, 2 Hafeez ur Rehman, Imran Sharif Chaudhry
1PhD Scholar, Department of Economics, University of Management and Technology Lahore, Pakistan, mianwaqqasashraf@gmail.com
2Chairman, Department of Economics, University of Management and Technology Lahore-Pakistan, hafeez.rehman@umt.edu.pk
3Director, School of Economics, Bahauddin Zakariya University Multan, Pakistan, imran@bzu.edu.pk

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT
The current examination ascertains the impact of foreign direct investment, urbanization, economic growth, fossil fuel consumption on carbon emissions in eleven rising Asian economies. Panel data has been scrutinized from 1990 to 2018, and (ARDL)/PMG model is executed. The outcomes of the model exemplify that in these growing Asian economies, the triumph to cultivate economic growth, foreign direct investment, urbanization and fossil fuels are bestowing CO2 emissions and deteriorating the environmental circumstances at the regional level. Moreover, the conclusions emphasis that foreign direct investment is a source of environmental humiliation and increases carbon emissions at the regional level. Furthermore, outcomes of the investigate also confirms the existence of (EKC) in these eleven emerging Asian economies. The study also suggest that by lessening the consumption of fossil fuel energy and encouragement of an environmental responsive economic growth policy will be suitable for the affluence in these emerging developing Asian economies and also the rest of world..

JEL Classification
M2, M21

1. Introduction
Among other challenges, most important tasks in the world is environmental degradation. Basically with the passage of time, increase in economic activities and economic growth leads to generate economic degradation (Peman et al., 2003). There are so many factors, which are responsible for environmental degradation and creates pollution by carbon dioxide emissions (Jacobson, 2008). Economic activity is the key factor of environmental disrepair. In other words, swift economic development and additional production in these emerging economies have to bear the overheads of environmental degradation (Shehbaz et al., 2016). Economic growth intended to change the global climate, predominantly through
use of fossil fuel (non-renewable) resources. Economic activity was one of the key factors for the increase in global warming in the middle of the 20th century in these Asian economies (IPCC 2018). The consumption of energy was low in Asian economies in 1960s but the economic reforms and sprawling of urban population in late 1970s and in 1980s enhance the use of energy in this region. These factors increase the environmental degradation in this region and the rest of the world (Guttikunda et al, 2003). With augmented carbon emissions from the households, the threat of toxicities such as pneumonia and other breathing diseases increased (Hanif 2018b). In addition, the volume of ejection comprises anthropogenic factors (for example urbanisation, FDI, population size and per capita GDP). Amplified carbon dioxide evacuation donates to a variety of diseases, including cardiovascular and respiratory complaints (WHO 2016). Social and economic actions are esteemed, which decline the stability of heat and energy exchanges over the Globe.

The mesosphere of the universe has changed environment, which is often categorized as "global warming." Humanistic activities have contributed to intensified atmospheric carbon dioxide (CO₂), predominantly by the energy usage specially for production targets (Maranga et al. 2010). There have not been reliable and consistent outcomes from earlier studies on environmental degradation, urbanization and carbon emissions at regional level. Thus, further work is required. The outcomes of a region or a sole country can not be revealed globally because of multifaceted geographical and socio-economic circumstances. Here, we will investigate the effect of economic growth, urbanization, FDI, fossil fuel consumption on carbon emissions/emissions in Asian emerging countries. Sprinkling literature on carbon emissions and environmental degradation in different regions has dazed the effect of economic growth, including Apergis and Ozturk (2015), Wang et al. (2016), Nasreen et al. (2017). Empirical evidence is uncertain, especially as regard of successful policy suggestions in the emerging economies of Asia. So present study has a remarkable association between the urbanization, fossil fuel energy, GDP and CO₂ emissions/emissions.

The economic growth trend in emerging but less developed countries in 2018 shows that nonlinear trend. The china has the largest share of GDP which was 10797222227694.5. The second highest GDP was 68358370 in India. The third one followed by Indonesia which was 1146844815417. The graphical explanation also shows that in 2018 the emission of CO₂ of these Countries, the highest carbon dioxide emitter was Malaysia (254368367.421025 million ton), on second level China (992844878.45 million ton) and lowest level is Nepal (9178807.276219 million ton) on third level, respectively. These data showed that in 2018 China the top economic growth with highest carbon dioxide emitter.
The FDI trend in emerging but less developed countries in 2018 shows that nonlinear trend. The China has the largest share of FDI which was 23536505036.341. The second highest FDI was 42117450737.2644 in India. The third one followed by Indonesia which was 18909826043.5105.

The Urban population trend in emerging but less developed countries in 2018 shows that nonlinear trend. The china has the largest share of Urban population which was 823827650. The second highest Urban population was 460295677 in India. The third one followed by Indonesia which was 148084795. Our data sample contains of eleven emerging countries from Asia. All of these economies are from the top twenty FDI hosting economies from last twenty years. These emerging countries encompass their reserve by remittance and foreign direct investment. These countries are more liberal in trade openness and due to trade openness multinational companies transfer their production infrastructure and technologies. The level of trade openness and other globalization process these countries are still in primary stage of development but their pace are very speedy. In 2008 financial crises these economies had speedy adjustment process due to strong financial institution. Due to above mentioned reasons these selected countries are emerging economies in Asia.

The outcomes were estimated with the help of panel data collected from 11 emerging Asian economies from 1990 to 2018. Section 2 provides data and methodology, Section 3 presents estimates and results, Section 4 interprets results, Section 5 concludes, and highlights the main policy consequences of the research.
2. Literature Review
Assessing the impact of Urbanization, fossil fuels energy consumption, economic growth, FDI, on environmental dilapidation is one of the immensely vital areas of research. In this concern, several efforts have been made by conducting empirical studies by paneling the different income / regional groups and using time series data of different countries. The empirical validation of (EKC) hypothesis is also confirmed in quantity of studies by using panel data and time series of different countries / regions. Some studies which have discussed these features of environmental research are discussed below: Acaravci (2010) explored the relation amongst CO₂ emissions, energy ingesting and economic growth in nineteen European economies between 1960 and 2005. The researchers found that the variables were definitely interlinked. In adding, the study demonstrated the analysis of the inverted U-shaped EKC, particularly in Italy and Denmark.

The Error Correction Model ( ECM) was implemented and this study found that there is a two-directional connection amongst the variables. Attari and Ataria (2011) evaluate the affiliation amongst Energy ingesting and economic growth among 1971 and 2008 through a regional analysis of Pakistan, India and China. Globally, the CO₂ emissions rate is 51.35%, but Pakistan has the lowest rate of 85.85% compared to India and China which was88.18% and 87.53% respectively. Pakistan has high population growth rate, low per capita GDP but low CO₂ emissions compared to China and India. Sharma (2011) observed the commitment to CO₂ emissions in sixty nine economies by using panel data. To examine those determining CO₂ emissions, 69 countries were divided into three subcategories in high, medium and low-income economies. The study originate that urban population has a negative influence on CO₂ emanations in middle and low-income countries. Arouri et al. (2012) assessed the association among CO₂ emanations, energy ingesting and GDP in Central and North African economies from the period of 1981 to 2005.

It determined that the long-term correlation in energy ingesting with CO₂ emanations is important and positive and GDP is a quadratic connection with CO₂ emanations for the entire world. The data estimate also showed the EKC shaped as inverted U. Remuald (2012) studied the connection between CO₂ growths per capita for the period of 1970 to 2004 for 5 countries. The estimation of panel data showed that education is not a factor in CO₂ emission growth but education is a factor in pollution growth. GMM-system estimation technique is used in this study. Chen and Huang (2013) analyzed the data of 1981-2009 to find out the connection amongst CO₂ emanations, urbanization, FDI, and energy ingesting for the N-11 nations. The results showed a extensive association between carbon emanations and economic growth using panel co-integration. Additionally, urban population has a important and negative relationship with carbon emanations. Sedorsky (2014) explored 16 developing countries and used STIRPAPAT model from 1971 to 2009.

Practical results suggested a positive correlation among energy intensity, per capita GDP, population size and carbon emanations. While the use of urbanization depends on the method of assessment, may be a positive or negative connection. Cetin and Ecevit (2015) deliberated the relationship among energy ingesting, urbanization, and environmental deprivation in 19 sub-Saharan countries between 1985 and 2010. As a result, it has been revealed that the main source of environmental degradation in these 19 sub-Saharan is energy consumption and urbanization.

This study acknowledged the long-term connection amongst the variables applying panel co-integration assessments. The outcomes of the Error Correction Model (VECM) showed that there are two reasons between long-term urbanization and both energy ingesting and CO₂ emanations. Alam et al. (2016) detected the consequence of energy ingesting, income and population growth on CO₂ discharges by applying annual data from 1970 to 2012 for Indonesia, India, China and Brazil. CO₂ emanations has optimistic and significant influence with increase in consumption of energy and income in all four countries. The outcome of populace growth on CO₂ emanations was significant for Brazil and India but inconsequential for Indonesia and China. Hypothesis of inverted- EKC was also initiate in China, Indonesia and Brazil but not in India. Smruti and Dash (2017) detected the relationship among FDI, energy intensity, urbanization and CO₂ emanations during 1980 to 2012 of 18 republics in South Asia.
The researchers divided the 17 countries into three sub categories on the basis of income them as middle and low income countries. This investigate divided the nations on the foundation of per capita income. A co-integration association is found between energy intensity, fossil fuel, FDI, urban population and Carbon emanations in middle income nations. The results indicated that energy ingesting significantly increased by the CO₂ emissions and incline to create to green house problem in the South Asian Countries. Hanif (2017) inspected the nexus of energy, economics and the environment in Caribbean Latin American countries.

The study aimed to discover the influence of fossil fuel ingesting, oil-based imports, electricity consumption, and increase of urban population on environmental collapse. The researcher used the System Generalized Method (SGM) for the period (1990-2015) with two-stage estimator included in a panel of 20 middle and 20 lower middle income nations. The results indicated that the expansion of oil imports, fossil fuel ingesting and urban population is contributing meaningfully to ecological degradation and also established the revealed U-shaped association among CO₂ emission and GDP per capita. This study expored that renewable energy resources could support to encounter growing energy demand and reduce trade deficits by reducing oil imports to developing countries in Caribbean Latin American countries. Sakiru and Mulali (2018) investigated the impact of FDI on environmental dilapidation by scrutinize 20 countries.

The results show that FDI has not any outcome on environmental dilapidation indicators, carbon footprints and ecological footprint. The results further explored that energy ingesting, GDP, and urbanization played key contributors to environmental degradation. The results exposed that FDI and urbanization enhance effluence in the developing countries but they alleviate pollution in developed countries. Hanif,(2018) analyzed “the effect of economic growth on energy ingesting and urban population on CO₂ emission in sub-Saharan Africa.

The results of study showed the positive and significant influence of economic growth, ingesting of fossil fuels, urban expansion, and renewable energy on environmental dilapidation in evolving nations of sub-Saharan African. In this study (GMM) was adapted on 34 sub-Saharan African economies for the period of 1995-2015. Results described that ingesting of fossil fuels for extension of metropolitan zones and cooking are meaningfully causal to CO₂ emission and air pollution. Inverted-U shaped relationship among per capita economic growth and CO₂ emission has also found. Empirical analysis also confirmed Environmental Kuznets Curve (EKC) in low-income and middle emerging economies of Sub Saharan Africa.

The study suggested that renewable energy replacements improve air value by monitoring CO₂ emission and depressing the direct interface of household’s noxious gases and use of renewable energy alternative help the economies to attain viable development goals”. Shehbaz, et al. (2019) observed the relation amongst FDI and CO₂ emanation from 1990-2015 for the Middle East and the North African region. The researcher applied GMM (Generalized Method Moments) for Pollution Haven Hypothesis (PHH) testing. N-shaped connotation found amongst FDI and CO₂ emanations. GDP and CO₂ emissions has inverted- U and N-shaped relationship and thus satisfied the Environmental Kuznets Curve. Hanif, et al. ( 2019) studied FDI, fossil fuels and economic growth that directed to Carbon dioxide emanations in developing countries in asia. Asia's fastest-growing economy is facing increasing environmental problems. Fossil fuels increase the emission of CO₂.

FDI in developing economies are important source of CO₂ emanations. Results confirmed the Pollution Haven Hypothesis and rejected the Halo effect by hypothesis. Panel data were used from 1990 to 2013 and the ARDL bound approach was applied. This study revealed a optimistic and significant influence of boosting economic growth, fossil fuels and FDI on CO₂ emanations and environmental degradation. The study also identified the existence of the EKC. The study concluded that reducing fossil fuel consumption and promoting environmental friendly economic growth strategies in developing countries will be beneficial. Chaudhry et al. (2020) inspected the association amongst economic development, urbanization of CO₂ emanations, population size in the economies of the South Asian Association for
Regional Cooperation (SAARC) for the period 1994-2013. In this investigation, an enhanced STIRPAT model along a fixed effect regression estimation is used. Practical results have shown that size of population and high carbon emanations per capita are the main drivers in SAARC economies. There is a U-shaped affiliation amongst urban population and CO\textsubscript{2} emanations. As urban population increases, CO\textsubscript{2} emanations initially decreases and then increases with urbanisation. Prior studies observed the connections between urban development, energy usage and Carbon emissions in developed, developing and low-developed economies.

A few preferred studies were mentioned in this report. In addition, a few papers addressed the dissimilar directions in Asian countries for economic degradation. In addition, not one of the prior studies visibly discovered the correlation between urban development, fossil fuels energy usage, GDP, FDI and carbon emissions and the overall effect on CO\textsubscript{2} emissions in Asia's emerging economies.

Keeping all these dynamics into review, this study empirically endeavors to discover the association between GDP, urbanization, fossil fuels energy consumption, FDI, and carbon emissions in emerging economies of Asia. Moreover, these economies have been taken into consideration, because these emerging economies of Asia have a few collective features such as growing population, enormous energy consumption, rising urban development and industrialization in the 1990s. By means of this, the existing investigation anticipates to cover the accessible gap in literature. Moreover, this empirical study efforts to inspect, whether rate of urban development, energy usage, GDP, FDI make easy to CO\textsubscript{2} emissions and environmental degradation in emerging economies of Asia.

3. Methodology and Data Description
Present study discussed the impact of economic growth, Urbanization, fossil fuel consumption, FDI on environmental dilapidation in the Asian developing economies. Panel data has been taken from the “World Bank Development Indicators 2018”. This study has assimilated yearly panel data for the period from 1990 to 2018. Data is collected from 11 emerging Asian economies (Bangladesh, Indonesia, China, India, Turkey, Malaysia, Philippines, Pakistan, Nepal, Thailand, Sri Lanka and time period is taken from 1990 to 2018).

3.1 Description of the Variables
3.1.1. Carbon Emissions (CO\textsubscript{2})
Log of CO\textsubscript{2} emissions per capita per metric ton is used as dependent variable. The supposition is that economic progress donates to carbon emanations/emissions and also scrutinize Environmental Kuznet Curve (EKC) relationship. According to the theory, economic growth donates to CO\textsubscript{2} emissions/emissions and these CO\textsubscript{2} emissions/emissions follow reversed U-shaped (EKC) relationships. In preceding studies Shahbaz et al. (2013); Hanif (2018); Sabori (2013) had been used these variables in their studies.

3.1.2. Economic Growth (GDP)
Economic growth is enumerated by taking the log of yearly per capital GDP rate. Shahbaz et al. (2013), Hanif (2017) and Ahmed and Doe (2017) have also used economic growth as Regressor or independent variable. One of the supposition of this study is that real GDP per capita growth contributes to CO\textsubscript{2} secretions.

3.1.3. Economic Growth Squared (GDP\textsuperscript{2})
Log of Square of the real GDP is used to measure the EKC hypothesis. Shahbaz et al. (2013); Ahmed and Long (2012); EKC has also constructed a square of GDP in their model to check the hypothesis. The evidence of the study is that the suqared of GDP per capita is negatively correlated with carbon emissions.

3.1.4. Fossil fuels usage (FFU)
Fossil fuels usage are recorded as annual energy consumption. Hanif (2019); Ahmad and Du (2017); and Lau et al. (2014) used fossil fuel to inspect the properties of usage of energy on CO\textsubscript{2} emanations. The use of fossil fuel energy is speculated to upsurge carbon emissions/emanations.
3.1.5. Foreign Direct Investment (FDI)
Foreign direct investment net income (BoP, current US dollars) is being used to assess its impact on CO₂ emissions. Then it is converted into real terms by dividing with GDP deflator according to the previous research by Lau et al. (2014); Cole (2004); and Zarsky, (1999). In previous studies, there are both positive and negative effects of FDI on CO₂ emissions. In some studies FDI indicates a lessening in CO₂ emissions and proves the halo effect hypothesis.

3.1.6. Urbanization (URP)
In this study researcher has used log of urban population as percentge of total population to measure the impression on carbon emissions. This is also used in the prior studies of Ahmed and Du (2017) and Hanif and Santos (2017). It is estimated that increasing population escalate carbon emanations.

3.2 Model Specification
To scrutinize the effect of fossil fuel consumption, economic growth, FDI and urbanization on CO₂ emanations/environmental degradation. The current study exercises the EKC hypothesis which is based on Kuznets’(1995) hypothesis. Kuznets initially found inverted U-shaped relation among CO₂ emanations and economic growth. While the same impression is used to validate the association between economic growth and the environment, the expression "environmental Kuznets curve" was designed. By “EKC” hypothesis, Economic growth firstly increases CO₂ emanations, but in future, instead of gaining a sure turning point, it increases economic growth and reduces CO₂ emanations.

The econometric form of the model is based on prior studies by Hanif and Santos (2017 a) and Shabbaz et al. (2012) can be described as follows:

\[ CO_2 = f \left( GDP, GDP^2, \emptyset \right) \]  \hspace{1cm} (1)

Equation (1) \emptyset expresses an unknown factor (such as FDI, urban population and fossil fuel energy consumption) and their probable impact on carbon emissions and equation becomes:

\[ CO_2 = f \left( GDP, GDP^2, URP, FFU, FDI \right) \] \hspace{1cm} (2)

CO₂ = CO₂ emanations/emissions per capita
GDP = Gross Domestic Product Per capita
GDP2 = Squared of Gross Domestic Production
URP = Urban population to the percentage of total population in millions
FFU = Annual consumption of fossil fuels (kg of oil equivalent per capita)

FDI = Foreign Direct Investment (BoP, current US$)/ GDP deflator/total population

The econometric model to assess the results can be transcribed as:

\[ CO_{2it} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 GDP_{it} + \beta_2 GDP^2_{it} + \beta_3 URP_{it} + \beta_4 FFU_{it} + \beta_5 FDI_{it} + \beta_6 URP_{it} + \epsilon_{it} \]  \hspace{1cm} (3)

To estimate the results and the extended form of the EKC hypothesis can be printed as:

\[ \ln CO_{2it} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 \ln GDP_{it} + \beta_2 \ln GDP^2_{it} + \beta_3 \ln URP_{it} + \beta_4 \ln FDI_{it} + \beta_5 \ln FFU_{it} + \beta_6 \ln URP_{it} + \epsilon_{it} \]  \hspace{1cm} (4)

Here \( t \) represents time when \( t \) represent the country. The lower case letters symbolize variable logarithmic changes. In addition, the individual error term is used in Equation (4) \( \epsilon_{it} \) and it implies that errors are distributed identically (i.i.d.). The individual errors or time fluctuating errors.

In Equation (4), logit model is used as it is assumed that GDP Per capita and CO2 excretions will not have a relationship that is linear but may have a relationship that is exponential. In addition, to lessen the issue of multicollinearity the researcher used log transformation. Natural logs are used to examine the effects of independent variables on environmental degradation (carbon emissions). Equation (4) presents a long-term association between regressing and regressing variables. In order to use the PMG/ARDL model, it is necessary to add short-term dynamics to the long-term equation (4); this is given as an equation (5).
\[ \Delta \ln CO_{2it} = \theta_0 + \sum_{j=1}^{k} \theta_{1j} \Delta \ln CO_{2t-1} + \sum_{j=0}^{k} \theta_{2j} \Delta \ln GDP t-t+1 + \sum_{j=0}^{k} \theta_{3j} \Delta \ln GDP^2 t-t+1 + \sum_{j=0}^{k} \theta_{4j} \Delta \ln FFU_{it-1} + \sum_{j=0}^{k} \theta_{5j} \Delta \ln FDI_{it-1} \\
+ \sum_{j=0}^{k} \theta_{6j} \Delta \ln URP_{t-t} + \beta_1 \Delta \ln CO_{2it-1} + \beta_2 \Delta \ln GDP_{it-1} + \beta_3 \Delta \ln GDP^2_{it-1} + \beta_4 \Delta \ln FFU_{it-1} + \beta_5 \Delta \ln FDI_{it-1} \\
+ \beta_6 \Delta \ln URP_{it-1} + \epsilon_{it} \] \tag{5}

In equation (5), \( \Delta \) shows the first difference operator, \( \beta \)s embodies the long run coefficient, \( \theta \)s present the short term coefficient, and \( \epsilon \)it shows for the commonly distributed error with mean zero. Moreover, in order to prevent long-term co-integration, there is null hypothesis of no co-integration among the variables. The alternative hypothesis on the other hand is that there exist a co-intergration amongst the variables.

Pedroni test is used to examine the the null hypothesis, F-statistics of test are observed to inspect the association of dependence and the mutual alliance between the independent variables and the analyzed variables. Compare statistical comparisons with key values formed by Pesaran et al. (2001). Once the long-term association is documented, then a random error correction procedure is devised here, which adds speed to the adjustment or model to add speed to the short-term to long-term transition.

\[ \Delta \ln CO_{2it} = \beta_0 + \sum_{i=1}^{n} \alpha_{1i} \Delta \ln CO_{it-1} + \sum_{i=1}^{n} \gamma_{2i} \Delta \ln GDP_{it-1} + \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sigma_{3i} \Delta \ln GDP^2_{it-1} + \sum_{i=1}^{n} \theta_{4i} \Delta \ln FFU_{it-1} + \sum_{i=1}^{n} \tau_{5i} \Delta \ln FDI_{it-1} \\
+ \sum_{i=1}^{n} \omega_{6i} \Delta \ln URP_{it-1} + \beta_1 \Delta \ln GDP_{it} + \beta_2 \Delta \ln GDP^2_{it} + \beta_3 \Delta \ln FFU_{it} + \beta_4 \Delta \ln FDI_{it} + \beta_5 \Delta \ln P + \delta E_{it-1} + U_{it} \]

Here, \( \delta \) regulate the coefficient of the ECT and to confirm the co-integration association. The value of ECT is predicted negative sign and also statistically significant.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables and data source description</th>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Proxies</th>
<th>Descriptions</th>
<th>Sources of data</th>
<th>Ranges of data</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Environmental degradation</td>
<td>CO2</td>
<td>Carbon Dioxide</td>
<td>WDI &amp; World Development Atlas</td>
<td>1990 – 2018</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic Growth</td>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross Domestic Product</td>
<td>World Development Indicator</td>
<td>1990 – 2018</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Investment</td>
<td>FDI</td>
<td>Foreign Direct Investment</td>
<td>World Development Indicator</td>
<td>1990 – 2018</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy consumption</td>
<td>FFU</td>
<td>Fossil Fuels</td>
<td>WDI &amp; Global Energy Statistical Book</td>
<td>1990 – 2018</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technology</td>
<td>UP</td>
<td>Urbanization</td>
<td>World Development Indicator</td>
<td>1990 – 2018</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All variables data are taken from World Development Indicators, World Development Atlas and Global Energy statistical book year 2019. All variables are used in log form.

4. Analysis of Results

4.1 Summary Statistics

The researcher reported the Summary statistics of all the variables in table 1. Fossil fuels energy consumption (FFU), FDI and urban population (URP) are weakly associated with the CO2 emissions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1 Summary Statistics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CO2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maximum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minimum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Std. Dev.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: author’s own calculation

4.2. Testing of Multicollinearity

In this estimation correlation method is applied to check the issue of multicollinearity. The outcomes of the correlation coefficients demonstrate the correlation amongst the variables. The outcomes indicate that fossil fuels energy usage (FFU), FDI, GDP per capita (GDP) and urban population (URP) are inadequately connected with the dependent variable “CO2 emissions”.

1486
Table 2: Correlation Matrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>LCO₂</th>
<th>LFFU</th>
<th>LFDI</th>
<th>LGDP</th>
<th>LURP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LCO₂</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LFFU</td>
<td>0.81</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LFDI</td>
<td>0.81</td>
<td>0.63</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LGDP</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td>0.61</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LURP</td>
<td>0.83</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td>0.62</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Noted: author’s own calculation.

The values of (VIF) is shown in Table 3 below. The value of the VIF fluctuates from 1.592 to 3.840, which means that there is no matter of multicollinearity in the evaluated model.

Table 3: Variance Inflation Factor (VIF)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>LCO₂</th>
<th>LFFU</th>
<th>LFDI</th>
<th>LGDP</th>
<th>LURP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LCO₂</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LFFU</td>
<td>2.915</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LFDI</td>
<td>1.468</td>
<td>1.201</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LGDP</td>
<td>1.102</td>
<td>1.064</td>
<td>1.093</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LURP</td>
<td>1.024</td>
<td>1.091</td>
<td>1.717</td>
<td>1.124</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.3. Testing for Stationarity
To evaluate the reliability of the results and to avoid the spurious results, the researcher applied the unit root tests for stationary status of the variables in the panel data series, because non-stationary variables produce ambiguous results. The results are elaborate in Table 4.

Table 4: Summary of Panel Unit Root

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Levin-Lin-Chu test</th>
<th>IPS-W test</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>At Level</td>
<td>At Difference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LCO₂</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stats</td>
<td>-1.54</td>
<td>-5.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P-value</td>
<td>0.064</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LFFU</td>
<td>-0.59</td>
<td>-3.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stats</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P-value</td>
<td>-3.46</td>
<td>-3.59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LFDI</td>
<td>-5.80</td>
<td>-9.45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stats</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P-value</td>
<td>-9.45</td>
<td>-5.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LGDP</td>
<td>1.72</td>
<td>-4.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stats</td>
<td>0.957</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P-value</td>
<td>-4.84</td>
<td>-5.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LGDP²</td>
<td>2.41</td>
<td>-3.37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stats</td>
<td>0.992</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P-value</td>
<td>-3.37</td>
<td>-4.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LURP</td>
<td>-4.14</td>
<td>0.97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stats</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
<td>0.8350</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P-value</td>
<td>0.97</td>
<td>0.8350</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Order</td>
<td>I(1)</td>
<td>I(0)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: author’s own calculation

In table 4 the outcomes show that the CO₂ emission, GDP and GDP² are stationary at first difference and co-integration order is I(1), while fossil fuels consumption FFU, FDI and URP variables are stationary at level and co-integration order is I(0). Therefore, it can be recognized that the variables have mixed order of integration; thus, for co-integration testing Pedroni co-integration test is used. Co-integration method is appropriate for large data set. In small sample data set, result may display excessive unpredictability. In distinction, the ARDL bound test righteous belongings for small sample data (Saboori & Sulaiman, 2013; Zhang & Gao, 2016). PMG/ARDL model is used to estimate the impact of FDI, GDP, URP and FFU on CO₂ emissions in the selected emerging Asian economies.

4.4. Testing of Panel Dependence
A lot of tests are provided in the prior work to learn about cross-sectional dependence on panel results, and the most widely used tests are Baltagi Feng, pacers (2004 A, B), Scaled LM (2004), Breusch and Pagan (1980) and Kao Bias based scaled LM (2012) are incorporated in different studies. The aforementioned assessment outcomes are listed in Table 5. Complete findings are reported in the table below did not support cross-sectional dependency, suggesting that the first generation panel root test is
more suitable for implementation.

### Table 5

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Test</th>
<th>Statistics</th>
<th>P. value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Breusch Pagan LM</td>
<td>41.76</td>
<td>0.9050</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pesaran CD test</td>
<td>1.63</td>
<td>0.1020</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### 4.5 Testing for Heteroscedasticity

To test heteroscedasticity of the model, we used Breush- Pagan test. The outcomes are following.

### Table 6: Results for Heteroscedasticity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Joint-chi² test</th>
<th>F-statistics</th>
<th>P-Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.6488</td>
<td>-0.429</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### 4.6 Testing for Serial Correlation

The serial correlation is verified using Langrangian Multiplier Test. Here it is considered null hypothesis that there is no serial correlation in model. The results are reported in table 7. The result shows acceptance of the serial correlation in the model by null assumption.

### Table 7: Results for Serial Correlation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Prob. &gt; chi² test</th>
<th>F-statistics</th>
<th>P-Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.22</td>
<td>0.292</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### 4.7 Functional Form

The functional form specification is verified using Joint-Jarque Bera test. The null hypothesis is considered that there is no misspecification in functional form of the model. The results are reported in table 8. The result shows acceptance of the serial correlation in the model by null assumption.

### Table 8: Results for Functional Form

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Prob. &gt; chi² test</th>
<th>F-statistics</th>
<th>P-Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.52</td>
<td>0.824</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### 4.8 Pedroni Co-Integration Testing

The Pedroni-test is being used to underpin the co-integration of GDP, GDP² fossil fuels energy usage (FFU), urbanization (URP), FDI and CO2 emissions. The results of this test are described in Table 9. Here, the outcomes of the test validates a co-integration association of dependent and independent variables. Moreover, Kao test also validate the co-integration relationship. The null hypothesis is considered that there is no co-integration exist in the model.

### Table 9: Results of Pedroni Co-integration Test

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Testing for presence of association amongst the variables in the model</th>
<th>Test- Statistics</th>
<th>t-statistic</th>
<th>P-Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Panel v-statistic</td>
<td>-1.929</td>
<td>(0.976)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Panel rho-statistic</td>
<td>1.509</td>
<td>(0.934)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Panel PP-statistic</td>
<td>-3.115***</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Panel ADF-statistic</td>
<td>-1.391*</td>
<td>(0.082)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group rho-statistic</td>
<td>2.533</td>
<td>(0.994)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group PP-statistic</td>
<td>-4.044***</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group ADF-statistic</td>
<td>-1.5055 **</td>
<td>(0.066)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5. Discussion

5.1. Co-integration Analysis in the Long-Run

PMG/ARDL model is used to study long-term connection among dependent Variable CO2 emissions and independent variables GDP, square of GDP, fossil fuels energy usage, urbanization URP and FDI. The results of the PMG/ARDL estimates are listed in Table 10.

Table 10: Estimation of Panel PMG/ARDL Approach

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Regressors</th>
<th>Coefficient</th>
<th>Standard Error</th>
<th>t-Statistic</th>
<th>P-values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LFFU</td>
<td>0.940***</td>
<td>0.145</td>
<td>6.456</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LFDI</td>
<td>0.036***</td>
<td>0.006</td>
<td>5.536</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LGDP</td>
<td>4.412***</td>
<td>0.948</td>
<td>4.650</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LGDP2</td>
<td>-0.697***</td>
<td>0.161</td>
<td>-4.323</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LURP</td>
<td>1.315***</td>
<td>0.231</td>
<td>5.682</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: ***, ** and *** represents the significance level at 1%, 5% and 10%, respectively

Results in the long-run of PMG model show that GDP significantly increases CO2 emissions/emanations. As increase in GDP give rise CO2 emissions also. More specifically, in the long run, every one percent increase in GDP increases CO2 emissions by around 4.412 per cent. These result shows that GDP in emerging Asian countries arises at the expense of increasing CO2 emissions. These results are consistent with Ziaei (2015); Kais and Sami (2016); Hanif (2017).

The present study also shows that square of GDP is negatively correlated with CO2 emissions, showing that every one percent increase in squred GDP decreases CO2 emissions by around 0.697 percent. These experimental results confirm the inverted U-shaped association between squred GDP and CO2 emissions in developing Asian countries. The results confirmed the presence of EKC and showed that increasing GDP increase CO2 emissions, and that further increases in GDP after a certain level reduce CO2 emissions (Esso and Keho, 2016; Hanif, 2018).

It results also shows that the use of fossil fuel energy in developing Asian economies also boost CO2 emissions, and stated as every one percent rise in use fossil fuels energy will increase the CO2 emissions by 0.940 percent, if all other factors held constant. So, use of fossil fuels energy is indeed rising CO2 emissions and is playing a important role in environmental degradation in emerging Asian countries, and this has led to the adoption of the Sadorsky (2014) and Heidari et al. (2015). In developing countries, use of fossil fuels energy is used to accelerate GDP and meet growing energy needs.

As such, energy use is certainly increasing CO2 emissions and is playing a substantial role in environmental degradation in emerging Asian countries, approving the results of the Shrestha et al. (2009); Wolde-Rufael and Menyah (2010); Sadorsky (2014); Heidari et al. (2015). These practical results are not inconsistent, because in developing Asian countries, use of fossil fuels energy is used to accelerate GDP. Like many other developing regions, Asian rising economies are plaster economic competitors and are constantly struggling to restore the living standards of their inhabitants. Moreover, the use of fossil fuels energy increases CO2 emissions is higher in emerging Asian countries due to less efficient oil-based techniques: these economies use less of fossil fuels energy while producing less, reduce their environmental degradation and improve health issues in the region.

FDI has a significant and positive impact on CO2 emissions in selected Asian countries in the estimation of present study. It has shown that if all other factors remain constant, an increase of one per cent in FDI will increase CO2 emissions by an average of 0.036 per cent. It has shown that FDI is a key
source of high CO2 emissions in selected Asian countries. Although we believe that FDI play a significant impact on income and job creation in Asian countries, this assistance can be compensated for in terms of the negative externalities of foreigners and the fitness of their residents. This result therefore identifies the need for emerging Asian countries to adopt the urbanization if all other factors remain constant. Since when the urban population grows, it increases industrialization, which in turn increases the CO2 emissions and economic downturn of Asian economies. This result is in line with the results of Rafiq et al. (2016), Hanif and Gago-de-Santos (2017).

5.2. Co-integration Analysis in Short-run Relationship:
PMG/ARDL model is employed to study the association of energy used, GDP and FDI with CO2 emissions in the short-run. The results are in table 11.

Table:11 Estimates of Panel PMG/ARDL Approach in the Short Run

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Regressors</th>
<th>Coefficient</th>
<th>Standard Error</th>
<th>t-Statistic</th>
<th>P-values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>dlog CO2(-1)</td>
<td>0.977***</td>
<td>0.011</td>
<td>85.924</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dlog FFU</td>
<td>0.712***</td>
<td>0.142</td>
<td>5.013</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dlog FFU(-1)</td>
<td>-0.715</td>
<td>0.135</td>
<td>-5.274</td>
<td>0.220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dlog FDI</td>
<td>-0.007</td>
<td>0.006</td>
<td>-1.216</td>
<td>0.225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dlog FDI(-1)</td>
<td>0.006</td>
<td>0.005</td>
<td>1.140</td>
<td>0.225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dlog GDP</td>
<td>-0.084</td>
<td>1.208</td>
<td>-0.070</td>
<td>0.944</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dlog GDP(-1)</td>
<td>0.128</td>
<td>1.213</td>
<td>0.106</td>
<td>0.914</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dlog GDP2</td>
<td>0.115</td>
<td>0.169</td>
<td>0.680</td>
<td>0.496</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dlog GDP2(-1)</td>
<td>-0.119</td>
<td>0.171</td>
<td>-0.697</td>
<td>0.486</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dlog URP</td>
<td>0.749*</td>
<td>0.428</td>
<td>1.751</td>
<td>0.081</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dlog URP(-1)</td>
<td>-0.748*</td>
<td>0.426</td>
<td>-1.755</td>
<td>0.080</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>-0.103</td>
<td>0.186</td>
<td>-0.556</td>
<td>0.578</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: ***, ** and * represents the significance level at 1%, 5% and 10%, respectively.

In table 11, 0.977 percent of CO2 emissions in a specific time period is accompanying with a 1% increase in CO2 emissions in the past. Furthermore, in the short term, use of fossil fuels (FFU) energy and urbanization (URP) has a statistically significant impact on CO2 emissions. results show that if every one percent increase in FFU helps to emit 0.712 percent of CO2 in the short term, if all other factors remain constant. One percent increase in urbanization will increase the CO2 emissions 0.749 percent. More over, GDP and FDI do not play a significant role in lowering CO2 emissions in the short run.

Table: 12 Panel Error Correction Model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Regressors</th>
<th>Coefficient</th>
<th>Standard Error</th>
<th>t-Statistic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Δlog FFU</td>
<td>0.920885</td>
<td>0.521635</td>
<td>1.765384</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Δlog FDI</td>
<td>-0.004874</td>
<td>0.006874</td>
<td>-0.709031</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Δlog GDP</td>
<td>8.164744</td>
<td>14.22678</td>
<td>0.57390</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Δlog GDP2</td>
<td>-1.346438</td>
<td>2.272279</td>
<td>-0.59255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Δlog URP</td>
<td>12.21799</td>
<td>8.780549</td>
<td>1.391484</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$E_{t-1}$</td>
<td>-0.3031***</td>
<td>0.1330</td>
<td>-2.27816</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: ***, ** and * represents the significance level at 1%, 5% and 10%, respectively. Here Δ is a first difference operator.

Finally, the outcomes of the error correction demonstrate that the term error correction (ECT-1) is statistically significant and negative. The consequence of the lagged error correction term authorizes the long-term association of fossil fuels energy used, economic growth, urbanization and FDI with carbon
emissions. In addition, the negative sign of the term error correction indicates the estimated balance of the model, and 30.3% of the error will be corrected from the short to the long term each year. The coefficient value of ECM (-1) is 0.303 which is negative and significant. It means if there is any shock in the data of the model, the model has the power to restore the equilibrium level in approximately 3.30 year.

The formula of speed of adjustment is given below:

\[ \text{speed of adjustment} = \frac{1}{\text{the coefficient of ECM}} \]

\[ \text{speed of adjustment} = \frac{1}{0.303} \]

\[ \text{speed of adjustment} = 3.30 \text{ year} \]

5.3. Turning point of EKC

This study also prove the inverted-U shaped Environmental Kuzett Curve (EKC). In this study the researcher also calculate the turning point of EKC which is in the data range.

\[ = \text{Antilog of} \left( -0.5 \times \frac{\text{coefficient attaching with GDP}}{\text{Coefficient attached with the quadratic term of GDP}} \right) \]

\[ = \text{Antilog of} \left( -0.5 \times \frac{4.412}{-0.697} \right) \]

\[ = \text{Antilog}(3.165) \]

\[ \text{Turning Point} = 1462.177 \]

5.4. Stability Test

To check the steadiness of the model, cumulative sum of recursive residuals and square cumulative sum of the recursive residual have calculated.

The CUSUM and square CUSUM are represented graphically in the upper and lower key boundaries of the 5 percent of level of significance. Therefore, both the graphs support the stability of the calculated model.
6. Conclusion
This research has reinforced the suggestions that economic growth, fossil fuels energy ingestion, urbanization and (FDI) foreign direct investment validate the production of carbon emissions in rising economies of Asia. However the influence of population growth (urbanization) on carbon productions is also create an optimistic impact, this has not verified significant results in the short-run. The technique of the analysis has emphasized the long-run and short-run impacts. The main findings of the study are:
Increase in GDP give rise CO$_2$ emissions also. These results are consistent with Ziaei (2015); Kais and Sami (2016); Hanif (2017). The results also shows that square of GDP is negatively correlated with CO$_2$ emissions. The results confirmed the presence of EKC and showed that increasing GDP increase CO$_2$ emissions, and that further increases in GDP after a certain level reduce CO$_2$ emissions (Esso and Keho, 2016; Hanif, 2018).

It results also shows that the use of fossil fuel energy in developing Asian economies also boost CO$_2$ emissions, use of fossil fuels energy is indeed rising CO$_2$ emissions and is playing a important role in environmental degradation in emerging Asian countries, and this has led to the adoption of the Sadorsky (2014) and Heidari et al. (2015). In developing countries, use of fossil fuels energy is used to accelerate GDP and meet growing energy needs. Approving the results of the Shrestha et al. (2009); Wolde-Rufael and Menyah (2010); Sadorsky (2014); Heidari et al. (2015). FDI has a significant and positive impact on CO$_2$ emissions in selected Asian countries in the estimation of present study. This result therefore identifies the need for emerging Asian countries to adopt the undesirable environmental characteristics of FDI. Otherwise, environmental degradation could set the stage for the end of the economic depression and could make previous growth unsustainable (Henderson and Millimet, 2007; He, 2006). When the urban population grows, it increases industrialization, which in turn increases the CO$_2$ emissions and economic downturn of Asian economies. This result is in line with the results of Rafiq et al. (2016), Hanif and Gago-de-Santos (2017).

7. Limitations
The latest data of other environmental gases and impact of other source of Energy can be estimated. These results are estimated with just PMG/ARDL techniques. This study considers just eleven emerging Economies.

8. Suggestion
Future research can be extended by applying latest year data of carbon emission and other greenhouse gases and energy sources can be disaggregated and impact on human beings. The estimation can be made by using latest econometrics techniques such as DOLS or FMOLS. The results can be made on region wise and different Economies.
Reference


Smurti and Dash (2017). The effect of urbanization, energy consumption, and foreign direct investment
on the carbon dioxide emission in the SSEA (South and Southeast Asian) region. Renew Energy 70 (2017), 96–106.


Relationship between Time Management Behavior and Academic Performance of University Students

Abdur Rashid, Ilyas Sharif, Shakeel Khan, Fazal Malik

1Lecturer, Department of Education, Shaheed Benazir Bhutto University, Sheringal Dir Upper, Pakistan
2Lecturer, Quaid-e-Azam College of Commerce, University of Peshawar, Pakistan, ilyasqacc@uop.edu.pk
3Lecturer Institute of Management Studies, University of Peshawar, Pakistan
4PhD Scholar, Management Science, Qurtuba University of Science and Technology, Peshawar, Pakistan

ARTICLE DETAILS

History
Revised format: November 2020
Available Online: December 2020

Keywords
Time Management Behaviour, Under Graduate Students, Public Sector Universities, CGPA

JEL Classification
M0, M1

ABSTRACT

Effective time management leads to greater academic performance and reduces stress, strain and anxiety among students, however, students facing difficulties to keep a balance between their academic life and personal-social life. This study aims to examine the self-perceptions of undergraduate students’ time management behaviour by using Time Management Behaviour Scale (TMBS) developed by Macan, Shahani, Dipboye and Phillips (1990). The scale consisted of 34 rating items ranges from very often true to seldom true. The population of the study consisted of all undergraduate students studying in the academic session 2018-19 at public sector general category universities in Malakand division. By using stratified sampling technique a sample of 1050 undergraduate students were selected from the sampled universities. Students were also asked to provide their CGPA in their previous semester. Both descriptive and inferential statistics were used to analyze the data. It was found that prospective teachers have moderate to high level of time management skills. Significant relationship was found between undergraduate students’ time management behaviour and academic performance. It was recommended that university administration should orient students to enhance their time management behaviour by arranging seminars, workshops and conferences to enhance their time management skills.

© 2020 Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: ilyasqacc@uop.edu.pk


1. Introduction
Balduf (2009) recognized that poor time management leads to academic underachievement while Britton and Tesser (1991) mentioned as good time management guarantees higher academic achievement of college students. Further, they found that 67% undergraduate students perceived time management as their most crucial problem. Moreover, they found that self-reported time management predicts academic achievement and particularly short-range planning predict grade point average of college students. George, Dixon, Stansal, Gelb and Pheri (2008) recognized that good time management skills may be proved as key to academic success. They found that time management is a significant predictor of academic achievement. In addition, they found that time management is the sole predictor of university students CGPA and also related to academic and personal success. Similarly, Misra and McKean (2000) stated that strategies adopted by students aimed to improve their effective utilization of time are recommended as support to increase academic achievement. They also found a negative correlation between time management and academic stress. Rabin, Fogel and Nutter-Upham (2011) found that 30% to 60% undergraduate university students regularly post pone their academic tasks. Similarly, Seo (2012) mentioned that undergraduate university students usually cram and “pulling and nighters” before an academic task. Hess, Sherman and Goodman (2000) mentioned that procrastination is also predictor of academic achievement.

Time is one of the precious resources that higher education intuitions students must possess. The way through which individuals manage their time may influence their academic performance (Claessens, Van Eerde, Rutte, & Roe, 2004). Effective time management leads to greater academic performance and reduces stress, strain and anxiety among students, however, students facing difficulties to keep a balance between their academic life and personal-social life (Adams & Blair 2019). The way through which students manage their time may influence their academic achievement, personal and social life and future or employment life (Macan et al., 1990; Britton & Tesser, 1991; Kearns & Gardiner, 2007). Thus it is very essential for the students to allocate and manage their time and meet the deadlines (Al Khatib, 2014).

Some universities in the world offer time management training programmes for their students during their studies (Covic, Adamson, Lincoln, & Kench, 2003). The main purpose of such initiatives is to improve their learning and grades. Grades or marks in the universities depend on the completion of different varieties of tasks. These tasks may be completed in a given time framework or deadline, including the length or period of the task and priorities of the task. Grades or marks are given to the students on the basis of completion of these multiple tasks depending on their quality and effort put in by the students. Britton and Tesser (1991) rightly pointed that students’ marks or their grade point average would be expected to be influenced by their time management skills. Thus students need to be conscious to manage their time effectively and efficiently to obtain high grades. Both Macan et al., (1990) and Britton and Tesser (1991) found that students’ time management ability is directly related to their academic performance. Generally, a student with successful and productive time management skill would have better grades and experience less stress related to their academic life. Britton and Tesser (1991) concluded that university students’ time management skills accounted for 36% of the variance with their grade point average. Macan et al., (1990) concluded that college students with more perceived control of time found to be more satisfied than those who haven’t control over time. Macan (1994) claimed that practices like setting goals, scheduling events, making to-do list and preferences for organization enable an individual to gain mastery over how they utilize their time.

The literature shows mixed findings regarding the relationship between students’ time management skills and their academic achievement. Many studies have been conducted in different fields and levels of education including medical, engineering, general college students, business students, school students and university students but no single study has been conducted in the local setting to find out the relationship between undergraduate students’ time management on their academic achievement. To fill this gap in the existing literature, the present study has been sought to seek the answers of the following research questions.

1. What is the time management behaviour level of undergraduate students in public sector universities of Malakand division?
2. What is the extent of relationship between students’ time management behaviour and academic achievement?

2. Research Methodology

The present study was based on quantitative (descriptive survey) research design. Cross-sectional survey design was used to collect data from the respondents. As the study focused on seeking undergraduate students’ time management level level and also finds the relationship between students’ time management behaviour and their academic achievement, therefore, correlational research design was used to analyze the data. Thus it was a cross-sectional survey and analytical in nature (Cohen, Manion, & Morrison, 2007). From scattered population survey is considered the best way to gather information from the respondents in an analytical study because it allows the researcher to find the relationship that exist between variables to be studied (Bryman, 2008; Cohen, Manion, & Morrison, 2013). Therefore, the researchers adopted the above stated method for collection and analysis of data in this study.

The population of the study consisted of all undergraduate students of three public sector universities of Malakand division. The sample of the study consisted of 1200 students through non-proportionate stratified sampling technique. From each university 400 undergraduate students were conveniently selected. A total number of twelve hundred survey packets (questionnaires) were distributed among undergraduate students of three public sector universities in Malakand division. Each survey packet was accompanied by a covering letter inviting participation in the survey, describing purposes of the study and ensuring confidentiality and anonymity for the institution and students. Twelve hundred filled questionnaires were received from the respondents as the researchers personally collected the data from these universities.

This study used Macan et al., (1990) four factors scale which has been widely used by different researchers in different parts of the world to measure students’ perception about time management behaviour. There were many reasons of using this scale as it is an easy, understandable, valid, and reliable and used by dozen of researchers to measure the time management behaviour of the school, college and university students of different fields like medical, engineering, business, petroleum and general students. For convenience of the students the scale was translated into Urdu language, so that students can understand it and would be able to understand the concepts and give exact response. This scale has four factors related to setting goals and priorities, mechanics of scheduling and planning, preference for organization, and perceived control of time. The scale consisted of 35 five points Likert scale ranging from “seldom true” to “very often true”. Out of 34 items 10 items were related to the first factor setting goals and priorities, 11 were related to the second factor mechanics of scheduling and planning, 08 items were related to the third factor preferences for organization and 05 items were related to perceived control of time.

As it was an adopted questionnaire and has been used by different researchers in different fields in different countries of the world. Therefore, it is a valid questionnaire. The questionnaire was first pilot tested on students in a university and responses were found satisfactory. Participants were asked to respond on Five-Point Likert scale ranging from “seldom true” to “very often true” having values of 5, 4, 3, 2, and 1 respectively. The Cronbach alpha value (.83) for the pilot test indicated that the instrument was highly reliable. The reliability values for TMBS were found more than 0.70 thresholds, which show satisfactory level of statistical testing for social sciences (Cohen et al., 2007: 506; Tesfaw, 2014).

3. Data Analysis

The researchers analyzed the collected data by using both descriptive and inferential statistical tests. In descriptive statistics the researchers used mean scores of each dimension and overall scores of students’ time management behaviour; and standard deviation of each dimension and overall scores of students’ time management behaviour were used. As the data was showing normal curve distribution, therefore, the researchers used Pearson’s Product-Moment co-efficient correlation (r) was used as inferential statistics. To interpret the mean scores, the researcher used mean score 3.0 as midpoint mark (Iqbal, 2010; Ghazi, 2004; Nguni, 2005: 125; Hukpati, 2009: 34; Tesfaw, 2014). It was assumed by the
researchers that the item or dimension which has mean score greater than midpoint 3.0 demonstrate the evidence of students’ time management behaviour. Thus the item or dimension having mean score greater than the midpoint (M>3), was interpreted as above average level of observance of time management behaviour. The researchers assumed that the higher the mean score, the greater the observance of time management behaviour.

