INTRODUCTION

The journal Sustainable Business and Society in Emerging Economies (ISSN: 2708-2504 and ISSN-E: 2708-2172) is an open access peer-reviewed research journal published bi-annually by CSRC Publishing, Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan. The journal seeks to bridge and strengthen the link between business activities and society development around myriad of sustainability issues with focus on emerging and developing economies. The content coverage highlights how business organizations can be responsible towards society in pursuing their value added activities. The journal also bring forward issues in social and behavioral sciences for their implications for business organization and their activities in emerging and developing economies. The journal is a platform for business people, academics, and others involved in the contemporary debate about the responsible role of business organizations and society towards each other. Coverage includes various areas of social and behavioral sciences including management sciences. The journal welcomes papers from all those working in this important area, including researchers and business professionals, members of the legal profession, government administrators and many others.

SCOPE AND MISSION

The journal strives to highlight theoretical and policy issues related to sustainable business practices and social issues faced by society in emerging and developing economies. The SBSEE seeks to integrate the actors and institutions in business and society given that sustainability issues are though found in market yet their solution requires deep and coordinated understanding of these issues from perspectives of various disciplines of social sciences, arts and humanities. With this background SBSEE aims to be a premier forum for policy and theoretical discussion of high impact research related to sustainable business and social development in emerging and developing economies.

The journal aims to cover sustainability topics and issues in various sub-areas of business, social and behavioral sciences in context of emerging and developing economies. Purpose is to highlight the theoretical and practical issues faced by businesses and society in these economies. The journal also welcomes submissions which focus the broader areas of business, management sciences and various areas of social sciences, arts and humanities.
EDITORIAL BOARD

Patron
• Prof Dr Hayat Muhammad Awan, President, Center of Sustainability and Research Center

Editor In Chief
• Prof. Dr. K. Kuperan Viswanathan, Senior Member Advisory Board, Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan; kuperan@gmail.com; sbsee@globalcsrc.org

Managing Editor
• Prof. Dr. Muhammad Ijaz Latif, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Pakistan

Associate Editors
• Dr. Rana Muhammad Adeel Farooq, University of Sahiwal Pakistan
• Dr. Athifah Najwani Shahidan, Senior Lecturer, Universiti Teknologi MARA Malaysia

Editorial Advisory Board
• Prof. Dr. Eric David Cohen, State University of Campinas (UNICAMP), São Paulo, Brazil.
• Prof. Dr. Otto Regalado, Chair of Marketing Department, ESAN Graduate School of Business Lima, Peru.
• Prof. Dr. Jawad Iqbal, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur Pakistan.
• Assoc. Prof. Dr. Muhammad Ramzan Sheikh, Bahauddin Zakariya University Multan Pakistan.
• Assoc. Prof. Dr. Waheed Ali Umrani, Karachi School of Business and Leadership Pakistan.
• Dr. Omer F. Gene, Asstt. Professor, Youngstown State University Ohio USA.
• Dr. Chan Man Hin, Eve, Asstt. Professor, Technological and Higher Education Institute (THEi) Hong Kong.
INDEXING AND ABSTRACTING

The journal Sustainable Business and Society in Emerging Economies is indexed and abstracted by following institutions. The publishing manager and editorial team are committed to enhance quality and outreach of the journal by expanding the indexing and abstracting of its content further.

- WorldCat of Library Literature and Information (LibLit)
- DOAJ (Directory of Open Access Journals)
- Sherpa/Romeo (British Library)
- ProQuest/ Humanities Index (HumInd)
- SocioRepec
- EconPapers
- Google Scholar
- IDEAS
- Crossref
- Scilit
- OAI-PMH Compliant Repositories
- RePEc
- Copac
- EDRIC
- CORE (Collection of Open Access Research Papers)
- I4OC (Initiative for Open Citations)
- LogEc
- CitEc
Parents and Students’ Satisfaction on Existing Instructional Practices and Educational Provisions for Children with Vision Impairment in Government Special Education Institutions 271-282
Muhammad Jahanzaib, Ghulam Fatima, Dur e Nayab

Application of GIS/RS in Assessment of Flash Flood Causes and Damages: A Case Study of Budhni Nullah, District Peshawar, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan 283-294
Shah Nawaz Khan, Danish Mujahid, Sardar Muzaffar Hussain Zahid

Islamic Bank: A Bank of Ethics in Compliance with Corporate Social Responsibility 295-302
Naheeda Ali, Kanwal Iqbal Khan, Salman Naseer

Resolving or Creating Conflicts Examining Role of Political Talk Shows in Pakistan 303-316
Sajida Awais, Atif Ashraf, Ghulam Shabir, Saba Balouch

Theoretical explanation of Sovereignty and Statehood in Islam within the purview of Modern Time 317-326
Abdus Samad Khan, Shaista Naznin, Rizwana Gul

An Empirical Study on Gender Based Discrimination at Pakistani Workplaces: Determination of the Causes of Gender Based Discrimination in Pakistan's Private Service Sector Workplaces 327-338
Sunbul Naeem Cheema, Warda Najeeb Jamal

Classification Modelling: A Case Study of Breast Cancer Patients of Islamabad 339-348
Aansa Abbas, Muhammad Zakria, Muhammad Kashif

Perception and Behavior of Teachers about Teacher Targeted Bullying and its Prevention in Tertiary Education Institutes 349-358
Fariha Gul, Sadaf Jabeen, Saba Hanif

Food Security and Social Inequalities from the Perspective of Women's Rights: Case Study of District Torghar 359-364
Fatima Sana Alam, Naila Awan, Abdus Samad Khan, Afeera Saeed

Role of Agile and Lean Supply Chain Strategy on Firm Performance: Evidence from Drinking-Water Industry of Sindh, Pakistan 365-372
Ikramuddin Junejo, Mehtab Begum Siddiqui, Noureen Bhutto, Jalil Ahmed Thebo
Cotton Growers Perception Level Regarding Pesticides Practices and Toxic Effects of Pesticides on Cotton Plants as Well as the Environment in Sindh
Muhammad Ismail Wasan, Muhammad Rafique Daudpoto, Uzair Essa Kori

Regime Shift Behavior and Interconnectedness of Stock Market Volatility and Exchange Rate Movements: Empirical Evidence from Emerging and Developed Economies
Attaullah, Kashif Hamid, Muhammad Yasir Saeed, Shareen Hussain

Impact of Trade Facilitation Reforms on The Trade Volume of SAARC Countries
Kubra Siraj, Muhammad Imran Khan, Kamran Abbas Naqvi

Role of Social Media Reviews in Capturing Brand Trust & Brand Loyalty: A Case of Burger Joints in Karachi
Usman Ahmad, Abu Huraira, Azam Anwar Khan, Saima Sardar

Discursive Constructions of Child Rape in Pakistani Newspapers: A Study of Hussain Khan Wala Case
Muhammad Waqas Butt, Sahira Zaman, Raana Malik

Critical Appraisal of a Contemporary Residential Building: A Case Study in the City of Uch Sharif South Punjab Pakistan
Ayaz Mahmood, Iftikhar Ali, Najma Kabir

Theoretical Analysis of a Multi-Tier Supply Chain Management Process Integration: A Case Study Method
Muhammad Nauman Abbasi, Nadir Munir, Javaria Abbas

Conflicts, Political Distance and Import Volume of Pakistan, a Gravity Model Estimation
Abdul Muteen, Muhammad Masood Anwar, Ghulam Yahya Khan

Proactive Personality as Mediating variable between Career Skills, Servant Leadership and Subjective Career Success of Working Women: A Study from Private Sector Universities of Pakistan
Iqra Mobeen, Ali Shahzaib, Kashan Shahzad, Quaisar Ijaz Khan

Analyzing English Translation of Premchand’s Urdu Short Stories: A Cultural Perspective
Muhammad Younas, Beenish Pervaiz, Muhammad Irfan Janjua, Babar Riaz

Influence of Pakistanis and Chinese Cultural differences on different Projects of CPEC
Ghulam Shabbir, Liang Xiangming

Modelling Cost of Quality for Defect Reduction
Ijaz Yusuf, Tashfeen M Azha
Scale Development to Measure Creating Shared Value adoption as a Strategy in the Developing Countries  
Mubashar Majeed Qadri, Maqbool Hussain Sial  
515-534

Consumer Intention towards Webrooming Behavior in Emerging Economies: A Conceptual Framework based on Behavioral Reasoning Theory  
Sarah Zafar, Rana Muhammad Shahid Yaqub  
535-546

Socio-Cultural Interest and Motivational Barriers for Female Sports Participation in Pakistan: A Comparative Study of Universities and Colleges  
Muhammad Raza, Huang Ya Ling, Syed Muhammad Zeeshan Haider Hamdani, Syed Ghufran Haide  
547-560

Employee Perception, Barriers towards Career Development and HRM Strategies tenacity Employee Career Development  
Ayesha Malik, Muhammad Ahsan Ali, Sidra Rafiq, Muhammad Adnan  
561-572

Forestry and Governance as Two Pillars of Sustainable Development: Empirical Verification  
Bilal Mehmood, Mohsin Raza, Abida Ramzan  
573-580

Estimation and Validation of Adapted Household Food Insecurity Access Scale in Lahore – Pakistan  
Bushra Pervaiz, Muhammad Qasim Manzoor, Rabia Pervaiz  
581-590

Evaluating Persons with Disabilities about Awareness of their Rights as Citizens of Pakistan: A Survey with Reference to ICT Rights of PWD’s Act 2020  
Muntaha Ahmad, Ayesha Raza, Ghulam Fatima  
591-596

Challenges Limiting the Role of Deaf Parents in Academics of their Children with Normal Hearing  
Asma Kanwal, Faiza Jaleel, RuKhsana Bashir, Komal Shahzadi  
597-610

Impacts of Covid-19 on Global Inflation and Unemployment  
Bushra Fatima, Fareeha Maqbool, Hina Maqbool  
611-618

Causes and Effect of Domestic Violence against Women in Pakistan: An Analytical Study  
Nabeela Falak  
619-626

Post Pandemic Research Trends on Challenges and Outcomes in Education: A Case-study of HEC Recognized Journals of Education 2020- 2021  
Naila Siddiqua, Rida Batool  
627-638

Factors Associated with the Participation of Children with Autism Spectrum Disorder in Leisure Activities  
Hafiz Muhammad Hamza Younas, Rukhsana Bashir, Samina Ashraf  
639-646
Understanding the Impact of E-Wom on Purchase behavior Using Information Acceptance Model
Reham Yahya, Jonathan Fazal Ellahi, Rafia Noor Davi, Sajjida Reza
Parents and Students’ Satisfaction on Existing Instructional Practices and Educational Provisions for Children with Vision Impairment in Government Special Education Institutions

Muhammad Jahanzaib, PhD Scholar, Institute of Special Education, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan
Ghulam Fatima, Associate Professor, Institute of Special Education, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan
Dur e Nayab, PhD Scholar, Institute of Education and Research, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan

*Corresponding Author’s Email: fatima.dse@pu.edu.pk

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

Purpose: This study is an effort to depict the level of satisfaction in children with vision impairment and their parents about instructional practices and educational provisions available at primary level in Government Special Education Institutions of Punjab, Pakistan.

Design/Methodology/Approach: It was a descriptive mixed method research. Multistage sampling technique was applied to collect the data from randomly selected 31 parents and 53 students with vision impairment studying in fifth grade. Three institutions were randomly selected from each zone to conduct the structured interviews from parents while four special education institutions were chosen randomly from each zone to fill the questionnaires by all available CWVI studying at primary level.

Findings: The study reported that the majority of parents are belonging to low socio economic status and they have minimum level of education and awareness and as do CWVI. Teachers usually have good attitude with parents. School management gave stipend, uniform and shoes in time. In addition CWVI praised the instructional practices of their teachers in reading, writing, mathematics, assigning & checking homework, regular class tests and provision of result cards to their parents.

Implications/Originality/Value: Study recommended that various programs and seminars should be arranged for parents to get better understanding of the standards of instructional practices and educational provisions. Braille books and Braille equipments should be provided to CWVI. Sufficient training about orientation and mobility, vocational subjects and use of assistive devices/IT should be provided to students in all special education institutions.

© 2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution- Non Commercial- 4.0


**Introduction**

All stakeholders of educational process are important but student are the central point of any education system because total arrangements and activities are rotating around him as he will be the ultimate product of an educational institution. Instructional practices are the collection of all those activities which support a student to attain the desired learning outcomes. It includes effective teaching, lesson planning and best utilization of all available resources under supervision of managerial body in an academic institution (Dodge, 2018). Similarly educational provisions include all necessary arrangements, opportunities, facilities and services to make teaching learning process more supportive and conducive for a student. Learner’s satisfaction from existing instructional practices and educational provisions has significant importance because he or she will not get complete advantages from these practices and provisions if he or she will not satisfied and comfortable with these provisions (Lattimore, 2003).

Parents are another fundamental stakeholder of an educational system as nobody is more sincere and concerned with the welfare of children than parents. They utilize their whole energy, potentiality and assets for progress and prosperity of their children. Parental involvement and satisfaction both are equally important for an education system because without their consent and collaboration neither academic decisions could be made nor executed for their children (Kurth, Love, Pirtle, 2019). Parents are first critic and beneficiaries of any educational program due to their continuous contact with institution in this way they know very well the all pros and cons of that particular educational institution and program. But in the case of children with different disabilities the parental involvement is more critical due to the disability related limitations and unique learning needs of these children. According to the IDEA parents are an integral part of any IEP team for their children with disabilities and IEP could be approved only at that time when they become satisfied about it (IDEA, 2006).

Moreover parental involvement and collaboration is the supportive tool to analyze and improve the existing instructional practices and educational provisions. Their satisfaction about prevailing practices and provisions gives their children better level of trust in their school and teaching learning process. As Shute and his companions elaborated that many factors of parental involvement have significant association with children’s educational performance (Kurth, Love, & Pirtle, 2019).

According to Shute, Hansen,Underwood, and Razzouk(2011), parent’s marital satisfaction is another variable which has less direct relation with student’s achievement than parental satisfaction on existing instructional practices and educational facilities however studies reflected that Parent’s marital satisfaction had a prominent indirect influence on kid’s educational achievement. In this scenario it can be assessed that in which level parental satisfaction on existing instructional practices and students performance have in depth relationship with each other (Lui, Tam, Hiu-Man, Sandy, & Kuen-Fung,2019).

**Review of Related Literature**

Parents are the first and fundamental care takers of their children. A study demonstrated that students’ success in their life is influenced by their parents' attitudes. In the same way another study narrated that Parental participation in a child's education has regularly been proven to be linked to improved educational excellence. In this way Parents of disabled children, without a doubt, know more about their children's improvement and advancement than anybody else. As a result, taking into account their viewpoints on services may result in improved care delivery to their impaired children (Isik, 2021).
In addition another study reflected more clear picture of parental satisfaction regarding school facilities in this way, a large number of respondents nearly (94%) were pleased with educational achievement of their kids and the services available at school campuses, such as qualified and competent staff, transportation (74%) and care takers, whereas more than half of the parents were dissatisfied with the provision of technical education at school. Most of the parents having children studying at primary level (David, et al, 2010). Moreover another study depicted that the practice of nursing the low vision and blind kids primarily affected by psychosocial aspects. Furthermore another study inquired how parents thought about teacher efficiency status, 64 percent of respondents stated that they were pleased or very impressed with performance of teachers. 12% were 'unhappy' or 'very dissatisfied. Surprisingly, research participants who were parents reported slightly greater satisfaction levels. While Psychologists and other medical professionals executed effectively parental self-efficacy training programs (Kelly, 2017).

According to Bariroh (2018), another study stated that Parental level of satisfaction with respect to various factors of their kids IEPs was observed. Data were collected from 142 parents of children with ASD between the ages 4 to 8 years about their level of satisfaction with four domains of IEP i.e. (a) Details of the IEP manuscript, (b) the services given, (c) an accepted level of agreement between the IEP document and the services delivered, and (d) the efficiency of the multi professional team (Naveed, 2017). Just over half of parents expressed medium to high satisfaction with each dimension, however 61% of families expressed disappointment with at least one of the four domains. Furthermore in early childhood settings, the parents favored conventional learning over online learning because they had unfavorable ideas about the values and advantages of online learning. They resisted, if not outright rejected, online learning for three reasons: the inadequacies of online learning, the lack of self-regulation in young children, and their lack of time and professional experience in assisting children's online learning (David, et al, 2010).

In this context Jacob (2010) found that there are a variety of obstacles that low vision and blind learners face, such as the school management viewing them as an extra load to the school and failing to satisfy their requirements, such as providing appropriate learning resources. Furthermore another study reflected the student’s dissatisfaction on existing instructional practices in this way 81% students desired that the teachers should utilize audiovisual devices to teach them (Benjamin, 2015). In the same way Gudjonsdottir and Gudmundsdottir (2021) demonstrated that there was no noticeable variation in respondent’s satisfaction among mobility device types. In addition, there was no noticeable variation in participant satisfaction with the devices and services features. In contrast a study exhibited the higher level of student’s satisfaction regarding their educational setting in this way this study demonstrates the satisfaction of children with visual impairments who attend school in a variety of settings, including students who attend school in a specialized educational environment and students who attend school in a regular educational setting. Students in each setting showed high levels of satisfaction with their educational environment (Jordan, 2015).

Although the level of student’s satisfaction about academic opportunities varies situation to situation but a study presented a research based fact in this way satisfaction of students has a favorable effect on their level of achievement. However there are many other factors that influence the student’s achievement as a study highlighted the significance of collaboration between instructors and parents for kid’s growth and development; the association was also found between student’s educational abilities and teachers’ education and professional development. Beside it another study revealed that the tests had a considerable, high, and significant association. While, there was no link between student achievement and instructors job satisfaction (Gopal, Singh, & Aggarwal 2021).
Objectives of the Study
1. To know the level of satisfaction having students with vision impairment and their parents about overall instructional practices and educational provisions available at primary level in Government Special Education Institutions of Punjab Pakistan.
2. To identify the instructional practices and educational provisions on which the students with vision impairment and their parents are quite satisfied.
3. To explore the instructional practices and educational provisions where students with vision impairment and their parents have reservations and feeling of dissatisfaction.
4. To perceive the difference between the level of satisfaction having students with vision impairment and their parents about prevailing instructional practices and educational provisions in Government Special Education Institutions of Punjab Pakistan.

Research Questions
1. What is the level of parental and students satisfaction on existing instructional practices and educational provisions at primary level in Government Special Education Institutions of Punjab Pakistan?
2. Which are the instructional practices and educational provisions where students with vision impairment and their parents are quite satisfied?
3. Which are the instructional practices and educational provisions where students with vision impairment and their parents having reservations and felling of dissatisfaction?
4. What is the difference between the level of satisfaction having students with vision impairment and their parents on instructional practices and educational provisions available at primary level in Government Special Education Institutions of Punjab?

Research Methodology
The current study was conducted to know the level of parental and students satisfaction on existing instructional practices and educational provisions at primary level in Government Special Education Institutions of Punjab. It was descriptive mixed method research by nature. Researchers adopted mixed method approach to conduct the study. As it is claimed that mixed method research enables a more comprehensive and complete perception of phenomena to be obtained than single methods approaches and reply complex research questions in more clear way.

To collect the data a structured interview schedule was executed as qualitative part of study at first step. At second step survey method was applied as Creswell elaborated that survey provides the most trustworthy data to evaluate programs and services in academic organizations (Creswell 2012). One Likert type questionnaire was carried out to conduct the survey. In fact this study was a part of an evaluation study which principal author conducted as his PhD dissertation.

Sample of the Study
To assure the comprehensive representation of population multi stage sampling technique was applied.

Selection of Districts and Special Education Institutions
At first stage, the province of Punjab was divided into four zones by drawing one vertical and one horizontal line at the central point of the map of Punjab (Fatima, 2015). In this way 36 districts of Punjab were randomly divided into 4 zones. The detail of four zones is as follows; zone one had 6
districts included 2 schools 28 centers, zone two had twelve districts included 11 schools and 57 centers, zone three consisted of 9 districts included 3 schools and 37 centers similarly zone four consisted of 9 districts included 2 schools and 40 centers.

