Comparison of English Writing Skill between Public and Private Sector Schools Students at Secondary Level: In Pakistani Perspective

Umm_e_Habiba, Punjab School Education Department, Lahore, Pakistan
*Tahira Batool, Department of STEM Education, Lahore College for Women University, Lahore, Pakistan
Sayeda Ayesha, Punjab School Education Department, Lahore, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email: tahirashehbaz@yahoo.com

ABSTRACT

Purpose: The objective of the study was to compare the English writing skills of English in the classroom at secondary level.

Design/Methodology/Approach: The study was carried on sample of hundred students of secondary level drawn from simple randomly selected from five private and five public secondary schools of Lahore. Self-structured test was used to compare English writing skill at secondary level. There were two sections of test, essay type and translation of ten sentences into English. The data collected was analyzed by using percentage and results obtained were converted to descriptive findings.

Findings: The result showed English writing skill of private school students is better than public schools students because majority of the private school students have correct sentence structure, Subject verb agreement in essay writing, correct Translations of Urdu sentences into English as compared to the public school students. In addition, most of the public schools student’s spelling, use of tenses and uses of auxiliaries are good and correct in essay writing rather than the private school students.

Implications/Originality/Value: So it is concluded that exercises for the English writing skill may be maximized in both public and private schools by using various teaching techniques.

© 2021 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0


Introduction

Language is the vehicle for effective communication. Every student needs to develop the skills such as listening, speaking, reading, and writing because these are the source which enable to
communicate properly in the society (Philomina, 2015). Writing is a creative and active process of the mind by which the writer creates meaningful message (Philomina, 2015). Furthermore, for inculcating education English is a vital subject in curriculum (Singapore’s Ministry of Education, 2010).

Creative writing has an important place in the educational institutions (Chandio, Khan & Samiullah, 2013). Moreover, Students require effective English writing skill is for their academic success and personal development (Mukulu, Indangasi, Mwangi, Gecaga & Okanga 2006). Similarly, Rao (2007) pointed out that writing is playing important role to build up students’ learning, thinking and reflecting on the English language in their academics. In addition, Finding of Ahmed’s (2010) study proved that those students who are competent in writing help them to perform well in their academic programs.

Rahman (2007) argued that secondary school students has high rate of failure in English writing skill because writing skill was not developed properly. In addition, they have no idea of creative writing. In the same way, content analysis of the essay English writing skills showed that serious problems in spelling, simple present tense, using appropriate forms of adjectives, recognizing passive voice, punctuation marks and using relative pronouns and prepositions were facing by the university students in Tanzania (Njabili, Kafanabo, Komba, Komba, & Kira, 2012). Furthermore, Muhammad, Masum, Ali, and Baksh (2017) revealed that teacher-centered teaching approach did not provide the opportunity of developing language skills to the students through practice in classrooms. Correspondingly, students need to be successful in workstation, school, and their personal lives but mostly students fail to develop the competence of creative writing (Graham and Perin, 2007).

Pakistani Perspective
Secondary schools students of Pakistan do not write creative essay because they are habitual of rote learning in essays and stories. Next, they also like Grammar Translation Method. Furthermore, they avoid to communicate in English (Awan & Shafi, 2016). In the same way, it has been observed by Rahman (2002) that the most of the secondary school students rely on cramming and has lack of ability of writing creatively in Pakistan. In addition, Pakistani secondary school students need of expertise in creative writing skills for a number of educational purposes for example writing tasks and assignments given by the teachers and final examinations etc. (Dar & Khan, 2015). In Pakistan a majority of people has accepted the importance of English language. But some people who are prejudiced and biased are against teaching of English to the new generation.

Literature Review
Msanjila (2005) stated that writing is skilled behavior performed in order to convey or record information or thoughts. Writer may wish to convey a message to someone else, or he may wish to keep a record of some event or thought for future reference.

