Editor in Chief: Prof. Dr. K. Kuperan Viswanatha, Universiti Utara Malaysia.

Associate Editors: Dr. Adeel Rana, University of Sahiwal, Pakistan

Dr. Athifah Najwani Shahidan, Associate Fellow, Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan
Dr. Owais Shafique, Department of Management Sciences, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur Pakistan

Vol. 3, Issue 2, June 2021
INTRODUCTION

The journal Sustainable Business and Society in Emerging Economies (ISSN: 2708-2504 and ISSN-E: 2708-2172) is an open access peer-reviewed research journal published bi-annually by CSRC Publishing, Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan. The journal seeks to bridge and strengthen the link between business activities and society development around myriad of sustainability issues with focus on emerging and developing economies. The content coverage highlights how business organizations can be responsible towards society in pursuing their value added activities. The journal also bring forward issues in social and behavioral sciences for their implications for business organization and their activities in emerging and developing economies. The journal is a platform for business people, academics, and others involved in the contemporary debate about the responsible role of business organizations and society towards each other. Coverage includes various areas of social and behavioral sciences including management sciences. The journal welcomes papers from all those working in this important area, including researchers and business professionals, members of the legal profession, government administrators and many others.

SCOPE AND MISSION

The journal strives to highlight theoretical and policy issues related to sustainable business practices and social issues faced by society in emerging and developing economies. The SBSEE seeks to integrate the actors and institutions in business and society given that sustainability issues are though found in market yet their solution requires deep and coordinated understanding of these issues from perspectives of various disciplines of social sciences, arts and humanities. With this background SBSEE aims to be a premier forum for policy and theoretical discussion of high impact research related to sustainable business and social development in emerging and developing economies.

The journal aims to cover sustainability topics and issues in various sub-areas of business, social and behavioral sciences in context of emerging and developing economies. Purpose is to highlight the theoretical and practical issues faced by businesses and society in these economies. The journal also welcomes submissions which focus the broader areas of business, management sciences and various areas of social sciences, arts and humanities.
EDITORIAL BOARD

Patron
- Prof Dr Hayat Muhammad Awan, President, Center of Sustainability and Research Center

Editor In Chief
- Prof. Dr. K. Kuperan Viswanathan, Senior Member Advisory Board, Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan: kuperan@gmail.com; sbsee@globalcsrc.org

Associate Editors
- Dr. Adeel Rana, University of Sahiwal Pakistan
- Dr. Athifah Najwani Shahidan, Associate Fellow, Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan
- Dr. Owais Shafique, Department of Management Sciences, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur Pakistan

Editorial Advisory Board
- Prof. Dr. Abdul Wajid Rana, Lahore School of Economics, Pakistan.
- Prof. Dr. Ruswati Suryasaputra, Universitas Wijaya Kusuma Surabaya Indonesia.
- Prof. Dr. Mohd Noor Mohd Sahriff, Universiti Utara Malaysia.
- Prof. Dr. Norshuhada Shiratuddin, Universiti Utara Malaysia.
- Prof. Dr. Raja Suzana Raja Kasim, Universiti Malaysia Kelantan Malaysia.
- Prof. Dr. Cornelia Pop, Babes-Bolyai University Romania.
- Prof. Dr. Josè G. Vargas-Hernández, University of Guadalajara Mexico.
- Prof. Dr. Maria Alejandra Gonzalez-Perez, Universidad EAFIT Colombia.
- Prof. Dr. Arkadiusz Mironko, Rutgers University, New Jersey USA.
- Prof. Dr. Anayo Dominic Nkamnebe, Nnamdi Azikiwe University Nigeria.
- Prof. Dr. D. E. Laouisset, Nottingham Business School, UK.
- Prof. Dr. Mauricio Garita, Universidad Francisco Marroquín Guatemala.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Johanan Zamilpa, University of Guanajuato Mexico.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Malgorzata Bartosik-Purgat, Poznan University Poland.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Rana Dilshad, Bahauddin Zakariya University Multan Pakistan.
- Assoc Prof Dr Jose E. Munoz, Point Loma Nazarene University California USA.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Vasyl Taras, University of North Carolina at Greensboro, USA.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Silvia Testarmata, Università degli Studi Niccolò Cusano Rome, Italy.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Artee Aggrawal, Amity University Navi Mumbai, India.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Barbara Jankowska, Poznan University of Economics and Business Poland.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Ernesto Tavoletti, University of Macerata Italy.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Sara Poggesi, University of Rome Tor Vergata Italy.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Shankar Chelliah, School of Management Universiti Sains Malaysia.
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Ali Malik, University of Hertfordshire, UK.
- Asst. Prof. Dr. Aasma Safdar, Bahauddin Zakariya University Multan Pakistan.
- Asst. Prof. Dr. Omer Faruk Genc, Abdullah Gül University, Kayseri, Turkey.
- Asst. Prof. Dr. Pawel Bryla, University of Lodz Poland.
- Asst. Prof. Dr. Anju Mehta, University of North Carolina at Greensboro USA.
• Asst. Prof. Dr. Khawaja Khalid Mehmood, Bahauddin Zakariya University Multan, Pakistan.
• Asst. Prof. Dr. Husnul Amin, International Islamic University Islamabad Pakistan.
• Asst. Prof. Dr. Sehar-un-Nisa Hassan, NUST Islamabad Pakistan.
• Dr. Diana Bank Weinberg, Berlin School of Economics and law (HWR), Germany.
• Dr. Muhammad Haroon Hafeez, Bahauddin Zakariya University Multan Pakistan.
• Dr. Waheed Asghar, Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority Punjab Pakistan.
• Dr. Otega Okinono, Delta State University, Nigeria.
• Dr. Muhammad Rizwan, Middlesex University Business School, London.
INDEXING AND ABSTRACTING

The journal Sustainable Business and Society in Emerging Economies is indexed and abstracted by following institutions. The publishing manager and editorial team are committed to enhance quality and outreach of the journal by expanding the indexing and abstracting of its content further.

- SocioRepec
- EconPapers
- SUNCAT
- Google Scholar
- Crossref
- Scilit
- OAI-PMH Compliant Repositories
- RePEc
- Copac
- ED Ric
- IDEAS
### TABLE OF CONTENTS

Vol. 3, Issue 2, June 2021

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Growth of Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs) in MENA Countries: Constraints and Success Factors</td>
<td>59-73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rim Ben Ayed Mouelhi, Monia Ghazali</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conceptual Framework for Teaching Sustainable Development Course in Blended Learning Environment</td>
<td>75-81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tilagavati Subramaniamam, Muthu Alagan Thangavelu</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Accessing Foreign Aid’s Long Run Contribution to Economic Growth of Pakistan: An Evidence from Time Series Data</td>
<td>83-94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hina Ali, Javeria Masood, Afifa Sadar Ud Din</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managing Entrepreneurship from an Islamic Perspective: Supporting Entrepreneurial Schemes through Islamic Work Ethics and Organisational Commitment</td>
<td>95-106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sadeeq Garba Abubakar, Lauratu Musa Yahaya, Yahaya Muhammad Adamu, Ya’u Mudasiru Muhammed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promoting Sustainable Tourism in Maldives through Social Media: A Review</td>
<td>107-114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aminath Raushan Imad, Tak Jie Chan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education for Sustainable Development (ESD): Awareness of the Pakistani Prospective Teachers</td>
<td>115-123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tahira Batool, Umm e Habiba</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impact of COVID-19 on Socio-Religious Integration in Developing Countries: A Case Study of India and Pakistan</td>
<td>125-131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nusrat Bano, Ghulam Mustafa, Anwar Ali</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Growth of Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs) in MENA Countries: Constraints and Success Factors

Rim Ben Ayed Mouelhi, Professor, ISCAE, University of Manouba, LEFA, ERF and EMNES, Tunis, Tunisia
*Monia Ghazali, Senior Lecturer, IHEC, University of Carthage, LEFA, ERF and EMNES, Tunis, Tunisia

*Corresponding author’s email address: monia.ghazali@ihec.u-carthage.tn

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

Purpose: This study attempts to contribute to a better understanding of the main constraints/boosters for MSME growth in selected countries of the MENA region (Tunisia, Egypt, Morocco and Jordan).

Design/Methodology/Approach: A multinomial logit model is used to investigate the impact of a three-fold classification of firm growth determinants (company characteristics, manager characteristics and business environment characteristics). The database is provided by the World Bank Enterprise Surveys (MENA ES).

Findings: Results give statistically robust evidence that innovative firms are more likely to grow.

Implications/Originality/Value: Therefore, the implementation of efficient and well-governed systems of innovation is a priority in the MENA region.

© 2021 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-4.0


Introduction

One of the most stylized facts emphasized in the EMNES study (2017) regarding the private sector development in the selected MENA region countries (Tunisia, Egypt, Morocco and Jordan) is that micro and very small firms are overwhelming in numbers, though they make the smallest contribution to job creation, as well as limited upward mobility, (The World Bank–Tunisia Development Policy Review, (2015); the World Bank Group business climate report on MENA region, (2016)). Micro and small firms do not seem to grow. They are the least productive and the least innovative, since they do not have the appropriate financial, human and logistical resources. In Tunisia, for example, micro firms represent 98% of firms, however, they generate only 16% of employment. Meanwhile, the share of small and medium firms within the total number of private firms is relatively small (around one percent). Yet,
SMEs absorb about 42% of total employment.

To sum up, the private sectors in the MENA countries are characterized by the “missing Middle” phenomenon. The development of small and medium businesses through the support of micro firms’ growth can foster the dynamic of job creation and contribute to poverty alleviation.

The literature on the MENA region private sector is relatively scarce. The purpose of this working paper is to empirically identify the main constraints/boosters for MSME growth in selected countries of the MENA region (Tunisia, Egypt, Morocco and Jordan). We devise a theoretical and empirical analysis to spot the key growth factors. Firms are distinguished according to their growth rate. We consider three categories: fast growing enterprises (average growth rate ≥20%) often referred to as “Gazelles”, firms with a moderate growth rate (between 10% and 20%) and low-growth firms (<10%). The aim is to capture the main differences and to learn from the experience of those MSMEs which were able to grow.

However, beyond the conventional constraints met by MSME companies related to the business environment (administrative procedures, taxes, infrastructure, access to finance) and the characteristics of firms (age, size, activity, innovation activities, etc.), we aim to focus on factors related to management competence, entrepreneurial experience and managerial skills. These factors are critical to the growth of small businesses, yet insufficiently investigated to date in the literature. Furthermore, we attempt to assess the innovation impact on MSME growth given that innovative firms have a greater probability of surviving and growing over the long term (Harrison, 2008).

The Database is provided by the World Bank Enterprise Surveys (MENA ES). It includes firm-level data collected through interviews of business owners and top managers. The data covers a broad range of firm characteristics, as well as some characteristics of leaders and business environment issues, including: access to finance, corruption, infrastructure, competition, innovation and performance measures. The Enterprise Survey data is available for the four selected countries (Tunisia, Egypt, Morocco and Jordan). The firms’ sample covers around 4469 firms, after cleansing.

The results of the empirical investigation will enable us to set a number of recommendations and priorities to support the growth of micro and small firms in the respective countries, in order to build a functioning private sector and to enhance job creation.

The first section of this study1 presents a literature review regarding the determinants of MSME growth. Section 2 draws a brief overview of the stylized facts on the MENA private sector. Section 3 is dedicated to the empirical strategy. Section 4 presents the main results and recommendations.

Determinants of MSMEs Growth

This section involves a literature review regarding the determinants of MSME performance growth. A wide range of studies, as Hampel et al. (2014), emphasize the constraints and success factors impacting the upgrading of MSMEs. The “onion model” of Reeg (2013) synthesizes a combination of these internal and external factors: entrepreneur characteristics, personal and professional networks, enterprise characteristics and business environments.

The entrepreneur characteristics and networks matter substantially in enterprise upgrading. Recently, Reeg (2013) and Hampel et al. (2014) have clearly shown that factors related to the competence of the entrepreneur and its human and social capital are critical to the growth of businesses. These factors are rarely mentioned by leaders when they are interviewed about the constraints to growth. However, the profile of business leaders, their entrepreneurial experience, their managerial skills, their attitudes, their ability to take risks, their knowledge of different sectors and their social capital and networks are crucial

---

1This paper has been produced with the financial assistance of the European Union within the context of the EMNES project. The contents of this document are the sole responsibility of the authors and can under no circumstances be regarded as reflecting the position of the European Union or the EMNES Network.
in research, as it might capture growth opportunities. A well-developed network can even facilitate the access to finance (Eifert, Gelb and Ramachandran (2005), Mouelhi (2001)).

The Firm characteristics: the age and size of the firm, as well as its location, the sector in which it operates, its human resources and skills, its absorption capacity and the ability to innovate are considered by several studies to be crucial for a firm’s growth and prosperity. According to Jovanovic (1982), the oldest companies develop more slowly because their managers have already reached their most effective operational capacity. Most of the time, they have also reached their optimum productivity.

The size of the company might also be a critical factor. Small-sized companies are often lacking the resources to invest in new equipment, to innovate or to develop R&D activities, which negatively impact their ability to grow (Rothwell and Dodgson, 1991). However, companies well-endowed with skilled and competent labour that invest in training and human resources development, are more likely to grow.

The owner’s gender might also have an impact on a firm’s growth. As indicated by Liedholm (2001), female owners would be more risk averse and probably less concerned by the firm’s growth than male owners.

The degree of foreign cooperation and the technological absorption capacity of the firm are also important for its growth. Participating in export markets and developing partnerships with foreign investors provide firms with opportunities to open up to international best practices. It also fosters learning, improves efficiency and productivity and offers growth opportunities for the firm.

Furthermore, companies in urban zones grow more quickly than their rural counterparts, according to Liedholm (2001). They benefit from externalities of urban areas and large-scale markets.

The innovation effort: several studies have addressed the relationship between innovation and firm growth without reaching a consensus. Many theoretical studies (Aghion et al. (2005), Harrison and al (2008), Hall et al (2008)) have concluded there is a positive relationship between innovation and growth. Empirical studies have delivered mixed results. Some researchers emphasize the absence of a relationship between innovation and firm growth while others conclude that it is a positive association. One possible explanation of such a discrepancy is the different measures and various innovation components (product innovation, process innovation, etc.) considered, as well as the data and econometric methods used. One should also keep in mind that the impact of innovation on growth could be low or absent in the short-term, as it needs maturity and time to turn into firm growth. Furthermore, the relationship between firm growth and innovation could be bi-directional. Innovation is a key driver of growth. Yet, high-growth firms have more resources and capacity to innovate (Mason and al, 2009).

These things considered, there is almost a consensus on the fact that innovative firms have more probability of surviving and of growing in the long term. There is also a consensus on the positive impact of product innovations on growth. Product innovations have a positive impact on firm employment as they lead to an increase in new products sales and to market extension (Harrison et al (2008), Bianchini et al (2014)).

However, the impact of the innovation process on employment growth is variable and inconclusive. On one hand, the innovation process might improve the production process. It is expected to exert a positive impact on productivity via a more efficient use of factors, which could lead to a reduction in
employment requirements and to a labour shrinkage. On the other hand, a compensation effect might take place: the innovation process leads to a decrease in production costs, and thus, in product price which translate into an increase in product demand and sales.

The business environment: Many studies show that the quality of the business environment is a determinant for MSME growth. Obstacles to firm growth range from political instability, hindered access to finance, regulation rigidity and heavy administrative procedures to corruption practices and unfair competition from the informal sector (Eifert et al (2005), MENA study (2017)).

**Data Description**

We use firm level data provided by the World Bank Enterprise Survey. Face to face interviews have been carried out with business owners and top managers in 2013 across 8 MENA countries. The MENA ES offers a representative sample of the non-agricultural, formal private sector. Firms included in the survey have at least five employees and operate in the manufacturing or services sectors. According to the World Bank Report (2016), the survey has used random sampling, itemized by firm size, sector of activity, and regional location within each economy, as well as weighing which guarantees a statistical representation of the private sector for each country. Data covers a broad range of firm characteristics, including innovation, performance measures, leadership characteristics and business environment issues, such as access to finance, corruption, infrastructure, informal sector, competition, etc.

For the purpose of this study, we have extracted a sample of 4469 firms belonging to the countries of interest. Table 1 provides some descriptive statistics related to the data in use. The largest sub-sample was observed in Egypt. Firms mainly operate in the manufacturing sector. Furthermore, one can observe that small firms comprise by far the largest category (about 60%) which is representative of the private sector structure in MENA countries.

We compute the average annual labour growth rates between 2009 and 2012 using the available data. As shown in Table 1, around 67% of firms have been downsizing, shrinking their number of employees. This is most notable in Tunisia and Egypt due to political, social and economic instability related to the popular uprisings. The so-called “gazelles”, i.e., firms with an average annual growth rate exceeding 20%, represent only 5.5% of total firms.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1. Sample Description</th>
<th>Tunisia</th>
<th>Morocco</th>
<th>Egypt</th>
<th>Jordan</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Firms number</strong></td>
<td>592</td>
<td>407</td>
<td>2897</td>
<td>573</td>
<td>4469</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Size in 2009</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Small (less than 50)</td>
<td>59%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium (50 to 200)</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Large (above 200)</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sectors</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>51%</td>
<td>71%</td>
<td>66%</td>
<td>67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Services</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retail</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Labor growth</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less than 0</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>47%</td>
<td>77%</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0 to 0.2</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>47%</td>
<td>27.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>above 0.2</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>5.5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Authors’ compilation using the MENA ES database

---

2This is infrequent according to Harrison et al (2008).
3Djibouti, Egypt, Jordan, Lebanon, Morocco, Tunisia, West Bank and Gaza and Yemen.
4Further details about The MENA Enterprise Survey are provided by the World Bank Report (2016).
Stylized Facts on MSMEs in the MENA Countries
Micro Firms: The Major Category and The Creator of Least Jobs

In Tunisia, according to the EMNES study (2017), firm size distribution is biased towards micro firms (98% of total firms), which only absorb 16% of total employment (see figure 1). In turn, large firms employing more than 200 workers account for only 0.1% of all firms, but absorb 42% of total employment. Overall, medium or large firms with more than 50 workers account for more than 50% of total employment.

**Figure 1. Employment Shares of Tunisian Firms in 2014 (sorted by size)**

Source: Authors’ compilation using RNE database. Micro firms employ less than 10 workers. Small firms employ between 10 and 50 workers. Medium firms account for between 50 and 200 workers. Large firms account for more than 200 workers.

In Jordan, the EMNES study (2017) points out that 89% of private sector establishments are micro enterprises and contribute to 36% of employment in the private sector. Nine percent of the firms can be considered small and employ a share of 16%, while medium firms represent one percent of total firms but create 12% of total jobs. Large companies represent 0.5% of the total establishment but generate 36% of jobs.