Selection of Parents of Children with Vision Impairment for Interviews
At second stage, three special education institutions were randomly selected from each zone to take interviews from parents of CWVI studying at primary level in Government Special Education Institutions of Punjab. To take interviews of parents, the management of the Government Special Education Schools and Centers was contacted before. Time and schedule was settled. The number of parents was depended on their availability and willingness. Zone wise detail of accessible sample from parents is as follows; zone one number of institutions 3 (one VI school two centers) total available parents for interviews 7 (4 males and 3 females). Zone two number of institutions 3 (two VI schools and one center) total number of parents for interviews 11(six males and five females). Zone three number of institutions 3 (two VI schools and one center) total number of available parents for interviews 7 (five males and 2 females). Zone four numbers of institutions 3 (zero VI school and three centers) number of available parents 6 (2 males 4 females). Total number of interviewed parents 31 (17 males and 14 females).

Selection of Students with Vision Impairment to Fill the Questionnaire Indicating their Level of Satisfaction on Existing Instructional Practices and Educational Provisions
At third stage, a questionnaire was formulated for children with vision impairment to depict their level of satisfaction on existing instructional practices and educational provisions at primary level in Government Special Education Institutions of Punjab. For this purpose presently studying students at primary level were more suitable. Therefore the SWVI studying in fifth grade at four randomly selected special education institutions were taken from each zone. In this sample schools for CWVI were integrated more than special education centres from each zone because schools have greater strength of CWVI than centres.

The zone wise description of selected SEIs is as follows; zone one (2 schools 2centres), zone two (3 schools one centre), zone three (3 schools 1 centre), and zone four (2 schools 2 centres). Total 10 special education schools working for CWVI and 6 special education centres were integrated in sample. The all available students of class fifth were selected to fill the brief questionnaire. The zone wise detail of accessible sample of CWVI is as follows; 7 students (4males and 3 female) were found from zone one, 25 students (14males and 11 females) were found from zone two, 9 students (5males and 4female) were found in zone three and 12 students (6 males and 6 females) were found in zone four. Total number of selected SWVI was 53(29 males and 24 females).

Instruments of the Study
Two instruments were carried out to conduct this study. The first instrument of the study was a validated structured interview schedule for parents of children with visual impairment to know their level of satisfaction on existing instructional practices and educational provisions for their children with vision impairment studying at primary level in Government Special Education Institutions. There were 8 queries in this interview schedule about various indicators of parental satisfaction.

After it a Likert type questionnaire was applied named Questionnaire for students with vision impairment to know the level of their satisfaction on existing instructional practices and educational provisions at primary level in Government Special Education Institutions. There were eight queries in this research instrument about demographic characteristics of students (respondents) where as twelve statements were included in it to determine their level of satisfaction on existing instructional practices and educational provisions. Three point Likert scale was applied in this self structured questionnaire as yes, no, from time to time. Both instruments were validated by the panel of five experts who had vast experience of teaching to students with vision impairment similarly in the field of research. The
reliability of questionnaires was determined by Chronbech alpha. Its turnout was (.792).

**Data Collection**
Principal author collected all data himself. He visited several special education institutions in all four zones of Punjab personally to fill the questionnaires from students with vision impairment. On the other hand he conducted all interviews from parents having students with vision impairment by telephonic conversation.

**Data Analysis**
Data collected by questionnaires were analyzed by using SPSS. Frequency distribution, percentages and mean scores were calculated to comprehend the data. In the same way t-test and ANOVA were applied to see the difference among the opinions of respondents on the behalf of various variables. On the other side data gathered by interviews were analyzed by thematic analysis. Data were coded categorized and interpreted. Four major and six sub themes were derived. Major themes and their related sub themes are as follows;

**Theme 1**
Role of institution in child’s learning and development;
It has four sub themes;

1.1.Visible changes in child after admission
1.2.Skills and concepts developed the child by school
1.3.Level of reading, writing and mathematical ability developed by school
1.4.Competence level in area of orientation and mobility

**Theme 2**
Effectiveness of Teacher’s input

**Theme 3**
Parental importance, their guidance and counseling in institution
This theme has two sub themes.
3.1 Response given by school management and teachers on parental suggestions and problem sharing.
3.2 Effectiveness of guidance and counseling provided by school.

**Theme 4**
Strengthen and weak areas of institutions

**Findings of the study**
Findings derived from the interviews of parents having children with vision impairment about their level of satisfaction on instructional practices and educational provisions available for their children are as follows;

**Demographic characteristics of informants (Parents)**

1. Total 31 parents were interviewed by telephonic conversation with the consent of school management. The majority of parents were male 17 (54.83%), on the other hand 14 interviewed parents were female (45.16%).
2. 6 interviewed parents were illiterate and they all were female (19.35%). 4 informants had metric level education (12.09%) three of them were male 9.67% while one parent who had done metric was female 3.22%. 8 interviewed parents had intermediate education (25.80%), 6 informants were male (19.35%), while 2 informants were female (6.45%). 3 informants had done graduation
Only 2 interviewed parents had masters degree 6.45% one was male 3.22% and one was female 3.22%. In addition 3 informants had professional education (B.ed, M.ed and law) 9.67% one was male 3.22% and two were female 6.45%.

3. 4 interviewed parents had monthly income 10 thousand or below (12.90%) in which one informant were male 3.22% and three informants were female 9.67%. Total 15 informants had monthly income between 11000 to 20000 (48.38%) nine informants were male at this level (29.03%) and Six informants were female 19.35%. Total 8 parents had monthly income between 21-30 thousand (25.80%), five informants were male (16.12%) and three informants were female at this level (9.67%). Total 4 informants had monthly income between 31 to 50 thousand (12.90%) two informants were male (6.45%) and two informants were female at this level (6.45%).

Thematic Analysis of Parental Interviews

- Total 31 informants (100%) revealed that they observed some significant positive changes in their CWVI after taking admission in Government Special Education Institutions.
- A large number of informants (8/31) (25.80%) reported that the confidence level of their children became improve after taking admission in government special education institution.
- In the same way 8 informants (25.80%) expressed that they feel improvement in behavior and maturity level of their children after taking admission.
- The big number of informants (10/31) (32.25%) asserted that their children developed better social skills and social manners after taking admission. According to the parents children became more obedient and more sensitive about their cleanliness. They learnt table manners and how to talk with others.
- A considerable number of informants (7/31) (22.58%) narrated that their children acquired some academic skills. In this way it can be said that they made progress in their study.
- Moreover 6 informants (19.35%) told that their children were hesitant in physical activities and mobility before taking admission in special education institution but now they became more active and dynamic in physical activities.
- 6 informants (19.35%) emphasized that their children have poor reading skill than general education students of same class.
- In the same way 8 informants (25.80%) informed that their children have poor writing skill.
- At the same time 11 informants (35.48%) clearly stated that our children are weak in mathematics than their class level.
- Furthermore 9 other informants (29.032%) exposed that no specific time or study period is allocated for the subject of orientation and mobility. Just teachers told them something about mobility time to time similarly some physical activities like sports and games are conducted in school after long duration but none of these is the replacement of mobility.
- A large number of informants 14(45.16%) reported that teachers make us satisfied whenever we go to school for some problem. They listen to our problems carefully than give us some practical solutions or support.
- A heavy majority of informants (22/31) (70.96%) stated that there are many qualities in schools but at the same time there are several weaknesses are also present in these special education institutions.

The prominent strengths of special education institutions narrated by these informants are as follows:
- It is a good school for VI children as it makes capable to its students self sufficient and independent in their lives.
school management gives uniform, shoes and stipend in time
Teachers have good behavior they guide and help the parents
Teachers guide us time to time about our children’s improvement
The prominent strength of this school that it has a wide play ground for children
The prominent weaknesses/areas of improvement in special education institutions elaborated by these parents are as follows;

- Braille Reading and writing ability of students are less focused areas,
- The routes of school buses are short so many territories are deprived from these services. In some institutions school transport is unavailable. In many other institutions school transport is insufficient so buses are overcrowded.
- Various Braille equipment and need based devices provided by government or donors are not available for students. So school management is responsible for it. Furthermore there is a severe lack of well trained, well motivated, well equipped and competent teachers in all necessary skills in the area of visual impairment. So better and sufficient pre-service and in-service trainings should be provided to teachers.
- There is alarming lack of parental counseling and training in schools.

Results derived from questionnaire for students with vision impairment to demonstrate their level of satisfaction on existing instructional practices and educational provisions.

**Table 1: Gender of the respondents**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>54.7</td>
<td>54.7</td>
<td>54.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>45.3</td>
<td>45.3</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1, displays the number of children with visual impairment that are enrolled in primary education in special education institutes in all four zones on the basis of gender. Its patent from the above table that the number of male children with visual impairment was greater than female children with visual impairment (male 29, 54.7% and female 24, 45.3%).

**Table 2: Age of the respondents**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11-15 years</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>71.7</td>
<td>71.7</td>
<td>71.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16-20 years</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>28.3</td>
<td>28.3</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2, displays zone wise distribution of children with visual impairment enrolled in primary special education institutions of Punjab on the basis of their age. It is apparent from the table that most of the children with visual impairment that were included in this data, with the age range of 11-15 years 38
Table 3: Results derived from the questionnaire for CWVI to depict the level of their satisfaction about existing instructional practices and educational provisions in their institutions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr No.</th>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>From time to time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td><strong>Academic Practices of teachers</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Do teachers provide reading opportunity to you in each class?</td>
<td>58.5</td>
<td>18.9</td>
<td>22.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Do teachers involve you in writing activity regularly?</td>
<td>88.7</td>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>5.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Do teachers give you mathematical concepts with sufficient explanation and practical demonstration?</td>
<td>92.5</td>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Do teachers provide you training to use different assistive devices?</td>
<td>39.6</td>
<td>58.5</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Is mobility training being provided in your institution regularly?</td>
<td>45.3</td>
<td>35.8</td>
<td>18.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Are vocational subjects mentioned in syllabus like cane work, chick work, makrama making, dori work, knitting and music being taught to you?</td>
<td>47.2</td>
<td>35.8</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Do teachers check your Braille assignments personally?</td>
<td>96.2</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Are Braille books being provided to you in time?</td>
<td>43.4</td>
<td>49.1</td>
<td>7.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Are class tests of each subject being conducted regularly?</td>
<td>75.5</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>22.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Do teachers give you written homework daily?</td>
<td>81.1</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>15.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Do teachers check your written homework daily?</td>
<td>94.3</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Are your result cards being sent to your parents?</td>
<td>73.6</td>
<td>15.1</td>
<td>11.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3: shows that the majority of students 58% reported that their teachers provide them reading opportunity in most of the classes. The heavy majority 89% of students claimed that their teachers involve them in writing activity regularly however some students showed their dissatisfaction about it. Most of the students 93% revealed that their teachers give them mathematical concepts with sufficient explanation and practical demonstration but on the other hand data obtained from classroom observations and parents of CWVI not endorsed the opinion given by students in this regard.

**Discussion**

The study was conducted to determine the level of satisfaction among children with vision impairment and their parents on various existing instructional practices and educational facilities at primary level in Government Special Education Institutions of Punjab. Researchers believe that student’s satisfaction on prevailing instructional practices and facilities are important contributing factors in student’s performance as Gopal, Singh and Aggarwal (2021) depicted that Student’s satisfaction productively affect their level of achievement.
Moreover Parents are the eventual stakeholders of any education system as the care takers and decision makers for their children’s schooling. Therefore it is a matter of interest for school authorities to perceive the level of satisfaction among parents having children with dyslexia. Similarly Parents have multi-dimensional relation with their children. In this way their concern about the growth and development of children has significant impact as Viana, Lourenço and Figueiredo narrated that Parenting is the progressive mechanism, based on the reciprocal action in different situations, like family, academics, fitness, and social life (Kelly, 2017).

Beside it present study shows that many parents have no accurate idea about the progress of their children in special schools due to their lack of concern, education and awareness. It creates bad impacts on the learning of children. However some other parents show their felling of dissatisfaction about some available educational provisions as ADDITUDE narrated that according to 70 percent respondents several kids with different abilities were disturbed in their academics due to the lack of awareness of their parents about school facilities and provisions, whereas 65 percent said that some kids having EBD, were being overlooked in special education institutions.

In the same scenario Zablotsky, Boswell, and Smith (2018), reported that Parents having kids with autism spectrum disorder were found very dissatisfied from the nature and type of communication offered by the special education institutions. There was a clear-cut positive association between parental involvement and parental satisfaction regarding academic affairs of their children. In addition the current study depicts the feelings of dissatisfaction by children with visual impairment on prevailing instructional practices. In the same context Kapur revealed that these students were provided poor training in reading, writing, listening and speaking. Similarly they faced lack of knowledge, policies, procedures, and inappropriate teaching methods, lack of facilities and insufficient involvement of parents (Kapur 2018).

But on the other hand present study reflects the good level of satisfaction among parents on the provisions of some special education institutions as they narrated that they feel some positive changes in their children after taking admission in special education institution. In this way another study expresses the parental satisfaction on available instructional practices among other stakeholders 64% respondents revealed that they were 'satisfied' or 'very satisfied with job performance of instructors but at the same time 12% were 'dissatisfied' or 'very dissatisfied. Amazingly, satisfaction rate was somewhat greater among parents (Kardona, 2018).

Conclusion
Following conclusions were derived on the behalf of above findings; Most of the parents having CWVI are belonging from low socio economic status and they have minimum level of education. That is why neither the majority of parents nor children with visual impairment have proper and sufficient awareness and understanding about standardized instructional practices and educational provisions due to limited knowledge and experience so most of the times they are satisfied with available practices and provisions. All of the parents felt that their children possessed some significant positive changes after taking admission in Government Special Education Institutions like improvement in confidence level, behavior/ maturity level, social skills/social manners, linguistic abilities, physical activities and some vocational skills. School management gave stipend, uniform and shoes in time. But at the same time most of the parents are not satisfied by various instructional practices and educational provisions as they express that their children have poor academic skills than their class level, poor reading writing and mathematical skills, Braille Reading and writing ability of students are less focused areas, the routes of school buses are short so many territories are deprived from these services. In some institutions school transport is unavailable. In many other institutions school transport is insufficient so buses are overcrowded; Children are still deprived from modern education. They cannot able to use IT devices or assistive aids with sufficient level of competence, MSo school
management is responsible for it. Orientation and mobility training similarly vocational training are neglected areas in most of the special education institutions.

Furthermore there is a severe lack of well trained, well-motivated, well equipped and competent teachers in all necessary skills in the area of visual impairment. In addition according to parents there is alarming lack of parental counseling and training in schools. But on the other hand majority of students with vision impairment were satisfied with several instructional practices and provisions like regular reading and writing opportunities in class, well teaching and explanation in the subject of mathematics, checking of written homework regularly by teachers, regular provision of their result cards to their parents, regular class tests and assigning written home work. But in-spite of all above areas of satisfaction a big number of CWVI depicted their felling of dissatisfaction about following lacks and gaps in existing instructional practices and provisions, lack of training about the use of assistive devices, lack of training in orientation and mobility, unavailability of any vocational training and lack of in time availability of Braille books.

**Recommendations**
Primary special education program for CWVI being run in Government Special Education Institutions of Punjab could be improved by consideration of following recommendations;

- The individualized family service plan should be formulated and administered for financial and educational rehabilitation of parents having children with vision impairment.
- Various programs and seminars should be arranged for parents to get better understanding about the standards of instructional practices and educational provisions.
- Sufficient number of expert special education teachers in the teaching of basic academic skills like reading, writing and mathematics by using Braille or other assistive devices should be provided in each special education institution.
- Braille books and Braille equipment should be provided to children with vision impairment in time.
- More busses maybe granted to special education institutions to accommodate the all children with special need in institutions.
- Improvement in competence level of students should be focused rather than only the completion of syllabus.
- Promotion in next class should be only associated with competence level of CWVI. Similarly the tradition about promotion of students into next class without acquiring enough level of competence should be discouraged.
- Purposely built well equipped buildings maybe provided to all special education institutions.
- Effective programs for parental guidance, counseling and training should be initiated.
- Sufficient training about orientation and mobility, vocational subjects and use of IT/assistive devices should be provided to students in all special education institutions.

**References**


**Jordan, J. (2015). Satisfaction of students with visual impairment within different school settings.** Retrieved from [https://commons.lib.jmu.edu/edspec201019/10/](https://commons.lib.jmu.edu/edspec201019/10/)


**Kelly, H. (2017). Satisfaction Levels of Central Minnesota Parents Regarding the School Instruction of their Dyslexic Children.** Retrieved from [https://repository.stcloudstate.edu/edad_etds/37/](https://repository.stcloudstate.edu/edad_etds/37/)


Application of GIS/RS in Assessment of Flash Flood Causes and Damages: A Case Study of Budhni Nullah, District Peshawar, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan

*Shah Nawaz Khan, Lecturer, Centre for Disaster Preparedness and Management, University of Peshawar, Pakistan  
Danish Mujahid, Lecturer, Department of Sociology, Bacha Khan University, Charsadda, Pakistan  
Sardar Muzaffar Hussain Zahid, Ph.D. Scholar, Centre for Disaster Preparedness and Management, University of Peshawar, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email address: nawazkhan@uop.edu.pk

**ARTICLE DETAILS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>History</th>
<th><strong>ABSTRACT</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Revised format: Apr 2022 | **Purpose:** The purpose of this research is to assess the flood hazard causes and damages and to draw the extent of flood hazard zones in Budhni Nullah District Peshawar on the basis of devastating historical flood data through the usage of the Geographic Information System (GIS) and Remote Sensing (RS).

| Keywords         | **Methodology:** In this research, a descriptive methodology and GIS techniques were carried out to identify flood hazard causes, damages, and hazard zones. Therefore, qualitative and quantitative data related to flood hazards are clipped from various sources. Satellite images such as digital elevation models were generated for acquiring watershed and slope data. The data were put in the ArcMap for mapping and in SPSS for ease of statistical calculations to find the causes and damages of flood hazards. Moreover, various other tools from different applications were used such as ERDAS Imagine for Image processing and GPS application for location tracking.

| JEL Classification | **Main Findings:** We delineated the catchment areas and different other tributaries and with the help of slope, settlements, area inundation, and past damages data we find out the flood hazard zones. These flood hazard zones were demarcated with the help of the Euclidean distance tool in which different data overlaid to others in ArcMap and through ground-truthing, we confirmed the flood hazard zones.

|                | **Applications:** Research results could be used for providing a recommendation to the local government authorities and communities to mitigate the flood hazard risk in the locality and improve the safety measures. Such as retaining walls to make them a little distance from levees.  

©2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-4.0  

Introduction

A flood is the abnormal rise of water from its mean level, which inundates the adjoining levees, and flood plains and sometimes inundates areas far away from flood plains depending on the rain or melting of ice in the upper catchment areas (Khan & Rahman, 2015). A flood occurs when land doesn't hold enough water or rain to absorb, so as a result, it overflows from the crest of rivers, lakes, and Nullah. This normally happens in the areas where we face heavy rain because of the monsoon season, thunderstorms, hurricanes, typhoons, and cloud bursts. (Khan & Rahman, 2015).

Flash flood is a rapid onset event that generates and reaches its peak in a short period. So whenever we try to control the water flow in case of encroachments on a flood plain, they create problems (Khan S. N., 2009). Likewise, flash floods rise rapidly along with urban low-lying areas and are dangerous as it causes destruction in areas that lies near the flood plains or on the flood plains. Such damages occur due to heavy rain, dam break, levees failure, rapid melting of snow, cloud bursting, and ice jams. Furthermore, heavy rain weakens the soil which changes water into the mud and becomes denser than ordinary watercourses and causes debris flow. This debris flow causes damage to buildings, roads, and other infrastructure. Flash floods are known for their fast occurrence, damage, and muddy flow. Flash floods are on small scale but can cause socio-economic damages and a threat to living creatures (Gruntfest & Handmer, 2001).