The researchers also interpreted the value of Pearson product-moment correlation coefficient (r) between students’ time management behaviour scores based on Field’s (2009) interpretation. According to Field’s (2009), the values of r which lies between .10 to .29 was interpreted as weak relationship; the value of r lies between .30 to .49 was interpreted as moderate level; and the value of r lies between .50 to 1.0 was interpreted as high or strong relationship. The researchers fed the collected data into data sheet for analysis in Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) version 22.0.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 01: Sample profile of the participants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Demographic Variables</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frequency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gender</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>≤ 20 Years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt; 20 Years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Current Semester</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2nd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4th</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6th</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8th</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above table represents the sample profile of the undergraduate students. Among the obtained data of 1200 students, 61 were male and 39 were female, which indicates that more male students has participated in the study. Among the sample students, 75.58 were less than or equal to the age of 20 while 24.42 have greater than 21 years old. Thus comparatively more students have participated in the study were of less than 20 years old. Out of 1200 students, 25.08% students of second semester; 33.66% students of fourth semester; 25.58% students of sixth semester and 15.66% students of eighth semester students have participated in the study. The number of fourth semester students was found higher than that of second, sixth, and eighth semester’s students respectively, who participated in the study.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 02: Time management behaviour level of undergraduate students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TMBS Constructs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Setting goals and priorities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mechanics of scheduling and planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preference for organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceived control of time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall TMBS</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above table shows the mean and standard deviation scores of the different dimensions of students’ time management behaviour. Perceptions of undergraduate students regarding “perceived control of time” were observed to have the maximum mean value (2.81) which shows that this dimension has the maximum level of observance among the four dimensions of time management behaviour. On the other hand “setting goals and priorities” was observed to have the minimum mean score (2.76) which shows the lowest level of observance among the four dimensions of time management behaviour. As the mean scores for different dimensions of time management behaviour was found less than the midpoint 3.0, therefore, undergraduate students’ time management behaviour level have below average level of observance.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 03: Relationship between TMBS constructs and Academic Performance of Students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Variables</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Setting Goals and Priorities</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The above table revealed the correlation matrix among different dimensions of TMBS and also the relationship of each dimension with students’ academic performance. The values of co-efficient of correlation among different dimensions of TMBS were ranging from weak to strong relationship. The relationship between all dimensions of TMBS and students’ academic performance were found statistically positive weak significant at the .05 level of significance. It shows that with the increase in time management behaviour of students accompanies with the increase in academic performance. In other words, the higher the level of students’ time management behaviour the greater the academic achievement of the students.

4. Discussion
The present study found that the undergraduate students of universities have below average level of time management behaviour. The mean scores for different dimensions of the time management behaviour showed that undergraduate students have below average level of tendencies towards setting goals and priorities, mechanics of time management, preference for organization and perceived control of time. The mean score for perceived control of time was found to be greater than that of the other time management behaviour dimensions while setting goals and priorities has minimum level of observance among the four dimensions of the time management behaviour scale. This implies that undergraduate students were generally more conscious about their time use. They tried their best to complete the task within the allotted period of time. They tried to follow the schedule and do not waste time in unimportant tasks. They felt difficulty in setting goals and priorities tasks; they can’t plan and manage their time for short and long term goals. Similarly, they felt difficulty in making to-do list and cannot priorities the tasks on urgency basis. As a result they failed to have good academic scores. These results have been testified by many researchers who found that students would like to be organized but fail to have any strategies to help themselves (Kelly, 2002; Adams & Blair, 2019). The mean scores of the different dimensions of time management behaviour scale showed that undergraduate students have trouble with SGP, MTM, PFO and PCOT. Strategies like keeping a log of activities, keeping an appointment book, reviewing daily activities, making to-do list will help the students to plan and keep them on track to feel more in control of their time and more able to estimate the needed time to accomplish tasks (Adams & Blair, 2019; Pozdeeva, 2019).

The study also finds positive weak significant relationship between different dimensions of time management behaviour scale and students’ academic achievement. This implies that students having
good time management behaviour tend to have better grades. On the other hand, students have poor time management behaviour will have low grades. The literature shows mixed findings regarding the relationship between time management and academic performance. Some researchers found direct relationship between students’ time management skills and academic achievement while other has regretted the positive relationships between these two constructs. The findings of the study have been testified by many other researchers who found that time management was positively related with students academic performance (Adams & Blair, 2019; Kears & Gardiner, 2007; Macan et al., 1990; McKenzie & Gow, 2004; Trueman & Hartley). Thus, it is evident that these times management behaviour i.e. SGP, MTM, PFO and PCOT lead to an improvement in academic performance of the students. Students having greater academic performance are better at managing their space and time.

5. Conclusions
Based on the findings, this study concludes that undergraduate students have below average level of time management behaviour level. Universities students find it difficult to set goals and priorities; schedule their time for different tasks; have well-organized workplace; make to-do list; feeling in control of time; being procrastinated and not able to estimate the needed time to accomplish tasks. The study also confirmed that students’ time management behaviour significantly positively correlated with their academic performance. Students having better time management behaviour tend to have higher grade point average.

6. Recommendations
The researchers have recommended that it is the joint responsibility of the teachers, administration and policy makers to provide students an overview of the main strategies to develop enhance the time management skills of students particularly the first year students when they newly enter in a higher education setting and know less about the academic matters. The university students must study the books related to time management which may lead them to better understanding of the concept of time management strategies which may be useful to utilize their time more productively. It is suggested that university administrators must arrange seminars and workshops for students on practical tips on how to manage time for different activities in order to reduce mental stress and enhance academic performance.

References


*Journal of Educational Psychology, 83*(3), 405-410.


Determinants of Customer Perception About Adoption of Islamic Insurance (Takaful) in Pakistan

1Areeba Khan, 2Hafiz Abdur Rashid, 3Rana Muhammad Shahid Yaqub, 4Saba Abbas
1IBMAS, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Pakistan, Areeba.khan@iub.edu.pk
2Assistant Professor, Hailey College of Commerce, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan, ha.rashid.hcc@gmail.com
3IBMAS, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Pakistan, Shahid.yaqub@iub.edu.pk
4Sabaabbasiub@gmail.com

ARTICLE DETAILS

History
Revised format: November 2020
Available Online: December 2020

Keywords
Takaful; Islamic Insurance; PLS Smart; Customer perception, Adoption, Social Influence

JEL Classification
M10, M14

ABSTRACT

The purpose of this study is to assess the response level of individuals concerning Islamic Insurance in Pakistan and to measure its outreach and most pertinent factors affecting customer selection of Islamic Insurance. It also seeks to make informed recommendations on empowering frameworks for the establishment of Takaful insurance through relevant marketing campaigns in Pakistan. The impact of factors like Customer Awareness, Consumer Satisfaction, Risk Perception, Compatibility and Religiosity was checked on Adoption of Islamic Insurance in Pakistan, with the presence of Social Influence as a mediating variable. Data were collected through questionnaire administered to 300 respondents, representing the Muslim community from urban as well as rural areas, of Pakistan. Partial least square-structural equation modeling (PLS-SEM) through Smart PLS3 was used to examine the relationships among pertinent factors in this study. The findings suggest that most respondents are either not aware of Takaful as an insurance and investment option, or do not understand the concept altogether. This study suggests that Islamic insurance organizations should focus on awareness campaigns as an essential marketing strategy and dedicated resources to reach prime customer segments in general and fulfil the need to inform people about their products and services through clear understanding of principles of Shariah compliance. The findings of this research have important implications for Takaful companies as well as regulators and general insurance customers.

© 2020 Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: Areeba.khan@iub.edu.pk


1. Introduction

The past decade has seen the rapid emergence and growth of the Islamic financial services sector, which has obtained wide acknowledgment and recognition. Since its emergence, the worldwide Islamic finance industry has extended further than the conventional Islamic economic boundaries of the major industrial
economy and has grown significantly (Abdullah, & Abd Rahman, 2018; Tan & Lim, 2019; ). Nowadays, Islamic Finance is not anymore a niche product used in a special market but is currently offered in more than 60 countries.

Internationally, the insurance market in developed countries is well-reputed and highly flourished (Souiden & Jabeur, 2015). In particular, the Altuntas, Berry-Stölzle, and Hoyt (2011) record shows that Japanese citizens invest from their annual income of about 8.6 percent ($ 3,472) in the insurance division. Also, the record emphasizes that the market share of 79.1 percent of the Japanese insurance market, 69 percent in France and the UK and 43 percent in the USA. The insurance industry in emerging countries is in its starting point. Countries like Turkey, Tunisia, and Algeria, show 15.6 percent, 13.2 percent, and 7.5 percent of market share of over-all insurance industry claimed by Islamic Insurance (Takaful) (Outreville, 2018).

In Pakistan, the takaful industry is growing with existing and new players contemplating the introduction of Sharia-compliant products. This is the beginning of a major transformation in which the Sharia-compliant insurance solutions may eventually become available to most Muslim people in the country. This further emphasizes the importance of study for Islamic consumer preferences. It is the consumer preferences that have given them the option to enjoy high-quality products and services. Also, Pakistani insurance companies allow customers to request insurance products and services that best suit their needs. Consumers have a lot of options to browse. Therefore, general and Islamic insurers need to compete more with the best products and services they can offer their customers. However, the possibilities do not arise incidentally. Many important questions must be discussed to ensure the credibility and acceptance of Takaful's bright future. Consequently, Takaful suppliers should be smart about their position in the product production phase which can meet market demands and respond positively to other mitigating factors that may reduce the tendency of Takaful subscribers.

Furthermore, the awareness of the Takaful related products is still low in Pakistan as compared to other countries and poses a vital concern for Takaful providers (Jamshidi, Hussin, & Wan, 2015). The perception that Takaful is similar to conventional insurance exhibits how little Pakistanis know about the Takaful mechanism (Akhter & Khan, 2017).

The above-given background has triggered the need for further investigation on the contributing factors that might influence the tendency to subscribe to a Takaful plan or products.

2. Literature review and prepositioning

"Islamic Insurance is a framework through which the members give part of the entirety of their commitments which are utilized to pay claims for losses endured by a portion of the members. The organization's job is confined to dealing with the insurance tasks and contributing to the insurance commitments." (Grassa, 2013).

The act of Takaful agreement and business will be in coherence with the Islamic idea of shared cooperation based on the standards of al-Mudharabah, which is allowable as indicated by Allah (SWT), and is completed dependent on the just and true intention to guarantee the member with financial protection from unforeseen future material hazard. Later on, for a Takaful exchange to get legal and enforceable, it ought to be liberated from unlawful components, for instance, usury, extortion, and ahead.

Takaful practices the idea of risk sharing, while the general insurance practice depends on risk transfer (Kasim, Htay, & Salman, 2016). In Takaful, risk sharing among members is decided by taking at the danger support. This reserve is a Tabarru (gift, donation), or commonly contributed finance. It is utilized to pay claims for any outstanding losses or surplus. The excess is shared among the participants just as the operator does, oppose to the allowing of the Takaful model and Islamic law. The basic concept of Takaful is the idea of proportionate sharing, designed to promote association and solidarity between members and the community.
In 2005, the Islamic State Council enacted the guidelines of the Islamic insurance policy. In Pakistan, the concept of Takaful is very old; though its relevant effects may be new. In 1983, the Pakistani government encouraged the Islamic Ideology Council of Pakistan to suggest an Islamic insurance policy. From that point on, Islamic insurance faced a variety of conversational difficulties because of its complications and the non-Shariah compliant environment. In 2005, the Islamic State Council set up standards for the Islamic insurance policy in the country. A large takaful organization, particularly the Pak-Kuwait Takaful limited company commenced their operations in 2006 based on Wakala-Waqf model. The SECP in recent times gave license to five more life insurance companies to elevate the market (Hanif & Iqbal, 2017).

Of estimated 200 million Pakistani people, access to insurance is very low when most people are left unprotected and unaware. Access to information in this scenario is the biggest challenge. As 75 percent of our people fall into the low-income bracket, the only viable consumer segment found in the insurance industry and Takaful is 25 percent of people who earn high, are educated, and have controlled access to their property. This still leaves a great percentage of unexploited consumers who are opting for voluntary exclusion from insurance.

By and large, the Takaful sector is at its evolving level over time, the industry will also need to produce products that show innovation, compatibility and transparency of Takaful to build new market sections. That will make the Takaful industry a default defense option and a viable tool for investment and securitization.

2.1 Adoption of Islamic Insurance

In the present research Adoption to Islamic Insurance (ADII) is a dependent variable used to identify the reasons why people have accepted or are interested in Islamic Insurance and the factors that contributing to its adoption. Arifin and Yazid (2018) refer to various factors affecting the adoption of Islamic insurance including aqilah and planning.

Shariah scholars have been open about the contradictions in their beliefs about Insurance framework in Islam. Takaful is permissible as a vehicle, but Sharia sources provide a complete overview of the basics of framework, rules and regulations, failure to comply with which would render the vehicle inadmissible (Morrison, 2014).

2.2 Customer awareness

The level of awareness about the Islamic Insurance product in urban areas of metropolitan cities, however, the greater part of the consumers is unaware of the Islamic financial products (Coolen-Maturi, 2013). Awareness means people develop their interest in certain issues and participate (Husin & Ab Rahman, 2016a).

In this study, Awareness is defined as knowledge level and approach of customers towards Islamic products and services of insurance companies. The first stage of acceptance of any product or service is awareness. It is therefore unthinkable that the adoption of any product would take place unless one knows about it. Awareness is therefore fundamental to the use of insurance products and services as it opens up a way to stimulate customer curiosity. Without awareness, there would be no customer action. L. Xu, Prybutok, and Blankson (2019) have identified awareness as a powerful factor that directs customer towards the acceptance or rejection of a particular product. Similarly, Bashir (2019) observed that creating awareness among consumers about a product or service remains a key factor in its acceptance.

Literature reports the link between variables awareness and customers’ acceptance and acceptance of a particular product, services, or idea (Hanafi, Kasim, & Diyana, 2019). Based on the literature as discussed, the following hypothesis is developed:

H1: There exists a significant relationship between Customer awareness and Islamic Insurance adoption.
2.3 Consumer Satisfaction
Consumers' fulfilment can be viewed as a client's evaluation of the outcomes that they have obtained in collaboration with the organization, which results from the customer's pre-purchase surveys of anticipated performance with real performance (Hamzah, Ishak, & Nor, 2015).

Consumers can think and choose Insurance options that will give them greater flexibility in terms of the materials and management are constantly educated about the commercial value due to the proliferation of new strategies (Narwal & Sachdeva, 2013). Samir Roushdy and Ali (2017) state that customer satisfaction is significant as they are the ones who be responsible for customer service and affect customer understanding of Takaful. Based on the literature as discussed, the following hypothesis is developed:

H2: There exists a significant relationship between Customer satisfaction and Islamic Insurance adoption.

2.4 Risk Perception
Perceived risk is defines as nature and the amount of the uncertainty faced by the customer in his effort to make use of Islamic bank products or services. Tamer Asaad (2016) reports that the perceived risk of innovation is related to adoption of Islamic insurance services whereas other studies have shown a negative relationship between perceived risk and adoption (Guillemette, Hussein, Phillips, & Martin, 2015; Mariadas & Murthy, 2017).

Depending on the services of the leading insurance system, any type of service by Islamic insurance should be easy to read and use. The perceived ease of use can be explained as the “level of ease associated with system use”, which helps and encourages customers to embrace and implement new programs (Thaker et al., 2019).
Based on the literature, the following hypothesis is developed:

H3: There exists a significant relationship between risk perception and Islamic Insurance adoption.

2.5 Compatibility
Compatibility refers to the level to which Islamic insurance products and services are seen as consistent with customer beliefs and values. It is also regarded as the harmony of insurance products and services in human justice, insurance practice, and the belief of recipients.

Perceived compatibility has been predicted to provide an impact on innovation adoption. The direct effect of this variable has been reported on individual behavior. Many studies have reported the relationship between compatibility and acceptance of a product or service. The relationship was guaranteed especially as positive and significant. Studies by Sidharta, Mentari, Wafaretta, and Nuraini (2017); Naicker and Van Der Merwe (2018) have revealed a positive relationship between compatibility and acceptance of Islamic insurance. Previous studies in various ways have confirmed the potential for adoption of new products or ideas if the new ones are considered to be in line with their beliefs, practices, current values, social system, and their values and lifestyles (Obeid & Kaabachi, 2016; Liu & Yi, 2017). Previous researches have noted that compatibility has a positive and significant relationship on the acceptance of Islamic insurance (Ali, Yaacob, & Haji, 2018). Based on the literature as discussed, the following hypothesis is developed:

H4: There exists a significant relationship between compatibility and Islamic Insurance adoption.

2.6 Religiosity
The definition of religiosity is the level of a person that believes in God, built on his or her faithfulness and love of religion (Zakaria et al., 2016).
Religiosity is characterized by emotions, exhibition, and a gathering of people. Religiosity was seen as one of the significant components in the determination of Islamic Insurance with the ultimate goal of acquisition of items and for the assumption.

From the researches of Mathras, Cohen, Mandel, and Mick (2016), it is established that religion could influence customer psychology and behavior through beliefs, customs, qualities, and community. The Muslims are urged to buy Islamic insurance in light of the fact that the product is based on Islamic standards. That idea has characterized the items and administrations as “halal” and it conforms with the Muslim religion (Siala, 2013). Based on the literature as discussed, the following hypothesis is developed:

**H5:** There exists a significant relationship between religiosity and Islamic Insurance adoption.

### 2.7 Mediating Role of Social Influence

It is observed that the people may change their behavior because of the influence of a group of people or individuals. It is stated that people may consider the opinion of others and may influence their decision to do or not to do something (Husin et al., 2016).

Choosing the insurance commitment depends on five key decisions that include the proposal of partners, the reputation of the insurance, the cost of managing the accounts, the people considering, and the availability of credit. In the context of Islamic insurance, social influence has 53% of the functionality and is effective and positive. People choose Islamic insurance because society expects it from them (Echchabi et al., 2016). SI contributes to consumer loyalty through references, family members, and friends (Badowska, 2017; Beldad & Hegner, 2018; Herawati & Tjahjono, 2020). Based on the literature as discussed, the following hypotheses are formulated:

**H6:** Social Influence significantly mediates the relationship between customer awareness and Islamic Insurance adoption.

**H7:** Social Influence significantly mediates the relationship between customer satisfaction and Islamic Insurance adoption.

**H8:** Social Influence significantly mediates the relationship between risk perception and Islamic Insurance adoption.

**H9:** Social Influence significantly mediates the relationship between compatibility and Islamic Insurance adoption.

**H10:** Social Influence significantly mediates the relationship between religiosity and Islamic Insurance adoption.

### 3. Method

Determining the appropriate research strategy allows the analyst to build interactive tools for data collection and analysis. The study is descriptive in nature and quantitative methodology is applied by obtaining a list of questions from the previous investigations.

**Table 3.1:** Description of Variables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables Name</th>
<th>Variables code</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Investigation tool</th>
<th>References</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Customer Awareness</td>
<td>CA</td>
<td>Awareness is a perception and customer information about any particular product, service, or situation.</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
<td>(Safari, 2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consumer Satisfaction</td>
<td>CS</td>
<td>Customer satisfaction response, the extent to which the completion is satisfactory or unpleasant.</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
<td>(Mariadas &amp; Murty, 2017)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The perceived risk can be defined as the level and type of uncertainty consumers experience in his or her attempt to use a particular product or service.

Compatibility is defined as the level at which an innovation is considered to be in line with existing values, past experiences, and potential recipients’ needs.

Religiosity is defined as the feelings, actions, and experiences of individuals.

Social influence is peer pressure, people perceiving it from their families, social groups, and surroundings, which influence their choice of behavior.

Takaful is a Shariah way to protect yourself and your family from future financial losses.

Convenience sampling is most common in Islamic finance research. The main reason for choosing this method is the lack of feedback from individuals, as individuals are completely unaware of the concept. Based on the convenience sampling, 300 respondents were selected and the impact of independent variables (awareness of the Islamic insurance system, customer satisfaction, compatibility, perceived risk, and social influence) was analyzed on the dependent variable (adoption of Islamic insurance) through administration of the questionnaire.

The instruments consists of 25 items were modified from the existing body of literature (Mariadas & Murthy, 2017; Safari, 2019; Schmidt, 2019; Thaker et al., 2019). All the items were estimated on five points Likert scale. The instrument is divided into two segments. The first segment manages access to socio-demographic data about the respondents and the second segment focuses on seven variables, including one dependent, one mediating, and five independent variables. This section was linked to the collection details using five indicators that influence the acceptance of Islamic Insurance.

The use of the Smart-Partial Least Square Structural Equation Modeling (Smart PLS-SEM) method of analysis as a second-generation method of analysis was employed to examine the data. PLS-SEM was used to analyze the relationship of varying degrees and it is a more sophisticated multivariate data analysis to measure unobservable variables and to minimize measurement error (Chin, 1998). To sum it up, the Smart PLS-SEM technique has the advantage of analyzing a sample of various degrees, minimizing measurement error, and also serve as the source of confirmatory and exploratory analysis (Henseler et al., 2014).

### 4. Findings and discussion

The initial phase in PLS-SEM is the measurement model evaluation. Reliability (factor loadings), internal consistency reliability (Cronbach's alpha) (composite reliability CR), construct validity (average variance extracted AVE), and discriminant validity (Fornell and Lacker (F and L) were run and analysed. The measurement outcomes were acquired after the running algorithm is SmartPLS and are presented in Table 4.1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questionnaire</th>
<th>(Thaker et al, 2019)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RP</td>
<td>The perceived risk can be defined as the level and type of uncertainty consumers experience in his or her attempt to use a particular product or service.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COM</td>
<td>Compatibility is defined as the level at which an innovation is considered to be in line with existing values, past experiences, and potential recipients’ needs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REL</td>
<td>Religiosity is defined as the feelings, actions, and experiences of individuals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SI</td>
<td>Social influence is peer pressure, people perceiving it from their families, social groups, and surroundings, which influence their choice of behavior.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adopt</td>
<td>Takaful is a Shariah way to protect yourself and your family from future financial losses.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Latip et al, 2017)</td>
<td>(Obeid &amp; Kaabachi, 2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Bodibe et al, 2016)</td>
<td>(Schmidt, 2019)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.1 also exhibits the Cronbach's alpha for six factors of adoption of Islamic Insurance in Pakistan. The alpha qualities ran from 0.772 to 0.871, more than the base model of 0.60 Cronbach's alpha which represents the rule of thumb for a reliability test as per Byrne and Van de Vijver (2010). Data analysis confirms the instrument is highly reliable because internal consistency is seen among all factors.

In this research, convergent validity was evaluated by factor loading, Composite Reliability (CR), and
Average Variance Extracted (AVE) (Fornell & Larcker, 1981). Confirmatory Factor Analysis (CFA) is directed to evaluate the factor loading of variables. As per this standard, the convergent validity of the measurement model can be surveyed by the Average Variance Extracted (AVE) and Composite Reliability (CR).

**Table 4.1: Construct Validity and Reliability**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Construct</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Factor loading</th>
<th>Cronbach’s Alpha (α)</th>
<th>CR</th>
<th>AVE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Customer Awareness</td>
<td>CA1</td>
<td>0.723</td>
<td>0.721</td>
<td>0.768</td>
<td>0.631</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CA2</td>
<td>0.639</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CA3</td>
<td>0.806</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customer Satisfaction</td>
<td>CS1</td>
<td>0.763</td>
<td>0.604</td>
<td>0.774</td>
<td>0.537</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CS2</td>
<td>0.788</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CS3</td>
<td>0.664</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Risk Perception</td>
<td>RP1</td>
<td>0.586</td>
<td>0.648</td>
<td>0.787</td>
<td>0.687</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>RP3</td>
<td>0.803</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>RP4</td>
<td>0.691</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>RP5</td>
<td>0.691</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compatibility</td>
<td>COM1</td>
<td>0.672</td>
<td>0.633</td>
<td>0.803</td>
<td>0.578</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>COM2</td>
<td>0.835</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>COM3</td>
<td>0.769</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religiosity</td>
<td>REL1</td>
<td>0.684</td>
<td>0.725</td>
<td>0.816</td>
<td>0.582</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>REL2</td>
<td>0.724</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>REL3</td>
<td>0.561</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>REL4</td>
<td>0.712</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>REL5</td>
<td>0.745</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Influence</td>
<td>SI1</td>
<td>0.796</td>
<td>0.697</td>
<td>0.832</td>
<td>0.623</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SI2</td>
<td>0.757</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SI3</td>
<td>0.814</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adopt of Islamic Insurance</td>
<td>Adopt1</td>
<td>0.712</td>
<td>0.684</td>
<td>0.807</td>
<td>0.515</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Adopt2</td>
<td>0.785</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Adopt3</td>
<td>0.781</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Adopt4</td>
<td>0.570</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 4.2: Discriminant Validity**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Adopt</th>
<th>CA</th>
<th>COM</th>
<th>CS</th>
<th>REL</th>
<th>RP</th>
<th>SI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Adopt</td>
<td>0.717</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CA</td>
<td>0.422</td>
<td>0.726</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COM</td>
<td>0.642</td>
<td>0.398</td>
<td>0.762</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CS</td>
<td>0.271</td>
<td>0.355</td>
<td>0.432</td>
<td>0.740</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REL</td>
<td>0.592</td>
<td>0.378</td>
<td>0.591</td>
<td>0.396</td>
<td>0.688</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RP</td>
<td>0.517</td>
<td>0.501</td>
<td>0.548</td>
<td>0.524</td>
<td>0.531</td>
<td>0.697</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SI</td>
<td>0.657</td>
<td>0.381</td>
<td>0.623</td>
<td>0.335</td>
<td>0.641</td>
<td>0.597</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1511
The measurement model has acceptable discriminant validity. Besides, since the measurement model of this examination indicated an acceptable degree of reliability and validity, further investigation could be accomplished to survey the structural model and followed by hypotheses testing.

After the analysis of the measurement model, the structural model was examined. The significance of the structural model was measured by R square value. As displayed in Table 4.3, R2 for adoption is 59% and social influence was 55% suggesting that the model has substantial explanatory power.

Table 4.3: Significance of Structural Model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Construct</th>
<th>R Square</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Adopt</td>
<td>0.595</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SI</td>
<td>0.552</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To test the hypothesized relationships among the constructs, the estimates were acquired for the path coefficients. SmartPLS can produce T-statistics for significance testing of both the internal and external models, using bootstrapping. Table 4.4 presents the hypotheses relationships among the constructs.

H1 shows the relation between customer awareness and adoption of Islamic Insurance, which is accepted by having a B= 0.122, P=0.001 and T statistics 2.445, H2 reveals the relationship between customer satisfaction and adoption of Islamic insurance which presents an inverse relation with B= -0.116, P= 0.009 and T statistics 2.612 which is accepted, H3 represents the relationship between risk perception and adoption of Islamic insurance that is rejected B= 0.071, P= 0.304 and T statistics 1.028. H4 presents the relationship between compatibility and adoption of Islamic Insurance. The results displays a significant relationship with B= 0.314, P= 0.000, and T statistics 6.191. H5 indicates a significant positive relationship between religiosity and adoption of Islamic Insurance, i.e. B= 0.075, P= 0.000, and T statistics 4.572.

Table 4.4 Structural Model Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypotheses</th>
<th>Relationship</th>
<th>Path Coefficient</th>
<th>T-Statistics</th>
<th>P-value</th>
<th>Decision</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>H1</td>
<td>CA -&gt; Adopt</td>
<td>0.122</td>
<td>2.445</td>
<td>0.001</td>
<td>Significant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H2</td>
<td>CS -&gt; Adopt</td>
<td>-0.116</td>
<td>2.612</td>
<td>0.009</td>
<td>Significant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H3</td>
<td>RP -&gt; Adopt</td>
<td>0.071</td>
<td>1.018</td>
<td>0.304</td>
<td>Insignificant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H4</td>
<td>COM -&gt; Adopt</td>
<td>0.314</td>
<td>6.191</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>Significant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H5</td>
<td>REL -&gt; Adopt</td>
<td>0.075</td>
<td>4.572</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>Significant</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To test the mediation relationship proposed in H6, the current study bootstrapped the direct effect of customer awareness on the adoption of Islamic Insurance and there is no mediation. It is found that the test was insignificant with t statistics = 0.406, p-value =0.685, therefore H6 is rejected. Further, to test the mediation suggested in H7, the current study bootstrapped the direct effect of customer satisfaction on the adoption of Islamic Insurance. The test was insignificant with t statistics = 1.438, p-value= 0.151. Having these results, this study found that social Influence did not play a mediating role between customer awareness and adoption of Islamic Insurance. In H8 social influence plays a mediating role between risk perception and adoption of Islamic Insurance. It was found that the test was significant with t statistics =3.463, p-value=0.001. In H9-H10 social influence plays a mediating role in compatibility and religiosity. Is it found that the test was significant with t statistics =3.589, p-value=0.000 so, H9 is accepted and t statistics =3.547, p-value=0.000 of H10. Therefore H9 and H10 are accepted. There is full mediation between customer awareness and customer satisfaction and partial mediation exists in risk perception, compatibility, and religiosity.

Table 4.5: Structural Model with Mediation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypotheses</th>
<th>Relationship</th>
<th>Beta</th>
<th>t-value</th>
<th>P-value</th>
<th>Decision</th>
<th>Conclusion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

1512
Awareness of Islamic insurance impacts customer acceptance of Islamic insurance products in a significant manner. That outcome is coherent with the findings of earlier literature (Karbhari et al., 2018). Awareness of Islamic insurance was also consistent with the findings of Hisham, Palil, Nowalid, and Ramli (2019) and Safari (2019). It exhibits that the heightened customer awareness prompts a surge in the adoption of Islamic Insurance.

From the results, the level of customer satisfaction negatively affects customer adoption toward takaful products. This finding is interesting as it relates to earlier studies conducted by Janahi and Al Mubarak (2017) and Mariaidas and Murthy (2017). Therefore, the findings suggest that satisfaction is a determinant of Takaful adoption. The empirical results of my findings indicate that people do not have high satisfaction in Takaful. Therefore, Takaful operators should increase the Takaful perceptions among conventional insurance customers to recognize its importance to create more satisfied Takaful customers.

From the results, risk perception does not seem to significantly influence the adoption of Islamic Insurance; these outcomes are similar to previous studies of Thaker et al. (2019). The outcome shows that ‘Perceived Risk’ is not a significant variable in the adoption of takaful and doesn’t have a direct relationship. That clarifies why customers observe ‘Perceived Risk’ as irrelevant in their choice to embrace Islamic insurance.

In addition, compatibility impacts customer adoption attitude toward Islamic insurance. The outcome suggests that respondents have confidence in Islamic insurance items and its similarity. It is also endorsed that Takaful items are steady with their moral qualities, religious belief, and satisfy their desires regarding financial needs. It concludes that the more compatible the people are, the easier they will feel to purchase Islamic insurance.

This study endorses a causal relationship between compatibility and customer intention towards Islamic insurance. Finally, the findings suggest that religiosity has an impact on the acceptance level of customers toward Islamic insurance. The foundation of Islamic insurance is religion, therefore, religion understandably had to be the most dominant reason which induces Muslims to switch from conventional insurance to Takaful.

5. Conclusion and Policy recommendations

It is concluded that religiosity is a significant element in purchasing Islamic insurance, while customer satisfaction with the current conventional insurance reduces its purchasing. Risk perception is not considered a factor in the adoption of Islamic Insurance. Therefore, in the presence of social influence, the risk perception considered significant factors towards the adoption behavior, and social influence is also considered a mediator between compatibility and religiosity in the adoption of Takaful.

It is recommended that to increase Takaful outreach among conventional customers, their attitude towards Takaful ought to be positively shaped by developing mass awareness campaigns through proper channels including advertisement that show Takaful operations and benefits, and its difference from...
traditional insurance. Customer of Pakistan perceives Takaful positively though there is dire need of conveying the details on Takaful through social media, interactive websites, or face to face meetings.

References


Measuring Pakistan’s Legislative Preparedness against COVID-19: A Critical Study of Newly Promulgated Law

1 Jibran Jamshed, 2 Ammara Mujtaba, 3 Muhammad Waqas Javed, 4 Syed Wajdan Rafay Bukhari

1 Assistant Professor, Department of Law, Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Pakistan
   jibran_jamshed@yahoo.com

2 Lecturer, Bahria University Islamabad, Pakistan, ammara_mujtaba@yahoo.com

3 Lecturer, School of Law, Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad, Pakistan, mwjaved@qau.edu.pk

4 Lecturer, University Law College, University of Sargodha, Pakistan, wajdan.rafay@uos.edu.pk

ARTICLE DETAILS

History
Revised format: November 2020
Available Online: December 2020

Keywords
Legislative Preparedness, COVID-19, Promulgated Law, Pakistan

JEL Classification
M10, M12

ABSTRACT

Background: Since December 2019, the COVID-19 pandemic has challenged the international community on health and legislative fronts. The widespread disease needs an effective response from the health-care system as well as the legislative framework. Pakistan is facing a challenge from the underdeveloped health-care system as well as a lack of awareness about the available laws to deal with the issue. Awareness about the relevant laws is a precursor to the establishment of rule of law. This study will doctrinally analyse the national laws of Pakistan to make the response more effective. The awareness about the relevant laws will supplement the healthcare response against the pandemic of COVID-19. Since Pakistan is a federation and healthcare is a provincial subject, therefore the study limits itself to the laws of Punjab, the largest populated province of Pakistan. Objectives: This study will analyse the available healthcare laws to deal with the recent outbreak of COVID-19. The focus will remain on the doctrinal measurement of the effectiveness of The Punjab Infectious Diseases (Prevention and Control) Act 2020 (PIDA) vis-à-vis already existing laws. It will also highlight the salient features of the PIDA 2020 along with its effectiveness to deal with the current pandemic. Method: The study benefits from documentary analysis of legal documents. The method is nearer to the doctrinal research method in law. The study will shape itself into two parts. First will be lax lata that will ascertain what is the relevant healthcare law to deal with infectious diseases like COVID-19. The next step will be lax ferenda where the study will propose how it can become more effective to deal with the issue. The research will opt black letter approach. Conclusion: This study finds that the adoption of PIDA 2020 is in spirit with dealing with the pandemic of the COVID-19. The law has shown positive trends in protecting the population from the widespread impact of the diseases. The World Health Organization has appreciated Pakistan’s methods and strategies against the first wave of the COVID-19 with reference to response in Punjab, the largest province of Pakistan.
1. Introduction

The outbreak of the COVID-19 pandemic has been an unprecedented challenge for the global economy, health, and rule of law. On 30 January 2020, The World Health Organization (WHO) declared the COVID-19 outbreak as “Sixth Public Health Emergency Services (SPHEC)” (Bilgin et al., 2020). The deadly disease originated from Mainland China after the report of the first cases from Wuhan City of China in December 2019. The disease was named as Severe Acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SAR-CoV-2) for the reason of leading to severe respiratory infections and pneumonia (She J. et al., 2020). The root of the infection is often argued; however, it is believed to start from the local seafood market in Wuhan and it got transmitted to the visitors. This initial endemic turned into a global pandemic in a very short period (Zu ZY et al., 2019; Millan, 2020).

The COVID-19 which is more commonly known as Coronavirus spread at a rapid pace all over the world from China. This new virus is related to Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome (SARS) and Middle East Respiratory Syndrome (MERS). The severity and effects of this deadly virus are varying and different in each country and each region (Tang, 2000). It is also interesting to note that this is not the first outbreak of Coronavirus. SARS-CoV (Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome Coronavirus) and MERS-CoV (Middle East Respiratory Syndrome Coronavirus) outbreaks were the previous coronavirus outbreaks (Zhou, 2020).

On 26 February 2020, the first case of COVID-19 has been confirmed by the Government of Pakistan in Provincial Capital Province Sindh i.e. Karachi. On the same day, another case was confirmed in Islamabad, Federal Capital, by the Federal Ministry of Health (Ali et al., 2020). Within 15 days, after the first case was confirmed, Coronavirus spread rapidly, and the total number of COVID-19 cases reached 20 in different parts of the country. All the reported cases have travel histories from Iran, Syria, and the UK (Waris et al., 2020). On 12 February 2020, the National Action Plan for Preparedness & Response to Corona Virus Disease Pakistan was presented by the Ministry of National Health Services. The aim was to control the spread of disease and strengthen the Pakistan and its society for effective and swift response against COVID-19 (Waris et al., 2020).

Apart from preventive measures and scientific research, the states have started taking legislative measures to curtail the spread of the deadly virus. Effective legislation and its implementation have been significant for the containment of COVID-19. Many developing countries have outdated laws regarding infectious diseases before the advent of COVID-19. To beef up its response against the outbreak, Punjab and other provinces of Pakistan have introduced laws to stop the mass outspread of the virus.

2. Methodology

As mentioned in the summary above, the study benefits from documentary analysis techniques. The legal issues need analysis vis-à-vis primary and secondary sources of laws. While primary sources with context to Pakistan, a Common Law country, are legislations and case laws. For these reasons, the fundamental primary sources or documents remain legislations such as The Punjab Epidemic Diseases Act 1958 (PEDA 1958), Pakistan Penal Code 1860 (PPC 1860), The Punjab Infections Diseases (Prevention and Control) Ordinance 2020 (PIDA 2020). The secondary sources used are books, research articles, and data published by the Government and Non-Government Organization.

As the documentary analysis technique is close to doctrinal research methods in legal research, where a researcher examines an issue based on already existing doctrine, the study uses black-letter approach.
The study will be desk-based to analyse the effectiveness of laws dealing with infectious diseases including the outbreak of the COVID-19, the effectiveness of laws, and what can be possibly done to make them more effective.

3. Objectives of the Study
The followings are the main objectives this study aims to achieve.

1. Awareness of the law is significant for creating the rule of law in society. Therefore, this study will create awareness about the legal framework in Punjab, Pakistan to control the infectious disease with special reference to the COVID-19.
2. To critically examine and analyze the effectiveness of the Punjab Infectious Diseases (Prevention and Control) Act 2020 which deals with COVID-19 and other infectious diseases in the Province of Punjab.
3. To compare this new law with the previous legislation dealing with COVID-19.
4. To suggest how to enforce the laws effectively.

4. Background
Almost half of the population of Pakistan resides in Punjab, a densely populated province of Pakistan (Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, 2020). The COVID-19 has challenged the government of Punjab at economic, healthcare, and administrative levels. With the highest population density in Pakistan, the possibility of a larger impact of the COVID-19 was on the cards. To deal with the issue, there was an urgent need to promulgate a new and effective law to curtail the outbreak of the COVID-19. Before the spread of COVID-19, The Punjab Epidemic Diseases Act 1958 primarily dealt with the control of infectious diseases including the COVID-19. Being an outdated law, it was not effective and hence Government of Punjab decided to repeal that law and promulgated The Punjab Infectious Diseases (Prevention and Control) Ordinance 2020 to deal with modern challenges posed by the COVID-19. On 11 August 2020, the provincial assembly adopted the Punjab Infectious Diseases (Prevention and Control) Act 2020 (PIDA 2020).

To build the context, this study will explore the limitations of the repealed Punjab Epidemic Diseases Act 1958.

4.1 The Framework of the Punjab Epidemic Diseases Act of 1958 (PEDA 1958)
The legislative framework for controlling infectious diseases was adopted during the year 1958. The law provided the government to take certain measures to stop the spread of infectious diseases. In this regard, PEDA 1958 aimed to consolidate the laws relating to the prevention of the spread of dangerous epidemic diseases in Punjab Province as provided in the preamble of PEDA 1958. Section 2 of the act empowered the government, if threatened with outbreak of any dangerous epidemic disease, it may to adopt “measures and by public notice prescribe such temporary regulations to be observed by the public or any person or class of persons as it shall deem necessary to prevent the outbreak of such disease or the spread” (S.2, PED Act 1958).

This law empowered the Provincial Government to take all necessary steps when there is a danger of an epidemic disease outbreak. According to that law, the Provincial Government is empowered to inspect any person who is suspected of being infected with any such disease and the person can also be segregated in any hospital temporarily. The District Coordination Officer (DCO) was given power by this act to exercise all powers on behalf of the Provincial Government. Although it was also clarified that all such powers delegated by the Provincial Government shall be subject to such restriction, limitations, and conditions, as specified by the Provincial Government spread (S.2, PEDA 1958).

According to section 3 of the PED Act 1958, “any person disobeying any regulation or order made under this act shall be deemed to have committed an offense punishable under section 188 of the Pakistan Penal Code”. Section 188 of the Pakistan Penal Code describes the punishment for disobedience to order duly promulgated by a public servant. anyone who violates the section 188 of Pakistan Penal Code, “be punished with simple imprisonment for a term which may extend to one month or with a fine which may extend to six hundred rupees, or with both: and if any such disobedience causes or tends to cause danger to human life, health or safety or causes or tends to cause a riot or affray,
shall be punished with imprisonment of either description for a term which may extend to six months, or with fine which may extend to three thousand rupees or with both” (S.188, PPC 1860).

PEDA 1958 was brief legislation that contains only 4 sections and it was not ready to deal with the multi-facet challenges posed by the COVID-19. It only contains general provisions regarding the powers of the provincial government to take some actions against the spread of infectious disease. There were no details, specifications, procedures, and specialized bodies provided in that act to deal with serious threats like COVID-19. The Act provides insignificant punishment for those who violate it hence fail to create effective deterrence. It was not capable to deal effectively with the infections disease like COVID-19 and that is the reason it was repealed by the Punjab Infectious Diseases (Prevention and Control) Act 2020.

4.2 The Domain and Scope of Punjab Infectious Diseases (Prevention and Control) Act 2020
To deal with the outbreak of the COVID-19 effectively, PIDA 2020 was promulgated on 27th March 2020. According to the preamble of PIDA 2020, the law is passed to provide for the prevention and control of infectious diseases in the Punjab and matters related to it. Although the COVID-19 is not mentioned anywhere in the preamble or the Ordinance, yet it was promulgated to control specifically the spread of Coronavirus in Punjab.

In the beginning, this law defines some important designations like Potentially Infectious Person, Director General Health, Secretary, and Notified Medical Officer. According to section 2 (g) of PIDA 2020, the “Potentially Infectious Person” as a “person who is suspected to be infected or contaminated with an infectious disease; or is a risk that such person might spread, infect or contaminate other persons with an infectious disease; or has arrived from or through an area affected by an infectious disease within fourteen days or such other period as may be specified by the secretary immediately preceding the date of his arrival”. The period of 14 days is specifically mentioned in this definition which makes it clear that the immediate concern of this law is to combat COVID-19.

In this law, the secretary and Director General Health are given special roles with specific powers. The Director-General Health is the Director General Health Services, Punjab (S.2b, PEDA 2020), and Secretary is defined as Secretary to the Government, Primary and Secondary Healthcare Department (S.2j, PEDA 2020). Notified Medical Officer is a medical officer notified for this Act by the Secretary (S.2j, PEDA 2020). In simple words, he is the Doctor who will have very important duties and powers in relation to this Law. According to 3(a) of PEDA 2020, “The Secretary may with the approval of Chief Minister, by notification in the Official Gazette, declare that the incidence of transmission of infectious diseases poses a serious and imminent threat to public health in the whole or any part of Punjab”. The same section also provides that the secretary after approval of the Chief Minister can revoke a declaration made by him. It also binds the secretary to get advice from Director General Health regarding the declaration or revocation of Disease along with at least two eminent epidemiologists appointed by the Chief Minister. Under this, the secretary is empowered to impose a duty upon all registered medical practitioners in Punjab to treat cases of infection or contamination. it means the Government can impose duties in case of infection emergency on any doctor/medical practitioner whether Private or Government. Similarly, the Secretary is empowered to declare any medical facility in Punjab to be a treatment center for specific infectious diseases whether private or government. “A registered medical practitioner shall include a registered medical practitioner, not in employment of Government, and the term health facility shall be deemed to include a clinic, hospital, diagnostic laboratory, and any other facility engaged in the provision of health services and not owned, financed, managed or run by the Government” (S.4, PEDA 2020).Section 7 of PIDA 2020, empowers the Director-General Health to “issue direction prohibiting or imposing one or more requirements or restrictions in relation to the holding of an event or gathering for a specific period”. Director-General Health can restrict the specific gathering or event concerning the number of people etc. He can impose these restrictions on the owner or occupier of premises for an event, organizers of the event, or another person who is holding such an event.
Section 8 of PIDA 2020 stated that The Director General is also empowered “to issue directions prohibiting or imposing one of more requirements or restrictions in relation to the entry into, exit from or location of persons in premises for specific period”. This power is given to the DG Health in order to contain the infection if it has already spread into specific areas. A specific place can be sealed and its entry and exit points are restricted for a specific period. Similarly, Deputy Commissioner of the concerned area may on the advice of the secretary, issue directions prohibiting or imposing requirements or restriction in relation to the entry into, exit from, or location of the person, goods, vehicles, vessels, and other means of transportation in any area for a specific period. It is important to note that Smart Lockdowns by the Government of Pakistan during the COVID-19 pandemic are imposed under the above-mentioned sections. This ordinance makes it obligatory for the potentially infectious person to move and remain in a specific place for a specific time. According to the Act, “A notified medical officer may, after having informed the potentially infectious person of the reasons for doing so, direct such person to proceed to a specified place that is suitable for screening and assessment and remains there for a specific period”. If a potential infection person refuses to follow the advice of a Medical officer, the person can be moved to that specific place by the Police through the concerned Head of the District Police Officer. He can be moved to that specific place for forty-eight hours for screening and assessment in normal circumstances. A notified Medical officer may “impose upon a potential infectious person one or more screening requirements to assess the level of risk of infection or contaminating to others and carry out such assessment”. According to section 11 of PIDA, “the potentially infectious person is bound to answer every question related to his health and travel history. He is also bound to produce any document with may be required in assessing his health, to allow personal examination like measurement of body temperature and other physical conditions, and to give biological sample by an appropriate mean”.

The Notified Medical Officer plays a key role in this law. He is entrusted with many important duties and given many powers to fulfill his duties effectively. According to section 12 of PIDA 2020, Where after the screening and assessment, the potentially infectious person found to be infected or contaminated, the notified Medical Officer may require such a person.

- To undertake further screening and assessment
- Be retained at a specific place for a specific period
- Be retained at a specific place in isolation
- Restrict his movements or travel including travels within and inside Province
- Restrict his activities including work or business
- Restrict his contact with other persons

This section provides the period of restriction up to 14 days under normal circumstances. The medical officer can direct the Police Officer to enforce the directions.

Although notified Medical Officer has given many powers under this law yet there are some restrictions, pre-conditions, and manners provided in this law for the exercise of this power by the notified Medical Officers and Police Officers. According to section 14 of PIDA 2020, “It is the duty of every person who knows or believes or has reason to know or believe, that a person under his care, supervision, or control is suffering from an infectious disease or is contaminated, to report such case to the notified medical officer immediately”. Hence this law made it compulsory for all residents of Punjab Province to provide information to the Government regarding any person who might be infected so that authorities can make proper arrangements for the containment of infection.

According to section 17 of the Act, “a person commits an offense if he fails without reasonable excuse to comply with any direction, reasonable instruction, duty, requirement, or restriction imposed upon him under the Ordinance”. The punishment provided is, “A first-time offender shall, under this section, be punished with imprisonment for a term not exceeding two months or a fine not exceeding fifty thousand rupees or both. If a person is guilty of a repeat offense under this section, he can be punished with imprisonment for a term not exceeding six months or a fine not exceeding one hundred thousand rupees or both”.

1521
This Ordinance also differentiates between the offense committed by an individual and a body corporate. Where an offense under this section is committed by a body corporate, the fine for the first offense shall not be less than fifty thousand rupees and not exceeding two hundred thousand rupees, and the fine for a repeat offense shall be between one hundred thousand rupees (minimum) and three hundred thousand rupees (maximum). There is a difference between the fine imposed on individuals and body corporate.

There are more strict punishments for those who violate certain sections of this Ordinance. If a potentially infectious person fails to comply with the duties imposed on him by Medical Officer or provides false information to the medical officer or obstructs a person who is exercising the powers conferred on him under this law than he is liable for strict punishments. According to section 18, “a person guilty of first offence be punished with imprisonment for a term not exceeding three months or a fine not exceeding fifty thousand rupees or both, and a person guilty of a repeat offence be punished with imprisonment for a term not exceeding one year or fine not exceeding one hundred thousand rupees or both. The offence for running away from a place of retention has more serious consequences. Under this law, if a person runs away or attempts to run away while being moved to or kept at a place under this law, the first offence is punished with imprisonment for a term not exceeding six months or a fine not exceeding fifty thousand rupees or both, repeat offence be punished with imprisonment for a term not exceeding six months or a fine not exceeding fifty thousand rupees or both”.

This comprehensive punishment provided in this law is one of its many positive aspects. The minimum and maximum amount of fine are also provided in this law for different offences which means even a court cannot impose any other amount of fine outside these limits. The limitation on the discretion of the court is according to the modern standard of punishments and it not only curtails the arbitrary powers of courts but also minimize the misuse of this law. A Magistrate of first-class is empowered to take cognizance of or try an offence under this Ordinance. All the offences under this law shall be tried in court in summary trials as provided in the Code of Criminal Procedure 1898. The Summary Procedure provided in this Law for the offences makes it sure that courts can decide the matters in time.