**Figure 2. Employment Shares of Jordanian firms in 2013 (sorted by size)**

In Egypt, the EMNES study (2017) emphasizes that micro enterprises employing one to four employees constitute approximately 91% of all firms. Small and medium ones, employing between five and one hundred people, account for around eight percent, while large enterprises represent less than one percent.

According to the ERF Research Report (2016), micro firms employing less than ten workers constitute 97.7% of the MSE sector (employing less than 50 employees) in Morocco which, in turn, represents 99.6% of the non-agriculture private sector.

Although it is somewhat harsh to rely on comparable statistics for the four MENA countries, one could point out that the share of SMEs is small compared to micro firms, however they contribute significantly to employment. Overall, promoting the upgrading and expansion of micro firms would boost the SME sector and generate spillover effects to the economy as a whole.

**Limited Upward Mobility: SMEs Do Not Grow**

According to the employment transition matrix related to the four MENA countries of interest (see Table 2), 91% of firms considered as small in 2009, remained small in 2012. None of the firms that had been categorized small in 2009 became large by 2012. Furthermore, only 4.5% of the firms that had been medium-sized in 2009 expanded in 2012, to become large companies. However, 36% of large firms in 2009 shrunk, becoming medium or small-sized. Hence, the dynamism of firms is limited in the MENA region, probably due to distorted competition and discrimination in firms’ access to government support, where there is a bias towards the selection and learning processes underlying firms’ growth (ERF Research Report (2016)).

| Source: Authors’ computations using the MENA ES database |
| MSME MENA Total |
| Size in 2009 | Large | Medium | Small | Total |
| Size in 2012 | 927 | 215 | 320 | 1462 |
| 63.4% | 14.7% | 21.9% | 100% |
| Medium | 69 | 1225 | 200 | 1494 |
| 4.6% | 82% | 13.4% | 100% |
| Small | 6 | 132 | 1375 | 1513 |
| 0.4% | 8.7M | 90.9% | 100% |
| Total | 1002 | 1572 | 1895 | 4.469 |
| 22.4 | 35.1 | 42.4 | 100 |

Obstacles to Development in Countries

According to instability is the MSME development, disclosed by firm managers in both Tunisia (50%) and Egypt (48%), due to the climate of uncertainty and political unrest following the popular uprisings. It is also among the top three cited obstacles in Jordan (12%), as a consequence of regional instability. However, in Morocco, corruption is viewed as the main business environment constraint, by 19% of firms. In Jordan, the largest issue faced by firms is related to tax rates (17% of respondents).

Access to finance is one of the top constraints jointly pointed out by managers in the four countries of interest. While the World Bank Report (2016) draws attention to the large size of financial and banking sectors in the MENA region, it emphasizes issues such as biased bank lending towards large firms and high collateral standards. Getting credit is a common issue pointed out by the latest World Bank’s Doing Business Report (2017) in Morocco, Tunisia, Jordan and, to a lesser extent, Egypt (see Table 3). Informality and the inadequate workforce are commonly highlighted by both Morocco and Tunisia as important constraints to MSME growth, while an unreliable supply of electricity is one of the top...
concerns of Egyptian firms, confirmed by the Doing Business Report (2017). The same report ranked Egypt and Jordan badly (respectively 122nd and 118th among 190 countries) with regard to the ease of doing business - far behind Morocco (68th) and Tunisia (77th). However, new entrepreneurs are facing greater challenges when starting a business in either Jordan or Tunisia (103rd and 106th out of 190th).

![Figure 3. Obstacles to MSME Growth in MENA Countries](image)

Source: MENA ES database

**Figure 3. Obstacles to MSME Growth in MENA Countries**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Egypt</th>
<th>Jordan</th>
<th>Morocco</th>
<th>Tunisia</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ease of doing business</td>
<td>122</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Starting a business</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dealing with construction permits</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>109</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Getting electricity</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Registering property</td>
<td>109</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Getting credit</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>185</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Protecting investors</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>165</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paying taxes</td>
<td>162</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trading abroad</td>
<td>168</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enforcing contracts</td>
<td>162</td>
<td>124</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Closing a business</td>
<td>109</td>
<td>142</td>
<td>131</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


**Empirical Analysis**

The purpose of this section is to assess the determinants of MSME growth in the MENA region. The dependent variable “Growth” is a multinomial variable with three outcomes. It takes the value of one if the firm registered a growth rate exceeding 20%, rating it in the “gazelles” category. It takes the value of two with a growth rate of between 10% and 20%. If the firm has grown by less than 10% per year on average during the last three years, the dependent variable takes the value of three. In order to compute the annual average growth rate \( g \) of MSMEs, we consider data regarding the number of employees in 2009 and 2012 as follows:

\[
Growth = 1 \quad \text{if} \quad g \geq 20\%
\]

\[
Growth = 2 \quad \text{if} \quad 10\% \leq g < 20\%
\]

\[
Growth = 3 \quad \text{if} \quad g < 10\%
\]

We attempt to explain the propensity of a firm to grow by using a multinomial model with a broad set of
explanatory variables, derived from a literature overview and available on the ES database. Table 4, below, sums up the main variables considered in the model.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 4. Variables Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Dependent variable</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Growth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Explanatory variables</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Manager characteristics</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female Top manager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Top manager experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Owner Manager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Firm characteristics</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Firm size</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Firm age</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreign participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Innovation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Productivity$_{(t-3)}$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Business Environment</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Major obstacle Finance</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Estimation Results

Table 5, below, displays the marginal effects derived from multinomial logit estimates of the determinants of MSME growth in the MENA region. We consider three categories of determinants: firm characteristics, manager characteristics and environment characteristics. Innovation is one of the core factors within the first category. Results suggest that firms implementing innovations related to production activities, management practices, marketing strategy, logistics or processes increase their probability of achieving a growth rate of between 10% and 20% by about 0.0771 points. All the marginal effects associated with the innovation variable are highly significant. This positive association between innovation and firm labour growth could stem from product, process or organizational innovation, as demonstrated by previous studies. Product innovation is expected to generate positive net effects by boosting demand for the firm’s products and expanding its market position (Harrison et al., 2008; Lachenmaier and Rottmann, 2011). Process innovation has a labour displacement effect in the short term, due to greater efficiency in production. This could be compensated by an increase in product demand through a reduction in production costs, implying more competitive prices. Evangelista and Vezzani (2012) give evidence that organizational change (i.e. the adoption of new business practices, knowledge management systems, etc) has an indirect positive impact on employment through the increase of sales revenues. Marketing innovation, as well as logistics innovation, are also considered to be important elements of non-technological innovation (Damijan et al. (2014)) that might lead to job creation via the growth of firms’ sales.

Results in table 6 also show that being a large firm reduces the probability of being a low-performing firm in terms of labour growth, holding all other variables constant. Large and medium sized firms have more resources to invest, to innovate, to train employees and so, to expand. Using a rich panel data set of manufacturing firms in nine sub-Saharan African countries, Van Biesebroeck (2005) gives empirical evidence confirming that large and medium sized firms are expanding their workforce and their added value more rapidly than smaller firms.

The age of the firm appears to be negatively related to the probability of showing high or moderate labour growth. The oldest companies develop more slowly because they have already reached their most effective operational size and their optimum productivity. Furthermore, older firms may suffer from lower growth persistence related to issues preventing their strategies to adapt to changing business conditions, as well as increasing inertia and organizational rigidities (Coad et al. 2014).

Unsurprisingly, an increase in firm sales growth rate of one percent increases the probability of being a “gazelle” by 0.05 and the probability of generating a growth rate of between 10% and 20% by 0.25. This underlines the importance of identifying and accessing new markets.

6We have included a qualitative variable « Patent » taking 1 if the firm has been granted a patent during the last 3 years and 0 otherwise. However, it appears to be statistically non-significant.
An increase in labour productivity can reduce the probability of being a low-performing firm. However, the magnitude of the marginal effect is low.

An increase in government participation in company capital negatively affects the probability of generating a growth rate of over 10%. Generally, many studies point out a negative link when investigating the impact of government involvement on company performance. This may be explained by the poor quality of management and governance in public firms.

Regarding the effect of the set of management characteristics on our dependent multinomial variable, only the owner-manager variable seems to play a statistically significant role. The owner-manager variable can decrease the probability of being a low-performing firm. Management ownership is frequently documented in the literature as being significantly and positively related to firm performance. In fact, as the proportion of shares held by the top manager increases, he is expected to be more motivated to maximize the company’s interests, rather than focusing on his personal interests, (Lei and Shunlin, 2008).

Within the third set of independent variables, being located in a capital city decreases the probability of generating a growth rate below 10%. Firms located in a capital city benefit from externalities and large scale markets. They also benefit from support programs, coaching and networking more than their counterparts located elsewhere (Liedholm 2001).

Furthermore, firms highlighting the political unrest obstacle as the biggest business constraint they face, are less likely to become “gazelles”. On the other hand, firms having trouble getting a license are less likely to have a growth rate between 10% and 20%. While the aforementioned constraints, especially political instability, are well emphasized in the descriptive analysis related to the four concerned MENA countries (see figure 3), it is questionable why the financial constraint does not have any statistically significant impact on the dependent multinomial variable.

The MENA ES survey measures firms’ business constraints through top managers’ self-assessment of the major obstacle encountered. One might suspect numerous pitfalls in such a measurement, particularly regarding the financing constraint. Ferrando and Mulier (2013) distinguish between data on firms' perceived financing constraints and more objective data based on firms' actual applications to external financing, in order to ascertain “whether the firms that self-report to be financially constrained have different characteristics than those financially unconstrained”. They find that younger firms are more likely to perceive access to finance as being complicated and to position themselves outside of the loan-application process due to “fear of rejection”. Perceived financial constraints, rather than actual constraints, increase significantly when firms have more short-term debt. Further, the authors provide some evidence that firms with sufficient liquidity and lower leverage ratios are less likely to feel financially constrained.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Explanatory Variables</th>
<th>Growth &gt;=20%</th>
<th>10% &lt;= Growth &lt;20%</th>
<th>Growth &lt;10%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Firm Characteristics</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Innovation</td>
<td>0.0115*</td>
<td>0.0771***</td>
<td>-0.0885***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.00680)</td>
<td>(0.0174)</td>
<td>(0.0184)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sales growth rate</td>
<td>0.0499***</td>
<td>0.254***</td>
<td>-0.304***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.0111)</td>
<td>(0.0518)</td>
<td>(0.0599)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Productivity (t-3)</td>
<td>2.41e-09*</td>
<td>4.94e-09</td>
<td>-7.35e-09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(1.33e-09)</td>
<td>(6.30e-09)</td>
<td>(7.22e-09)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ln (firm size)</td>
<td>0.00547**</td>
<td>0.0571***</td>
<td>-0.0626***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.00277)</td>
<td>(0.00612)</td>
<td>(0.00666)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ln (firm age)</td>
<td>-0.0317***</td>
<td>-0.0777***</td>
<td>0.109***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.00550)</td>
<td>(0.0140)</td>
<td>(0.0149)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreign participation</td>
<td>-4.14e-05</td>
<td>6.15e-05</td>
<td>-2.01e-05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.000129)</td>
<td>(0.000336)</td>
<td>(0.000361)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government participation</td>
<td>-3.12e-05</td>
<td>-0.00367*</td>
<td>0.00370*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.000632)</td>
<td>(0.00212)</td>
<td>(0.00209)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Manager characteristics</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Top manager female</td>
<td>-0.00597</td>
<td>0.0119</td>
<td>-0.00594</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.0139)</td>
<td>(0.0378)</td>
<td>(0.0406)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Top manager experience</td>
<td>-0.000187</td>
<td>-0.000230</td>
<td>0.000417</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.000347)</td>
<td>(0.000816)</td>
<td>(0.000864)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Owner Manager</td>
<td>0.00617</td>
<td>0.0451***</td>
<td>-0.0512**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.00779)</td>
<td>(0.0196)</td>
<td>(0.0210)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Environment characteristics</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Licence major obstacle</td>
<td>0.00977</td>
<td>-0.0889**</td>
<td>0.0791</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.0206)</td>
<td>(0.0444)</td>
<td>(0.0491)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance major obstacle</td>
<td>0.00244</td>
<td>0.0257</td>
<td>-0.0281</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.0106)</td>
<td>(0.0288)</td>
<td>(0.0305)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political instability major obstacle</td>
<td>-0.0165**</td>
<td>0.00133</td>
<td>0.0151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.00731)</td>
<td>(0.0197)</td>
<td>(0.0207)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labour inadequacy major obstacle</td>
<td>0.00144</td>
<td>-0.0139</td>
<td>0.0125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.0131)</td>
<td>(0.0381)</td>
<td>(0.0405)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capital city</td>
<td>0.0162*</td>
<td>0.0799***</td>
<td>-0.0961***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.00861)</td>
<td>(0.0206)</td>
<td>(0.0217)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Note:** Sector and country dummies are included. Number of observations: 3158. Standard errors in parentheses*** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1
Conclusion and Recommendations

This study attempts to contribute to a better understanding of the main constraints and boosters for MSME growth in selected countries of the MENA region (Tunisia, Egypt, Morocco and Jordan). A multinomial logit model is used to investigate the impact of a three-fold classification of firm growth determinants (company characteristics, manager characteristics and business environment characteristics). The dependent multinomial variable “growth” captures the annual average employment growth rate of MSMEs over 2009-2012.

Our findings suggest that innovation is a key factor for a firm’s growth. This result is statistically robust. Innovative firms are more likely to grow. As noted above, the adoption of new technologies and processes allows the emergence of high-value added products with new markets perspectives. Therefore, the implementation of efficient and well-governed systems of innovation is a priority in the MENA region. A well-defined innovation strategy, directed to specific sectors and products, is crucial (Ghali, 2016). Greater synergy between the different actors in that process (firms, governments, research centers, agencies, etc.) is needed. Governments should play a more active role to facilitate financing of innovation, particularly in MSMEs. Innovation costs are particularly high. Additional funding and incentives are also necessary to support the innovators. It is also important to steer the efforts and incentives towards more applied research and development projects.

Further, the empirical results suggest a positive and statistically significant relationship between employment growth and firm size, once we consider the age variable. This denotes that large firms are more likely to contribute to job creation. Several studies show that large companies are also the highest performing, in terms of productivity and exports. Promoting the settlement of large companies, especially multinationals, by making sites in the MENA region more attractive is, hence, of major importance. Economic diplomacy has to play a more active role in the attraction of such companies. Political leaders are expected, inter alia to place priority on improving the business climate and removing regulatory and non-regulatory barriers.

Support the growth of small-sized firms is also vital. Specific training for managers is needed to develop strategic plans for their activities and to encourage and extend their professional network. The support structures should develop coaching led by experts and experienced business managers.

Another challenge to be highlighted: to assist small firms in identifying new markets and developing their sales which, according to our results, is one of the most important factors of firms’ growth. This should be the role of professional organizations, the governmental and non-governmental structures supporting entrepreneurship and MSMEs. African markets are very promising, as they display high-growth perspectives and potentials. Companies need support to gain access to these markets, including information and experience sharing, and networking.

Finally, as noted above, the quality of the business environment is a determinant for MSME growth. According to our results, political instability seems to be a significant obstacle to firms’ growth (especially in Tunisia and Egypt after the revolutions). Local firms, as well as foreign ones, need more visibility and political stability to decide whether to invest or to expand.
References


The World Bank (2016). European Investment Bank and European Bank for Development and

Conceptual Framework for Teaching Sustainable Development Course in Blended Learning Environment

*Tilagavati Subramaniam, Faculty of Social Sciences, Quest International University (QIU), Perak, Malaysia
Muthualagan Thangavelu, Faculty of Social Sciences, Quest International University (QIU), Perak, Malaysia

*Corresponding author’s email address: thaya.tilaga@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

Purposes: This paper presents a conceptual framework for teaching sustainable development courses in an online learning environment in institutions of higher education. Sustainability development courses are becoming essential in higher education institutions mainly to educate the younger generations who will be part of the community to make it happen. Higher education institutions are experiencing dramatic shift to cater a young generation of prospective students, to integrate technical innovations in teaching practices and to concentrate on increasing concerns about global sustainability issues. There has been little research to promote an innovative learning in the teaching of sustainable development. The goal of this paper was to create a framework for teaching sustainable development in a virtual learning environment (blended learning) due to the lack of a conceptual framework that could direct this implementation.

Findings: Hence, the blended learning method is eco-friendly, whereby protects global environmental resources. For hands-on experiences, students will develop projects to make their campus and community more sustainable. In the process, students learn how to analyse sustainability and able to apply online learning knowledge into practice.

Implication: The conceptual framework proposed will support all educators in higher education institutions engaged in the promotion of quality online education in this pandemic circumstance to develop an effective online practise that are aligned with the corresponding learning needs, skills and facilities.

© 2021 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-4.0
Introduction
The proliferation of higher education students in internet usage and emerging technology is leading to improvements in curriculum content as well as in teaching and learning methods. An innovative combination of different modes of delivery, teaching models and learning styles can promote this transformation of the teaching and learning environments in higher education settings. Universities and colleges are undergoing rapid change to cater new generation of incoming students, to integrate advanced technology in teaching practices and to concentrate on increasing concerns about global sustainability issues.

With strong insight into the value and potential challenges of sustainable living, these graduates exit the academic world and join the workforce. Therefore, many higher education institutions have incorporated sustainability as a central part of their teaching objectives in order to create a stronger foundation for students entering society and the marketplace of the 21st century. Any curriculum reform, including the establishment and inclusion of compulsory sustainability studies, is not a simplistic undertaking and few have certainly succeeded.

This article proposed the conceptual framework to teach sustainable development course as one of the compulsory university courses to the broader student body. Based on the private higher education institution Act 1996 (Act 555), all the student enroll in the private higher education must be taken compulsory courses (MPU course) and considered as must pass the courses for graduating. There is a total of four components in compulsory course U1, U2, U3 and U4 that emphasizes knowledge, skills, morals, value, patriotism, towering personality and community engagement.

The newly established course will be taught as U3, raising awareness of sustainability issues in Malaysia through a compulsory course for first-year students and raising awareness of Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs).

This article intends to present a conceptual framework to teach sustainability course entitled Sustainable development in Malaysia in an online virtual learning environment and implement a project to solve the sustainability issues in the U4 course. Literally to offer recommendations for other higher education institutions plan to undertake a similar endeavour.

Background of Study
The concept of sustainable development encompasses all facets of financial, societal, and ecological interdependence. The educational strategy is an important way of improving society and becoming an important forum for sustainable development. The Education for Sustainable Development aspect was first officially recognised by the 1992 Earth Summit in Rio de Janeiro, which developed Agenda 21. The new 2030 Sustainable Development Plan clearly illustrates the importance of integrating the Sustainable Development Education Standards into all levels of education. Education is reiterated by the 17 Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) as a primary priority for leading to more sustainable and inclusive communities. Therefore, higher education institutions play a significant role in creating knowledge and application of this knowledge on sustainable development in society through the process of education, outreach and service to the community. Tertiary education is the last destination for students before they enter society. Improvements in values and attitudes, skills and behaviour, particularly through a broad awareness of concerns on sustainable development, can be accomplished through education (Ng, Wee, Ariffin, Shabudin & Hassan, 2020).