Literature Review

To tackle the flood hazard, hazard mapping is a tool that helps in depicting those areas which are vulnerable to it. It can also be used for earthquakes, tsunamis, cyclones, and Glacial Lake Outburst Flood (GLOF) mapping. Hazard mapping is a workable component for suitable land use in flood locations which creates readable, and less time-consuming maps and helps in the identification of hazard risk areas to address the mitigative measure in AOI (Bapalu & Sinha, 2005). Therefore, the main aim of hazard mapping is to know the occurrence of an event and to share it with stakeholders and the local community. Such maps cannot prevent flood hazards or any phenomena but can minimize their impacts up to a maximum level. In addition, its main theme is to provide knowledge to residents; that what could be the range of possible damages, the extent of a disaster that will occur, and a roadmap for its prevention (Udon & Sah, 2002). As a result of flood hazard mapping, a flood hazard study needs to be conducted in those locations mainly where the flood risk is high. This hazard mapping will be divided into three categories based on damages received into low, medium, and high values. Besides this, the scale of a map can help us in studying the AOI in detail. A scale of 1:2500 can be used to identify the extent of flood water at different rainfall in such settlements and roads in hazard occurrence zone for detailed study. This can be distinguished by different colors based on the risk it experiences (Cooper & Opadevi, 2006).

These flood hazard maps will help us to prioritize the areas to mitigate the flood hazard impacts. Forkuo, one of the researchers created a composite flood hazard index based on which he prioritized different areas as high, medium, and less prone. His prioritization was based on the distance to the White Volta River, population density, number of towns in each district, the area of cultivated savannah, and heights. His findings were four main high hazardous districts. It has been concluded in his report that this mapping will provide essential information to stakeholders, so they will plan and administer to analyze and manage the floods. Lastly, he recommended that these results can be improved further through findings of flood inundation, flood depth, and velocity (Forkuo, 2011).

Similarly, Islam and Sado generated the flood hazard maps in 1988 based on elevation, geological and physiographic division. For this purpose different thematic maps were evaluated for making more accurate hazard maps. These flood maps are used for better planning and management of floods. They mentioned that different levels of inundation data can be clipped from various satellite images of various events. As a result flood depth and frequency were found through NOAA-AHVRR data and flood damages through physiographic and geologic divisions and administrative districts. This study was
helpful in the form of giving information for flood risk management and the awareness of people. They also found that 7.50% area is at high risk and 16.34% at medium risk, in which the capital city also lies (Islam & Sado, 2009).

In addition, research on flood hazard maps is a good technique for defining the flood hazard areas in Chiang Mai Province; Northern Thailand. Duan and his fellow researchers used multi-criteria of decision-making techniques such as AHP (Analytical Hierarchical Process) which reflects a regular approach for finding and accumulating the impact of different factors and depends on qualitative and quantitative information. Their results were finding the flood depth, total flood area, flood inundation area through satellite images, most affected locations due to floods Number of affected schools, etc. (Duan et al, 2010).

Catani, Esagil, Ermini, and his friends researched the mapping of landslide hazards and risks at catchment in ARNO River Basin. They used already adopted methodologies and main points related to the catchment area. Based on those points, they made new methods such as conventional and non-conventional methods. They mapped mass movements due to different triggering events and the role of the environment in causing landslides. The Final result was made based on mapping i.e. land planning and risk prevention policies at the local and national levels (Catani et al, 2005).

Lastly, according to a research report on St. Lucina, flooding is the most occurring hazard in the Caribbean region. It causes serious interruption to business and life losses. In this report, the main concentration was on mapping the extent and frequency of floods. The hazard assessment process has been prepared in it by documenting the following i.e. including description and contents of hazard maps, making of hazard maps by the distribution of hazard zone and explanation that how the hazard maps will be used for developmental planning, etc. They made two hazard maps i.e. the detailed hazard map and the island-wide hazard map. The island-wide hazard map was divided into three hazard zones such as low, medium, and high zones, and these values were based on the vulnerability posed to human life. The extent of flood water is represented by the return period at different times. Their results were finding the slope, whereas, in some areas, it was steep, flat, and in others, there were gentle slopes. It was further found that the level of the flood is medium, where we have high catchment and high runoff quantity. The recommendations were to develop a hydrologic database and to update maps regularly. This will be effective in predicting upcoming events (Cooper & Opadeyi, 2006).

Methods and Materials

Study Area
Geographical coordinates of Budhni Nullah (Peshawar) are 34° 00’ 18” to 34° 4’ 27” North, 74° 24’ 18” to 74° 42’ 36” and is located in the North-Eastern part of Peshawar (Khan & Rahman, 2010). The current study is carried out on Budhni Nullah and areas surrounding it in District Peshawar, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa-Pakistan. Based on the Census report of 2017, the population of this region was 1,991,000 (GoP, 2017). The area of Budhni Nullah is surrounded by 18 Union Councils (UCs) which consist of 80 villages. Which 35 villages are present in the exposure zone around Budhni Nullah (GoKP, 2015). The area has been suffered from severe floods in 2008 and 2013 because of high precipitation and population density. Moreover, the area is also prone to flooding because of unplanned urbanization. Like other provinces, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa also faced huge losses because of floods, especially in 2010. The number of severely affected districts in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa was 10, whereas, 14 districts were rendered moderately affected (NDMA, 2010). Khyber Pakhtunkhwa recorded havoc losses of crops that stood up to 191,020 hectares which was the primary source of revenue generation. The main crops affected were maize, sugar cane, wheat, fodder crops, and rice (GoKPK, 2010).

Figure 1: Study Area
**Methodology**

This study was based on assessing the flood risks in which different techniques were used to find out different hazards, their causes, and damages. To conduct this study, the terrain of the area, frequency of events occurring, footprints of flood inundation, assessment of past or potential damages, land use map generation, prioritization of different hazardous areas into low, medium, and high hazards, and assessment of the settlements were focused (Beven et al., 2018).

Concerning these various aspects of flood risk, the descriptive survey method was used to achieve the purpose of the study (Nassaji, 2015). Quantitative data was found through a questionnaire to explain the phenomena. Besides, the results are presented in the form of graphs and charts and then explaining those charts and graphs. The qualitative research methodology was adopted in which the questionnaire was filled from the local people who have been affected by the flood hazard. Other data concerning flood causes were obtained through satellite images i.e. slope, watershed, land use, settlements, and inundation in AOI. These satellite images were taken from various satellites such as lands at 7 and Geodex. The flood damages data were taken from local sources and through ground-truthing. Flood extent and flood hazard zones were generated by overlaying various layers of causes and damages (Kerle, 2013). Data that were obtained were analyzed through SPSS statistical software and ArcGIS (Arkkelin, 2014). Other different software were used such as ERDAS, and Google Earth. GPS was also used for confirming the elevation and for taking the point data of mostly affected locations and buildings. Moreover, a data assimilation approach was carried out in which techniques of analysis were used through ArcMap software to find out the hazard zones based on past data, interpolation, and filtering (Stanev & Schulz-Stellenfleth, 2014). The final result was obtained by overlaying all the images using the Euclidean distance tool.

**Tools Used in ArcGIS**

Different tools are used for hydrology to find out the watershed area. These are fillings, flow direction, and watershed on the DEM image. Other tools are flow accumulation, map algebra, slope, contour, interpolation, buffer extract by the mask, clip, feature class, digitization, and Euclidean distance tool. Moreover, a few tools from ERDAS image are Mosaic, stacking, and image classification.

**Discussion**

During floods timely and detailed situation reports are required by the disaster management authorities
to locate and identify the affected areas and to implement the corresponding damage mitigation. This is the most delicate management category since it involves rescue operations and the safety of people and property (Jeyaseelan, 2004).

**Causes of Flood Hazard**
In different hazards various forms of causes trigger the events, similarly, we have different flood causes which lead to disaster. These causes are described below.

**Watershed**
Budhni Nullah is charged from streams present above it. We find out the discharge point of it and based on this, the watershed pattern of Nullah has been generated that shows us the catchments areas from where the Nullah gets the charge to the discharge point. Through the watershed, the streams which help in water flow are identified. Streams are identified through the Map Algebra tool. Watershed shows us that water is coming from upper catchment areas which need to be managed properly.

**Slope as a Hazard**
Slopes affect the constancy of terrain. It gives us the direction and runoff of water. It also directly contributes to the intensity, speed, erosion, and losses as a result of the flood. The more the slope is steep, the more will be the speed and velocity of the flood. Normally the water moves in narrow paths and if the speed of the water is high it will lead to more erosion of the soil layers and will flow away with everything that comes in its path. The best practical example is flash floods and riverine floods. Flash floods usually cover a small area with huge economic and human losses. As the slope decreases the flood starts becoming riverine, which means the water starts to spread out. This image demonstrates the slope area of interest in which we have lower and higher slopes. Also, this change in slopes tells us where the water will accumulate more and cause more damage. The points based on which the slope of different settlements is generated were through GPS. This helps us to determine another cause of the flood and also different hazard-prone areas through contours. It also covers the aspect of flood risk assessments i.e. terrain and footprints of inundation (Beven et al., 2018).

**Settlements**
There are more than 35 villages and towns that are located at flood planes of Budhni Nullah. Despite, the fact that the people are facing floods after every high rain in the summer season. The population of the area is increasing rapidly due to which encroachment is getting near day by day to Budhni Nullah. They face different kinds of diseases and damage. The impact of these settlements on the environment is severe because of unawareness and mismanagement during and after the flash flood event. Due to sedimentations and uncleaning of water bodies, the level of normal flow has increased. Moreover, people living in such types of settlements are facing various diseases like tuberculosis, influenza, malaria, dengue, diarrhea, and other intestinal diseases. The image below shows the number of settlements on Nullah, which after comparing it with other causes and maps show the peak of vulnerability in multiple points at AOI.

**Foot Prints of Flood Inundation**
Flood inundation means the rising of a water body from its normal flow which can inundate the drylands and other adjoining areas i.e. the fields, houses, settlements, roads, etc. Area inundated maps show different areas which are inundated (a source of showing damages). After conducting a field survey it was found that the severe flooding that occurred in 2008 and 2013 had inundated almost an average of 70% area. Furthermore, it gives us a different level of inundation which depends on the area at different heights. Besides, the area of different heights will experience different levels of inundation. This helps the decision-makers and the stakeholders to define their routes and their settlements that will be safe as compared to low-lying areas. So during the analysis of the level of inundation, we kept in mind the elevation of different areas based on the area inundated map is generated.
The peak discharge of different floods is mentioned below which depicts how high the flood level was in 2008 at Darmangi Grid Station.

This graph shows the peak discharge at Darmangi Grid Station with various historical discharge data for 2008 and 2010. All the four cause scenarios of flood hazards at BudhniNullah are shown in the maps below which depict the different causes of flood hazards.
This figure shows various causes that can lead to severe floods along with damages. We have watershed, slope, settlements, and area inundation in the above-mentioned figures. Area inundation shows the area that can easily be inundated after every heavy rain.

**Flash Flood Damages**

In the flood damages section, we are describing various forms of damage caused by flash flood hazards at Budhni Nullah. These damages are discussed below.

**Affected Buildings**

The buildings of the villages and colonies which got affected because of flash floods in 2008 and 2013 were Kacha (Un-Cemented) which suffered complete loss as compared to cemented houses. Based on those damages, we make a building effective map in which homes and other infrastructural buildings are selected. We have assigned the different weights and divided these weights into three categories i.e. low, moderate, and high affected buildings.

**Losses**

The loss that people have faced was because of flash floods. Mainly people have faced agricultural losses because their main economic activity is to sow and reap crops. It is because of the low level of education that people have a less diversified form of economic sources. Losses maps are based on both structural and non-structural losses. Keeping in mind all the factors of losses i.e. environmental and others gave us the structure of losses while analyzing them. Based on those losses, we gave weightage to different villages and towns that faced losses.
Injuries and Sanitation

Injuries were high after the catastrophic flood of 2008 and 2013. Many people evacuated and some who were stuck or took time in evacuation got injured but death tolls were low. Moreover, people suffered from sanitation problems because the water was not cleaned which created water-borne diseases. The people who are living in those settlements are facing various vector and infectious problems i.e. tuberculosis, malaria, diarrhoea, and other mainly intestinal problems.

There are serious sanitation problems in those settlements. The groundwater and surface water gets unhealthy and dirty because of poor waste management. The Budhni Nullah receives toxic chemicals from other catchments areas. People living in these areas use different types of sanitation ways, likewise, some are using water motors, some are taking water from well, and some through hand pumps. We can say that the secondary hazard of floods is still residing in the locale even after many years. Also, there is a severe problem with huge rats that killed many people. People said that they had emerged after the floods of 2008 and 2013.

In this map, we have assigned the intensity of injuries and sanitation system values in Pie Chart symbology so that the readers easily understand the intensity of injuries and sanitation problems. Below we have shown all the damages caused by flash floods in Budhni Nullah. This figure shows the various form of damage that AOI received in various forms after flash floods. We have separated figures for a better representation of each damage.

![Injuries and Sanitation Map]

Findings

For finding the flood hazard zones different layers of causes and damages were added to one another to get the result for marking the flood hazard zones. These resultant maps can be used for pre-disaster planning and they can play a lucrative role in the preparedness phase of disaster management.

Flood Extent

Flood extent shows us to what extent the flood water has reached and can reach further in the future.
based on all raster data of damages and causes. It gives us the prediction of upcoming high flood events extent. As a result, we find out the flood extent by using a tool Euclidean Distance tool on a slope and then changing the database of the inundated area and inundation level of the vector to the raster layer and summing all the point data on which we generate the second Euclidean Distance. Then through the Raster Calculator, we summed up both the Euclidean Distance of slope and survey data. We got the final Euclidean Distance which we called flood extent which shows us area inundation and level of inundation and slope as mentioned above.

**Flood Hazard Zones**

The chances of occurrence of flash floods in different villages and colonies are calculated by overlaying all the hazard factors which are discussed above to find the hazard zones and make a flood hazard zonation based on that figure. During the field survey, we noted the distance of each point i.e. villages and colonies from the flood watercourse through which we found that different colonies and villages are located next to Budhni Nullah suffer from flash floods almost every year after heavy rain at upper catchment areas.

The total weightage for defining the flood hazard zones can find out by the sum of every contributing hazard. The final figure layout shows us different zones, which are generated through various results. And this is a final resultant map in which we found that the high hazard zone is 300 meters, the moderate hazard zone is 500 and the low is 700. These figures depict that to mitigate the flash flood hazard, settlements should be relocated. These results are generated based on the 2008 and 2013 flood disaster which shows extremity in overflowing of flood water under this weightage. These resultant figures are described below

![Resultant Figure](image-url)
Recommendations

➢ There is work going on Budhni Nullah in the form of new housing societies and retaining walls but the safety walls do not seem strong enough to hold the flood water because in many places it is damaged and dislocated.

➢ Budhni Nullah has a lot of encroachments such as homes, BHUs, and other different towns and colonies are in making which shows weak land-use planning and will further escalate the flood risk. This predicts a lack of technical staff to implement suitable measures for flood risk mitigation.

➢ The area of interest is already prone to flood hazards and a further increase in water amount from upper catchments areas will escalate the situation. Therefore, strong measures are required to control climate change globally to sustain our environment.

➢ The government is required to support poor people who want to shift from these vulnerable locations but because of poverty, they are living there. Besides, huge-sized rats are destroying local fields therefore, strong and urgent measures are necessary to control their growth ratio.

➢ Some people are using early warning techniques because they are living at the levees of Nullah. For example, one resident was noticed who made a hole in their wall close to the nullah so that when the water level rises then it will enter through that hole and they will evacuate their house. Therefore, an Early Warning System (EWS) is required in the upper catchment area to minimize casualties and losses.

Conclusion

Analysis of flash flood causes and damages is an important component in land use planning for hazardous areas. Therefore, creating easily readable figures, and charts will help the government’s technical staff, planners, NGOs, and community members. This study consists of the multi-criteria decision-making process in which different techniques and tools were used i.e. both qualitative and quantitative to identify the flood hazards, flood risk, and the consequences of severe floods in past. Furthermore, GIS/RS software like ERDAS ArcMap, google earth and SPSS plays a vital role in assessing and integrating the required data. BudhniNullah created devastating floods in 2008 and 2013 where the flood level was very high and people suffered from socio-economic losses also. However the death toll was less but many people got injured and they suffer in the form of buildings collapse, agriculture, and others. Based on different factors like slope, watershed, land use, inundation, and settlements the flood extent and flood hazard map has been generated which gives a decision-making strength to stakeholders to shift the community from areas that are prone and to take steps regarding Nullah by increasing its width. Flood hazard analysis has shown that the maximum area is under the high hazard category and people residing near Nullah are still facing long-term secondary hazards such as problems caused due to poor sanitation which causes the outbreak of different diseases. As a result, hazard mapping plays a lucrative role in the evolution of geographic location through identifying various causes and damages of hazards and then defining the hazard zones with the help of various results derive from the hazard causes and damages.

References


Islamic Bank: A Bank of Ethics in Compliance with Corporate Social Responsibility

*Naheeda Ali, Assistant Professor, Department of Law, The University of the Punjab, Gujranwala Campus, Gujranwala, Pakistan  
Kanwal Iqbal Khan, Assistant Professor, Institute of Business & Management, University of Engineering and Technology Lahore, Pakistan  
Salman Naseer, Assistant Professor, Department of Information Technology, University of the Punjab, Gujranwala Campus, Gujranwala, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email address: naheeda.ali@pugc.edu.pk

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

Purpose: This paper aims to shed light on the issue's prospects, as ethics in Islamic banking may become another distinguishing factor when compared to its conventional counterpart. This comparative research will compare co-operative banks that emphasize ethical operations to Islamic banking in Pakistan. Although ethics in other countries' co-operative banks has become a new market segment and succeeded because it drew many new customers who wanted to engage in a morally sound investment, Islamic banks continue to concentrate only on sharia.

Design/Methodology/Approach: The qualitative method is used in this study by analyzing statutes, particularly Islamic jurisprudences, local and international protocols, conventions, and treaties.

Findings: In this work, it shows that ethics has the potential to make Islamic banking a full-fledged financial system if it is used as one of Islam's three pillars.

Implications/Originality/Value: In the Islamic economy, Islamic banking is unquestionably at the forefront. Along with Faith (Aqidah) and Islamic Legal Jurisprudence (Sharia), Ethics (Akhlak), as in corporate social responsibility, is a core part of Islam that doesn't get as much attention as it should. An Islamic bank should primarily concentrate on sharia despite balancing those three pillars. In practice, a business with a high ethical standard must be profitable, legal, honest, and ethical while also considering long-term sustainability.

© 2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial- 4.0


Introduction

21st century, corporate social responsibility (CSR) is recognized as an essential strategic instrument for businesses and financial institutions (Khan et al., 2020). A large number of academics feel that top-level managers have a crucial duty to make CSR a priority in their organizations. However, CSR is also being
viewed as a strategy for competitive advantage by many firms (Branco & Rodrigues, 2006). It is possible to think of this as an ethical investment made by the firm to benefit its customers, workers, and other stakeholders. The phenomenon of CSR offers excellent governance, the rights of employees, education and training, customer happiness, environmental preservation, and other essential aspects for a firm's success (Jamali & Mirshak, 2007). It is a widely held belief that CSR may affect entire societies and combine social and moral ideals to develop beneficial relationships with communities. CSR encompasses obligations in social welfare, the economy, ethics, and charitable giving (Caroll, 1979). It suggests that organizations with strong social responsibility will improve the overall quality of life for most individuals (Platonova et al., 2018).