Categories of Writing Problems

Factors Affect English Writing Skill in the Classroom
It was reported that overcrowded classrooms, teachers’ workload, poor infrastructure, examination system and inefficient monitoring mechanism are influencing factors on the English writing skill of students (Muhammad, Masum, Ali, & Baksh, 2017). Similarly, researchers proved that writing skill of students (creativity, ideas and command over grammar and
vocabulary) is unsatisfactory because teachers did not involve students in English writing practice (Emmitt, Zbarackiet, Komesaroff & Pollock, 2003).

Moreover, it is essential to revise the English text book at secondary level. In addition, in order to involve the students in learning there is need a book with language activities. Furthermore, all the four language skills should be covered in book (Sahu, 2004). Thus, existing teaching methods used by the teachers are not satisfactory for developing the language skills of students, (Nawab, 2012). Findings of Okwaras’ (2012) study showed that inadequate evaluation may easily affect writing competence of secondary level students. Another similar study was conducted by Farooq (2012) indicated that second language learners faced a lot of difficulties in English writing skill because they have lack of vocabulary, poor spelling, L1 interference and poor understanding of grammatical structures. A study carried out by Msanjila (2005) shed light on those writing problems which faced by the secondary school students in Tanzania, such as, capitalization and punctuation errors, inexplicitness or fuzziness, poor organization of sentence making or illogical sequence, spelling and grammatical mistakes.

The finding of the study showed that most of the students faced some problems to develop English language skill in Tanzania (Komba & John, 2015). Parallel to findings of previous studies, Mohite (2014) proved the lack of understanding in the compositional aspect of the English writing.

**Strategies to Improve the English Writing Skill**

Therefore, the implications of the Mohites (2014) suggested in the light of his study that there is need to raise learners' awareness about English writing compositional skills and highlight the communicative purpose of writing in English. Finally, train the students train to use the peer collaboration strategy to facilitate their English writing most effectively. In addition, it was recommended by Komba & John (2015), recruit those teachers who are proficient in English language at primary level, then they will able to become role model for learners. Another study was suggested; provide adequate practice of essay writing to the students by the teachers (Okwara, 2012). In the light of findings of previous studies, it was recommended by Yigzaw (2013) that 11 grade Ethiopian students need to pay attention on grammar and vocabulary teaching approach because it would enable them to apply in their English writing skill. In conclusion, Moore (2014) and Lloyd, Blaus & Sousa (2017) presented another point of view that develops English writing skill through enhancing extensive reading. In addition, the findings of Msanjilas’(2005) study showed, students’ writing problems arise from pedagogical reasons in secondary school of Tanzania. But, professional language teachers can minimized students’ writing problems. Similarly, In Nigeria, Ayodele, Akinkurolere, Ariyo, Mahmud, and Abuya (2017) shed light on cooperative writing strategy which is one of the innovative ways to improve students’ learning and performance because it involves role-playing and role-shifting.

A great significance of this survey is to find out the difference between the English writing skill of public and private school students at secondary level. This survey has its special worth for teachers and institutions to make English writing skill affective for students. This study will also be useful for teachers of public and private schools to take advantages to improve the deficiencies of English writing skill. This research will guide the teachers of secondary schools to give importance to the English writing skill along with other skills. This research study will also compare the English writing skills of students of public or private school.

**Objectives of the Study**

Objectives of the study are:

- To investigate the difference between English writing skill of public and private schools students at secondary level.
Hypothesis
Hypothesis of the study were:
Ho1 There is no significant difference in students’ English writing skill of public and private Secondary schools
Ho1.1 There is no significance difference in the essay type test means scores of public and private sector schools students.
Ho1.2 There is no significance difference in the translation into English test means scores of public and private sector schools students.

Delimitation of Study
This study was delimited to the ten secondary schools (Five public and five private) of Lahore district, Tehsil Cantt.

Methodology
Following procedure was adopted in collecting, analyzing and interpreting data for the research work.

Nature of Research
Research was descriptive and quantitative in nature.

Method of Research
The researcher used survey method in this research work.

Population
The population of this research was secondary students of public and private schools of Lahore city.