4.3 Synergizing the PIDA 2020 by the Pakistan Penal Code 1860 regarding the Infectious Diseases

The laws dealing with the control of infectious diseases can be synergized by the relevant provisions in the PPC 1860, federal legislation. The code is a substantive criminal law containing offences and their punishments. Being a federal law, it is also enforceable in the Province of Punjab like all other provinces of Pakistan. It contained some provisions which are related to the prevention of infectious diseases and provide punishments for those who violate. For instance, the section 269 of PPC provides “that whoever unlawfully or negligently does any act which is, and which he knows or has reason to believe to be, likely to spread the infection of any disease dangerous to life, shall be punished with imprisonment of either description for a term which may extend to six months or with fine or with both”. Section 270 of PPC is about “the malignant act likely to spread infection of disease dangerous to life. Whoever malignantly does any act which is, and which he knows or has reason to believe to be, likely to spread the infection of any disease dangerous to life, shall be punished with imprisonment of either description for a term which may extend to two years or with fine or with both”. In the next section i.e. 271 of PPC, it is provided that, “whoever knowingly disobeys any rule made and promulgated by the Federal or any Provincial Government for putting any vessel into a state of quarantine or for regulating the intercourse of vessels in a state of quarantine with the shore or with other vessels, or for regulating the intercourse between places where an infectious disease prevails and other places, shall be punished with imprisonment of either description for a term which may extend to six months or with fine or with both”. Although these sections provide punishment for those who violate the law by spreading infectious diseases, yet the punishments provided in these sections are not strict enough to create any strong deterrence. These sections are not repealed and still part of the PPC, but they are seldom used practically. Dealing with the control of the outbreak of COVID-19 under the criminal laws, in Punjab, can positively help in effectively controlling the contact of the affected person with the population. In the most populated province of Pakistan, the adoption of new laws and effective enforcement mechanism has played a positive role in curtailing the gatherings those may lead to a widespread outbreak of the virus in the society.
5. Discussion & Analysis
The legislative measures taken by the Government of Punjab has been effective in controlling the spread of the virus by authorizing the local authorities to stop all sort of public gatherings. Moreover, these laws further empower the authorities to take all necessary actions in relation to the protection of healthcare. However, these legislative measures have attracted criticism from economic and human rights perspectives. The PIDA 2020 empowers the local authorities to control all economic and mobilization restrictions that may affect the fundamental rights of the citizens. There are some strong arguments against the lockdowns and economic shutdown in a developing country like Pakistan where economic indicators are already down. But the policy choice for Government is the same as it is around the world for most of the Governments i.e. simple trade-off between saving lives and saving the economy.

During the pandemic, the government authorities are facing the issue to balance strict control measures and protection of economic activities as well as human rights. The choice has always been the protection of life by imposing strict social distancing laws and shut down the economic activities although the severity and magnitude of these shutdowns vary from country to country. In Pakistan, the government imposed the strict lockdown during March 2020, but later switched to the smart lockdown and resumed the economic activities. The application of PIDA 2020 has been effective in controlling the spread of the virus. A recent study on the Scandinavian countries suggests that most of the economic contraction is caused by the virus itself and occurs regardless of the social distancing laws (Sheridan et al., 2020). This study also suggests that the social distancing laws, which empower the Governments to impose lockdowns and shut down economic activities, are often considered contrary to the economy and human rights. However, these measures are necessary to save lives, a basic human right. In such circumstances the newly promulgated PIDA 2020 is justifiable and it already has shown the positive results because the number of infections in Punjab reduced dramatically after its implementation.

6. Conclusion
The study has tried to achieve the goals of awareness and analysis of local laws dealing with the control of the infectious disease. The study explains and interprets the newly promulgated Punjab Infectious Diseases (Prevention and Control) Act 2020. The legislation has been useful in introducing an effective substantive law that enjoys an advanced enforcement mechanism. The law has been useful in controlling the spread of the virus in Punjab by restricting public gathering. Former laws controlling the infectious diseases did not give authorities space to deal with the novel challenges posed by the COVID-19. Since the legislation is new, therefore, the study examines the salient features and important characteristics of the PIDA 2020 to create awareness about the law, an essential part of establishing rule of law in society. The study finds that the adoption of the PIDA 2020 has balanced the legislative, enforcement, and policymaking of Punjab government with the protection of related human rights. A further study may investigate the issue using the qualitative research methods by conducting the interviews of relevant stakeholders such as enforcement agencies, district administration, market (traders) unions, and public

References
Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, 

Punjab Epidemic Diseases Act 1958

Punjab Penal Code 1860

Punjab Infectious Diseases (Prevention and Control) Ordinance 2020


Socio-Economic and Political Impacts of Vocational Trainings on Tribal Community of Pakistan

1Sami Ullah, 2Zilakat Khan Malik
1PhD Scholar, University of Peshawar, Peshawar, Pakistan, sami00212@yahoo.com
2Professor of Economics, University of Peshawar, Peshawar, Pakistan, Zilakat@uop.edu.pk

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

This study was conducted to evaluate the role of vocational training imparted by the Federally Administered Tribal Area’s Development Authority (FATA-DA) in the socio-economic and political development of the tribal community in Pakistan. The survey was initiated in the year 2018 in FATA where 400 males in the age group (16-35 years) were selected for data collection through a disproportionate simple random sampling procedure. Cross Tabulation Analysis was conducted using SPSS. The result indicates that vocational training imparted by FATA-DA contributed very less to the socio-economic and political development of FATA’s youth. Among 13 indicators, the impact on only 02 indicators was found significant for the treatment group. This study concluded that vocational training does have a contribution to the socio-economic development of youth but in the case of FATA-DA sponsored training, the result was not desirable. This might be due to certain quality issues that must be taken into consideration during initiating a vocational training program for the socio-economic and political development of youth.

© 2020 Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: Sami00212@yahoo.com


1. Introduction

Investment in human capital is a highly focused phenomenon in the modern economy. Economists and human capital theorists believe that vocational training is an essential means for the socio-economic development of individuals and nations. Human capital development means to increase the earning potential of the human being. It focuses on obtaining knowledge, skills, competencies, and personality traits through education and training (Mincer, 1958; Becker, 1975). Vocational training is considered an indispensable way for the development of human capital. Vocational training means the attainment of knowledge and practical skills related to various occupations in different sectors of economic life. Vocational training increases the chances of employment and earnings which breed considerable economic and social benefits for human beings. It has an indirect effect on the decline in crime rate, decrease in mental illness, improvement in health condition, better schooling of children, and social cohesion. In this regard, it has been observed that skilling youth with vocational training has a
significant effect on the socialization of the youth community (Managing Vocational Training Systems: A Handbook for Senior Administrators, 2001). Excessive academic literature presents that vocational training has the potential of bringing positive changes in individual wellbeing (Maclean & Wilson, 2009).

From a social viewpoint, vocational training is a tool for fighting against individual poverty by promoting equal opportunities in terms of labor, social context, and citizenship (Patankar, 2019). Research conducted by the European Centre for the Development of Vocational Training (CEDEFOP) has shown that technical and vocational training can foster confidence and self-esteem in individuals, contributing to their engagement with families and society (Career Space Consortium, 2001). Technical and vocational skills development can play a significant role in the transformation of rural communities by making people empowered to make decisions and take action to improve their social, cultural, economic, and political lives in a way that result in a broad positive impact on society as a whole (Catherine & Jacob, 2014).

It enhances a wide range of so-called ‘life skills’ such as communication, motivation, teamwork, responsibility, violence prevention, and training in reproductive health which shows that technical and vocational training is increasingly accepted as a way of enhancing youth capability sets (Debrah, 2013). In most countries of the world, technical and vocational training schemes have been started to make underprivileged citizens believe that they have a bright future. Prominently, these schemes have provided a means of reducing the psychological pressure of socio-political and economic trauma that is bedeviling most of the underdeveloped countries. It has been observed that if the youth of a country deprived of vocational and technical skills, there are the tendencies of becoming caught up in the web of depression, hopelessness, juvenile delinquency, social aggression, and economic dependency. These observations, as mentioned above, have been the greatest cause of prostitution, thuggery, and hooliganism for most of the youth community who remained deprived of such vocational training programs (Elebute & Mashood, 2016).

Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA) is the most lagging and underdeveloped community in Pakistan. It is spread over an area of 27,220 square km, with a total population of 5001676 (Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, 2017). 97.1% of people in FATA are living in rural areas. Two-third of the population (73%) is living under the poverty line with multidimensional Poverty Index (MPI) 0.337 and poverty incidence 73.7%. FATA consistently ranks lowest in the country in terms of human development indicators like literacy, healthcare access, potable water access, employment rates, average income, etc.

The political system remained weak in FATA for ages. After the independence of the sub-continent, the Government of Pakistan also failed to devise a better policy for tribal Pashtuns and kept them deprived of representation and political rights till 1997. Due to the lack of education in FATA, most of its community is engaged in agriculture, livestock rearing, non-technical labor, and local businesses (Khan, 2017). The overall literacy rate is 33.3% which is far less than the national average (58%). Unemployment in FATA is higher than the national average and other provinces of the country. The highest rate of unemployment (10.8%) prevails in youth fall in the age bracket 15-24 years. This age group remained the main resource pool for militant recruitment in the near past. The majority of women (74.4%) are married by the age of 18 (BoS, 2015).

FATA-Development Authority was established in the year 2004 as a specialized body for prompt development in FATA. FATA-DA started imparting technical education and vocational training to both male and female youth to make them developed. From the year 2006 till 2018, FATA-DA imparted vocational training to more than 50 thousand youth in 70 different vocational trades. This study was, therefore, conducted as an evaluation study to investigate the socio-economic and political impacts of the vocational training of FATA-DA on FATA’s youth. This study is a first-ever evaluation study on the impacts of the said program. Results confirmed the limited impacts of the vocational training program of FATA-DA on the socialization and political development of FATA’s youth. However, the impacts were
significant on two parameters, i.e. “poverty reduction and life-long learning”. In a study from Portugal, it was reported that the impacts of vocational training on the social development of communities are not certain as community transformations generally take a longer time (CEDFOP, 2011).

This study adds valuable stuff to the existing literature in the sense that the vocational training program of FATA-DA has not been evaluated yet. Neither its economic contribution nor social contribution to the target group has been studied so far.

Furthermore, limited literature exists on the contribution of vocational training to the social advancement of the target community. Social development indicators taken in this study are less studied in the past. A cross-tabulation analysis was conducted to compare the outcome for treatment and control groups that may not be used in previous studies on the same topic. This study also concluded that if quality issues exist in any vocational training program, the program will not deliver its objectives well like in the case of FATA-DA vocational training.

2. Literature Review

2.1 Human Capital Theory

Schultz (1961) introduced the concept of human capital for the first time. He mentioned that human capital development is an important factor for the nation’s growth. He further stated that human capital is entrenched in individuals in the form of knowledge and skills. Human capital is closely linked with training, practical skills attainment, knowledge, and abilities that facilitate the formation of personal, economic, and social wellbeing (Garavan et al., 2001).

Vocational training and attainment of vocational skills are considered essential means of human capital development. It has both direct and indirect economic and social effects on individuals and society. Technical and vocational training is considered by experts a specific instrument for human capital development that can play a significant role in promoting socio-economic progress (Wallenborn, 2010). Vocational training result in economic gain with the impression of an increase in earnings that lead to a decline in the incidence of crimes in youth, change in fertility behavior, hinder population growth, reduce poverty and environmental pollution, etc. (Sweetland, 1996; McMahon, 1998). Vocational training and skills development have both formal and informal effects on an individual’s personal growth and development and income (Mincer, 1958).

Human capital development not only took into consideration the rate of monetary return but also consider social values and quality of life created due to investment in education and training (Bensen, 1978). Vocational training develops specific human capital by creating job-specific skills that make the workers more suitable and productive (Becker, 1975).

Vocational skill training increases productivity, innovation and growth, and bridge poverty reduction among vulnerable communities. In a study, it was found that vocational skills development improves the quality and diversity of output and improves the lives and health of marginalized rural communities by increasing their earnings (Atchoarena & Gasperini, 2003).

2.2 New Growth Theory

According to the New Growth Theory, the economy can grow well by increasing the intellectual abilities and skills of human beings rather than increasing physical capital (Cortright, 2001). New Growth Theory advocates increasing return on investment rather than decreasing return as advocated by traditional growth theories. It claims that human capital allows the economy to grow at a constant rate as it has no diminishing marginal utility (Romer, 1994). This theory postulate that increased skills and knowledge of producing more with limited resources will impact the standard of living of people positively (Grossman & Helpman, 1994).

2.3 Socio-Economic Impacts of Vocational Training

The measurement of social benefits of vocational training is much difficult than the economic benefits as
The association between human capital development and social awareness is based on a close interrelationship that results in socio-economic and political development (Grubb & Lazerson, 2005). Investment in vocational training and skills development is beneficial for individuals, society, and a nation. The return on investment for an individual is a better career path and earnings and is global competitiveness and economic development for nations and societies (Alam, 2008). Effective utilization of vocational skills training inculcates essential skills and capabilities in youth that would help them become self-confident. In a study on technical and vocational training, Akyeampong pointed out that these trainings are not important only for their economic contribution but also for their positive role in social, cultural, and political development (Akyempong, 2002).

Vocational skills development reduces the economic dependency of family members on each other. In a study, it was concluded that adult learning caused improved earnings, decreased poverty, provided health benefits and brought considerable returns for one’s children, etc. (Sabates, 2008). The association between adult learning and community welfare contents from a social capital perspective which argues that adult learning promotes an active lifestyle that helps preserve community resources (Merriam & Kee, 2014). Unemployment among youth is a major economic and social problem with consequences of skill shortages in the economy, underutilization of human capital, poverty among youth, a potential increase in drug use, and criminal behavior (Dettmann & Günther, 2013; Meager, 2009). In a study on data taken from the National Child Development Study (NCDS), it was revealed that adult learning (Vocational and Leisure Courses) has a significant positive effect on the socialization of adults. The effect was observed in social and health outcomes, i.e. reduction in the use of alcohol and smoking, increase in physical exercise, and other related measures of life satisfaction (Feinstein & Hammond, 2004).

In another study by Feinstein, the effects of higher and vocational education were found less robust on depression and obesity (Feinstein, 2002). Self-esteem, gaining self-competencies, social integration, gaining a sense of hope and purpose are direct outcomes of education that result in better health conditions and wellbeing (Hammond, 2002). Self-esteem and confidence associated with vocational courses had also been reported by Dawe (2004). In another study, Hammond mentioned that failure to succeed in learning could have long-lasting negative effects on learners (Hammond, 2004). National Centre for Vocational Education Research (NCVER) surveyed the indigenous Australians’ community and reported that 90% of the respondents had gained self-confidence and communicated better to people as a result of undertaking vocational courses (Butler et al. forthcoming).

The demands of employment for vocational training and increased skills put pressure on the individual to delay marriage and avoid parenthood at the earlier stages (Blackwell & Baynner, 2002). Durkheim (1956) wrote that developing a “sense of belonging to a larger society” should be the fundamental aim of formal (Institute based) and non-formal (Vocational) education regardless of the setting in which it emerges. Vocational education and training have immeasurable gains to a community as a whole. For instance, after controlling for one’s income, the amount of money and time devoted to charity and civic engagements respectively is directly associated with employment and earning and indirectly with job skills and training (Wolfe & Haveman, 1997).

Goel, (2010) stated that vocational skills and knowledge have a considerable effect on the social
development of any nation thus plays an essential role in the economic development of a country. It was concluded in a study that more skilled workers volunteered twice as many hours as low skilled personnel and donated 50% more to charities. This good feature of human capital development through vocational training may lead to social cohesion and integrity (Hodgkinson & Weitzman, 1998). More skilled and educated people contribute to the formation of a good society in many ways. They make conversant choices during voting, add positively to political stability and democratization, care more for human rights, and are more trusted by others (Wolfe & Haveman, 2002).

Van de Werfhorst (2016) concluded that vocational education graduates had a lower level of political interest and engagement as compared to general education graduates. He further suggested that this type of rigid differentiation of educational institutions may form a threat to democratic equality. Vocational training raises job skills and earning potential of the individual, which results in a decline in the crime rate. Crime becomes less attractive for the highly skilled and employed workforce. In a study conducted in England, it was found that the ultimate benefit from vocational education and skills training are growth in lifelong learning, increase in self-confidence, social cohesion, and active citizenship of individuals. It also results in the extension of friendship and social networks (Schuller, Brassett-Gandy, Green, Hammond & Preston, 2002). The effect of skills development on individual workers and organizations ends in an increase in social awareness that eventually leads to social development (Beach, 2009).

Vocational education and technical skills training are the most important factors for economic growth and social inclusion in a country (Nilsson, 2010). The findings of a study in Southern Punjab revealed that foreign funds play a significant role in boosting vocational training which is then a cause to alleviate individual poverty. It was also concluded that vocational training generates viable human capital for socio-economic development (Hayyat & Chughtai, 2016). In a study in Nigeria, it was supposed that the acquisition of technical and vocational skills improve the socio-economic condition of people and helps to transform men into a self-reliant and economically stable person. It helps to reduce the incidence of militancy, restlessness, kidnapping, and other social immoralities among youth (Isaac & Ph, 2014). Typical short term vocational training programs have significant effects on individual performance levels and self-confidence. However, no absolute evidence is available to determine its impacts on most social behavior, delinquency, employment, and lifestyles (Knox & Chicago, 1981).

The existing literature has shown an indirect relationship between vocational education and socio-economic wellbeing through intermediary variables, i.e. income and earnings, etc. Variation in this relationship also depends on the socio-cultural context of rural/indigenous communities as well as on the learning environment (Stanwick, Ong & Karmel, 2006). More importantly, social contact, friendship, solidarity, family concepts, sense of belonging and supportive environment, etc. are factors affecting the socialization of individuals during the training process.

2.4 Vocational Training Program of FATA-DA
FATA-DA being a specialized agency for prompt development in infrastructure and human capital, started interventions in FATA in the year 2006. Human capital development is the priority sector of FATA-DA was focused, and a huge amount of development budget (Approx. Rs. 2.8 billion) was allocated to vocational training. More than 52000 males and females in age 16-35 were trained in more than 70 different market-oriented trades. 90% of training was of six months duration each. 10% were of either three months or twelve months duration. The program focused on more than 70 different vocational trades listed in Table 1 below.
Students were recruited through open competition within agency quota and were invited through an advertisement in daily news as well as through the official website of FATA-DA. Basic eligibility criteria were candidates having FATA Domicile and fall in the age group of 16-35 years. Education requirements varied from the middle to matric in different categories. According to a report of FATA-DA Skill section, 95-96% of trainees completed their training. After 1-2 years of training completion, it was observed that 36% of trainees were engaged in any category of job, while 24% were found employed in the category of training (Relevant employment) (Ullah & Malik, 2020). An unpublished study conducted by the M&E Section of FATA-DA also showed 25-27% relevant employment for male youth of FATA after training completion.

3. Research Methodology

3.1 Study Area

The study was conducted in an extremely backward area of the country (FATA) where most of the people (73%) living under the poverty line. It is a general perception that people of FATA are socially underdeveloped that can easily be seen from their involvement in anti-state and anti-social activities. People lack vocational skills hence restricted to subsistent farming for their livelihood.

3.2 Study Population & Sample Size

The population for the treatment group was 23296 males who completed at least one course from FATA-DA from 2006 till June 2016. The population for the control group was male group age 16-35.
years from FATA who didn’t participate in the training program. The sample size of 200 each was taken from both population groups through disproportionate stratified random sampling. This type of sampling was done to avoid underrepresentation of one stratum; as both groups were of uneven nature. The sample size was selected by using the following Slovin’s formula. The use of Slovin's formula allows the researcher to sample the population with the desired degree of accuracy (Ellen, 2013).

\[
\text{Sample size (SS)} = \frac{\text{N}}{1 + \left(\frac{a}{100}\right)^2}
\]

Where N= Target population from which sample to be drawn

a = Margin of error at 95% confidence level i.e. 100%-95% = 5%

3.3 Questioner Development and Survey Administration
A well-structured questioner was developed by incorporating information on personal and family parameters and questions on social development indicators. The questioner was developed by taking help from other questioners administered in similar studies conducted earlier. The survey was given to respondents at least 02 years after the training completion. The questioners were administered directly by face to face interaction to gather information from respondents.

4. Research Design
A cross-sectional research design was used for this study. This type of research data is collected at a single point in time. The quantitative research methodology was adopted. The respondents were asked questions on social changes brought about by vocational training. Likert scale was used for data analysis in order to ensure the entire data sample is analyzed fairly. In order to compare the outcome for treatment and control groups, data were analyzed through cross-tabulation in SPSS.

5. Results and Discussion
5.1 Descriptive Statistics (Demographic Information of the Respondents)
Table 2 below summarizes the demographic differences of the treatment and the control group. Most of the respondents from both groups fall in the age group 16-20 years. Most of the respondents are unmarried. Maximum numbers of the respondents have education up to FA/FSc level. Fathers of most of the respondents in the treatment group are illiterate while in the control group, they were having primary level education. Fathers of most of the respondents were self-employed having their own businesses. Most of the respondents in both groups were belonging to families having monthly income above Pak Rs. 20,000. It was also noted that most of the families were living inside FATA. Most of the respondents from the treatment group showed their family size of 9-12 members each, while in the case of the control group, it was 6-8 members each. In both cases, maximum numbers of families were reported to have a household head other than the respondent himself. When asked about the previous job position, a maximum number of the respondents were having no job before starting the training with FATA-DA.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2 Demographic information of respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Respondent Information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age of Respondent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16-20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21-25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26-30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital Status</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unmarried</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Married</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respondents Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matric</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FA/FSc</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BA/BSc</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MA/MSc</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Father Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6. Analysis of Socio-Economic and Political Impacts of Vocational Training of FATA-DA

6.1 Poverty Reduction

The result in table 3 below shows that vocational training has significantly contributed to poverty reduction in FATA. Overall, 35% of respondents from the treatment group were found to either agree or strongly agree with the statement as compared to 18.5% from the control group. These findings are supported by Rothwell and Kazanas (2014), who stated that effective skills training leads to an increase in the performance of craftsmen, hence their wages. On the micro-level, investments in human capital formation through education and training were regarded as a means to create employment and increase earning, thereby reducing individual poverty (Tilak, 2002).

Table 3 Participation in vocational training*My poverty level has reduced (Cross tabulation)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participation in vocational training</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Disagree</td>
<td>39(19.5%)</td>
<td>28(14%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>36(18%)</td>
<td>56(28%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>55(27.5%)</td>
<td>79(39.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>47(23.5%)</td>
<td>33(16.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td>23(11.5%)</td>
<td>04 (2%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>200(100%)</td>
<td>200(100%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Pearson Chi-Square Value = 26.25 (0.000)

Source: Field Survey 2018

6.2 Life-Long Learning

Lifelong learning is defined as “all learning activity is undertaken throughout life”. Life-long learning improves health condition, increase earning and reduce poverty (Sabates, 2008). Respondents were inquired about an increase in life-long learning as a result of vocational training. The result shows a
significant improvement in the life-learning of respondents. 62% of the respondents from the treatment group were found to either agree or strongly agree with the statement as compared to 45% from the control group. These findings are supported by Schuler et al. (2002) who in his study concluded that the ultimate benefit from vocational education and skills training are growth in lifelong learning, increase in self-confidence, social cohesion, and active citizenship of individuals. These findings also supported by Wößmann (2008), who stated that TVET could improve the non-cognitive skills of low-skilled adults, which further enhance their lifetime skill acquisition and learning.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participation in vocational training</th>
<th>My life-long learning has increased (Cross tabulation)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Strongly Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>13(6.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>10(5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>23(5.8%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Pearson Chi-Square Value = 20.29 (0.000)

Source: Field Survey, 2018

6.3 Voluntary Communal Activities and Social Engagements
The respondents were asked if they were actively participating in voluntary communal activities after training completion. The result shows no significant effect of participation in vocational training in that respect. 52.5% of respondents from the treatment group were found either strongly disagree or disagree with the statement as compared to only 10.5% from the control group. 55.6% of respondents from the control group were found either agree or strongly agree as compared to 32.5% from the treatment group. These findings are inconsistent with the findings of Schuler et al. (2002) and (Wolfe & Haveman, 1997). The relationship of vocational training with social change also depends on the socio-cultural context of the indigenous communities as well as on the learning environment (Stanwick, Ong & Karmel, 2006). In the case of vocational training of FATA-DA, the non-significant effect may also be due to not suitable learning environment or due to socio-cultural issues.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participation in vocational training</th>
<th>Participation in voluntary communal and social activities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Strongly Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>28(14%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>08(4%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>36(9%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Pearson Chi-Square Value = 90.471 (0.000)

Source: Field survey, 2018

6.4 Avoiding Risky Health Behaviors
Respondents were investigated for the subject effect after completion of their training. The result showed no significant effect of vocational training of FATA-DA on building a sense of avoiding risky health behavior. 42% of the respondents from the treatment group were found either agree or strongly agree with the statement as compared to 87% from the control group. These findings are in line with the findings of Stanwick (2006), who concluded that higher level qualifications were closely associated with better health outcomes and healthy life behavior, while lower-level vocational qualifications were not. In another study by Feinstein, the effects of higher and vocational education were found less robust on depression and obesity (Feinstein, 2002).
Participation in vocational training | Disagree | Agree |
---|---|---|
Yes | 13(6.5%) | 26(13%) |
No | 04(2%) | 85(42.5%) |
Total | 17(4.2%) | 200(100%) |

**Pearson Chi-Square Value = 1.01 (0.000)**

Source: Field survey, 2017

6.5 Perception of Male Youth towards Female Education

FATA’s women had been deprived of their educational rights for ages. The male being a dominant group in FATA does not allow their female counterpart to get an education. It is evident from the existing female literacy rate in FATA, which is 3%, and drop out ratio, which is 70.6%. Positive change in perception of male toward female education was the expected outcome of the vocational training program. The result shows no significant effect of participation in vocational training. 62.5% of the respondents from the treatment group were found either agree or strongly agree with the statement as compared to 82% from the control group. On the other side, 23% of the respondents from the treatment group were found either strongly disagree or disagree as compared to 10.5% from the control group. According to Bennett (2018), general education is more effective than technical and vocational in bringing social change and awareness among the masses. Furthermore, it can be stated that the learning environment and short duration of the training would not have been enough for bringing positive change in the perception of male youth towards female education.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participation in vocational training</th>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>20(10%)</td>
<td>26(13%)</td>
<td>31(15.5%)</td>
<td>77(38.5%)</td>
<td>46(23%)</td>
<td>200(100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>18(9%)</td>
<td>03(1.5%)</td>
<td>14(7%)</td>
<td>87(43.5%)</td>
<td>78(39%)</td>
<td>200(100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>38(9.5%)</td>
<td>29(7.2%)</td>
<td>45(11.2%)</td>
<td>164(41%)</td>
<td>124(31%)</td>
<td>400(100%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Pearson Chi-Square Value = 33.63 (0.000)**

Source: Field survey, 2018

6.6 Appreciating FATA’s Women for Doing a Job

In the FATA context, in a male-dominated society, women are rarely allowed to work outside their homes. The respondents were inquired for the same reason and found that participation in vocational training of FATA has no significant effect on changing the mentality of males towards working women. 33.5% of the respondents from the treatment group were found either disagree or strongly disagree with the statement as compared to 22% from the control group. These findings are supported by Bennett (2018), who stated that vocational education is less effective in bringing social changes and awareness among the masses. Furthermore, quality training and learning environments also matter.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participation in vocational training</th>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>49(24.5%)</td>
<td>18(9%)</td>
<td>63(31.5%)</td>
<td>41(20.5%)</td>
<td>29(14.5%)</td>
<td>200(100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>26(13%)</td>
<td>18(9%)</td>
<td>45(22.5%)</td>
<td>66(33%)</td>
<td>45(22.5%)</td>
<td>200(100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>75(18.8%)</td>
<td>36(9%)</td>
<td>108(27%)</td>
<td>107(27.8)</td>
<td>74(18.5%)</td>
<td>400(100%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Pearson Chi-Square Value = 19.35 (0.000)**

Source: Field survey, 2018
6.7 Preference for an Educated Life Partner
As per the findings of Anderberg & Zhu (2010), the educated and skilled individual prefers a life partner of the same qualification and background.

The respondents were asked if they desire educated and skilled life partners and observed no significant difference between treatment and control groups. A maximum number of the respondents from both groups were found interested in having an educated and skilled life partner. These findings show social change among the youth of FATA, but again no significant role of vocational training of FATA-DA was found.

Table 9 Participation in vocational training*Preferences for educated life partner

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participation in vocational training</th>
<th>Preferences for educated life partner</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Strongly Disagree</td>
<td>Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>28(14%)</td>
<td>35(17.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>20(10%)</td>
<td>29(14.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>48(12%)</td>
<td>64(16%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Pearson Chi-Square Value = 3.755 (0.440)

Source: Field Survey, 2018

6.8 Perceptions of Family Planning
According to the economic theory of fertility II, parents desire to have less number of children with higher human capital investment. Increasing return to human capital development results in fertility decline (Pradhan, 2016). Family Planning is a vague concept in the context of FATA. Respondents were asked for any positive change if occurred due to vocational training. The result shows no significant difference between treatment and control groups.

These findings are inconsistent with the findings of Baird, Chirwa, McIntosh, & Özler, (2010); Baird, McIntosh, & Özler, (2011) and Blackwell & Baynner, (2002) but supported by Bennett (2018) who stated that vocational education is less effective in bringing social changes and awareness among masses. In the FATA context, due to the stronger influence of culture and religion; six months short duration vocational training courses may not be enough alone to change the perception of FATA’s youth towards family planning.

Table 10 Participation in vocational training* Perceptions towards bringing more children

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participation in vocational training</th>
<th>Perceptions towards bringing more children</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Strongly Disagree</td>
<td>Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>21(10.5%)</td>
<td>35(17.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>11 (5.5%)</td>
<td>36(18%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>32(8%)</td>
<td>71(17.8%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Pearson Chi-Square Value = 5.683 (0.224)

Source: Field Survey, 2018

6.9 Self-confidence and Sense of Responsibility
As employees undergo skill training, their confidence level increases, and their value can also be confirmed (Noe, Hollenbeck, Gerhart & Wright, 2014). The respondents were asked if they had built self-confidence and a sense of responsibility after participation in the vocational training of FATA-DA. The result shows no significant effect of the said training on the treatment group. 85% of the respondents from the control group were found either agree or strongly agree with the statement as compared to 73% from the treatment group.

Typical short term vocational training courses have significant effects on individual performance levels
and self-confidence (Knox & Chicago, 1981). In the case of FATA’s youth, respondents from the control group didn’t participate in vocational training, but they might have continued their general education that may have resulted in building more confidence and a sense of responsibility as compared to vocational training graduates.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participation in vocational training*</th>
<th>Feeling self-confidence and sense of responsibility</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Strongly Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>9(4.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>05(2.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>32(8%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Pearson Chi-Square Value = 16.70 (0.002)

Source: Field survey, 2018

6.10 Financial Support of the Needy People
Alms and charitable giving is an indirect beneficial effect of vocational training (McMahon, 1998). The respondents were inquired if they have developed such type of kind behavior after participation in the vocational training of FATA-DA.

The result shows no significant effect. Less number of the respondents from the treatment group, i.e. 45.5% were found either agree or strongly agree with the statement as compared to respondents from the control group (87%). These findings are in contrast to the findings of Wolfe & Haveman, (1997). 64% of graduates of the training program were still unemployed (Ullah & Malik, 2019). An unpublished report of the M&E Section of FATA-DA showed 73-75% unemployment among graduates of the vocational training program of FATA-DA.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participation in vocational training*</th>
<th>Financial support of needy people in the community</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Strongly Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>13(6.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>03(1.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>16(4%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Pearson Chi-Square Value = 88.059 (.000)

Source: Field Survey, 2018

6.11 Participation in Politics
People of FATA due to certain discriminatory policies of government remained deprived and unaware of their political rights in the past. The respondents were asked about their political participation after training completion.

The result shows no significant contribution in this area. 62.5% of respondents from the treatment group were found either agree or strongly agree as compared to 79.5% from the control group. These findings are supported by the study of Van de Werfhorst (2016), where he concluded that vocational education graduates had a lower level of political interest and engagement as compared to general education graduates.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participation in vocational training*</th>
<th>Participation in political engagements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Participation in political engagements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6.12 Favor of Participation of FATA's Women in Politics

FATA’s society remained male-dominated; therefore, women are not allowed to participate in activities other than agricultural activities and household chores. The respondents were asked for a change in their perception of women’s participation in political activities.

No positive impact was observed. Less number of individuals (41%) from the treatment group was found either agree or strongly agree with the statement as compared to the control group (70.5%). Vocational skills development has a significant effect on the socialization of the youth community (Managing Vocational Training Systems: A Handbook for Senior Administrators, 2001) but here may be due to quality issues the training didn’t show its effect.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participation in vocational training</th>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>16(8%)</td>
<td>24(12%)</td>
<td>35(17.5%)</td>
<td>88(44%)</td>
<td>37(18.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>10(5%)</td>
<td>06(3%)</td>
<td>25(12.5%)</td>
<td>100(50%)</td>
<td>59(29.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>26(6.5%)</td>
<td>30(7.5%)</td>
<td>60(15%)</td>
<td>188(44%)</td>
<td>96(24%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Pearson Chi-Square Value = 19.659 (0.001)

Source: Field survey, 2018

6.13 Perception towards FATA’s Merger with Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) Province

For the last few years, FATA’s merger with Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province was the government's first priority. With the merger, it was expected that a change would occur in the tradition, economy, politics, and socio-economic development of FATA.

A significant number of well-known elders and associations have strongly rejected the idea of merging FATA with KP with the view that it will replace one corrupt system in the shape of a political agent with a more corrupt system in the form of police and judiciary (Qazi, Qazi & Bashir, 2018). Respondents were asked about their concern about FATA’s merger with KP province. The result shows 65% of the respondents from the treatment group were found either agree or strongly agree as compared to 75% from the control group. No significant effect of the vocational training of FATA-DA was observed. Taking the merger, a political issue, these findings are again supported by the study of Van de Werfhorst (2016).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participation in vocational training</th>
<th>Favor of FATA merger with KP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Strongly Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>20(10%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>25(12.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>45(11.2%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Pearson Chi-Square Value = 18.223 (0.001)
7. Conclusion
This study concluded with the findings that vocational training of FATA-DA has limited impact on the social development of FATA’s youth. Among 13 indicators of social change and development that were focused on in this study, the positive impact was observed only on 02 indicators, i.e. reduction in poverty level and an increase in lifelong learning.

Same responses were observed for both the treatment and control group on 02 indicators, i.e. preference for an educated life partner and family planning. On 09 indicators of social change, i.e. participation in voluntary communal activities, avoiding healthy risky behavior, perception towards the education of female, appreciating women for doing jobs, self-confidence and sense of responsibility, financial support of poor people, political participation, the favor of the participation of women in politics and perception regarding FATA’s merger in KP province, the impact of vocational training of FATA-DA recorded were recorded not significant.

Literature is deficient in studies focusing on the social impacts of vocational training. Most of the studies have focused on the social impacts of general and higher education. Few studies showed, i.e. studies conducted by Knox & Chicago (1981) and Van de Werfhorst (2016) etc. reported limited social impacts of short-term vocational training.

As far as the FATA-DA vocational training is concerned; the researcher in another study on vocational training of FATA-DA recorded that only 24% of training graduates got relevant employment after training completion. As evident from the literature that the social impacts of vocational training up to a maximum extent are indirect and depend on intermediary variables, i.e. income and employment, etc.

Less employment and minimum earning may have the leading causes of limited social impacts in this case. It is recommended that quality parameters should be focused for maximum outcome. A course on ethics, social and behavioral studies may also be included in the vocational training curriculum. It is also recommended that the same study may be replicated again with bigger sample size.

8. Acknowledgement
The authors acknowledge the support of FATA-DA Officials in the provision of data and FATA’s youth for their participation in the survey.

Funding Source
There are no funding sources for this research.

Competing Interest
The authors declare no competing interest.

Literature Cited
Beach, J. M. (2009). A critique of human capital formation in the US and the economic returns to sub-
baccalaureate credentials. *Educational Studies, 45*(1), 24-38.


Center for the Assessment of Alternatives to Juvenile Justice Processing, University of Chicago, School of Social Service Administration.


Social Media Marketing and Committed Customer: Analyzing the Underlying Role of Customer Commitment in Developing Country Context

Hafiz Muhammad Usman Khizar, Rana Muhammad Shahid Yaqub, Tasawar Javed, Shanayyara Mahmood

Institute of Business Management and Administrative Sciences (IBM&AS), The Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Pakistan, Usman.khizar@iub.edu.pk

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

This study aims at finding the effect of “Traditional Media Marketing”, “Social Media marketing”, and “Word of Mouth” on the customers’ “Intention to Purchase” (ITP) through their Commitment to specific Mobile phone brand Samsung mobile in Pakistan. The data was collected by using quantitative approach specifically from those professional accountants who were using Samsung mobile brand through simple random sampling technique. Total 450 questionnaires were distributed while 390 were returned as entirely filled generating a response rate of 86%. Data was analyzed using software SPSS 24 and AMOS 25, by performing structural equation modelling, confirmatory factor analysis, correlation, and regression and mediation tests. Barron and Kenny test was applied to analyze that whether the mediation is full or partial. Results explain that Traditional Media Marketing, Social Media Marketing, and Word of Mouth has a significant positive impact on Intention to Purchase. Similarly results demonstrate that Customer Commitment has a significant positive impact on Intention to Purchase. Finally, Customer Commitment (CC) mediates the relationship among the Traditional Media Marketing (TMM), Social Media Marketing (SMM), Word of Mouth (WOM) and Intention to Purchase (ITP). It is also concluded that there exists a partial mediation between the SMM, TMM and ITP. Further it is analyzed that there is no mediation among the WOM and ITP. This study focused on Pakistan due to some limitations while there were budgetary limitation and time constraints.

© 2020 Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: Usman.khizar@iub.edu.pk


1. Introduction
Technological revolution has risen at an extraordinary rate during the past few years, particularly in case of online and traditional media (Duffett, 2015). The internet based technologies have redefined the skills of interacting to consumers by providing an access to opportunities in marketplace regarding social networking websites, wikis, blogs and product review sites (Ajina, 2019). Previous studies proposed that in 2012, 500 famous companies used social media and 73 percent of these firms had an official company account in Twitter however 66 percent businesses had Facebook pages further in 2011, 28 percent of these firms had blogs (Barnes, Lescault, & Andonian, 2012). The usage of social media (Facebook, YouTube, Instagram, Twitter, and LinkedIn) has increased among customers. As specified by the Nielsen Company (2012), customers pass more time on social media instead any other set of sites with an average of 121.18 min per day in 2012, which denotes an increase of 37% with respect to the previous year. This trend has encouraged scholars to recognize how to use social media to effect customer preferences, purchase decisions, and word of mouth (Arora & Sanni, 2019).

Social media refers to “a group of Internet-based applications that builds on the ideological and technological foundations of Web 2.0 and that allows the creation and exchange of user generated content” (Cheung, Pires, & Rosenberger, 2020). Social Media is becoming an important part of marketing communications platform because it’s communicating features assist collaborative participating, and knowledge-sharing activities (Moslehpor, Dadvari, Nugroho, & Do, 2020). Without the virtual world the company would struggle to confirm its stability. Social Media arise as the most powerful media for promotion across the world. Businesses are shifting a more pie of their promotion budgets towards social media to better reach consumers (Saxena & Khanna, 2013). Social media is an advancement and innovation in traditional media, a marketing instrument that alert the users about brands and products, including newspapers, print ads, newsletters, television advertisements and billboards. Further, Mulhern (2009) found that traditional media covers the market in short term and hit the customer choices precisely. Abzari, Ghassemi, & Vosta (2014) proposed that social media differs from traditional media through a change from the desk top to the web. Besides these two marketing channels, there is a non-noticeable channel called Word of Mouth (WOM), that is a communication procedure among customers regarding famous companies, their products, features, new ideas and services (Zhou et al., 1997). These three marketing channels permits the marketers to share and exchange the information with the consumers (Thackeray, Neiger, Hanson, & McKenzie, 2008). Consequently customers show the intention to purchase that specific product and make purchases according to their budget plans and within a specific span of time. Once a customer make purchase of that specific brand, there is a possibility that he may become committed and loyal to that company due to their psychological attachment referring this relation as customer commitment (Dimitriades, 2006).

The objective of this research work is to study the relationship between (SMM, WOM, and TMM) and ITP in Pakistan with a particular focus on the direct and mediating impacts of CC on ITP. The three variables (SMM, WOM, and TMM) are of particular significance due to their importance to Pakistani marketing managers. The results of this research confirm the mediating role of CC in enhancing the effects of TMM, SMM and WOM on ITP. The findings also show a positive relationship among each of the variables (i.e., TMM, SMM and WOM) and ITP. SMM is not only about promotion or product but it also is a network for well communication with consumers. The benefits obtain from social media marketing is the fast consumer feedback. The repeated customer reaction obtains not only benefits the brand but also gives a better understanding of the targeted audience. The contribution of this study to the SMM literature is twofold. Previous study suggested that SMM in cooperation with WOM, TMM, and its impact on ITP was not studied in Pakistan. This research will also contribute to the future literature in a way that CC play a mediating role in marketing channels. Social media (SM) is a new thought for the advertisement and least studied in Pakistan.

The rest of the paper is arranged as follows; Section two discusses previous literature and develops the hypotheses. Section three presents methodology. Section four describes the results. Section five concludes the study.

2. Theoretical Framework and Hypotheses Development
2.1 Intention to Purchase (ITP)
The decision to purchase products and service in future is known as consumer intention to purchase. The willingness of a consumer to buying a specific brands and specific products is identified as ITP (Martins, Costa, Oliveira, Gonçalves, & Branco, 2019). Researcher explain that cost of retentive present buyer is fewer than searching of new buyers (Spreng, Harrell, & Mckoy, 1995). ITP is more important for the firm’s. Customer purchase Intention effect by the customer satisfaction (Rattanareuthai, 2006). Customers purchase intention changed by social communities (Xu, Zhang, & Xue, 2013). Some authors describe that service quality and consumer loyalty also effect the purchase intention (Hellier, Gerssen, Carr, & Rickard, 2003). Previous study explain that customer satisfaction and purchase intention have significant relationship. Companies satisfied their buyers and focus on purchase intention (Yi & Zenithal, 1990). Literature show that WOM also influence purchase intention (Erkan & Evans, 2016). Previous study recommended that there occurs positive relationship among the SMM and ITP.

2.2 Social Media Marketing (SMM) and ITP
Social media marketing is an electronic communication process. By the social media customers makes social groups and share their messages, thoughts and videos (Lester, Serkedakis, & Tudor, 2016). Social media as the “means for production, consumption and exchange of information” by online social connections and platforms that have value for an organization's stakeholder (Jacobson, Gruzd, & Hernández-García, 2020). Social media as the “group of applications that is based on internet that allow the formation and exchange of user created content” (Kaplan & Haenlein, 2010). SMM provides platform by which customer communicate, like as conversation forums, wikis, blogs, social networks and multi-media sites, most of the famous Facebook, Twitter, Flicker, Myspace, Linked in and You Tube (Bradley & Bartlett, 2011). Social media updates the party-political condition and day to day activity via the Facebook and Twitter thus the costumer purchase intention has increased (Aad et al., 2012) . Some researcher explain that Social Media updates the fitness info. People reply positive on social media bulletin instead of newscast media (Lehmann, Ruiter, & Kok, 2013). Previous studies shows that there is Social Media Marketing and Intention to Purchase are positively related. Social Media Marketing changes the consumers’ behavior that impact the customer intention to purchase. If the consumer behavior changed in a positive way then the consumer purchasing intention also enhanced (An et al., 2012). SMM play a significant role in many businesses. The success and failure of companies is based on customer feedback connected decision making of the business. For example, if a negative word of mouth for a brand or service of the stock is forwarded on ‘Twitter or Facebook’ numerous consumers will immediately follow and even distribute these comments. This could in time become a big issue which negatively effects upcoming business (Ramanathan et al., 2017). Social media marketing has improved the mode that organizations attract and hold potential customers. Due to easy availability of internet, consumer feel free to generate and share information related to the products and services on social media to make value (Tiruwa et al., 2016).

According to Ramanathan et al., (2017) customer purchasing behavior has dramatically changed due to social media marketing . This has really changed in the purchasing behavior of seller and buyer where the majority of SMM and e-commerce has providing contemporary purchaser with a greater platform of buying options. SMM may become a valued addition for the brand advertisement if worked properly as it has a worldwide influence and wide spread of usage at both national and international level (McClure & Sock, 2020).

H1a: SMM has a significant effect on ITP.

2.3 Traditional Media Marketing (TMM) and ITP
In Traditional Media Marketing, consumers are attracted and informed about the products, services and offers of the seller through the conventional media channels as Radio, TV ads, Print media, Mail and Newspaper. TMM is a marketing instrument that alert the consumers about products (Sillanpää, 2020). Traditional media includes newspapers, print ads, newsletters, television advertisements and billboards. TMM cover the market in short term and hit the customer choices (Mulhern, 2009). Arndt (1967) described the connection among the business and their consumers. The transactional theory describes the response of the customers that is changed by the TMM. TMM connect with the customers and keep them for long term.
Yoo et al. (2000) explain the marketing channels have positive effect on brand loyalty, brand value, brand equity and brand awareness. However previous research work on the relationship among the brand and the marketing tools has emphasis on TMM. Trusov et al. (2009) explain the relationship among the WOM and TMM. The author explains the impact of TMM tools on the growth of followers in a social media. Previous research show that word of mouth (WOM) effects positively on followers’ growth rate and they have long term relationship as compared to TMM. Stephen and Galak (2009) observed the impact of SMM “such as weblogs” and TMM “such as television” on sales. According to Tümer, Aghaei, Öney, & Eddine (2019) TMM have positive impact on marketing performance of businesses. Although they thought that the impact of TMM is greater and stronger than SMM. Tümer, Aghaei, Öney, & Eddine (2019) conclude that there was positive relation between the traditional media marketing and customer intention to purchase.

H1b: TMM has a significant effect on ITP.

2.4 Word of Mouth (WOM) and ITP

Word of Mouth is a one to one method among the consumers that share information about the products characteristic (Nininen, Buhalis, & March, 2007). WOM has two persons one is sender other person is receiver, sender share the relevant information about the brands, companies, ideas and characteristic of brands (Buhalis, & March, 2007). WOM is very honest type of marketing in which more than two consumers converse their views related to the goods and services of any company (Iwane et al., 2004). WOM has significant positive effect on customer purchase intention (Bansal & Voyer, 2000). WOM effects positively on consumer mind, hence the sale of a business increased. WOM effect the purchasing intention so strong and positive word of mouth increased the business sale and firm earn high profit (Alrwashdeh, Emeagwali, & Aljuhmani, 2019). Research Explain that there exists a good relation among the word of mouth and ITP (Reyes-Menendez, Saura, & Martinez-Navalon, 2019). A profitable company have a good WOM stimulates the pushing power of customer (McGriff, 2012). WOM is a type of promotion that retain the new consumers. Through the good WOM companies transfer their information about the new products, new business, and new facilities and sustain their customer for long duration so the WOM enhance the purchase intention (Jansen, Zhang, Sobel, & Chowdury, 2009). “Theory of reasoned action” (TRA) support the Word of Mouth concept. TRA theory explained in the previous study which indicate that WOM and ITP are highly correlated (Fishbein & Ajzen, 1977).

H1c: There is a positive relationship between Word of Mouth (WOM) and Intention to Purchase (ITP).

2.5 Direct and Mediating Effect of Customer Commitment (CC) on ITP

Customer Commitment is an innovative idea in which consumers have strong relationship with brands, services. Customers attach emotionally with the, products, services and keep the long term relation (Khan, Hollebeek, Fatma, Islam, & Riivits-Arkonsuo, 2020). CC is a continuous practice in which consumer prefer and sustain the long-term company relationship (Hunt & Vasquez-Parraga, 1993). Research identify that customers sacrificing their short term needs and maintain the long term relationship (Morgan & Hunt, 1994). CC enhance the trust and consumer loyalty (Aad et al., 2010). CC can’t be destroyed because consumers are faithful and become important element of the business achievement. Committed buyers get many advantages from the business in the form of special care and deductions.

Most researcher agree that establishing long term relationship with customers makes positive return to companies (Reichheld,1993, 1996), thus the customer commitment become a key marketing success. Geyskens et al. (1996) defined as customer commitment is long term relationship rather than terminate relationship. Literature proposed two wide components of commitment: “affective commitment and calculative or continuance commitment” (Kaur and Soch, 2012; Davis-Sramek et al., 2009; Evanschitzky et al., 2006; Fullerton, 2003). Regarding to Fullerton (2003), affective commitment shows customer identify and feel the positive attachment with products and services. Commitment can be a cause of maintainable competitive benefit to a firm because it offers positive word-of-mouth, cost reduction, enhanced profits, and the prospect of sales at a premium price (Hur et al., 2010).
Poushneh & Vasquez-Parraga, (2019) argue that customer commitment is a strong predictor of different metrics connected to customer retention, staying intention like switching and intention to purchase. Therefore most researcher agree that establishing long term relationship with customers makes positive return to companies and have positive relation with customer intention to purchase (Poushneh & Vasquez-Parraga, 2019). The “commitment–trust theory” of relationship marketing supports the Customer Commitment (Morgan and Hunt 1994). “The commitment-trust theory of states that two vital components, duty and trust, must occur for success of a company”. Morgan and Hunt (1994) discuss that commitment improves when a firm “joins to relationships by keeping high values of corporate values and associating oneself with exchange partners having similar standards.