The Islamic concepts of solidarity and economic justice are the roots of the notion of social accountability in Islam. According to Chapra (1992), the concept of social duty is deeply ingrained in the connection to one's religious tradition. In a similar line, the banking sectors of developing nations are showing CSR practises to meet their social justice requirements and deliver more great value to stakeholders. This may be seen as a positive development for these countries (Narayan & Phan, 2019). The field of corporate social responsibility (CSR) within Pakistan's banks is the one that is the most active, complex, and demanding. It contributes to the determination of the interdependent relationship that exists between economic systems and financial institutions (Ali & Khan, 2022a). In addition to this, it is utilised in Islamic banking, where it aids to the elimination of unethical and illegal banking procedures. By participating in CSR, banks have the potential to impact the surrounding community positively. CSR helps strengthen the firm's culture and offers all relevant economic or non-economic matters (Guthrie & Mathews, 1985).

This research paper investigates and compares the CSR practises of conventional and Islamic banking concerning Pakistan's economic environment. The gap between Islamic banking and its optimal ethical structure, a bank led by the revealed script as the source of its reverence, prompted this particular line of inquiry to be undertaken. Because Islamic Financial is founded on Islamic principles, it is expected to be a bank that implements every instruction in its entirety. The only way for a banking system to be considered entirely functional (Narayan & Phan, 2019). According to Muhammad Rasulullah, I had only been provided with the revelations so that I may complete the most outstanding standards of morality and ethics (Imam Malik, Al-Muwattha', No. 1723); all of the shariah requirements in Islam are either advice or a clear road to the enlightenment of ethics. Because of this, Muhammad Rasulullah said these things. If this is the case, we can conclude that Islamic banking, like all other economic activities, seeks to raise the participants' ethics and moral worth and increase the profits they make from their transactions (Cowton & Thompson, 2001).

On the other hand, if we question individuals or even the officers of banks about Islamic banking, the majority will respond by saying that Islamic banking is a bank that does not charge interest or shares profits and losses. Nevertheless, the actual value of Islamic Banking or Islamic economics, both at the vanguard of the Islamic Economic system, may get obscured due to the problems described above. One of the final results that we may receive from Islamic Banking should be the use of the Akhlakul Karimah concept, which translates to "noble character." Several traditional banks have locations outside of the country, such as Co-operative Bank, Smile Bank, and JAK Medlemsbank, in response to the growing need for a commercial organization, banking institutions in particular, that operates with a higher degree of moral decency, other financial institutions, some of which have self-identified as co-operative banks, have emerged (El Hussein, 2018). Their operational breadth will be covered in greater detail later on in the findings of this investigation. This study's only objective is to illustrate what an Islamic bank would look like because co-operative banks might have a thing or two to pick up along the way (Alhammadi et al., 2020). Because changing a firm's conduct will never going to be an easy task to finish, integrating Islamic Banks into the banking of ethics will require a significant amount of time and labour. However, this needs to be done to finish the essential values of Islamic banking. This Research will contribute to the recently developed field of Islamic banking research in Pakistan. It is feasible to do this by
presenting a convincing line of reasoning that demonstrates the potential effects of this value and principle that will not compromise the economic goals of banks (Alwi et al., 2021).

Literature Review

The idea of CSR is becoming more acceptable in today's modern commercial enterprises, both in wealthy countries and in developing nations. It is advised that different medium and big enterprises participate in socially responsible activities to improve the satisfaction level of a variety of stakeholders. However, the concept and application of CSR are just in their infancy stage in the business sector, particularly in developing countries. The 1930s and 1940s saw several allusions to CSR, but it was not until the 1950s that Bowen presented the idea of social responsibility for the first time. Frederick (1960) defined CSR as any activity made throughout the business to meet the requirements set forth by society. In this early period, in addition to a few activities, the fundamental building blocks of corporate social responsibility were established on generosity by corporations (Carroll, 2008). The development of CSR continued during the 1970s and 1980s and underwent a transition during this time period, moving toward more controlled procedures in commercial enterprises. It involves a wide range of behaviours, including the management of stakeholder relationships, corporate citizenship, corporate reputation, stakeholder rights, and other legal obligations (Khan & Mushtaq, 2020). Last but not least, beginning in the 1990s and continuing into the 21st century, the establishment of international CSR standards, intense competition, an increase in legislative requirements from the government, and environmental pressures all demand instrumental or strategic CSR in order to improve the survivability and productivity of organisations. (Zafar & Sulaiman, 2019).

Since its inception over 1400 years ago, Islam has served as a foundation for moral ethics and social responsibility. However, in today's contemporary corporate environment, the concept of CSR is still a subject of discussion and dispute. The Islamic model of corporate social responsibility (CSR) is built on divine knowledge and principles that are in agreement with Al Quran and Sunnah, which together make up Tasawur (World View) as the fundamental component of Islam. The foundation for corporate social responsibility may be found in the Quran, and its validity was shown by the conduct of the Prophet Muhammad (PBUH). He was a model of what is and is not considered to be moral, spiritual, and socially acceptable characteristics, as well as practical values and disvalues (Chapra, 1992). The concept of CSR in Islamic law is not compatible with the way CSR is conceptualised in the West. When compared to Islamic CSR, Western CSR, which is founded on the fundamentals of Western values and culture, is a very different approach to CSR (Meslier et al., 2020). The principle of CSR is embedded in the Islamic legal code known as Shariah. The idea of Shariah has two immediate repercussions on Islamic CSR. The first is that companies should be moral in all of their dealings, have faith in the unity of Allah SWT, and strive to make people happy in both this life and the next, regardless of the potential impact on their finances. Second, Islamic corporate social responsibility promotes practices of oneness and equality as a means of striking a balance between the rights of workers and a more coherent link between self-interest and charity. This balance may be achieved by striking a better work-life balance (Alhammadi et al., 2020).

However, researchers like Zinkin and Williams (2010) concluded that the notion of CSR outlined in the UN Global Compact and Islamic CSR do not fundamentally vary from one another. Reveal that Islamic CSR concepts and actions are fundamentally different from Western CSR are directly contradicted by this statement, which exhibits a conflict with those findings. Islam covers intellectual and economic facets, and the religion strongly emphasizes moral and ethical principles—two characteristics that Zinkin and Williams fail to highlight (2010). Islamic CSR must be considered part of a company's compliance with Shariah law since Islam is a comprehensive religion founded on the principles of the Quran and Sunnah (Deen Ullah). In Islam, some commitments are obligatory, and those that are voluntary. When it comes to obligatory responsibilities, Shariah has established distinct differences from both the Quran and the Sunnah as a source of guidance. It has also established a clear distinction between permissible CSR activities (halal) and those that are prohibited (haram) for businesses and corporations like Islamic
banking to implement (Narayan & Phan, 2019).

Other duties, such as those to the government and one's ethics, are voluntary. In Islam's Sharia law, the government is permitted to temporarily impose or forbid some behaviours that are harmful to society; however, such responsibilities must be within the Sharia law circle (Nawaz, 2019). On the other hand, ethical responsibilities are founded on the Aqidah Aakhirat, which encourages only the actions that are both good to society in this life and in the world to come. As a result, all Islamic Financial Institutions (IFIs), including Islamic banks, should engage in CSR activities to demonstrate conformity with Shariah and further the fundamental Islamic ethos. The concept of corporate social responsibility (CSR) in Islamic banks has been expanded thanks to a number of studies that were conducted in the past and published in the appropriate literature. The findings of the study that Dusuki and Dar conducted demonstrate this to be the case (2005). The results of these research indicate that corporate social responsibility (CSR) is not a fresh idea for Islamic financial firms. CSR may be used as a strategic tool by top-level managers to obtain a competitive advantage, increase market share, and improve positioning. This can be accomplished via improved positioning and increased market share. Prior to this, Rashid et al. (2013) claimed that annual reports of selected Islamic banks revealed that they are strongly oriented toward CSR core notions of efficiency and customer happiness, albeit at the price of Shariah standards. They based their claim on the fact that these banks revealed this orientation in their annual reports. The activities of Islamic banking are not only carried out with the intention of maximising profits for shareholders. Rather, their primary purpose is to carry out all activities related to Islamic corporate social responsibility (CSR), with the objectives of having an impact on the larger environment and fostering the economic empowerment of contextual society. Islamic banks are founded to promote their operations in accordance with Shariah law; nonetheless, they often adhere to traditional CSR methodologies that were developed according to the setting, cultures, and viewpoints of the west. These methods include the use of certain activities that are not in accordance with the applicability of Shariah (Alwi et al., 2021).

**Islamic Jurisprudence and Moral Principles**

This study expands on the issue that exists in the area of corporate ethics. It is derived from Immanuel Kant's [1785] & (1993) Categorical Imperative Theory. He said, Act solely according to the principle whereby you might, simultaneously, hope that it might become a universal law. This theory is the foundation for the categorical imperative theory. In this context, the term "maxim" may be seen as a responsibility or duty to behave ethically; hence, the term "maxim" can also be used for an Islamic bank that bases its operations on Islamic jurisprudence and moral principles. For a company to be considered ethical, it must be lucrative, lawful, fair, do what is right, and work toward advancing sustainable development (Caroll, 1979).

Sadly, Islamic banks have not demonstrated that they have made their best effort to establish a connection between what is ethical and the actual transactions that take place in the financial world according to Islamic values (El Hussein, 2018). Because it places such a high emphasis on the moral and ethical elements of business operations and evaluating the operations and products to be supported, Islamic Bank has the potential to play a significant part in promoting socially beneficial investments. This is because it focuses highly on conducting business's ethical and moral components (Cowton & Thompson, 2001). For the Islamic Bank to achieve its goal of being considered morally commendable, the Islamic Bank ought to fashion itself after the Cooperative Bank of Britain. Nienhaus has also claimed that there are no longer any differences between traditional "prudent" banks and Islamic banks to be ethical and practical; however, this may change in the future due to growing worries of customers about the compliance activities of Islamic banks. In addition, customers have a widespread sentiment that Islamic banks should address concerns related to social welfare (Basheer et al., 2019).

However, some of the executives of the co-operative banks in the Czech have abused their authority, which caused the stakeholders to develop a suspicious attitude. A stringent check needs to be correctly
carried out to circumvent this situation. In terms of financing, Islamic banks are quite similar to their conventionally organized counterparts (El Hussein, 2018). Why ethics is such an important factor for consumers, the simple answer is that the future of marketing opportunities in Islamic banking lies in offering values without compromising on ethics. Because co-operatives might be considered a third economic system in addition to capitalism and communism, they may offer a superior alternative to the two methods mentioned earlier of economic organization. Therefore, it is abundantly evident that this ethical framework is essential, and it must be carefully considered if Islamic banking is to reach its full potential (Alhammadi et al., 2020).

Methodology
This research aimed to analyze the differences between what is considered to be the superlative of ethical behaviour in co-operative banking practice that is now followed by Islamic banks in practice using a descriptive comparative study. Assuming that almost all co-operative banks adhere to the same code of ethics, this study selected three co-operative banks located in other countries as its topic of investigation. They are the Cooperative Bank in the United Kingdom, the Charity Bank in the United Kingdom, and the Triodos Bank in Spain. This study will analyze the fundamental or objective of the banks and their ethical practice, asset development, and difficulties; this is done to give a strong justification as an argument for why it is appropriate to undertake ethical problem research in Islamic banking.

Analysis of Banking System
The Cooperative Banking System
Cooperative Group, which includes the Co-operative Bank in the United Kingdom, is a huge consumer co-operative globally. Founded in Northern England, where most of the country's manufacturing and other industrial operations are situated; hence, the bank is often considered to cater to customers from the working class. Even the opinions and worries of the company's customers are taken seriously, and the company actively encourages its employees to get involved in community organizations and events (Narayan & Phan, 2019). A stakeholder approach, which has the potential to be helpful in the further implementation of Islamic banking, was also embraced by the banks. The purpose is to acknowledge and create a treaty and collaboration with relevant stakeholders to achieve reciprocated advantage for the parties involved. Bank declared, "guided by philosophy, engage with affiliates to create variations to cause betterment," using language consistent with the Islamic notion of devotion to Ummah. Counselling, self-responsibility, egalitarianism, impartiality, justice, and harmony are a few ideals. It placed a strong emphasis on its ethical ideals, which included transparency, honesty, social responsibility, and concern for the well-being of others. According to the ethical policy outlined by the banks, which advertise themselves as an ethical banking institution, the banks does not make investments in businesses that participate in genetic engineering, weapons trading, globally weather changes, animal research, or exploitation of sweat labour (Migliorelli et al., 2018).

1992 was the year when the ethical policy was first implemented. In addition, the Financial Times named this financial institution the World's Most Sustainable Bank in 2010. Its balance sheet assets are at £45.7 billion, and the quality of its assets has been enhanced while client lending has been maintained. According to the financial report published by the Co-operative Bank in 2010, the bank was able to sustain additional lending of £ 1.1 billion to consumers and £ 0.4 billion to companies through a robust rise in client deposits of £1.4 billion (4.2 percent) in the first half of 2010. When it comes to determining if investments are ethical or not, we will face some challenges. Additionally, it ever had a problem of a technical nature in the IT system. Since its founding in 1872, the Co-operative bank has proven to be the most successful in its co-operative efforts and its progression into the future (Platonova et al., 2018).

Regulated Charity Bank
The only regulated bank in the UK, a Charity Bank, provides money only to non-profit organizations and businesses that support social causes. The organization's purpose is to make affordable loans
available to charitable organizations, many of whom have difficulty gaining access to financing on terms within their means. The operational surpluses were put back into the charitable sector, and the chairman and board of directors did their work freely without pay (Zainuldin et al., 2020). Statement from Charity Bank provides consumers access to an innovative financial institution to create a different world (Cowton & Thompson, 2001). The bank's goal, supported by depositors and investors interested in promoting more ethical and open use of their money, is to provide funding to charitable organizations and other "social profit" organizations that work to meet the requirements of society. The bank aims to create a society that recognizes the need for a social return in addition to a capital gain and a flourishing finance industry responsible for bringing about substantial progressive reform. Its core principles include honesty, putting the needs of others first, responsibility, creativity, and dedication. Charity Bank is "different" since a foundation established it. Charity Bank surveyed as part of their 2011 annual review, the results of which showed that 95 percent of respondents said that the bank's loan had been a significant factor in the organization's success in achieving its mission, and 53 percent said the loan had assisted them in growing their operations. It has even given away 150 million pounds in loans to charitable organizations and social businesses (El Hussein, 2018). However, it still maintains a deposit growth rate of 42 percent each year, a loan portfolio growth rate of 33 percent each year, and a loan loss rate below 0.5 percent. The issue, however, is that it has a limited ability to generate new money, but it does have adequate cash to underwrite the expansion that is projected for 2012. This issue arises due to a brand-new regulation that will come into effect in 2013 and is controlled by the Capital Requirements Directive issued by the European Commission (2011).

**First Bank Adopt an Ethical Business Model**

The Triodos Bank was one of the first financial institutions to adopt an ethical business model. They have different locations throughout the Netherlands, Belgium, Germany, the United Kingdom, and Spain, in addition to its headquarters in the Netherlands. Its goal is to put financial resources to productive use to promote healthy social, environmental, and cultural development. Economic activity should have a good influence not just on society but also on the environment and culture is known as the Triodos method, which derives its name from the Greek term "tri hodos," which translates to "three ways." It placed a high priority on both people and the world and profits, and it made sure to consider all three in all it did. The principles of sustainability, transparency, quality, and entrepreneurship are among the core values upheld by Triodos Bank. Triodos Bank's balance sheet reached a new all-time high of £4.8 billion after seeing a growth of 11 percent during the first half of 2012 (Bosheim, 2013). The growth rate for the same period in 2011 was 7 percent, indicating constant and uninterrupted development in banks.

Additionally, it demonstrated a profit rise of 31 percent compared to the same period in 2011. According to the Triodos Bank Half-year report 2012, the company has set a goal of obtaining between £60 and £80 million in the capital by the end of the year. In general, it also has a policy for whistleblowers, which ensures that employees at Ensco have accessibility (pseudonymously or otherwise) to higher levels of the organization in the event that there are claims of broad, logistical, or fiscal infractions within the firm. As a further step toward achieving its goal of total openness, the bank publishes a comprehensive list of each of the organizations to whom it extends credit. As a result, Triode's Bank is well-positioned to succeed in the years to come. (Cowton & Thompson, 2001).

**Banks in Pakistan and Ethical Business**

In this research, an attempt was made to evaluate and contrast the CSR policies of Islamic and conventional banks operating in Pakistan. In general, CSR is the most typical activity that both financial organizations engage in at the current time (Ali & Khan, 2022b). The majority of such disclosures suggested that Islamic and conventional banking were not dissimilar from one another. On the other hand, the Islamic banking industry operates according to a separate value system known as Shariah, which directs the whole process and social activities. Nevertheless, conventional banks spend more resources on CSR programmes because of their greater age and size (Mergaliyev et al., 2021).
On the other hand, despite the fact that Islamic banks are still in the development stage of their organisation life cycle, they are significantly more developed than their conventional counterparts in a variety of ways, which contributes to the overall significantly greater prosperity of Islamic banks. However, in terms of corporate social responsibility operations, Islamic banks in Pakistan have a long way to go (John et al., 2022). This is despite the fact that Islamic banks already have built-in features to promote CSR supported by Shariah (El Hussein, 2018). It implies that Islamic banks are required to adhere to Islamic ethical norms, which will serve to create a more comprehensive framework for CSR and should serve to drive Islamic banks to strive toward achieving it (Zafar & Sulaiman, 2020). In a similar vein, conventional banking was forced to emphasize corporate governance, ethical principles, and all of the other aspects of banking that were discussed before to overcome the disadvantages successfully. Conventional banking places the most emphasis on sociopolitical considerations. To improve their image, conventional financial institutions need to make it feasible to donate money and provide loans without interest (Narayan & Phan, 2019).

The Concluding Remarks

According to the findings of past studies, we can derive an important question: why we are required to participate in Islamic banking, which adheres to the rules established by sharia but has vanished the fundamental memorandum or meaning behind it. The fact that Islamic banking is the primary representative of Islamic economics gives rise to the need for heightened attention on this matter. A bank account that does not charge interest or give Zakat is insufficient, even though doing so may indicate some aspect of Islam's ethical philosophy. Co-operative banks worldwide have advanced their principles and have also been successful due to these advancements. Therefore, why not use Islamic banking? For this reason, changing a corporate organization's conduct is challenging; thus, a future research project may be devoted to finding a straightforward solution that can be seamlessly included in Islamic Banking. But the effort needs to be made.

References


Resolving or Creating Conflicts: Examining Role of Political Talk Shows in Pakistan

Sajida Awais, Lecturer, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan
*Atif Ashraf, Assistant Professor, University of Central Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan
Ghulam Shabir, Ex-Professor, University of Central Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan
Saba Balouch, Visiting Faculty, University of Central Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email: atifashraf@ucp.edu.pk

ABSTRACT

Purpose: This study is “Role of Television Talk Shows in Political Conflict Resolution after General Elections 2013: A Study of Pakistan Tehreek e Insaf and Pakistan Muslim League –N”. The research has aimed to explore the role of political talk shows in resolving the political conflict between PTI and PML-N, to assess their issues regarding their conflict, to examine the discussion on matters of common interest among them and to compare and analyze the discussion on matters of common interests and disputing issues between PTI and PML-N in television political talk shows.

Design/Methodology/Approach: This research has used quantitative content analysis for collecting data and has concluded that the political talk shows have not been playing a positive role in resolving the political conflict between conflicting parties and moreover the role of political talk shows has been escalating in the process of political conflict resolution between PTI and PML-N.

Findings: This study has also concluded that the role of anchor persons has not facilitated the discussion of talk shows towards a need of any possible solution regarding the discussed problem between PTI and PML-N.

Implications/Originality/Value: It has been concluded that the political talk shows have highlighted the disputing and controversial issues between the conflicting parties instead of discussing the matters of common interests among them. The political talk shows have not encouraged a need of any possible solution regarding the political conflict resolution between PTI and PML-N after general elections 2013.