Most current research to date has explored the learning outcomes and competencies of educational programmes that transform the students to become change agents towards sustainability (Cebrián, Junyent & Mulà, 2020). This mirrors the lack of conceptual framework in innovative teaching and learning in higher education institutions. Leading to a shortage of a conceptual framework that could
direct this integration, the aim of this paper was to establish a framework for teaching sustainable development in a virtual learning environment (blended learning).

**Literature Review**

**The Concept of Blended Learning**

Blended learning is an approach to be a useful interactive experience in the teaching of sustainable development. According to Caird and Roy (2019), Blended learning designs will promote sustainable development, including the social, economic and environmental aspects of sustainability, and secure global environmental resources for reaching the needs of current and future generations. This method of learning includes the thoughtful combination of face-to-face learning with online learning. Blended learning offers lecturers and students the ability to work together and connect with each other in the field of education, so that learning experiences can be better gained. Blended learning is a blend of multimedia technology, virtual classroom, voicemail, email and conference calls, online text animation and video streaming.

Blended learning is a learning concept that uses conventional approaches to incorporate e-learning methods that can offer solutions, advantages and is very useful both in and out of the classroom to provide students with an in-depth learning experience (Rasmitadila, Widyasari, Humaira, Tambunan, Rachmadtullah, & Samsudin, 2020). Changing or restructuring the learning system to educate a current generation is one way of achieving learning objectives, especially in tertiary education.

The blended learning concept can be used to offer students an enjoyable learning experience, a deep and meaningful learning experience. (Puspita & Hasyim, 2019). Furthermore, blended learning is an environmentally friendly learning experience that helps to create a source-saving society (Yao, 2019). Blended learning shows a learning transformation that relies on the use of technology advancement that is combined with conventional education, such as face-to-face learning, which is the new learning process in the modern period.

**Course development and structure**

The course synopsis is to introduce students to sustainability and sustainable development through an examination of the United Nations’ Sustainable Development Goals. This course will help students understand the environmental, social, and economic challenges faced by Malaysia and how to overcome these challenges.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course Title: Sustainable Development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Course code: XXX</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Course learning outcomes:**

CLO 1: Discuss the relevance of the Sustainable Development Goals to Malaysia.
CLO2: Evaluate current issues, and their implications, related to the Sustainable Development Goals in local and national contexts.
CLO3: Create a positive social impact project related to selected Sustainable Development Goals.

**Course Content Outline:**

- Topic 1: Overview of sustainable development
- Topic 2: 17 Sustainable Development Goals
- Topic 3: Sustainability: Issues, challenges and prospects
- Topic 4: Implementation of sustainable development through Malaysia's case studies
- Topic 5: Developing sustainability-oriented programmes

**Assessment Method:**

1. Group Project
2. Individual assignment
3. Presentation
4. Online participation
Discussion
According to Soria & Weiner (2013), Sustainable development course has the ability to enhance the instructive teaching environment for university students by linking knowledge and experience. The findings of a study by Soria and Weiner (2013) contribute to an idea for the advantages of integrating teaching elements into virtual courses and contribute to a hypothesis that explains how real-world connections improve students' learning. It is essential to discuss the implication of having a sustainable development course in a blended learning setting since its statistically proven that electronic learning is increase in tertiary education. In results, the students would be capable of applying everything they have discovered in a blended learning setting that incorporates with the physical and virtual environments.
The Applications of Blended Learning Method in Sustainable Development (SD) Course.

Community of Inquiry (CoI) is a framework developed by Garrison and Randy (2011) distinguishes three main components that are essential for constructing knowledge in a virtual learning course. The level of motivation and performance increases as the level of presence improves. As an outcome, researchers have recognized that in order to achieve instructional goals in learning, students need guidance from teachers or more professional peers. (Reiser, 2002; Kazlauskas & Applebee, 2007). Some of the related online tools that can use in online learning would be like moodle, socreative, blendspace, edpuzzle and many more.

Apart from that, an instrument like forum discussions, chat room, comment boxes which are also widely employed in the eLearning context. Learners can communicate using computer-mediated communication methods such as forum discussion. As opposed to synchronous face-to-face conversations, research indicates that asynchronous online discussions are much better for information co-construction since there is more scope for reflection and positive contributions (Wang, Shen & Ritterfeld, 2009).

Based on CLO1 - Discuss the relevance of the Sustainable Development Goals to Malaysia and CLO2- Evaluate current issues, and their implications, related to the Sustainable Development Goals in local and national contexts.

Students will be expected to understand SD, current issues of SD and implications of nine fundamental goals of SD. This CLOs covers the essential topics of the overall module of SD. Thus, the mixed approach or blended learning would be one of the best methods that can be used to achieve those course learning outcomes. Finding demonstrates that studying without appropriate guidance from teachers causes students to feel lonely, lack self-confidence, lose motivation, and struggle to complete the complex assignment. It will induce the students to lose concentration on their studies, as well as their hopes and enthusiasm for furthering their skills and knowledge (Holmes, Birds, Seay, Smith & Wilson, 2010).

For CLO3, - Create a positive social impact project related to selected Sustainable Development Goals.

As mentioned in the proposed framework, students are required to “engaged in a collaborative and reflective process which includes understanding an issue or problem, searching for relevant information, connecting and integrating information, and actively confirming the understanding”. Students will be able to construct the implications of Sustainable Development, or in other words, students will develop their “Cognitive Presence”. The essence of the learning environment in raising awareness improvements
is cognitive presence (Garrison & Randy, 2011). It refers to a student’s ability to comprehend course material and engage in an efficient online forum based on a real event, discovery, adaptation, and resolution in this proposed conceptual framework. In this blended learning course, each link is focused on CLOs to maximize the learning outcome by creating a conducive teaching and learning atmosphere. Students are expected to collaborate on information and have discussions in an online community in order to fix the issues and achieve the objective by vanquish challenges in the mission.

**Implication and Conclusion**

This paper illustrates online learning (blended learning) can be used to facilitate teaching for a sustainable development course in compulsory courses (MPU) to bridge face-to-face classroom interaction and out-of-classroom learning experience. Academics or university teachers may take the opportunity to use online learning to completely incorporate their teaching and learning. The instructor may set an online teaching and learning platform like “Moodle” or “Google classroom” for example, that could encourage students to connect with them in a more exciting and less stressful way. Since students can access to the online platform every day anyway, the tendency that the students might miss any essential academic-related announcements, information or instructions is minimal. This will allow students not only to keep track of any recent information from their educators, but it will also provide them with the ability to discuss their academic problems synchronously or asynchronously across the online platform, for instance. In short, university scholars should make effective use of everything that the online platform has to give to carry their teaching and learn outside traditional lectures so that it can help both teachers and students. In addition, while being linked on an online platform, students may also make proper use of their time to do something much more valuable instead of only doing the normal on an online platform.

In order to accommodate the various areas in the course, the syllabus teaching approaches were updated to incorporate instructional techniques like seminars, workshops, sustainability projects and online games. An online platform such as socrative, coggle, edpuzzle and blendspace should be developed to encourage online learning. This type of online learning benefits for the students, because these applications allow voice recording, and the voice recording might be used as comments and suggestions for the teaching and learning activities. Further, these applications can also be downloaded on multiple devices, particularly smartphones, so that students and instructors can use the feature to make learning more casual and enjoyable.

The students were expected to prepare and implement a sustainability project instead of teaching a sustainable development course using blended learning. It is basically a project in which they had to discuss their project with the teacher and under the guidance and supervision of a teacher, created a plan to explain their chosen project and execute the project. This real-world initiative is capable of achieving sustainable development goals, raising awareness, providing students with the information and skills for lasting lifestyle behavioural change and active involvement in social issues. In addition, the course and project help to forge sustainable goals for the academic, administrative and stakeholder institutions of higher education.

**References**


**Accessing Foreign Aid’s Long Run Contribution to Economic Growth of Pakistan: An Evidence from Time Series Data**


*Javeria Masood*, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, Pakistan.

*Afifa Sadar Ud Din*, Department of Economics, The Women University Multan, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email address: hinaali@wum.edu.pk*

**ARTICLE DETAILS**

**History**
Revised format: May 2021
Available Online: Jun 2021

**Keywords**
Population Growth, Foreign Aid, Inflation, Foreign Direct Investment, Gross Domestic Product

**JEL Classification**
F35, F43, E31, E44

**ABSTRACT**

**Purpose:** This research examines the effectiveness of foreign aid on Pakistan’s economic growth. The foreign aid efficiency is still under question. Some researches show positive affiliation of foreign aid with economic growth while some show negative affiliation. If foreign aid is not replacing or used as a substitute for domestic savings then foreign aid is useful for growth. To fill the two gaps of the economy the Two-Gap theory suggest that poor nations have to depend on overseas funds. Those two gaps are the Savings-Investment Gap and Import-Export Gap. There’re many kinds of international funds. Like foreign loans, development and non-development aid, FDI, and technological help. But underdeveloped nations like Pakistan have not a favorable speculation policy. Therefore, these nations are dependent on international aid and balance quite than foreign direct investment.

**Design/Methodology/Approach:** For the analysis of this study the time era used is 1974 to 2016. The GDP is the dependent variable. Independent variables are population growth, foreign aid, inflation, foreign direct investment (FDI), and domestic savings. The annual data is collected from different sources. The technique for analysis is OLS and ARDL bound testing.

**Findings:** Concluding remarks show that in Pakistan foreign aid affects economic growth negatively.

**Implications/Originality/Value:** The current study was based on the least considered variables and the pioneer in testing the complex relationship through OLS and ARDL estimation.

© 2021 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-4.0


**Introduction**

Foreign aid is good or bad for economic growth. The effectiveness of foreign aid is still under question. After World War II many countries, especially underdeveloped countries highly appreciate stimulating
outdoor support or foreign aid to boost investment or output growth. But in under developing countries or poor countries, foreign aid has a positive effect, as well as negative effects, show on economic growth at the same time. Foreign aid is useful for growth if it does not replace domestic savings. Foreign aid can be clear as the financial, mechanical, and military assistance given by one nation to another for the reason of help and cure, financial stabilization, or for mutual protection. External assistance or foreign aid has multiple forms such as grants, foreign private assistance, developmental loans, and official loans, tied and united loans. Bilateral and multilateral loans and many others.

Foreign aid to Pakistan includes many types of aids these are (a) support Project (b) Commodity aid (c) for food Aid under PL 480 and (d) Technical support. The huge amount of foreign assistance that Pakistan received has been in the type of fixed project aid in the majority of the cases for both resource and use. Development assistance is a sort of assistance that is earmarked on behalf of special advance initiatives, such as irrigation schemes and huge manufacturing networks and communications introduced a significant component. The second-largest factor of the assistance received by Pakistan is commodity support. This type of aid is allowed a certain degree of flexibility. Land use is not fixed, but in most cases, it is linked to sources. (Khuhro et al., 2012, March).

This is the reason that the Pakistan Commodity support elected rather than aid projects. Commodity aid whiles a proportion of the entire aid falls34% in 1960-1965 to 23% in 1979-1980. The third huge factor of aid to Pakistan is Food aid less than PL 480. These aids provide by the United States through the sale of surplus agriculture products. The funds from the trade of these remaining farming products are then paid complement support prohibited by the US management throughout relieve job to Pakistan. Distribution of the resources, defined as help, among other actions the maintenance of the US Government. The fourth type of foreign aid is vital for Pakistan, for the reason that Pakistan is lacking technological awareness, capitalist capacity, and expert labor. (Abbas & Raza 2013).

Two-Gap Model and Foreign Aid: Hollis Chenery and A. Strout were present in this model. According to them most of the developing countries face the two-gap model. These Two Gaps are: (1): The lack of domestic (national) savings to cope with the Investment opportunities. (2): The lack of financing foreign currency needed for imports of intermediate goods & capital. These two, Savings and Foreign exchange gaps are traditional “TWO-GAP”. According to this model, to achieve self-sustained growth a country passes through three stages: First, absorption is a withdrawn economy that cans useful investing the minimum amount.

Purpose of foreign assistance, to increases this stage to the recording capacity of the economy, via providing technical help, proper education, and guidance, and so on. Foreign aid is a contentious matter. Some community says that it increases economic growth or some argue that it increases the debt burden. Here its main benefits or importance are as follows: Increased production: The influx of aid as capital or technology to increases production in various sectors of the economy. Increases investment level: In less developed economies, such as Pakistan, the saving rate is low. We cannot meet the needs of investors. International aid or loans can fill this gap. It increases the rate of investment. For the Trade deficit: Less developed countries face the deficit BOP. So this deficit is filled with the help of foreign aid. Increase employment level: With the assistance will be determined by the development of foreign aid plan different or new industries. So we will employ new workers. It raises the employment level in the country. Increase in real wages: Inflow of capital will increase the output level. Foreign aid increases the competence of the workers. Thus it increases the real wages of their marginal product. (Nkoro, & Furo 2012).

An increase in government revenue: The profit which ears by the foreign investment will tax by the government. New projects of foreign investors raised revenue. In this way the revenue of the government raises. Outdoor economies: With the flow of overseas aid, enterprises can enjoy the benefits of external economies such as the formation of labor and the beginning of new machinery. Improved
quality of production: Foreign aid generates new industries in the economy. The influx of capital and technology advances the worth of manufacture and lessens cost. Rate of development increases: The correct use of external aid can be useful in developing countries and increasing development in these countries. Make love and brotherhood: Foreign assistance generates love and brotherhood between wealthy and deprived nations because aid makes the poor nation wealthy. (Mohey-ud-din, 2005).

Beyond the importance or benefits of foreign assistance, there are also disadvantages of foreign assistance because several citizens squabble that the capital is not a single factor in increasing economic growth or development rate in a country. These are: (1): Increase in the burden of debt, (2): Payment of interest, (3): dangerous for freedom, (4): Tied loans, (5): Foreign dependence, (6): Cause of inflation, (7): Aims of aid givers, (8): External Indebtedness, (9): Projects not requiring aid, (10): Uncertainty, (11): Misuse of aid, (12): Economic sovereignty. Similar to many other less developed economies, Pakistan relies on foreign aid to finance to increase national savings investment. To bridge the gap of resources, it starts external debt in the 1950s. Over the years, there was a stop begging off the inflow of aid to Pakistan. Just transfer is made as regards 90% of unpleasant expenditure in 1964-1965 was fall to 56% in 1977-1978 and 50% in 1979-1980.

In starting years received a high percentage of aid as a grant or aid assistance. Such assistance was reduced and changed by the term of foreign grants and credits are repayable in foreign currency with the terms & conditions strictly. In the first plan, the share of aid or assistance in total commitments was 80%. This 80% share was reduced to 46% on the second floor and 31% reduced during the 3rd floor. It has 12% in the period of non-plan. Moreover, the share of aid is increased slowly by over 20% during the five years of the plan. From 2002 to 2009 only 30% of foreign aid was used in economic-related needs. The remaining 70% allocated to security-related assistance. From 2010 to 2016 only 41% of aid is used in economic needs.

Figure 1: Trend of dependent and independent variables

Source: Authors calculations (Eviews 7.0)

Figure 1 shows the 40 years trends of foreign assistance's effect on economic growth in Pakistan. According to the economic survey of Pakistan in 1974, GDP has a 132.58 percent rate in Pakistan and then increased and fluctuate year by year.

Literature Review
Din (2005) examined the contact of foreign support for financial development in Pakistan (1960-2002). This study analyzed the trend and performance of international aid and the effectiveness or role in the Pakistan economy. The study describes two variables are the growth of GDP and the Debt burden. The source of the data calculated at stable prices of 2000. For the analysis, the quadratic regression model is used. The study concludes empirically both negative and positive effects of foreign assistance. So the overall effect of foreign aid is positive on economic growth. But replacing the detriment of the aid equal to domestic savings has increases the debt burden. The policy has played a role ineffectiveness of
foreign aid. The assistance perhaps useful for a financial expansion increased simply with the existence of the monetary policy, fiscal, and trade policies.

Khan and Ahmad (2007) examined that Foreign Aid is good or bad: facts from Pakistan. This study investigates whether international support is a lucky thing or bothers for Pakistan. The variables of this study are economic growth, foreign aid, export, domestic investment, and FDI. This study examines the link between aid growth in total and disaggregated levels for the era of 1972 to 2006. The analytical study is based on an approach of cointegration ARDL. In the end, results showed the negative effect of overseas aid on augmentation in total and a broken face. The study also suggests that inward investment, growth of export, and the inflows of foreign direct investment strengthen major providers to financial enlargement in Pakistan.

Shehzad et al. (2011) examined the effect of international assistance on government spending in the case of Pakistan. The total expenditures of government, actual government spending for development, total domestic resources, the program aid, and project aid are taken as a variable in this study. The data period is 1990-2008. The sources of the data are the Pakistan economic survey, some official publications, and WDI reports. To analyze, the data study uses a Simple regression model. The research concluded that there is a positive association between the two programs and project assistance and government expenditure.

Min and Sanidas (2011) analyzed the impact of the support of Foreign Functional classes for economic development in receiver economies. The research suggested that there are three important visits to the efficiency of overseas funds. Firstly, international support was seen as direct in terms of the impact on expansion. Secondly, foreign support is effective while assured circumstances are met. Thirdly, aid doesn’t have significantly positive returns, not on economic growth. To explain all these aspects are examined seven major functional forms of support. This study takes the variables are index of Physical Quality of Life, HDI, dependency ratio of age, infant mortality rate, the rate of adult literacy, and GDP growth. The entire variables are used in the analysis as dependent variables to evaluate the efficiency of the aid. The study used a range of them for the prose and the 7 sorts of assistance, these are independent variables. At the end of the investigation, all types of assistance become conditional variables in diverse customs. This study used panel figures procedure, as permanent effects, arbitrary effects, and the organization GMM. Finally, the study verifies the optimistic force of foreign assistance for financial development.

Chowdhury and Das (2011) examined the link Aid expansion in south Asia: facts as of the time series and panel cointegration. This study investigates the connection between overseas help and real GDP as per capita is relatively uncertain. This means aid doing work in South Asia? For five nations in this district, study analysis: Bangladesh, Pakistan, India, Nepal, and Sri Lanka. The research evaluates four key variables, per capita real GDP, foreign assistance as a fraction of GDP, nasty wealth formation as a fraction of GDP, and trade Openness as a proportion of GDP. The yearly data is used for the period 1976 to 2008. All this data will be taken respectively, from WDI, International Financial information record, and OECD reports, and International Monetary Fund. For the analysis, the study uses both sets of nation-explicit time series plus a procedure of co-integration. The result of the study demonstrates a helpful time-consuming association connecting the development speed of real GDP for each capita and support as a fraction of GDP for 4 beyond 5 countries. In the end, these investigations tend to hold the hypothesis's effectiveness of aid for the South Asian countries.