Sample and Sampling Technique
Hundred students from five public and five from private sector schools.
- 10 schools of Lahore district (Tehsil Cantt.) were selected for this study by using simple random sampling, in which five public and five private schools were included.
- Simple random sampling technique was used for selecting the 50 students of 10th grade from private and public secondary schools.

Tools of Research
A writing skill test was essay type (open ended) and other was translation into English (close ended).

Rationale
As the writing ability of students is judged through a criteria that is product based, that’s why a test was developed consisting of an open ended (essay type) and a close ended (translation into English) question. First part was developed to check creative writing of students and second part was developed to check the grammatical competence of students. Translation into English was chosen for two reasons firstly because the paper pattern of English at secondary level includes a question based on translation into English or translation into Urdu. Secondly GMT (Grammer translation methods) is used in most of the schools to teach English.

Data Collection Procedure
The test was conducted for 30 minutes. The students were not informed prior that they have to appear in the test. The test was administered and conducted by the researcher.
Analysis of Data
The research supervised all scoring of answer sheet herself. The collected data was analyzed and interpreted in order to get factual results. The researcher used percentage method to analyzed data. The data is presented in the form of tables.

Data is analyzed by comparing the writing of students of both schools. Analysis consisted on the two sections, first section deals with the analysis of creative writing skill of public and private school students separately on creative writing, second is consisted on the analysis of grammatical competence of the students of both the schools separately and third section is consisted on the comparison of English writing skill of public and private secondary schools. The writing skill of the students in checked on the basis of errors they make. As the population of this study is the students of secondary level and at secondary level in Pakistan a student is required to produce fundamental sentences. So following few errors are analyzed in the writing of the students.

- Tense
- Spelling
- Subject-verb agreement
- Use of auxiliaries/helping verbs
- Sentence-structure

After taking the data, percentage method was used by multiplying the total number of errors of each item by hundred and dividing these by the total number of students. Following formula was used for analysis of writing skill:

\[
\text{Percentage} = \frac{\text{Total number of errors of each item}}{\text{Total number of students}} \times 100
\]

(Each type of error is counted only even if occurs multiple times).

### Table No.1: Comparison of Top Five Errors in Written Composition of the Students of Public and private Schools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. No.</th>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Public School Students Errors</th>
<th>Private School Students Errors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(F)</td>
<td>%(f)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Tense</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Spelling</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Subject-verb agreement</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Use of auxiliaries</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Sentence-structure</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Analysis of Table No.1 indicates**
- Tense errors of public school students are 16% and 12% are of private school students.
- Spelling mistakes of public school students are 38% and 50% of private school students.
- 8% errors of subject-verb agreement are of public school students and 30% are of private school students.
- Errors of use of auxiliaries are 36% of public school and 12% of private school students.
- 62% sentence structures of public school students are wrong and 34% are of private school students.

### Table No.2: Comparison of 1 to 5 translate sentences of public and private school students

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. No.</th>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Public School Students Correct</th>
<th>Incorrect</th>
<th>Private School Students Correct</th>
<th>Incorrect</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(f)</td>
<td>%(f)</td>
<td>(f)</td>
<td>%(f)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>راہی گا یہ کا کا گا ہے کہ ہیں کریں ہے</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>ہم سے اپنے چہرے پر ہے</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Analysis of Table No. 2 indicates

- Item one indicates that 36% sentences are correct of public schools and 60% of private schools.
- Item two indicates that 20% sentences are correct of public schools and 34% of private schools.
- Item three indicates that 42% sentences are correct of public schools and 36% of private schools.
- Item four indicates that 36% sentences are correct of public schools and 48% of private schools.
- Item five indicates that 64% sentences are correct of public schools and 80% of private schools.