© 2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-4.0

Introduction
Media has been playing an important role in local, regional, interstate, intrastate, national and international conflicts from the second half of the twentieth century. Manoff (1998) has stated that “the media play a role in resolving conflict by providing accurate information, reducing the misconception and identifying the mutual interest among the conflicting parties” (p. 11-15).
“Imran Khan states that 100,000 motorcycles would join his party’s Azadi March from Lahore to Islamabad for a ‘dharna’ (sit-in) outside the parliament house will not be lifted until the end of PML-N’s government” (Dawn, August, 2014).

The present study intends to explore the role of media through investigating the role of television political talk shows in political conflict resolution between PTI and PML-N. Waisbord (1993) has noted that “Political talk shows are politicians’ most favorite television genre” (p. 14) and “political parties focus on television appearance by candidates on talk shows” (p. 7). Lee (2002) has stated that “politicians appear on talk shows to explain their points of view on several issues and to clear their political agendas regarding issues” (57-79).

The matters of common interests among PTI and PML-N after general elections 2013 that can create harmony among the conflicting parties and resolve the political conflicts are: 1) Solution must be “within the law”, 2) election reforms needed, 3) establish of judicial commission (JC) to investigate the allegations, 4) three Supreme Court (SC) Judges Judicial commission should be 'fully empowered', 5) Establish a Joint Investigation Team (JIT) for JC, 6) JIT head should be of good repute and integrity, 7) Nobody will influence the JC, 8) Change up NADRA chief, Federal Investigation Agency (FIA) chief, Secretary Election Commission of Pakistan (ECP), 9) Need of Code of Conduct in consultation with all political parties, 10) 'Secret funds' need to be supervised, 11) collaboration in war against terrorism, polio campaign, (APC) meeting and No compromise with prosperity of Pakistan. (The Dawn, September, 2014).

Objectives of the Study
To explore the role of TV talk shows towards resolving the political conflict between PTI and PML-N.

To assess the issues of PML-N and PTI presented in TV talk shows regarding their conflicts.
To examine the discussion on matters of common interest among PTI and PML_N (enlisted in Introduction) in TV talk shows.

Literature Review
Saleem & Hanan (2014) have proposed a “Media-Conflict Resolution Model (MCR)” in their research article “Media and Conflict Resolution: Toward building a Relationship Model”. The proposed model has explained the role of media in conflict resolution process.

Imtihani (2014) has analyzed coverage of media in Aceh conflict in a study “The Mass-Media Role in Conflict Resolution (A Case Study of Kompas Daily Coverage on Aceh Conflict 2003- 2005)”. According to the reviewed study, the contents of mass media raise the different players and society in the perspective of conflict.

Siraj (2014) has conducted a study on “War or peace journalism in elite US newspapers: exploring news framing in Pakistan-India conflict” to explore the role of media in conflict between Pakistan and India over Kashmir issue. The study has discussed that media coverage forms the perspective about events in war and peace and conflict reporting intensify the conflicting situation with repeated and furious claims of prejudice from both sides.

Fog (2013) has analyzed the priority of resources in media to solve social problems and conflicts in a research work “The supposed and the real role of mass media in modern democracy”. The reviewed
study has explored that news media select and frame stories to solve internal social problems as well as international conflicts in the best way.

Qaisar, Amin, Rasheed & Umair (2014) have conducted a study on “Impact of Political Programs of Private Channels and Satisfaction of Student: A case study of Sensationalized Pakistani Media (Geo and Express News)” to examine the viewers perception about the private television channels’ political programs on national and international issues.

Similarly, Qaisar et al. (2014) have explored the watching habits of political talk shows in their study “Exposure of political talk shows of private television channels among students of Sargodha city, Pakistan”.

Orlova (2013) has investigated the role of political talk shows as discursive platforms in study “Representation of ‘Europe’ in the Mediatized Discourse of Ukrainian Political Elites”.

Kontogiannis (2012) has conducted a study “The Impact of Television News Exposure and Political Talk on Voter Turnout” to investigate the political talk shows for mobilizing voter turnout in European parliamentary elections 2004

Bilal, Ahsan, Gohar, Younis & Awan (2012) have explored the political talk shows of private television channels regarding the representation of relationships between language and ideology in their study “Critical Discourse Analysis of Political TV Talk

Freeman (2010) has analyzed television political talk show regarding the concepts of speakers’ hyper articulate that express their attitude in a study “Using acoustic measures of hyper articulation to quantify novelty and evaluation in a corpus of political talk shows”.

Arceneaux & Johnson (2007) have examined the format of political talk shows regarding the political communication in their study “Channel Surfing: Does Choice Reduce Videomalaise?”. Lunt & Stenner (2005) have analyzed the talk shows regarding the Habermas’ concept of bourgeois public sphere in their study “The Jerry Springer Show as an

Hypothesis
There are two hypotheses of the study. These are as follows:

H1: TV talk shows are playing positive role in resolving political conflict between PTI and PML-N.

H2: Anchor persons of TV talk shows are playing a mediating role towards resolving political conflict between PTI and PML-N.

Methodology
The researchers have selected quantitative content analysis to study the role of television political talk shows in resolving political conflict between PTI and PML-N after general elections 2013. Pakistani television news channels have been selected as universe of the study to examine the role of television political talk shows regarding the political conflict resolution between PTI and PML-N. The sample of the study is Dunya News channel and Express News channel. ‘Kal Tak Program of Javaid Chauhdry from ‘Express News channel’ and ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’ from ‘Dunya News channel’ have been selected. Second program of each selected talk show which has been on aired on third week of each month were selected. The total sampling size for study is 40 programs of selected talk shows after general election of 2013 and selected time period is from May 2013 to December 2014.

A coding sheet has been used for data collection. The researchers have designed a yearly coding sheet in which three sections have been made with the name of ‘Topic of Discussion’, ‘Anchor person’ and ‘Participants of talk show’ respectively whereas unit of ‘Anchor person’ has been divided into ‘Introduction of Talk Show’, ‘Question Asked by Anchor Person’ and ‘End notes by Anchor Person’
and similarly unit of ‘Participants of talk show’ has been divided into ‘Affiliation with Political Party’ and ‘Arguments by Participants’. One coding sheet was used for one year and for only one political talk show. Four coding sheets were used for two talk shows from May 2013 to December 2014. Units were analyzed in a categorical data i.e. positive, negative and neutral.

Different computer soft wares have been used in this study and Microsoft office has been used mainly. Documentation has been done on Microsoft Word and whereas Microsoft Excel has been used for geographical representation. For data testing or hypothesis testing and data entry, “Statistical Package for Social Sciences” (SPSS) has been used. For testing the hypothesis, chi square test has been applied. Utilization of Chi Square test is applied to check the association of variables.

Findings
This chapter reveals the findings and data interpretation with the graphical representation of results that has been taken at the end of the research. This chapter deals with the descriptive form of data representation which has been taken from ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’ on ‘Express news channel’ and ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’ on ‘Dunya news channel’.

**Percentage of overall coverage of talk shows i.e. ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’ and ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Positive</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>19.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.1 (see in Appendix) shows that from May 2013 to December 2014, positive coverage of political talk shows regarding the political conflict resolution between Pakistan Tehreek e Insaf (PTI) and Pakistan Muslim League-N (PML-N) is 38% and negative coverage regarding the resolution of political conflict is 42% and neutral coverage of political talk shows regarding the conflict is 19.9%.

**Figure 5.2**

**Percentage of unit of analysis (topic of discussion) in ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Positive</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.2 (see in Appendix) shows that from May 2013 to December 2014, 60% of discussed topics are positive towards resolving the political conflict between PTI and PML-N in talk show ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’. And 15% discussed topics are negative and 25% are neutral towards resolving the political conflict between PTI and PML-N in political talk show ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’.

**Figure 5.3**

**Percentage of unit of analysis (topic of discussion) in ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Positive</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.3 (see in Appendix) shows that in talk show ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’, 30% of topics of discussion is positive, 30% is negative and 40% is neutral towards resolving the political conflict between PTI and PML-N from May 2013 to December 2014.

**Figure 5.4**

**Percentage of unit of analysis (topic of discussion) in ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’ and ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’**
Table 5.4 (see in Appendix) shows that in talk shows i.e. ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’ and ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’, 45% of topics of discussion, is positive, 22.5% is negative and 32.5% is neutral towards resolving the political conflict between PTI and PML-N from May 2013 to December 2014.

Table 5.5 (see in Appendix) shows that in talk show ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’, 38.1% of introduction by anchor is positive, 28.6% is negative and 33.3% is neutral towards resolving the political conflict between PTI and PML-N from May 2013 to December 2014.

Table 5.6 (see in Appendix) shows that in talk show ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’, 40% of introduction by anchor person is positive, 50% is negative and 10% is neutral towards resolving the political conflict between PTI and PML-N from May 2013 to December 2014.

Table 5.7 (see in Appendix) shows that in talk shows i.e. ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’ and ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’, 39% of introduction by anchor persons is positive, 39% is negative and 22% is neutral towards resolving the political conflict between PTI and PML-N from May 2013 to December 2014.

Table 5.8 (see in Appendix) shows that in talk show ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’, 34.7% of questions by anchor persons, is positive, 45.4% is negative and 19.8% is neutral towards resolving the
political conflict between PTI and PML-N from May 2013 to December 2014.

*Figure 5.9*

**Percentage of unit of analysis (Questions Asked by Anchor Person) in ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Positive</td>
<td>40.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>36.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>22.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.9 (see in Appendix) shows that in talk show ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’, 40.6% of questions asked by anchor person, is positive, 36.7% is negative and 22.7% is neutral towards resolving the political conflict between PTI and PML-N from May 2013 to December 2014.

*Figure 5.10*

**Percentage of unit of analysis (Question Asked by Anchor Person) in ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’ and ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Positive</td>
<td>37.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>41.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>21.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.10 (see in Appendix) shows that in talk shows i.e. ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’ and ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’, 37.6% of questions by anchor persons is positive, 41.1% is negative and 21.2% is neutral towards resolving the political conflict between PTI and PML-N from May 2013 to December 2014.

*Figure 5.11*

**Percentage of unit of analysis (End notes by Anchor Person) in ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Positive</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.11 (see in Appendix) shows that in talk show ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’, 30% of end notes by anchor person is positive, 35% is negative and 35% is neutral towards resolving the political conflict between PTI and PML-N from May 2013 to December 2014.

*Figure 5.12*

**Percentage of unit of analysis (End notes by Anchor Person) in ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Positive</td>
<td>21.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>26.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>52.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.12 (see in Appendix) shows that in talk show ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’, 21.1% of end notes by anchor person, is positive, 26.3% is negative and 52.6% is neutral towards resolving the political conflict between PTI and PML-N from May 2013 to December 2014.

*Figure 5.13*

**Percentage of unit of analysis (End notes by Anchor Person) in ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’ and ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Positive</td>
<td>25.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>30.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>43.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.13 (see in Appendix) shows that in talk show ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’ and ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’, 25.6% of end notes by anchor person is positive, 30.8% is negative and 43.6% is neutral towards resolving the political conflict between PTI and PML-N from May 2013 to December 2014.
Table 5.13 (see in Appendix) shows that in talk shows i.e. ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’ and ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’, 25.6% of end notes by anchor persons is positive, 30.8% is negative and 43.6% is neutral towards resolving the political conflict between PTI and PML-N from May 2013 to December 2014.

Table 5.14 (see in Appendix) shows that in talk show ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’, 75% of affiliation of participants with political parties are positive, 20% is negative and 5% is neutral towards resolving the political conflict between PTI and PML-N from May 2013 to December 2014.

Table 5.15 (see in Appendix) shows that in talk show ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’, 66.7% of affiliation of participants with political parties is positive, 19% is negative and 14.3% is neutral towards resolving the political conflict between PTI and PML-N from May 2013 to December 2014.

Table 5.16 (see in Appendix) shows that in talk shows ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’ and ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’, 70.7% of affiliation of participants with political parties is positive, 19.5% is negative and 9.8% is neutral towards resolving the political conflict between PTI and PML-N from May 2013 to December 2014.

Table 5.17 (see in Appendix) shows that in talk show ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’, 34.4% of arguments by participants, is positive, 49% is negative and 16.6% is neutral towards resolving the political conflict between PTI and PML-N from May 2013 to December 2014.

Table 5.18 (see in Appendix) shows that in talk show ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’, 37.9% of arguments by participants is positive, 45.6% is negative and 16.5% is neutral towards resolving the political conflict between PTI and PML-N from May 2013 to December 2014.
Table 5.18 (see in Appendix) shows that in talk show ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’, 37.9% of arguments by participants, is positive, 45.6% is negative and 16.5% is neutral towards resolving the political conflict between PTI and PML-N from May 2013 to December 2014.

**Figure 5.19**

**Percentage of unit of analysis (Arguments by Participants) in ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’ and ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Positive</td>
<td>36.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>47.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>16.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.19 (see in Appendix) shows that in talk shows ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’ and ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’, 36.2% of arguments by participants, is positive, 47.3% is negative and 16.5% is neutral towards resolving the political conflict between PTI and PML-N from May 2013 to December 2014.

**Hypothesis Testing**

This study is about to analyze the role of political television talk shows in resolving political conflict between PTI and PML-N after general elections 2013. In this research time period is from May 2013 to December 2014.

There are two hypotheses of the study which are formulated according to the objectives of the study. In this chapter researchers have tested the hypotheses to find out the results of SPSS. Chi square has been applied for the testing of hypotheses. Hypotheses testing are as follows:

**H1:** TV talk shows are playing a positive role in resolving political conflict between PTI and PML-N.

**H0:** TV talk shows are not playing a positive role in resolving political conflict between PTI and PML-N.

**Table 6.1**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chi square test</th>
<th>Values</th>
<th>Df.</th>
<th>asymp sig (2 sided)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“Pearson” chi square</td>
<td>2.303a</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>.316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Likelihood Ratio”</td>
<td>2.304</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>.316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linear by Linear Association</td>
<td>.053</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.818</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

No. of valid case = 1199

As level of significance is equal to 0.05

And the above chi square table shows

Chi square = 2.303

P-value = .818

The level of significance is 0.05 but P value is greater i.e. .818>0.05, which shows H1 is rejected and political talk shows are not playing positive role in resolving political conflict between PTI and PML-N.

**H2:** Anchor persons of talk shows are playing a mediating role towards resolving political conflict between PTI and PML-N.

**Chi square test**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Values</th>
<th>Df.</th>
<th>asymp sig (2 sided)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“Pearson” chi square</td>
<td>47.293a</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Likelihood Ratio”</td>
<td>44.465</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Sustainable Business and Society in Emerging Economies

Vol. 4, No 2, June 2022

Linear by Linear Association

| Linear by Linear Association | 1.475 | 1 | .224 |

No. of valid case 1199

As level of significance is equal to 0.05
And the above chi square test table shows

Chi square= 47.293
P- value = .224

The level of significance is 0.05 but P value is greater i.e. 0.224>0.05, hence H1 is rejected and anchor persons are not playing a mediating role towards resolving political conflicts between PTI and PML-N.

Discussion and Analysis

This study is “Role of Television Talk Shows in Political Conflict Resolution after General Elections 2013: A Study of Pakistan Tehreek e Insaf and Pakistan Muslim League –N”. The research has used quantitative content analysis research methodology for collecting data to examine and analyze the role of television political talk shows regarding the political conflict resolution between conflicting political parties. By keeping the objectives in view, the research has selected two political talk shows i.e. ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’ from ‘Express News channel’ and ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’ from ‘Dunya News channel’ for analyzing their role in resolving political conflict between PTI and PML-N and time period has been selected from May 2013 to December 2014.

The study has concerned to analyze the significant role of political talk shows regarding the political conflicts so researchers have examined that political talk shows have escalated the political conflict between PTI and PML-N.

A conflict under discussion is political conflict between PTI and PML-N. The main disputing and controversial issues between PTI and PML-N are: “General elections 2013 were disputed and controversial and massive rigging in general election, PML-N manipulation in election, demand for resignation of Prime Minister (PM) and Chief Minister (CM) of Punjab, demand for inquiry into rigging according to PTI’s conditions, judicial commission (JC) proceedings should be in summary, PM should resign till JC report produced, Once PM resigns, need to establish Supreme Monitoring Council”.

By keeping disputing issues and matters of common interest between the conflicting parties (mentioned above) in a view, the study has explored the role of political talk shows in resolving the political conflicts between PTI and PML-N, assessed the issues of PML-N and PTI regarding their conflicts, examined the discussion on matters of common interest among conflicting parties (mentioned above) and compared and analyzed the discussion on common interests and disputing issues between PTI and PML-N (mentioned above) in TV talk shows.

Researchers have analyzed the mediating role of anchor persons in resolving the political conflict between PTI and PML-N from May 2013 to December 2014. The study has evaluated the role of anchor persons by analyzing the introduction, questions and end notes of selected talk shows.

Figure 5.5 and Table 5.5 have shown that the most of the introductions by anchor person have discussed matters of common interests among PTI and PML-N in ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’ from May 2013 to December 2014. Whereas, Figure 5.6 and Table 5.6 have shown that the most of the introductions by anchor person have discussed controversial and disputing issues between PTI and PML-N in ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’, from May 2013 to December 2014. If collectively analyzed then Figure 5.7 and Table 5.7 have shown that the introductions by anchor persons have focused on both controversial issues and common matters among PTI and PML-N in ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’ and ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’ from May 2013 to December 2014.

Figure 5.8 and Table 5.8 have shown that questions asked by anchor person to the panel of discussion have been more related to controversial and disputing issues between PTI and PML-N in ‘Kal Tak
Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’ from May 2013 to December 2014. Whereas Figure 5.9 and Table 5.9 have shown, questions asked by anchor person to the panel of discussion have been more related to matters of common interests among PTI and PML-N in ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’, from May 2013 to December 2014. In collective analysis, Figure 5.10 and Table 5.10 have shown that questions asked by anchor persons to the panel of discussion have been more related to matters of common interests among PTI and PML-N in ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’ and ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’ from May 2013 to December 2014.

The study has analyzed the role of anchor person through evaluating that how much equal opportunity has been given to the participants affiliated with PTI and PML-N for exchanging their opinions, agendas and stance regarding the solution of their conflict.

Figure 5.14 and Table 5.14 have shown 75% of affiliation of participants with political parties is positive in ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’, so the findings reveal that political talk show, ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’, has given equal opportunity to the members of PTI and PML-N to participate in order to exchange their opinion, agendas and stance regarding the solution of conflict. Whereas, Figure 5.15 and Table 5.15 have shown 66.7% of affiliation of participants with political parties is positive in ‘On The Front with Kamran Shahid’, so the findings reveal that political talk show, ‘

The overall role of anchor persons of television talk shows has been analyzed in second hypothesis and the findings reveal that role of anchor persons is not mediating towards resolving the political conflict between PTI and PML-N (see Table 6.2). Furthermore, the role of anchor persons has not facilitated the discussion of talk shows towards a need of any solution regarding the discussed problem between PTI and PML-N.

Figure 5.2 and Table 5.2 have shown that issues related to matters of common interests among PTI and PML-N have been discussed more in the topics of ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’, from May 2013 to December 2014. The topics of talk show have encouraged a need of any possible solution regarding the conflict. Whereas Figure 5.3 and Table 5.3 have shown that the most of the topic of ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’ have not mentioned the matters of common interest and the controversial issues between PTI and PML-N from May 2013 to December 2014. If collectively analyzed then Figure 5.4 and Table 5.4 have revealed that issues related to matters of common interests among PTI and PML-N have been discussed more in the topics of ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’ and ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’, from May 2013 to December 2014. The topics of talk show have encouraged a need of solution regarding the conflict.

The findings of research have revealed that the role of political talk shows has been escalated towards political conflict between PTI and PML-N after general elections 2013. The findings have also exposed that the political talk shows has highlighted the disputing and controversial issues between the conflicting parties instead of discussing the matters of common interests among them. The findings have also revealed that the political talk shows have not encouraged a need of any possible solution regarding the political conflict between PTI and PML-N.