Fatima et al. (2012) investigate the contact of the inflow of domestic resources and foreign capital for Pakistan’s economic growth. The time used is from 1975 to 2008. This study takes the economic growth as needy variable and FDI, overseas aid; national resources are as autonomous variables. This study was analyzed by multiple linear regressions service ordinary least square method (OLS). The consequences of this study break down that FDI has a statistically encouraging relation plus momentous role to the
economic extension in this country. But, international assistance has an insignificant effect on financial growth and national resources have been found to contribute more to the rate of economic growth, compared to accelerate foreign resources. In the end, the study suggested that the reliance on foreign aid must cease or be used only for productive purposes.

Jones (2013) tested the hypothesis growth driven foreign assistance in the West African economies. This study evaluates the growth assumptions in foreign aid led by a group of West African countries. Total 16th countries in West Africa were used in the sample. The International Financial Statistics database of the International Monetary Fund and African bank by Economic indicators, and from the Social Data Service reports, time-series data utilized for empirical investigation. The variables taken by this study are Real GDP, labor, stock of domestic resources, international aid, FDI, and official development assistance. This study uses panel co-integration techniques and then on a country to the country origin, by the use of cointegration methods of time series. The study concludes that the cointegration fellow panel shows a lengthy relation among support and development in the entire panel. In the end, the study shows evidence of causality check of overseas aid for economic development.

Bashir et al., (2016) investigated the flow of foreign capital and the economic development of Pakistan. This research takes growth as a dependent while external debt servicing, FDI, workers’ remittances, national investment, rate of inflation measured by GDP deflator plus the literacy rate are the independent variables. The sample period taken is 1972-2013. The cointegration test of Johansen and the causality test of the granger were used for data analysis. This study shows the negative effects of the flows of the economic growth of the economy in the long term. Analysis of the short period victims checks debt service in the form of running, FDI, inflation, and rate of growth literacy. Bidirectional casualty shows between remittances and growth.

Data and Research Methodology
In this segment, the researcher briefly outlines the data methodology and empirical setup via illustrating data and by examining structural and statically approach to estimate the relation of foreign assistance with economic growth in Pakistan.

Data
This research uses the secondary type of figures. The data series covered the period from 1974 to 2013. The data series examined in this research is collected from secondary data sources. Secondary data sources of this study are world development, the World Bank (WB), Pakistan Economic Surveys, and Hand BOOK of statics (SBP or State Bank of Pakistan).

Variables Description:
The quantitative variables are used in the analysis for examining the relationships between foreign aid and economic growth. Following is the table showing variables used in this research;

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Description of variables</th>
<th>Unit</th>
<th>Expected sign</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross domestic production</td>
<td>In current dollars (US$)</td>
<td>+ve sign</td>
<td>World development indicator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POPG</td>
<td>Population Growth</td>
<td>In annual percent (%)</td>
<td>-ve sign</td>
<td>World development indicator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AID</td>
<td>Foreign Aid</td>
<td>In percent (%)</td>
<td>-ve sign</td>
<td>World development indicator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INF</td>
<td>Inflation</td>
<td>In annual percent (%)</td>
<td>-ve sign</td>
<td>World development indicator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDI</td>
<td>Foreign direct investment</td>
<td>In current dollars (US$)</td>
<td>+ve sign</td>
<td>World development indicator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DS</td>
<td>Domestic saving</td>
<td>In price rupees</td>
<td>-ve sign</td>
<td>Economic Survey of Pakistan</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: author’s calculation

The table shows all variables that are utilized in this research. This table also displays the units of
measurement and their expected sign of these variables. The dependent variable of this research is gross
domestic product (GDP, in USS dollar). While, Independent variables are population growth, foreign
aid, inflation, foreign direct investment, and domestic savings.

The dependent variable GDP has an expected positive significant sign. Independent variables are
population growth, aid, inflation, and domestic savings. Population growth (POPG) has an expected
negative significant impact. AID has also a negative significant impact. Inflation (INF) has an expected
negative significant sign. Domestic saving (DS) has an expected positive significant impact. In the last
column, the data source is mentioned.

Methodology
The OLS (ordinary least square) and ARDL (Auto-regressive distributed lagged model) are the main
statistical estimation techniques applied to measure the association among dependent (GDP) and
independent variables (POPG, AID, POP, DS, INF, and FDI) in the regression analysis. The OLS
method is a much admired and generally used method examined by many researchers. Firstly, this
technique was developed by Cart Friedrich Gausses in 1821.

Model specification
In the regression analysis mostly the model is used as follow:
\[ Y = a_0 + b_1X_1 + b_2X_2 + B_3X_3 + e \]…………………(1)
In this model:
- \( Y \)= dependent or needy variable
- \( X_1, X_2, \) and \( X_3 \) are free or independent variables

This paper examined model that shows the association among the Foreign aid and economic growth is
discussed below:
\[ Y(GDP) = a_0+b_1(POPG)+b_2(AID)+b_3(INF)+b_4(FDI)+b_5(DS)+e \]…………………(2)
In this model:
- GDP= Gross domestic product
- POPG= population growth
- AID= Foreign assistance or aid
- INF= Inflation
- FDI= foreign direct investment
- DS= Domestic saving
- e= error term

Gross Domestic Product
The gross domestic product (GDP) is a quantitative measure of the broader economic activity of the
country. GDP is the monetary cost of all goods and services produced within the borders of nation
services during a specified period.

AID
In this paper, aid is used as foreign assistance or help. Foreign assistance can be distinct as economic
aid, technological help, or military support from one country to another for the principle of release plus
rehabilitation, financial stabilization, or communal security.

Composition of Foreign Aid in Pakistan:
International assistance to this country generally circulated in two main categories, namely assistance to
the project and no aid project, while the aid is not to project is divided into; food assistance, non-food,
BOP. The figure provides the division of foreign help to Pakistan. The part of project support stay high
throughout the era 1952-1953 to 2002-2003 is 58%, whereas the allocation of food, non-food, and BOP
and support respectively are 10, 11, 18, and 3 percent.
Source: Pakistan Government, Statistically Supplement: Pakistan economic survey (2002-03)

Analysis and result
In this segment, the researcher demonstrates the statistical estimations and interpretations. In this section, the researcher displays a descriptive statistics table, correlation matrix, OLS estimates, ARDL short and long run estimation, and CUSUM stability analysis.

Table 2: Descriptive Statistics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>St. Dev.</th>
<th>Skewness</th>
<th>Kurtosis</th>
<th>J.B.</th>
<th>Prob</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>520.9812</td>
<td>307.2327</td>
<td>1.1891</td>
<td>3.3546</td>
<td>9.6372</td>
<td>0.0080</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POPG</td>
<td>2.6031</td>
<td>0.6253</td>
<td>-0.1979</td>
<td>1.5367</td>
<td>3.8294</td>
<td>0.1473</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AID</td>
<td>2.4457</td>
<td>1.4003</td>
<td>1.5402</td>
<td>5.8359</td>
<td>29.2208</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INF</td>
<td>9.2982</td>
<td>4.9403</td>
<td>1.4950</td>
<td>5.8640</td>
<td>28.573</td>
<td>0.0001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDI</td>
<td>8.68E+08</td>
<td>1.37E+09</td>
<td>2.4124</td>
<td>8.1320</td>
<td>82.6955</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DS</td>
<td>358649.2</td>
<td>459347.5</td>
<td>1.1399</td>
<td>2.8772</td>
<td>8.6890</td>
<td>0.0129</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Author’s calculation (Eviews)

The mean value shows the average value of all the variables. The standard deviation of GDP shows that its value is 307.23 units deviate from the actual value. In population growth its value is 0.62 units deviate from its actual value. The standard deviation of AID shows a 1.40 unit deviation from its actual value. Inflation shows a 4.94 unit deviation from an actual value. Foreign direct investment standard deviation shows the 1.37 units deviation and domestic savings are deviate at 459347.5 units from the actual value. The kurtosis values showed the variables are leptokurtic, mesokurtic, and platykurtic.

Foreign aids (AID), Inflation (INF), and foreign direct investment (FDI) have Leptokurtic distribution or at a high peaked. Gross domestic production (GDP) has a medium peaked or Messo-87Kurtic distribution. Other variables population growth (POPG) and Domestic savings (DS) have a low peaked or PlatyKurtic distribution.

The normality test of Jarque-Bera (JB) presents the joint result of skewness and kurtosis. The normality test of Jarque-Bera illustrates that the calculated ‘prob’ worth of Gross domestic production, foreign aid, inflation, foreign domestic investment, and domestic savings are zero. So it shows that they are not normally distributed. Population growth is normally distributed.

Table 3: Correlation Matrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>GDP</th>
<th>POPG</th>
<th>AID</th>
<th>INF</th>
<th>FDI</th>
<th>DS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POPG</td>
<td>-0.82624</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AID</td>
<td>-0.63168</td>
<td>0.54557</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INF</td>
<td>0.06108</td>
<td>-0.05697</td>
<td>0.24716</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
FDI  0.66556  -0.63307  -0.42520  0.19442  1
DS  0.51869  -0.720691  -0.43891  0.00516  0.76751  1

Source: Author’s calculation (Eviews)

This table shows the correlation between the variables. The correlation between GDP and POPG is -0.826 and it shows multicollinearity. The correlation between GDP and AID is -0.631 and it shows no multicollinearity. The correlation between GDP and INF is 0.061 and it shows no multicollinearity. The correlation between GDP and FDI is 0.66 and it also shows no multicollinearity. The correlation between GDP and DS is 0.51 and it shows no multicollinearity. The correlation between POPG and AID is 0.72 and it also shows no multicollinearity. The correlation between POPG and INF is -0.05 and there is also no multicollinearity. The correlation between POPG and FDI is -0.63 and it shows no multicollinearity. The correlation between AID and DS is -0.43 and there is also no multicollinearity. The correlation between INF and FDI is 0.19 and it also shows no multicollinearity. The correlation between INF and DS is 0.005 and there is no multicollinearity problem. The correlation between FDI and DS is 0.76 and it shows no multicollinearity problem.

### Table 4: OLS Estimates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Coefficient</th>
<th>St. Error</th>
<th>t-Statistic</th>
<th>Probability.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>1643.984</td>
<td>162.8024</td>
<td>10.09803</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POPG</td>
<td>-371.1809</td>
<td>55.65162</td>
<td>-6.669723</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AID</td>
<td>-50.92443</td>
<td>20.31020</td>
<td>-2.507333</td>
<td>0.0171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INF</td>
<td>-0.709922</td>
<td>5.015928</td>
<td>-0.141534</td>
<td>0.8883</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDI</td>
<td>1.03E-07</td>
<td>2.72E-08</td>
<td>3.797886</td>
<td>0.0006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DS</td>
<td>-0.000321</td>
<td>8.68E-05</td>
<td>-3.700256</td>
<td>0.0008</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

R-squared 0.826822  Mean dependent var 520.9812
Adjusted R-squared 0.801354  S.D. dependent var 307.2327
S.E. of regression 136.9327  Akaike info criterion 12.81434
Sum squared resid 637518.8  Schwarz criterion 13.06767
Log likelihood -250.2867  F-statistic 32.46588
Durbin-Watson stat 0.525850  Prob(F-statistic) 0.000000

Source: Author’s own calculation (Eviews)

This table illustrates the result of the specified model of regression analysis. It estimates the effect of foreign support for economic growth in Pakistan. 1 unit change in population growth results in 371.1 units decrease in GDP and it shows the negative relation between GDP and POPG. The t-statics show that population growth is statistically momentous at a 1% level. The change in foreign aid results in a 50.92 unit decrease in economic growth and there is a negative relationship between economic growth and foreign aid. AID is statistically significant at 5%. Inflation showed a negative relationship between economic growth and inflation. One unit change in the inflation result is 0.709 units fall in financial growth and insignificant. The change in foreign direct investment result is 1.03 units boost in economic expansion and is statistically significant at 1%. It shows the positive relationship between GDP and FDI. Domestic savings shows a negative relation and the change in domestic savings is 0.0032 units decrease the economic growth. It is statistically considerable at a 1% level of significance. The result of the independent variables showed strong multicollinearity among independent variables. The high value of the F-statistic showed that the independent variables contained in the model collectively negatively related to Foreign aid and economic growth. The value of R2=0.8268 also adjusted R2=0.8013 are high i.e. excess of 0.80 that indicates the variability in the economic growth due to the independent variable is 80%. Since population growth (POPG), foreign aid (AID), foreign direct investment (FDI), and domestic savings (DS) all have a negative significant impact at a 1% level of significance, Inflation (INF) has an insignificant impact on economic growth.
Table 5: ARDL Estimation Table (Short Run)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Coefficient</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>t-Statistic</th>
<th>Prob.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>D(FDI)</td>
<td>-0.000000</td>
<td>0.000000</td>
<td>-0.178325</td>
<td>0.8610</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(FDI(-1))</td>
<td>0.000000</td>
<td>0.000000</td>
<td>2.023131</td>
<td>0.0626</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(FDI(-2))</td>
<td>0.000000</td>
<td>0.000000</td>
<td>1.864095</td>
<td>0.0834</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(FDI(-3))</td>
<td>-0.000000</td>
<td>0.000000</td>
<td>-3.599781</td>
<td>0.0029</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(DS)</td>
<td>0.000064</td>
<td>0.000056</td>
<td>1.139451</td>
<td>0.2736</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(DS(-1))</td>
<td>0.000169</td>
<td>0.000062</td>
<td>2.717847</td>
<td>0.0167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(DS(-2))</td>
<td>-0.000077</td>
<td>0.000121</td>
<td>-0.637162</td>
<td>0.5343</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(DS(-3))</td>
<td>-0.000462</td>
<td>0.000161</td>
<td>-2.877850</td>
<td>0.0122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(AID)</td>
<td>-14.800562</td>
<td>5.610528</td>
<td>-2.637998</td>
<td>0.0195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(AID(-1))</td>
<td>-4.484703</td>
<td>4.754598</td>
<td>-0.943235</td>
<td>0.3616</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(AID(-2))</td>
<td>8.038633</td>
<td>3.813696</td>
<td>2.107832</td>
<td>0.0536</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(POPG)</td>
<td>-91.523280</td>
<td>252.57656</td>
<td>-0.362359</td>
<td>0.7225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(POPG(-1))</td>
<td>252.57656</td>
<td>803.384624</td>
<td>-2.1224</td>
<td>0.0037</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D(INF)</td>
<td>6.576490</td>
<td>1.798251</td>
<td>3.657159</td>
<td>0.0026</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CointEq(-1)</td>
<td>-0.818581</td>
<td>0.142061</td>
<td>-5.762169</td>
<td>0.0000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Cointeq = GDP - (0.0000*FDI + 0.0006*DS -26.9532*AID + 99.8885*POPG + 10.2365*INF -2.1224 )

Source: Author’s calculation (Eviews)

In this table, the short run relationship between examined variables is exhibited. In the short run, the variable shows significant and insignificant results. The short run table does not clearly show the correct results therefore, we will look at the long run table. Here, in the short run, the value of CoinEq. is statistically significant. Significant cointegration equation value shows that there is the long run relationship between the examined variables of the study.

Table 6: ARDL Estimation Table (Long Run)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Coefficient</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>t-Statistic</th>
<th>Prob.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FDI</td>
<td>0.102300</td>
<td>0.000000</td>
<td>4.067691</td>
<td>0.0012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DS</td>
<td>0.000553</td>
<td>0.000108</td>
<td>5.107127</td>
<td>0.0002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AID</td>
<td>-26.953157</td>
<td>8.420727</td>
<td>-3.200811</td>
<td>0.0064</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POPG</td>
<td>99.888525</td>
<td>40.855988</td>
<td>2.444893</td>
<td>0.0283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INF</td>
<td>-10.236517</td>
<td>2.944421</td>
<td>3.476581</td>
<td>0.0037</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>-2.122360</td>
<td>147.140655</td>
<td>-0.014424</td>
<td>0.9887</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Author’s own calculation (Eviews)

In this table, the short run relationship between examined variables is exhibited. This table illustrates the result of the specified model of regression analysis. It estimates the effect of foreign support for economic growth in Pakistan. 1 unit Change in population growth results is 99.888 units increase in GDP and it shows the positive relationships among GDP and POPG. The t-statics show that population growth is statistically momentous at a 5% level. The change in foreign aid results in a 26.953 unit decrease in economic growth and there is a negative relationship between economic growth and foreign aid. AID is statistically significant at 1%. Inflation showed a negative relationship between economic growth and inflation. One unit change in the inflation result is 10.236 units fall in financial growth and significant. The change in foreign direct investment result is 0.1030 units boost in economic expansion and is statistically significant at 1%. It shows the positive relationship between GDP and FDI. Domestic savings shows a positive relationship and the change in domestic savings is 0.0005 units decrease the economic growth. It is statistically considerable at a 1% level of significance. Overall, the results show that all variables of this are statistically significant. Moreover, except for foreign aid and inflation, all variables (population, FDI, and domestic savings) confirmed a positive relationship with GDP.

Table 7: ARDL Estimation Table (Bound Testing)

Null Hypothesis: No long-run relationships exist

| F-statistic | 9.837377 |

In this table, the short run relationship between examined variables is exhibited. It shows the positive relationships among GDP and POPG. The t-statics show that population growth is statistically momentous at a 5% level. The change in foreign aid results in a 26.953 unit decrease in economic growth and there is a negative relationship between economic growth and foreign aid. AID is statistically significant at 1%. Inflation showed a negative relationship between economic growth and inflation. One unit change in the inflation result is 10.236 units fall in financial growth and significant. The change in foreign direct investment result is 0.1030 units boost in economic expansion and is statistically significant at 1%. It shows the positive relationship between GDP and FDI. Domestic savings shows a positive relationship and the change in domestic savings is 0.0005 units decrease the economic growth. It is statistically considerable at a 1% level of significance. Overall, the results show that all variables of this are statistically significant. Moreover, except for foreign aid and inflation, all variables (population, FDI, and domestic savings) confirmed a positive relationship with GDP.
The F-statistics critical value is larger than lower (I0) and upper (I1) bound values. Therefore, we can say long run association exists between examined variables.

CUSUM graph and the CUSUM of the square graph show that examined model of this study is statistically significant.