H2: There is a positive relationship between CC and ITP.

With this, previous research explain that customer commitment (cc) mediates the relationship among SMM and ITP. According to (Khodabandeh & Lindh, 2020) social media marketing change the customers buying behavior and customers commitment mediate the relationship between SMM and ITP.

H3a: CC mediates the relationship among SMM and ITP.

Traditional Media Marketing is the use of conventional media channels as Radio, TV, Newspaper, Print media and others to attract and inform the target market. Customer commitment have positive impact on customer intention to purchase and mediate the relationship among TMM and ITP (Tümer et al., 2019)

H3b: CC mediates the relationship among TMM and ITP.

WOM is a one to one method among the consumers that share information about the products characteristic (Niininen, Buhalis, & March, 2007). Some researcher explain that there is strong and mediating effect among the CC, WOM and ITP (Mahadin & Akroush, 2019)

H3c: CC mediates the relationship among WOM and ITP.

Figure 1 shows the conceptual model in which TMM, SMM, WOM are independent Variables, ITP is dependent Variable and Customer Commitment is mediating Variable.
3. Research Methodology

This study observes the impact of SMM, Word of Mouth and TM on ITP. In this research work CC mediates the relationship among the (SMM, WOM, TMM), and ITP. Convenience sampling method was used for data collection. Population was customers of Samsung Company in Pakistan and various audit firms were study randomly to collect the data. Quantitative research was conducted among 450 respondents through Self-administered structured questionnaires in Pakistan. In total 390 valid questionnaires having response rate of 86% were included in the data analysis. The survey was pre-tested and reviewed. The questionnaire consisted of five portions covering the following matters: 1: Social Media (Tsiros, Mittal, & Ross, 2004), 2: Tradition Media (Tsiros, Mittal, & Ross, 2004), 3: Word of Mouth (Groeger & Buttle, 2014), 4: Purchase Intention (Jalilvand, Samiei, Dini, &Manzari, 2012) and 5: Customer Commitment (Bettencourt, 1997).

Furthermore, AMOS and SPSS software were used for analysis of data. Model fitness was tested by using (CFA) Confirmatory Factor Analysis and (SEM), Structural Equation Modelling by the criteria proposed by Hu & Bentler (1999). Barron and Kenny mediation test was applied to check the mediation among the constructs.

4. Data Analysis and Results

4.1 Descriptive Statistics, Correlation and Regression Analysis

Table 1 depicts the chronbach’s alpha reliability values for all the variables as TM has .785, SM has .725, WOM as .819 Customer Commitment has .759 and Customer Purchase Intention having reliability value of .704 which is acceptable for the data analysis. Further Standard Deviation and Mean Values for TM, SM, WOM, CC and ITP are (0.48821, 3.354), (0.42223, 3.744), (0.48821, 3.661), (0.4378, 3.452), (0.4677, 3.55) respectively. Moreover, Correlation Analysis was used to analyze the relationship between variables, as Traditional Media and Social Media has positive correlation with the value (.153**) which explains if Traditional Media works in a positive way then the Social Media also capture the customers. Similarly, Traditional Media and Word of Mouth also have positive correlation with the value (.272**) which mean that if the Word of Mouth have positive impact on customers then the sales increased. The overall correlation analysis explain that the relationship among the all variables have positive effects with the values (.422**, .325**, .510**, .298**, .322**, .407**, .523**, .543**) which means that Customer Purchase Intention has increased if the Marketing Media works in a positive way. Regression analysis was applied to test the effect as Traditional Media impacts the Intention to purchase of customer with the value of $R = .325$, $R^2 = .105$, $\beta = .325$ and P value =.000 expressive the significance of the effect. Similarly, regression values for the impact of Social Media on Intention to Purchase are $R = .322$, $R^2 = .103$, Beta Value = .322 and P value =.000 showing the significance of this impact. Similarly, the effect of WOM on Customer Purchase Intention has significant effect as the P-value < 0.05, $R = .523$, $R^2 = .274$ and the Beta Value = .523. Results also explain that the impact of CC on ITP as the P-value < 0.05 $R = .543$, $R^2 = .295$ and the $\beta = .553$.

Table 1. Descriptive Statistics, Correlation and Regression Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Reliability</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>TMM</th>
<th>SMM</th>
<th>WOM</th>
<th>CC</th>
<th>ITP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TMM</td>
<td>.785</td>
<td>.3534</td>
<td>0.48821</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMM</td>
<td>.725</td>
<td>3.744</td>
<td>0.42223</td>
<td>.153**</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WOM</td>
<td>.819</td>
<td>3.661</td>
<td>0.48821</td>
<td>.272**</td>
<td>.510**</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CC</td>
<td>.759</td>
<td>3.452</td>
<td>0.4378</td>
<td>.422**</td>
<td>.298**</td>
<td>.407**</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITP</td>
<td>.704</td>
<td>3.55</td>
<td>0.4677</td>
<td>.325**</td>
<td>.322**</td>
<td>.523**</td>
<td>.543**</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

"Regression Analysis"

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Direct Effect</th>
<th>&quot;R&quot;</th>
<th>&quot;R2&quot;</th>
<th>&quot;Beta Value&quot;</th>
<th>&quot;P Value&quot;</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TMM $\rightarrow$ ITP</td>
<td>.325</td>
<td>.105</td>
<td>.325</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMM $\rightarrow$ ITP</td>
<td>.322</td>
<td>.103</td>
<td>.322</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WOM $\rightarrow$ ITP</td>
<td>.523</td>
<td>.274</td>
<td>.523</td>
<td>.002</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.2 Confirmatory Factor Analysis

4.2.1 Measurement Model A

Measurement Model A explains that there are 3 latent variables in the circle, constituting SMM, Customer Commitment, and Word of Mouth that are expressed by 19 observed variables in squares, further the single-headed arrow showed the tendency of proposed causal impact and covariance among two latent variables demonstrated by double-headed arrows.

Table 2. Standardized Regression Weights of Measurement Model A

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Latent Variable</th>
<th>Item Label</th>
<th>Standardized Factor Loading</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Social Media Marketing</td>
<td>SMM4</td>
<td>0.668</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SMM5</td>
<td>0.451</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SMM6</td>
<td>0.549</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SMM7</td>
<td>0.642</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SMM8</td>
<td>0.619</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SMM9</td>
<td>0.795</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SMM10</td>
<td>0.657</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SMM11</td>
<td>0.611</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SMM12</td>
<td>0.806</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SMM13</td>
<td>0.622</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SMM14</td>
<td>0.809</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customer Commitment</td>
<td>CC39</td>
<td>0.437</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CC38</td>
<td>0.578</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CC37</td>
<td>0.442</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CC36</td>
<td>0.730</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CC35</td>
<td>0.801</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intention to Purchase (ITP)</td>
<td>ITP42</td>
<td>0.715</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ITP41</td>
<td>0.722</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ITP40</td>
<td>0.527</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2.0 explains that latent variables caused the observed variables which are shown by single-headed arrows towards the unobserved pointing away from the circle as shown by the values of elements of Social Media Marketing constituting SMM4 (0.668), SMM5 (0.451), SMM6 (0.549), SMM7 (0.642), SMM8 (0.619), SMM9 (0.795), SMM10 (0.657), SMM11 (0.611), SMM12 (0.806), SMM13 (0.622) and SMM14 (0.809), similarly values of elements of Customer Commitment as CC39 (0.437), CC38 (0.578), CC37 (0.442), CC36 (0.730) and CC35 (0.801), and finally the values of elements of Intention to Purchase as ITP42 (0.715), ITP41 (0.722) and ITP40 (0.527).
4.2.2 Model Fitness Evaluation
The data was analyzed with the help of AMOS as it provides a set of indices to analyze where data confirmed the hypothesized model or not, further it demonstrates the level to which these constructs correlate with each other as the model estimates. In this study, some indices were used to test model fitness constituting (RMSEA) Route Mean Square Error of Approximation, (CFI) Comparative fit indices, (GFI) Goodness of Fit Index, (AGFI) Adjusted Goodness of Fit Index and (CMIN/DF) Minimum Discrepancy divided by Degrees of Freedom.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model Indices</th>
<th>Fitness</th>
<th>X²</th>
<th>RMSEA</th>
<th>RMR</th>
<th>AGFI</th>
<th>GFI</th>
<th>CFI</th>
<th>CMIN/DF</th>
<th>PCLOSE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Measurement</td>
<td></td>
<td>390</td>
<td>0.056</td>
<td>0.046</td>
<td>0.837</td>
<td>0.878</td>
<td>0.846</td>
<td>2.663</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3.0 explains the model fitness summary by demonstrating that all the values are according to model fitness indices and model accepted as a good fit with the support of RMSEA (0.056), RMR (0.046), AGFI (0.837), GFI (0.878), CFI (0.846), CMIN/DF (2.663) and PCLOSE (0.000).

4.2.3 Structural Equation Model A1
Structural Equation Modelling demonstrates the testing of complex association between unobserved & observed variables, further relationship between two or more latent variables are also examined in it (Danish, Shahid, Humayon, & Nawaz, 2015) and overall model fitness is also tested by investigating whether exact paths are significant or not.
Table 4. Model A1 Fitness Summary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model Indices</th>
<th>PCLOSE</th>
<th>RMSEA</th>
<th>RMR</th>
<th>AGFI</th>
<th>GFI</th>
<th>CFI</th>
<th>CMIN/DF</th>
<th>X²</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Measurement</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.093</td>
<td>0.056</td>
<td>0.844</td>
<td>0.901</td>
<td>0.941</td>
<td>3.533</td>
<td>390</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.0 explains the model fitness summary for Structural Equation Model as the values of PCLOSE (0.000), RMSEA (0.09), RMR (0.05), AGFI (0.84), GFI (0.94), and CMIN/DF (3.53) are according to the benchmarked indices showing model fitness.

Table 5. Standardized Regression Weights of Model A1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Estimates</th>
<th>Estimates</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Customer Commitment ← Social Media Marketing</td>
<td>0.432</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intention to Purchase ITP ← Customer Commitment</td>
<td>0.529</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intention to Purchase ITP ← Social Media Marketing</td>
<td>0.411</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.0 shows the standardized regression weights of association of different variables such as Customer Commitment to Social Media (0.432), Intention to Purchase and Customer Commitment (0.529) and Intention to purchase to social media (0.411), these results demonstrate the significant association among variables as regression weights of relationships exceeds 0.

4.2.4 Measurement Model B

Measurement Model B explains that are 3 latent variables in circle, constituting Word of Mouth, CC and ITP that are expressed by 27 observed variables in squares.

Table 6. Standardized Regression Weights of Measurement Model B

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Latent Variable</th>
<th>Item Label</th>
<th>Standardized Factor Loading</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Word of Mouth</td>
<td>WOM34</td>
<td>0.677</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>WOM33</td>
<td>0.441</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>WOM32</td>
<td>0.559</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>WOM31</td>
<td>0.664</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>WOM30</td>
<td>0.691</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>WOM29</td>
<td>0.789</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>WOM28</td>
<td>0.667</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>WOM27</td>
<td>0.621</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>WOM26</td>
<td>0.860</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>WOM25</td>
<td>0.623</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>WOM24</td>
<td>0.890</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>WOM23</td>
<td>0.447</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 6.0 explains that latent variables caused the observed variables which are show by single headed arrows towards the unobserved pointing away from the circle as shown by the values of elements of Word of Mouth constituting WOM34 (0.677), WOM33 (0.441), WOM32 (0.559), WOM31 (0.664), WOM30 (0.691), WOM29 (0.789), WOM28 (0.667), WOM27 (0.621), WOM26 (0.860), WOM25 (0.623), WOM24 (0.890), WOM23 (0.447), WOM22 (0.567), WOM21 (0.452), WOM20 (0.740), WOM19 (0.810), WOM18 (0.751), WOM17 (0.721), WOM16 (0.572). Similarly values of elements of Customer Commitment as CC39 (0.587), CC38 (0.424), CC37 (0.703), CC36 (0.810) and CC35 (0.751), and finally the values of element of Intention to Purchase as ITP42 (0.724), ITP41 (0.572) and ITP40 (0.711).

Figure 4. Measurement Model B

Table 7. Model B Fitness Summary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model Indices</th>
<th>Fitness</th>
<th>PCLOSE</th>
<th>RMSEA</th>
<th>RMR</th>
<th>AGFI</th>
<th>GFI</th>
<th>CFI</th>
<th>CMIN/D F</th>
<th>X^2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Measurement</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.092</td>
<td>0.057</td>
<td>0.834</td>
<td>0.900</td>
<td>0.932</td>
<td>2.763</td>
<td>390</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7.0 explains the model fitness summary regarding confirmatory factor analysis by demonstrating
that all the values are according to model fitness indices and model accepted as a good fit with the support of RMSEA (0.092), RMR (0.057), AGFI (0.834), GFI (0.900), CFI (0.932), CMIN/DF (2.763) and PCLOSE (0.000).

a) Structural Equation Model B1

Table 8. Model B1 Fitness Summary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Fitness</th>
<th>PCLOSE</th>
<th>RMSEA</th>
<th>RMR</th>
<th>AGFI</th>
<th>GFI</th>
<th>CFI</th>
<th>CMIN/DF</th>
<th>X^2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Measurement</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.065</td>
<td>0.063</td>
<td>0.856</td>
<td>0.890</td>
<td>0.801</td>
<td>2.620</td>
<td>390</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8.0 explains the model fitness summary regarding structural equation model by demonstrating that all the values are according to model fitness indices and model accepted as a good fit with the support of RMSEA (0.065), RMR (0.063), AGFI (0.856), GFI (0.890), CFI (0.801), CMIN/DF (2.620) and PCLOSE (0.000).

Table 9. Standardized Regression Weights of Model B1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Estimates</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Customer Commitment ← Word of Mouth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intention to Purchase ← Customer Commitment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intention to Purchase ← Word of Mouth</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 9.0 shows the standardized regression weights of association of different variables such as Customer Commitment to Word of Mouth (0.421), Intention to Purchase with Customer Commitment (0.530) and Intention to Purchase to Word of Mouth (0.412), further these results demonstrate the significant association among variables as regression weights of relationships exceed 0.

4.2.5 Measurement Model C

Table 10. Standardized Regression Weights of Measurement Model C

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>“Standardized Regression Weights”</th>
<th>“Latent Variable”</th>
<th>“Item Label”</th>
<th>“Standardized Factor Loading”</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Traditional Media (TM)</td>
<td>TMM1</td>
<td>0.790</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TMM2</td>
<td>0.890</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Measurement Model C explains that are 3 latent variables in circle, constituting SM, Customer Commitment and Word of Mouth that are expressed by 11 observed variables in squares, further the single headed arrow showed the tendency of proposed causal impact and co variance among two latent variables demonstrated by double headed arrows as shown by the values such as TMM1 (0.790), TMM2 (0.890), TMM3 (0.791), CC39 (0.791), CC38 (0.592), CC37 (0.597), CC36 (0.494), CC35 (0.713), ITP42 (0.820), ITP41 (0.761) and ITP40 (0.671).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Fitness</th>
<th>PCLOSE</th>
<th>RMSEA</th>
<th>RMR</th>
<th>AGFI</th>
<th>GFI</th>
<th>CFI</th>
<th>CMIN/DF</th>
<th>X²</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Measurement</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.066</td>
<td>0.064</td>
<td>0.854</td>
<td>0.889</td>
<td>0.803</td>
<td>2.624</td>
<td>390</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 11.0 explains the model fitness summary regarding confirmatory factor analysis of measurement model by demonstrating that all the values are according to model fitness indices and model accepted as a good fit with the help of RMSEA (0.066), RMR (0.064), AGFI (0.854), GFI (0.889), CFI (0.803), CMIN/DF (2.624) and PCLOSE (0.000).
Table 12. Model Fitness Summary of Model C1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model Indices</th>
<th>PCLOSE</th>
<th>RMSEA</th>
<th>RMR</th>
<th>AGFI</th>
<th>GFI</th>
<th>CFI</th>
<th>CMIN/DF</th>
<th>X²</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Measurement</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.064</td>
<td>0.067</td>
<td>0.857</td>
<td>0.888</td>
<td>0.801</td>
<td>2.626</td>
<td>390</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 12.0 explains the model fitness summary regarding confirmatory factor analysis of measurement model C by demonstrating that all the values are according to model fitness indices and model accepted as a good fit with the support of RMSEA (0.064), RMR (0.067), AGFI (0.857), GFI (0.888), CFI (0.801), CMIN/DF (2.626) and PCLOSE (0.000).

Table 13. Standardized Regression Weights of Model C1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Estimates</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Customer Commitment ← Traditional Media 0.423</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intention to Purchase ← Customer Commitment 0.533</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intention to Purchase ← Traditional Media 0.413</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 13.0 shows the standardized regression weights of association of different variables such as Customer Commitment to Traditional Media (0.423), Intention to Purchase with Customer Commitment (0.533) and Intention to Purchase to Traditional Media (0.413), further these results demonstrate the significant association among variables as regression weights of relationships exceeds 0.

4.3. Mediation Analysis by Barron and Kenny

Table 14. Mediation Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Models</th>
<th>Direct Effect</th>
<th>Indirect Effect</th>
<th>Mediation Effect</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Model I</td>
<td>SMM----CC----ITP</td>
<td>Significant</td>
<td>Significant P=0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Model II</td>
<td>WOM----CC----ITP</td>
<td>Significant</td>
<td>Insignificant P&gt;0.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Model III</td>
<td>TM----CC----ITP</td>
<td>Significant</td>
<td>Significant P=0.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 14.0 explain the Mediation Analysis of this study. In Model I results explain that the direct and indirect effect both are significant as the (P >0.05) and the mediation results is partial mediation. Model III observed that the direct and indirect effect both are significant as the (P >0.05) and the mediation results is partial mediation. Model II results showed that the direct effect is significant as the (P >0.05) and the indirect effect is insignificant as the (P <0.05) so there is no mediation.

H1a: SMM has a significant effect on ITP.
Regression analysis findings shows that SMM has significant impact on ITP, as β is .322 with significant level of P<= 0.005. According to the findings, which are supporting the hypothesis that SMM is significantly related to ITP. Thus, this hypothesis is accepted.

H1b: TMM has a significant effect on ITP.

Results also indicates the association between TMM and ITP is positive. The results explain that β = .325 at .000 significance level. This relation among variables are considered to be significantly thus the hypothesis is accepted.

H1c: There is positive relationship between WOM and ITP.

Results represents the connection between WOM and ITP. The results show that β =.523 at .000 significance level. The significant level has been proven by the sig. value as .000 having p value < 0.001. Thus, hypothesis is accepted.

H2: There is positive relationship between CC and ITP.

Same as the case with H2 the results shows that there is positive significant relationship with the CC and ITP and the β = .553 at .000 significance level.

H3a: CC mediates the relationship among SMM and ITP.

The results are showing that CC has partially mediate the relationship with ITP and SMM .Results explain that the direct and indirect effect both are significant as the (P >0.05) and the mediation results is partial mediation. Thus, the above stated hypothesis is accepted.

H3b: CC mediates the relationship among TMM and ITP.

Same as the case with H3b where result values suggest that the CC has partially mediate with TMM and ITP. Thus, the above stated hypothesis is accepted. . Results indicates that the direct and indirect effect both are significant as the (P >0.05) and the mediation results is partial mediation.

H3c: CC mediates the relationship among WOM and ITP.

The results show that CC does not mediate the relationship among WOM and ITP. Results showed that the direct effect is significant as the (P >0.05) and the indirect effect is insignificant as the (P <0.05) so there is no mediation. Thus, the above stated hypothesis is rejected.

5. Discussions

With the sheer rise in Information Technology and computing, a new era of marketing and advertisement has been started. The face of advertisement has been changed dramatically and its ability to provide the information and communication to target customers has been increased manifold. Internet has become the biggest facilitator of communication through Social Media as well as Word of Mouth Communication. The growth of Social Media Marketing globally as well as in Pakistan, paved new ways for marketers and researchers to further investigate that how Traditional Media Marketing, Social Media Marketing and Word of Mouth influence the behaviors of customers and eventually effect Consumer Purchase Intentions. The purpose of this study was to explore the possible influence of TMM, SMM and WOM on ITP through CC in the Samsung Company.

SMM have a strong positive influence on intention to purchase. The findings have revealed the significant impact of TMM and WOM on ITP. Thus, our results are in line with prior studies which found SMM a significant factor be affecting consumer intention to purchase (Alalwan, 2018). The prior findings also indicate that TMM have significant impact on intention to purchase (Mustafa & Al-Abdallah, 2020). On another hand, results show from this study that WOM have a significant effect on consumer intention to purchase. Previous studies show that WOM have strong positive effect on ITP.
Additionally, results also indicate that CC have direct and mediating effect on intention to purchase. The prior findings also indicate that CC have direct impact on ITP (Amoako, Kutu-Adu, Caesar, & Neequaye, 2019). From the results, we can observe that the influence of CC partially mediates the relationship between SMM and TMM on ITP. The result also indicates that CC does not mediate the relationship between WOM and ITP in the context Samsung brand in Pakistan.

6. Conclusion
In this study, it is found that all the developed hypothesis (H1a, H1b, H1c, H2 and H3a, H3b) are accepted with some changes as it can be observed that there occurs positive relationship between the (SMM, TMM, WOM) and ITP. H3c hypothesis is rejected in this study. Similarly, results prove that CC has positive significant impact on ITP. Finally, CC mediates the relationship between the (SMM, TMM, WOM) and ITP. It is concluded that there exists a partial mediation between the (SMM, TMM) and ITP. Further it is analyzed that there is no mediation among the WOM and Customer Purchase Intention. Further reliability values also suggested that data is clean and the questioners which is used to gather the data is satisfactory. Confirmatory Factor Analysis also depicts that all the item values are within the given ranges and model is fit according to those values and the indices for structural equation modelling are also within the range of indices, proposing the fitness of model.

This research is an attempt to provide literature and good results regarding Impact of SMM, WOM and TMM on Purchase Intentions through customer commitment among professional accountants working in small audit firms of Pakistan who were using Samsung mobile as they are more conscious about their products particularly mobile technologies. Marketing activities are considered as a key element for the companies so from findings it can be conclude that when the customers are aware about the brands and services through the (SMM, TMM, WOM) then customers have higher Intention to Purchase. Similarly, when the customers remain Commit with the brands and services then the Customer Purchase Intention also high.

7. Implications for Theory and Practice
To the researcher’s knowledge, the effects of Social Media Marketing and Traditional Marketing, Customer Commitment and Word of Mouth Marketing on Customer Purchase Intentions have been simultaneously studied for the first time in literature. In this study, the above mentioned three marketing concepts have been differentiated and the effect of these different methods on Customer Purchase Intentions is compared.

This study provides additional information about how Social Media Marketing, Traditional Media Marketing and WOM enhances Customer Commitment and eventually how Customer Commitment explains the Customer Behavior and effect the intention to Purchase. The results of this study suggest that Samsung Company may develop Online Advertisement Strategies that create higher Customer Satisfaction and meet the expectations of customers that will lead to favorable Purchase Intentions of customers. This infers that companies can enhance sales through direct purchases from online sources by giving more focus on Social Media Marketing and advertising. Moreover, more customers can be attracted through Social Media Advertising on various channels.

Furthermore, Traditional Media Marketing should not be ignored by the companies, as Digital Media and WOM is not being embraced by all the age groups and social classes. As the results show that Traditional Media Marketing blended with Digital Marketing and WOM produces significant effect on Customer Intention to Purchase. In addition, Mobile Technology companies like Samsung must give importance and focus on providing the customers with after sale services through telecommunication for complaint handling and other services, through Social Media channels that is Instagram, Facebook, Twitter and others. It infers the significance of a diversified advertisement plan of Samsung through Digital and Traditional Media to provide customers better services and to enhance customer commitment and satisfaction.

Samsung should also use active social media campaign, free call centers from customer services, and email for customer complaints and information. Positive Word of Mouth can be generated through
incentivizing and giving special discounts to the customers that share and spread the positive message, ads and other contents of the company on various Social Media channels. Opinion leaders and celebrities can also be used to promote the company through Social Media Campaigns and to attract more customers by creating opinion leader influence. Lastly, the content of messages used in Social Media Campaign must be carefully designed as it is crucial to give importance to customer expectations. Market research should also be conducted by Samsung for better understanding of customers’ preferences and need, and this insight can be used for development of customized and high quality products that could lead to Customer Satisfaction and Customer Commitment and thus generate positive Purchase Intention.

8. Limitations and Future Research
As other studies, this study also have some limitations. The research design used in this study was cross sectional and due to limited time and resources, data collected at a single location that is Pakistan, which limits the generalizability of the findings. Future research may be conducted through longitudinal design. Moreover, the study was focused only on a specific high involvement product that is Smartphone. Due to this the applicability of the results of this study is limited to high involvement products only. Future research may be extended to other product categories. Furthermore, future research may study the effect of other theoretical constructs or potential moderators (such as Price discount on the SMM, TMM, and WOM). Only Pakistan” was surveyed in this research therefore it is suggested that in future research other big and developed countries should be considered. In this research our sample size was controlled but in future research sample size can be increased. This study used quantitative data, whereas qualitative data should be used in future research. In this research respondents were professional accountants working in small accounting firms of Pakistan but in future study respondents belong to other sectors should be focused.

References
umassd. edu/cmr/socialmedia/2012fortune500/(accessed November 11, 2012).


Strategic Dimensions of CPEC: Role of Regional and International Powers

Muhammad Ijaz Latif, Muhammad Tayyab Zia

Chairman Department of International Relations, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Pakistan, PhD Scholar, University of the Punjab Lahore, Associate Lecturer, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Pakistan

ARTICLE DETAILS

History
Revised format: November 2020
Available Online: December 2020

Keywords
CPEC, US, Pakistan, China, Indian Ocean, CARs, Russia, Iran, India

JEL Classification
M10, M14

ABSTRACT

Indian Ocean, along with its chokepoints and Sea Lanes of Communications, is considered to be the significant strategic maritime arena. The area has remained under the influence of the US. India, being a largest littoral state of the said ocean, has a strong say here. Sino- Pakistan strategic collaboration and convergence over the construction of Gwadar and CPEC would not only serve the commercial interests of both of the states, rather it would also strengthen their strategic and defense position in the region. On the Beijing’s part, China would, to a considerable extent, neutralize its “Malacca Dilemma”. And on Islamabad’s part, it would serve to be a deterrent to any aggressive design of her arch rival India. It is because on the one hand it would enhance the strategic depth of Pakistan, and on the other hand integrity of Pakistan would be indispensible for China. And any attempt to destabilize Pakistan could provoke China, so Pakistan’s integrity would be sine qua non for China.

© 2020 Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: ijazlatif@iub.edu.pk


1. Introduction

Alfred Mahan in 1890 stated that “whoever controls the Indian Ocean will dominate Asia, the destiny of the world will be decided on its waters” (Abbasi, 2015). Contemporary maritime power politics and geo-strategic struggle of various rising international and regional powers is verifying the saying of the said scholar. Indian Ocean has been evolved to be the center stage of thrust for power of numerous players. Strategic importance of Indian Ocean and significance of its Sea Lanes of Communications has made the area, the focus point of US, India China and Pakistan.

Indian Ocean has been remained under the impact of hegemonic hankerings of the US since few decades, yet the economic and political rise of China has set the question mark on previous standing of the US. India, being a major littoral state of the Indian Ocean, too has the candidature of the ocean which perplexes its immediate neighbor Pakistan. Any rift between New Delhi and Beijing can consequently bring the region at the brink of a maritime standoff not only between the said states, rather various other actors too could involve. It is because the area has the some most sensitive chokepoints i.e. Strait of Hormuz, Bab el Mandeb and Malacca strait, all of which play decisive role in world trade.
Strait of Hormuz joins Persian Gulf to the Arabian Sea and is located between Oman and Iran. Being one of the most crucial chokepoints, almost seventeen million barrel oil on daily basis is being transported through the Strait, as well as eighty five percent of crude oil is exported through the strait to Asia (Ahmad, 2015).

Washington has devised both bilateral and multilateral approaches to maintain the status quo in the said area with the objective of diminish the probability of emergence of any state or an alliance that can pose a threat to US interests there. But changing strategic patterns in the maritime power structure have made the Indian Ocean an upcoming arena of competition for international and regional actors. In order to deal with this emerging environment, Washington is developing its strategic relations with New Delhi to counter any situation, growing Chinese role, which could be a matter of concern for both of the states (Smith, 2016: 4, 5).

Construction of Gwadar port and CPEC too are anticipated to alter the status quo and power patterns of South Asia and Indian Ocean. It is because on the Islamabad’s part, Pakistan would step forward towards its second strike naval capability and On Beijing’s part China would have a direct access to Indian Ocean. These developments have the potential to pose a severe challenge to the long cherished interests of US and India to exert a strong position in the region.

1.1 Strategic Significance of CPEC

Having a unique geo-strategic location, Pakistan is located at the juncture of energy deficient and energy proficient countries. CPEC is considered to be a pilot project of One Belt One Road initiative of China. Industrialized zones, energy infrastructure, communication infrastructure, and Gwadar port are the core areas of CPEC. Although commercial significance and economic dimension of CPEC is palpable yet few factors limit its economic side. It is assumed that CPEC would be a transit trade route for Central Asian Republics (CARs) and Afghanistan which since previous few years depend upon Iran significantly. It is speculated that utilization of Gwadar and CPEC by upper discussed landlocked states for their trade would be unlikely in near future for certain reasons. To persuade Kabul and CARs to opt for CPEC and Gwadar as alternative route for their international trade, Islamabad will have to ensure economic and political stability along with efforts for sustained peace and stability in Afghanistan. But as for as feeble maritime standing of Pakistan and aspirations of China to have a more proactive role in maritime politics are concerned, CPEC and Gwadar would have positive impacts in strategic and security terms. Moreover, CPEC would play a key role in strengthening the land based defense of Pakistan and security situation in Baluchistan. It is because CPEC is considered to be a security concern for India (Pande, 2015: 22).

Assuming the geographical position of the Gwadar port, it could be a listening post in order to monitor, and if, essential, to intervene in highly significant maritime oil trade region of the world, Strait of Hormuz. Some strategists are of the view that Gwadar port and CPEC would contribute in enhancing the bargaining position of Islamabad in regional and global arena while negotiating with other players. Furthermore, if both key regional players, Islamabad and New Delhi, have a naval confrontation, Gwadar would be a better geo-strategic alternative as compared to vulnerable and heavily burdened ports of Karachi. It is because on the one hand Karachi is geographically close to India and naval barricade of Karachi is assumed to be a crucial tactical option for India with reference to its ‘cold start doctrine’ It is because according to the claims of New Delhi, its strategic doctrine has been converted from pro-active to offensive and reactive to defensive. The said doctrine was released with the title of The Indian Army Doctrine in 2004. The anticipated offensive move is intended to have a swift penetration in Pakistan’s territory coupled with the air strikes and naval barricade of Karachi. Indian military advancement in territory of Pakistan is having the ambition to hit the military installations of Pakistan and barricade of Karachi is said to cease the energy and arms supplies of Pakistan (Chandramohan, 2015: 97).

Gwadar and CPEC would be the primary line of defense for Pakistan in that worst case scenario. This line of defense has a two-pronged aspect.
(i) Logistical network of CPEC would serve to be a better option for military forces of Pakistan to move swiftly according to the given situation.

(ii) a. If Eastern route, and Western route also to certain extent, of CPEC is threatened by hegemonic designs of India, it would automatically threaten the Chinese strategic and commercial interests that could prompt China to intervene in order to secure its installations.

b. As for as Gwadar is concerned, a well-equipped naval base here would make the barricade of Karachi by India meaningless (Boyce, 2017: 22).

On the other hand Pakistan worryingly relied on ports of Karachi both for commercial and naval operations, not having an equal alternative to Karachi. So the barricade of Karachi only could severely hamper the naval security of Pakistan. With the development of deep sea port of Gwadar, Islamabad would have a resilient alternative to Karachi in any case of naval adventure of its adversary, New Delhi (Hussain, Javiad, Sabri, Ilyas, Batool, 2014: 602).

Sino-Pakistan bilateral naval collaboration is expected to be further augmented with the construction of Gwadar port and CPEC. Both of the states would be in a better environment for joint military and naval exercises. Restructuring of regional and international power equations have compelled Islamabad and Beijing to be more close to each other. A China-US Forum’s report states that Washington is courting New Delhi with the declared and overt objective of a lead role in the Indian Ocean region. New Delhi’s close ties with states that Beijing is apprehensive of, compel both Pakistan and China to deepen their bilateral ties. (Butt and Butt, 2015:30).

While considering Tehran, Iran would build an oil refinery accompanied by previously planned Iran-Pakistan Gas Pipeline and in this perspective, CPEC is anticipated to have a trilateral aspect. First, Tehran would export her gas and oil related products to Beijing and Islamabad, second, for her energy requirements, China would have a more reliable source and third, Pakistan, on the one hand, would serve to be a nucleus for Sino-Iran bilateral trade, and on the other hand, convergence of interests of two major actors, Beijing and Tehran, with Islamabad, Pakistan’s position in the region would be more strengthened in the region. All, Beijing, Tehran and Islamabad, have ambiguous ties with New Delhi, except Indo-Iran ties, which are to a certain extent objectively oriented, But as for as increased Indo-US role in region is concerned, it seems more likely that Iran would make attempts to limit their role. Diminishing the strength of Baloch nationalists, assumed to be Indian backed, too is the converged objective of the said trilateral virtual alliance. Construction of Gwadar and CPEC would further deepen the objective of these states regarding peace and stability in Baluchistan, as peaceful Baluchistan is the pre-requisite for the success of the project (Wolf, 2018:170).

It is perhaps earlier to assume that Gwadar would be utilized for combined naval operations too by Beijing and Islamabad, but energy, security and trade are evident to be focused by both of the partners. Pakistan’s orientations in this regard, in order to operationalize the Gwadar port for non-commercialized dimension too, is more pro-active. Although Chinese stance, in this perspective, is not very vibrant, yet partial takeover of Gwadar by Chinese authority in not deemed only to secure her energy trade route, rather increased role in Indian Ocean too is the interest of China (Jamshed, 2015).

It is due to the ‘Malacca dilemma’ that the Asian giant is facing because of her massive dependence upon Malacca Strait, a bottleneck between Indonesia and Malaysia. This narrower and congested area can easily be blocked and consequently having the lesser energy supply for China. Moreover, Malacca Strait is considered under the dominance of the US, which is not threatening the energy supply of China at the current moment but monitoring of these supplies by the US is more likely and probability of blockade of the said strait in any event of confrontation between two powers, Beijing and Washington, is not precluded (Snedden, 2016:19).

Therefore, for China, Gwadar is more than mere an alternative to Malacca Strait, rather Beijing views it to be the staging ground of various maritime operations. It is considered to be the first opportunity for Beijing to operate at a port in Indian Ocean at such a larger scale for her submarines and ships coupled
with refueling and refurbishment of Chinese vessels, enhancing influence in Indian Ocean. The discussed development would anticipated to assist Islamabad and Beijing to counterbalance specifically New Delhi, and Washington in general, in South Asian regional affairs and Indian Ocean. Although China has assisted various other sea ports too in the Indian Ocean littoral states i.e. Bangladesh, Sri Lanka etc, yet these projects don’t undermine the strategic significance of CPEC and Gwadar. It is because on the one hand Islamabad is having a rift with New Delhi, unlikely to Colombo and Dhaka, and on the other hand Gwadar would be opted to be a transit trade that would bypass Malacca Strait, which is implausible in the case of ports of Bangladesh and Sri Lanka. As having the potential to restructure the power equation in Indian Ocean and South Asia, specifically in hub of global trade oil, Strait of Hormuz, CPEC would make Islamabad capable to marginalize the naval dominance of New Delhi in the region. For Islamabad, CPEC would be a deterrent to New Delhi for latter’s alleged intervention in Pakistan generally and Baluchistan specifically, because of the fact that if Chinese workforce is assassinated or attacked by insurgents, assumed to be partially Indian backed, that could consequently create a more rift in bilateral Sino- India relations. New Delhi would have to experience a severe response from Beijing, ultimately benefitting Pakistan (Wagner, 2016:2).

1.2 CPEC and Indian Concerns

New Delhi percepts CPEC to be a threat to its hegemonic designs in Arabian Sea, Strait of Hormuz, Persian Gulf and in the region. It is because as being a major trade partner of India, China shares common economic advantages with the former state. Indian strategists are of the view that it could be a long- term security concern if Beijing operates through Gwadar as that development would enable China to have a strategic edge in Indian Ocean and Strait of Hormuz. For that very reason, India has overtly asserted concerns regarding the CPEC (Jahangir &Anis, 2016:13). Prime Minister of India Narendra Modi has called CPEC as “unacceptable”. Sujatha Singh, Foreign Minister of India expressed that New Delhi has raised the issue of CPEC and Gwadar (Ranjan, 2015: 14).

Minister of Foreign Affairs of India (2014- 2919), Sushma Swaraj expressed that the Government of India has noticed the reports regarding joint efforts of Islamabad and Beijing in order to build infrastructure in POK which includes the development of CPEC as well. She further said that India has sent its apprehensions to China regarding their bilateral, Islamabad and China, actions in POK and appealed to terminate these arrangements (Sekhon, 2016: 184).

In past, New Delhi believed that potential rise of economy of India would compel Islamabad to be agreed to collaborate on East- West alignment. It was because of Indian attempts to persuade Pakistan to grant her transit rights for trade with Central Asian Republics. Whereas, CPEC would make Pakistan capable to jeopardize these Indian attempts and embark North- South alignments of cooperation and attract Central Asian Republics towards the logistic advantage of CPEC and deep sea port of Gwadar. Consequently, irrespective of potential economic rise of New Delhi in the decades ahead, Central Asian Republics would find themselves to have a more plausible trade route and more reliable trade partner, Beijing (Zargar, 2017: 5).

As a matter of fact, a significant part of CPEC passes through the Azad Jammu and Kashmir. Completion of CPEC would reinforce the legitimacy of Islamabad’s stance regarding the Kashmir conflict, which enhances the anxieties of New Delhi. Moreover, that could lead towards the termination of historic aspirations of India to bring Pakistan under the hegemony of the former, which could only be possible if Islamabad would be under the economic umbrella of New Delhi. But that would become meaningless after the construction of Gwadar port and completion of CPEC, subsequently hindering the hegemonic aspirations of India (Khan, 2018: 93). Furthermore Beijing has strived to convince Islamabad to convert Iran- Pakistan- India gas pipe line (IPI) to Iran- Pakistan- China, which worried New Delhi because CPEC would catalyze the process of conversion of energy trade routes to China and making it for India a zero-sum-game (Khayyam, 2014: 4).

Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, China and Pakistan have agreed upon a quadrilateral trade and transit agreement too is under consideration. With the diplomatic assistance of China, some of the upper
discussed states have showed their consent to utilize Gwadar port for their trade in the long run. This Sino-Pak bilateral quest to persuade Central Asian Republics towards CPEC and Gwadar would not only strengthen their economies, rather it would hamper the role of New Delhi in these states. Some of the Indian strategists have suggested a two-pronged military solution, annexing Gilgit Baltistan, as far as CPEC is concerned. On the one hand that would serve to be a direct Indian access to Central Asia via Afghanistan and on the other hand the strategic move would cut the contagious land based Sino-Pakistan border, consequently leaving CPEC with no meaning (Zargar, 2017:4).

Moreover, strengthened economy of Pakistan in the wake of CPEC would lead towards increase in military budget of Pakistan. Pakistan with sophisticated military potential would have no interest in bilateral economic cooperation with India, which is a prerequisite to marginalize the rift between both of the key regional actors. Moreover, Islamabad would more confidently internationalize the voice of Kashmir, in order to prompt international community, if she would have a strong military potential. That would hamper the regional aspirations of New Delhi, as she negates any regional, international or any multilateral solution of the Kashmir conflict (Wagner, 2016: 2).

As far as Indian perspective is concerned, challenge to the interests of the New Delhi in the Indian Ocean Region has compelled India to increase her strategic collaboration with the US. In the aftermath of construction of Gwadar port, acquisition of sea based second strike capability would be more plausible for Pakistan due to the anticipated sophistication of Pakistan Navy. The said development would be more detrimental for India when it would be coupled with the likely competence of CPEC and Gwadar to provide the logistic support to Chinese Navy. Consequently and unsurprisingly, India has given access for the US to her military bases with the objective of reciprocity of import of sophisticated technology from the US (Rashid, 2018: 16).

1.3 CPEC and US Concerns
Due to the geo-political significance of South Asia, US is having a long history of its involvement in the region. As future emergence of two major powers, Beijing and New Delhi and potentially among them Beijing, is anticipated in the region, Washington has to ensure her military presence in South Asia (Lashari, 2016:176).

Although US has not expressed her apprehensions regarding CPEC, yet US strategic objective, halt the probability of emergence of any international power in global arena, it could be analyzed that US would not remained indifferent regarding CPEC. It could be reinforced by the focus of various writings and statements of US officials on geo-strategic importance of Baluchistan. Some of them have suggested the independence of Baluchistan to fulfill the Washington’s strategic interests in South Asia. Director of Asia Program, Selig Harrison, offered US to seek an independent Baluchistan. He not only presented the indication of independence of Baluchistan, rather step by step comprehensive course of actions too was purposed. He is of the view that, on the one hand, independent Baluchistan would marginalize the regional repercussions that Washington is facing and on the other hand decrease the regional anarchy. That would be utilized to be a “safe playground” for covert and overt operations of the US in order to achieve her strategic interests in the region. US military strategist, Lt. Col. Ralph Peter too presented the same motive of revising the land borders of Iran, Afghanistan and Pakistan. In his article “Blood borders” he stated that the current border demarcations of these said states are not natural and their revision would be in the long-term strategic interest of the US (Hilali, 2014).

Selig Harrison, taking a step forward, wrote that to dissuade China of what she is doing in Pakistan, Opting Gwadar to be an alternative trade route, US has to “play hardball” by backing separatists in Baluchistan. Assistance of the US to separatist movements would avert China from constructing the naval base in Gwadar. Statements and writings of these responsible US officials reveal that Washington would not only have no objection on intelligence activities of Mosad and RAW in Baluchistan rather US’ own intelligence monitoring in this regard is even cannot be precluded. An Indian defense analyst, Amarjit Singh too is of the view that only a weakened Islamabad is in the strategic interest of New Delhi as only then India would be able to concentrate solely on the rise of Chinese influence in South Asia. Selig Harrison further argued that independent Baluchistan under the influence of the US would limit the
Iranian influence in Persian Gulf. Discussed ambitious regional designs of New Delhi and their convergence on them has made their apprehensions evident regarding bilateral collaboration of Islamabad and Beijing on construction of Gwadar port and CPEC (Hilali, 2014).

Historically, Indian Ocean’s exits and entrances along with its chokepoints and South Asia have remained under the hegemonic influence of the US. Due to her maritime vulnerabilities, specifically in Strait of Malacca, China too was not in a position to be an potential equal of the US. It is because massive dependence of Beijing on Strait of Malacca and the said area too is under the influence of the US. Any possible Chinese threat to the interests of the US would only result into increased trouble for China for her trade which traverses the said strait. CPEC and Gwadar could be a two pronged concern for the US. On the one hand China would have a direct access to Indian Ocean and on the other hand Chinese dependence on Strait of Malacca would be reduced to a significant extent. Resultantly, a more proactive Chinese role in Indian Ocean maritime politics is anticipated. Consequently, New Delhi and Washington in 2015 signed a Joint Strategic Vision, the era of bilateral Sino- Pakistan collaboration on CPEC and Gwadar port. Principal Deputy Assistant Secretary of State for South and Central Asian Affairs, Richard E. Hoaglan argued that strategic vision with New Delhi is a distinctive step that would exert a clear indication to that country which is having the ambitions to sabotage the global norms. This development illustrates South Asian and maritime concerns of the New Delhi and Washington about CPEC (Jia, 2017: 105).

Although Washington has not overtly opposed CPEC, yet her full scale indifference in future seems less likely. It is because, due to the rift between Russia and the US, Washington is anticipated to marginalize her role and let Beijing to play the role of a balancer. But in the long run, when power equation of the region would be altered, Washington’s intentions to interpret CPEC to be a zero sum game and attempt to jeopardize it cannot be precluded, as CPEC could also be a matter of concern for the US designs in Middle East, Persian Gulf and resource rich area of Central Asia (Butt & Butt, 2015: 39).

Although Islamabad and Beijing have negated those reports which have argued about the naval potential of Gwadar as well as US concerns. SussaneKoelbl, a German Journalist, constructed compatibility between Indo- US alliance and role of Gwadar in future maritime power structure in Indian Ocean. Arguing further, she stated that New Delhi and Washington, both, assume construction of Gwadar port to be a challenge to their interests. Bilateral construction of Gwadar port, by Beijing and Islamabad, is anticipated with the objective of stationing warships of China. Various Indian officials have stated that CPEC and construction of Gwadar would make Beijing capable of setting a sophisticatedly equipped naval stage on the West of India (Jamshed, 2015).

Washington too has developed her own vision of New Silk Road with the intention of increasing her role in Central and East Asia. The US Defense Secretary, James Mattis, reclaimed theIndian assertions that CPEC traverses in the disputed area of Kashmir and GilgitBaltistan. The statement reveals the overt tilt of Washington towards New Delhi, as a senior US official has apprehensions regarding the mega project of CPEC. Intensified international propaganda too can be examined in the same context of Indo- US anxieties over more velocity of One Belt One Road as compared to the US given New silk Road (Khan, 2019: 185).

Moreover, US intends to take Pakistan as its area of influence. Be it containment of Communism and cold war, or be it war against terrorism. Although Islamabad has developed deep ties with China, yet she has remained under the influence of the US. But in the aftermath of CPEC and construction of Gwadar, on the one hand China too would have a strong say along with the US and on the other hand, because of it, Pakistan too would be at better position to negotiate with the US (Mustafa & Zafar, 2011:5065).

1.4 Role of Various Players

1.4.1 Iran

Tehran is one of the key stakeholders regarding Gwadar port and CPEC because on the one hand Gwadar is considered to be a potential challenge to Chahbahar and on the other hand India has developed a meaningful understanding with Iran. As a response to bilateral collaboration of Pakistan and
China on CPEC and Gwadar port, Iran and India have worked closely on sophistication of Chahbahar. New Delhi has supposedly budgeted US$ 500 million for the development of a free trade area coupled with US$20 billion to sophisticate the port of Chahbahar (Boyce, 2017: 23).

But Gwadar has a natural advantage on Chahbahar as on the one hand Gwadar is a deep sea port as compared to Chahbahar and on the other hand Iran remains under the international sanctions that limit the effectiveness of Chahbahar. Moreover, Iran has showed its interests to be the part of CPEC and Gwadar port (Zargar, 2017: 3).

1.4.2 Russia
As Iran and Russia have close bilateral relations. With the growing ties of Islamabad, Beijing, Tehran and Moscow, it would be more likely that Russia would seek the opportunity of trade and other commercial operations by utilizing CPEC and Gwadar port. Islamabad has offered Moscow to opt for CPEC and Gwadar port for trade. Foreign Minister of Russia too showed indications about Russian interests in the project (Boyce, 2017: 23).

1.4.3 Afghanistan
Afghanistan is bridge between two significant regions, South and Central Asia. Access to Central Asian Republics is one of the key components of CPEC and for that very reason Kabul’s role is of much importance for Islamabad and Beijing as well. It is because a trilateral discussion was arranged among Afghanistan, China and Pakistan in 2018 in which debate on role of Afghanistan regarding CPEC and Gwadar was arranged (Khan, 2019: 184).

Islamabad has announced that a 265 KM Motorway would be constructed from Kabul to Peshawar in order to connect Afghanistan with CPEC. That linkage would assist the integration of Afghanistan to other regions of the world via Indian Ocean, Gwadar port and CPEC. Another road linkage which would connect Afghanistan to CPEC is via Chaman and this is too under consideration, which would connect Afghanistan to the Western route of CPEC. That link road would save 600 KM as compared to the route which is utilized now (Butt & Butt, 2017: 33).

1.4.4 Central Asia
As having the land locked geography, Central Asian Republics desperately depend upon other countries specifically Iran and Russia for trade operations. These states would have a more feasible route in shape of CPEC and Gwadar port due to two factors. On the one hand Gwadar is a deep sea port than Chahbahar and on the other hand Iran too has shown its interests in CPEC and Gwadar. Turkmenistan Afghanistan Pakistan India gas pipe- line and its extension towards China would catalyze the addition of these land locked states in CPEC (Zia- ur-Rehman, 2017: 274).

2. Conclusion
CPEC and construction of Gwadar port are anticipated to shift the geo- political and geo- strategic alignments not only in South Asian region but beyond South Asia too. Countries of various other regions are also reconsidering their multilateral and bilateral relations with other regional and global players. Potential of Gwadar and CPEC to bridge various regions, not only of Asian origin but other regions as well, at a single center- stage, Pakistan, would lead Islamabad and Beijing towards further closer ties and mutual exertion of power in regional as well as in global arena. Those regional and global players which assume CPEC and Gwadar to be a potential concern, if not challenge, have been perplexed and will, more likely, strive to marginalize the anticipated prospective of the project. In order to neutralize any attempt like that, Pakistan and China would need to have further strengthen their security measures specifically in Baluchistan and GilgitBaltistan. Being a global power, role of Washington would remain significant and relevant in the region. Construing CPEC to be a challenge by the US and forwarding New Delhi against Pakistan and China would only perpetuate the longstanding regional strategic rift and security structure of the region.