**Conclusion**

The study has applied conflict resolution theory for theoretical support. The findings of study have supported the conceptualization of conflict resolution theory. The research has used quantitative content analysis research methodology for collecting data to examine and analyze the role of television political talk shows regarding the political conflict resolution between conflicting political parties. By keeping the objectives in view, the research has selected two political talk shows i.e. ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’ from ‘Express News channel’ and ‘On The Front with Kamran Shahid’ from ‘Dunya News channel’, for analyzing their role in resolving political conflict between PTI and PML-N and time period has been selected from May 2013 to December 2014.
The study has concluded that the political talk shows have not been playing a positive role in resolving the political conflict between conflicting parties and moreover the role of political talk shows has been escalating in the process of political conflict resolution between PTI and PML-N (see Figure 5.1 and table 5.1). The research work has also concluded that the role of anchor persons has not facilitated the discussion of talk shows towards a need of any possible solution between PTI and PML-N. It has been concluded that the political talk shows has highlighted the disputing and controversial issues between the conflicting parties instead of discussing the matters of common interests among them and in this way the political talk shows have not encouraged a need of any possible solution regarding the political conflict resolution between PTI and PML-N after general elections 2013.

The study also provides some suggestions for future agenda and future media students. The purpose of this section is to deal with the responsibility to help researchers who wants to do research work or their course thesis on this topic in future.

In this research, quantitative content analysis has been used for data collection. For the analyzing the role of television talk shows in resolving political conflict between PTI and PML-N, researchers have selected two political talk shows i.e. ‘Kal Tak Javaid Chauhdry Kay Sath’ and ‘On the Front with Kamran Shahid’. If anyone wants to conduct a study related to this issue then one can interview the media experts. One can also conduct a qualitative content analysis by establishing themes and one can also do discourse analysis.

In this research work, political talk shows has been taken under investigation but if any one wants to examine the role of media in political conflict resolution then one can take newspapers under investigation. The study has investigated the issue under the theory of conflict resolution but one can investigate this issue under the theories of agenda setting and framing.

References


bitstream/handle/10803/116324/do1de1.pdf?sequence=1.


Theoretical explanation of Sovereignty and Statehood in Islam within the purview of Modern Time

*Abdus Samad Khan, Assistant Professor, Department of Law, Abdul Wali Khan University Mardan, Pakistan
Shaista Naznin, Assistant Professor, Department of Law, Abdul Wali Khan University Mardan, Pakistan
Rizwana Gul, Assistant Professor, Department of Law, Abdul Wali Khan University Mardan, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email: abdus@awkum.edu.pk

ARTICLE DETAILS

Purpose: The main theme of the present study was to provide previous empirical and other literature reviews of sovereignty and statehood in Islam and particularly its compression with modern times.

Methodology: Prior study on statehood was examined from various aspects.

Findings: It has been reaveled that Statehood and sovereignty is one of the important elements of an Islamic state in the modern world. Besides, in Islam, one of the greatest attributes of God is sovereignty. However, the western notion of sovereignty developed by declining God’s sovereignty is rejected on two grounds; the first slam lacks any historical evidence to grant ultimate power to any political authority or ruler. Second, the notion of sovereignty in a specific historical and present social European setting is an attempt to undermine the absolute authority of the church. Notwithstanding, there are three notions of Islamic sovereignty.

Implications: The study concluded that in the Islamic State, sovereignty belongs to Allah and Allah is the only one who rules which is viewed in the form of divine laws and Jurisprudence. The interpretation of this rule of sovereignty as that there is no concept of people’s sovereignty in Islam is not correct because Allah cannot be an immediate ruler in the political connotation.

© 2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-4.0


Introduction
The concept of Statehood and sovereignty is of utmost importance to understand the elements of an Islamic state in the modern world. The Ottoman Empire's downfall and the colonization of the Muslim world were the main reasons for the modern-day discussion of sovereignty and statehood.
The first thing that springs to mind is whether Islamic theories of sovereignty can be compared to those developed by Western political philosophy. The common thought which prevails in the west is that the development of Islamic political philosophy has been constrained by the unquestioning acceptance of Allah and the Qur'an as the plain reading of Allah's word. Challenges have been brought by progressive intellectual Muslims to the political theory of Islam with a view that modernity is not a challenge to Islam but to Muslim societies (Bassiouni, 2014). It is evident from the fact that the political philosophy of Muslim States over the globe has been changed without any change in the Quran and Sunnah at all which testifies to the fact that the change is the outcome of changing scholars, leaders, and elites over the time but not Islam. While discussing different scholarly views on the theory of sovereignty, the point is worth mentioning that the Islamic theory of sovereignty represents Islam applying God's Law in the civil realm (kingdom of Saudi Arabia) while the ideology and scholarly work of Muslims and their views are not included. If we refer to the West, it has tried to fix the problem of absolute sovereignty via community transitions in sociopolitical history and has incorporated the salient features of sovereignty into a multinational organization where the member nations' liberty is constrained (Malpas & Davidson, 2012).

**Islamic and Western Concept of Sovereignty**

In Islam, one of the greatest attributes of God is sovereignty. The western notion of sovereignty developed by declining God’s sovereignty is rejected on two grounds; the first slam lacks any historical evidence to grant ultimate power to any political authority or ruler. Second, the notion of sovereignty in a specific historical and present social European setting is an attempt to undermine the absolute authority of the church (Alijla & Hamed, 2015). It can be transferred to men by making them lords over others to the extent of use of God’s sovereignty where the Islamic Sharia places restrictions on political and governing authority.

**Three Notions of Islamic Sovereignty**

The view of Muslim scholars on the concept of sovereignty covers three distinct approaches.

The first group argues that sovereignty is the attribute of God and Islamic Sharia and they demarcate the term ‘sovereignty’ from ‘authority’. The group proclaims that ‘sovereignty’ is the pure and absolute attribute of God whereas ‘authority’ is delegated to Ummah to exercise within the parameters of sovereign power (Saed, 1999). It further says that if an Islamic state has emerged as a result of the wishes of the people, God's sovereignty over the state must be stripped away. Theorists that belong to this group base their contention on the following verse of Quran 4:59:

"O you who have believed, obey Allah and obey the Messenger and those in authority among you.”

This view of sovereignty is connected to the notion of “Al-Hakimya”, which is described and adopted by Al-Mawdudi and Sayyid Qutb.

The second group argues that the Ummah, the country, is the source of sovereignty and power.

Representatives in the Ummah use and take guidelines from Sharia as the fundamental framework of Islamic laws, and the ruler is the leader of this law (Alijla & Hamed, 2015). A national decision is of utmost importance in all matters when consultation is made between a ruler and the consultation committees comprised of people engaged in the process of law-making according to Sharia.

This notion of sovereignty is supported by the practice of appointment of Caliph, Hazrat Abu Baker after the demise of the Prophet (PBUH). Neither God nor prophet delegated Abu Baker the power to rule but his friends (Sahaba) and the citizens in Mecca and Medina nominated him as the first intelligent Calip. This implies that all authority, including juridical authority, comes from the nation and its inhabitants, with a condition that it is based on the framework of the Sharia.
The third group adopts a middle approach to link the views of both groups. They stated that judicial Sharia embodies sovereignty of the Divine while the dominance of the state is represented in the assemblies or consultations. Mohamed Hamad, Al-Samad, Mohammed DiaEldin, and Al-Rayyes are among those Islamic scholars who believe that God's sovereignty and national sovereignty both exist. However, it is worth mentioning that all three Islamic views of sovereignty share the same idea that there is a limit to the sovereignty and authority of man by Sharia.

Western Legal View of Sovereignty
Bodin and Hobbes can be rightly said the first writers of the modern doctrine of Sovereignty. Sovereignty is called to be asserted in “a determinate human superior, not in the habit of obedience to a like superior (Mahajan, 2005)”. The same notion of sovereignty was stated by Austin in the 19th century.

Bodin, Hobbes, Bentham, and Austin gave the juristic view of sovereignty and declared the lawmaker as the most sovereign with absolute authority by avoiding the moral or abstract idea of sovereignty found in the concept of Sovereignty of God or the General Will (Ahmad, 1958). It shows that the modern idea of sovereignty is influenced by Greek, Rome, and Christian civilizations passing up the idea of sovereignty present in Islamic civilization.

The belief that Bodin and Hobbes were the first modern writers of sovereignty in the history of political thought is rejected, though they may be considered as such in the history of European political thought only(Ahmad, 1958). The claim is defended that “if we believe in the unity of history we must also believe in the unity of the history of political thought(Ahmad, 1958).” In the light of this claim and its justification by Ahmad, the credit is the first writers of the concept of legal and political sovereignty must go to Ibn Abi-ar-Rabi, Al-Farabi, and Ibn Khaldun even though they lived and died in the so-called Middle ages(called by West).

Ibn Khaldun (1332-1406 A.D) is known as the greatest historical philosopher of Islam. Ibn Khaldun, in his Muqaddama, calls a human being a social animal who cannot live all alone. Yet they have an apparent tendency to quarrel and conflict also.

The Idea of Caliphate
The concept of statehood in Islam is much in news today. Dr. Baker mentions the different reasons why Islam and its concept of statehood are much in news today. He explains these reasons;

a) Islamic states are located at the intersection of the three continents Europe, Africa, and Asia on the globe map, which is both geophysical and politically significant.

b) Political awareness among Muslim states after the I and II world war resulted in almost 35-40 Muslim states,
c) Oil reservoirs of the Muslim states

d) Perhaps more importantly, the meddling by superpowers in the name of their purported global interests (Baker, 1981).

If we refer to the early Islamic periods, the Arabian community was built on kinship. Prophet Muhammad (BPOH) altered the foundation of political and social life and substituted the blood kin with a community of faith. Thus the society and aggregation of the ummah of the Prophet- was integrated into the teaching along with the message which substituted ancient ummah or tribe made on the bases of kinship.

The concept of statehood in Islam, therefore, is quite different from the one that derives its authority from the man-made authority or their morality base authority. Islam embraces that God is the sovereign of the whole universe and this is the God who made laws or put the foundation of law. In addition, the Prophet's authority over the people in the early Islamic state was considered the second foundation.
The ruler or caliph served as the third pillar of the early Islamic community. Hazrat Abu Bakr—Prophets’ most trusted adviser and the first Caliph, used to lead public prayers/worship in place of the Prophet when the prophet was too ill. After the demise of the Prophet, Abu Bakr was appointed as the first caliph. As a result, Abu Bakr was democratically selected by community members to follow the Prophet. He was granted the title of caliph, which translates as vicegerent or deputy and denotes someone whose job it is to provide righteous judgments (Baker, 1981). Hazrat Abu Bakr was succeeded by three more Caliphs. During the time of the Four Rightly Guided Caliphs (632 AD-661 AD), the appointment of the Caliph was made through different methods, however, the appointment in all cases was confirmed by the Muslim community through its consent formally obtained by way of baiyat (J. J. Iqbal, 1984).

The prophetic caliphate’s political program is the sole valid form of government, and it also corresponds with the reign of the four well-directed or properly led caliphs. Moreover, after this golden period, Caliphate witnessed a progressive decline. The practical requirements of a growing empire and the inconsistent Arab temperament were two factors that made the issue worse. This changed the caliphate into a personal rule under the Umayyads and subsequently an imperial government based on the Persian model during the Abbasids that moved gradually to its ruin.

There remained two main factors that altered the character of the caliphate (Baker, 1981). The first was the shift of military headquarters from Madina to Kufah during the reign of the fourth caliph Ali (656-661) due to military operations. As the first Umayyad Caliphate, Maawiya afterward carried on the caliphate in Damascus (661-680). Furthermore, this mitigated the significance and influence in the discussions and decisions of the Muslim scholars and jurors of Medina. The adoption of the dynastic concept of succession to the caliphate was the second modification (J. J. Iqbal, 1984).

The first disagreement in the Muslim community on the issue of leadership was raised during the times of Caliph Ali (RA). There was disagreement on who should head the Ummah and what his responsibilities should be. The Kharijis, who divided themselves from the Caliph Ali (RA), had differences, particularly on the issue of adjudication of the murder of previous Caliph Usman (RA) between Caliph Ali (RA) and Amir Muawiya (RA). Arbitration in this matter was not accepted and declared as a sin against God. Writings of different Muslim scholars, including Ibn Taymiyya, Imams al-Ghazali, al-Baghdadi, al Mawardi, al Juwayni, al Razi, Ibn Khaldun, Abu Yusuf, al-Baqillani, and al-Kunji is a rich source of Islamic historical works on the state’s ruling and sovereignty (Lambton, 2013). Some of the mentioned writers believe that the sovereignty of God- if taken in its literal form- cannot function in human society because God cannot be an immediate ruler in the political nuance. They elaborate that it is no God but God’s law that provides the basis of the state (Khadduri, 2006) and the term that can be applied appropriately to the Islamic state is nomocracy which means "a system or government based on a legal code; the rule of law in a community". However, Syed Abdu Rahman uses the most appropriate term that can best explain the nature of the Islamic form of state and called it “khilafat” (Rahman, 1986). Qur’an emphasizes the sovereignty of Allah on one hand and repeatedly refers to the vicegerency conferred on man on the other hand. These verses of the Quran testifies this fact;

Behold, thy Lord said to the angels:  
"I will create a vicegerent on earth”  
"And remember how He made you inheritors”  
And make you inheritors in the earth;”

Dr. Allama Iqbal has discussed the same doctrine of sovereignty under the Islamic concept of tauhid which means the oneness of God. According to Iqbal
"The essence of 'Tauhid' as a working idea is equality, solidarity, and freedom. The state, from the Islamic standpoint, is an endeavor to transform these ideal principles into time-space forces, as an aspiration to realize them in a definite human organization" (M. Iqbal, 2013).

It shows the law of God as "absolutely supreme." It by no means is to limit human freedom. Rather it is an effective protection against the error of judgment to which human reason is prone (Rahman, 1986).

Towards the Islamic Republic
The development of the fledgling state during the first four well-guided Caliphs and the brief survey of its decline in the Umayyad and Abbasid caliphat is to take us towards the political system in the form of Islamic Republics claimed by Muslim leaders of Pakistan, Iran, and Libya to see and understand what they define as the Islamic Republic in the modern world. It is easier to express in words than it is to put into practice. Besides, in the Islamic Republic, God has sovereignty, and as a result, God's Laws (shari'ah) should be ultimate. Notwithstanding, there is no consensus, raising the question of what sort and extent of earthly power or authorities these countries can establish? (Baker, 1981). The vulnerability to evils and loss of moral values deteriorates the situation further as these states are devoted to growth in education as well as in science and technology.

A solution can be discovered by looking at the link between shari'ah (the law) and khilafa (the governing authority or authorities) and understanding the meaning of the term Khalifah as used in the Holy Qur'an and throughout Islamic history.

We will turn to the work of a Pakistani scholar, Kemal A. Faruki, who mentions the three-stage of progress or development regarding Khalifah in Muslim history (Faruki, 1974).

There was no doubt about the shari'ah's dominance over the Khalifah during the early Medina caliphate. And the authority of the caliph was subject to his conduct by the shari'ah only. The caliphate witnessed considerable modifications throughout the reigns of the Umayyad and Abbasid caliphat in the middle stages. The Shari'ah doctrine remained preeminent, but in fact, the caliph was the greatest authority on earth as God's vicegerent (Faruki, 1974). In the post-caliphate period following the destruction of Baghdad, an acceptable kind of Islamic state was still feasible provided the monarch (sultan) listened to religious instruction from the 'ulama as shown in the writings of al-Dawwani (Faruki, 1974).

During various periods of Islamic history, most Muslim thinkers establish the opinion that the Khalifah of the holy Qur'an is the Khalifah of man-God's trustee- as the Qur'an refers to mankind in general and not to a particular person. Faruki (1974) disclosed that authority explained by the Qur'an as under “for understanding and carrying out God's commands is nothing less than the totality of God's vicegerents in an Islamic state, which is the Muslim community. Hence, an Islamic state, even in matters of shari'ah understanding, cannot be monarchical, autocratic, or oligarchic, but must necessarily be democratic, although its democratic nature may require special expression for shari'ah purposes.”

Democracy and Ummah
Could the powers and duties of the Caliph be replaced by the body of persons elected as representatives in a Muslim state? Turkey was the first country in the Islamic world just after the collapse of the Ottoman Empire and the Caliphate in Istanbul in 1924 which give effect to the view that the power of the Caliph can be transferred to the elected body of person known as the elected assembly. The viewpoint was the same as that of khawaraj in the early history of Islam who stated that the appointment of the Caliph is not obligatory and Muslims can handle their affairs by consultation among themselves, as the Quran advises (J. J. Iqbal, 1984). The transformation which took place in Turkey was adopted by many Muslim states including Pakistan creating legislative assemblies. In the view of Justice Javed Iqbal, this transformation and replacement of the Caliphate by the Western ideology of democracy is an imperfect one. He supports his viewpoint by explaining that;
I) Islamic State needs to be run and administered by the best among Muslims but the western method of election does not fulfill the purpose and no election of the best, therefore.

II) Voting is not a replacement for baiyat, a mutual agreement.

III) Similarly, in Islam, there is no requirement to uphold the majority viewpoint.

IV) Some Sunni legal schools reject the Ijma as a source of law. They think that Shura is only a group of specialists or advisors that Calipha must appoint, through selection or nomination and not through election for consultation purposes (J. J. Iqbal, 1984).

If we take it generally, in a Muslim sovereign nation, the legislative process might take place in three different areas.

1) Firstly to uphold the rules outlined in the Quran and Sunnah
2) Secondly to harmonize all current legislation with the Quran and Sunnah
3) Thirdly to enact laws that are not incompatible with the Quran and Sunnah as secondary legislation

Therefore, to construct the contemporary legislative through elections, it is first necessary to make the voter aware of its obligations and rights under Islamic law. Second, to elect their representatives through Islamic-affiliated political parties or on a non-party basis with candidates aware of their legislative limits prescribed by the Quran and Sunnah (J. J. Iqbal, 1984).

Mostly in the Arab World, the issue is even more perplexing. For instance, until 1952, Iraq, Jordan, and Egypt all practiced constitutional monarchies of the British kind, but Syria and Lebanon are republics designed after the French model (Najjar, 1958). Does it not give rise to confusion and conflict if not accompanied by the restatement in modern terms of the teachings of Islam by Muslim intellectuals? (Najjar, 1958). It makes Islamic countries like Western-type of political organizations adopted by Muslims. Since the opinions, attitudes, and thoughts of the majority of people determine and govern how a democracy functions. However, Muslims as a whole are more aware of how their values, culture, and beliefs conflict with those of a new and foreign system since they have a wider variety of cultural and religious perspectives. Islam is undergoing different severe changes in the region of "governmental organization" and political system. The Islamic Republic of Pakistan is a country that has a provision in its constitution stating that laws that do not follow the Holy Quran and Sunna (Muhammadan Traditions) are invalid (Government_of-pakistan, 1973). Syria proclaimed that the primary source of legislation will be Islamic law (Khadduri, 1951). "Other nations, like Saudi Arabia and Yemen, strictly enforce Quranic rules (Najjar, 1958).

**Citizenship and Ummah**

Is generally perceived The concept of citizenship perceived in Islam is that the Islamic State is made up of all Muslims and that citizenship and religion are the same. The citizen (believer) owes his loyalty primarily to and after Islam to his immediate social group (Najjar, 1958).

Recently, a Pakistani Political scientist disclosed that Najjar (1958) stated that

"Islam enjoins that the best in should rule and the best only be judged on Islamic cording to their faith and deeds. Only on this criterion of belief or of action does Islam recognize the categorization of human beings not on birth, language, appearance or geographic nearness"

Margoliouth continues by stating that citizenship is a question of faith in a society where the nation's religions are the same,

"Although we are apt to think of Islam as a religion, it is probable that the Prophet thought of a nation”

In a such like situation if we refer to the word ‘Umma- which means nation- the question arises here that who constitutes Umma. To meet this query, we must refer to the first-ever constitution-constitution of Medina by Prophet Muhammad (BPOH) issued on 1 A.H having 53 Articles. The Umma was described as "the followers, the Muslims, as well as those who reside in Medina" in the opening paragraph of the
Constitution of Madina. Its first and second sections are explained by Watt (1961);

“(1) This is a document from Muhammad the Prophet (governing the relations) between the believers and Muslims of Quraysh and Yathrib, and those who followed them and joined them and labored with them.
(2) They are one community (Umma) to the exclusion of all men.”