Table No. 3: Comparison of 6 to 10 translate sentences of public and private school students

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. No.</th>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Public School Students</th>
<th>Private School Students</th>
<th>School Students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Correct</td>
<td>Incorrect</td>
<td>Correct</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>انسان کو آرم جا کرچکاوے -</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>انسان 2002</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>لاہور سے پیاک کو تھوگے -</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>پیر اکٹ &quot;امہ&quot; جیت چپا جوکا -</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>خس بھا سے آئے پیر اکٹ کے پا کا رپا کچھ کا -</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Analysis of Table No. 3 indicates

- Item six indicates that 38% answers of public school students and 62% of private school students are correct.
- Item seven indicates that 14% answers of public school students and 26% of private school students are correct.
- Item eight indicates that 36% answers of public school students and 99% of private school students are correct.
- Item nine indicates that 30% answers of public school students and 50% of private school students are correct.
- Item ten indicates that 34% answers of public school students and 40% of private school students are correct.
Conclusion and Discussion

After the analysis of data, findings were drawn & in the light of findings, it was concluded that:

This study was proposed to investigate the difference between English writing skill of public and private schools students at secondary level. The results of the current study demonstrated that English writing skill of private school students is better as compared to the students of public school because majority of the private school students have correct sentence structure, Subject verb agreement in essay writing as compared to the public school students. This supports the points of view that creative writing skills among the secondary school students are dissatisfactory as compared to private sector school students in Bahawalpur (Chandio, Khan & Samiullah, 2013; Rahman, 2002; Siddiqui, 2007; Bashiruddin, 2009; Rahman, 2007). Similarly, Arifa (2009) and Shah, Rani, Mehmood and Irum (2013) proved that secondary school students choose specific educational material, memorize it and try to write in exams in Pakistan because they are not able in writing themselves. In line with previous studies, brainstorming, group work and presentation for generating ideas regarding developing writing skills are used in classrooms by O level teachers as compared to teachers of secondary schools in Pakistan (Fatima & Akbar, 2017). Correspondingly, lack of pre-writing activities, poor in vocabulary, grammar, punctuation and spellings, lengthy syllabus and limited time are main issues in Pakistani secondary schools which are facing by students while they write (Fareed, Jawed, & Awan, 2018). In the same way, Naeem (2011) found in his study that O level students are good in creative English writing skill as compared to secondary school student in Pakistan. In addition, findings of many researches also showed that students had difficulties in English writing such as grammar (spelling, punctuation), vocabulary, content and organization of the sentences in Kenya and Pakistan (Hussain, 2013; Njabili, Kafanabo, Komba, Komba, & Kira, 2012; Farooqi, 2014; Nyasimi, 2014).

Another finding of this study is, most of the public schools student’s spelling, use of tenses and uses of auxiliaries are good and correct in essay writing rather than the private school students. In addition, Hassan, Rehman and Masum (2015) stated, English writing skill of Bangladeshi students is satisfactory, but overall they made errors (Punctuation, capitalization). Likewise, findings of study pointed out the significant difference between government, aided and private Primary school students regarding reading and writing skills in U.K. (Philomina, 2015). In the same way, the essays of Swedish students are better in writing quality and they got higher scores but they were lacking in spelling (Villanueva, 2008).

One of the most important results reported by this study is that majority of private school students have correct Translations of Urdu sentences into English as compared to public school students. Likewise, Ali, Ahmad, Manzoor, and Naseer (2014); Aqeel and Sajid, (2014) also argued that the students of secondary school are facing many problems in learning of three forms of verb, narration, reading comprehension, sentence arrangements, parts of speech (conjunctions, prepositions) and articles. Moreover, teacher related problems were also identified such as teachers did not focus on writing skill, lack of constructive feedback and had not did correction of spelling and grammar (Aqeel & Sajid, 2014; Khan, 2011).

In Nutshell, we can say that there is less number of students of public school who respond correctly rather than to private school students. So, private school students are better in English writing skill as compare to public students. But errors are equally done in the essay question by public and private sector students.

Recommendations

- There is need to improve English writing skills of public schools students by using various teaching methods.
- Public school Teachers need to improve the sentence structure of students through practice of sentence making.
Public school students need to improve their creative writing skill without doing spelling mistakes, the errors of tenses, using of helping verbs and subject verb agreement.

If teachers encourage students in English writing skill, students can get success in correcting grammar errors.

References