References


A Comparative Study of Perjury in Legal System of Pakistan and Islamic Law

Rashida Zahoor, Muhammad Fahad Anwar, Muhammad Asif Safdar, Jibran Jamshed

1Assistant Professor, Department of Law, University of Sahiwal, Pakistan, rashidazahoor@uosahiwal.edu.pk, fahad@uosahiwal.edu.pk
2Assistant Professor, Principal of Gillani Law College, Bahauddin Zakariya University Multan, Pakistan, principallaw@bzu.edu.pk
3Assistant Professor, Department of Law, Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Pakistan, jibran.jamshed@iub.edu.pk

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

Perjury is one of the crimes that harm criminal justice; Action against criminal justice means behavior that affects people's right to access the justice system or society's right to prosecute and punish criminals. The witness is considered a reason to prove disputes in both legal and criminal complaints, and due to the importance and value of the evidence, perjury has its specific implications. In our criminal justice system, testimony is a way of legal knowledge and reasoning to diagnose crimes committed by the accused. The testimony is not used in criminal matters, and ignoring his way is not against the accused. Consequently, truth is essential, and testimony cannot be used if it is not true. This paper expresses various forms and numerous aspects of perjury along with its definition, discusses perjury as part of the behavioral and psychological approach of sociology, and finally analyzes the laws of Perjury in Pakistan along with the relevant sections of the Pakistan Penal Code, 1860 (PPC), Qanoon and Shahadat Ordinance, 1984 (QSO) and The Oaths Act, 1873 and other Islamic provisions of laws relating to perjury.

1. Introduction

The only purpose of taking evidence in court has always been to allow judges to practice justice after adequately assessing the pros and cons of the litigation in question while keeping the rating scale among the parties concerned. It would be difficult for the court of law to do so unless and as long as the evidence previously presented is truthful, uncontaminated, and free of prejudice. The basic rules for the test of evidence were followed in Pre-Islamic Society of Arabia, early Roman Society, India, Persia, etc. In all legal systems, the oath is one reason for the trial, and a means to resolve hostility in claims for religious and belief reasons. It means that people swear by God and by their religions and beliefs to show that they are correct and accurate in what they deposed. Suppose a person finds out that swearing is false, and I shall achieve several effects in the judgment issued by the judge. Swearing is the last
resort to prove the case and examine the claims and disputes in civil and criminal cases. Due to the authority of trying to ascertain the cause, perjury will have some effect. In the legal system, this reason generally serves only to settle the dispute. The curse word is used if the complaint cannot be proven in any other way. After introducing the swear word, the plaintiff's reason is not accepted; however, the lawyer's refusal to award the award is useful in the lawsuit and is released based on the above admission. Taking the oath is based on conscience and believes in the oath. By reducing the likelihood of false statements, the legislature predicted the concentration on the dirty word. In Islamic law, the oath is a concept of dignity; even if the lawyer is not one of the followers of monotheistic religions after swearing God, the prosecutor can also take the oath to the sanctities accepted by the above. Based on measures such as the meaning of the subject matter of the complaint, the parties' personality to the dispute, the oath could be focused according to the perspective and discretion of the court in terms of conditions, time, space, and situation state. "I swear to inform the reality, the total truth and to compress the truth" - a sentence that is narrated many times in a week in television programs and films. It is therefore known that its meaning is often not marked. However, as soon as he is sworn in court or other officials who continue, he will provide all of the above information regarding reality or violation.

Wrong testimony or false testimony is a curse for any country's criminal justice system. Several innocent people suffered behind bars for ages just because a person had lied to the court. It is encouraging that Pakistan's Supreme Court Judge viewed the extinction of perjury as one of the foundations to reform the criminal justice system. Supreme Court of Pakistan had firmly stated his objective to build a dam against false testimonies and false witnesses. Supreme Court said that those on trial would be sentenced to prison and forbidden to testify again.

Providing false evidence of an oath in a competent jurisdiction is legally known as a violation. It is a grave crime because it delays the method of justice at the center of a system. Perjury as the crime of being under oath could be a serious crime as it upsets the essential objectives of the judicial system "the discovery of reality". Even the well-known and influential have been exposed to effects of violations that embody law enforcement, prison, and legal documents—the tendency to lie sticks to practically every society and civilization.

Furthermore, an individual could also be a habitual traitor and pathological liar. The use of lies is not only subject to cessation but will also be the result of interference. The opposite side of the violation is that under "oath" a lie is formed.

Giving false testimony is a criminal offense in the law of Pakistan. In PPC making false statements at every stage in court proceedings accounts for seven years in jail, while the penalty for making wrong statements in capital cases can be up to life imprisonment. According to the law, the same lender can be sentenced to death because of his fall statement; an innocent person is executed.

1.1 Definition
Judicial affirmation of falsehood upon oath and affirmation equivalent to the oath is called perjury. For perjury, there must be a renunciation of what is correct or an assertion of what is false. The declarations criticized must be relevant to the matter which has been initially tried.

The deliberate declaration on a matter of fact, faith, knowledge, or opinion given by a witness as a portion of the evidence, whether or not the evidence is given to the judge in open court or by an affidavit or otherwise, by way of oath or in any manner permitted by law to be substituted for an oath. Such declaration must be known as false by such witness and be intended to mislead the court or person conducting a case.

1.2 Essential Elements of Perjury
A witness who is under oath has committed perjury if he makes a statement that the witness knew it was not correct in court or other proceedings. The witness's statement in court has to be "material" on the
matter. It means that statement and material before the court must connect to the litigation, investigation or inquiry of the proceeding. Following are the essential elements of perjury:-

- **Perjury only takes place under oath**
  The witness, who makes a declaration, must swear by a judge, a notary or other official to tell the truth before someone who is authorized to take the oath under the relevant law. Also, the proceedings must be 'in front of a competent authority' authorized by the state's law. For instance, an authority that has started an inquiry outside its powers will not be considered competent proceeding (Reid Jr, 1999). In such a case, the accused will not be liable for perjury as for perjury, authority or court must be empowered to record evidence (Mst. Maryam Hayyat Case, PLD 2013 Karachi 194, 2013).

- **Perjury involves statement**
  Keeping quiet or denying a witness to give a statement will not be considered perjury, but it may lead to other punitive charges. If testimony is accepted in the proceedings and the witness authenticates it as incorrect scripture under oath will be considered perjury.

- **With an intention to mislead**
  A witness submitting before the competent authority must know that the declaration it makes is false and he must make it to deceive the court.

- **Only incorrect statements are perjury**
  Incorrect statements of a witness resulting from misperception, memory loss, or errors are neither false and nor will be considered perjury. Contradiction in evidence may be considered perjury if one witness made self-contradictory statements and prosecutors may prove perjury because self-contradictory statements were false.

- **Contradictory Statements may lead to perjury**
  A witness's statement must be observed and read as a whole by the court/authority. If, when questioned at one point during evidence, a witness claimed that he did not recall an incident. However, he undoubtedly recollected aspects of the event when questioned future than he may have committed perjury. However, if evidence of a witness is inconsistent, the proceeding before the authority or the court is not perjury.

- **Statement in court or another trial**
  Inappropriate comments made outside of official hearings do not constitute perjury. For example, a deponent is lying to his prosecutor, who takes outlines to draw up an affidavit that the deponent has not committed any perjury. However, if the deponent signs the affidavit later with the false statement that it includes, then perjury is considered. Affidavits, written declarations, written responses to courts or public bodies and proceedings statements are subject to perjury in the prevailing state laws.

- **"Substantial" testimonials can be perjury**
  The wrong statement must manipulate the proceeding. This implies, in a matter of the proceeding, it must have a connection to the matter. It involves an incorrect statement that is likely to mislead or hinder the investigation or case. This implies that a lie under oath about an issue irrelevant to the proceeding is not regarded as perjury. For example, it would not amount to perjury to incorrectly state in a proceeding that "I never update my Facebook page at work" and it had nothing to do with social networking at work.

- **A substantial statement that is unnecessary may be a perjury**
  Where false evidence does not affect a case's outcome, witness lying may be accused of perjury. For example, an ex-police officer is on trial for participating in a gambling operation, and some witnesses have affirmed his involvement. That ex-police officer denied any involvement, however. His denial would be a strong statement, although it did not affect the court's finding of guilt because the court had evidence from the other witnesses to rely on.

### 1.3 Main Reasons for Giving False Evidence

Commonly main reasons for giving wrong evidence are as under:-
i. The desire to cause damage to the party in civil or criminal proceedings, either because of the adverse party's inducement or pressure or because of the witness' dispute with the adverse party or
ii. To assist the suspect in criminal proceedings or civil litigation, either under coercion, threat or inducement,
iii. To avoid suffering rage of a party to which witness must submit evidence.

In many cases, witnesses evade appearing before courts to give a statement and show unawareness of disputed matter to avoid aggravation usually faced by witnesses while appearing in the courts. Witnesses also considered it a waste of time and unnecessary embarrassment. It was also noted in many criminal cases that, on the one hand, some witnesses give false evidence at police request to make the prosecution case successful. Despite being inclined to give real evidence, other witnesses are abstained from fear of retribution, either by the police or the accused party.

1.4 Lying and Environmental Approach: An Behavioral Analysis
"Lying" is a behavior that seems prevalent in different cultures, ages, etc. Lying also seems to be linked with some of the social problems. It frequently interrupts social connections, causes problems in places of work, and corrupts politics. For example, in lying behavior, people are considered liars, whereby lying is considered to exist in the individual. Because of this, the individual is liable for their lying behavior. Thus, thinking of environmental factors leading to the development and persistence of lying is avoided as the problem of lying is presumed to exist in individuals (Fryling, 2016).

Not surprisingly, lying can grow very early in the life of every child. In childhood, most behavior is secure through instant incidents. Children learn to take food, which is reinforced by contact with food and by taking puppets from their age fellows or friends when nobody watches, all these behaviors are immediately reinforced. Much of the young child's behavior can be considered impulsive in this sense. Indeed, both past and future are verbal constructs (Hayes, n.d.). However, as children grow a sophisticated verbal range. For example, they start responding to several derived stimulus issues.

While building on childhood practices, adult situations are reasonably separate in their complexity that deserves special attention. In line with our analysis, lying may occur in adulthood as it was not sufficiently conditioned as an aversive stimulus condition. Usually, some adults may lie because they have never been taught lying was "bad." Lying, as defined by an aversive stimulus, is not a form of stimulus to avoid. If the lying context's remaining features are not avoided, the positive and negative strengthens both direct and derived. This condition makes lying cases somewhat probable (Fryling, 2016).

1.5 Pathological Liars
Pathological lying has been outlined as "falsification entirely disproportionate to any discernible finish visible, is also in-depth and sophisticated, and should manifest over several years or perhaps a lifetime".
- Tell compulsive lies while not a transparent motive
- Told of times and obsessively
- Told for no apparent reason or gain
- Continuous
- Told to create the teller seem heroic or the victim
- Not deterred by guilt or risk of obtaining acknowledged

Examples of pathological lying:
- Making a false history, like expression they have achieved or experienced one thing they haven't
- Claiming to own a grievous unhealthiness that they do not have
- Telling lies to impress others, like expression they are associated with a superstar

1.6 Pakistani Laws Dealing with Perjury:
1.6.1 Perjury under PPC
Section 191 of PPC deals with Perjury in Pakistan (PPC, 1860). This section contains the following elements: -
1.6.2 Giving the Wrong Evidence
PPC defines "giving of false evidence". This definition cannot be said to include any common principle of universal application as such. An individual should always express the truth is a moral belief, but not a legal principle.

1.6.3 Statement on Oath
When an individual is "legally bound by an oath" a person authorized to administer it must give sufficient legal oath. The person to whom such oaths can be administered must be competent. The oath must have been made before giving a statement.

1.6.4 Court not Appropriately Established
An individual who makes false statements on oath before a court or authority that is not correctly constituted cannot sentence for perjury.

1.6.5 Wrong Verification
Perjury is a false statement made through wrong verification, and it constitutes an offense punishable under S. 193 PPC.

1.6.6 Declaration
If an individual makes a false statement that any law binds him, he would be guilty of perjury. For example, if a court officer makes a false statement of how a "warrant of sale" was issued, he will be guilty of an offense under S. 191 of PPC.

1.6.7 Giving False Statement
To constitute an offence of perjury, the case's decision in which it is given need not provide false evidence on a material question of law or fact. For perjury, it is sufficient that the false evidence is deliberately given if the person making that statement deliberately makes it known that it is false and intends to mislead the court to presume it is true. But if the false statement is not directly related to a fact in the case, but only to incidental matters, it should be taken into account in the sentence.

1.6.8 The Statement is not Read over to the Person
If a witness's false statement was not read as required by S.360 of the CrPC, the defect was deemed curable and would not be fatal to the proceedings (IDO Case, PLD 1951 Quetta 14, 1951).

1.6.9 Information of Falsehood is Required
An individual cannot be convicted of perjury unless he knows that his statement is false or thinks it is false or does not believe it is true. An individual does not commit an offense under PPC S.193 by merely mentioning something untrue in a complaint or written statement or omitting something from the complaint or written statement. Excluding the name of one of the decree-holders in a decree, the application is not an offense under S. 193.

1.6.10 Proof
There must be absolute certainty about the statement's falseness and the absence of faith by the accused in his own words to support a conviction under S 193 of the PPC. The burden is on the prosecution to show that the witness' statement in his testimony, or any document produced in court, was false as defined in S. PPC 191. It cannot be presumed that the statement made before the police during the investigation by the witness spoke the truth and, based on that assumption, it cannot be held that he gave false evidence in the testimony of the witness before the court and thus committed an offence under S. PPC, 193.

1.6.11 Perjury in Qanoon-e-shahadat Ordinance, 1984
Competency of witnesses under Article 3 of the 1984 Qanoon-e-Shahadat Order;
Article 3 provides that each person is competent to give evidence in court (QSO, 1984). The only restriction to regulate the witness' ability is court satisfaction that the person before the court can provide evidence. However, the article itself qualifies this general principle by providing exceptions. One of Article 3's exceptions is perjury. His exception says perjury is an offence; it means deliberately giving false evidence in court. Any person sentenced for perjury is excluded from giving evidence in court. Such a person is not a truthful witness. However, if the person repents in the court's opinion, the evidence can be accepted.

1.6.12 The 'Tazkiya-al-Shahood'
It is a method of inquiry to be implemented by the court to govern a witness's trustworthiness on the standard of Islamic injunctions that require piousness, credibility and truthfulness of the witness. It is only acceptable in Hadood laws and not in Tazir (Shahid Orakzai Case, PLD 2017 FSC 63, 2017).

1.6.12.1 Ways of checking Tazkiya:
According to Fatawa-e Alamgiry, there are two ways of checking Tazkiya;
1. Capability of the witness can be examined openly
2. Capability of the witness can be checked through investigation secretly

1.6.12.2 Persons can also aid in checking Tazkiya:
Following persons can also aid in checking Tazkiya;
1. Persons trustworthy;
2. Persons familiar with the witness's life and the character whose capability is being tested.

Even if need in respect of Tazkiya-al-Shuhood will be accomplished at the top of the testimony and interrogation of a witness, the suspect should be supplied with another chance of cross-examining even at that stage the witness in respect of his standing as claimed to be a just/Adil witness. It is solely through the method of interrogatory of a witness in respect of a matter asked of him to fulfill the wants of Tazkiya-al-Shuhood that associate suspect will, on the one hand, impeach the integrity and quality of a witness and by an equivalent process modify the judicature to fulfill late requirements of inquiry to succeed in a conclusion that the witness could be a just/Adil witness which his proof need not be discarded however must be relied upon to choose the case (Wajid Umar Case, 1992 PCR.LJ 1536, 1992).

1.6.13 Impeaching a Witness
When evidence is given under oath during the hearing, the adverse party can usually challenge the authenticity of evidence through cross-examination. The opposition's tools express flexibility to analyze witnesses' authentic ability to look at certain witnesses' occurrences or memory. The opponent may also challenge the witness's necessary quality by allowing witnesses to tell reality apart from those facts. Such a way in proceedings can be called "impeaching witness", and it is rapid attack on the witnesses' character (Naeem Case, 2019 PCR.LJ Karachi 305, 2019).

1.6.14 Impeaching a Witness through Previous Inconsistent Statements
A person's own statements confronting the witness on the opposite side, which are at odds with the person's evidence, could be common to impeach. However, the opposing party cannot introduce the statement without allowing the witness to clarify (Mehdi Khan Case, 2015 PCR.LJ Lahore 26, 2015).

1.6.15 Implementation of Oath Laws in Pakistan
The Pakistani courts barely apply laws punishing perjury for punishing liars. That is why they do not perform the theory of deterrent practically. In August 2018, during the case regarding judicial reforms, the Sindh High Court (SHC) Registrar replied that "the SHC and its subordinate courts have not prosecuted even a single person over the past almost three years for perjury under Sections 193-196 of PPC" (Sehgal, 2019).

The public thinks there are many excellent ways to get away with lies in court, even if the liars are identified during proceedings even though they have no fear of punishment. Witnesses lying in court against Aasia Bibi are accountable for her long-term imprisonment. Supreme Court acquitted Aasia Bibi, but no action was taken against witnesses for perjury (Wikipedia, n.d.).
Perjury is an exclusively criminal offense as it weakens the court's very purpose, country laws, and judiciary at large. Pakistan's honest citizens currently feel hopeless to reach court in disputes because they are not sure that justice will prevail. Gulzar Ahmad's new Supreme Court Chief Justice (CJP) style may differ from his predecessors to bring the rule of law back into the system. Justice Gulzar Ahmad took up the abolition of perjury as one of the foundations of criminal justice reform and his involvement in restoring Pakistan's judiciary. He assured that the law punishing perjury would be implemented with full spirit.

Justice and truth are closely linked and inter-reliant. According to Islamic teachings established truthfulness is a Muslim's central characteristic. Once, Hazrat Muhammad PBUH offered morning prayer, and after he has finished his prayer, he stood up, saying three times: False witness was made equivalent to attributing a partner to Allah. Then he recited: avoid the abomination of idols and avoid speaking falsehood as pure people of Allah's faith, associating nothing with Him.

The discussion of Articles 62 and 63 of the Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973, and the demands we heard to delete them from this fundamental law of our country signify that being trustworthy is no longer considered a central value.

A judiciary that allows deliberate falsehood is doomed to fail, and a society that accepts destroying it. The truth is that the foundation of the Criminal Justice System. In application No. 231 of 2019 before the Supreme Court of Pakistan, Chief Justice of Pakistan stated that "Justice is that the essence and foundation of civil society can compromise the truth is a compromise for society's future as a simple, genuine and civilized society" (Khizar Hayyat Case, PLJ 2019 Supreme Court (Criminal) 265, 2019).

Under Pakistani law false witnesses can be imprisoned up to life, it was said by said former Pakistani chief justice Asif Saeed Khosa during a case of false testimony in Mazhar Hussain's famous murder case. In this case, a police officer, namely Mazhar Hussain, was murdered in Faisalabad, Pakistan. A witness Muhammad Arshad appeared in the witness box. He said, "he was shot in the arm, and he injured out the bit, and I may be punished in the hereafter if I have lied in court." During the hearing, Pakistan's chief justice said that the witness should refrain from talking so much and told him that his medical report says a pellet or bullet did not hit him. CJP also added that "you said that you felt the pellet on your leg too, were you wearing iron pants? A person was sentenced to death because you lied in court. The law says that people who give false testimonies should be imprisoned for life." The court rejected his statement and sent his case to the Anti-Terrorism Court (SAMAA | Zulqarnain Iqbal, 2019).

1.7 Islamic Laws about Perjury
In Islam, very great pressure has been laid on the significance of proper evidence. In the Holy Quran in "Sura-e-Yusaf," it has been provided that when Zulekha falsely accused Hazrat Yusaf of arrogant conduct and no clear evidence was available, except the inconsistent statements of both parties. It was suggested that the shirt of Hazrat Yusaf might be inspected and if it was found to be torn from the front than Zulekha's allegation is correct, but in case the shirt was found torn from the back, Hazrat Yusaf is innocent, and after inspection, Zulekha was found guilty of the false allegation.

1.8 Verses of the Holy Quran
The following verses of the Holy Quran are dealing with the matter of giving testimony:
"And do not mix the truth with falsehood or conceal the truth while you know [it]."(Quran 2:42)
"And let not the witnesses refuse when they are called upon." (Quran 2:282)
"And do not conceal testimony, for whoever conceals it his heart is indeed sinful." (Quran 2:283)
"O you who have believed, be persistently standing firm for Allah, witnesses in justice, and do not let the hatred of a people prevent you from being just. Be just that is nearer to righteousness. Moreover, fear Allah; indeed, Allah is acquainted with what you do." (Quran 5:8)
"O you who have believed, be persistently standing firm in justice, witnesses for Allah, even if it be against yourselves or parents and relatives." (Quran 4:135)
"So follow not [personal] inclination, lest you not be just. And if you distort [your testimony] or refuse [to give it], then indeed Allah is ever, with what you do, acquainted." (Quran 4:135)
"And establish the testimony for [the acceptance of] Allah." (Quran 65:2)
"And we will not withhold the testimony of Allah. Indeed, we would then be of the sinful." (Quran 5:106)
"And avoid false statement." (Quran 22:30)
"And they who do not bear witness to what is false." (Quran 25:72)

From the above verses of the Holy Quran, testifying to its proper meaning and weight is a compulsory duty, and those who stand firm in their testimonies are among the people of morality and faith. If there are no other witnesses that would allow justice to be done, and there is fear that somebody's right may be lost, testifying becomes the few witnesses' responsibilities. Islam commands testimony and prohibits hiding it as hiding evidence is condemned in Islam and disliked by Allah. Giving false testimony has many sins that promote falsehood against the truth and promote injustice and violence against justice. It also erases justice and equity and jeopardizes public security.

1.9 Traditions of the Holy Prophet (PBUH)
According to the Holy Prophet (PBUH), false testimony is one of the extreme evils, and the following hadith verifies the importance of giving true testimony:
" Hazrat Anas (RA) said the Holy Prophet (PBUH) was once asked about great sins.
  i. Joining others to worship Allah;
  ii. To undutiful to one's parents;
  iii. Kill someone (which Allah has forbidden to kill)
  iv. Giving false evidence."

Hazrat Abdullah (RA) narrated that the Holy Prophet (PBUH) said that if somebody makes a false oath to unjustly get a Muslim's property, Allah will be angry when he meets Him (Bukhari, n.d.).

1.10 Enforcement of Hadd Ordinance, 1979
Under section 2 of the Offence of Qazf (Enforcement of Hadd) Ordinance, 1979 offence of Qazf had been provided.
The Holy Quran dealing the offence of Qazf commands that:
"And those who accuse chaste women and then do not produce four witnesses - lash them with eighty lashes and do not accept from them testimony ever after. And those are defiantly disobedient." (Quran 24:4)

"And those who accuse their wives [of adultery] and have no witnesses except themselves - then the witness of one of them [shall be] four testimonies [swearing] by Allah that indeed, he is of the truthful." (Quran 24:6)

"And the fifth [oath will be] that the curse of Allah be upon him if he should be among the liars." (Quran 24:7)

"But it will prevent punishment from her if she gives four testimonies [swearing] by Allah that indeed, he is of the liars." (Quran 24:8)

"And the fifth [oath will be] that the wrath of Allah be upon her if he was of the truthful." (Quran 24:9)

The above verses highlight Islam's position on the compulsory standard of evidence to achieve. The Holy Quran places great importance on the need to meet the necessary standard of evidence. A person who lifts Zina's allegation but does not comply with the evidentiary standards provided must be punished.

2. Conclusion
Individuals who commit perjury are complicit in justice's failure and crooked the legal process of exposing the truth. Bearing false evidence attracts severe, legal penalties in a well-functioning justice system. In an unethical, cruel system, however, giving false evidence is treated as daily detail. Lower courts are rife with alls offering a price for false evidence. Indeed, an accused's life may be in an individual's hands who lives by misleading the court. It is not because there is no perjury law.

The reason perjury is so prevalent in the criminal justice system is that it is so rarely enforced that it may not exist. It emerged in August 2018 that over the past three years, not a single individual is prosecuted for perjury in the SHC and its subordinate courts. False testimony is not always bought, but may sometimes result from witness pressure. Therefore, witness protection must be much more substantial.
Enhanced forensic services would also reduce witness trust. Perjury cannot be isolated. It is just one feature of the consistent, appalling criminal justice system.

In Pakistan whoever gives false evidence or interferes with oral or documentary evidence is liable for imprisonment up to seven-year, and it may also be extended up to the imprisonment of life.

References
IDO Case, PLD 1951 Quetta 14, (1951).
Khizar Hayyat Case, PLJ 2019 Supreme Court (Criminal) 265, (2019).
Implicit Change Leadership, Affective Commitment to Change, and the Mediating Role of Organizational Trust

1Sarfraz Ahmed Dakhan, 2Sheraz Rajput, 3Tariq Aziz, 4Khalil Ahmed Channa
1,2,3,4Department of Business Administration, Sukkur IBA University, Sukkur, Pakistan,
sarfraz@iba-suk.edu.pk

ABSTRACT
This paper aims to know the implicit change leadership schemas, the commitment of the employees towards change, and their relationship with the trust culture of academic institutions. Quantitative approach with surveys of 300 employees of academic institutions has been used in this study. SPSS software has been used to examine the relationship between variables and constructs. Findings reveal that organizational trust has a mediating effect on implicit change leadership and affective commitment to change. Moreover, a positive relationship was found between trust culture and change leadership and change leadership with a commitment to change. Furthermore, the results suggest that change leaders must take into account the trusting culture perspective of the organization to motivate the employees to make them accept change.

JEL Classification
M10, M14

1. Introduction
Today’s era is the most competing if we compare it with the past. With the latest innovations and technologies, and the increased global competition, organizations have to move towards the latest trends, be innovative to sustain, and to adapt the change (Regiana M.hechanova. Raquel Cementina-Olpoc, 2012).

The fast pace changing environment has also pushed academic institutions towards being more receptive to change, and to be flexible enough to cope with the diverse global business models, policies, cultures, and operational structures. This study will be based on analyzing academic institutions. The thing which needs focus here is that this change is not easy to adapt, it requires efforts, management support, employees’ acceptance and most importantly, change leaders and leadership plays a very important role here. Organizations have always found this challenging to deal with change. It is very hard for employees to accept it because it is a matter of moving out of their comfort zones and try to fit into something very new (Lorenzoni, Nicholson, and Whitmarsh, 2007). However, with the help of good leadership culture of change can be developed because leaders are the ones who change the values, behaviours, attitude of the employees with their abilities (Ganta, and Manukonda, 2014).
Without a change leader, the prevailing culture of an organization and commitment of the follower engaged in the change process, it is often not possible to execute, maintain and control the change, no matter what actions are required (Metre, 2009). These leaders aim to be change agent, because they identify the change, create a vision and implement a proper strategy (Drucker, 1999; Gilley, 2005; Hawkins, 2001). Moreover, the employee’s emotional responses to change can be key indicators of how the change will be accepted in an organization.

A study by Griffith cooper has argued that change agents may curb the resistance by creating a sense of collaboration between them for a more united action to construct change through their personality characteristics (Griffith-Cooper and King, 2007). Furthermore, these change agents are supposed to be effective communicators, so that there should be high interaction with the employees and more engagement in the change process. They should also have self-motivation, a clear vision, problem-solving skills, ability to provide accurate information, to communicate and negotiate well, and to rapidly take action where necessary (Luscher and Lewis, 2008).

Apart from the leadership, those employees who are emotionally attached with the organization, and feel that their organizations' problems are their own, they show more commitment, are likely to show a positive attitude to organizational change.

Emphasize has been put on in this paper on affective commitment to change since it positively influences the success of change (Cunningham, 2006; Michaelis et al. 2010) and can be likely to be influenced by implicit leadership theory "ILT" (Hechanova, Caringal-Go and Magsaysay (2018). This theory exhibits that subordinates have do have some dispositions for their leaders, the more their schemas match the actual traits of the leaders, the more that leader is perceived as effective (Epitropaki and Martin, 2005). According to this theory, leaders have five dimensions to be an ideal change leader, which this study will examine in the context of academic institutions. These are strategic or technical competence, character, social, execution, and resilience competence at last. (Magsaysay and Hechanova, 2017).

Accepting the change is also influenced by trust culture in the organization where employees have faith in each other’s intentions, abilities, behaviours, decisions towards the organizational interest rather than the individual interest and have good trustworthy relationships among them. However, leaders also play a pivotal role when it comes to forming a positive culture in the organization where the trustworthy relationship is made among the employees (Ionescu, 2014). A good leader guides the employee through his interpersonal skills about how to maintain a positive work environment which helps employees to embrace change more rapidly. Further research has also demonstrated the more the trust in leaders’ employees have, the more they feel that they are obliged to accept the change (Reinke, 2003).

In this study, we will explore whether there exists to be a positive relationship between implicit change leadership and affective commitment to change. Secondly, we will see how implicit change leadership has an influence on trust culture. We will see the mediating effect of trust culture between change leadership and commitment to change. Lastly, we will see the difference between the actual traits of change leaders and the perceived schemas of the subordinates based on implicit leadership theory (ILT) in academic institutions.

2. Literature Review
2.1 Implicit Change Leadership
Leadership is an important part of an organization to embrace change and face the challenges of rapid growth in technologies and the economic environment (Cabeza Erikson, Edwards, and Van Brabant, 2008). Leadership is considered to be a special ability through which perceptions, values, attitude and beliefs of subordinates can be changed (Ganta, and Manukonda). Change leaders have been emphasized in creating a vision for the future, where employees are motivated and encouraged to accept change.
(Bass, 1985; Den Hartog, Van Muijen & Koopman, 1997; Yammarino & Bass, 1990). Change leadership has thus been an important factor in the change management process.

2.2 Why is it Important?
Research suggests that change is unavoidable and that it is increasing day by day. It’s a critical factor which leads to organizational victory (Drucker, 1999; Ford & Gioia, 2000; Fried-man, 2005; Johansson, 2004; Kuhn, 1970). It can also be seen as the variable which serves ways to gain an edge in the market. (Florida, 2005; Friedman, 2005; Howkins, 2001). Findings reveal that organizations can get a competitive advantage when they adapt transformational and continuous change (Cohen, 1999). Researchers refer to the continuous change which is frequently recurring, emergent, and which never ends (Quinn, 2004; Weick & Sutcliffe, 2001).

Transformational change on the other side refers to the fundamental shift from the current model (Kuhn, 1970). In either case, the researcher agrees that change in the organization is increasing. Change programs where improve organizational performance often disrupts the employee’s routines because they have to perform completely new tasks for which they have little knowledge, learn different skills, and adjust with the new people and environment which is why this is the basic source of unwillingness in employees to adapt the change (Chreim, 2006). Any programs in relation to change therefore could result in stress if employees find it difficult to face (Andrews et al., 2008).

For a change, leaders are the building blocks of readiness in the employees in an organization, where adapting change is not readily accepted. Leadership is now as per new paradigm seen from follower’s perspective. ILT has assumption every individual has mental predispositions about an ideal leader. (Eden and Leviatan, 1975). Follower uses their cognitive schemas to decide upon the effectiveness and ineffectiveness of leaders (Offermann et al., 1994; Phillips and Lord, 1981). ILT defines that employees perform a matching process between their leader and ILT and if there exits deficiency that reduces the impression of the leader. Reversely, more the congruence between ILT of employee and actual leader, the leader is going to be considered as effective (Epitropaki and Martin, 2005; Schyns et al., 2011).

Leadership schemas in one culture may vary from other culture based on varying expectations and settings in cultures. (Popper and Druyan, 2001). The study with reference to ILT across Asia has shown a different list than the list of other countries. Research by (Ling et al. (2000) exhibited Chinese employees had four patterns to define their leaders: interpersonal competence, goal efficiency, versatility and personal mortality. There has been much research conducted on ILT in the context of different cultures. In a research conducted by (Offermann et al. (1994) started with 160 characteristics thought of as leader characteristics, eventually they revealed eight dimensions defining ideal leaders: strength, tyranny, devotion, attractiveness, charisma, intelligence a counter-prototype trait and sensitivity.

2.3 What Variables have been Studied through ICL
A recent study conducted by (Magsaysay and Hechanova, (2017) found out that an ideal leader has five competencies: character, technical and strategic, resilience, execution, and social competencies. Leadership expectation gap occurs when there exists a substantial difference between ILT and actual leader. As per the research conducted by Saltz (2004), stated that follower is to be satisfied with the leader once Leader exhibits the behaviour consistent with follower schema.

2.4 Relationship between Affective Commitment (AC) to Change
2.4.1 ICL
2.4.1.1 AC to Change
AC to change in this study means the (intentions to bolster for the change having perceived all the benefits resulting from the change). For any change initiative of an organization to succeed it must be supported and accepted by its employees (Armenakis and Harris, 2009; Fedor et al., 2006; Smollan, 2006). Commitment to change has an influence on the behaviour and intentions to support change (Herscovitch and Meyer, 2002; Fedor et al., 2006).
2.4.1.2 Why is it Important
A research conducted by Herscovitch and Meyer (2002) showed special interest in investigating the idea of commitment to change which is considered to be the mindset that makes employees pursue the course of actions direly needed for effective implementation of change and formulated the three dimensions of commitment to change (normative, continuance and affective) given the original framework of organizational commitment (Herscovitch and Meyer, 2002). Emphasis on the affective commitment to change since it positively impacts the success of change (Cunningham, 2006; Michaelis et al. 2010) and it is to be positively impacted by ILT (Hechanova, Caringal-Go and Magsaysay (2018).

Moreover, researchers have found a positive relationship between effective leadership and commitment to change. Visionary leaders make employees understand the fair intentions from management side (Harvey et al., 2003). Employees feel committed towards the change and more readily accept the change initiative once they believe that the organization is going to get benefit out of it, and since they deem that the intentions of organizations are worthwhile (Byrne et al., 2005). Furthermore, they also believe that organization is respecting them and is protecting their interests (Korsgaard et al., 2002). By doing so followers tend to perceive the positive outcome of the change and show more commitment towards the change initiative.

Consequently, employees show more commitment during a change when they feel their leaders have respect for them and that they value their dignity during a change process. Open communication of leaders to employees to build trust give employees a sense of good intentions for them (Byrne et al., 2005). These supportive behaviours organizations increase the commitment of the employees to be more receptive to change. (House and Mitchell, 1974).

Affective commitment to change is further supported by social exchange theory in which employees see commitment as a two-way process when they perceive the organization to give them training, opportunities to grow, security in the job and return they believe they should give organization, the loyalty and commitment it needs from its employees (Robinson et al., 1994). Therefore, our first hypothesis to be tested is

Hypotheses 1: There exists a positive relationship between ILC and AC

2.5 Relationship between ICL and Trust Culture
Research conducted by (e.g. Dietz and Den Hartog, 2006; Lewicki et al., 2006; Rousseau et al., 1998; Schoorman et al., 2007) showed that trust consists of multiple dimensions and it has multiple facets even: the affective, trust propensity, behavioural element and cognitive elements, perceived characteristics of the trustee, and the position that trustee and trustor hold in the organization. If perceived promises are not fulfilled in the organization, then the employees of that organization seek to behave negatively (Robinson, 1996; Robinson and Rousseau, 1994). (Neves and Caetano (2009) revealed that how the trust in their leader’s competencies led to an affective commitment by reducing turnover and increasing overall organizational performance.

In an organizational change to accept and be willing to take risks of the change, there are four believes related to trust, the belief that other parties will prove themselves confidential and trustworthy, be honest with what they say and open in their communications, belief that leaders they trust do have such capabilities to process change, and that they are truly sincere with about others best interests (Algahtani, 2014). According to one study trust in management is often characterized as social bond with other parties, a type of social bond in which people exchange their thoughts, receive positive treatments from each other, and create a sense of understanding with each other which improves commitment in the employees (Tyler and Degoey 1996).

Grint says that those who possess strong leadership skills can prove himself a good role model because his achievements get the trust of the people (Grint, 2007). Leaders are the ones who are responsible for the proper execution of the goals. Effective leaders set optimistic and specific goals and they make
effective strategies to achieve those goals. Atkinson in his study said that if there are no good leaders, motivation in employees can’t be enhanced and no clear direction can be given to the organization to adopt the change (Atkinson, 2015). However, a recent take on leadership is to view it from the follower side that comes up with the understanding that leadership is socially constructed, and effective leadership is basically what perceiver thinks. (Meindl, 1995; Van Quaquabeke et al, 2011). Therefore, our second hypothesis to be tested is

**Hypotheses 2: There is a positive relationship between ICL and Trust culture**

**2.6 The Mediating Role of Organizational Trust Culture**

Trust has been identified as the factor which shows the willingness to depend on others based on the previous experience about someone being a trustworthy person (Sitkin and Roth, 1993; Mishra, 1996; Mayer et al., 2007). As per this understanding of the trust, it can be defined as an attitude exhibited by employees for the organization and how it leads its employees (Korsgaard et al., 2002). Scholars have defined trust to be an essential part of implementing change (Armenakis et al., 1993). If the subordinates have trust in the abilities of the leader, their performance can show a boost up and their commitment increases (Lee et al, 2010).

People follow a person whom they trust that he will show them the right path but not a leader who just posturizes the things but not put his words into actions (Stacey, Paul and Alice, 2011). Trust helps build commitment in the employees which reduces the resistance to accept change and helps modify the preexisting beliefs and values which are potential barriers to accept change.

If employees want to embrace change, they need to trust their leaders and management, believe that they are trustworthy (Huy, 2002). Leaders who believe in keeping their promise are to be trusted since they are considered to be honest (Bass, 1985).

In addition, an exceptional leader being good at active management that is to deal with irregularities are mostly perceived as competent, which is a vital dimension of the trust (Mishra, 1997). Moreover, trust in the leaders plays an intervening role between various outcomes and leadership (Podsakoff et al., 1990). Some researchers argue that trust mediates the relationship between leadership and the internal psychological behaviours such as organizational citizenship, satisfaction and motivation (Pillai et al., 1999).

The literature regarding trust has shown its vitality about how valuable it can be to for the acceptance of the change. For instance, a study by (Reinke 2003) has stated the more there is the trust of employees in their leaders the more readiness employees will show to accept the change. Similarly, another study by (Condrey, 1995) has shown a direct relationship between organizational trust and evaluation of new human resource management system and their supervisor role in the change process as the fundamental one. Therefore, our third hypothesis is:

**Hypotheses 3: Trust culture will mediate the positive relationship between ICL and AC.**
3. Methodology
This study was based on convenient sampling. Participants used in this study was lecturers, Assistant professors, Associate Professors, and Professors which were 300 in total. Percentage of male participants were 75.4 and female participants were 24.6. Education of participants ranged from undergraduate to PhD level. The study was based on university teachers, and the sample has been collected from different universities of Sindh province of Pakistan.

3.1 Measures
3.1.1 Implicit Change Leadership: ICL tests whether there is a difference between the characteristics of an actual and ideal leader. Measures used in this study were based on 5 competencies of a change leader in which 30 items has been tested. All the items were recorded on a five-point Likert scale with 1 showing “Strongly Disagree” and 5 show “Strongly Agree”.

3.1.2 Strategic and Technical Competencies: six items have been tested which includes if a leader is Open-minded, Proactive, creative, Analytical, possess intelligence, and have long-term thinking.

3.1.3 Character: Three items have been tested which includes if a leader is Credible, Arrogant, and exemplary.

3.1.4 Execution Competencies: Nine items have been tested to see if a leader is Decisive, Lazy, Inspiring, Persuasive, Passive, Micro manages, effective coach or mentor, is organized, and lacks execution.

3.1.5 Social Competencies: Eight items have been tested to see if a leader is a participative, approachable, empathetic, not bossy, supportive, people-oriented, and not distrustful, and effective communicator.

3.1.6 Resilience: Four items have been tested to see if a leader is Optimistic, Adaptable, not sensitive, composed under pressure.

3.1.7 Affective Commitment to Change: Eights dimensions were tested on a five-point Likert scale with 1 showing "Strongly Disagree" and 5 show "Strongly Agree". Items were “I would be very happy to spend the rest of my career with this institute”. "I enjoy discussing my organization with people outside it”. “I feel as if this institute’s problems are my own”. “I think that I could easily become as attached to another institute as I am to this one”. 
I do not feel like ‘part of the family’ at my institute”. "I do not feel ‘emotionally attached’ to this institute”. "This institute has a much deal of personal meaning for me.” I have no strong sense of belonging to my institute”.

3.1.8 Organizational Trust: Six items have been tested on a five-point Likert scale with 1 showing "strongly disagree” and 5 show "Strongly Agree". Item was “Our institute members are generally trustworthy”. “Our institute members have reciprocal faith in other members' intentions and behaviours". "Our institute members have reciprocal faith in others' ability". “Our institute members have reciprocal faith in others' behaviours to work toward organizational goals”. “Our institute members have reciprocal faith in others' decision toward organizational interests than individual interests". “Our institute members have relationships based on reciprocal faith”.

4. Data Analysis and Results
Compatibility scores for implicit change leadership (ICL) were calculated by getting the difference between actual and ideal. Correlation and mean scores were calculated for each scale. Preceding to the testing of hypothesis, we computed analysis for presuppositions for the bivariate statistic. Durbin Watson test is conducted which is 1.639. Gender, age and education frequency are analyzed from assumptions. At last, regression analysis was used to see the relationship between implicit change leadership (ICL) and affective commitment to change (AC) with mediating role of organizational trust culture (OTC) Cronbach’s alpha is computed from assumptions which show data reliability of 0.739.

4.1 Measurement Model Assessment
Before testing the hypothesis, we have tested the reliability, discriminant validity and convergent validity of the hypothesis. Further details are present in table 2. It represents that all the Loadings (AC1 0.849) are higher than its level of significance of 0.5 (Barclay et al., 1995; chin, 1998). Average variance of every construct (AC 0525, CH 0.58, EC 0.504, SC 0.522, S&T0.544, R 0.533, and TC0.502) is exceeding through its nominal threshold of 0.5 (Bagozzi & Yi, 1988). Results of composite reliability (AC 0.765, TC 0.833 and ICL 0.80086) is also higher than its minimum value recommended (0.70) (Hair et al., 2013). These results are assuring convergent validity and its achievement. So, table 2 suggests the study has significantly attained both the measures validities convergent reliability and scale validity.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Constructs</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Loadings</th>
<th>CR</th>
<th>AVE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Affective-Commitment</td>
<td>AC1</td>
<td>0.849</td>
<td>0.765</td>
<td>0.525</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>AC2</td>
<td>0.694</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>AC3</td>
<td>0.61</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ICLCHAR1</td>
<td>0.594</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ICLCHAR2</td>
<td>0.898</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Character</td>
<td>ICLEC1</td>
<td>0.722</td>
<td>0.726</td>
<td>0.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ICLEC2</td>
<td>0.653</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ICLEC3</td>
<td>0.681</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ICLEC4</td>
<td>0.759</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ICLEC9</td>
<td>0.73</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Execution-Competence</td>
<td>ICLR1</td>
<td>0.838</td>
<td>0.835</td>
<td>0.504</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ICLR2</td>
<td>0.72</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ICLR3</td>
<td>0.615</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social-Competence</td>
<td>ICLSOCIAL2</td>
<td>0.691</td>
<td>0.845</td>
<td>0.522</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ICLSOCIAL3</td>
<td>0.708</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ICLSOCIAL5</td>
<td>0.684</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ICLSOCIAL7</td>
<td>0.798</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3 shows details of the discriminant validity of the current study. Fornell and Larcker (1981) that each variable must have a greater square root of AVE (AC 0.725, CH 0.762, EC 0.71, R0.73, SC 0.722, S&T 0.738, TC 0.708) than the correlation and other variables will have discriminant validity. Also, Fornell and Cha (1994) told us the same measures to confirm discriminant validity. So, table 3 reveals that all variables have discriminant validity.

**Table 3: Discriminant Validity – Fornell and Larcket Method**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Affective-Commitment</td>
<td>0.725</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Character</td>
<td>0.337</td>
<td>0.762</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Execution-Competencies</td>
<td>0.623</td>
<td>0.449</td>
<td>0.71</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resilience</td>
<td>0.561</td>
<td>0.357</td>
<td>0.663</td>
<td>0.73</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social-Competencies</td>
<td>0.596</td>
<td>0.425</td>
<td>0.699</td>
<td>0.638</td>
<td>0.722</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strategic-Tech</td>
<td>0.504</td>
<td>0.424</td>
<td>0.613</td>
<td>0.516</td>
<td>0.56</td>
<td>0.738</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trust Culture</td>
<td>0.656</td>
<td>0.319</td>
<td>0.569</td>
<td>0.556</td>
<td>0.529</td>
<td>0.454</td>
<td>0.708</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.2 Assessment of Structural Model

With the accomplishment of significant reliability and validity for the research model, the assessment with regard to the structural model was obtained. T-Values (implicit change leadership and affective commitment = 8.973 and implicit change leadership and trust culture=16.051) got through the bootstrapping procedure with 300 samples. Table 4 depicts the results of hypotheses. Table 4 shows the positive relationship between implicit change leadership and affective commitment ($\beta =0.427, p<0.01$) and standard error between implicit change leadership and affective commitment is 0.048.

According to hypothesis 2 relationship between implicit change leadership and trust culture also get empirical acknowledgement by the results ($\beta = 0.613, p<0.01$) and standard error between implicit change leadership and trust culture is 0.038.
Table 4: Assessment of Structure Model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypothesis</th>
<th>Relationships</th>
<th>Beta</th>
<th>SE</th>
<th>t-Value</th>
<th>Decision</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>H1</td>
<td>Change Leadership -&gt; Affective Commitment</td>
<td>0.427</td>
<td>0.048</td>
<td>8.973**</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H2</td>
<td>Change Leadership -&gt; Trust Culture</td>
<td>0.613</td>
<td>0.038</td>
<td>16.051**</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 2: Structure Model

4.3 Predictive Power of the Model
In order to determine the predictive power of the model, $R^2$ was analyzed and computed through the PLS algorithm function in Smart PLS 3.0. It was computed for trust Culture which is designed to be the dependent variable in the model. $R^2$ of 0.375 has been determined which is greater than the acceptable value threshold of 0.1 according to the industrial and international research perspective (Falk and Miller, 1992)

Table 5: Assessment of R-Squared

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Construct</th>
<th>$R^2$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Affective-Commitment</td>
<td>0.545</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trust Culture</td>
<td>0.375</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.4 $F$ Squared Assessment
Effect size is being conducted on the formula $F^2 = (R^2 \text{ included} - R^2 \text{ excluded}) / (1 - R^2 \text{ included})$. $F^2$ values are considered to be small when they are 0.02, considered to be as medium when they are 0.15, and 0.35 when they are having large effect size. This study found the results that Trust Culture has small
effect size $f^2 = 0.214$ than affective commitment to change. The effect size of the character is also found to be small with $f = 0.45$. However, the effect size of Resilience, Social, Strategic and technical was found to be large. Following table summarizes the results which are discussed.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dependent Variables</th>
<th>Affective-Commitment</th>
<th>Character</th>
<th>Execution</th>
<th>Resilience</th>
<th>Social</th>
<th>Strategic-Tech</th>
<th>Trust Culture</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Change Leadership</td>
<td>0.251</td>
<td>0.45</td>
<td>3.46</td>
<td>1.685</td>
<td>3.09</td>
<td>1.556</td>
<td>0.601</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trust Culture</td>
<td>0.214</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**4.5 Q-Squared Assessment**

To determine the predictive relevance of the dependent variable, the blindfold approach for cross-validated redundancy of $Q^2$ was computed. The below table presents the blindfold approach results, through which $Q^2$ values for the constructs are found to be greater than zero which suggest that the model do have predictive relevance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dependent Variables</th>
<th>SSO</th>
<th>SSE</th>
<th>$Q^2 = (1 - SSE/SSO)$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Affective-Commitment</td>
<td>900</td>
<td>662.799</td>
<td>0.264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trust Culture</td>
<td>1,500.00</td>
<td>1,238.40</td>
<td>0.174</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**4.6 Mediation Analysis**

Regarding hypothesis 3, the mediation effect of trust culture on change leadership and affective commitment to change, the recommendation from preacher and Hayes (2004; 2008) has been considered. The Bootstrapping method has been carried out to examine the indirect effects of mediation. Findings have been found positive in which $\beta = 0.242, p<0.01$) and with a $t$-value of 7.715. Moreover, as per Preacher and Hayes research indicated there exists the indirect effect of 0.183 with 97.5 per cent Boot must not straddle a zero and hence suggests a mediating effect.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypo:</th>
<th>Relationship</th>
<th>Beta</th>
<th>SE</th>
<th>$t$-value</th>
<th>2.50%</th>
<th>97.50%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>H3</td>
<td>Change Leadership -&gt; Affective-Commitment</td>
<td>0.242</td>
<td>0.031</td>
<td>7.715</td>
<td>0.183</td>
<td>0.305</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**5. Discussion**

Results support our hypothesis that implicit change leadership do have a positive direct relationship with affective commitment to change and that change leadership schemas positively affects commitment to change.

Moreover, our second hypothesis has also been supported showing that implicit change leadership schemas also have a positive relationship with organizational trust culture. Our third hypothesis which was to show the mediating effect of trust culture on change leadership and affective commitment to change has also been supported by using the bootstrapping method, and with the $t$-value of 7.715 and $p$-value of less than 0.01 and with the beta of 0.242 the mediation effect does exist. These results add to the literature and show how important it is for leaders to develop a positive mindset and image in the
eyes of employees and subordinates to readily accept change and to show more loyalty and commitment in terms of organizational trust and change.