It establishes the view that Muslims alone do not constitute Umma and it includes others who
Live within the borders of the Islamic states. Public ruler who comes through political consultation or free elections- resulting in a democratic society- is the highest authority in the state but his delegated authority is subject to Sharia and legislative diligence if there is no straight reference or description in the Quran or Sunna. It means that no one in Ummah-including the head and consultation body- can ever act contrary to the limitations imposed by Quran and Sunnah which impose a direct restriction on Umma’s sovereignty.

Islamic State - a State or a Non-State Actor
In the modern world, political sovereignty in international law of a state means total control over its territory and internal affairs, and it excludes all outside powers by the concept of non-interference in the internal affairs of other countries(Vila, 2016). This principle of territorial integrity was recognized in the Peace of Westphalia in 1648 ending the thirty years war, among continental European states(Vila, 2016). A fresh surge of nationalism in Europe was sparked by the Peace of Westphalia. Due to the spread of European influence spread over the world, the Westphalian concept of sovereignty became a vital element of international law and the prevailing world order (Wickramasinghe, 2015).

Westphalian sovereignty consists of three aspects. Firstly, a sovereign state was made the symbol of the most powerful political unity. Secondly, all authority and control over its territory were declared the attribute of government only (known as territorial integrity). Thirdly, it lifted prior legal constraints on a's actions inside its borders (Mansbach, 2004). This changed the way Westphalian nations interacted with each other under these elements of statehood.

In an Islamic political state, there are three components to the Islamic political structure, namely: the Sharia; the Caliph; and the Ummah. Now if we turn to the situation in the Middle East with the proclamation of sovereignty and Caliphate by ISIS, it generates contrasting and competing views placing more challenges to the idea of sovereignty. The invasion of Iraq in 2003, which brought an end to decades of Sunni domination and brought in a Shiite administration, prepared the door for groups like the Kurds to assert their right to self-determination (Wickramasinghe, 2015). Because of this, the Islamic world is currently going through its version of the Thirty Years' War, which was fought between Protestants and Catholics to rule Europe and gave rise to the Westphalian system..”(Wickramasinghe, 2015).

The deep influence and control of religion upon international affairs can be seen on every informational platform: from the Israeli-Palestinian conflict to Al-Qaeda cells throughout the world to the impact of Evangelicalism on US politics (Wickramasinghe, 2015). Now if we turn to the political scenario of the Middle East, it is dominated by the Islamic State (ISIS). The political ideals of this group are transnational. ISIS maintains control over territory whose borders are determined by religion by recruiting members from across international borders and the world. They have requested the dissolution of the boundary between Syria and Iraq Caliphate in the territories and control 8 million Syrians and Iraqis, with about 400,000 of those under their control supporting the Islamic State(Wickramasinghe, 2015).

Abu Bakr al- Baghdadi- the ISIS leader- said in 2014;
‘Rush O Muslims to your state. It is your state. Syria is not for Syrians and Iraq is not for Iraqis. The land is for the Muslims, all Muslims’. 
Assuming the title of Caliph, Al-Baghdadi is assisted by two chief advisors, one for Syria and the other for Iraq. Each of them oversees 5-7 governors and nine councils, including the Leadership Council, the Shore Council, the Military Council, the Legal Counsel, the Fighters’ Assistance Council, the Financial Council, the Intelligence Council, the Security Council, and the Media Council (Wickramasinghe, 2015).

In the light of the above-mentioned facts, will ISIS be called an insurgency or a state-holding territory, the most important attribute of statehood? Under the norms of the Peace of Westphalia, ISIS constitutes an insurgency because

i) It does not claim territorial sovereignty.

ii) Its ideology stands in contrast to Westphalian sovereignty

iii) It doesn't want recognition as a state. Rather it wants recognition as being the only legitimate political entity on the planet

If we, for instance, admit the establishment and existence of ISIS, it makes the issue more politicized. ISIS is of the size of a small American state university, fielding no more than 30,000 with no air force or navy, no reliable tax base, or any of the other resources found in even the smallest and most fragile of nations and no single and formal recognition by any State across the globe (Rothkopf, 2014). Why couldn't the U.S. beat an army the size of a junior college though it took the U.S. only three and a half years to defeat the Axis in World War II? When asked about the time frame to curb and defeat the threat posed by ISIS, Admiral John Kirby of the U.S.- the spokesperson for the most powerful military force the world has ever known told that it might take 5 years, 7 years, or even more (Rothkopf, 2014). It is evident from the 15-year war against the Taliban that fighting insurgencies is challenging. The situation deteriorates further when the claimed insurgency is not fighting in a pure guerilla-style like Al Qaeda and the Taliban in Afghanistan but claim and hold territory, build and maintain supply chains, and protect illicit oil shipments like ISIS - all in the effort to construct a state (Rothkopf, 2014).

ISIS opposes state sovereignty because it is a man-made law that isolates Muslims from one another and forces them to be tied by artificial borders; as a result, acknowledging state sovereignty is akin to showing respect for it (Wickramasinghe, 2015). Hakim al-Muteiri during a talk on the Al Jazeera program “Sharia and Life” in 2012 disclosed that

‘The house of Islam is one, and the legal rulings are one. This map that was imposed by Sykes-Picot and imposed by the Western occupation is of no consideration legally’.

Aside from ISIS, several other organizations throughout the world are unhappy with present state borders and contest them, but not the standards of sovereignty. ISIS, in contrast, opposes not just the idea of boundaries but also the present borders as well (Wickramasinghe, 2015). He may be referring to the map circulating on the internet that purports to depict the vision of ISIS of an Islamic Caliphate (Gunter, 2015).

“There may be a perception that other governments have some kind of sovereignty outside of the borders shown on the map, but any sovereignty that interferes with territory considered to have traditionally belonged to Muslims would be invalid.” (Wickramasinghe, 2015).

ISIS’s view of the sovereign state is intriguingly both pre-and post-Westphalian in that it demands to be recognized as a sovereign state, while it is seeking to create a new world order erasing political borders and territorial lines be based on religious identity with a community of people bound by religious values (Wickramasinghe, 2015). Demolishing boundaries between Syria and Iraq by ISIS signifies borders as an offensive created as a result of the Sykes-Picot Agreement 1916 (Marx, 2012) between Britain and France with the assent of imperial Russia. It was a secret agreement for the dismemberment of the Ottoman Empire dividing Turkish-held Iraq, Syria, Lebanon, and Palestine into various French- and British-administered areas (Wickramasinghe, 2015).
Conclusion
In an Islamic state, sovereignty belongs to Allah and Allah is the only one who rules which is viewed in the form of divine laws and Jurisprudence. The interpretation of this rule of sovereignty as that there is no concept of people’s sovereignty in Islam is not correct because Allah cannot be an immediate ruler in the political connotation. Misrepresentation due to misunderstandings and misinterpretations among Muslim academics as well as misquotations by Western writers. Moreover, there is an agreement of opinion among all Muslim scholars on Umma’s sovereignty in Islam yet this sovereignty cannot go beyond the limit of Sharia. This concept of sovereignty builds various absolute divine rules and gives the people space in the Islamic state to exercise their power over their political life, policy, and polity as well. It is not God but God’s law that provides the basis of the state (Khadduri, 2006). Maulana Abdul Ala Maudood most properly used the term “the democracy” by which he characterized the Medinan democratic means of arriving at decisions. According to Smith (1943), a country should have

"none of this moder European or American democracy, this Bolshevik regimentation, this fascist apotheosis, this Turkish revolt from Islam; the only state for Muslims . . . is the Islamic Theocracy.”

This is also close to Ayatollah Ruhollah Khomeini’s view which claims that “true democracy” means the representation of the people by the ‘ulama”. With the death of Muhammad Rashid Rida of Egypt, no Muslim thinker of any repute has agitated for the restoration of the Caliphate- a balancing act of the autonomy of Islam and external pressure for modernism.

In the international community, the nations must design their constitutions and laws in the framework of their own sovereignty. The prevailing view today is that the Caliphate claimed by ISIS, slows down the customary world order and the system of states as it exists today. Calling it a state is to give it a false air of legitimacy, though its claim seems similar to the one experienced by Europe during the Middle Ages, in which the church ruled politically in the name of God. The victory over ISIS in Syria might end up empowering the brutal regime of President Bashar al-Assad and in Iraq, the only result may be the birth of a Shiite-led regime in Baghdad again- the main reason for the half-hearted effort to curb ISIS.

References


An Empirical Study on Gender Based Discrimination at Pakistani Workplaces: Determination of the Causes of Gender Based Discrimination in Pakistan's Private Service Sector Workplaces

*Sunbul Naeem Cheema*, Ph.D. Scholar, The Islamia University, Bahawalpur, Pakistan
*Warda Najeeb Jamal*, Assistant Professor, The Islamia University, Bahawalpur, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email address: sunbulnaeemcheema@gmail.com

Purpose: Gender-based discrimination in the workplace in the private service sector is well known all over the world phenomenon, but in developing states like Pakistan the issue is comparatively high. The purpose of this paper is to determine the causes and factors of Gender-based discrimination in the private service sector workplaces in Pakistan.

**Design/Methodology/Approach:** The quantitative method was used. Data was collected through a structured questionnaire. The population of the research is the employees of the private service sector of Pakistan. The sample size was 120 (N=120). Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) software is used for analysis.

**Findings:** In this study, it is investigated that Unequal treatment of employees, favoritism, and educational qualification (Independent Variables) are causes of Gender-based discrimination (dependent variable), and this relationship is mediated by the human resource department’s rules and policies, unfortunately, the role of HR policies and the department is not satisfactory in the private service sector of Pakistan.

**Implications:** Managers, policymakers, and educationists must reassess their dependence on stereotypical ideas of women as women become an increasingly important component of the workforce.

**Originality/Value:** The paper explores the factors that contribute to gender-based discrimination and uses HR rules as a unique mediator between these factors and prejudice.

©2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-4.0


**Introduction**
Although gender-based discrimination and gender bias in the workplace in the private service industry are global phenomena, they are more prevalent in developing countries. Since Pakistan is a developing
country, employees there frequently deal with unfair treatment at work from both the employer and the HR division. As a result, the HR division is the primary division in the commercial service sector that is held accountable for gender-based discrimination. Additionally, compared to male employees, women workers in Pakistan's private service sector are denied their rights. The primary obstacles to workplace equality are the HR department's and the organization's leaders' failure to put policies, rules, and laws into practice. Women workers have typically been treated unfairly when it comes to hiring, compensation determination, and advancement. The policies designed to promote equality in the workplace must be put into practice immediately. The problem of gender discrimination affects all countries, not only those in developing nations. Similar to how women in various professions are treated unequally in urban and rural areas.

Pakistan is an underdeveloped state and working women here have to face a lot of complexities due to the patriarchal society and many other reasons (Sadruddin, 2013). The women in the workplace have to bear unequal treatment not only from the side of male employers but also from female employers. It is because women are not exploited only from the male side but also from the women's side. Hence the deprivation of the women is due to the power factor and not due to the element of male dominancy only. On the other side, the poor policy formation by the HR department enhances the problems of women in the private service sector of Pakistan. Women experience disadvantages such as poor pay, few benefits, and privileges, slim prospects of advancement, sexual harassment at work, etc. (Moss, 2022).

Pakistan's private service industry makes a significant contribution to the country's economy. The private service industry employs the majority of our labor force and paid population. Therefore, the private service sector, which includes institutions of higher learning, hospitals, the service sector (which includes banking and insurance), private service enterprises, etc., plays a significant part in Pakistan's growth and prosperity. In Pakistan's private services sector, millions of people are employed. Additionally, any form of discrimination against either male or female employees of a private company leads to subpar work from those individuals, which has a significant impact on the department's output (Mumtaz, 2003).

**Discrimination Based on Gender is a Global Issue**

It is a global issue that gender-based prejudice and discrimination against women exist in both developed and developing nations. The affluent nations of the world are also drafting laws that discriminate against women's equal rights in several spheres of the economy. Similar to this, one of the typical examples of discrimination against women is workplace inequality in the private sector of services, which is a serious injustice to women (Agarwal, 1994). However, due to the passage of pro-women laws and increased public awareness of women's rights, there are fewer inequities against women in industrialized countries than in developing and poor ones. Due to the meddling of the men, the movement for women's rights evolved and grew in strength. But in the modern-day, the awareness campaign for women's rights is at its height (Rizvi, 2008).

The first time that women were included in the private service sector was during World War-I when women had to work in the private service sector instead of men workers and employees because the majority of the men employees headed towards the war field. However, after World War One, when the men returned from the battlefield, the women had to deal with prejudice and unfair treatment because the men were unemployed. In this way, for the first time in history, discrimination against female workers and employees began after World War I. Here, the women launched their fight for survival at work in the private services industry. Prejudice will eventually be used on a global scale. To improve the working conditions for women, women must create several organizations and non-governmental organizations (NGOs) (Flood, 2011).

**Gender-based Discrimination towards Women in Pakistan's Private Service Sector**

One of the major industries in Pakistan's economy that makes a significant contribution to its GDP is the
private services sector. The primary private service organizations where gender discrimination is practiced are banks, insurance firms, private service corporations, etc. And this is detrimental to Pakistan's economy's growth and development. Religious, educational, social, and political factors all play a role in Pakistan's private service sector's gender discrimination. Men are the predominant gender in Pakistani society, which is patriarchal (Sharif et al., 2021). As a result, gender inequality and discrimination against women are widespread in Pakistan's private service industry (Randeree, 2009).

Similar to this, education and a person's background—whether rural or urban—are the key factors that affect gender bias in the workplace in Pakistan's private service industry. Even if they receive their education from the same institutions as their male counterparts, female employees nonetheless receive unequal treatment. When determining pay, bonuses, and promotions, such female employees are not given precedence. Women, therefore, keep their distance from male workers and employees. That's why: Men make up the majority of employees and business owners in Pakistan's private service industry. As a result of their preference for male employees, male employers create policies and procedures that are favorable to male employees and workers (Chaudhry, 2009).

**Gender-based Discrimination and HR Policies**

In the private service sector of any state, there is a direct correlation between gender-based prejudice, discrimination, and human resource department policies. It is thus because the human resources department is the main department in charge of selecting, hiring, promoting, and paying employees and workers (Syed, 2008). There is a potential that the human resources department will favor one gender over another. Due to several factors, the human resources department acts unfairly towards its employees while making decisions about their pay, commission, and advancement. As a result, the human resource department plays a significant influence in the presence or absence of gender-based discrimination at work in Pakistan's private service industry (Özbilgin, 2012).

Ironically, when someone in a developing society like Pakistan discusses discrimination based on gender, it is assumed that they are discussing the unfair treatment of women in the workplace in the private service sector. In contrast, gender-based discrimination is a word that is frequently used to refer to both genders. But because there is such a high level of discrimination and inequality against women, this phrase is frequently used to describe the distinctive behavior of women in Pakistan's private service industry. Pakistan is a patriarchal society, thus the reason. Men also receive preferential treatment in all departments and economic sectors, following the "the majority is the authority idea" (Greig, 2000).

In Pakistan's private service sector, the working atmosphere has altered somewhat in the modern era. In Pakistan's private service sector, numerous laws and regulations have been passed since 2010 to ensure that women are treated equally at work. Legislation has been passed to protect women from discrimination, harassment, and other offensive behavior (Nayab et al., 2021). The situation of women in the workplace has improved since these laws were passed, but there is still a significant wage difference between men and women in Pakistan's private service industry. The final location where laws for the benefit of women will be put into effect is the human resources department. Since women make up half of Pakistan's population, gender disparities will harm the country's development and prosperity (Bielby, 2000).
Statistics of Women's Employment in Pakistan

Problem Statement
In Pakistan's private service sector, gender-based workplace discrimination is a major issue. Due to various factors, especially women must deal with unfair treatment at work. The unfairness and discrimination against women are harming Pakistan's progress and development, which ultimately has a significant negative impact on the nation's economy. Given that nearly half of Pakistan's population is female, injustices and inequities affecting women would have an impact on the country's level of prosperity. It is imperative that the government, along with the heads of commercial service organizations, concentrate on putting an end to this discrimination against women in the workplace. To control gender-based discrimination in the workplace, the Human Resources department and regulations are crucial.

Significance of the Study
This study is very helpful in understanding the existing discrimination and biases against women that exist in several facets of the private service sector. Following the completion of this study, it will be simple to comprehend the causes, consequences, and recommendations for resolving the issue of gender discrimination in Pakistan's private service industry. This study helps government policymakers comprehend the major problem of gender-based discrimination and allows them to adjust their policies to meet the needs of the time. It also helps private service sector administration and HR departments. The gender-based discrimination issues in Pakistan's private service industry have received relatively

Source: Statistics Bureau of Pakistan

### Table 20: Percentage Distribution of Employed Persons 10 Years of Age and Over by Major Industry Division, Sex and Area 2013-14

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major Industry Division</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ALL AREAS</td>
<td>RURAL</td>
<td>URBAN</td>
<td>ALL AREAS</td>
<td>RURAL</td>
<td>URBAN</td>
<td>ALL AREAS</td>
<td>RURAL</td>
<td>URBAN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture, Forestry, and Fishing</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>76.67</td>
<td>33.33</td>
<td>69.13</td>
<td>49.24</td>
<td>19.89</td>
<td>30.87</td>
<td>27.43</td>
<td>3.43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mining and Quarrying</td>
<td>43.48</td>
<td>26.22</td>
<td>17.26</td>
<td>41.71</td>
<td>24.87</td>
<td>16.84</td>
<td>1.76</td>
<td>1.35</td>
<td>0.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>14.16</td>
<td>11.28</td>
<td>2.88</td>
<td>6.69</td>
<td>4.86</td>
<td>1.83</td>
<td>7.48</td>
<td>6.42</td>
<td>1.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electricity, Gas, Steam and Air Conditioning Supply</td>
<td>0.48</td>
<td>0.48</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.20</td>
<td>0.20</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.28</td>
<td>0.28</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water Supply; Sewerage, Waste Management &amp; Remediation Activity</td>
<td>0.30</td>
<td>0.28</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.19</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction</td>
<td>7.33</td>
<td>7.25</td>
<td>0.08</td>
<td>4.92</td>
<td>4.87</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>2.41</td>
<td>2.39</td>
<td>0.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wholesale and Retail Trade, Repair</td>
<td>14.68</td>
<td>14.20</td>
<td>0.47</td>
<td>6.09</td>
<td>6.06</td>
<td>0.03</td>
<td>8.40</td>
<td>8.31</td>
<td>0.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation, Storage</td>
<td>5.01</td>
<td>4.98</td>
<td>0.03</td>
<td>2.86</td>
<td>2.84</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>3.16</td>
<td>3.14</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accommodation and Food Services</td>
<td>1.57</td>
<td>1.53</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>0.64</td>
<td>0.62</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>0.93</td>
<td>0.91</td>
<td>0.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information and Communication</td>
<td>0.44</td>
<td>0.43</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.34</td>
<td>0.33</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial and Insurance Activities</td>
<td>0.47</td>
<td>0.46</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.36</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Real Estate Activities</td>
<td>0.33</td>
<td>0.32</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0.09</td>
<td>0.09</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.23</td>
<td>0.23</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional, Scientific and Technical Activities</td>
<td>0.44</td>
<td>0.42</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>0.15</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.28</td>
<td>0.27</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administrative and Support Service Activities</td>
<td>0.50</td>
<td>0.49</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0.19</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.31</td>
<td>0.31</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Administration and Defence</td>
<td>2.33</td>
<td>2.27</td>
<td>0.06</td>
<td>1.93</td>
<td>1.92</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>1.39</td>
<td>1.35</td>
<td>0.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compulsory Social Security</td>
<td>3.56</td>
<td>3.27</td>
<td>1.29</td>
<td>1.86</td>
<td>1.41</td>
<td>0.45</td>
<td>1.70</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td>0.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Health and Social Work</td>
<td>1.40</td>
<td>1.03</td>
<td>0.37</td>
<td>0.63</td>
<td>0.45</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td>0.58</td>
<td>0.19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arts, Entertainment &amp; Recreation</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>0.15</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0.09</td>
<td>0.08</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0.07</td>
<td>0.07</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Service Activities</td>
<td>2.10</td>
<td>1.92</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td>1.19</td>
<td>1.13</td>
<td>0.07</td>
<td>0.92</td>
<td>0.79</td>
<td>0.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Activities of Households as Employers; Undifferentiated Goods &amp; Services - Producing Activities</td>
<td>1.15</td>
<td>0.85</td>
<td>0.30</td>
<td>0.38</td>
<td>0.15</td>
<td>0.23</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td>0.30</td>
<td>0.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Activities Extraterritorial Organizations and Bodies</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
little prior academic attention, making this study unusual. As a result, the research hole that existed before this research endeavor has been filled by the current study.