**Summary and Conclusion**
The principal reason for this study is to determine the foreign aid effect on economic expansion in this country. This paper analyzed the relationship between GDP, foreign aid, population growth, inflation, FDI, and domestic savings. The basis for the empirical study of the belongings of foreign support began in 1960, with a general inspection that aid is useful for the growth and progress of countries in the developing world. But few economists dispute that international aid is not useful for all time to the developing countries, but it may be extra dependence on support, bribery, and financial mismanagement of the beneficiary countries cause. A large amount of empirical investigation about the relationship of aid/growth was carried out before; discover the positive relationships among them, at the same time few say this absolute relation depends on fine fiscal, monetary, and trade policies of nations. Also, a few
types of research suggest there is no association among them or else negative.

Contained by the miscellaneous record of anticipate and worries, the paper empirically analyzed the effect of international assistance on economic development in Pakistan’s economy during the era 1974-2013. Observed consequences point out an extremely small part of foreign support specified to the beneficial projects are successfully and professionally used, though the majority is wasted left. In this study, the analysis exhibits that aid is negatively connected with economic growth in Pakistan. In this paper, all the variables show a different relation with economic growth. Growth of population is also negatively related with the GDP when population increases growth of an economy automatically decreases due to the increase in population growth because increased population wants more sources and demand increases. The inflation rate is also negatively connected with economic growth when inflation increases in the economy then the GDP decreases because the increase in the prices decreases the growth of the economy. Inflation causes low savings and low investment. The foreign direct investment (FDI) shows an affirmative association with GDP when the foreign direct investment increases the new industries are developed then economic growth increases. Domestic saving displays a negative affiliation with GDP. When savings are higher than the investment then there will be a decrease in the growth of the economy. When savings are equal to the investment the economy goes into development. All these variables are connected with foreign aid and confirm the negative effect of foreign support on financial growth. Aid appears, replaces domestic savings, increased the debt burden. Several indicators of debt of Pakistan have augmented with time and nation cultivated in serious problem credit service as the macro-economic organization, overseas trade policies, and national savings are not planned plus manufactured properly.

Consequently, there is not only want of superior policies, other than also the accomplishment of policies, also toward proper monitoring of aid projects that used, and it is necessary to prevent the negligence and mismanagement of international resources. Therefore we say that aid can use to raise financial growth only with the presence of suitable pecuniary, financial, and stimulate trade policies.

Suggested policies:
One guiding principle based on practical data of the paper is to augment the impact of overseas aid in the growth and development of Pakistan.
1: accountability for improved use of foreign support in development division depends on together contributor and receiver nations. The policy of contributors is alarmed, they ought to the receiver country to plan and originate the policies and venture.
2: in the recipient countries they should provide more resources for the development sector. More funds should be provided for the improvement of the technology or to improve the quality of products and their industries.
3: also, they must develop an arrangement of liability and precision to lessen any possibility of fungibility assistance into other divisions of receiver countries.

References
Managing Entrepreneurship from an Islamic Perspective: Supporting Entrepreneurial Schemes through Islamic Work Ethics and Organizational Commitment

*Sadeeq Garba Abubakar*, Department of Business Administration and Management, Federal Polytechnic Bauchi, Bauchi State, Nigeria  
*Lauratu Musa Yahaya*, Department of Office Technology and Management, Federal Polytechnic Bauchi, Bauchi State, Nigeria  
*Yahaya Muhammad Adamu*, Department of Business Administration and Management, Federal Polytechnic Bauchi, Bauchi State, Nigeria  
*Ya’u Mudasiru Muhammed*, Department of Office Technology and Management, Federal Polytechnic Bauchi, Bauchi State, Nigeria

*Corresponding author’s email address: sadeeqgarbatee@yahoo.com*

**ARTICLE DETAILS**

**History**  
Revised format: May 2021  
Available Online: Jun 2021

**Keywords**  
Islam, Entrepreneur, Entrepreneurship in the Islamic Standpoint, Islamic work ethics, Organizational Commitment.

**JEL Classification**  
L26, L29

**ABSTRACT**

**Purpose:** The study attempts to determine the role of the Islamic faith in fashioning out a management model as an option to other modern management tools in the enhancement of entrepreneurship through Islamic work ethics and organisational commitment. Is a research process that attempts to link Islam with entrepreneurship and management using empirical studies on entrepreneurship from an Islamic perspective (EIP).

**Design/Methodology/Approach:** In this study, it was outlined how Islam shapes entrepreneurship, and indicated the possibility of considering Islam as entrepreneurial in its outlook. Islam allows and inspires business activity, and shapes the belief system that incorporates the scopes of belief in Allah, the Exalted, and in the Hereafter.

**Findings:** This study is adding to knowledge that faith-based management model could be relevant as an alternative to other non-faith-based management tools to support the growth of entrepreneurship through the practice of Islamic work ethics and organisational commitment.

**Implications/Originality/Value:** The research endeavour has major theoretical and applied effects and therefore suggested unique findings for the enhancement of entrepreneurship through Islamic work ethics and organisational commitment.

© 2021 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-4.0

Introduction
Management, Entrepreneurship and the role of religion
There has been a less or minimal contribution of research on the place of religion in the practice of entrepreneurship and generally in management.

Management is the harmonisation and supervision of tasks to accomplish a set objective. Administration undertakings include setting the of the corporate strategy and coordinating the labour of staff to realize the stated objectives through marshalling of the organisation’s resources.

The word ‘Entrepreneur’ refers to a person who assumes to run a business enterprise and who is ready to shoulder responsibility for success or failure. This person organizes, manages and assumes the risk of a business (Indeed.com, 2021). Accordingly, the entrepreneurs work hard and put their talent on the line while seeking the satisfaction that comes from being their own boss and being responsible for their own success. To sum up, then, an entrepreneur is an individual who risks financial, materials, and human resources in a new way to create a new business concept or opportunity within an existing firm.

According to (Dana, 2010, cited by Gümüsay, 2014), religion has been commonly mistreated with very little exemptions, citing the research undertakings on entrepreneurial activities from economic (Casson 2003), social (Shapero & Sokol 1982). Furthermore, and from the various viewpoints i.e. political (Schneider & Teske 1992), institutional (Battilana et al. 2009), and psychological (Begley & Boyd 1987).

Gumusay (2014) said that a religious viewpoint on entrepreneurship is different, as it normally includes unambiguous as well as comprehensive explanations, procedures, and a defined theological foundation. Moreover, it is an all-inclusive method to entrepreneurship investigation which includes belief that may hence supplement and improve the current entrepreneurship perception.

Habermas (2001) described this period as a post-secular environment. Contrasting the old-school that recognizes modernism as secular, religion as per Habermas remains a major player in the society. Berger (1999, p. 2), viewed “The world today, with some exceptions, is as furiously religious as it ever was, and in some places more so than ever. This gives the impression that some form of literature by historians and social scientists that lightly labelled “secularization theory” is fundamentally faulty.” Moreover, religion cannot be eliminated from our study by attempting to study a secular social science while the social was hardly secular.

General objective
To explore the Islamic perspective on management and to outlines some important management lessons from the teaching of Islam, with particular emphasis on how it could support entrepreneurial growth and development.

Specific objectives.
a) To examine the challenge posed by the contribution of contemporary management concepts that were based on certain premises of thought that is foreign to the Muslim state of mind.
b) To attempt an examination of the role of the Islamic faith in fashioning out a management model that would encompass the dimensions of belief in Allah, the Exalted, and in the Hereafter as an option to other modern management tools.
c) To look into the role of Islamic work ethics and organisational commitments in supporting the growth and development of entrepreneurship.

Statement of the Problems.
The fewer attempts to research what role religion plays in entrepreneurship in particular and generally in management stood as a stumbling block in exploiting the richness and vastness of the religion of Islam on the subject matter that seeks to safeguard publics from mischief, harm, and by serving their safeties through real use of resources provided by Allah, the Most High. The objective intended to be achieved has to be within the framework of justice, dignity, and benevolence, which invariably are provided for by Islam as a philosophy and a plan for people to live by. Hence this study seeks to unravel the missing links that kept the Islamic management perspective that far outperformed its contemporaries as an obscure management school.

**Research Question**

The study has the following research questions:

a) To what point does the application of entrepreneurship from an Islamic perspective (EIP) affect the performance of an entrepreneurial venture?

b) To what extent does the Islamic belief system that focuses in the triple articles of what Islam stands for, what is Iman, and what is Ihsan and how all these affect the conduct of the entrepreneur as the owner/manager of the business venture?

c) To what point do the adoption of Islamic work ethics and organisational commitment enhance the progression of entrepreneurship?

**Scope of the Study**

The study took a view of the contributions of the teachings of Islam as a plan with some distinctive managerial lessons (managerial concepts) from the way the Islamic teachings are structured and integrated. Furthermore, the study is limited to the management of entrepreneurship from an Islamic perspective.

**Review Of Literature**

**Conceptual Framework**

When a theory is unsuitable and/or deficient to explain a phenomenon and/or relationships amongst numerous "concepts", the investigator could possibly undertake to “synthesize” the current views in the drafted works regarding a known condition which comprises the theoretic and also from the experiential results. The combination could be referred to as a model or conceptual framework, which essentially represents an ‘integrated’ way of looking at the problem (Liehr & Smith, 1999).

**Entrepreneurship and the role of Islam**

Islam plays a major role in entrepreneurship and is grounded on the combination of written sources and relative background. The prime foundations are the Qur’an and Sunnah For adherents of the Islamic religion, the Quran is the Word of God as revealed in the 114 chapters, and with over 6,000 ayat. The Sunnah (Arabic: “habitual practice”) is recorded sayings of the Prophet Muhammad that remains the body of traditional social and legal custom and practice of the Islamic community, and also a major source of Shariah, or Islamic law.

The actions, sayings and silent or tacit approvals of the Prophet Muhammad (pbuh) are been referred to as the ‘Sunnah’ constitute a major platform and ancillary sources and practices which include the Ijma (Unanimity) and Qiyas (Analogy reasoning).

**Entrepreneurship from an Islamic Perspective (EIP)**

Gumusay (2014) averred that EIP is composed of Islam and entrepreneurship concepts. He recited that Islam in its least fundamental background is the affirmation of belief in the One true God and that Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him) is a servant and messenger of God. Furthermore, Al-Bukhari recited in one of the famous hadith that the prophet was asked by the archangel Gabriel about Islam, Iman, and Ihsan.
The prophet said that Islam is the testimony that there is no God but Allah, that Muhammad (pbuh) is His messengers, to perform prayers, to pay Zakat, to fast the month of Ramadan, and to undertake hajj (pilgrimage) to Makkah (Mecca). Iman is the belief in Allah, in His angels, His revealed books, His messengers, and in the last day and divine destiny (good or bad). To worship Allah as if you are seeing Him is the Islamic belief referred to as Ihsan. This belief and submission to the only One God (Allah) are part of the principles of EIP.

Value-based Islamic Management Model (IMM).
Conventional management has undeniably made valuable contributions to the efficiency and effectiveness of organisations the world over. The adoption of conventional management without necessarily asserting its validity in any environment and its consistency with values in that environment could be counterproductive. According to Jabnoun (2005), because conventional management ignores revelation (source of Islamic supreme knowledge), is, therefore, deprived of an inexhaustible source of knowledge. Furthermore, and looking at the conventional and the Islamic model approaches, the latter pays attention to differences in principles of thought, the cultural context of cases, empirical studies, and differences in values.

Figure 1
Islamic Management Model

Systems and Structures
Leadership
Strategic planning
Decision making
Human Resources Management
Tawhid & Freedom from Tyranny
(Adopted from Jabnoun, 2005)
The Islamic management model is value centred and it sprouts from tauhid (the inseparable oneness conception of monotheism in Islam) and freedom from tyranny. All the principles of strategic planning, decision-making, human resources management (HRM), leadership, and systems and structures are chosen based on the extent they serve Islamic values.

Unlike other models, this model is not divided into enablers and results. This is because Islam focuses on the process and not on results. Improving success does not indeed guarantee improving results. This model does also include a special section on customer satisfaction because it is a value centred model and the importance of all stakeholders and particularly customers is an integral part of Islamic values.
Measurement of the Value-based Islamic Management Model

According to Jabnoun (2005), the measurement of the Islamic management model is based on a joint system based on the experience of the initiator of the model. The Islamic values that are in the centre and the focus of the model were given a weight of 20%. Leadership was given a weight of 21%, Planning was allocated 18%, and decision making was allocated 8%, HRM was given 12%, while systems and structures were given a weight of 21%.

Moreover, an evaluation of the model measurement indicated that Islamic values had a weighted measurement below some of the other elements of the model. This can be attributed to the fact that all the management practices included in the other five dimensions of the model were selected because of their support of the values and their measurements do, therefore, reflect the measurement of the values. In addition, decision-making was only allocated 8% because of its strong relationship with planning which was allocated 18%. HRM was only given a weight of 12% because it is a separate function whose activities are not necessarily continuously involved in every aspect of the organisation like leadership and systems and structures.

Jabnoun (2005) said that the model was developed alongside values with each having its own benefits. Furthermore, the source of Islamic values as a key component of the model include:-

(1) Tauhid and freedom from tyranny that has the benefit of taking initiatives, solving problems on personal initiative guided by the fear of Allah, speaking up and correcting the wrong, and feeling secure in every sense including social and economic security. *Humbleness* (charity never decreases wealth and Allah only increases a forgiving person in honour and whosoever is humbled for Allah is elevated by Allah (Muslim). The benefits of humbleness include the willingness to improve, willingness to listen and be corrected, willingness to corporate, and giving due respect to others.

Other values include tawakkal (doing the best and trusting in Allah), which could benefit the believer in growing confidence, optimism, in resolve, and finally in diligence; abstaining from Haram (abstaining from evil and hurting ourselves, not hurting others, and gaining the ability to serve the long term interest of all stakeholders; flexibility: involved with the high degree of freedom, innovation, and avoiding conflicts that can be caused by lack of clarity of the prohibited acts; fairness; caring and sharing; cooperation; dignity and respect; trust; cost efficiency; time efficiency; quality/diligence; long-term orientation; unity of purpose; discipline; participative management; eagerness to learn and share knowledge.

(2) Planning is having a vision leading to the general vision of Islam which is to gain the mercy of Allah by securing you an eternal place in paradise. Having a mission consistent with the general mission of Ibadat.

(3) Decision making that encourages mutual consultation at every level and using consensus in the strategic decision.

(4) Leadership that involves championing Islamic values by acting as a role model and intervening when these values are endangered.

(5) Human resources management requires having a transparent recruitment procedure based on qualification and trustworthiness.

(6) Building a flexible systems and structure that recognizes the utility of leadership in terms of building teams, establishing a grievance procedure, and a reward system.
Islamic Work Ethics.
Three core essential lessons in the Islamic system include a solid acceptance of Monotheism which is the belief in One God. Is also the belief in the actuality of The only One God that is Almighty, Ever-present and All-knowing. The IWE could be seen as the set of ethical values which differentiate what is correct from what is incorrect in the Islamic perspective (Beekun, 2004).
According to Yaken (2006), as cited by Nasutiona and Rafikib (2019), ethics in Islam is not only a material of religious ethics in certain conducts but it covers all facets of life in the physical, divine, and expressive domain.

Table 1
Islamic work ethics and references in the Qur’an

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Al-Qur’an verses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Agreements and promises</td>
<td>Ar-Rad 13:25, Al-Qasas 28:28, Yunnas 10:71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consideration for others</td>
<td>An-Nisa’ 4:46, Al-Mumtahina 60:9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consultation</td>
<td>Ash-Shara 42:38, Taha 28:103, Al-Kahf 18:22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous improvement</td>
<td>Al-Araaf 7:42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cooperation</td>
<td>Al-Hujraat 59:99, Maryam 99:66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equality and unity</td>
<td>Al-Iasa 17:26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fairness in dealings</td>
<td>Al-An'am 6:52, Al-Mumtahina 60:8, An-Najm 53:32, Al-Maida 58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fairness in wages</td>
<td>Al-Imran 35:77, Saba’ 34:37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hard work</td>
<td>Al-Baqara 2:62, 82, Al-An'am 6:135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Helping others</td>
<td>As-Saff 61:14, An-Nahl 16:97, Yunnas 10:41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Honesty and justice</td>
<td>Al-Baqara 2:177, An-Zumar 30:2, 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Humble</td>
<td>Hud 11:23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patience</td>
<td>Hud 11:11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social order</td>
<td>Al-Imran 3:310, Al-Baqara 2:273</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Truth</td>
<td>Al-Anfal 8:27, Yunnas 10:65, An-Nur 24:8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Adopted from Nasutiona & Rafikib (2019)

The table 1 shows the elements of the IWE that gave a more empirical basis to support the availability of numerous injunctions by Allah (SWA) as referenced from the glorious Qur’an. According to Nasutiona and Rafikib (2019), if the teachings of the Qur’an as pencilled down in Table 1 above are adhered to, then fairness, goodness, kindness, reliance as components of IWE could bring incentive to the workers. As a result, there would be gratefulness on the part the same workers in the workplace, which consequently could create increased performance.

Table 2.
Values Components in Qur’an Work Ethics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Religious Values</th>
<th>Quality Values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ṭaqwā (piety)</td>
<td>Professionalism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gratitude</td>
<td>Trustworthiness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benevolence</td>
<td>Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Justice</td>
<td>Consultation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dignity</td>
<td>Keep promise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ḥiqān (diligence)</td>
<td>Punctuality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ṭawakkal (absolute reliance)</td>
<td>Transparency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ṭamarrūf (ahly munkar)</td>
<td>Personal Values</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Values Components in Qur’anic Work Ethics

- Truthfulness
- Moderation
- Honesty
- Patience
- Tolerance
- Humbleness
- Generosity
- Responsibility
Source: Adopted from Kamri, Ramlan & Ibrahim (2014)

The ethics from religious values, quality values, and personal values as contained in table 2 above are all components in the Qur’anic Work Ethics vis-à-vis Islamic Work Ethics. These values which are derived from the Qur’an no doubt gave some insight that are critical and stimulating positive work culture, and therefore, guaranteeing the achievement of the objectives sought by the enterprise. The resulting benefits of the values as depicted in Table 2 above could be briefly presented below:

- Boosting work performance
- Performance of work as an equivalent to worship
- Harnessing a relationship beneficial to all parties
- Creating and sustaining an environment of mutual confidence and trust
- Augmenting organizational obligation
- Supporting cooperation amongst work teams on the basis of collectiveness

From the explanation above, therefore, it can be established that Qur’anic work ethics offers the path way to every Muslim to do his assigned duty uprightly that are established on the basic direction of Islam as contained in the glorious Qur’an. Therefore, contrasting the western concept of work ethics that are premised on viewpoint of materialism, work ethics in Islam is beyond that idea but is rather a doctrine premised on the basis of an act of worship to the Almighty Allah.

Organizational Commitment.