Results also indicated that the constructs have also passed reliability test with all the constructs of implicit change leadership having more loading than the normal significant level. Of 0.05. So, it has been shown that the study has convergent reliability which shows that the constructs are in fact related. Furthermore, a discriminant validity test was also conducted, and all the variables proved discriminant validity as shown in table 3 which suggests that those items which are not related are actually not overlapping and are unrelated.

Structural equation modelling and the bootstrapping method was used to prove the hypothesis and infer the decision in which all the decisions were supported. The mediating effect of trust culture was shown and the relationship between implicit change leadership and trust culture was supported with a standard error of 0.038.

The proportion of variance for the dependent variable was found R2 was found more than the acceptable threshold level for the dependent variable. Affective commitment with R2 0.545 shows 54.5% of the variance accounted by the model, which shows a moderate fit with the model, whereas trust culture with R2 0.375 shows 37.5 % variance accounted by the model.

The model has greater than 0 Q2 values which show that the model does have predictive validity with affective commitment having slightly more predictive relevance than the trust culture. This measure shows the importance of creating an organizational trust among employees with having change leaders possessing strong influence and desirable attitude to get the subordinates to accept the change by showing the positive relationships between trust culture and change leadership.

6. Implications and Conclusion

6.1 Implications
It has been revealed in the research that how important it is for the leaders to develop a positive attitude in the minds of employees and build a culture in which employees trust in the practices of organization and feel committed to it.

It is, therefore, necessary for change leaders to develop such skills and polish their competencies so that in the time when they truly want their organizational members to be adept to change they should not face any difficult convincing them, instead they must not be concerned about the resistance they might face from their employees regarding any change that may occur in an organization and rather should have a firm trusting culture.

7. Conclusion
This study confirmed that organizational trust plays a key role in accepting change. It shows that change leaders personality traits do have an influence on the commitment of employees in academic institutions and that trust and commitment collectively build leadership schemas which in turn make the employees feel more loyal to their organizations and readily accept the change.

The study was limited to academic institutions of Sindh region; however, culture influences may differ in other provinces. Leadership traits may differ based on the specific cultural aspects of that region. So, future studies can consider the cultural perspective of academic institutions of other provinces as well. Furthermore, future studies can also take the effects of different variables as a mediating effect on change leadership and commitment to change.

References


Awareness on Islamic Banking: An Investigation on Women Entrepreneurs in Quetta

1Saba Raja, 2Jameel Ahmed, 3Kaneez Fatima
1Research Student, Institute of Management Sciences, University of Balochistan, Quetta, Pakistan, sabaraja28@yahoo.com
2&3 Assistant Professor, Institute of Management Sciences, University of Balochistan, Quetta, Pakistan, jamil.ahmed@um.uob.edu.pk, fatima.sohail@hotmail.com

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

History
Revised format: November 2020
Available Online: December 2020

Keywords
Women entrepreneurs, Awareness, Islamic Banking, Islamic Banking Products, Quetta.

JEL Classification
M0, M1

This study creates the profile of women entrepreneurs in Quetta city and examines their awareness level regarding Islamic banking and its products. The study is descriptive in nature and survey questionnaire was used for data collection. The data from 106 women entrepreneurs were collected who are engaged in multiple business activities in Quetta city. From the results it has been found that majority of the women entrepreneurs (i.e., 60%) knew about the term, Islamic banking but the sample size trimmed down as the research questions moved to awareness about Islamic principles, Shariah board, Islamic banking products, Islamic modes of finance and comparison of Islamic banking with conventional banking. It was found that only 10 (out of 106) women entrepreneurs are highly aware about Islamic banking, Islamic principles, Shariah board, Islamic banking products, and Islamic modes of finance. This study suggests that Islamic banks, scholars, and academicians should collaborate to enhance the awareness by arranging awareness campaigns, workshops, seminars, and training sessions on Islamic banking and its products among women entrepreneurs.

© 2020 Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: sabaraja28@yahoo.com

1. Introduction

Islamic finance implies the financial structure in which all financial activities must comply with Shariah (Reiff, 2018). The concept of Islamic finance came into being with the inception of Islam, but formally Islamic banking system was established in the 20th century. It provides an interest-free banking system and operates according to Shariah (Gait & Worthington, 2007). Islamic banking is rapidly growing in the international market. Currently, more than 300 Islamic banks are operating in over 50 countries around the world (Lim, 2019) and more than 200 conventional banks are offering Islamic banking services from their Islamic windows (Markets, 2019).

In Pakistan, the Islamic banking system was initiated with the establishment of Meezan bank in 2002.
Currently, five Islamic banks and 16 conventional banks with Islamic windows are functioning in the country (SBP, 2019). The annual growth rate of the Islamic banking is 17% in Pakistan. The market share of Islamic banking in total assets and deposits of banking industry has grown to 13.5% and 15.5% respectively in 2018. However, the market share is still low in comparison to conventional banks which indicates that there is enormous potential for growth of Islamic banking in Pakistan (Islamic Banking Bulletin, 2018).

To expand the market share, Islamic banks need to provide an extensive range of financial products and facilities to serve a large group of consumers. In Pakistan, currently, Islamic banks are providing financing in three sectors, which are corporate, consumer and SME sector. Figure-1 shows the sector-wise financing by Islamic banks. It is evident from the figures that financing to the corporate sector is high in overall financing while financing to SMEs is very low throughout the period (Islamic Banking Bulletin, 2020). Islamic banks may increase their share substantially by paying attention to the SME sector as it is one of the major sectors which captures the 90% of business in Pakistan, contributes nearly 40% in GDP and provides employment to 80% of the non-farming workforce (Iqbal, 2019).

In the SME sector, women entrepreneurs are also playing an essential role and has immense potential to contribute to the development of society and economic growth (Susruhan & Priyadharshany, 2018). In Pakistan, the number of women entrepreneurs is growing at good pace (Kazmi, 2018).

However, in Pakistan, women are disproportionately under-served by the country's financial system as only 25% of the total unique bank accounts are owned by women. This situation is bleaker in case of Balochistan which may be attributed to poverty, cultural or religious values. This act as a major impediment in economic and social development. To address this gap, State Bank of Pakistan has developed a Gender Mainstreaming Policy "Banking on Equality: Reducing the Gender Gap in Financial Inclusion" that aims to promote women financial inclusion in Pakistan (State Bank of Pakistan).

Islamic banks may play an important role in this regard by focusing on financial needs of women entrepreneurs to run their businesses smoothly. This will increase the market share of Islamic banks in the industry and their contribution towards economic growth and development. To serve this purpose, Islamic banks must have knowledge about the awareness level of individuals in the market about Islamic banking. They must take measures to create basic awareness about the products and services they are offering to the customers and make them understand how Islamic banks are different from conventional banks.

There have been many studies conducted to examine the attitudes and awareness of customers, university graduates and bank employees about the Islamic banking (Hidayat et al., 2020; Luija et al., 2018; Ahmed, Bano & Dawood, 2017; Ahmad et al., 2015; Chowdhury & Arifuzzaman, 2013; Khafafa
There have also been few studies conducted on business firms, corporations, and SMEs’ attitudes towards the Islamic financial system (Gait & Worthington, 2008). However, no study in literature has investigated the awareness level of women entrepreneurs about Islamic banking. Thus, this study aims to investigate the awareness level of women entrepreneurs about Islamic banking and its products in Quetta, Pakistan. The study will contribute to literature in several ways; First, it focuses the women entrepreneurs of Quetta where, no profile of the women entrepreneurs was available with SMEDA or any other Govt Organization. Hence, we create their profile. Secondly, it determines the degree of awareness of women entrepreneurs on Islamic banking, and its products and the difference between Islamic and conventional banking.

The rest of the paper is organized as follows; Section 2 reviews the literature briefly, section 3 lays out the methodology, section 4 presents the analysis of results, section 5 concludes.

2. Literature Review

Islamic banking system is characterized as banking system which is in line with Islamic values and governed by the Shariah principles (Cheteni, 2014). Fundamentally, Islamic banking system is introduced to fulfill the requirement of Muslims to use banking products/services in such a way that doesn’t comprise the Islamic values (Khan et al., 2007). Islamic banking is rapidly growing in last few decades and expended to all places in world-wide and it has gained extensive recognition among Muslims and Non-Muslims (Ahmad et al., 2015).

2.1 Awareness about Islamic Banking

Awareness refers to the knowledge or information about the particular object (Yaur, 1973). Awareness towards Islamic banking and its products refers to the knowledge and understanding about the existence of Islamic bank, as well as information about its operations, product/services and all functions of Islamic banking (Buchari et al., 2015a). In literature, number of studies (for example Hidayat et al., 2020; Ahmed, Bano & Dawood, 2017; Ahmad et al., 2015; Chowdhury & Arifuzzaman, 2013; Gökşu & Becic, 2012; Haron et al., 1994) have been conducted on the awareness level of customers, employees, entrepreneurs, students of graduate studies, university employees, and Muslims and Non-Muslim communities. These studies have been conducted in various countries around the world including Bahrain, Jordan, Bangladesh, Brunei, Libya, South Africa and in several cities of Pakistan.

The previous studies show that majority of customers were aware with the term, ‘Islamic banking’ (Saini et al., 2011). However, they were less aware with the products and services provides by Islamic banks (Metawa & Almosawi, 1998). The customers were using it for daily transactions therefore they were aware only with some general products including current/saving accounts, Automated Tailored Machine (ATM), and the rest were unfamiliar with other products offered by Islamic banking (Imran et al., 2014; Raza & Azeem, 2014). Similarly, the majority of the respondents were not aware with several financial products such as Mudarabaha, Musharkaha, Murhabaha and Ijarah (Khan et al., 2007). Naser et al. (1999) found that majority of the customers have switched to Islamic banking due to religious motivation. The religious motivation is one of the important factors while choosing Islamic banking, whereas the other factors including confidentiality of customers' information, transaction efficiency, services charges, and financial counseling played a significant role in choosing Islamic banking (Khattak & Rehman, 2010). On the contrary there were few customers who had skeptical views regarding the Shariah compliance of Islamic banking (Imran et al., 2014). The few studies suggested that marketing strategies should be improved to boost the customer's awareness regarding Islamic banking products as the majority of the respondents were unaware with Islamic banking products and financial products (Bashir, 2013; Khafafa & Shafii, 2013).

Similarly, few studies have been conducted on awareness of financial institution’s employees. These studies have been conducted in Bahrain, Russia, and Pakistan. The study in Bahrain shows that more than half of the participants were aware of Islamic banking, and have positive perspective for Islamic banking products (Buchari et al., 2015b). On the other hand, the study in Russia found that there is a
relatively low level of awareness among employees of financial institutions. The respondents were not aware that Riba, Maysir and Gharar strictly prohibited in Islam. Likewise, the respondents were not aware of financial products, even they were not familiar with the terminologies used in modes of finance (Hidayat et al., 2020). Furthermore, in comparison to the employees of Islamic banks and Conventional banks having Islamic windows, the employees of Islamic banks are more aware with the operations, products and services of Islamic banks than their conventional counterparts (Arshad et al., 2011; Zainol, 2008). It has also been found that the gender and age pay a significant role in terms of awareness of employees (Buchari et al., 2015b; Saleem et al., 2018).

Furthermore, few studies have also been conducted on university graduates regarding their awareness about Islamic banking. These studies found that majority of respondents have a lack of understanding about Islamic banking and they were unfamiliar with the products offered by Islamic banks (Ali, 2016). Due to lack of understanding, the respondents had skeptical views regarding Shariah compliance activities of Islamic banking (Chowdhury & Arifuzzaman, 2013).

The review of literature shows that the studies are conducted on awareness level of customers, employees, entrepreneurs, students of graduate studies, university employees, and Muslims and Non-Muslims communities. They found varying degree of awareness on Islamic banking. However, no study has investigated the awareness level of women entrepreneurs on Islamic banking. This study attempts to fill the gap by measuring the awareness level of women entrepreneurs in Quetta city. This is interesting to investigate because women in general and Quetta being a capital city of Balochistan, in particular are underserved by the financial system in Pakistan.

3. Research Methodology
This study is descriptive in nature as it described the extent to which women entrepreneurs are aware of Islamic banking and its products in Quetta city. This approach is deemed appropriate to observe and measure any phenomena (Combes, 2019). Additionally, the researcher compiled the business profile of Quetta's women entrepreneurs, as no such information was available regarding women entrepreneurs and their businesses in Quetta.

The researchers used survey method to examine the women entrepreneurs' awareness level about Islamic banking and its products. Survey method is an appropriate method when the researchers aim to describe or explain the characteristics of a group (Ponto, 2015). A structured questionnaire was designed to survey women entrepreneurs; the questionnaire consisted of the demographic, business profile, and awareness about Islamic banking.

For data collection, the researchers acquired the list of 201 women entrepreneurs from various sources including Small and Medium Development Authority (SMEDA), Innovative Development Organization (IDO), Incubation Center of Sardar Bahadur Khan Women University (SBKWU), National Incubation Center (NIC) Quetta, and Women Chamber of Commerce and Industries (WCCI) Quetta. The snowball sampling was also used to get further contacts of women entrepreneurs.

The researcher approached the complete list of 201 women entrepreneurs. It has been found that out of the 201 contacts, 51 contacts numbers were invalid or wrong, 21 of them didn't attend the call, and 23 didn't respond to the questionnaire. Therefore, the data was collected from 106 women entrepreneurs by personal visits, using telephonic calls, and through online questionnaires.

The data was analyzed through descriptive analysis using SPSS. The descriptive analysis technique describes the basic features and provides the summarized information of measured data (Kenton, 2019).

4. Analysis and Findings
The analysis of the study is divided into three sections. Firstly, the demographic profile is presented which demonstrate the respondents' background. In the second section, the business profile is developed, which identified the business sectors of women entrepreneurs in Quetta. In the last section, awareness
about Islamic banking is analyzed to measure women entrepreneurs’ awareness level about Islamic banking and its products.

In this study, the researchers analyzed different aspects of the demographic profile of women entrepreneurs. Table 1 demonstrates various age groups of the women entrepreneurs. It is evident from the following Table that majority of women entrepreneurs fall under the age of 45 years. More than 50 percent of women entrepreneurs are in the age group of 25-35. This means that women in this age group are more inclined toward starting their own businesses rather than seeking jobs. It is because Govt. of Pakistan is encouraging higher education institutions to educate the university graduates regarding entrepreneurship by not only offering courses related to entrepreneurship but also organizing training sessions and Business Idea Competitions. For this purpose, Higher Education Commission (HEC) directed all universities to operationalize business incubation centers to support the young entrepreneurs (Reuters, 2019).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>≤ 25 Years</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>22.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26-35 Years</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>37.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36-45 Years</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>28.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46-55 Years</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>10.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>≥ 56 Years</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1. Age profile of Women entrepreneurs

The type of businesses operated by women entrepreneurs in Quetta city can be divided into 11 different business sectors as shown in Table 3. It has been found that Clothing, Beauty Salon and Food-related businesses account for approximately 75 percent of overall businesses operated by women entrepreneurs.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethnic Group</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Balochi</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>11.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pashtun</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>14.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brahvi</td>
<td>04</td>
<td>3.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persian</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>10.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Punjabi</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>33.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urdu</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>23.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>04</td>
<td>3.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2. Ethnic Group of Women

5. Business Report that overview of the which includes nature of business owner 2019). In the researchers developed the business profile of 106 women entrepreneurs because no detailed information existed regarding women entrepreneurs' businesses in Quetta city. This is not surprising because women entrepreneurship is one of the areas which has not received much attention in traditional societies of Pakistan. According to World Bank, Pakistan has the lowest rate of women entrepreneurship (i.e., only 1 percent) among other countries across the globe.

The type of businesses operated by women entrepreneurs in Quetta city can be divided into 11 different business sectors as shown in Table 3. It has been found that Clothing, Beauty Salon and Food-related businesses account for approximately 75 percent of overall businesses operated by women entrepreneurs.
in Quetta city. According to Khizar and Farrukh (2020), Clothing, Beauty Salon and Food-related businesses are the traditional sectors for women businesses. Majority of women prefer these businesses over other types of businesses.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nature of Business</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Baking</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beauty salon</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>29.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clothing</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>30.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Event Management</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>15.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Handicrafts</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jewelry</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miscellaneous</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Regarding nature of the businesses, the businesses may be classified as registered or un-registered. Williams and Shahid (2016) state that women entrepreneurs are more likely to operate in the informal sector. According to (ILO, 2012), an informal sector is defined as the fact that businesses are not constituted as a legal entity, or owners have not registered their business with any authorized body for tax purposes. It is evident from Table 4 that 68 percent of the women entrepreneurs of Quetta city are operating informal businesses. In literature, it has been also identified that most of the women entrepreneurs in Pakistan operate informal businesses. Goheer et al. (2003) argue that majority of women are hesitant to register their businesses with legislative bodies because their businesses are small scale and home-based. Additionally, documentation is required for getting registered.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Business sector</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Registered</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>32.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Un-registered</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>68.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5 depicts that approximately 70 percent of women entrepreneurs have home-based businesses. They either sell their products online using social media or arranging stalls in different exhibitions. On the contrary, only 30 percent of women entrepreneurs have business outlets in various locations of Quetta city. These outlets include Boutiques, Beauty Salons, and Restaurants located in a different areas of Quetta city. Due to small scale businesses and un-affordability of business outlets, majority of the women started their online businesses and promoting their products through social media. The new era of technology provides great opportunities for people to start and nourish their business by using less financial resources (Sarfaraz, 2017).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Business operation</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Home-Based</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>69.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical outlet</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>30.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Regarding means of finance, majority of the women entrepreneurs started their businesses from personal financing. Shaharuddin et al. (2005) identified that significant number of the SMEs owners started their business with personal financing; which means initial financing from bank is relatively low in case of SMEs. The results given in Table 6 exhibited that 68.9 percent of respondents instigated their businesses
by personal financing, 29.2 percent through family/friends financing. However, only a small fraction of 1.9 percent of women entrepreneurs commenced their business by obtaining financing from the banks. Due to interest factor and bank criteria for financing, most of the women prefers to start their business with their personal, and family financing (Syed, 2010).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Initial Capital for Business</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Personal</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>68.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family/Friends Financing</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>29.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loan from Bank</td>
<td>02</td>
<td>1.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6. Analysis of Awareness about Islamic Banking and its Products

In this study, numerous questions were probed from women entrepreneurs about Islamic banking to assess their awareness regarding Islamic banking and its product. The questionnaire was categorized into six sections based on awareness about Islamic banking, Islamic principles, Shariah board, Islamic banking products, modes of finance, and comparison of Islamic banking with their conventional counterparts.

The first about and main question about awareness of Islamic banking was asked from 106 women entrepreneurs. The result as shown in Figure 2 depicts that only 64 women entrepreneurs were aware about Islamic banking, whereas 42 women entrepreneurs were not aware about it. In Pakistan, the Islamic banking system is introduced since nearly two decades, yet the awareness level among women entrepreneurs is relatively low. Such low awareness level among women entrepreneurs could be due to insufficient marketing strategies as up till now Islamic banks are incapable to launch awareness campaigns for the women in Pakistan (Ayub, 2013). Based on awareness of women entrepreneurs about Islamic banking, the sample size decreased to 64 respondents. The researchers queried the remaining questions from only those women entrepreneurs who were aware about Islamic banking.

Although majority of the women entrepreneurs (i.e., 60 percent) knew about Islamic banking but the number of women entrepreneurs further trimmed down as we moved to our second question i.e., Islamic banking operations are based on Islamic principles. From 64 women entrepreneurs, only 44 of them were aware that Islamic banking is based on Islamic principles as shown in Figure 3. The results found to be in line with a study conducted on general society that majority of the respondents were aware with the existence of Islamic banking. However, limited respondents knew about the way Islamic banks operate (Shaikh et al., 2017). Based on the responses of women entrepreneurs, the sample size further
reduced to 44 respondents. The researchers asked the remaining questions from only those women entrepreneurs who were not only aware about Islamic banking existence but also knew that it is based on Islamic principles.

The queries regarding various aspect of Islamic principles, which the researchers asked from the women entrepreneurs, were mainly focused on *Riba* (interest), profit-loss sharing principles, uncertainty (*gharar*) and investment in *halal* businesses. Being a Muslim and resident of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, the majority of women entrepreneurs were aware about the concept of *Riba* and its prohibition in Islam (see Figure 4). This may be because *Riba* and its prohibition is not only stated in Quran, *Hadith* and in *fiqh* books but it has also been discussed in length by Islamic scholars (Ali, 2007). However, only 34 of women entrepreneurs knew about *Riba*-free banking activities.

Regarding profit-loss sharing principle, the researchers found that almost half of the women entrepreneurs knew that Islamic banking and its returns are based on profit-loss sharing principle. While 15 of them were informed about the risk-sharing model as shown in Figure 5. The results demonstrated that awareness regarding Islamic banking operations was relatively low. Such low level of awareness could be due to marketing strategies, as Islamic banks are unable to properly target the unaware segment of general society in order to create their awareness regarding Islamic baking and its operations which would ultimately increase market share of Islamic banks (Rustam et al., 2011).
Concerning the awareness about prohibition of uncertainty (gharar) and investment by the Islamic banks in *Halal* businesses, only 14 women entrepreneurs were aware about the fact that Islamic banks avoid uncertainty (gharar) in all forms of transactions (see Figure 6). Almost half of them knew that Islamic banks invest only in *Halal* businesses.

Based on the responses of 44 women entrepreneurs regarding various aspects of Islamic principles (such as *Riba* & its prohibition, profit-loss sharing principle, risking sharing, uncertainty (gharar) and investment in *Halal* businesses), the results (as shown in Figure 4 – 6) found to be mixed as discussed previously. Although majority of them were well informed about concept of *Riba* and its prohibition in Islam. But it has been found that there were only 21 women entrepreneurs who positively answered all the questions related to different aspects of Islamic principles. The rest of them were not familiar with different aspects of Islamic principles. Insufficient knowledge about Islamic principles pertaining to Islamic finance and its various aspects could be one of the reasons behind such unawareness as highlighted by (Hidayat, 2020).

Due to lack of understanding about Islamic principles and its different aspects, the sample size reduced to 21 so the remaining questions were asked from those women entrepreneurs who not only were aware about existence of Islamic banking but also were well informed about Islamic principles and its various aspects. The researchers queried the 21 women entrepreneurs about *Shariah* board and its functions. It has been found that all of the women entrepreneurs were aware about *Shariah* board of Islamic banks and its roles in evaluation of Islamic banking activities and product & services as depicted in Figure 7.
The responses of 21 women entrepreneurs about products and services offered by the Islamic banks are shown in Figure 8. It is evident from the results that almost half of the women entrepreneurs were aware about the different products offered by the banks. Such products included saving accounts, investment schemes/funds and Takaful. These results found to be consistent with the literature (Khafafa & Shafi, 2013).

Based on the results discussed in the previous para, the sample size shrank to the 12 women entrepreneurs. The research inquired the question about the modes of Islamic finance from remaining 12 women entrepreneurs. These women entrepreneurs were well aware about the Islamic principles and its various aspects, Shariah board, and products offered by the Islamic banks. It is evident from the results as shown in Figure 9 that most of the women entrepreneurs had high level of understanding about two of the modes of Islamic finance used by Islamic banks in structuring their products which included Mudarabaha and Musharakah. However, their awareness about Murabahah, Istisna, Salam and Diminishing Musharakah found to be quite low Ijara, Salam etc. These results were also in line with the findings of Raza and Azeem (2014), which demonstrated that banking customers were informed about Mudarabaha and Musharakah, but they do not have high level of awareness about other modes of Islamic finance which included Istisna, Murabahah etc.
Finally, the researchers asked the most aware 10 women entrepreneurs about the comparison of Islamic banks with conventional ones. It is evident from Figure 10 that all 10 women entrepreneurs deemed Islamic banks different from their conventional counterparts.

The study analyzed that there are 10 women entrepreneurs who are highly aware about Islamic banking, Islamic principles, Shariah board, Islamic banking products, and Islamic modes of finance.

7. Conclusion
The paper investigated the awareness level of women entrepreneurs regarding Islamic banking and its products in Quetta city. Additionally, the researcher compiled business profile of Quetta-based women entrepreneurs. The researchers identified the 11 multiple sectors where women entrepreneurs are operating their businesses and found that majority of women entrepreneurs are engaged in informal businesses.

Moreover, to examine the awareness level, the researcher conducted a survey and found that the overall awareness about Islamic banking among women entrepreneurs is relatively low. The study analyzed that around 60% women entrepreneurs knew Islamic banking however the response regarding the furtherquires were diminished as the researcher moved to the next sections. Regarding various aspect of Islamic principles, the study identified that majority of women entrepreneurs were aware about the concept of Riba and its prohibition in Islam. However, the study found mixed responses for other aspects of Islamic principles including profit-loss sharing, uncertainty (gharar), and investment in halal business. The findings revealed that only a few numbers of women entrepreneurs were familiar with different aspects of Islamic principles and about Shariah board’s role in Islamic banking. The results revealed that around 11% women entrepreneurs were aware of different products offered by Islamic
banks. Similarly, around 09% of women entrepreneurs were aware with various financial products such as Mudarabaha, Musharkaha, Ijarah, Salam, Istisna, and Diminishing Musharakah. The study found that only 10 women entrepreneurs (i.e., 09%) are highly aware about Islamic banking, Islamic principles, Shariah board, Islamic banking products, and Islamic modes of financing.

The study analyzed that due to lack of knowledge and insufficient marketing strategies of Islamic banks, majority of women entrepreneurs were unaware with different aspects of Islamic banking. The study suggested that Islamic banks should start new marketing strategies by targeting the neglected sectors. Therefore, with the collaboration of the State Bank of Pakistan, the Islamic banking industry should initiate awareness campaigns, arrange workshops, seminars, and training sessions to increase awareness regarding Islamic banking among women entrepreneurs and general public.

Reference


Markets. (2019). Global Islamic Finance Markets Report 2019: Islamic Banking is the Largest Sector,


Sectarianism in Pakistan: A Statistical Analysis of Problems of Shia Hazara Community of Quetta

Gulshan Majeed, 1

1Assistant Professor, Department of Political Science, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan, gulshan_99@hotmail.com

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

Pakistan was created on the name of religion and it was perceived by the leaders that religion would prove a binding factor among various ethnic and religious identities of Pakistan but it could not happen because religion was not implemented in its true sense. The phenomenon of sectarianism emerged as a significant issue specifically during the decade of 1980s in the era of General Zia because of Islamization process. Quetta, the city of Balochistan has largest Shia Hazara community and this community has become victim of Suicide attacks, bomb blasts and terrorist acts. This community feels itself highly insecure in Quetta. Researcher has conducted research on this sensitive issue of sectarian violence against Shia Hazara community of Quetta by using primary and secondary sources to collect data. This study will highlight actual grievances of this community and provide guidance to the policy makers to understand the real concerns of this community.

© 2020 Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0

Keywords

sectarianism, integration, Shia Hazara Community, Militant, Violence

JEL Classification

M10, M11

Corresponding author’s email address: gulshan_99@hotmail.com


1. Introduction

Sunni-Shia conflicting situation is not new in Pakistan particularly in the province of Punjab. Sunni-Shia conflicts were of different nature under Britishers than the Muslim rulers in Sub-Continent. British Raj became successful to uproot sunni-shia confrontation during its whole period of governance from 1857 to 1947. They implemented various policies to contain Sunni-Shia conflicting situation. After 1947 Shia in Pakistan tried to continue the attitude of indifference towards their faith as they used to do under Britishers. (Ahmad, 2011). Sectarian conflicts became more prominent during the decade of 1980. A number of internal and external reasons were there. Some external forces for example the Iranian Revolution also contributed in the emergence of sectarian violent conflicting situation in Pakistan. The growth of Shi’ite militancy in Iran proved a source for Shia community of Pakistan to assert them more forcefully and this assertion gave air to the existing differences between Shia and Sunni community of Pakistan. Ruling elite remained unable to establish socio-political institutions on the basis of true democratic and moral values. (Jullundhri, 1998). In the capital city of Balochistan different sects used to live peacefully but the peace of province was disturbed because of war in Afghanistan and Iranian Revolution. Quetta the capital of Balochistan has largest Shia population between 500,000 and 600,000. They spread over in the west and east of the city. Since 1947, the Shia Hazaras community has remained an underprivileged. Mostly their income depends on remittance payments from Australia, Europe, Iran,
and Gulf. This is one belief in Pakistan that Shia Hazara community receives Iranian support and General Zia's government permitted state actors to support anti-Hazara segments for this reason. *(NHRC Report, 2018)*. Hazara Democratic Party is an organized voice of Shia Hazara community of Balochistan. This party is a significant source to find statistics on anti-Hazara violence in the capital city of Balochistan. The socio-economic condition of Pakistan also produces militant behavior among different sects. The country has been facing the menace of poverty since its birth and has a high population growth rate. One can observe socio-political fabric of the country ripped by corruption, poverty, illiteracy, and terrorism and most crucial by sectarian conflicts. The people of Pakistan seem highly worried about the future of Pakistan. In Pakistani society the phenomenon of radicalism has been working on sectarian lines. *(Mahmood, 1995)*

2. Literature Review

To review literature is very important to conduct research in an organized way. Researcher can have an opportunity through available literature review regarding topic to evolve a mechanism to conduct research in an impartial way. There can be more conceptual clarity and more valuable conclusions can be drawn which can be more helpful to solve problems of the society and state. For this present study researcher has tried to go through various available resources to develop conceptual clarity.

Khalid Ahmad in his book titled "Sectarian War: Pakistan Sunni-Shia Violence and Its Links to the Middle –East" has explained that thousands of lives have been lost in Pakistan because of sectarian conflicts. He states that during British Raj very tolerable level of Sunni-Shia tension was witnessed and this situation remained in Pakistan till the decade of 1970s. Sunni-Shia conflicts became explicit during 1980s due to role of certain internal and external factors. Pakistan became front line state during Soviet invasion in Afghanistan Islamization process which provided by General Zia within the boundary of Pakistan also was supported by the government of Saudi Arabia.

Musa Khan Jalazai in his book titled "Sectarianism and Politico-Religious Terrorism in Pakistan” has explained in detail administrative structure before partition and highlights the structure of Pakistan administrative system 1973 to 1985. Author discusses ideological confrontation in religious perspective and organized sectarianism in Pakistan. He has explained in detail the differences among Sunni and Shia sects and their different tactics to respond each other and create terror in the society.

Anatol Lieven in his book titled " Pakistan a Hard Country “ has explained in detail Pakistan's internal problems and threat to Pakistan from Pakistani Taliban. Author has discussed about different activities of Pakistani Taliban and their support base in Pakistani society. Pakistani Taliban enjoy support by the local population. Security forces find it very difficult to sort out their hide outs because they have been living like common people among general public. They initiate their disruptive activities and seek hide among local population.

Musa Khan Jalazai in his book titled "Suicide Terrorism Taliban, Cross-Border Terrorism and Violence in Pakistan and Afghanistan” has explained that terrorists target people indiscriminately and they initiate terrorist acts to achieve their specific objectives. The major objective of terrorists is to create fear in the mind of people and get government’s attention. He did highlight the concerns of US and Afghanistan. It is the main concern of Afghanistan that Pakistan should prevent terrorists to cross over into Afghanistan. Escalation of militant extremism in Pakistan has created a significant fault line in the politics of Pakistan. Author explained that sectarian forces have potential to shake the foundation of state. Extremist elements have been posing great internal security threat.

Zahid Hussain  in his book titled "The Relentless Rise of Islamic Militants in Pakistan –And How It Threatened the World The Scorpion's Tail” has explained how and in what way Americans have been initiating various activities to fight against the militant groups of Pakistan and Afghanistan. He has highlighted in detail the concerns of America in this region. Author explained in detail about drone attacks Campaign to tackle extremist elements of Pakistan. Author has explained various issues related
to drone attacks and reaction of local population because according to local population some innocent people have also becoming victim of these attacks and developing sense of hatred towards security agencies. Author did highlight that militants have secured safe heavens in different parts of Pakistan including the province of KPK, Baluchistan and Punjab.

Rashid Ahmad (Jullundhri) in his book titled “Islam and Current Issues” has explained in detail about the impact of Islamic fundamentalism in Pakistan. In Pakistan various social organization, Ulama, fundamentalists and nationalists want to bring change in socio-political set up. These groups share national feelings that Pakistani people should have a healthy political system which can secure their material and spiritual needs. Consequently people have to face hard times. They received bad treatment at the hands of ruling class. The author has explained the case of East Pakistan crisis.

Tor H. Aase in his article in the book titled “Muslim Diversity: Local Islam in Global Context” has explained in an organized way the existing differences between Sunni and Shia of Gilgit. Before 1988 Gilgit used to be perceived a peaceful place where Shia, Sunni and Ismailis have been living peacefully without confronting with each other. In 1988 conflict emerged between Shias and Sunnis over the start of Ramadan. A single incident did happen which escalated into violent conflicting situation between Sunnis and Shias of Gilgit particularly and generally in whole. Shias start their fast one day before Sunnis and same was done by the Shias of Gilgit. On the second day of Ramadan Shias of Gilgit woke up and anti shia slogans written on the walls of towns. The writings claimed that Shias were non Muslims or Kuffar. Shias became highly emotional over these writings and shooting broke out. Sunnis from the south of Gilgit started to move to rescue their fellow believers. Sunnis were moving to wage jihad on Shias in Gilgit and Shias were also gathering to fight against the Sunnis. Conflict became so violent that government has to ask.

Huma Yousaf in her report Titled “Sectarian violence; Pakistan Greatest Security Threat” Author has explained that Pakistan has faced a sharp resurgence in sectarian violence. This sectarian violence can be inter-faith and inter-sect. In inter-faith violence non Muslim communities like Hindus, Christians, Sikhs and parse’s are made target. In sectarian conflicts the Deobandi practice the most orthodox version of Islam and are most extremist group against Shias. They have established madras’s in country and developed relations with Taliban. She has highlighted the emergence of sectarian conflicts in more forceful way during Zia regime. The role of external actors’ cannot be ignored in this regard. Musharraf during his regime imposed ban on different sectarian and militant organization but after 9/11 the policies of government gave air to the resurgence of sectarian violence. She has suggested various policies to curb the menace of sectarian violence. The government has to impose strict ban on sectarian outfits and provide security to those judges who involve in trial of sectarian criminals and restricting funding to sectarian groups. Farman Ullah in his article titled “ Sectarianism in Pakistan: Causes & Remedies (Pakistan No 43&44 Spring &Autumn 2009) has explained in a comprehensive way about the concept of sectarianism and its strong hold in Pakistani society. According to author Religion in Pakistan is used by the religious, political and military force as a card to grab power. First phase of the sectarianism started in Pakistan from 1947 and remained till 1977. During this era, sectarianism escalated because of many reasons. Zia’s Islamization further added intensity in this whole process.

Asma Khan Mahsood in this article titled “History of Sectarianism in Pakistan: Implications for Lasting Peace (Journal of Political Science & Public Affairs Vol.5, Issue 4. 2017) has explained about the historical background of sectarianism, social, political and economic implications of sectarianism on the Pakistani society. Islam is the religion of peace and tolerance. Pakistan was established on the name of Islam so is called as the country of peace and love. Before 1980, issue of the sectarianism was not a major problem but due to the Islamic policies of Zia and religious intolerance made this issue more prominent. Author has explained various social, economic and political implications of sectarianism. Muhammad Usman Amin Siddiqi &Misbah Mukhtar in the article titled “Perception Of Violence And Victimization Among Hazaras in Pakistan (Journal of Political Science XXXIII,2015) has explained about violence against the Hazara community of Quetta and impact of violence on the Hazara people. It is also considered that states like India and Iran who do not want stable Pakistan are behind the killings
of Hazaras. Because of sectarian clashes, scattered Hazaras all around the Balochistan began to live together at Hazara Town.

3. Research Methodology
One precisely can define that research methodology is a determining tool of overall research. It provides guidelines to conduct research in a precise way within certain limitations. Research is always conducted on certain parameters. Collection and nature of data also facilitate to adopt a specific methodology. There are two main techniques to conduct a research; qualitative and quantitative. Quantitative data is all about numbers. Quantitative research involves a larger population more people means more data (Javaid, 2012). In the present research, both these approaches have been applied by the researcher to evaluate data in a more comprehensive way. Researcher has used both primary and secondary sources to collect data. Primary source is more significant to collect more accurate information related to the issue and this source includes group discussions, interviews, distribution of questionnaire among targeted population and official documents. Secondary sources provide information through international and national journals, books, newspapers, and internet sources.

4. Statistical Analysis Result and Discussions
For collecting more accurate and concerned data researcher has conducted in-depth interviews and a survey from the Hazara community of Quetta in Balochistan. The population of the present study is students, young professionals, lawyers, doctors, bankers, teachers, leading figures of Hazara Democratic Party, laborers, vendors. Researcher under the quantitative approach has analyzed data through frequency tables.

### Frequency Table 1
May In spite of military presence, Quetta one of the most insecure place in the country?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>64.0</td>
<td>70.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>30.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>50</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above table shows that 4% of the respondents were neutral, 2% of the respondents were disagreeing, 64% were agreed and 30% were strongly agreed on the statement that in spite of overwhelming military presence, Quetta may be one of the most insecure places in the country. Majority of the respondents were agreed on that Quetta may be one of the most insecure places in the country. Respondents were conveying their sense of dissatisfaction towards the policies of the government regarding ensuring security in Quetta.

### Frequency Table 2
Does Hazara community as a minority of Quetta feel its survival endanger?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td>20.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>80.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>50</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above table shows that 20% respondents were agreed and 80% respondents were strongly agreed on that Hazara community as a minority of Quetta feel its survival endanger so majority of the respondents were strongly agreed that their future in Quetta is not secure. Most of the students’ respondents were worried about their future in Quetta. According to them after completing their master degree what they will do in Quetta as far as their professional life is concerned.
Do Hazara have their due share in administrative set up of Quetta?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>neutral</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>18.0</td>
<td>18.0</td>
<td>18.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.D</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>22.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>16.0</td>
<td>16.0</td>
<td>38.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>46.0</td>
<td>46.0</td>
<td>84.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>16.0</td>
<td>16.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above table shows that 18% respondents were neutral, 4% were strongly disagree, 16% were disagree, 46% were agreed and 16% were strongly agreed on the statement that Hazara have their due share in administrative set up of Quetta. Majority of the respondents were agreed that Hazara have their due share in administrative set up of Quetta. According to various categories of the respondents they have satisfaction regarding their participation in various administrative departments of Quetta.

Is core identity of hazara endanger in Quetta?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>neutral</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>32.0</td>
<td>32.0</td>
<td>36.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>64.0</td>
<td>64.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above table shows that 2% respondents were neutral, 2% respondents were disagree, 32% respondents were agreed and 62% respondents were strongly agreed on the statement that core identity of Hazara is endanger in Quetta. Most of the student respondents showed their concern regarding presence of threat for their core identity. According to them their different features of face become a source to identify them as they are from Hazara community and easily they can be made a target by other sectarian identities. Students said they have to wear veil to hide their identity.

Is Hazra Democratic Party an organized voice of Hazara community of Quetta?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.D</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>8.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>10.0</td>
<td>10.0</td>
<td>18.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>68.0</td>
<td>68.0</td>
<td>86.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>14.0</td>
<td>14.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above table shows that in response of the statement that Hazara Democratic party is an organized voice of Hazara community of Quetta 6% respondents were neutral, 2% respondents were strongly disagreed, 10% respondents were disagreed, 68% respondents were agreed and 14% respondents were strongly agreed that Hazara Democratic party is an organized voice of Hazaras. According to various categories of respondents this party has been playing a vital role for the protection of rights of Hazara community. This party is a strong voice for conveying the demands of Hazara community towards the ruling authority.

Are The concerns of Hazara community not properly addressed by the government?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.D</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The above table shows that in response of the question about the concerns of Hazara community are properly taken into consideration by the concerned authority and government in the real sense address the actual issues of this Shia community. 6% respondents were strongly disagreed with this statement and 2% were disagreed. The overwhelming response of different individuals from Hazara community with reference of this statement was yes. 76% respondents showed their agreement regarding this statement. They were of the view that various ruling authorities did not bother to initiate accurate policies to resolve genuine issues of Hazara community of Quetta. 16% respondents were strongly agreed with this question.

Frequency Table 7

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Are Hazara living in isolation in Quetta?</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>40.0</td>
<td>40.0</td>
<td>46.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>54.0</td>
<td>54.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Frequency table 7 shows that in response of the question are Hazara living in isolation in Quetta 54% respondents were strongly agreed regarding living in isolation issue. They have stated that their residential areas are separate from rest of the population of Quetta. According to them majority of Hazara population have been living in Hazara town and Mari Abad in Quetta. After many suicide incidents against Hazara community now government have taken various initiatives to provide them security to some extent. Young female students of Hazara community showed their reservations regarding their strict security orbit. They stated that they want to move freely but because of their prominent features which express they are Hazara Shia, they feel highly insecure to move according to their will. 40% respondents were agreed regarding this issue of isolation. 4% respondents remained neutral regarding this question and 2% respondents were disagreed with this statement and they stated we do not think we are living in isolation.

Frequency Table 8

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Are Economic interests of Hazara community safe in Quetta</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.D</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>16.0</td>
<td>16.0</td>
<td>22.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>68.0</td>
<td>68.0</td>
<td>90.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8.0</td>
<td>8.0</td>
<td>98.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Frequency table 8 explains that 68% respondents have expressed their discontent regarding safety of economic interests of Hazara community in Quetta. They stated that sense of insecurity do not let them to utilize various economic opportunities. They prefer to invest outside the country. Most of the population if they have skill and knowledge they prefer to go abroad to avail different opportunities. 16% percent respondents were strongly disagreed regarding secure economic interests. They have said that Hazara community do not feel comfortable to have economic interaction with the local population. They feel their business; their economic interests are not safe in Quetta. 8% respondents were satisfied regarding safety of their economic interests in Quetta. 2% respondents were strongly agreed with security of their economic interests and 6% respondents remained neutral regarding this statement.
The above table shows that in response of the question is religious militancy affecting negatively to Hazara community of Quetta? 62% respondents were strongly agreed regarding this question. According to them religious militancy has created serious distrust between local population and Hazara community. Hazara because of their distinctive features cannot hide their specific identity and because of this identification they become easy prey in the hands of opponent sect. they have a dominant threat of insecurity and remain unable to participate positively in the development of province. Though they are well educated and become successful to become part of different administrative posts. 36% respondents were agreed that religious militancy has been proving a major obstacle in the way of their development. While 2% respondents remained neutral regarding this statement.

The above table shows that in response of the question about the role of media in creating peace and harmony among various communities of Quetta 50% respondents were agreed regarding the role of media. They stated that media should create a soft image of various religious communities of Quetta. Media should highlight in the true sense various concepts of Islamic teachings for example tolerance, peace, equality, brotherhood and human dignity. Media should create strong awareness about the concept of tolerance among various religious communities. So they can learn to tolerate each other belief system. 6% respondents were strongly agreed with significant role of media to create harmony. 12% were disagreed and 12% were disagreed with the role of media. They say government should initiate effective policies to create awareness through educating people so they would be able to make differentiation between right and wrong. While 20% respondents remained neutral regarding the role of Media.

Frequency table 11 shows that in response of the question regarding the future of Hazara community in Quetta 50% respondents were agreed that they do not see any optimism regarding their presence in Quetta. Religious militancy always poses a serious threat to their lives. The element of satisfaction is
disappearing from their lives. 30% respondents were strongly agreed with the statement. There is hard need on the part of the federal as well as provincial governments to formulate a long run policy to address the menace of sectarianism. 18% respondents were of the view that they feel a positive development in near future regarding the existence of Hazara community in Quetta and 2% respondents remained neutral regarding this question.

Frequency Table 12

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Are people of Hazara community migrating from Quetta for the sake of their survival and economic well being?</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>neutral</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>8.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>60.0</td>
<td>60.0</td>
<td>68.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>32.0</td>
<td>32.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Frequency table 12 shows that in response of the question are people of Hazara community of Quetta migrating for their survival and economic well being 60% respondents were agreed regarding this question. They stated those who can afford to go abroad for availing better opportunities regarding economic activities and for the welfare of their families they prefer to go and settled on permanent basis. 32% respondents were strongly agreed with this statement that to leave Quetta for a better future is very common trend among individuals of Hazara community. 2% respondents were disagreed that it is not necessary to migrate for better future and survival. If government ensure peace among different communities of Quetta then Quetta can be a best place to live and 6% respondents remained neutral regarding this question.

Frequency Table 13

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Are you satisfied by the efforts of Government of Pakistan to stop sectarian violence</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>neutral</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>60.0</td>
<td>60.0</td>
<td>66.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>22.0</td>
<td>22.0</td>
<td>88.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>12.0</td>
<td>12.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above table shows that in response of the question do the people of Hazara community feel satisfaction over the efforts of government of Pakistan 60% respondents were disagreed regarding this question. According to them various governments did not realize the sensitivity of the issue. Sectarian violence takes place under the sense of hatred. When different sects do not tolerate each other and start to kill on the basis of minor differences. Survival in such societies becomes difficult. Different governments formulated short term policies to tackle the menace of sectarian violence. The government first evolves a policy to manage sectarian conflicts and then long run policies should be evolved to resolve the issue. 22% respondents were agreed regarding government initiatives to address the sectarian issues but say that concerned sects should be taken into confidence by the government at the time of formulation of policies. 12% respondents were strongly agreed regarding the arrangements of various governments to tackle the issue. While 6% respondents remained neutral.

Frequency Table 14

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Is Role of political parties satisfactory to minimize sectarian violence in Quetta?</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>neutral</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>14.0</td>
<td>14.0</td>
<td>14.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.D</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>16.0</td>
<td>16.0</td>
<td>30.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>52.0</td>
<td>52.0</td>
<td>82.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>16.0</td>
<td>16.0</td>
<td>98.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Frequency table 14 shows that in response of question about the role of political parties to minimize sectarian violence in Quetta 52% respondents were disagreed regarding satisfaction about the role of political parties to address the issue of sectarianism. They stated political parties in Pakistan work for the personal interests of leadership and do not bother about issue regarding national integration. Political parties have interaction with people only during the days of elections. After elections it is a kind of dream of people to see their leaders in their respective constituency. 16% respondents were strongly disagreed about the positive role of political parties to minimize sectarianism. 16% respondents were agreed that they are to some extent satisfied with the role of political parties to curb the menace of sectarian violence. 2% respondents were strongly agreed regarding the effective role of political parties. While 14% respondents remained neutral in this regard.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Frequency Table 15

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Is a viable strategy the need of the time to stop sectarian violence?</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>neutral</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.D</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>10.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>12.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>34.0</td>
<td>34.0</td>
<td>46.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>54.0</td>
<td>54.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above table shows in response of the question about a viable strategy is required to stop sectarian violence 54% respondents were strongly agreed regarding the need of a viable mechanism to contain sectarian violence. They stated that various governments should initiate a policy which can provide a conducive environment to all religious communities to live according to their own specific belief system and freely can celebrate their rituals. 34% respondents were agreed with a durable strategy to stop sectarian violence. 6% respondents were strongly disagreed and 2% respondents were disagreed regarding the need of the strategy to contain sectarian violence. While 4% respondents remained neutral regarding this question.

5. Conclusion

Above available information are very important to show ground reality about the existing fear among the Shia Hazara community of Quetta regarding their survival in Pakistan. They want to play their constructive role in the development of the country by availing different opportunities. But when they will remain confining in specific areas because of certain security reasons then it becomes difficult for them to move freely and flourish their potential. Shia Hazara community is facing various psychological issues due to prevailing insecurity. This is the need of the time that government has to take initiatives to curb those elements of society which are responsible to initiate sectarian attacks against the Shia Hazara community of Quetta. Government has to provide them justice so that Hazara community can feel itself an important part of political system of Pakistan and can remain positive in the progress of country.

References:
Ullah, Farman. (2009) in the article titled “Sectarianism in Pakistan: Causes & Remedies” Pakistan, No. 43&44 (Spring & Autumn) Pakistan Study Centre, University of Peshawar, ISSN:1990-6579
Mechanism between Organizational Support Factors and Motivation to Transfer: Mediating Role of Self-Efficacy

1Zeshan Ahmer, 2Muhammad Aamir, 3Majid Ali, 4Muhammad Usman

1Assistant Professor, Institute of Business Administration, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan, zeshan@ibapu.edu.pk
2Assistant Professor, Hailey College of Commerce, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan, aamir@hcc.edu.pk
3Assistant Professor, Hailey College of Commerce, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan, puhailey@gmail.com
4Assistant Professor, Hailey College of Commerce, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan, usmanhc@yahoo.com

ARTICLE DETAILS

Transfer of training has turned out to be a major issue for the banking industry and the desire of successful transferability of training content can be actualized by motivating the trainees to transfer their learned skills. Therefore, this study highlighted the less studied variables from organizational factors (i.e. organizational and supervisor support) and trainee’s characteristics (i.e. self-efficacy) to develop a model for motivation to transfer. For the purpose, data were collected from 388 banking employees and the hypotheses were investigated by means of structural equation modeling using AMOS. The study found both organizational and supervisor support as contributing factors towards motivation to transfer through self-efficacy. The study has implications for the banking sector to cope with this emerging issue.

© 2020 Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: zeshan@ibapu.edu.pk


1. Introduction

In today’s knowledge-based economy, organizations are striving to gain a competitive advantage over their rivals (Islam & Ahmed, 2018; Islam et al., 2021; Islam et al., 2020). Studies in the domain of management have suggested establishing a learning culture, designing organizational structure, caring employee’s career growth, focusing on HR practices as well as developing employees (Bates & Khasawneh, 2005; Islam & Ahmed, 2018; Islam, 2019) to gain competitive advantage. However, Tian et al., (2016) emphasized focusing on ‘transfer of training’ as it is an essential but neglected aspect of employee’s development. It is evident that organizations spend a huge amount on the training of their employees but remained unable to get the desired results, because the majority of the trainees are not intended to transfer the acquired skilled (Salas & Kosarzycki, 2003; Silverman, 2012). Training provided by US Postal Service and Burger King can be considered as the best examples where
organizations have to suffer millions of dollars (Bunch, 2007; Feiden, 2003). Further, Salas et al., (2003) argued that “… learning through training programs usually disseminated within a year” in the service sector.

Service sectors contribute 80 percent (in the case of developed countries) and 60 percent (in case of developing countries) in the country’s gross domestic products. Amongst many services sectors, the significance of the banking sector cannot be overlooked. In Pakistan, State Bank of Pakistan (SBP) is the regulatory authority for all the conventional and Islamic banks. According to the latest press release, banks in Pakistan lack in providing training programs to its employees, and if so, most of the trainees remained unable to transfer their learned skills at the workplace (Azam, 2016). Given that, the prime focus of this study is on Motivation to Transfer (MTT) as motivated employees can better transform their newly learned knowledge and skills at their workplace (Islam, 2019).

Motivation to transfer training refers to “the learner’s intended efforts to utilize skills and knowledge learned in training setting to a real-world work situation (Burke & Hutchins, 2007, p. 167).” According to Facteau et al., (1995), the presence of motivation is essential for learners because efficacious learners are more likely to perform better to accomplish organizational goals. Despite the fact that MTT is more inspirational construct compared to transfer of training (Burke & Hutchins, 2007), it was considered rarely by preceding researchers. Literature has highlighted organizational factors and trainee’s characteristics as main aspects that contribute in motivation to transfer (Chauhan, Ghosh, Rai, & Shukla, 2016). Studies on the association between trainee’s characteristics with motivation to transfer are well documented, whereas how organizational factors contribute in motivating trainees to transfer their learned knowledge still need to shed light (Islam, 2019; Islam & Tariq, 2018). However, this study considered both the aspects to understand the mechanism between the same. More specifically, according to Van den Bossche, Segers and Jansen (2010), researchers need to study the association of perceived organizational support (POS) and perceived supervisor support (PSS) with motivation to transfer (MTT) as previous studies are of mixed results. In addition, the association of self-efficacy (from trainee’s characteristics) with MTT is well documented (Yamkovenko & Holton, 2010). However, studies are not well documented about the mediating role of self-efficacy towards MTT.

Organizational Support Theory (OST) provides a base for this study. OST states that employees’ with the perception of care and support by their organization, reciprocate with greater or similar values (Rhoades & Eisenberger, 2002). The receptive work environment in the form of support provided by organization and supervisors may not only develop a sense of being acknowledged and remunerated for remarkable performance, but also enhances self-reliance of individuals (Bandura, 1995), which not only effect on their self-efficacy but also motivate them to apply their learned skills at the workplace. Therefore, this study investigates the effects of perceived organizational support and perceived supervisor support on MTT through self-efficacy.

2. Hypotheses development
The concept MTT is important for human resource development. Cheng and Hampson (2008) mentioned that there is a need to explore hidden variables related with the transfer of training because learning in training does not transfer automatically, motivation of trainee for transfer is an unavoidable factor. Literature indicates that work environment and personal emotions are most relevant factors that motivate trainee for transfer of training (Zumrah & Boyle, 2015). Work-environment related factors include peer support (Martin, 2010), supervisory support (Saks & Belcourt, 2006), preferred support (Pham, Segers, & Gijselaers, 2013) and top management support (Kupritz & Hillsman, 2011). Whereas, personal factors include motivation to transfer (Devos et al., 2007), employees’ personality (Yamkovenko & Holton, 2010) and self-efficacy (Velada et al., 2007). The interaction of some work environment factors and personal characteristics such as perceived supervisor support (PSS), POS, self-efficacy, and MTT have been over-sighted by previous studies. The current study intends to investigate such relationships to fill existing void.

Generally, MTT is influenced through organizational support and personal intention of the employee to
transfer training at workplaces. The positive attitude of the organization enhances the motivation of employee to transfer back skills which he/she learned during a training session. Training skills cannot be transferred through mechanical ways but it is motivated through organizational and personal emotions of employees (Bosset & Bourgeois, 2015). The previous literature directs that POS and self-efficacy are quite an influential factor that effects MTT but they have been examined in isolation and structural linkage of these variables is missing in the literature (Chiaburu & Lindsay, 2008; Chiaburu & Marinova, 2005). The literature unveiled that POS positively influences employees’ attitudes and behavior (Ahmed, Ismail, Amin, & Islam, 2014; Islam, Khan, Khawaja, & Ahmad, 2017; Islam & Tariq, 2018; Rozkwitalska & Basinska, 2015). Meta-analysis on POS disclosed that it has a direct effect on individual-level outcomes (Ahmed & Nawaz, 2015; Riggle, Edmondson, & Hansen, 2009; Rhoades & Eisenberger, 2002) but prior studies have ignored the impact of POS on subjective aspect of employees’ welfare. As Caesens and Stinglhamber (2014) describe that POS improve the subjective behavior of employees through physiological and emotional ways. Self-efficacy is one of the important aspects of the subjective welfare of employees. Therefore, the present study has used self-efficacy as a mediator to explain the relationship between POS and MTT in accordance with many of previous studies conducted in the service sector. Caesens and Stinglhamber (2014) used self-efficacy as a mediator while studying the relationship between POS and work engagement. Islam and Ahmed (2018) also used this variable as a mediator while investigating the association between POS and transfer of training.

POS is one of the organizational factors that influences MTT. Theoretically, POS help employees in a subjective way by satisfying their socio-emotional needs like commitment, affiliation and self-efficacy. Consequently, POS promotes employees’ commitment towards job and extra-role performance in the organization (Bosset & Bourgeois, 2015). Recently, the importance of MTT has increased because it is a vital factor to ensure training transfer. MTT is divided into two dimensions, such as autonomous motivation and controlled motivation. Autonomous motivation is defined as the internal desire of an individual to transfer training whereas, controlled motivation is regulated through organizational rewards and incentives (Gegenfurtner et al., 2009). Previous studies have proposed two factors, namely, self-efficacy and motivation to learn and they are believed to have a significant influence on MTT (Kontoghiorghes, 2002; Machin & Fogarty, 2004; Paulsen & Kauffeld, 2017). The above discussion indicates that the influence of POS on MTT seems to be essential for the transfer of training, however, its impacts may be examined. Therefore, it is hypothesized that:

H1: POS has positive impact on MTT.
H2: POS has positive impact on self-efficacy.
H3: Self-efficacy mediates the positive association between POS and MTT.

The relevance of POS with MTT may not be refuted but environmental factors such as supervisory support, co-worker support, managerial support, and learning culture are equally important to motive employees for transfer of training (Islam, Khan, Ahmad, & Ahmed, 2013; Martin, 2010; Pham et al., 2013). Previous studies (e.g. Ghosh, Chauhan, & Rai, 2015; Lancaster, Milia, & Cameron, 2013) revealed divergent results to explain the relationship between PSS and MTT. A group of studies found a strong and position association between PSS and MTT (Cromwell & Kolb, 2004; Gumuseli & Ergin, 2002). As Chiaburu and Lindsay (2008) reported a positive influence of PSS on MTT on the individual as well as on group level. Whereas another group of studies found a moderate association between these variables, reported mixed results and suggested that future studies should clarify the relationship between PSS and MTT through further investigation (Burke & Hutchins, 2007). Some of the studies have proposed that PSS normally influences MTT indirectly, therefore, the relationship of both variables should be investigated through any mediator (Bhatti, Battour,Sundram, & Othman, 2013; Nijman, Nijhof, Wognum, & Veldkamp, 2006). There is a dearth of literature that predicts the negative and non-significant association between PSS and MTT; however, few researchers proclaim that no association exists between these variables (Chiaburu & Marinova, 2005). According to Baldwin and Ford (1988), work environment factors may be classified into three categories: general-environmental factors, general, and specific training factors. Richey (1992) added that these factors are interrelated with each other, therefore, general-environmental factors impact general-training related factors that consequently
impact specific factors related to training. Furthermore, Nijman et al. (2006) suggested three separate components of work environment that influence training transfer: a) general work environment; b) specific work environments that is an intention to transfer training; c) supervisor supportive behavior to enhance transfer. They consider it as a separate and significant component of the work environment. The review of literature witnesses the independent relationship between PSS and MTT and relationship between self-efficacy and MTT, however, a little effort is made to investigate the relationship between PSS and MTT through mediating role of self-efficacy (Simosi, 2012). Self-efficacy is the part of the cognitive process that motivates individuals to enhance their emotional and motivational performance because individuals with high self-efficacy put more effort to achieve high performance. Self-efficacy positively influences transfer intentions and transfer promoting activities.

Though, it is perceived that employees with high self-efficacy are more likely to get innovative skills through training and are not only enthusiastic to newly learned skills on the job but also encourage their colleagues to apply their training at the workplace. Several studies narrate that trainee who is confident about his abilities would be more inclined to apply and transfer training e.g., (Al-Eisa, Furayyan, & Alhemoud, 2009; Islam & Ahmed, 2018). The above discussion concludes that transfer literature examines these variables separately with motivation towards transfer training. Thus, the present study aimed to investigate PSS and MTT through the mediating role of self-efficacy. Therefore, it was hypothesized that:

H1: PSS has positive impact on MTT.
H2: PSS has positive impact on self-efficacy.
H3: Self-efficacy mediates the positive association between PSS and MTT.

3. Methods
3.1 Participants and Procedures
The study considered employees of the banking sector. Despite the fact that employees of private and public organizations have varied level of MTT, still this study consider both the sectors in the light of the fact that in Pakistan this has turned into a challenge for both the sectors (Azam, 2016). Item response theory was used to select the sample of 480 (i.e. 24x20) and respondents were approached on convenience basis. Of these, 388 were used in the final analysis. First, permission was obtained from respective heads, and then respondents were assured about the anonymity of their responses. The data of this study was collected from January 2017 till December 2017.

On the basis of demographical characteristics, the majority of the respondents were male (71.7%), less than 30 years of age (59.1%), married (46.8%), holding 18-years of education (50.0%) with the current work experience of less than 5-years (59.5%).

3.2 Measures
This study adapted scales from the previous studies and respondents were asked to respond on a five-point Likert scale ranging between “1-strongly disagree to 5-strongly agree”.

PSS was measured using a four-item scale of Tsai and Tai (2003) with the sample item, “My supervisor encourages me to attend training program.” POS was measured using a shortened six-item scale of Rhoaedes and Eisenberger (2002). This scale was noted as reliable, a sample item includes, “My organization really cares about my well-being.” A ten-item scale of Schwarz and Jerusalem, (1995) with the sample item, “I am confident that I could deal efficiently with unexpected events” was used for self-efficacy. Finally, MTT was measured through Machin and Forgarty’s (2004) four-item scale with the sample item, “I intend to use the knowledge and skills acquired from training program when I get back on the job.”

4. Results
4.1 Primary analyses
Initially, the primary analyses were conducted (including missing values, outliers, normality and
multicollinearity). Since the data was collected through personal visit to banks and respondents were requested to fill all the questions, therefore, the data was found free from missing values. Regarding outliers, twelve questionnaires were considered redundant as they were having extreme values whereas, multicollinearity was examined using the correlation of values and all the variables were found to have correlation of less than 0.85 (see table 1).

Table 1: Descriptive statistics, reliability and correlation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>α</th>
<th>CR</th>
<th>AVE</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1-POS</td>
<td>0.82</td>
<td>0.65</td>
<td>0.58</td>
<td>3.83</td>
<td>0.72</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2-PSS</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td>0.61</td>
<td>0.56</td>
<td>3.61</td>
<td>0.69</td>
<td>0.49**</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-Self-efficacy</td>
<td>0.80</td>
<td>0.73</td>
<td>0.61</td>
<td>3.79</td>
<td>0.73</td>
<td>0.41**</td>
<td>0.51**</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-MTT</td>
<td>0.79</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td>0.66</td>
<td>3.81</td>
<td>0.57</td>
<td>0.45**</td>
<td>0.46**</td>
<td>0.57**</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

“Note: POS = perceived organizational support, PSS = perceived supervisor support, MTT = motivation to transfer training, α=reliability, CR=composite reliability, AVE=average variance extracted, ** P<0.01”

The values of descriptive statistics and correlation are presented in Table 1. The values show that all the variables are reliable as the value of Cronbach Alpha is greater than the standard value of 0.70 (Hair, 2010). Moreover, the values of composite reliability and average variance extracted are also found to be well above the standard values of 0.60 and 0.50 respectively (Byrne, 2016). Further, POS is found to be positively relate to PSS (r=0.49, P<0.01), self-efficacy (r=0.41, P<0.01) and MTT (r=0.45, P<0.01).

Confirmatory Factor Analysis (CFA):

First, CFA analysis were conducted because all the measures used in this study were adapted (Islam, Ahmed, Ali & Ahmer, 2019). Initially, the values of model fit were not found to be good when compared with their standard values. Then modifications in error terms were made as per the suggestions of Hair et al., (2010) and the final model was found to be fit i.e. $x^2/df = 1.62$, CFI = 0.96, SRMR = 0.03, RMSEA = 0.05 (see Table 2).

Table 2: Model fit values of CFA and structured model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fit Index</th>
<th>CFA</th>
<th>Hypothesized Model</th>
<th>Standardized Values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$x^2$</td>
<td>581.47</td>
<td>579.25</td>
<td>≥ 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Degree of freedom (df)</td>
<td>376</td>
<td>359</td>
<td>≤ 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Normed $x^2$ ($x^2/df$)</td>
<td>1.62</td>
<td>1.61</td>
<td>≥ 0.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comparative fit index (CFI)</td>
<td>0.96</td>
<td>0.96</td>
<td>&lt; 0.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standard Root Mean Residual (SRMR)</td>
<td>0.03</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>&lt; 0.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Root Mean Square Error of Approximation (RMSEA)</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>&lt; 0.08</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources of standardized values: Hair et al., (2010)

4.2 Hypotheses Testing

Subsequently, this study used structural equation modeling (SEM) to test the hypotheses and the values of model fit were found as $x^2/df = 1.61$, CFI = 0.96, SRMR = 0.02, RMSEA = 0.04 (see Table 2). The values identify that POS has positive effects on self-efficacy ($\beta = 0.39, P < 0.01$) and MTT ($\beta = 0.41, P < 0.01$) which support suggested hypotheses H1 & H2. Similarly, PSS was found to have positive effects on self-efficacy ($\beta = 0.48, P < 0.01$) and MTT ($\beta = 0.41, P<0.01$), which support suggested hypotheses H4 & H5 (see figure 1).
Figure 1: Structural Model

Further, path analysis was conducted to test the mediating effect of self-efficacy. Where direct paths between POS-MTT and PSS-MTT were compared with the indirect paths (i.e. path POS-SE × Path SE-MTT) to examine its significance. The values depict that the indirect path between POS-MTT through self-efficacy ($\beta = 0.20$, $P < 0.01$) was found to be lesser than direct path ($\beta = 0.41$, $P < 0.01$), but still significant. This identifies partial mediating effect of self-efficacy between POS-MTT relationship and support hypothesis H3. Similarly, the indirect path between PSS-MTT through self-efficacy ($\beta = 0.22$, $P < 0.01$) was found to be lesser than direct path ($\beta = 0.41$, $P < 0.01$), but significant and allowed to accept suggested hypothesis H6.

5. Discussion and Implications

This study aimed at fulfilling literary gaps regarding the mediating role of self-efficacy between the associations of PSS and POS with MTT. The results found POS as an important predictor of self-efficacy and MTT. These results are in line with Eisenberger et al.’s. (1986) organizational support theory as when employees feel of being cared by their organization, they not only found to be confident (i.e. self-efficacy) in achieving given tasks but also feel motivated to apply and transfer their learned skills through various programs (i.e. training programs here). Thus, employees perception of support from their organization contributed to building their confidence (Islam & Ahmed, 2018), which further motivate them for transfer.

In addition, the study also found PSS to be positively contributing towards the development of employee’s confidence and in turn, they were found to be motivated regarding the transfer of training. According to Gist and Mitchell (1992), being efficacious or not is dependent upon the level of support which employees perceive. Drawing from this notion and results of this study, it has confirmed that support from supervisor boosts employees’ confidence on themselves, in turn, they get motivated to apply the same on others (by transferring their learned skills). In a similar study, Taylor. (2000) also noted that trainees having supportive supervisors are more likely to transfer their skilled at the workplace.

These results contribute to present literature in several ways. First, it extends the findings and scope of OST as previous studies have not examined the same on a frequent basis. Second, this study adds to the limited literature on transfer of training by identifying the mechanism between organizational and motivational training. Undoubtedly, training is important at all levels of an organization, but if it is not transferred by the trainees, it will remain unfruitful for the organization. Therefore, organizations are suggested to focus on motivating trainees to transfer their learned skills. This study suggests banking sector management to foster a cooperative environment where employees feel that they would be cared by them and they can communicate to their supervisors easily. Such an environment may be achieved by fostering learning environment (Islam & Tariq, 2018). Learning environment gives enough confidence to the employees to share their ideas with each other especially with their immediate supervisors.

Though the study has implications, it is not free from limitations. First, the data for this study was collected from the banking sector considering the need of Pakistani banking sector. Therefore, to further generalize the results other sectors can be considered. Second, literature has suggested that cultures effect the employee’s perception, it is therefore recommended to examine the same in other countries as well. Finally, as Pakistan is a male dominant country, most of the participants of this study were male, which may raise a question on gender biased results. Therefore, future researchers should consider both male and female respondents.

References:


A Descriptive Analysis of Compensation Offerings and its Impact on Turnover Intentions of Educational Managers of Punjab

Majid Ali, Muhammad Ramzan, Rizwan Qaiser Danish

1Assistant Professor, Hailey College of Commerce, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan, majid.hcc@pu.edu.pk
2Assistant Professor, Hailey College of Commerce, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan, wadrah1@gmail.com
3Associate Professor, Institute of Business Administration, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan, rqdanish@hcc.edu.pk

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

This research is aimed at investigating compensation offerings at various levels and its impact on the turnover intentions of employees in educational sector of Punjab. It specifically addressed the issue how different compensation offerings (for example pay, bonus, medical facility, housing etc) effects on intention to quit from the organisation. The research has focused on gauging the impact of the compensation package on the educational managers’ intention to quit, i.e. turnover, and to know to what extent degree of impact of each constituent of the compensation package has on their intention to leave the organization. This study has provided implications for policy makers in different organisations related to education particularly in Pakistani context.

© 2020 Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: majid.hcc@pu.edu.pk


1. Introduction

Educational sector of Pakistan is typically characterised with high turnover and teaching and non-teaching staff switch their jobs rapidly. In this way, hiring and retaining talented employees incur a huge cost. In a study by Steers, the research undertaken to understand the offerings of compensation by a company and its various elements and demonstrates that there exists a bond among the rewards a company compromises and persons individuals which are engrossed to the compensation into working for the organization, and incumbents which wanted to remain the part of business (Steers, 1991). The flourishing economy of Pakistan with a greatest extended economic expansion, specifically with the foundation of CPEC, a younger and mid-career workforce that are not old work force is increasing on regular basis and it is also evident how short joblessness is putting burden on educational industry wages while more and more PhDs and MPhils are saturating the market. Organizations and institutions in this important sector are reacting with heaps of new customized and choice based employee reward packages and benefit contributions not characteristically available from other type of firms. As a result, employees are very keen in retorting with thoughts around in which way continuum of new liaison of employee and employer must graft in the new-fangled economic conditions.

1631
2. Significance of the Study
From a standpoint of theory, this study is an effort to provide suggestion of the financial and non-financial elements of compensation that are considered of utmost prominence to educational managers. The recent bulk of scholar’s work on this area of educational management, endeavors to help further in understanding of rewards, both related financial and nonfinancial, along with their intentions to leave their jobs. This investigation also anticipates contributing to the scant studies by presenting indication of the mark to which management benefit bundles, as a whole, have an encouragement on intentions to halt with the group of universal managers. Finally, two “open ended questions” have been focused on establishing “what is the most important factor influencing a general manager’s decision to stay with the company”, and “what is the most important factor influencing their decision to leave”. As per pragmatic approach, this research is to chart new boundaries to escort managers yearning to advance their retaining and diminish their turnover as an emblem of the useful or tolerant compensation strategies. These types of different financial and non-financial compensation plans will provide and reduce turnover.

In recent times the more focus is being paid on the employees how well they are performing in their organizations. How well an organization gears its policies and programs regarding reward system and achieves its strategic intent in terms of its mission and vision is of paramount concern. Managers are becoming increasingly aware in both private and public organizations that using an apt compensation plan a critical source of competitive advantage often comes from a suitable system of attracting and managing the organizations human resources. Hence following are the research questions and objectives of the study.

3. Research Objectives
1. To investigate the existing management reward or compensation practices of the educational managers
2. To find the relationship between compensation practices and turnover intentions in teaching and non-teaching managerial staff.
3. To identify the differences in various managerial level in compensation and turnover intentions.

4. Research Questions
The following basic research questions of this study have been described below:
1. Are the employees turnover intention decrease by the compensation plan for educational managers?
2. Among compensation essentials which in turn, as identified by different educational managers, effect turnover intentions?

5. Literature Review
5.1 Compensation
Lawler (1981) explained that total or whole compensation composed of all the benefits in cash or financial forms plus other fringe benefits which are received by employees from a company during a time is called compensation. Dibble (1999) expands the definition of earnings, “it is money even when we do not use the word” and further elaborates by stating that “a benefit like employee development, even though not necessarily viewed by the employee as compensation, is a substitute for money and a major cost for employers”. In today’s era, the rewards offered to employees has extended both in terms of category and quantity. Normally, a meeting is conducted after a fixed term usually one year and compensation plan is offered to managers along with annual bonus or increments based on performance considering goals for revenues and expenses of the company (Muller, 1999). In broad, compensation is categorized among two types among which one is monetary and second is non-monetary, however as the time has passed new idea of cafeteria compensation has been devised in which employees are offered a long range of benefits from which he can take whatever he wants within his limitations. Moreover, employees that have knowledge skills and abilities at their peak, they are in a better position to negotiate with the employer like a sports man. The following lists will give an overview of some of the categories and types of bonuses:

“Base Pay”
• “Salary and wages- for being at work”
“Increases for Demonstrating New Skills”
• “Competency pay”
• “Skill based pay”
• “Job progression”

“Increases for Results”
• “Incentive”
• “Commission”
• “Gainsharing”
• “Merit increase”

“Pay For Working More Hours”
• “Overtime”
• “Premium pay”

“Increases not Dependent on Anything Else”
• “Cost of living adjustment- COLA”
• “General Increase”

“Increase Based on the Organizations Financial Success”
• “Profit sharing”
• “Bonus”

“Other Forms of Increases”
• “Promotional increase”
• “Market adjustment”

“Short term incentives”
• Retention bonus
• Signing bonus
• Referral bonus
• Guaranteed annual bonus
• Gainsharing
• Cash incentive programs
• Vacation awards

Long term incentives
• Stock options
• Employee stock ownership
• IPO equity
• Restrictive stock
• Manager bonus plan
• Ownership stake
• 401K plan
• Retirement plan
• Deferred compensation- 3 years or longer”

5.2 Turnover
Turnover has been defined by Mobley (1982) as “the cessation of membership in an organization by an individual who received monetary compensation from the organization”. According to Wasmuth and Davis (1983), there are various schemes for categorizing employee turnover. Specifically, for this study the contrast of deliberate versus unintentional will be used since the research will focus on the employee’s intention to turnover. Voluntary turnover is the choice of employee how he wants to quit from his own will and by choice, whereas quite opposite to it is involuntary turnover which is based on the option of organization due to any reason including retirement and death (Mobley, 1982).

5.3 Intention to Turnover
In theory, a good predictor of future behavior must be a person’s behavioral intentions according to multiple research studies offered by Mobley (1982). In the previous study including intention to quit seven variables were studied as a predictor for turnover by Mobley, he concluded that when all variables were combined, “only intention to quit was significantly related to turnover”. Additionally, determined
through the other study, that intentions to leave served as a “summary variable” encompassing many other variables that were associated to turnover. The assessment by Mobley was, “intentions are the best predictors of turnover”. Intent to quit was used as a substitute for actual turnover by McFellen, Riegel and Enz because the capability to quit the job depend upon whether the employee can quit.

According to Woods (1999), the relationship changed through the process of reengineering, downsizing and reorganization when businesses decided to break the “psychological contracts” they had long held with employees, which gave employees a sense of security, in the late 1980’s and 90’s. Today we are “employed at will” Because employees are “temporary”, in the sense that mostly employees do not holds a job for whole life; Despite the certainties of the new economy still there are avoidable reasons for turnover and ways to decrease it.

Many reasons of turnover may be:

- Pay
- “Treatment by superiors”
- “Amount of work hours”
- “Job pressure”
- “Scheduling of hours - frustration with the chain”
- “Training program - slow promotions”
- “Fringe benefit package-performance expectations- poor job performance”
- “Attractive opportunity in another line of work”
- “Working manager concept- need for a new challenge- type of work required”
- “Physical demands of job”
- “Inability to live up to chain store managers image”
- “Inability to handle job”
- “Desire to get out of education business”
- “Desire to find work in another geographic area”
According to Lazear (1999) Turnover is less likely among high wage, high performing workers. Roseman states (1981), that for “more money” peoples quit the companies and “there is no question that pay rates can influence turnover however, managers generally overestimate the significance of pay”. It is sure that pay is significant, but “there are many other issues, other than pay, that effect intention to turnover. In any company, employees can compare their pay with individuals or groups internal and external to the organization. Both internal and external inequity can have dire consequences for the firm”, though the outcomes of external equity such as turnover are the most threatening according to Lawler (1981).

In the recent years another issue is planned turnover which has gained more attention. According to Lawler “not all turnover is detrimental to an organizations ability to be effective (Lawler, 1987). From losing poor performers and the inflow of “new blood” organization can benefit. When the replacement costs are negligible then it could be cost effective to agree to take a higher rate of turnover for keeping salaries repressed, and it may be the situation with unqualified labor. In additionally, when a project has a limited lifetime and the need for the employees linked with the project will come to an end” then use of planned turnover is effective.

6. Method
Data was collected through self-administered questionnaire including open ended questions from sample and population which was appropriate for this study. Unit of analysis was individual and there was minimal interference of researcher. As there were four different levels of employees, so multilevel data was analyzed to see if there is any difference among different levels.

The questionnaire with major focus on demographic variables and compensation types or offerings was distributed among the academic staff with some managerial responsibilities. Their turnover intentions were measured by one global question as whether they want to leave their job or not. We consider every person having 2 or more people under him or her to manage with. Overall 600 questionnaires were distributed among which 560 were returned filled. Among these 16 were discarded due to missing data or left-over page thus making useable response 91%.

The respondents were questioned on five point Likert scale with anchors “Not at all influential”, “Slightly Influential” “Moderately Influential” “Very Influential” and “Extremely Influential” and we analyzed it on major demographic variables, analysis of variance and correlation. The results are described in the next section.

7. Result and Analysis
Data has been analyzed through SPSS software for in depth analysis. Frequencies, mean, standard deviation, correlation, regression, and ANOVA were run for descriptive analysis and multilevel differences.

7.1 Descriptive Statistics
7.1.1 Basic Salary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1. Salary of Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Frequency</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not at all influential</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slightly influential</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderately influential</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very influential</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extremely influential</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1 explains that out of total 546 respondents the basic salary of 39 respondents was “Not at all
influential”, 59 respondents had “Slightly Influential” salary, 136 respondents had “Moderately Influential” salary, 181 respondents has “Very Influential” salary and 131 respondents had “Extremely Influential” salary with a percentage of 7.1%, 10.8%, 24.9%, 33.2% and 24.0% making it cumulative of 100.0%.

7.2 Community Association/ Location

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2. Location of Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not at all influential</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slightly influential</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderately influential</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very influential</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extremely influential</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2 explains that out of total 546 respondents the location or community association of 39 respondents was “Not at all influential”, 76 respondents had “Slightly Influential” salary, 135 respondents had “Moderately Influential” salary, 202 respondents has “Very Influential” salary and 94 respondents had “Extremely Influential” salary with a percentage of 7.1%, 13.9%, 24.7%, 37.0% and 17.2% making it cumulative of 100.0%. 
7.3 Deferred compensation/ end of contract cash out

Table 3. Deferred Compensation of Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not at all influential</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>10.6</td>
<td>10.6</td>
<td>10.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slightly influential</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>27.1</td>
<td>27.1</td>
<td>37.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderately influential</td>
<td>137</td>
<td>25.1</td>
<td>25.1</td>
<td>62.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very influential</td>
<td>147</td>
<td>26.9</td>
<td>26.9</td>
<td>89.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extremely influential</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3 explains that out of total 546 respondents the deferred compensation of 58 respondents was “Not at all influential”, 148 respondents had “Slightly Influential” salary, 137 respondents had “Moderately Influential” salary, 147 respondents has “Very Influential” salary and 56 respondents had “Extremely Influential” salary with a percentage of 10.6%, 27.1%, 25.1%, 26.29 and 10.3% making it cumulative of 100.0%.
7.4 Job Autonomy

Table 4. Job Autonomy of Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not at all influential</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>5.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slightly influential</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>13.0</td>
<td>13.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderately influential</td>
<td>121</td>
<td>22.2</td>
<td>22.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very influential</td>
<td>239</td>
<td>43.8</td>
<td>43.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extremely influential</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>15.2</td>
<td>15.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.0 explains that out of total 546 respondents the job autonomy of 32 respondents was “Not at all influential”, 71 respondents had “Slightly Influential” salary, 121 respondents had “Moderately Influential” salary, 239 respondents has “Very Influential” salary and 83 respondents had “Extremely Influential” salary with a percentage of 5.9%, 13.0%, 22.2%, 43.8 and 15.2% making it cumulative of 100.0%.

7.5 Job Responsibility

Table 5 Job Autonomy of Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not at all influential</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>8.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slightly influential</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>12.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderately influential</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>20.5</td>
<td>20.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very influential</td>
<td>193</td>
<td>35.3</td>
<td>35.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extremely influential</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>23.4</td>
<td>23.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5 explains that out of total 546 respondents the job responsibility of 45 respondents was “Not at all influential”, 68 respondents had “Slightly Influential” salary, 112 respondents had “Moderately Influential” salary, 193 respondents has “Very Influential” salary and 128 respondents had “Extremely Influential” salary with a percentage of 8.2%, 12.5%, 20.5%, 35.3 and 23.4% making it cumulative of 100.0%.
7.6 Medical, Dental, Life Insurance

Table 6 Job Medical, Dental and Life Insurance of Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Job responsibility</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not at all influential</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>4.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slightly influential</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>11.0</td>
<td>11.0</td>
<td>15.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderately influential</td>
<td>138</td>
<td>25.3</td>
<td>25.3</td>
<td>41.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very influential</td>
<td>214</td>
<td>39.2</td>
<td>39.2</td>
<td>80.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extremely influential</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>19.6</td>
<td>19.6</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6 explains that out of total 546 respondents the medical dental and life insurance of 27 respondents was “Not at all influential”, 60 respondents had “Slightly Influential” salary, 138 respondents had “Moderately Influential” salary, 214 respondents has “Very Influential” salary and 107 respondents had “Extremely Influential” salary with a percentage of 4.9%, 11.0%, 25.3%, 39.2 and 19.6% making it cumulative of 100.0%.
7.7 Ownership Stake/ Equity Interest

Table 7 Ownership of Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not at all influential</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>7.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slightly influential</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>10.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderately influential</td>
<td>172</td>
<td>31.5</td>
<td>31.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very influential</td>
<td>196</td>
<td>35.9</td>
<td>35.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extremely influential</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>15.4</td>
<td>15.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7 explains that out of total 546 respondents the ownership of 38 respondents was “Not at all influential”, 56 respondents had “Slightly Influential” salary, 172 respondents had “Moderately Influential” salary, 196 respondents has “Very Influential” salary and 84 respondents had “Extremely Influential” salary with a percentage of 7.0%, 10.3%, 31.5%, 35.9% and 15.4% making it cumulative of 100.0%.

7.8 Performance Bonus

Table 8 Performance Bonus of Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not at all influential</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>5.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slightly influential</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>16.1</td>
<td>16.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderately influential</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>25.6</td>
<td>25.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very influential</td>
<td>204</td>
<td>37.4</td>
<td>37.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extremely influential</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>15.4</td>
<td>15.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8 explains that out of total 546 respondents the performance bonus of 30 respondents was “Not at all influential”, 88 respondents had “Slightly Influential” salary, 140 respondents had “Moderately Influential” salary, 204 respondents has “Very Influential” salary and 84 respondents had “Extremely Influential” salary with a percentage of 5.5%, 16.1%, 25.6%, 37.4% and 15.4% making it cumulative of 100.0%.
Table 9 Quality of working conditions of Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Quality of Working Conditions</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not at all influential</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>3.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slightly influential</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>10.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderately influential</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>20.5</td>
<td>20.5</td>
<td>31.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very influential</td>
<td>247</td>
<td>45.2</td>
<td>45.2</td>
<td>76.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extremely influential</td>
<td>129</td>
<td>23.6</td>
<td>23.6</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>546</strong></td>
<td><strong>100.0</strong></td>
<td><strong>100.0</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 9 explains that out of total 546 respondents the quality of working conditions of 21 respondents was “Not at all influential”, 37 respondents had “Slightly Influential” salary, 112 respondents had “Moderately Influential” salary, 247 respondents has “Very Influential” salary and 129 respondents had “Extremely Influential” salary with a percentage of 3.8%, 6.8%, 20.5%, 45.2% and 23.6% making it cumulative of 100.0%.
7.10 Retirement Plan

Table 10 Retirement plan of Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Retirement Plan of Respondents</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not at all influential</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>2.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slightly influential</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>10.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderately influential</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>26.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very influential</td>
<td>226</td>
<td>41.4</td>
<td>41.4</td>
<td>68.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extremely influential</td>
<td>173</td>
<td>31.7</td>
<td>31.7</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>546</strong></td>
<td><strong>100.0</strong></td>
<td><strong>100.0</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 10 explains that out of total 546 respondents the retirement plan of 16 respondents was “Not at all influential”, 40 respondents had “Slightly Influential” salary, 91 respondents had “Moderately Influential” salary, 226 respondents has “Very Influential” salary and 173 respondents had “Extremely Influential” salary with a percentage of 2.9%, 7.3%, 16.7%, 41.4% and 31.7% making it cumulative of 100.0%.

7.11 Status as Employer or Owner

Table 11 Status of Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Status as Respondents</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not at all influential</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>2.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slightly influential</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>11.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderately influential</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>19.4</td>
<td>19.4</td>
<td>30.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very influential</td>
<td>231</td>
<td>42.3</td>
<td>42.3</td>
<td>72.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extremely influential</td>
<td>149</td>
<td>27.3</td>
<td>27.3</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>546</strong></td>
<td><strong>100.0</strong></td>
<td><strong>100.0</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 11.0 explains that out of total 546 respondents the status as owners of 16 respondents was “Not at all influential”, 40 respondents had “Slightly Influential” salary, 91 respondents had “Moderately Influential” salary, 226 respondents has “Very Influential” salary and 173 respondents had “Extremely Influential” salary with a percentage of 2.9%, 7.3%, 16.7%, 41.4% and 31.7% making it cumulative of 100.0%.
### 7.12 Stock Options

Table 12 explains that out of total 546 respondents the stock options of 17 respondents was “Not at all influential”, 51 respondents had “Slightly Influential” salary, 110 respondents had “Moderately Influential” salary, 236 respondents has “Very Influential” salary and 132 respondents had “Extremely Influential” salary with a percentage of 3.1%, 9.3%, 20.1%, 43.2% and 24.2% making it cumulative of 100.0%.
7.13 Vacation /paid time off

Table 13 Paid Time of Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not at all influential</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>4.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slightly influential</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>6.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderately influential</td>
<td>141</td>
<td>25.8</td>
<td>25.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very influential</td>
<td>218</td>
<td>39.9</td>
<td>39.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extremely influential</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>22.9</td>
<td>22.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 13 explains that out of total 546 respondents the vacation or paid time of 27 respondents was “Not at all influential”, 35 respondents had “Slightly Influential” salary, 141 respondents had “Moderately Influential” salary, 218 respondents had “Very Influential” salary and 125 respondents had “Extremely Influential” salary with a percentage of 4.9%, 6.4%, 25.8%, 39.9% and 22.9% making it cumulative of 100.0%.

![Vacation/paid time off chart]

7.14 Job Title of Respondents

Table 14 Job Title of Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lecturer</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>14.7</td>
<td>14.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assistant Professor</td>
<td>228</td>
<td>41.8</td>
<td>41.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Associate Professor</td>
<td>214</td>
<td>39.2</td>
<td>39.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>4.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 14 explains that out of total 546 respondents the job title of 80 respondents was “Lecturer”, 228 respondents were “Assistant Professor” salary, 214 respondents were “Associate Professor” salary and 24 respondents were “Professor” with a percentage of 14.7%, 41.8%, 39.2% and 4.4% making it cumulative of 100.0%.
7.15 Marital Status

Table 15 Marital Status of Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Marital Status</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Single</td>
<td>313</td>
<td>57.3</td>
<td>57.3</td>
<td>57.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Married</td>
<td>233</td>
<td>42.7</td>
<td>42.7</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 15.0 explains the marital status of respondents that out of total 546 respondents, 313 were “Single” and 233 respondents were “Married” with a percentage of 57.3%, and 42.7% making it cumulative of 100.0%.

7.16 Total Experience

Table 16 Experience of Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Experience Range</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1-5 Years</td>
<td>361</td>
<td>66.1</td>
<td>66.1</td>
<td>66.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-10 Years</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>22.9</td>
<td>22.9</td>
<td>89.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11-15 Years</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>96.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16-20 Years</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>98.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21-25 Years</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 16 explains the total experience of respondents that out of total 546 respondents, 361 had experience of 1-5 years, 125 respondents have experience of 6-10 years, 42 respondents had experience of 11-15 years, 12 respondents had experience of 16-20 years and 6 respondents had experiences of 21-25 years respectively with percentage of 66.1%, 22.9%, 7.7%, 2.2% and 1.1% making it cumulative of 100.0%.
7.17 Age

Table 17 Age of Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age Group</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>21-30 Years</td>
<td>390</td>
<td>71.4%</td>
<td>71.4%</td>
<td>71.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-40 Years</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>22.0%</td>
<td>22.0%</td>
<td>93.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41-50 Years</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>5.1%</td>
<td>5.1%</td>
<td>98.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51-60 Years</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1.5%</td>
<td>1.5%</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 17 explains the age of respondents that out of total 546 respondents, 390 respondents belonged to 21-30 years of age, 120 respondents belonged to 31-40 years of age, 28 respondents belonged to 41-50 years of age and 8 respondents belonged to 51-60 years of age respectively with percentages of 71.4%, 22.0%, 5.1% and 1.5% making it cumulative of 100.0%.

7.18 Nature of Employment

Table 18 Nature of Employment of Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Employment Type</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Regular</td>
<td>405</td>
<td>74.2%</td>
<td>74.2%</td>
<td>74.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contractual</td>
<td>141</td>
<td>25.8%</td>
<td>25.8%</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 18 explains the nature of employment of respondents that out of total 546 respondents, 405 were
“Regular” and 141 respondents were “Contractual” with a percentage of 74.2%, and 25.8% making it cumulative of 100.0%.

7.19 Education of Respondents

Table 19 Education of Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Masters/MPhil</td>
<td>245</td>
<td>44.9</td>
<td>44.9</td>
<td>44.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doctorate</td>
<td>263</td>
<td>48.2</td>
<td>48.2</td>
<td>93.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 19 explains the education of respondents that out of total 546 respondents, 245 were “Master/MPhil qualified”, 263 were Doctorate and 38 respondents had other qualification with a percentage of 44.9%, 48.2% and 7.0% making it cumulative of 100.0%.

7.20 Salary of Respondents

Table 20 Education of Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Salary</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>20000-40000</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>16.5</td>
<td>16.5</td>
<td>16.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41000-60000</td>
<td>135</td>
<td>24.7</td>
<td>24.7</td>
<td>41.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61000-90000</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>22.0</td>
<td>22.0</td>
<td>63.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>91000-110000</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>27.5</td>
<td>27.5</td>
<td>90.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>110000-130000</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 20 explains the experience of respondents that out of total 546 respondents, 90 had salary of 20,000 to 40,000, 135 had salary of 41,000-60,000, 120 had salary of 61,000-90,000, 150 had salary of 91,000-110,000 and 51 had salary of 110,000-130,000 with a percentage of 16.5%, 24.7%, 22.0%, 27.5% and 9.3% making it cumulative of 100.0%.

7.21 Job Status of Respondents

Table 21 Job Status of Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Job Status</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Top Management</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>2.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle Management</td>
<td>162</td>
<td>29.7</td>
<td>29.7</td>
<td>32.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower Management</td>
<td>154</td>
<td>28.2</td>
<td>28.2</td>
<td>60.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Managerial</td>
<td>215</td>
<td>39.4</td>
<td>39.4</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 21 explains the job status of respondents that out of total 546 respondents, 12 belongs to top management, 162 belongs to middle management, 154 belongs to lower management and 215 belongs to non-managerial job with a percentage of 2.7%, 29.7%, 28.2% and 39.4% making it cumulative of 100.0%.

Following table describes descriptive statistics including mean standard deviation, skewness and kurtosis. We can see that the retirement plan has the highest mean value, 3.92 while deferred compensation has the lowest mean value 2.99. All the standard deviations are approximately one. Skewness and kurtosis is within the threshold range.

### 7.22 Descriptive Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Min</th>
<th>Max</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>Skewness Statistics</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>Kurtosis Statistics</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Base salary</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3.56</td>
<td>1.172</td>
<td>-0.568</td>
<td>0.105</td>
<td>-0.451</td>
<td>0.209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community association/location</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3.43</td>
<td>1.140</td>
<td>-0.493</td>
<td>0.105</td>
<td>-0.512</td>
<td>0.209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deferred compensation/Job Autonomy</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2.99</td>
<td>1.174</td>
<td>0.004</td>
<td>0.105</td>
<td>-0.946</td>
<td>0.209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job responsibility</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3.49</td>
<td>1.081</td>
<td>-0.634</td>
<td>0.105</td>
<td>-0.238</td>
<td>0.209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical, dental, life insurance</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3.58</td>
<td>1.075</td>
<td>-0.592</td>
<td>0.105</td>
<td>-0.559</td>
<td>0.209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ownership stake/ equity interest</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3.42</td>
<td>1.085</td>
<td>-0.507</td>
<td>0.105</td>
<td>-0.219</td>
<td>0.209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Performance bonus</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3.41</td>
<td>1.097</td>
<td>-0.414</td>
<td>0.105</td>
<td>-0.552</td>
<td>0.209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality of working conditions</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3.78</td>
<td>1.006</td>
<td>-0.862</td>
<td>0.105</td>
<td>0.522</td>
<td>0.209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retirement plan</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3.92</td>
<td>1.017</td>
<td>-0.922</td>
<td>0.105</td>
<td>0.444</td>
<td>0.209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Status as employer or owner</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3.83</td>
<td>1.013</td>
<td>-0.802</td>
<td>0.105</td>
<td>0.242</td>
<td>0.209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stock options</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3.76</td>
<td>1.020</td>
<td>-0.743</td>
<td>0.105</td>
<td>0.106</td>
<td>0.209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vacation/paid time off</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3.69</td>
<td>1.047</td>
<td>-0.738</td>
<td>0.105</td>
<td>0.234</td>
<td>0.209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job Title</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2.33</td>
<td>0.777</td>
<td>-0.092</td>
<td>0.105</td>
<td>-0.562</td>
<td>0.209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital Status</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.43</td>
<td>0.495</td>
<td>0.297</td>
<td>0.105</td>
<td>-0.191</td>
<td>0.209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Experience</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.49</td>
<td>0.818</td>
<td>1.903</td>
<td>0.105</td>
<td>3.739</td>
<td>0.209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.37</td>
<td>0.651</td>
<td>1.869</td>
<td>0.105</td>
<td>3.304</td>
<td>0.209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nature of Employment</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.26</td>
<td>0.438</td>
<td>1.108</td>
<td>0.105</td>
<td>-0.776</td>
<td>0.209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.62</td>
<td>0.613</td>
<td>0.444</td>
<td>0.105</td>
<td>-0.655</td>
<td>0.209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salary</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2.88</td>
<td>1.243</td>
<td>-0.005</td>
<td>0.105</td>
<td>-1.094</td>
<td>0.209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job Status</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3.04</td>
<td>0.894</td>
<td>-0.314</td>
<td>0.105</td>
<td>-1.182</td>
<td>0.209</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The following table is about Analysis of variance that describes mean differences among variables and
their relative significance. We can observe that there is no significant difference except for job autonomy and retirement plan.

### 7.23 ANOVA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Sum of Squares Between Groups</th>
<th>DF</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Base salary</td>
<td>1.560</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>.520</td>
<td>.377</td>
<td>.769</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community association</td>
<td>5.205</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.735</td>
<td>1.338</td>
<td>.261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deferred compensation</td>
<td>3.120</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.040</td>
<td>.754</td>
<td>.521</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job Autonomy</td>
<td>10.077</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3.359</td>
<td><strong>2.906</strong></td>
<td>.034</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job responsibility</td>
<td>6.763</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.254</td>
<td>1.544</td>
<td>.202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical, life insurance</td>
<td>4.562</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.521</td>
<td>1.319</td>
<td>.267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ownership stake</td>
<td>6.183</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.061</td>
<td>1.758</td>
<td>.154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Performance bonus</td>
<td>1.757</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>.586</td>
<td>.485</td>
<td>.693</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality of working conditions</td>
<td>7.169</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.390</td>
<td>2.379</td>
<td>.069</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retirement plan</td>
<td>10.726</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3.575</td>
<td><strong>3.502</strong></td>
<td>.015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Status as employer or owner</td>
<td>6.699</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.233</td>
<td>2.191</td>
<td>.088</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stock options</td>
<td>7.313</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.438</td>
<td>2.358</td>
<td>.071</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vacation /paid time off</td>
<td>5.306</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.769</td>
<td>1.617</td>
<td>.184</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The following table describes the bivariate relationship among various variables. Most of the relationships are strong and significantly correlated, except base salary with performance bonus, community association with performance bonus. Likewise performance bonus with status as employer or owner is also insignificant.

### 7.24 Correlation among Variables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>(1)</th>
<th>(2)</th>
<th>(3)</th>
<th>(4)</th>
<th>(5)</th>
<th>(6)</th>
<th>(7)</th>
<th>(8)</th>
<th>(9)</th>
<th>(10)</th>
<th>(11)</th>
<th>(12)</th>
<th>(13)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Base salary (1)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community association (2)</td>
<td>.740**</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deferred</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-.057</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compensation (10)</td>
<td>.398*</td>
<td>.405*</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>.174*</td>
<td>.33</td>
<td>.406*</td>
<td>.410*</td>
<td>.394*</td>
<td>.136**</td>
<td>.406*</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Status as employer or owner (11)</td>
<td>.486**</td>
<td>.394*</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>.136**</td>
<td>.40</td>
<td>.474*</td>
<td>.439*</td>
<td>.482*</td>
<td>.014</td>
<td>.504*</td>
<td>.565*</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stock options (12)</td>
<td>.433**</td>
<td>.451*</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>.155**</td>
<td>.44</td>
<td>.454*</td>
<td>.452*</td>
<td>.433*</td>
<td>.451*</td>
<td>.135*</td>
<td>.446*</td>
<td>.454*</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vacation / paid time off (13)</td>
<td>.451**</td>
<td>.424*</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>.113*</td>
<td>.45</td>
<td>.417*</td>
<td>.442*</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>.174*</td>
<td>.330*</td>
<td>.406*</td>
<td>.410*</td>
<td>.394*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 8. Conclusion

Basic purpose of this research was to find out how different compensation offerings affect different levels of educational managers in Punjab in different universities, public as well as private sector. Specifically, in this study, Base salary, Community association/ location, Deferred compensation, Job Independence, Job obligation, Medical, dental, Performance bonus, Ownership stake/ equity interest, life insurance, Quality of working environments, Withdrawal plan, Position as employer or possessor, Stock choices, Holiday/ salaried time off, Job Title, Marital Status, Total Experience, Age, Nature of Employment, Education, Salary and Job Status were considered as compensation which are widely used in various educational institutions.

The retirement plan has the highest mean value, 3.92 while deferred compensation has the lowest mean value 2.99. All the standard deviations are approximately one. Skewness and kurtosis is within the threshold range. The mean differences among variables and their relative significance was computed. There is no significant difference except for job autonomy and retirement plan. The bivariate relationships among various variables show that most of the relationships are strong and significant, except base salary with performance bonus, community association with performance bonus. Likewise, performance bonus with status as employer or owner is also insignificant.