Nelson & Quick (2012) characterises Organizational commitment as the strength of the individual’s identification with an organization; and also who is used to accepting any changes more readily than others, according to Yousef (2000). In the same vein, boosting motivation in the workplace demonstrates the achievement of organizational goals as per Pool and Pool (2007). Furthermore, it points to better-quality interactions and job presentation and inspires member of staff’s retention thus decreasing movement of staff out of jobs in the organisation.

Mowday, Porter, and Steers (1982) averred that the constituents of organizational commitment are associated narrowly with the IWEs principles, such a robust aspiration to sustain interactions in the association, a strong acceptance of the organization’s aims and ideals, and a readiness to exercise substantial effort on behalf of the organization. Kaptein (2008) emphasized that organizational effort could create a work setting that boosts work regulation, social practices, and proper behaviour in the enterprise. According to Milliman, Czaplewski, and Ferguson (2003) the more the workers acknowledged personal fulfilment at work, the more they feel devoted to the association.

Research Methodology

Ran and Leeuwen (2002) agreed that literature analyses could produce information from previously published research on the proposed study. Thus, this study had the opportunity of collating data from selected articles obtained from databases that reported in the research area of the study. The use of secondary was adopted in this study.

Ghauri and Gronhaug (2005) defined secondary data collected from previously stored data with the intention of mounting a research. Multiple sources of data such as journal articles, books, and other online resources exist. Furthermore, and according to Saunders, Lewis, and Thornhill (2009), secondary data embraces raw data which have been assembled for other usage. This suggests that the requisite material is obtainable and only necessities the researcher to extract.

Analysis/Discussion of Results

Gumusay (2014) mentioned that management research had integrated a multiplicity of disciplines into its research agenda such as Psychology (Weick, 1979), Ecology (Hannan & Freeman 1977), and

Gumusay (2014) averred that given Muslim population worldwide one is could be agitated to ask the question on the intellectual neglect of dealings with Islam cum management. It is therefore, imperative to cause for the upturn of this situation. There is no doubt religion has a substantial effect on modern societies, and it is instructive for management research to engage more aggressively within the realm of the relations existing between religion and management (King 2008). On the same basis, Tracey (2012) and Chan-Serafin et al. (2013) opined that there should also be more engagement between religion and the organisation.

The micro-, meso-, and macro-levels are affected by the EIP through the determination of the people/individual, the business units, and the diversity in such association/organizations. This intricacy necessitates the integration of the micro-level, meso-level, and macro-level into all-inclusive models which could possibly produce explanatory disclosures while not neglecting the value of thriftiness. The entrepreneurial attractiveness in Islam could be appraised and the exploratory results might stand in as the background knowledge in entrepreneurship as a business process. The Arabic word ‘Ijtihad’ which means independent reasoning permits in-depth thinking that allows for putting the different issues into their contextual frameworks.

Muslim intellectuals also acknowledged the importance of Islamic work ethics in the present time. It has developed into a central fragment of Islamic philosophy, which could indeed be beneficial to every generation of Muslim faithful. Consequently, it is imperative for the entrepreneur to generate a situation that will create the platform for organizational obligation to strive among employees in order to serve the organisation better through the acceptance and implementation of IWEs constituents. The researchers settled that superiority conclusions will be provided if the workforces are appreciated and are comfortable. Therefore, job contentment could possibly do with the happiness or unhappiness of workers in the work environments.

**Summary, Recommendations, Conclusion**

**Summary**

Kayed and Hassan (2010) asserted that religion of Islam could be considered an “entrepreneurial religion” because it empowers and inspires entrepreneurial activity, which incorporates the recreation of opportunity, instituting innovation, and the taking of risks. In the Quran and Sunnah, issues relating to the pursuit of worldly pursuit were highlighted. For instance, it was stated that “But seek the abode of the Hereafter in that which Allah has given you, and forget not your portion of the world, and be kind even as Allah has been kind to you, and seek not corruption in the earth; for Allah loves not corrupters.” (Qur’an 77: 28).

The Prophet of Islam, Muhammad (SAW), said that “Work for your worldly life as if you were going to live forever, but work for the life to come as if you were going to die tomorrow.” Although scholars classified it a weak hadith, it has however provided the knowledge of the divine guidance offered by Islamic religion to the Muslim personality.

**Recommendation**

After a thorough study, the following are the views put forward:-

a) The research proposed that in terms of the management of entrepreneurial ventures, the provisions of Qur’an and the Sunnah should be perused and applied to suit the modern business models that are halal-based in all its facets.

b) There is the necessity to incorporate the advances on scholarly research findings on Islamic entrepreneurship in our educational curriculum.

c) To avoid the application of secular theories which are inconsistent with Islamic religious belief.
d) Islam supports work ethics, and therefore, is positioned as the central pillar of the faith and is all about ‘work and worship’. Consequently, priority should be given to teaching the principles of work ethics in Islam at seminars/workshops for both up-coming and existing entrepreneurs.

**Conclusion**

The adoption of conventional management without necessarily asserting its validity in any environment and its consistency with values in that environment could be counterproductive. According to Jabnoun (2005), because conventional management ignores revelation (source of Islamic supreme knowledge), is, therefore, deprived of an inexhaustible source of knowledge.

Furthermore, and looking at the conventional and the Islamic model approaches, the latter pays attention to differences in principles of thought, the cultural context of cases, empirical studies, and differences in values. And this exemplified one of the approaches of exploiting the benefits of Islamic work ethics and organisational commitment.

In today’s world, Islamic ethical values that encourage hard work and commitment to work could guarantee the reinforcement of businesses and the overall economic advancement of a Country. The Islamic values are necessary to support the quest for self-determination, sincere resourcefulness, and autonomy which are all desired as the basic requirements for any successful would-be and existing entrepreneur.

**References**


Promoting Sustainable Tourism in Maldives through Social Media: A Review

Aminath Raushan Imad, Faculty of Business, Accountancy, Communication and Hospitality Management, SEGi University, Selangor, Malaysia
*Tak-Jie Chan, Faculty of Business, Accountancy, Communication and Hospitality Management, SEGi University, Selangor, Malaysia

*Corresponding author’s email address: chantakjie@segi.edu.my

ARTICLE DETAILS
History
Revised format: May 2021
Available Online: Jun 2021

Keywords
Sustainable Tourism, Social Media, Green Marketing Practices, Sustainable Development Goals, Maldives

JEL Classification
L80, L83

ABSTRACT

Purpose: The archipelago of the Maldives is the main source of attraction to many tourists worldwide, making tourism the largest sector of the country’s economy. However, global challenges have become increasingly visible and remote countries like Maldives is facing extreme challenges economically as well as environmentally. With the advancement of the technology, social media marketing being the worthwhile strategic positioning tool. This review article aimed to discuss global tourism industry, the practice of sustainable tourism in the Maldives, followed by the literature incorporates social media marketing in the context of tourism promotion in Maldives.

Design/Methodology/Approach: The study is a review paper on sustainable tourism in Maldives context, by focusing on global tourism industry, the practice of sustainable tourism in the Maldives, followed by social media marketing in the context of tourism promotion.

Findings: The review of the sustainable tourism literature found that Maldives as an island are practicing and incorporated green and sustainable practices.

Implications/ Originality/Value: The study provides a prodigious scope for marketing practitioners of tourism industry and provides insights on building a successful social media marketing strategy that may lead to enhance the green image and tourist’s intention to revisit.

Introduction
Tourism is undoubtedly one of the major industries in the world considering its immense contribution to job creation and economic development (Niñerola, Sánchez-Rebull, & Hernández-Lara 2019). Tourism has become a key driver for socio-economic progress (World Tourism Organization, 2018). The Maldives is recognized for its crystal-clear water and soft sandy beaches which made the country one of the world’s famous tourist destinations. Since the beginning of tourism in Maldives in the year 1972,
with the opening of the first tourist resort, the industry has transformed and developed to be a globally recognized and world-famous travel destination for leisure. The country that located in the Indian Ocean now has 147 resorts with a total of more than 34076 beds in operation attracting tourists over a million each year (Marcus, 2021). Despite the challenges faced due to Covid-19 pandemic, a total of 555,494 tourists were welcomed to the country in the year 2020. In January 2021, arrival numbers stood at 92,103 and it increased to 99,397 by 3rd February 2021 with a daily average of 2,923 tourists (United Nations World Tourism Organization, 2021).

Based on the concept of one-island-one resort, resorts in the Maldives are an establishment on a single low-lying island surrounded by the sea (Zubair & Bouchon, 2014). Over the past decade, global warming and localized human-made activities have caused an adverse effect on the environment. Hence, they are at high risk and easily affected by climate change, global warming, and the accompanying issues such as rising of sea level (Fardeen, 2019). The effects of climate change are putting the world’s most visited destinations at risk. By 2050 climate change could directly lead to elimination of 90% of coral reefs (Layne, 2017). While the tourism industry will never be fully sustainable, there are steps that need to be taken to protect the planet in the context of tourism. Therefore, it is imperative for the country to focus on sustainability and environment friendliness.

Over the past decade, with the development of information and communication technology, the growing role of social media in tourism promotion is undeniable. With this development it has completely changed the relationship of tourist’s behavioural intention towards the destination. It has proven that leveraging off social media to market the sustainable tourist destination is an excellent strategy especially when the destination is promoted with green. In this light, in order to understand the sustainable tourism industry, this review article focuses on the following: global tourism industry, the state of tourism in the Maldives and the practice of sustainable tourism in the Maldives. Following to this, the literature incorporates social media marketing in the context of tourism promotion will also be discussed.

**Literature Review**

**Global Tourism Industry**

Global tourism evolved from being an exclusive activity for the elites to becoming public tourism in the twentieth century (Triarchi & Karamanis, 2017). In comparison, 1970 recorded an estimated 165.8 million international tourists, up from 69.3 million that were recorded in 1960 (Scott & Gössling, 2015). According to the UNWTO (2021) the industry experienced sustained growth as international arrivals increased by 7% in 2017 and by 6% in 2018. In 2019, all the regions experienced an increase in tourist arrivals with the Middle East increasing by 8% whilst both Asia and the Pacific and Europe increased by 4%.

However, due to the advent of the Covid-19 pandemic, the tourism industry was hit the hardest as year 2020 saw international arrivals dropping by 74% (UNWTO, 2021). In addition, an estimated USD 1.3 trillion in export revenues was lost during this period and between 100 and 120 million direct tourism jobs were put at risk. In particular, Asia-Pacific region saw an 84% decrease in international arrivals, the Middle East and Africa experienced a 75%, the Americas 69% and Europe 70% (UNWTO, 2021). The year of 2021 seems to be following the same trajectory as most sectors remain shut since most countries and regions across the globe are still battling the Covid-19 pandemic in check.

**Tourism in the Maldives Context**

International tourism in the Maldives is synonymous with resort-island as resorts are based on the concept of one-island-one resort. Since the late 1970s, tourism became the main economic sector of the country as well an important source of foreign exchange (Sathiendrakumar, Jaffur, & Seetanah, 2021). Evolution in tourism sector in the Maldives has its impacts on the population and Gross Domestic Products (GDP). Since the beginning of the establishment of the first resort, the governments turned potential islands into high class resorts only focuses on 5-star quality services that attracted tourists
across the globe (Giampiccoli, Muhsin & Mtapuri, 2020). Subsequently, tourism has improved its economy since the discovery of its potential. In the process, the sector has become an indispensable and dominant driver of economic growth in the Maldives (Ahmed, 2018).

As all resort destinations are placed in their natural environment (Kim & Thapa, 2018), the tourists seek to get the most out of it while visiting the Maldives resorts. The main activities they take part mostly are swimming, snorkelling, and diving, as the main attractions in the country’s tourism sector are beach, sea, underwater life, sun, lagoon, islands, and culture (Sae-Tang & Yamchuti, 2020). The tourist arrival rate in the year 2019 was 1.9 million and by 2023, the government aims to achieve 2.3 million tourists to visit the Maldives. Hence, with that set target, the country expanded tourism sector for low-budget tourists by developing guesthouses in local islands (Dam, Sabacan, Sim, & Thirumaran, 2021). However, the tourism sector of the Maldives has noted for some constraints with the concern of high tourist arrivals leading to environmental problems. Moreover, the country is currently facing challenges with regard to the global Covid-19 pandemic and is uncertain with the maintenance of tourist’s arrival in the following years.

Tourism and the Maldives’ Economy During the Covid-19 Pandemic

Like at the global level, economies of countries that depend on tourism were heavily affected by Covid-19 pandemic as air travel was banned. This hugely decreased the number of international tourist arrivals. Maldives also closed its borders for the purposes of self-protection, thus, the country was also victim of this reality. According to the World Bank (2020), the Maldives was affected by the Covid-19 global pandemic more than any other country in the South Asia region.

The Maldives majorly relies on foreign currency inflows from tourism coupled with foreign investments and loans to finance its huge account deficit. For instance, in the first and second quarters of 2020, GDP contracted by 5.0% and 51.6% respectively due to Covid-19 as almost all sectors (and particularly the tourism industry) was at halt. The tourism industry experienced a 14.2% decrease in the first half of 2020 whilst transportation and communication decreased by 3.8% and construction by 1.8% (Asian Development Bank, 2020). Figure 1 below clearly explains the GDP dynamics of the Maldives during the Covid-19 pandemic.

Figure 1: Supply-side Contributions to Growth (Q1 2019–Q2 2020)
Source: Asian Development Bank (2020)

The Practice of Sustainable Tourism

Sustainable tourism is defined as the responsible type of tourism which generates the administration of natural resources economic and social needs while following the fundamental procedures such as environmental, biological, cultural, and supportive networks (World Tourism Organization, 2017). The
term sustainability is still being broadly examined and gradually tourism industry is adopting the sustainable factor with the arising concerns for the environment. The 21st century has made clear on some of the severe environmental issues, hence, most businesses including tourism sector had to make environment a priority. Moreover, the close relationship between the environment and sustainability became vital especially remote island like the Maldives.

As the issues related to sustainable development were gathering momentum, they became interwoven with tourism issues that potentially cause environmental and cultural harm, such as, anthropogenic overload of tourist facilities, pollution of ecosystems, and the destruction of national identity and culture. Thus, there was a call in the tourism industry to move towards tourism practices that are not destructive to the natural and social environment. However, today, the tourism sector accounts for about 5% of global carbon dioxide (CO2) emissions, including 40% for air transport and 20% for accommodation facilities. Tourism industry is responsible for 4.6% of radiation pressure, which causes climate changes (Stukalo, Krasnikova, Krupskyi, & Redko, 2018). The challenges posed by tourism on the environment do not seem to be ending soon, therefore, there is a need to understand sustainable tourism in a more holistic perspective.

The United Nations sponsored a programme spearheaded by the World Commission on Environment and Development (WCED) and the result was the need to focus on the concept of sustainable development because there was a realization in the connection between the natural environment and socio-economic activities. According to the EU Guidebook on Sustainable Tourism for Development, it defines sustainable tourism as “tourism that takes full account of its current and future economic, social and environmental impacts, addressing the needs of visitors, the industry, the environment and host communities” (WTO, n.d.). The ultimate aim is to make sure that the needs of future generations are not compromised in an attempt to satisfy the needs of the present.

While the concept of sustainable tourism has been embraced by many scholars and policymakers as a noble cause, there are concerns when it comes to implementation. A concern raised by Aydin and Alvarez (2020), observes sustainable tourism programmes on supply side (of demand and supply) and neglect the viewpoints of the tourists - “obtaining the support of the tourists is essential for the success of sustainability initiatives”. However, a noteworthy issue related to sustainable tourism that emerged from the literature is that no one-size-fits-all solutions to measure its. Following that reason, it is of crucial to devote a sub-section on sustainable tourism specifically related to the Maldives to reveal the unique characteristics it possesses.

The Maldives Case

As a small island state, the Maldives is especially vulnerable to climate change impacts. These impacts include: (1) sea-level rise causing permanent inundation and flooding, sea-level surges, and erosion; (2) increases in sea and surface temperatures causing changes to island and marine ecosystems; (3) increases in the intensity of extreme weather events, such as severe storms and cyclones causing high waves, winds, and sea surges; (4) changes in precipitation, which can exacerbate the effects of sea-level rise; and (5) increases in sea temperature causing damage to coral reefs and other aquatic life (Stukalo et al., 2018).

The observations made above demonstrate the magnitude of the sustainability problem in the Maldives. For such reasons the government of Maldives challenged other members of the United Nations to take serious action against climate change lest they become “environmental refugees” in the future (Collado, 2016). This means that no matter how much they can do to make their tourism sustainable, they still require other countries to play their part so that they are not put in jeopardy. The literature on the Maldives’ sustainable tourism seems to underemphasize the importance of understanding the tourists’ demand. As for the issue of social media in relation to sustainability, there seems to be a gap that can be explore because it is not dealt much in detail in the existing literature.
Social Media Marketing
The social media serves as a platform where individuals come together and share mutual thoughts, comments, and opinions with no definite restrictions on the time or location. As underlined by Kietzman, Hermkens, McCarthy and Silvestre (2011), the social platforms can be identified through, personal interests, friendship, or professional connection. Social media has transformed the marketing strategies and continues to popularize among the businesses. The latest global social media statistics shows that 4.20 billion people are active social media users. This figure takes up 53.6% of the global population (Chaffey, 2021). It is also noted that each user spends approximately 2 hours daily and owns 5.5 social media accounts each. Under the most used platforms of social media today are Facebook (2,740 million users), YouTube (2,291 million users), Instagram (1,221), Twitter (353), TikTok (689 million users), and many more (Perrin & Anderson, 2019).

The scale of new technologies over the past years has transformed the way in managing the social media marketing. According to Li, Larimo and Leonidou (2020) social media marketing is noted as the most worthwhile strategic positioning tool which companies utilize in their marketing strategy to expand their horizons in reaching to a vast audience. The role of social media should not be underestimated as social media platforms are utilized by a multitude of users, especially in an era that has advanced technology. Moreover, with the Covid-19 pandemic, the world was highly depend on the online sources and social media, which reflected the importance of the online web. The central role played by the online platforms, highlights the dominance factor.

The Role of Social Media in Sustainable Tourism Promotion
With the advent of social media, the tourism industry entered the e-Marketing sphere where tourism promoters are utilizing the attributes and functions of online mediums to get closer to the audience. The role of social media marketing in the tourism industry has contributed tourists to make travel decisions over the past years (Stylos, 2020) and continues to create significant values in their travel experiences (Buhalis, 2019; Zhang, 2020). As highlighted by DeMers (2014), social media contributes to a wide range of courses including content postings, grasping demand for products and services through specific marketing tactics, and to spread awareness to stakeholders about sustainability practices and initiatives by the company. Moreover, with revolution of social media marketing, it has become a vital tool for tourism industry to succeed in their visions and achieve their objectives. Part of this justifies the unique and persuasive power social media in attracting tourists to the destinations and further bringing the holistic change into the scope of sustainable tourism.

The rapid adoption of social media in sustainable destination promotion often creates virtual communities that are built on shared experiences, and therefore, it is important to maintain the trust among these communities for building new social interactions (Gulati, 2021). According to Luck and Gianti (2013), social media has been studied as an effective interactive channel that contributes to the promotion of sustainable consumption practices. As Hardeman, Font and Nawijn (2017), urged that information shared on social media tend to be more pursuasive than the traditional way of marketing, thus, having a favorable impact on tourist’s behavioural intentions into choosing sustainable activities. A sustainable tourist can be specified to those who plan to travel for business or leisure, but also have responsible concerns for the society and its environment (Gulati, 2021). As stated, earlier, with the growing awareness of environmentalism, more consumers are choosing products and services that have minimum effect on the environment. In the context of tourism, social media is used most prominently to make certain decisions, social sharing, information exchange, publicity or promotion and trip planning (Gössling & Stavrinidi, 2016). Hence, social media has been widely acknowledged in gaining public support for sustainability initiatives as it plays a vital role in spreading awareness and information at a quick pace. With the driving force of social media, hence, it opens opportunities for extensive sustainable destination promotion and engaging tourists toward the sustainable choices.
The Maldives Case

The introduction of new features and influence of social media attributes has connected social, economic, and environmental spheres of tourism sector as it offers various alternative frameworks that facilitates effective communication. While the concept of social media marketing has been used by many marketing experts at an innovative level, there are yet many features and dimensions not discovered and utilized in the implementation process. Especially, when the concept of sustainable tourism and its promotion is still in a very early stage within the Maldives destination promoters (Waseema, 2017). Although, social media networks are taking up the popularity in the tourism sector, it varies with different demographics of audience (Chaffey, 2021). Ecological advancement, equity, futurity, and holism are some of the concept ideas behind the sustainable factor (Gulati, 2021). Hence, it is important to explore the degree of social media marketing practices implemented in the Maldives.

As discussed earlier, sustainability can be a competitive advantage in the marketing segment. However, most of the literature has focused on physical factors rather than looking from a marketing perspective for promoting sustainable tourism in the Maldives. For instance, the study conducted by Cowburn, Moritz, Birrell, Grimsditch, & Abdulla (2018) assessed the environmental impacts of resort tourism on coral reefs in the Maldives. Moreover, exploratory case studies have been done in relation to sustainable tourism and environment identifying the existing causes concerning the natural environment (Eiseman, 2018; Sae-Tang & Yamchuti, 2020). However, these studies does not highlight the promotion of green image nor the importance of social media marketing. Promoting green image from the marketing perspective has limited attention in previous studies as the main focus in rising environmental issues are mostly through exploitation of resources and environmental related activities. However, the previous literature has suggested to find ways to preserve the green image and maintain the sustainable factor especially the countries that rely on tourism (Eiseman, 2018).

Conclusion

As a conclusion, tourism is one of the sectors that falls under the danger zone with its substantial risks related to environmental issues. Hence, sustainable tourism has been an integral part of the development of the Maldives. However, main bodies promoting sustainable tourism are challenged by the limitations in knowledge for social media marketing tactics, which effects the green image of the industry and tourist’s arrival rate. Emerging online media communications and social media attributes offer extensive possibilities for bringing up the green image and managing tourist relations in a way that can influence tourist’s to repeat their intentions on visiting the resorts that practice sustainable tourism. Moreover, with this contribution to the greater course, the country can benefits both environmentally as well as economically.

References


Fardeen, M. (2019). *Climate change and it’s effects on the Maldives*. https://storymaps.arcgis.com/stories/a8f8b5b0477f458ea70826756b46a275


Education for Sustainable Development (ESD): Awareness of the Pakistani Prospective Teachers

*Tahira Batool, Assistant Professor, Lahore College for Women University, Lahore, Pakistan
Umm e Habiba, Punjab School Education Department, Lahore, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email address: batooltahra@gmail.com

Purpose: The major purpose of current study was to explore the awareness regarding education for sustainable development (ESD) of the Pakistani prospective teachers. It is necessary to explore the understanding and awareness of prospective teachers for further implementation process of ESD in the Pakistan general education to achieve UNESCO’s aim of Education for Sustainable Development (2005-2014). As future generation can shape society in a sustainable manner so it is necessary to investigate the comprehension of prospective teachers regarding ESD.

Methodology: Population of the study was all prospective teachers. Total 115 prospective teachers of a public university were taken as a sample of this study in Lahore. It was cross sectional study and quantitative in nature. The data was collected through standardized instrument questionnaire which was consisted on 19 statements (International Institute for Sustainable Development, 2009).

Findings: Current study found that students have already much awareness about ESD before teaching the course of ESD thus there is not major difference of awareness about ESD among students before teaching and after teaching the ESD course.

Implications: It is recommended that as students already have awareness about ESD without teaching ESD as a course thus awareness might be given through multimedia, advertisements in T.V, radio, banners and other colorful sources from early education. So such subjects should be included in elementary education.

© 2021 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-4.0


Introduction

The theoretical framework for sustainable development progressed between 1972 and 1992 through a series of international conferences and initiatives. The first major world gathering to discuss sustainability internationally in 1972, named the UN Conference on the Human Environment was held in Stockholm. In addition, a report published by the World Commission on Environment and
Development (WCED) in 1987 was promoted the word sustainable development. Moreover, the United Nations (UN) General Assembly accepted that report and gave the term political salience. Next, leaders start out the principles of sustainable development at the UN Conference on Environment and Development (UNCED) in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil, also referred to as the Rio Summit and the Earth Summit in 1992 (Murphy & Drexhage, 2010). In addition, Sustainable development is a challenging and complex concept to delineate. Definition of sustainable development is credited to the Brundtland Commission: “Sustainable development is development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs” (World Commission on Environment and Development, 1987, p 43 as cited in Murphy & Drexhage, 2010). In addition, this definition is stating about saving present resources for fulfilling the future needs of our coming generations by engaging all the countries. (Johnston, 2007; Leicht, Bormann & Haan, 2010). Moreover, secretary general of the United Nations Kofi Annan said that as concept of ESD is looking abstract and it is challenging task to turn it into reality in future. (UNESCO, 2005).

A study in Jorden stated about sustainable development and sustainability that it is discussing in educational field rapidly, especially in teacher education programs (Alkhawaldeh, 2017). In addition, teachers have not only the responsibility of teaching but they also have new roles and responsibilities regarding awareness about ESD in society (Kabaday, 2016; Niemi, 2015). Similarly, Mohammadi and Moradi (2017), highlighted that in order to implement the sustainable education, there is need for continuous professional development for teachers’ education. Next, there are three pillars of sustainable development according to the Rio Earth Summit. Those pillars are environment, society, and economy. These three areas are knotted (McKeon, 2002). All three pillars are important in creating and sustaining stability and balance (Johnston, 2007). In addition, to live “sustainably” mean to discover those developing ways which will bring innovation and variation at all levels within society (Cleveland & Kubiszewski, 2007). Universities have played an important role in many regional, social, political, and economic issues, but mobilizing the intellectual and educational community to support the goals of environmentally sustainable development on a regional as well as on a global basis has acquired special significance in recent years (Lo & Park, 1997). In order to developing and implementing ESD principles it is essential for engineers to have a practical understanding about it into their everyday living. Furthermore, it also can become helpful to make engineering decisions for sustainable development (Wanous & Davis, 2007; Devis, 2006).

Lukman, Irfan and Kwami’s (2013) study revealed that the lecturers agreed on the sustainability status of university Kebangsaan in Malaysia (UKM) academic programs, but differ significantly in their means in their departments. As higher educational institutions are right source to support transformation through new ideas, activities and researches. Thus, Aksari, Saadatian and Dola (2009) explored that majority of campus students have not full understanding about the meaning of ESD but they encourage and support to develop sustainable environment in campus (Yusof, Aziz and Sheikh, (2012) investigated awareness and thinking of students of engineering about ESD in a university of Malaysia. As a result, most of students were not produce a single definition on ESD. Although, most of them do know about recycling, climate change etc. because these activities are part of their daily life. Studies of Todorescu, Luminita, Greculescu and Lampa, (2013), thrown light on ESD that it can bring change in the mindset of community, and also improve the quality of life. Hence, in order to cope up with the future difficulties, ESD helps us to use innovative ways, approaches and practices that are useful for us. Educational process is powerful source to train even the feeblest students.

While Sirilanka, Nithlavarnan, Sinnathamby and Gunawardana, (2010) highlighted that science is the most relevant subject to impart knowledge, attitudes, skills and values regarding ESD to the students at secondary level. Their findings showed a majority of student teachers have poor understanding about the concept of Sustainable Development. In addition, Ryan, (2010) pointed out that students have slight awareness of current problems and issues of global system. On the other hand, in Newzealand, a most of the pupils thought positivly about ESD (Kelly & Sharma, 2008). Similarly, Manni, Ottander, Sporre and
Parchmann, (2013) reported in Swedish exploratory study that students’ perceptions of the learning experiences about ESD which in which relationships was found. Gupta, (2010) revealed significant difference in the teachers’ perception, understanding, attitude, approach and style regarding ESD. Furthermore, these differences are occurring on the basis of the grade and the subject taught by teachers, years of teaching experience, gender, and the nature of the institute in which they teach. On the other hand, it was found that PBL model inspires and stimulate students to contextualize engineering complications and resolutions and further apply knowledge about sustainability in real life situations (Holgaard & Guerra, 2013).

In the study of Pavlova, (2010), argued that members were known about ESD and about all its aspects and features as well. In addition, participants had awareness regarding ESD and they also had positive perceptions of ESD for promoting sustainable environment (Darkwa, Felix, & Asuamah, 2012). In similar way, study thrown light on the development of a positive trend in terms of thinking and the behavior towards environment conservation when comparing the longitudinal surveys of 2007 and 2010 (Shamaa, Nel & Plessis, 2012). Petcoz and Reid (2006) pointed out the need to make pupils ready for their specialized roles in Australia. In order to fulfill this purpose, include all parts of ESD in curriculum of all classes. Creative pedagogy will be required to bring real change in thinking of people.

School textbooks for inculcating the concept of SD are main source of knowledge for prospective teachers. Next, this study revealed that perception of future teachers was very high about the concept of SD (Ambusaidi & Washahi, 2016; Erawan, 2015). Furthermore, Maidou, plakitsi, and Polatoglou, (2019); Soysal, (2016) revealed in their research findings that most newly trained teachers considered only environment is an aspect of ESD but they did not have knowledge about societal and financial matters which are also the parts of ESD. Next, most of the students never learn ESD during their whole period of education. Their study shed light on opinion of newly trained teachers about ESD, they all thought that it is essential issue so it should be included in curriculum in order to teach the students about ESD in Greece. Moreover, the influence of ESD perceptions on student’s lifestyle was low because low correlation was found between ESD perceptions and attitudes towards the lifestyles of various grades students in Canada (Milama, Ali, & Rusman, 2018). Likewise, Burmeister, and Eilks, (2013) revealed positive attitudes of participants towards ESD in subject of chemistry. However, most of the participants had vague knowledge about ESD theoretically. But, few participants had very clear concepts about ESD theory in Germany.

In consistent with previous studies, Karpudewan, Ismail, and Mohamed, (2011) also concluded in their study that in order to inculcate the ESD theory and skills and environmental values among community then there is need to use educational means. Next, they observed environmental values and attitudes among teachers and students. In addition, a Nigerian study investigated the need and importance of Education for sustainable development goals. Furthermore, it was recommended to improve teacher education in order to achieve goals of ESD (Nnokami & Sule, 2017). In the same way, it was recommended by Taj and Ahmad (2018) that ESD should introduced in Pakistani teacher training programs and courses and make it part of its curriculum, and implemented it. Because newly trained teachers aware about it then they would be able to inculcate ESD concept and skills among their students and society. In brief, Holfelder, (2019) shed light through his observation that only the education is the way to raise awareness among community and society about ESD. Because, education is also a source of training.

**Agenda Set by Rio (Chapter 36)**


- Make it possible for society to be aware about environmental and other aspects of ESD as soon as possible.
- Inculcate all aspects of ESD into the curriculum into all level of education.
• Establish the national advisory environmental education coordinating bodies.
• Provide assistance to schools for design work plans to enrich environmental activity
• Support teachers training included pre-service and in-service training
• Encourage to use the proven and innovative teaching methods because it is necessary for teaching methods

Results of their study highlighted that first of all the scholars who are conducting ESD researches start to observe the current environment and situation of the society. Because this observation would be helpful for them to develop societal future life models according to ESD. Furthermore, they would be able to calculate and measure the change of community awareness and action in order to develop more sustainable lifestyles. Afterwards, these changes (focusing on sustainable development) can be inculcated at all level of education such as (Pipere, Reunamo & Jones, 2010).

It is acknowledged after research by Aksari, Saadatian and Dola (2009) that in order to produces the institution and campus on the basis of successful sustainability then there is requirement to create public awareness and understanding of sustainable development and empowerment. Previous studies are on the perceptions of students and few are on teacher’s perception but not found single study on prospective teacher’s perception and aware regarding ESD. Implementation of sustainable development can be possible by developing the ideas and thinking of the prospective teachers in Pakistan. As teacher is change agent hence there is need to impart knowledge and give awareness to the prospective teachers before going into field for teaching. In conclusion, a Pakistani study stressed upon the need to include education for sustainable development as a subject in teacher education training programs by making it part if its curriculum (Kulsoom, Qureshi, & Khanum, 2019). Therefore, proper planning to make ESD a part of curriculum of teacher education program is need of current circumstances (Jumani & Abbasi, 2015)

Objectives of the Study
Objective of the study is follows:
• To investigate the current ESD awareness of prospective teachers of semester two and semester four at university level.

Research hypothesis
To attain the above mentioned objective the following research hypothesis are formulated as under:
• There is no significance difference between prospective teachers’ awareness of semester two and semester four regarding ESD awareness

Significance of the Study
Prospective teachers are the leading actors in the process of developing ESD and they can play a vigorous role for educational change. The purpose of conducting this study is to know awareness of prospective teachers regarding ESD. It is necessary to explore the understanding and awareness of prospective teachers for further implementation process of ESD into the Pakistan general education to achieve UNESCO’s aim of Education for Sustainable Development (2005-2014). As future generation can shape society in a sustainable manner so it is necessary to investigate the comprehension of prospective teachers regarding ESD. Awareness about sustainable development of prospective teachers is going on now days. So it is necessary to conduct researches about ESD in order to provide deep insight for those scholars and experts who are working in this field.

Methodology
The target population was prospective teachers of students of M.A Education of public university, Lahore. This is a descriptive and cross-sectional study.
Population and Sample
All the female prospective teachers of M.A Education of public university were population of the study. Sample size of this study was 115 students. 61 of semester 1 and semester 4 were 54 of M.A Education from public university.

Research Tool
A standardized Questionnaire was used as a tool to obtain prospective teacher’s knowledge, attitudes and behaviors concerning the basics of sustainable development. Permission to use questionnaire was given by Kathy Clark who is publication coordinator of international institute for sustainable development (IISD). The framework lists the following “fifteen strategic perspectives, such as “socio-cultural perspectives,” including human rights, peace and human security, gender equality, cultural diversity and intercultural understanding, health, HIV/AIDS, governance; “environmental perspectives,” including natural resources(water, energy, agriculture, biodiversity), climate change, rural development, sustainable urbanization, disaster prevention and mitigation; and “economic perspectives” including poverty reduction, corporate responsibility and accountability and market economy. Tests of people’s knowledge, attitudes and behaviours concerning sustainable development should reflect the topics included in this list.

Data Collection Procedure
Data was collected from the selected sample by the researcher herself. First of all, questionnaire was distributed among those prospective teachers of M.A education who did not study the ESD subject in second semester in 2014. Data was collected before teaching the ESD course in second semester. Same questionnaire was again distributed among those prospective teachers of fourth semester who studied the ESD course in second semester.

Data Analysis
The study was based on descriptive, quantitative, and cross-sectional survey design of prospective teachers of public sector university. The sample of the study was based on convenient sample method of 300 respondents. Primary data was analyzed by using percentages, frequencies, mean and t-test for comparing the awareness regarding ESD of two groups. Results were presented in tables and chart

\( H_{01}. \text{There is no significant difference between semester 2 and semester 4 regarding awareness of ESD.} \)

Table 1.1 Comparison of Semester two and Semester four by t-test

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Awareness of ESD</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>t-value</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>p-value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Semester 2</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>45.18</td>
<td>3.45</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Semester 4</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>33.83</td>
<td>6.64</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>11.67</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Above table reveals that t-value post-test of Semester two and Semester four is significant at the level of significance 0.05 regarding awareness of ESD. The mean scores 45.18 (SD=3.45) of Semester two is greater than mean scores 33.83 (SD=6.64) of Semester 4 regarding awareness of ESD. There for null hypothesis is rejected that There is no significant difference found between semester 1 and semester 4 regarding awareness of ESD.

Table 1.2 Mean, Standard Deviation and Percentage Regarding Awareness of ESD Among Students

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Semester</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Per (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Semester 2</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>45.18</td>
<td>3.46</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
From the figure 1, it become obvious that students of semester with mean score 45.18 (\%=57, SD=3.46) is more aware about ESD as compared to students semester 4 with mean score 33.83(SD= 6.64, \%=43).

**Conclusion and Discussion**

A hypothesis was formulated to determine if there is any significant difference in the mean response regarding ESD awareness of the prospective teachers of semester 1 and semester 4. Findings of our study revealed that students of 1\textsuperscript{st} semester have more awareness of ESD as compared to semester 4. It can be interpret that without studying the course of ESD, prospective teachers have more awareness about ESD as compared to those who studied in 4 semesters. Similarly, Findings of Dola, Tian and Askari (2009) has shown that majority of campus community in Malaysia understand and support the need for creating sustainable campus although they have not fully embraced the meaning of sustainable development. In contrast, results of Kelly and Sharma’s (2008) study suggested that students’ knowledge of sustainable business practices improved significantly from their studies.

The finding of the study revealed that percentage of ESD awareness of prospective teacher’s (1s semester) is high than students of semester 4. Similarly, a Nigerian study highlighted in their study about prospective biology teachers’s understanding of sustainability concept. Furthermore, suitable harmony was also found among three aspects of sustainability (Hartadiyati, Wiyanto, Rusilowati & Priyono, 2019). Likewise, findings of Akça’s, (2019) descriptive study in Turkey found positive and strong beliefs of prospective teachers about ESD. It was also observed in this study that prospective teachers who are studying at the faculty of education had stronger beliefs of ESD as compared to those enrolled in the Pedagogical Formation Certificate Program. Similarly, results of Abozaied’s (2018) study showed that Egyptian prospective teachers have strong understanding of the concept of ESD due
to the workshop. In the same way, Listyarini (2019) found positive perception about ESD, awareness about environmental issues and implementation of principles among student’s life in Indonesia. In addition, findings of research indicated that teachers awareness regarding climate change was increased upon completion of professional development course in Turkey (Dal, Ozturk, Alper, Sonmez, & Cokelez, 2015).