However, this study is an initial step towards the attractiveness of compensation among educational managers. The longitudinal research can be conducted to find whether over the period, preferences of employees change or not. Moreover, the data was limited to Punjab based educational institutions and more data can be collected from whole Pakistan to make it more generalize. The policy makers must focus on job autonomy and retirement plans to motivate employees, specifically with greater job experience and higher-level designations.
9. Limitations and Future Guidelines
This study is not free of limitations like other studies. The nature of the study is cross sectional while the choice of employees may change over a period. So, longitudinal study may produce different results. As the sample drawn was related to a developing country, sample from developed countries may differ in the choice of compensation offerings due to different economic conditions and cultural choices. Its generalizability may also be increased. It is recommended that future research should emphasis on the role of age, gender and culture in the compensation offerings. Executive compensation should be considered separately from general offerings. Moreover, pay for performance can be used as moderating or contingent effect to see the patterns more clearly.

References
Mcfillen, James, Riegel, Carl & Enz, Cathy, (1986, Nov.), Why restaurant managers Qui (and how to keep them), The Cornell Hotel and Restaurant Administration Quarterly.
The Development of a Questionnaire to Measure the Institutional Performance in Higher Education Institutions

1Gulshan Fatima Alvi, 2Nazma Bibi, 3Mahwish Safder,
1Assistant Professor Lahore Leads University, Lahore, Pakistan, gulshan_fatima_alvi@yahoo.com
2Assistant Professor Govt Degree College (W) Kot Khawaja Saeed, Lahore, Pakistan, nazma.bibi@ymail.com
3Assistant Professor Lahore Leads University, Lahore, Pakistan, mawahishsafder@gmail.com

ARTICLE DETAILS

History
Revised format: November 2020
Available Online: December 2020

Keywords
Development, Institutional Performance Questionnaire, Standards, Higher Education Institutions

JEL Classification
M0, M1

ABSTRACT

The objective of the study was to develop a questionnaire named IPQ (Institutional Performance Questionnaire) that measures the institutional performance of higher educational institutions. The scale comprised 11 subscales: Mission Statement and Goal (5 items), Planning and Evaluation (3 items), Organization & Governance, (3 items), Integrity (3 items), Faculty (3 items), Students (2 items), Institutional Resources (3 items), Academic Programs and Curricula (3 items), Public Disclosure and Transparency (2 items), Assessment & Quality Assurance (8 items), and Student Support Services (3 items). In total, 25 faculty members of the universities were selected by multistage stratified sampling, response to the questionnaire. The questionnaire was pilot tested and the Cronbach's alpha for the entire questionnaire was .951; for each subscale, alpha ranged from .623 to 0.823. Exploratory factor analysis was utilized to establish the construct validity of institutional performance in higher education institutions Findings of the study confirmed the validity and reliability of the IPQ (Institutional Performance Questionnaire).

© 2020 Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: gulshan_fatima_alvi@yahoo.com


1. Introduction

Universities impact the advancement of nations through their commitment to improved innovation, information move, advancing national solidarity, and supporting change and expanding productivity (Mugizi, 2018). Within the context of the national development, higher education institutions (HEIs) are the most important milestones of the knowledge-based economy (Secundo, Margherita, Elia, & Passionate, 2010). HEIs are the underpinning organizations of the rational capacity building. Moreover, these institutions always seek for policy reforms that target at the progression of the entire education system (Chapman, 2009).

Hedin (2009) asserts that higher education institutions have been endeavoring to purposeful incredible
performance towards attaining international measures of education. HEIs are considered as the main instruments for the national development.

In contemporary times, higher education institutions have a key role for the sustenance of any society, likewise the quality of education, modern trends of curriculum, competent faculty members and manpower resources are viewed as most imperative components for the development of higher education institutions (Rena, 2010). Quality of education transforms the traditional society into a modern society and efficient institutions are the major determinants for meeting the demands of the advance technologies in modern society. Measurement of institutional performance is a tool for the evaluation of institutions so that they may become efficient. With the passage of the time, researchers concentrated on the measurement of the institutional performance, so the initiative may take to achieve the required objectives of the efficient institutions.

In Pakistan, HEC (Higher Education Commission) is that body which is considered as a liable for consolidation and development of public and private sector universities. HEC was inaugurated in 2003 for the sake of quality assurance of educational institutions and also placed some standards for full-fledged Monitoring and performance evaluation of higher education institutions. Higher Education Commission consigns its aims and objectives according to the international expansion and practice. With the help of England Association of Schools and Colleges in 2005, and the middle states commission in 2006, the crucial arrangements were taken and eleven standards of accreditation were established by this commission to improve the performance of HEIs.

According to Batool, Qureshi, and Raouf (2010), the standards established by HEC, have substantial place in the global ranking of the higher education institutions. These standards aim to prospect the development and evaluate the effectiveness of higher educational institutions. Therefore, there is a need to develop a more comprehensive questionnaire that may base on performance evaluation standards of higher education institutions recommended by HEC (Higher Education Commission).

2. Literature Review

Institutional Performance (IP) indicates the hierarchical ability of an institution to achieve its objectives like gainfulness, solid monetary outcomes, a sizeable piece of the pie, quality items, consumer loyalty, and long term endurance (Sawalha, 2013). Institutional performance of higher education institutions subsists on a mission. All the tactics and measures are considered to get the successful achievement of the mission statement and objectives to the extent that establishes its productivity, usefulness with quality and excellence (Lambinicio, 2016).

Institutional performance can be measured through the availability of human and financial resources in order to attain the objectives. Especially, in profit-making organizations (Greenberg, 2011; Abubakar, 2017; Hilman, Kamyabi & Devi, 2012).

During the examination of prior research, Carton (2004) focused on the institutional performance measurement and developed a questionnaire. The domain of institutional financial performance was empirically established and this measure also provided more relevant information about profitability, growth, cash flow, leverage and the efficiency of the institution. Validity and reliability of the constructs and measures were finally tested, and the questionnaire was also statistically evaluated. The nature of that research was exploratory.

Antony and Bhattacharyya (2010) empirically developed a model for the measurement of institutional performance and institutional excellence. This model significantly contributes to distinguish the excellence level from the performance level. Managers of small and medium enterprises can use this model to evaluate the performance and excellence in segments.
PGF Consultants Inc. was ordered by the Forum of Federations to direct a developmental (mid-term) of Institutional Performance Evaluation, as required by its Grant Agreement with the Government of Canada 2005-2011. The reason for the evaluation was to survey the Forum's utilization of the funds and its prescribed results, efficiency, and effectiveness of the finance strategies (Meekison, 2008).

Chun and Rainey (2005) developed theoretically and methodologically more significant, four procedures of institutional performances those are, administrative usefulness, client service alignment, output, and work excellence. These measures are related to objective vagueness of U.S. federal government agencies' performance.

Researchers prepared two larger reports on the agency’s performance with the help of these measures that had the valid value of Cronbach’s alpha series of .73 to .74 Brewer and Selden (2000) developed a model to evaluate institutional performance and proposed theoretical dimensions for it. They also classified the constructs to help in predicting the institutional performance that are managerial philosophy, human wealth and ability of leadership and control of individual-level factors (individual performance, task motivation, structure of work/task, public service motivation, task motivation). The model has good reliability with the Cronbach’s alpha (.70 to .94).

Crucke and Decramer (2016) developed as a self-assessment tool to evaluate the social enterprise. They selected five performance domains named: financial performance, atmosphere performance, and public performance, human performance that are supporting in decision-making. Different members of the enterprise can use this tool easily. This tool is being tried to fill the gap through a most suitable instrument for the inner and exterior assessment of non-financial output of different groups in public enterprises. The results specified strong scale reliability 0.70 to 0.93.

The researchers measured the performance in the light of academic results. Different trends of development also used for performance evaluation. Strong theoretical rationale of performance was also measured as important construct for management related researches (Richard, Devinney, Yip, & Johnson, 2009; Liao & Wu, 2009; Kirby, 2005).

Considering the above researches, sufficient information about the performance measurement scales and questionnaire have been described.

All these measurements are the fundamentals for future development in different institution, but in Pakistan HEC (Higher Education Commission) is systematically executing the reforms for the improvement of performance in higher education institutions. Performance evaluations Standards are the primary step for the task accomplishment.

The objective of this study is to develop a questionnaire for the measurement of institutional performance in higher education institutions, so that the anticipated certification to the quality provisions in higher education may be achieved. Moreover, these are the essentials for the international visibility and regional development of the country.

3. Objectives
1. To develop a questionnaire to measure the institutional performance in higher Education Institutions
2. To develop the institutional performance evaluation system in higher education institutions under the eleven standards of accreditation recommended by HEC (Higher Education Commission).

4. Conceptual Framework
This study encompassed various features that were perceived in the conceptual framework of the study. The institutional performance in higher education institutions was estimated with the support of eleven standards of accreditation by NEASC (England Association of Schools and Colleges, 2005) for the higher education institutions namely, Mission Statement and Goal, Planning and Evaluation, Organization and Governance, Integrity Faculty, Students, Institutional Resources, Academic Programs and Curricula, Public Disclosure & Transparency, Assessment & Quality Assurance, and Student Support Services.

5. Methodology
6. Goodness of Measures

6.1 Content and Face Validity

Items of the questionnaire were given to the research experts at institute of Education & Research in university of Punjab so that content and face validity may be confirmed. The researchers were rephrased the items according to the opinion of experts and also three items were dropped after the pilot study. The final items of the questionnaire were as followings.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Standard 1: Mission Statement and Goals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Faculty staff and governing authorities are involved to assign the activities and tasks according to mission statements and goals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Facilities and resource allocation for the accomplishment of the goals are sufficient.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Mission and statements of goals are relevant within country context.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- All the faculty members are helpful for the accomplishments of these goals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Analysis reports of all the academic process are prepared at the end of short-term and long-term plans.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Standard 2: Planning &amp; Evaluation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Decision-making process is based on well-defined pre-planning and evaluation results</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Growth and development of higher educational institutes are assessed on a regular basis for quality improvement and accountability.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Reviews of Allocated funds, grants and self-raised financial resources are properly managed under supervisory authority.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Standard 3: Organization and Governance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- All the members of governing body are adequate expert members keeping in view public interest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Senior students have the opportunities to participate in the governance system.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Faculty members communicate with each other and all other concerned participants and they also incorporates the results of self-assessments</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Standard 4: Integrity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Factual reports about policy implementation process are periodically evaluated.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Faculty hiring, promotion, and their compensation are transparent and fair.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The environment of institute is in favor of mutual respect for each other’s suggestions and interests.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Standard 5: Faculty</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- All the faculty members have a professional attitude.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Curriculum is developed under the qualified and trained faculty members</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Evaluation criteria of academic program are appropriate under observation of senior faculty members.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Standard   | Students 6: | Admission policies are annually reviewed and changed according to the demand of the current era.  
| Standard Institutional Resources 7: | Support program is developed for low achiever students to achieve the expected learning outcomes of present educational policy of higher education.  
| Standard Academic Programs and Curricula 8: | Resources are appropriately allocated according to the requirements of faculty and students relevant the execution of institutional goals.  
| Standard Public Disclosure and Transparency 9: | Strategies are well developed to measure the level of utilization of institutional resources.  
| Standard Assessment & Quality Assurance 10: | Physical infrastructure and facilities are the part of the Comprehensive master plan and life-cycle management plan including in the policy of higher education.  
| Standard Institutional Performance Measurement |  
|  | Faculty members are restricted to follow the course outline and they also plan the lesson before delivering the lectures.  
|  | Curricula and syllabus content are correlated with institutional goals.  
|  | The academic program quality standards are compatible with international purposes of student’s survival in the society.  
|  | Inquiries are transparently arranged about institutional program.  
|  | Reports are published on monthly or quarterly basis to inform all the stakeholders.  
|  | Institutional performance is assessed in terms of correlated goals and missions.  
|  | This assessment review is used for further improvement in academic program.  
|  | Administration and faculty members coordinate and facilitate to each other in terms of required goals and objectives of higher education policy  
|  | Quality Enhancement Cell is working properly to accelerate the best faculty, administrative members and students.  
|  | Quality Enhancement Cell is working for capacity building and training sessions of faculty members.  
|  | Quality Enhancement Cell is preparing PQAR (program quality assurance report) for continuous improvement.  
|  | Administrative, technical and financial support is providing by higher authorities for quality assurance.  
|  | Quality and assessment survey performs are distributed to faculty members, students and other stakeholders in the institution.  

1658
Standard 11: Student Support Services
- Guidance and counseling services of students are adequately processing.
- Athletics’ programs are arranging regularly for consolidating the energies of students towards a beneficial competition.
- Students’ complaints and grievances’ reports are using for further benefits in favor of those students

Research instrument, Institutional Performance Questionnaire was pilot tested. Firstly two universities, Government College University, Lahore (public university) and University of Central Punjab, Lahore (private university) were randomly selected for this purpose. After the selection of the universities, Institutional Performance Questionnaire was distributed to the Deans of the Faculties and Heads of the Quality Enhancement Cells from both universities, and then also disseminated to the Heads of the Departments of the universities.

7. Pilot test for Assessing Institutional Performance Questionnaire

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item Number</th>
<th>Mean (Difficulty Level)</th>
<th>Item-total Correlation (Discrimination Index)</th>
<th>Mean (Difficulty Level)</th>
<th>Item-total Correlation (Discrimination Index)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>IPQ 1</td>
<td>3.630</td>
<td>.621</td>
<td>IPQ 20</td>
<td>3.620</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPQ 2</td>
<td>3.580</td>
<td>.487</td>
<td>IPQ 21</td>
<td>3.760</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPQ 3</td>
<td>3.780</td>
<td>.812</td>
<td>IPQ 22</td>
<td>3.700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPQ 4</td>
<td>3.740</td>
<td>.247</td>
<td>IPQ 23</td>
<td>3.780</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPQ 5</td>
<td>3.660</td>
<td>.405</td>
<td>IPQ 24</td>
<td>3.860</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPQ 6</td>
<td>3.880</td>
<td>.430</td>
<td>IPQ 25</td>
<td>3.860</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPQ 7</td>
<td>4.150</td>
<td>.258</td>
<td>IPQ 26</td>
<td>3.780</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPQ 8</td>
<td>3.820</td>
<td>.543</td>
<td>IPQ 27</td>
<td>3.620</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPQ 9</td>
<td>3.580</td>
<td>.802</td>
<td>IPQ 28</td>
<td>3.780</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPQ 10</td>
<td>3.100</td>
<td>.520</td>
<td>IPQ 29</td>
<td>3.740</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPQ 11</td>
<td>3.280</td>
<td>.570</td>
<td>IPQ 30</td>
<td>3.660</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPQ 12</td>
<td>3.620</td>
<td>.718</td>
<td>IPQ 31</td>
<td>3.540</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPQ 13</td>
<td>3.630</td>
<td>.602</td>
<td>IPQ 32</td>
<td>3.740</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPQ 14</td>
<td>3.660</td>
<td>.751</td>
<td>IPQ 33</td>
<td>3.540</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPQ 15</td>
<td>3.700</td>
<td>.690</td>
<td>IPQ 34</td>
<td>3.540</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPQ 16</td>
<td>4.040</td>
<td>.509</td>
<td>IPQ 35</td>
<td>3.780</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPQ 17</td>
<td>3.660</td>
<td>.741</td>
<td>IPQ 36</td>
<td>3.860</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPQ 18</td>
<td>3.620</td>
<td>.436</td>
<td>IPQ 37</td>
<td>3.840</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPQ 19</td>
<td>3.380</td>
<td>.672</td>
<td>IPQ 38</td>
<td>3.870</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1.3 Scales Statistics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1659
The Cronbach’s alpha reliability coefficients and discriminating validity for the sub-scales of institutional performance survey were also described in the following table.

Table: 1.4 Descriptive Statistics, Reliability Coefficients and Discriminative Validity (in terms of mean correlations with scale)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>No. Items</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Cronbach’s Alpha</th>
<th>Mean Correlations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mission Statement and Goals</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>17.47</td>
<td>2.17</td>
<td>.686</td>
<td>.212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planning and Evaluation</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>11.86</td>
<td>2.02</td>
<td>.633</td>
<td>.369</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organization &amp; Governance</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10.00</td>
<td>2.85</td>
<td>.786</td>
<td>.584</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrity</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10.62</td>
<td>2.32</td>
<td>.623</td>
<td>.354</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faculty</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>11.61</td>
<td>2.11</td>
<td>.733</td>
<td>502</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7.22</td>
<td>1.46</td>
<td>.479</td>
<td>.314</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutional Resources</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>11.28</td>
<td>1.55</td>
<td>.649</td>
<td>.243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic Programs and Curricula</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12.81</td>
<td>1.92</td>
<td>.750</td>
<td>.498</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Disclosure and Transparency</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.50</td>
<td>1.60</td>
<td>.762</td>
<td>.613</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assessment &amp; Quality Assurance</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>26.24</td>
<td>4.34</td>
<td>.813</td>
<td>.383</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student Support Services</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>11.40</td>
<td>1.63</td>
<td>.582</td>
<td>.355</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Exploratory factor analysis was investigated to create the construct validity of the questionnaire that was defined in the following table.
The results of this study concluded that Institutional Performance Questionnaire has high reliability and evaluates a good construct for the measurement of institutional performance in higher education institutions. The Institutional Performance Questionnaire was validated with the visions of the Deans of the Faculties and Heads of the Quality Enhancement Cells and Heads of the Departments from the universities that were selected as the sample of the study. It was also concluded through the pilot study that the instrument is fit for the performance measurement of higher education institutions. Consequently, this research study documented an empirically reliable and valid instrument to measure the institutional performance in higher education institutions. Moreover, factor loading of all the items were exceeding of 0.7. Therefore, Institutional Performance Questionnaire has recognized to be a good parameter for measuring institutional performance in higher educational institutions.

Discussion

The researchers conceptualized the framework of questionnaire development that was based on the eleven standards of accreditation. These standards have been accepted with the assistance of England Association of Schools and Colleges, 2005, and the Higher Education Commission of the Middle States, 2006. These performance evaluation standards concentrated on the imminent growth and efficiency of higher education institutions. The Institutional Performance Questionnaire has 11 subscales. Firstly, the pilot study was carried out. Descriptive Statistics, Reliability Coefficients and Discriminative Validity (in terms of mean correlations with questionnaire) were taken into account. The results legitimate that

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions No.</th>
<th>Factor 1 Mission Statement and Goals</th>
<th>Factor 2 Planning and Evaluation</th>
<th>Factor 3 Organization and Governance</th>
<th>Factor 4 Integrity</th>
<th>Factor 5 Faculty</th>
<th>Factor 6 Student</th>
<th>Factor 7 Institutional Resources</th>
<th>Factor 8 Academic Programs and Curricula</th>
<th>Factor 9 Public Disclosure and Transparency</th>
<th>Factor 10 Assessment &amp; Quality Assurance</th>
<th>Factor 11 Student Support Services</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>.923</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>.819</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q3</td>
<td>.872</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q4</td>
<td>.919</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q5</td>
<td>.848</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q6</td>
<td>.766</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q7</td>
<td>.751</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q8</td>
<td>.848</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q10</td>
<td>.872</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q11</td>
<td>.880</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q12</td>
<td>.848</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q13</td>
<td>.776</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q14</td>
<td>.838</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q16</td>
<td>.672</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q17</td>
<td>.914</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q18</td>
<td>.810</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q19</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q20</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q21</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q22</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q23</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q24</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q26</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q27</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q28</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q29</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q31</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q32</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q33</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q34</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q35</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q36</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q37</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q38</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table: 1.5 Factor loading of the questionnaire
Institutional Performance Questionnaire and its subscales have good criterion-related validity and also construct validity. The study revealed the scale Cronbach’s Alpha Reliability Coefficient value was .951 and the subscales alpha ranged from .623 to 0.823. Exploratory factor analysis was applied to ensure the construct validity of instrument.

As others measured described in different studies (Brewer & Selden 2000; Carton 2004; Chun & Rainey 2005; Meekison, 2008; Crucke & Decramer, 2016) all the measures had been systematically conducted with good construct and criterion validity. The researchers conceptualized different constructs like Organizational Culture, Human Capital and Capacity, Leadership and Supervision and Individual-Level Factors (Structure of Task/Work, Task Motivation, Public Service Motivation, and Individual Performance), managerial effectiveness, customer service orientation, productivity, and work quality. The alpha value of all measures ranged from 0.70 to .0.93.

The Institutional Performance Questionnaire was significantly developed for the higher education institutions according to the international standard of accreditation in higher education institutions that portrayed also the strength of the HEC (higher education commission). Main focus of this questionnaire was to evaluate the performance of higher education institutions because HEIs are the spinal column and prosperity of a nation. This study provides a conceptual framework also that how the performance of higher education institutions can be improved. The researchers endeavored to cover all the performance indicators and provisions that made a considerable contribution by analyzing mission, planning and evaluation, assessment and quality assurance etc. Statistical results of the study authenticated that this questionnaire can be used for the performance evaluation of the universities because the well awareness of change leads towards betterments and provide best educational opportunities.

8. Practical Implications
This study provides a strategy for questionnaire design to measure the institutional performance in higher education institutions. This questionnaire is based on the eleven standards of accreditation that brings out the starting point for educational management towards rational initiatives. It may also helpful to fill the gaps between development and implementations of policy reforms in higher education institutions. This research also represents a resourceful contribution to the expansion of international performance evaluation standards especially for developing countries.

References
University Readiness and University Adjustment: Lived Experience of First-generation University Students

1Waqas Ahmad, 2Sadaf Mahmood, 3Muhammad Shabbir, 4Nazia Malik
1PhD Scholar in Sociology, Department of Sociology, GC University Faisalabad, Pakistan, 
Waqasahmad1548@gmail.com
2Assistant Professor, Department of Sociology, GC University Faisalabad, Pakistan, 
Sadaf.mahmood88@gmail.com
3Assistant Professor, Department of Sociology, GC University Faisalabad, Pakistan, drmshabbir@gcuf.edu.pk
4Assistant Professor, Department of Sociology, GC University Faisalabad, Pakistan, naziamalik@gmail.com

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

The study purpose is to explore the relationship between university readiness and university adjustment of first-generation students. Students enter university with dreams and motivation after entering university the first challenge is to adjust in the university environment. University readiness directly linked and influenced the university adjustment of the students. Thus, the major objectives of the research are: to know the university readiness of first-generation university students and to access how first-generation university students in step to the university life. For the purpose of data collection, a self-administered well-structured questionnaire was developed and used. The COVID-19 pandemic restricted the movement of the individuals and the academic institutions remained close that’s why the method of online survey was adopted to collect data in the second half of year 2020. In total, 405 first-generation university students’ responses were collected. Results show that first-generation students were less prepared to enter the university. The researcher found a significant relationship between university readiness and university adjustment. It was also found that majority of the first-generation university students were less prepared to enter the university and feel themselves miss adjustment with university environment.

1. Introduction

A higher degree is a dire need for economic security in the era of global economy. World is rapidly shifting towards knowledge-based occupations where earning opportunities enhanced through educational attainment (Roderick et al., 2009). Worldwide enrollments in higher education increased 0.8
to 4.6 from late 1970s to 2015 (Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development, 2017). After joining university or higher education the first important thing is to adjust and retain in the university environment. Adjustment is a psychological procedure of coping with, adapting to and managing the challenges, problems and demands of daily life (Chong et al, 2014; Nasir & Maliha, 2011).

Students’ adjustment with university environment is an imperative factor in forecasting outcomes and their future accomplishments. Students enter first time in university face problems to adjust in the university environment. They are passing through the adjustment phase in their first year of joining university. After the first semester it is the vital period in deciding retention in university (Clinciu, 2012). University readiness defined as the ability to college or high school student to succeed in the hunt graduate or higher degree. For university readiness they need to understand the process of joining university and associated things with university education like how to deal and manage with financial issues, how to see living/ residence matters, and adjust with university environment (Conley, 2020).

Students join universities for social, personal and intellectual growth. They expect it will enhance their personal and professional skills, social status, and employment opportunities; and parallel to this it will make them independent. They imagine a life free of parental control, full of joy and interest with novel activities. Although after joining the university many of their positive expectations and feelings converted into negative. In the first years of their study many challenges are in the way of their adjustment. The reality of students’ university experience is stressful, harsher, than their forecasting (Bruce et al., 1986).

There is no any clear definition of University readiness because the concept varies due to emphasis on contrary combination and criteria thence (Conley, 2020). According to Baker et al., (2005) university readiness is the combination of three components: first is the university/College awareness (guardian/parent and students’ information about the process and planning aspects of university attendance), second is eligibility (completion of coursework needed for admission in university), and the third one is Preparation (Students’ aptitude to execute their awareness into accomplishment). Definition of university/college readiness may include aspirations of students’, emotional and social development, social capital, navigation, study skills, and home support are important apparatuses of college readiness (Mishkind 2014; Cortez et al., 2014).

2. Challenges of first-generation students in university readiness and adjustment
First-generation students faced lot of inequalities and hurdles because of their parental experience in terms of lack of motivation lack of guidance, subject selection and support. Choy (2001) describe that there is a huge gap between the continuing-generation and first-generation in relation to facing challenges. Lee et al., (2004) explains that the FGS faced many challenges and disadvantages during their university education. Many studies concluded that first-generation students are less prepared academically (Martinez et al., 2009). Some other studies found that first-generation students attend university part-time due to financial issues (Cushman, 2007; Thomas 2009). First-generation students feel themselves inferior from other and maintain less interaction with regular generation students (Kuh et al., 2008).

Another important factor is parental support which provide students confidence to complete their studies. First-generation found less guidance and support from their parents because their parents have less knowledge, and exposure. They got less emotional, financial and educational support from their parents. FGS also face language barriers, difficulty to adjust university social environment and low academic self-esteem (Stephens et al., 2014). Student who are first in their family attend university having problems in adjustment both socially and academically. They struggle to construct their identity as Stephens et al. (2014) describes that first-generation students struggle more to find their way to adjust in university environment. Other studies as ASHE (2013) concluded that first-generation students have limited access towards information’s, less interaction with faculty, and sense of belongingness with
university social and cultural environment. The student joins university and is the first in his/her family making him/her separate from his family and showing more engagement in university culture (Boden, 2011).

The study examine what first-generation students face in adjustment when attaining higher education for the first time, an occurrence which, without any prior preparation by them or by their institution (university), may elevate their level of anxiety and may impede in their learning capabilities (Checkoway, 2018). In Pakistan students face a similar dilemma, being first generation students pursuing higher education degrees, is a daunting task. The major objectives of the research are to know the university readiness of first-generation university students and to access how first-generation university students adjusted to university life.

3. Research Methodology
Aim of the current study is to explore the relationship between student’s university readiness and university adjustment. The study intended to identify problem FGS faced to adjust in social environment of university and throughout the university period. The research methodology considered most suitable for this research is quantitative. Quantitative study seeks to collect and interpret empirical data to reach the desired objectives.

First-generation students (both male & female) studying in different public and private sector universities of Pakistan are population interviewed through a Google docs survey form for the current study. Data were collected from 405 respondent belongs to different universities of Pakistan from them 232 respondents were male and 173 respondents were female. Data were collected by using online research tool survey monkey, after making data collection form it was shared on different plat forms included social media, emails, WhatsApp groups and, other available platform. The association between university readiness and university adjustment is checked.

4. Results and Discussions
The part of the article is discussing the results of the present study. The first subsection discussion about the background information of the respondents, while the descriptive overview of university readiness, university adjustment is presented and in the end the relationship between these two variables is checked.

### Table 1: Background Characteristics of the respondents (N = 405)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr.</th>
<th>Demographic determinants</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>232</td>
<td>57.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>173</td>
<td>42.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Age</td>
<td>18-22</td>
<td>287</td>
<td>70.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>23-27</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>21.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>28-32</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>5.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Above 32</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Residence</td>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>187</td>
<td>46.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Semi-Urban</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>16.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>152</td>
<td>37.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Degree Program</td>
<td>BS</td>
<td>250</td>
<td>61.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Master</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>27.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>MS, M.Phil.</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>7.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>PhD</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>3.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Semester</td>
<td>1st</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>12.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2nd</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3rd</td>
<td>167</td>
<td>41.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 1 presents the results of the background characteristics of the respondents. Total 405 respondents filled the questionnaire in which 232 (57.3%) were males and 173 (42.7%) were females. Majority of the respondents 287 (70.9%) belongs to the age group of 18-22 years while the second majority of the first-generation students 86 (21.2%) lies in the age group of 23-27 years old. 22 (5.4%) respondents belongs to age group 28-32 years old and only 10 (2.5%) were above 32 years of age. According to their residential status 187 (46.2%) were residing in rural areas while 66 (16.3%) were staying in semi-urban areas. The second majority 152 (37.5%) were living in urban areas.

From the above mentioned data, a significant majority 250 (61.7%) students were enrolled in the BS program, 111 (27.4%) students were enrolled in Master’s Degree program, 31 (7.7%) respondents were enrolled in MS/M.Phil. program. only 13 (3.2%) of them were enrolled in PhD program. Majority of the students were from 3rd and 5th semester. Only 15.6% of the respondents were employed while a huge majority of the respondents were unemployed and they were only student at the time of survey. The annual family income of the majority of the students 48.6% were below 200 thousand, while 15.6% respondent’s annual family income was between 201 thousand to 300 thousand, 14.3% of the respondent’s yearly family income was 301-500 thousand, 11.1% respondent’s family annual income was between 501-700 thousand. Only 10.4% respondent’s monthly income was more than 701 thousand annually.

5. University Readiness

Our one imperative variable was university readiness. University readiness is the combination of three components: first is the university/College awareness, second is eligibility, and the third one is preparation university readiness may also include aspirations of students’, emotional and social development, social capital, navigation, study skills, and home support are important apparatuses of university readiness. The research inquires the university readiness on five-point Likert scale with the help of ten indicators. The descriptive results of this variable are given below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>University Readiness</th>
<th>S. disagree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>S. Agree</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I was mentally ready to join university</td>
<td>180 (44.4%)</td>
<td>141 (34.8%)</td>
<td>38 (9.4%)</td>
<td>23 (5.7%)</td>
<td>23 (5.7%)</td>
<td>1.93</td>
<td>1.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I was well aware about necessary information before joining university</td>
<td>96 (23.7%)</td>
<td>150 (37.0%)</td>
<td>83 (20.5%)</td>
<td>51 (12.6%)</td>
<td>25 (6.2%)</td>
<td>2.40</td>
<td>1.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My previous academic record helped me in getting admission in university</td>
<td>179 (44.2%)</td>
<td>140 (34.6%)</td>
<td>42 (10.4%)</td>
<td>26 (6.4%)</td>
<td>18 (4.4%)</td>
<td>1.92</td>
<td>1.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am well aware about my purpose to join university and what I want out of it</td>
<td>131 (32.3%)</td>
<td>169 (41.7%)</td>
<td>64 (15.8%)</td>
<td>27 (6.7%)</td>
<td>14 (3.5%)</td>
<td>2.07</td>
<td>1.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feel confident that I will be able to deal in a satisfactory manner with challenges here at University.</td>
<td>94 (23.2%)</td>
<td>174 (43.0%)</td>
<td>93 (23.0%)</td>
<td>32 (7.9%)</td>
<td>12 (3.0%)</td>
<td>2.24</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2 reveals the university readiness of first-generation students. Total 10 questions were asked to check the university readiness. Frequency and percentages carried out for description and then mean and standard deviation calculated to check the central tendency and variance. Low standard deviation designates data points are very close to the means and high deviation reveals that data points are scattered. The measurement of table data describes that majority of the university students were not mentally ready to join university (M = 1.93, SD = 1.13), while majority of them don’t have enough awareness and necessary information before joining the university (M = 2.40, SD = 1.16). The average response of previous academic record helped me in getting admission in university 1.92 (SD = 1.10). Majority of the respondents were disagreed with the statement that they were well aware about their purpose to join university (M = 2.07, SD = 1.03). Similarly, more than half were not confident with their skills to deal with challenges in a satisfactory manner in the university with the average value of 2.24 (SD = 1.00). The response remained in disagreement regarding their awareness about their academic goals with M = 2.11, SD = 0.90. The mean value of 2.59 with the standard deviation of (0.84) shows that the first generation students were not fully prepared to face challenges of university life before joining university. Majority of the students were not expecting very high from the university (M = 2.13, SD = 1.14). Almost 65% of the respondents clearly stated that they were not enough skilled to adjust in university environment (M = 2.30, SD = 1.00). While, the response for the question that “I don’t have much motivation for study lately” remained unclear in its response as 27.6% of the respondents were disagreed, 28.6% remained neutral, and almost 26% agreed (M = 2.94, SD = 1.13). Many studies found that as Arnold et al. (2012) describe that most of the first-generation students were mentally unprepared for the joining university and having less knowledge about the procedures of applying for admission and university selection as well. As Crozier, Reay & Clayton, 2008) described that first-generation students had low academic grades and limited knowledge about subject selection and finding opportunities related to their subject lemmatized their academic performance and opportunities to succeed. Gamez et al. (2013) described that first-generation students having less university readiness resultantly faced issues in university selection, subject selection, adjust in university environment as compare to regular students. Johnson, S.E et al., (2011) found that students feel trouble to find their place in the university environment.

6. Adjustment with the curriculum and the extra-curricular activities
The research inquires the adjustment of the first-generation students with the curriculum and extra-curricular activities on five-point Likert scale with the help of eight indicators. The descriptive results with frequency, percentage, mean and standard deviation of this variable are given below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Adjustment with curriculum extra-curriculum activities</th>
<th>S. disagree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>S. Agree</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>University education is difficult for me</td>
<td>38 (9.4%)</td>
<td>78 (19.3%)</td>
<td>90 (22.2%)</td>
<td>119 (29.4%)</td>
<td>80 (19.8%)</td>
<td>3.31</td>
<td>1.24</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3 is about the adjustment with curriculum and extra-curriculum activities. Total 08 questions were asked to check the adjustment with curriculum and extra-curriculum activities. Frequency and percentages carried out for description and then mean and standard deviation calculated to check the central tendency and variance. Low standard deviation designates data points are very close to the means and high deviation reveals that data points are scattered. Majority (Mean= 3.31, SD= 1.24) of the first-generation students agreed that university education is difficult for them, while (Mean= 2.84, SD= 1.10) found themselves in trouble while doing their academic tasks. The involvement in social activities at university level found high among first-generation students with mean value 2.82 and SD= 1.18. While fewer less than half (Mean= 2.36, SD=1.09) didn’t enjoy completing academic assignments. While course/syllabus understanding is another basic and most important thing to feel adjust in university. Research data found that less than half (Mean= 2.39, SD= 1.02) agreed that course/syllabus is easy to understand for them. A slightly more than half (Mean= 2.54, SD= 1.11) were satisfied with their participation in social activities at university level, while only (Mean= 2.21, SD= 1.10) found satisfied with the course content of their degree program. Satisfaction with academic and other services also recorded low (Mean= 2.41, SD= 1.02) among students.

7. Conclusion
Results show that first-generation students were less prepared and not ready to enter in the university. Data shows that there is a significant relationship between university readiness and university adjustment. It was also found that majority of the first-generation university students were less prepared to enter the university and they feel them less adjusted with university curriculum and extra-curricular activities. First-generation students were not satisfied with the services provided by university and the course contents as well. It was difficult for them to evaluate this situation of maladjustment.

8. Recommendations
In the light of the present study, it is recommended that student’s facilitation center should be established at central and department or at least faculty level to guide and facilitate the students’ in admission and after admission throughout the degree completion. The psychologists or psychiatrists should appoint in the university so that the students can visit and discuss their issues that are actually not serious ones but the students failed to cope with the situation. These specialists can help them in adjustment and minimize the effects of these challenges on their academic achievements. As it is the first research in Pakistan on first-generation university students. There is a need to conduct more researches on first-generation students to understand the problems and challenges of first-generation students that will not only help to collect statistics regarding first-generation students and their challenges as well as will help in policy making.
References


Effect of Practices Executed by Monitoring Education Assistants on Elementary School Teachers’ Mental Health

1Sumaira Munawar, 2Khadija Sittar, 3Misbah Malik

1Assistant professor, Lahore Leads University, Lahore, Pakistan, sumairamunawar16@gmail.com
2Institute of Education and Research, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan, khadijasittar@gmail.com
3Lecturer, Institute of Education and Research, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan, misbah.ier@pu.edu.pk

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

Teachers’ mental health not only increases their efficiency, professional growth and development but also their effects their personality. Punjab education department established Monitoring education authorities to improve quality of education by monitoring quality indicators. Monitoring practices of Education Assistants may affect the mental health of teachers on their workplaces which culminate in low performance. The objective of this study was to determine effect of monitoring education authorities’ practices on school teachers’ mental health. 300 elementary school teachers were selected for data collection through cluster sampling technique in District Sheikhpura. Data collection was done through survey questionnaire with 17 statements. Findings revealed that a significant correlation between teachers’ performance and motivational techniques used by their heads. A pilot study was conducted to validate cronbach's alpha 0.86 which statistically significant. Furthermore, following practices of Monitoring education authorities are effecting mental health index .On the bases of these findings that it is recommended that the government might give training to MEAs for improving their behaviours during their visits in schools.

© 2020 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: sumairamunawar16@gmail.com


1. Introduction

The socio-economic development of any country is based on the most important indicator called education. For a nations’ socio-economic development it is a vital investment and given importance in
all over the world. According to Government of Pakistan (2009) the role of education as a reform and development of a country is emphasized in all the education policies of Pakistan. In Pakistan there is no proper attention on quality of education. Total 2 percent of GDP is investing by the federal and provincial government which is very less to promote education in the country. World Bank (2004) described that in our country both quality and quantity of education is poor. This backwardness has many reasons. Some of them are poverty, lack of infrastructure, lack of funds and teachers’ absenteeism. It is difficult in organizations of education to introduce the system of complex management in order to develop the means of modification for creation and formation of modern system (Sergeevich & Sevastjanovna, 2020).

According to Muriuning (2015) “monitoring is a continuous process of collecting information, providing check and balance and presenting factual position of assigned work.” The relevant information is gathered through monitoring process. “It is a type of evaluation that collects concrete information utilized for program reformation (Noh, 2006)”. Mental health, in layman terms, is a “level of psychological well-being, or an absence of a mental disorder”. According to various personnel and professional demands the level of mental health being effected in teachers. The social, physical and mental health of teachers not only develop teachers’ personality but it also adds to the teachers’ efficiency. (Lucas & Kate, 2019).

According to McCutcheon (2007) we have to remove these reasons in order to achieve national education goals. It is reviewed in the education policy of Pakistan recently that there are two main reasons (lack of commitment and implementation) because of them previous educational policies did not achieve the targets. Through motivation commitment gap might be filled and through better monitoring system implementation gap may be filled. Government of Pakistan (2009) recommended that in education sector monitoring system should be strengthen. The successful key to implementation of any educational program adequate, inclusive, rigorous, supervision and continuous monitoring are the most important elements. In order to assess implementation progress readily, there is need to some kind of mechanism for newly program introduced in any educational settings. This type of mechanism is called monitoring mechanism (Donkoh & Dwamena, 2014).

Khawaja (2001) stated that activities of monitoring and supervision by monitoring education assistant within an educational system. “Monitoring is a type of evaluation that collects concrete information utilized for program reformation” (Noh, 2006). According to Shah (2009) “monitoring is a continuous process of collecting information, providing check and balance and presenting factual position of assigned work.” The relevant information is gathered through monitoring. According to Shami (2009) monitoring involves results of communication at appropriate management level and for future evaluation of storage of information. For effective implementation of any program, monitoring is an effective part of management.

According to Tatnack (2000) “monitoring is an aspect of both accountability and development.” There are two types of monitoring functions i.e. passive and active. Without proper monitoring any organization cannot be achieved their desired goals. Therefore, in all developed countries there is an effective and organized system of monitoring in the world. Shah (2004) defined that in order to ensure quality education effective monitoring is an important part of management system. The following steps involved in monitoring; objectives formulation, instrumentation, and aims of education. Through these steps it is ensured whether these objectives are achieved vigilantly or not. Many countries have their own monitoring system in all over the world. The monitoring education in Pakistan lies with the education department itself. The responsibility of monitoring school programs are the responsibility of heads who are the immediate boss of the institution. On the other hand EDOs, DEOs, DDEOs, and AEOs are responsible for planning, organizing, staffing, directing, leading, controlling, monitoring and evaluating the institutions.

Under the Punjab Education Sector Reforms Program (PESRP) in 2000, Government of the Punjab (2001) has reforms in education sectors. PESRP has three pillars responsible for quality education. In 2001 under the act of devolution power, provincial government introduced an external monitoring system called Program Monitoring and Implementation which was initiated to enhance quality of
education, access to education, allocation of resources to support devolution and improve governance in Punjab at provincial and district level. The programs and projects of government of the Punjab are monitoring by the Monitoring and Implementation Unit (PMIU). In all thirty five districts there are appointed thirty five District Monitoring Officers (DMOs) for this purpose. “These DMOs had been appointed directly by the Chief Minister Secretariat after recommendation of services and general administration department of the provincial government and they were appointed from District Management Group.” A sub department of monitoring cell PMIU called monitoring cell was established to monitoring educational programs.

In order to collect data from schools retired Junior Commissioned Officers of army (JCOs) were appointed. The designation given to these newly appointed field workers are called Monitoring and Evaluation Assistants (MEAs). The monthly reports are sent to District Monitoring Officers made by them. Then further copies of these reports forwarded to the DCO and Chief Minister of Punjab. According to the report given by DMOs it is the duty of DCO to give instructions to concerned education officer to take action on these reports. At district level under the DCO both departments are working. The data is gathered by monitoring system through public education system and third party validated the data. With the help of these stake holders (EDOEs, DEOs, DMOs and heads) through PESRP has to improve the Punjab province education system. Under the PESRP at primary and secondary level enrollment rate has been increased GOP, 2007).

Many factors like devolution of power, external and internal motivation, commitment and efforts of government and media campaigns are responsible for this gain. In order to take corrective actions, monitoring system provide facts and figures provided by these factors. There is need to find effectiveness of both systems working parallel to the both monitoring system. Mental health of teachers are affected by this strict monitoring system. Therefore, researcher intended to investigate the effect of monitoring evaluation on mental health of teachers.

2. Research Questions
Following research questions were formed in this study.

1. Is there any significant difference between male and female teachers about “Effect of Practices Executed by Monitoring Education Assistants on Elementary School Teachers’ Mental Health”?

2. Is there any significant difference between rural and urban teachers about “Effect of Practices Executed by Monitoring Education Assistants on Elementary School Teachers’ Mental Health”?

3. Is there any significant difference between B. Ed. And M. Ed. teachers about “Effect of Practices Executed by Monitoring Education Assistants on Elementary School Teachers’ Mental Health”?

4. Is there any significant difference between PST and EST teachers about “Effect of Practices Executed by Monitoring Education Assistants on Elementary School Teachers’ Mental Health”?

5. Is there any significant difference between teachers about “Effect of Practices Executed by Monitoring Education Assistants on Elementary School Teachers’ Mental Health in terms of their qualification”?

6. Is there any significant difference between teachers about “Effect of Practices Executed by Monitoring Education Assistants on Elementary School Teachers’ Mental Health in terms of their age”?

3. Research Methodology
Present study was quantitative in nature. The survey method was used to collect data. Population of the study was all the Government Elementary School teachers working in schools of District Sheikhpura. Sample of the study was 300 elementary school teachers.

4. Instrumentation
Questioner was used for data collection. The researcher used a self-compiled questionnaire for data collection. The questionnaire consisted of five point Likert scales. Responses of the items rated on five point Likert type scale from ‘strongly agree 5’ to ‘strongly Disagree1.

5. Data Analysis
Data were analysed by using inferential statistics (independent samples t-test).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>t-value</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MEAS</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>121</td>
<td>57.09</td>
<td>11.34</td>
<td>4.872</td>
<td>298</td>
<td>0.094</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mental</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>121</td>
<td>49.39</td>
<td>7.90</td>
<td>0.859</td>
<td>296.885</td>
<td>0.003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>179</td>
<td>50.40</td>
<td>12.47</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The mean scores regarding the perceptions of male and female teachers about “Effect of Practices Executed by Monitoring Education Assistants on Elementary School Teachers’ Mental Health” was shown in table 1. No significant mean difference between male and female teachers’ was found at p≤0.05 level of significance. Whereas, male and female teachers have mean difference regarding mental health at p≤0.05 significance level.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Area</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>t-value</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MEAS</td>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>172</td>
<td>54.21</td>
<td>12.67</td>
<td>1.980</td>
<td>298</td>
<td>0.775</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mental</td>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>172</td>
<td>49.05</td>
<td>7.99</td>
<td>1.625</td>
<td>190.048</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>51.26</td>
<td>13.73</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The mean scores regarding the perceptions of rural and urban teachers about “Effect of Practices Executed by Monitoring Education Assistants on Elementary School Teachers’ Mental Health” was shown in table 2. A significant mean difference between male and female teachers’ was found at p≤0.05 level of significance. Whereas, rural and urban teachers have mean difference regarding mental health at p≤0.05 level of significance.
The mean scores regarding the perceptions of B.Ed and M.Ed. teachers about “Effect of Practices Executed by Monitoring Education Assistants on Elementary School Teachers’ Mental Health” was shown in table 3. A significant mean difference between B.Ed and M.Ed. teachers’ was found at $p \leq 0.05$ level of significance. Whereas, B. Ed. and M.Ed. teachers have no mean difference regarding mental health at $p \leq 0.05$ significance level.

### Table 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>PQ</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>t-value</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MEAS</td>
<td>B. Ed.</td>
<td>171</td>
<td>52.67</td>
<td>13.67</td>
<td>0.820</td>
<td>294.887</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M. Ed.</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>53.81</td>
<td>10.26</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mental</td>
<td>B. Ed.</td>
<td>171</td>
<td>48.46</td>
<td>9.32</td>
<td>2.964</td>
<td>295</td>
<td>0.525</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>M. Ed.</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>52.20</td>
<td>12.41</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The mean scores regarding the perceptions of PST and EST teachers about “Effect of Practices Executed by Monitoring Education Assistants on Elementary School Teachers’ Mental Health” was shown in table 4. No significant mean difference between PST and EST teachers’ was found at $p \leq 0.05$ level of significance. Whereas, PST and EST teachers have no mean difference regarding mental health at $p \leq 0.05$ level of significance.

### Table 4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Designation</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>t-value</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MEAS</td>
<td>EST</td>
<td>151</td>
<td>53.60</td>
<td>12.40</td>
<td>0.763</td>
<td>297</td>
<td>0.889</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PST</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>52.51</td>
<td>12.42</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mental</td>
<td>EST</td>
<td>151</td>
<td>50.58</td>
<td>9.49</td>
<td>0.828</td>
<td>297</td>
<td>0.665</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>PST</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>49.54</td>
<td>12.01</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Age wise mean scores regarding the perceptions of male and female teachers about “Effect of Practices Executed by Monitoring Education Assistants on Elementary School Teachers’ Mental Health” was shown in table 5. “No significant mean difference between male and female teachers’ was found at p≤0.05 level of significance”. Whereas, male and female teachers have no mean difference regarding mental health at p≤0.05 level of significance.

### Table 5

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Sum of Square</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MEAS</td>
<td>168.753</td>
<td>84.377</td>
<td>0.543</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.582</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>46175.234</td>
<td>155.472</td>
<td></td>
<td>297</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>46343.987</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>299</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mental Health</td>
<td>152.168</td>
<td>76.084</td>
<td>0.644</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.526</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>35097.832</td>
<td>118.175</td>
<td></td>
<td>297</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>35250.000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>299</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 6

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Sum of Square</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Qualification</td>
<td>141.759</td>
<td>70.880</td>
<td>0.456</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.634</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>46202.227</td>
<td>155.563</td>
<td></td>
<td>297</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>46343.987</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>299</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qualification</td>
<td>105.410</td>
<td>52.705</td>
<td>0.445</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.641</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>35144.590</td>
<td>118.332</td>
<td></td>
<td>297</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>35250.000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>299</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Qualification wise mean scores regarding the perceptions of male and female teachers about “Effect of Practices Executed by Monitoring Education Assistants on Elementary School Teachers’ Mental Health” was shown in table 6. “No significant mean difference between male and female teachers’ was found at p≤0.05 level of significance”. Whereas, male and female teachers have no mean difference regarding mental health at p≤0.05 level of significance.

6. **Conclusions**

On the basis of data analyses, the following conclusions are drawn.

1. MEAs checked the balance/record of School Council (SC), Farogh-e-Taleem funds.
2. “MEAs also reviewed the number of meetings held during the past three months by the school board and the visit by the District Officer and the Deputy District Education Officer.”
3. The necessary equipment would be tested by MEAs like, cleanliness of building, parks, and school playgrounds and classroom environment.
4. This monitoring system for the improvement of primary education system is valuable.
5. Daily three to four hour MEAs should visit by MEAs regularly in schools.
6. School monitoring training did not received by MEAs.
7. Before visit to any school deputy district education officer did not inform by MEAs before the visit to any school.
8. Head-teachers provide co-operation to MEAs during their visit to school.
9. Number of students present and absent in the class should be checked by the MEAs at the time of monitoring and also check Farogh-e-Taleem fund received per student.
10. MEAs examined the students' level of cleanliness and a number of free sets of textbooks.

7. Recommendations
Following were the recommendations on the basis of the above findings.
1. Monitoring education authorities receive no school trainings. Therefore, MEAs should provide training before the 15 days of their appointments and an orientation session should be conducted.
2. Before visiting to any school MEAs should informed by District Education Officer / Deputy District Education Officer, therefore, the visit schedule should be provided to the District Education Officer/ Deputy District Education Officer by MEAs.

References