**Recommendation**

The institutions may conduct workshops/seminars for the awareness of teachers and students about ESD. The study has investigated the limited range ESD awareness. In this regard, more quantitative studies may be conducted to get detailed views of prospective teachers to find out significance to teach the subject of ESD in academic institutions.

**References**


Dola, K., Tian, O., & Askari, A. H. (2009). Public awareness and understanding on Sustainable development in creating sustainable campus. *Alam Cipta 4*(1) 3-8, ISSN1823-7231


Impact of COVID-19 on Socio-Religious Integration in Developing Countries: A Case Study of India and Pakistan

*Nusrat Bano, Department of Political Science & International Relations, Government College University Faisalabad, Pakistan
Ghulam Mustafa, Department of Political Science & International Relations, Government College University Faisalabad, Pakistan
Anwar Ali, Department of Political Science & International Relations, Government College University Faisalabad, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email address: nusratb82@gmail.com

ARTICLEDETAILS

History
Revised format: May 2021
Available Online: Jun 2021

Keywords
Social integration, Religious integration, Corona virus, Weak economy, Developing Countries

JEL Classification
M1, M12

ABSTRACT

Purpose: Integrity is pre-requisite for the prosperity and development of the society. Stable integration is the sign of justice, equality, rights and duties which provides tolerated society and religious inclusion. But, developing countries still have many challenges to stabilize their socio-religious integration due to non-cooperative behavior among different segments of the society, lack of politico-religious tolerance and less socio-economic development. The other factors responsible are poor educational and health system, weak social institution, marginalized segments of society, absences of culture of welfare state. Likewise, in India, communal conflicts remain present in every time as well as Pakistan faces sectarian tension and in both countries, religious norms and attitudes are used for political purposes. Similarly, both countries have the challenges of inequality and injustices within their communities.

Design/Methodology/Approach: The qualitative techniques have been applied in this research. Date has been collected from Secondary and Primary Sources.

Findings: Economic development is necessary for the development of the social prosperity without it socio-religious integration is a dream.

Implications/Originality/Value: The epidemic COVID-19 has challenged the socio-religiosity of the developing countries which affected the socio-economic and religious set up of these countries ruthlessly.

©2021 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution- Non Commercial- 4.0

Introduction

Socio-religious integration is pre-requisite for the development of the country. It detail may be subjective in socio-religious harmony and political hypothesis. Social integration is refers to promotion of values, institutions and relations which enables society to participate all sphere of life on the basis of rights, equalities and justices. Society is called the relationships of individuals which are united systematically for common and collective objectives. It is organized by modes of behavior, institutions and associations which individuals are bound for collectivity. While, culture refers as part of to society having common characteristics, cluster of social norms, attitudes and institutions.

Traditionally, religious beliefs, ideas and values have major contribution for the development of the societies and its cultures. Religiosity provides guideline to human relating to human identity, nature, purposes and role of religion in his life. It directed the individuals understanding the value of the world and actions of community. More, it suggested that how religious values influence societal norms and attitudes. Thus, religion develops cooperative behavior within society and promotes the culture of socio-religious harmony.

Historically, religion could be traced from all humanities including ancient human societies symbolizing their beliefs and practices. Religion is a cluster of cultural systems, belief systems and universal acceptance that develop the mindset of worships through ritual practice. It plays the central part in all human activities guiding people and shaping human in which they live. According to sociological approach, religion prevails around the world both in belief system and social institutions preaching individual specifically under religious premises, promoting collective consciousness and sense of belonging. While, as a part of social system, religious in most of societies had influential role both in economic and political segments (Oluwaseun, David, & Issa, 2013).

The outbreak of virus is termed COVID-19 by SARS-CoV-2 virus. It has originated from the Wuhan, city of China located in Hubei province in December 2019. It has travelled other countries and now, it was identified in Italy, South Korea, Iran, and Japan. Although, China because of its well structured socio-economic set up and stronger medical sector tried to curb it effectively, but other countries where and when it emerged posed greater uncertainly and unrest including all developed, developing and under-develop region of the world. World Health Organization (WHO) declared health emergency to fight against epidemic. It became more painful when precautionary measures were taken to combat it, including social distancing, and banned travel movements, events, education and entertainment industries (Ozili & Arun, 2020).

The main purpose of the research is to investigate the socio-religious integration in developing countries and impact of COVID-19 on it. It describes the social, religious, political and economic relations in the developing countries. It examines that how COVID-19 challenged the religiosity in developing countries specifying India and Pakistan. It describes the impact of COVID-19 on the communities of the developing countries.

Socio-Religious Integration

Cooperation among different segments of society is guaranteed to social solidarity and integration in a nation state. Basically, social integration is the sign of cultural acceptance, inclusive politics, and promotion of social institutions. Social integration governs the behavior of the members of the society; promote equality and social justice within society. It is considered the process of socio-political participation equally within diversity without any discrimination including caste, ethnicity, religion, sect and political ideas. It neglects the social exclusion giving rights and opportunities which negates sense of self deprivation and extremism. In contrary, lack of integral social set up increase the threat of war and conflicts in the society (Cruz-Saco, 2008).

Social integrity is associated with identity, values and rights without it there is not concept of social
integration which could be caused of lose of ambitions, confidence and self-esteem. Moreover, social injustices and institutional inequalities prevails poor social behavior which gives the birth of marginalized and prejudice society. In many societies, domestic violence and gender discrimination is common due to disparities and absence of socio-economic equality. Politically, collective decision making and political participation assures harmony and prosperity in a society but without it there is no political rights, rule of law and good governance which could be caused of disintegration and dispersion of both society and state. Moreover, marginalization on the basis of religion, ethnicity and culture disturb the whole setup of the society as well as country.

Interestingly, religious can be found in every society and accepted as an institution of the society. In the map of glob very few societies existed without religion even it prevails in secular western countries where more than one third population believe in God. It is the significant element and inevitable part of politics and social life. It influences the political ideology and policy making behavior of the country. Religious identity is interlinked to political activities including rule of law, democracy, voting behavior, lobbying and participation. It is considered source of legitimacy justifying aims and objectives as well as policies and action or acceptant and rejection of government in most of the countries. So, on that result, religiosity supports, engage and regulate the governments and its policies. Government could not denied and restrict the importance of religion in politics (Fox, 2012).

Challenged of Socio-Religious Integration in Developing Countries

In developing states, the aim of stable social structure could not be established properly due to several challenges. Firstly, in most of developing countries, poverty is one of major reason which hurdles to social prosperity and development in developing countries. Secondly, social injustices develop the marginalized segments of society which people are deprived to their rights, opportunities and could be reasoned of social disintegration. Thirdly, due to less economic opportunities in developing countries spread uncertainly, unrest and poverty, backwardness, less socio-economic development in these countries. Fourthly, poor health, weal living standard and poor educational institutions are the cause malnutrition, diseases and illiteracy in developing countries including India and Pakistan.

Social integrity can be examined by levels of education, health, economy, equality, justices, modernization, communication and status of women. For example, in India, socio-religious integrity is not uniformed due to wide range of religious and regional disparities. Majority of people have no access to good quality of food, safe drinking water, good quality education and health care infrastructure. For example, despite of secularist recognized ideology of India, its nationalists promote Hinduism in India neglecting minorities including Muslims and Christians, due to that reasons countless Muslims, low-caste Hindus and Christians have been killed, tortured. India due to its inequalities is going to social disintegration instead of unity and multiculturalism. For example, several types of movements were started against religious extremism by suppressed communities (Mahadeva, 2016).

In Pakistan, culture of development has a very low success rate due to absence of clarity about to aims and objective, inconsistencies, budget constraint and absence of experts who could deal skillfully with regional issues. Moreover, feudal mindset is still considered responsible to backwardness and poor social development especially educational and economic development. According to International Monetary Fund (IMF) despite of some efforts, Pakistan still have low progress in gender equality, most of people have poor economic status and women have less socio-economic benefits only 25% women participation in economic sector as compared men have 83% as well as Pakistan has very low literacy rate 35% young women are illiterate (Sydorenko, 2019).

Historically, sectarianism is the major issue of Pakistan challenging political, social, economic and cultural and even security order of the country. It had destabilized the law and order of the county as well as causing social disorder, unrest and violence in the society. More interestingly, it gave birth to terrorism, radicalism and religious extremism in the Pakistan. It not only divided the Muslims of
Pakistan but whole Islamic world, it is considered the root cause of all evil (Mahsood, 2017). India is the multi-religious country having communal conflicts between Hindus and Muslims. Historically, partition plan was decided India-Pakistan, due ghastly communal or religious violence between two communities Hind-Muslim. Unfortunately, the geographical division was not solved the communal tension and Muslims were blamed for the partition of the sub-continent. Basically, the conflict between two communities has the nature of more socio-political interest and less religious (Eckert, 2009).

Socio-Religious Integration in Developing Countries and Impact of COVID-19

As one commentator put it, “the coronavirus has turned the global market into the global hospital”. It impacted every single individual beyond the country and paralyzed the world social, economic, religious and political setup. Even the most developed countries of the world seem vulnerable to deal with virus. Now, COVID-19 became epicenter of developed states and disturbing new world order. So, what about the developing and poor countries? South Asia consisting of ¼ population of the world is considered most threatened region and impact of COVID-19 could be much more devastating giving poor health and economic infrastructure.

Both India and Pakistan as well other developing countries, most of the people living below poverty line, the consequences of the COVID-19 would be more serious which would be result of socio-political decline and increasing risk of violence. Pakistan is already struggling to keep save livelihoods and maintain its health sector within its weakest economy. So, the explosion of the COVID-19 challenged the capability of the health sector and economic well-being of state of Pakistan. Unfortunately, state of Pakistan already survived under fragile economy both internally and externally. The fiscal deficit is on the decline having more than 41 trillion which almost 94% of the GDP of the country. So, in that situation, Pakistan has to divert its limited resources to fight against pandemic (Hussain, 2020).

United Nation warned that billions of people of developing states are on the edge of economic devastation due to pandemic and overburden of COVID-19. Likewise, India is consisted of most of backward regions having extreme poverty, mal nutrition, crippled health institutions, poor sanitation access, due to lockdown these backward and poorest regions faced with extreme poverty and deprivation which would be resulted of more hunger and starvation. The families from rural areas are being faced with little saving, poor social security net, borrowing money, having with fewer meals and facing the threat of police violence. The World Health Organization said, it seems lockdown could overcome the threat of COVID-19 but it enhances dangerous consequences for the poorest and most vulnerable people of the country. Others, many developing states including tourism driven nations and oil-exporting nations are being pushed toward debt crisis. If these debts were not overcome, it would lead for the long term which could be caused of poverty and unemployment (Suleymanova, 2020).

According to United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) affected developing countries will take year to recover their economies. The loss of employment and income affected sever outcome regarding areas such as food security, education and human rights. The institution warned health centers of developing countries have to run under poor recourses which increases the threat of spread of virus. The UNDP further argued that more than 75% of people in under develop region have no access on water and soap which resulted of highly transmission of COVID-19 among the poorest communities (Suleymanova, 2020).

Likewise, other countries, Pakistan have also shut its cities, borders as well as all sorts of activities across the country. The decline of international economy also affected the economy of Pakistan due to decline of tourism, falling oil prices and global airline industry and decline transportation. For instant, oil prices have been declined below $30 per barrel internationally due to price conflict between Russia and Saudi Arabia and on the eve of it, stock market of Middle has plunged East (Rehman, 2020).
Likewise, India, Bangladesh and Nepal Pakistan have the challenge of malnutrition among children, food insecurity which poses the threat of COVID-19. The Vice President World Bank, Hartwig Schäfer warned the South Asian Region regarding prolonged national lockdown which would be caused of negative economic growth rate. Likewise, both main exporters Pakistan and Bangladesh of the South Asia would suffer with serious consequences, because COVID-19 epicenter’s countries were the buyers of their items, food, textile, tobacco and garments. On that result, poor people would be suffered with unemployment and rural poverty would be increased. He argued that the economy of the half of the South Asian countries would experience its worst performance in 40 years. The harsh reality was that poor would become poorer and more affected with virus due to lack of facilities to maintain social distancing. Further, government seems vulnerable to maintain lockdown for a long time as well as to provide basic necessities of life for their citizens. The World Bank emphasis main priority of the governments to combat COVID-19 and to secure their poor native especially they are under the threat of poor economic and health facilities (Rana S., 2020). Unfortunately, in developing countries, security of the individuals is defined on the basis of gender, race, age, ethnicity and geographical location. On that result, people belonging to vulnerabilities, like children, women, migrants, poor people and people of backward areas suffer a lot with human led disasters and natural calamities. During implementation of lockdown and social distancing, these factors faced greater risk. It is mandatory for government to regulate these vulnerable factors regularly and properly. The havoc of COVID-19 increased the psychological, economic pressure and threat of domestic abuses in a society (Hasan, 2020). UN report warned, spreading COVID-19 in emerging economy like, both India and Pakistan would be harmful due to significant decrease in export, declining foreign exchange and increasing unemployment. The decline of oil prices would further complicate the situation resulting losses of jobs for Indian and Pakistani migrant labor in Gulf States. It could be caused of widespread social unrest and economic chaos for emerging economies of the world (Afzal, 2020).

Pakistan is religious recognized state in the map of the world practicing religious rights freely and independently. Recently, the state of Pakistan has affected by coronavirus due to its religious gathering inside and outside the country. Initially, majority of corona affected people returned from neighboring state Iran and other inside the country. Suddenly, Coronavirus disease (COVID-19) surrounded the whole world including Pakistan. According to estimation, the havoc of COVID-19 surrounded the whole country within two weeks. However, the disturbing element is that, it increased involving people that did not have travel history. Pakistan has not well potential in resources and equipment to curb the virus as compared to developed countries. Further, the population of Pakistan more than Iran and Italy and 16th most populated county of the globe. The cities of the country, Karachi, Lahore are populated cities having more than 10 million people separately (Jamal, 2020). Basically, power is largely associated with winning confidence and trust of the people who give mandate for the protection of their interests. More, the supreme law of the country comprehensively defines the relations between people and state. For example, religious actors and government have two sources which protect people in time of crisis. The government could provide sense of security through its action and policies and religious actors through their belief.

Medically, all sorts of gathering could be caused of spreading the coronavirus disease. Whether, it is linked with travel, mass migration and religious prayers. In Pakistan, both experts and officials agreed that proper lockdown could not be successful without neglecting religious gatherings. The preachers of Tableeghi Jamaat (TJ), Shia pilgrims of Pakistan and continuation of Friday congregations were considered responsible spreading havoc of COVID-19 in Pakistan. In Pakistan, hundreds of cases were associated with TJ gathering in Raiwind and pilgrims of Iran. Moreover, COVID-19 complicated the relations between government and religious actors, Last week, clergy of the religious ideological groups refused to demands of the government to maintain social distancing (Jamal, 2020).

Similarly, other Muslim and Non-Muslim countries also are facing same challenges which further complicate the situation. For example, TJ gathering in India, Pakistan and Malaysia contributed to
spread virus more quickly. According to dawn estimation more than half of Malaysia’s Covid-19 affected people have been directly linked to the activities of TJ which were held in Kuala Lumpur by the end of February as well as other countries including Thailand, Philippines, Indonesia and Tunisia and Kuwait (Jamal, 2020). Unfortunately, both in India and Pakistan, the pandemic has increased the sectarian and communal tension. The Muslim community was being responsible spreading virus in a country by the Hindu nationalist groups. Unlike, Pakistan was also divided by sectarianism, Shia pilgrims returning from neighboring country were not treated properly both by centre and provinces due to some causes including transmission of virus to local as same threat posed by the TJ gathering. Initially, sectarian hatred remained present at social media and later, sectarian hatred reactivated as groups who were banned by the authority (Rana M. A., 2020).

New Delhi claimed that 8,000 people visited religious gathering including locals and foreigners in the early March which were caused biggest coronavirus spike in India. In one hand leadership of Jamaat was blamed of “Carelessness” on other hand government was criticized for delaying response to act against foreigners who coming from COVID-19 epicenter’s countries including Indonesia, Malaysia and even within India. The Tabligi Jamaat was blamed and charged ignoring rule and regulations about social distancing enforced by the government to overcome pandemic. On that result, authority registered number of case against Tabligi leadership under the Epidemic Disease Act as well as authority has blacklisted the 960 foreigners for violating visa norms. The Jamaat pointed that the gathering was suspended immediately after government requested them. The Jamaat also blamed screening process was not conducted properly and number of people carried the virus who back to their homes (Bisht & Naqvi, 2020). Not only The jammat but also 200 million Muslim of the country were blamed spreading COVID-19 in India through mainstream media, leaders of ruling Bharatiya Janata Party termed Corona Jihad, Taliban crime and Corona terrorism. Faizan Mustafa, a constitutional expert, argued to Al Jazeera news that it is unfair using term Corona Jihad and media should play positive role ignoring mischievous behavior and government should adopt greater rationality rather than prejudice nature. (Bisht & Naqvi, 2020). In other countries both socio-religious matters are taken with the executive order in situation of emergency but in Pakistan, government seemed vulnerable towards religious agents regarding suspension of religious gathering. This lenient behavior show government incapability to deal religious affairs and could be caused of increasing more sectarianism and radicalism. Although, to curb COVID-19 has little room for the populist tendencies but the government has to change its sources of inspiration and learn from other countries including China, New Zealand, South Korea, Germany and Japan.

Conclusion
It is concluded that developing countries have multi-dimensional challenges within their hometown. The aim to socio-religious integration is still a myth in the developing counties. Traditionally, the societies of these countries have conservative characteristic due to less modernity and advancement in technology resulting less socio-religious integration priorities of these societies. Thus, true development can be possible with the improvement of educational and health, economic sector and promotion of social justices and equality in the country. Both institutions and government should overcome their weakness in dealing with religious affairs and actors. Government should take decision encouraging religious scholars rather than religious individuals, parties and brands and no one should be allowed to use religion for political purposes. Moreover, interestingly, the impact of COVID-19 different to each country due to different causes and effects. India having large portion of poor population, limited state capacity and limited heath care resources resulting collapse of health sector and social unrest. The policy of shutdown affected the poor segment of society ruthlessly. According to Chinese experts, it is necessary to maintain social distancing, harsher lockdown, and increasing more and more testing capacity to combat COVID-19. But the governments of developing nation are not financially capable to take decision effectively. Now, it will not possible without the support of international organizations and international communities. Other, religious agents and common people have to cooperate with government being responsible citizens of the country.
Reference