**Research Questions**

1- What are the many manifestations of discrimination against women at work in Pakistan's private service industry?
2- In Pakistan's private service sector, what part does the HR department play in gender-based workplace discrimination?

**The Objective of the Study**

The goal of the current study is to learn more about the gender-based discrimination, gender bias, and gender discrimination that occurs at work in Pakistan's commercial service sector as a result of the HR department's subpar policies, rules, and regulations. Finding out the many manifestations of gender-based discrimination in the workplace and the part played by the HR department in the unfair treatment of a certain gender is another one of the research's primary goals.

**Literature Review**

This section of the study describes the prior research of the academics that is pertinent to our topic and its variables. Two distinct manifestations of gender bias are gender-based discrimination in the public and commercial sectors. In contrast to the public sector, there are separate rules and regulations governing employee hiring and benefits. Policies in the private service sector are frequently regarded as being more strict than those in the government or semi-government sectors. This is the rationale behind why most people choose to work in the public sector. Because there are fewer opportunities for people to choose alternative employment, among other things, there is a greater level of deprivation among employees in Pakistan's private service sector (Connell, 2010).

According to their particular gender, people are denied and treated unfairly. The majority of victims of gender discrimination at work are women who work in Pakistan's private service industry. Since women are less focused on their careers, firms prefer to hire them so they may reduce their compensation costs. Similar to males, women are content with the low pay, and hiring more women can save employers a tonne of money. Male workers and employees, on the other hand, are career-focused and want high remuneration. For a pay increase and a faster promotion, they also protest and go on strikes. Women, on the other hand, typically do not give these matters any thought. As a result, Pakistan's private service sector treats women less favorably than men in the workplace (Jacobs, 1996).

Various tactics are used by management or administration to treat women less favorably than men in the workplace. The organization's decision-making process occasionally excludes female personnel. When making such decisions, though, their peers participate. One of the most significant discriminations against women workers in the modern business environment is this. The decisions made for the benefit of the corporation are frequently kept a secret from the female employees in a similar manner. Given that they are an integral component of the business, women employees should be informed of company happenings. There are significant disparities and injustices against women in Pakistan's private service sector because they purposefully keep them in the dark about the company's decision-making process.

In certain situations, men are treated differently. When performing their jobs at the workplace, they have occasionally encountered unfairness. The private service sector in developing nations like Pakistan occasionally benefits women. In Pakistan's private service sector, there is no quota system for men and women, therefore business owners hire staff based on their preferences. In this way, they occasionally favor hiring women over men, which is one of the ways that men face discrimination. However, it only occurs very seldom. The management's discrimination and inequities frequently target female employees and workers (Ridgeway, 2004). Inequalities in the workplace in the private service sector are a result of biological and cultural variables (Akbar et al., 2022). Both genders are unable to perform a particular
task due to their biological differences in shape. In the context of Pakistani society, several occupations were viewed as going against social standards, but now women are doing these vocations, although in small numbers, such as pilots and army officers (Smith, 2002).

On the other hand, discriminatory behavior towards women in the workplace in Pakistan is largely a result of the human resources department's rules. In the private service industry of Pakistan, there are frequently no definite norms and laws governing employee hiring, benefits, and privileges. Most often, women are denied their fundamental rights in private service businesses. There is a law allowing for legal women's leave in Pakistan's public and private service sectors, as women do occasionally need to take time off to give birth. Instead of this reality, however, female workers frequently lack this fundamental right. One of the main differences between men and women at work is this (Childs, 2012).

Working women in Pakistan's private service industry must contend with a variety of injustices daily. The main disparities that contemporary women face at work in Pakistan's private service sector include lower pay than their male coworkers, fewer benefits, bonuses, and commissions, preferential treatment of men over women during promotions, and a lack of consultation with female employees during decision-making. Women in Pakistan's private service industry face discrimination at work, which is caused by both the top management and the human resources division (Trentham, 1998).

The disparity between men and women at work in Pakistan's private service sector is also significantly influenced by another important issue. For instance, a male organization's or department's head of human resources' preference for male candidates for promotions and high wages is based on their shared gender. In rare instances, the male head of the company or human resource department prefers the opposite gender for promotion and a decent wage since they get along well with each other. When it comes to hiring, choosing, paying, promoting, and providing benefits to male and female employees and workers in the private service sector, the role of the company's top management and the preference of the human resources department are very important factors to consider (Sipe, 2009).

Methodology
The primary data collection strategy is employed in this study, which is founded on a quantitative approach to research. An organized questionnaire was used to collect the data. In addition, the population of the study includes those who work for private service providers in Pakistan, including educational institutions, hospitals, banks, insurance corporations, and private service firms. The study uses a sample of 120 people.

Variables
Unequal treatment of employees, favoritism, and educational qualification are independent variables. Gender-based discrimination is the dependent variable in the current study. Mediating Factor is the human resource department’s rules and policies are the key mediating factors that are responsible for gender-based discrimination in the workplace in the private service sector of Pakistan.

Data Analysis and Interpretation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>SDA (%)</th>
<th>DA (%)</th>
<th>DKn (%)</th>
<th>A (%)</th>
<th>SA (%)</th>
<th>M (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Do you think male coworkers advance more quickly in their careers than</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>9.8</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>21.5</td>
<td>62.4</td>
<td>3.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>female coworkers do at your place of employment?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do you think that male and female employees with the same qualifications</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>16.0</td>
<td>03.0</td>
<td>21.3</td>
<td>58.0</td>
<td>3.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>receive remuneration that is different from that of the other?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Would you say your gender has affected your chances of</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>55.8</td>
<td>26.7</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
getting a promotion in your current job?
Do you believe you and your male coworkers are treated similarly by your boss at work?
Have you ever been a victim of job discrimination based on gender?
Do you think any action is being taken to promote gender equality?
A hidden barrier that prevents women from advancing in their careers is frequently referred to as the "glass ceiling."
How much do you believe there is a glass ceiling at work?
Are there equal professional growth chances for men and women at work?
Do women have to put in more effort at work to advance to the same status as their male counterparts?
Do you believe that salaries for male and female employees are set differently at your company?
Do you think that when it comes to promotions, men employees have received preferential treatment?
Are the rules and regulations created by the human resources department the main cause of the injustice and disparities among employees in the private service sector's workplaces?
Do you believe that workplace inequality is less pronounced in organizations like these where women lead the human resources division?
Do you believe that in businesses like these where men dominate the human resources sector, there are more workplace inequalities?
Do you believe that the human resource department treats men and women differently when it comes to hiring and selection even when they both have the same educational background?
In the human resources department, there is a culture of partiality/Favoratism
Although the human resources department has failed to put equal pay for equal work and promotion guidelines into practice, why is that?
In terms of pay and promotion, the human resources department has purposefully broken these rules.

**Interpretation of Results**
The numbers are displayed as percentages, and the percentage with the highest value is taken as the primary response to a given query. As a result, the majority of respondents stated that they were only very rarely treated equally at work, while a minority stated that they were treated equally in Pakistan's private service sector. This conclusion was reached after analyzing the data that had been gathered. In Pakistan's private service industry, the vast majority of respondents claimed that they are not treated fairly at work. In addition, the majority of female respondents stated that male coworkers receive promotions more quickly than female workers. According to the data gathered, a significant portion of respondents stated that pay disparities between men and women in the workplace exist and are a major issue for employees. Many of the respondents claimed that one of the main factors influencing promotion in Pakistan's private service sector is gender. In addition, while a minority of respondents believed the opposite, the majority of respondents claimed that they had experienced discriminatory treatment at work. However, the majority of respondents claimed that they had never observed any
action taken to promote equality among workers. The majority of respondents in a different situation, however, claimed that there are many obstacles standing in the way of women's advancement and promotion inside the business. Furthermore, a large majority of respondents in the data that was gathered and later interpreted stated that they thought opportunities for equal professional advancement for men and women in the workplace were extremely rare. A sizable number of those polled claimed that to be promoted to the same level, female employees had to put in more effort than their male counterparts. Additionally, a large majority of the respondents stated that it is extremely unlikely that men and women will be treated equally in the business when determining their salaries. According to the data gathered, the majority of the respondents claimed that preference is commonly provided for promotions based on gender. Additionally, the vast majority of respondents believe that the human resources department creates rules and policies that lead to injustice and inequalities. In a similar vein, the vast majority of respondents concur that there are fewer workplace inequalities when women hold leadership positions in the human resources department. The minority, however, disagrees with this point of view. The majority of respondents claimed that there is more inequality in the workplace where men dominate the human resources field. On the other hand, the majority of responders who have the same educational background are treated unfairly, including both men and women. Similar to the previous statement, the majority of respondents claimed that the human resources division has a culture of partiality. Finally, even though the human resource department fails to put the rules and regulations into effect, the majority of respondents said that there are equal rules and regulations. The majority of respondents claimed that the human resources department did not abide by the laws establishing equal rights for men and women.

Research Findings
In terms of gender-based discrimination at work, this paper details the actual reality that exists in Pakistan's private service sector. As a result of the human resources department's neglect, the study's findings indicate that there are several sorts of injustices and inequities that primarily affect women who work in Pakistan's private service industry. From the time a candidate is hired until they are promoted or retire, there are disparities or injustices present. The majority of instances of gender discrimination, also known as gender-based discrimination, involve bias and injustice directed against female employees of private service companies.

Furthermore, the study's findings indicate that the human resources division is typically held accountable for any disparities between female employees and workers within a private sector business. The fundamental causes of employment disparities for women are their educational background, their employer's preference for hiring women, the culture of favoring, societal pressure, social barriers, and their membership in a certain gender, area, religion, or socioeconomic class. Additionally, one of the main causes of unfairness and inequality among female employees is the HR department's failure to follow the policies and regulations of a business. There are occasional instances where male employees are treated unfairly and unequally, but these are extremely rare. Female employees are not treated equally when compensation and commission are set, according to the data gathered and the study's subsequent findings. It is a well-known fact that female employees are less focused on their careers and are more willing to accept lower pay than male employees. In light of the information gathered for this study, it can therefore be said that employers favor hiring men over women when it comes to commission and compensation rates. Additionally, when it comes to choosing which employees will be promoted, men are given preference. This situation describes how Pakistan's private service sector treats its female employees and workers unfairly at work.

Discussion
In developing nations like Pakistan, prejudice against women is a problem. Equal opportunities are not afforded to male and female employees and workers. Due to same-gender attraction and social influence, this has occurred. Due to the same gender attraction factor, preference is given because the majority of huge organization owners and employers are men. There are extremely few female business owners, and the majority of people in Pakistan's private services industry believe that men hold the majority of the country's leadership positions. The same findings were drawn from the study about the
influence of culture, according to Farah Yasmin's (2013) investigation on the question of whether gender discrimination is a myth or the reality regarding women's standing in Pakistan. According to the research, one of the key factors contributing to gender inequality and workplace discrimination against women employees in Pakistan's private service sector is the culture of male dominance or influence. Similarly, a recent study discovered that women are not primarily career-oriented due to domestic issues. As a result of marriage, women frequently have to relocate. They frequently end up having to quit their employment as a result. After marriage, men do not, on the other hand, relocate from one location to another.

Women's access to equal chances and amenities at work in Pakistan's private service sector is thus being hampered by a gender-specific issue. Similar to this, Woods (1994) did research on the subject of Gender Discrimination and Sexual Harassment as Experienced by Hospitality-Industry Managers; this study discussed the connection between women's domestic issues and disparities among women in the workplace. The results of the current and prior studies indicate that women experience issues at work because of domestic issues as well as because they are women.

In a company, the human resources division is seen to be in charge of creating the disparities that exist between men and women in the private service sector of Pakistan. For hiring, selecting, setting salaries, and promoting people, the human resources department develops policies, rules, and regulations. The amount of inequality between the employees of both genders will therefore increase if the human resources department creates one policy for men and another for women.

Additionally, male employees and workers are preferred over female employees when it comes to promotions and the calculation of bonuses and other benefits in the private service sector. This is one of the most severe forms of discrimination against female workers. For the organization's progress and the welfare of the state, this type of culture must be eradicated from the workplace. Unfairness when it comes to wage, bonus, and promotion determination breeds a feeling of inferiority among female employees, which is bad for private service organizations.

Women employees are treated differently than men employees, and this behavior even occurs in the presence of both female and male organizational leaders. Because having a male leader in an organization is not the only factor contributing to the injustice toward women; power is also a factor. When a woman assumes leadership, her attitude changes, as do the executives of private service companies. Gender stereotypes are still prevalent and actively contribute to workplace discrimination, according to a study done in the past (Heilman, 2008).

In Pakistan's private service sector, according to Industrial and Organizational Psychology, women are primarily denied their legal entitlements at work because of issues with gender, social pressures, and favoritism. Consequently, the rules and regulations about women's empowerment and gender equality should be put into place to end the discrimination against women.

**A Path Forward**
The treatment of women should be humane. Both women and men employees have the same potential. In contrast, research indicates that female employees are more devoted to their jobs than male employees in some instances and that in some instances, women work more conscientiously. Since women have distinct physical characteristics and genders than males, they cannot be treated differently. Because women are now considered to be equal members of society with men and have the same rights, leaders of the business sector should put gender equality laws into practice. In Pakistan's private service industry, gender-based workplace discrimination is a problem that the government should take seriously. For women to be treated equally at work in Pakistan's private service industry, we must first treat them as human beings.
Conclusion

Women are not often career-oriented due to household issues, according to the current study. As a result of marriage, women frequently have to relocate. They frequently end up having to quit their employment as a result. After marriage, men do not, on the other hand, relocate from one location to another. Therefore, barriers to equal chances and facilities for women at work in Pakistan's private service sector are being caused by gender-specific issues. Similar to this, (Woods, 1994) researched the subject of Gender Discrimination and Sexual Harassment as Experienced by Hospitality Industry Managers; this study discussed the connection between women's domestic issues and disparities among women in the workplace. HR department’s rules and policies are the key mediating factor, which is responsible for gender-based discrimination in the workplace in the private service sector of Pakistan. So, Studies from the past and present can be used to conclude that women's challenges at work are caused by both domestic issues and by belonging to a particular gender.

References


Farah, Y.B. (2013). Gender Discrimination: A myth or truth Women's status in Pakistan, 88-97


Classification Modelling: A Case Study of Breast Cancer Patients of Islamabad

Aansa Abbas, Assistant Professor, Government Associate College for women, Gawalmandi, Rawalpindi, Pakistan
*Muhammad Zakria, Associate professor, Department of Statistics, Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad, Pakistan
Muhammad Kashif, Lecturer, Department of Mathematics & Statistics, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email: zakria@aiou.edu.pk

ARTICLE DETAILS

Revised format: May 2022
Available Online: June 2022

Keywords
Logistic regression, Discriminant Analysis, Mastectomy, Breast-Conserving Surgery, Classification

JEL Classification C1, C19

ABSTRACT

Purpose: The rate of breast cancer in Pakistan is the highest among all other Asian countries and all other types of cancer. The foremost treatment for breast cancer patients of stage 2 and stage 3 is surgery. The main types of surgery in this era are Mastectomy and Breast Conservative surgery. The decision about the type of surgery depends on demographic and clinical factors.

Approach: In this study, the seven characteristics have been considered. A purposive sample of 365 breast cancer patients was collected from the two main hospitals in Islamabad. The foremost objective of this study was to classify each breast cancer patient regarding surgery type based on significant explanatory characteristics. The binary logistics regression and discriminant analysis techniques were used and the significance of each parameter was tested.

Findings: The main effects i.e., age, tumor size, Estrogen Receptor, and Progesterone Receptor were found to be significant with some diverse probabilities and all two-factor interactions were found to be non-significant. The sensitivity of logistic regression and discriminant analysis is almost the same i.e., 93.1% and 92.8% respectively whereas the specificity of these two techniques is also almost the same i.e., 70.8% and 71.9% respectively. The overall actual correct classify rate and Apparent error rate of both these techniques are found to be 87.7% and 12.3% respectively.

Implications: In brief, it was deducted that the Tumor size stage is the most imperative characteristic among other significant characteristics in discriminating between two types of surgery.

© 2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-4.0


Introduction
Cancer is a disease due to the uncontrolled growth of abnormal cells in the body. A cancerous tumor is
malignant, meaning it can grow and expand to other parts of the body whereas the term breast cancer refers to a malignant tumor that has spread from cells in the breast tissue resulting in a lump or mass (NCI’s Dictionary of Cancer Terms, 2015). According to the American Cancer Society Report (2021) in the US, the incidence of new breast cancer cases was approximately 281,550 and there were 43,600 deaths in 2021.

World Health Organization Report (2021) revealed that the new breast cancer cases during 2020 were approximately 2.3 million worldwide. About 7 lac patients die from breast cancer. The incidence of breast cancer was highest among all other cancers and was the 5th leading cause of cancer mortality with the death of 3.5 lac. According to World Health Organization Report (2021), in Asia, the incidence of breast cancer was second-highest among all other cancer types and recorded 1 million cases in 2020. In a developed country, the survival of at least 5 years after diagnosis was approximately 90% whereas, in the developing world, it was 40% only. It indicates that its effects are severe in developing countries due to late diagnosis and lack of resources and education. In Pakistan, the incidence and mortality of breast cancer were at the top among all other cancers and in any other Asian country. According to World Health Organization Report (2021) reported that the incidence of new cases was approximately 26 thousand in 2020 and approximately 14 thousand deaths were due to breast cancer. It is a severe public health issue and creates financial problems for families in Pakistan.

There are two rudimentary types of surgeries in practice for the management of breast cancer patients i.e., Mastectomy and Breast Conservative Surgery. The main purpose of said treatments is the removal of the tumor either by removing the whole breast i.e., Mastectomy (MX), or by an attempt to maintain the breast without compromising survival i.e., Breast Conservative Surgery (BCS). The decision between Mastectomy and Breast Conservative Surgery depends on many factors like Age, Tumor size, Hormone Receptors, etc. Several studies have been conducted in the medical field and analyzed for classification purposes. Moiel et al. (2019) conducted a study to investigate the significant factors using logistic regression. It was concluded that Mastectomy was preferred on the base of Tumor size. Al-Gaithy et al. (2019) conducted a retrospective study of 335 non-Saudi female, breast cancer patients who underwent Mastectomy or BCS. Among 335 patients 62.4% went under Mastectomy and 37.6% underwent BCS. It was concluded from the multivariate logistic regression analysis that neoadjuvant chemotherapy, higher tumor stage, and positive HER2 were significantly correlated with Mastectomy but Estrogen and Progesterone receptor status have a non-significant effect on the decision of the type of surgery. Elgohari (2017) conducted a study on 344 patients for the classification of anemic and non-anemic children with chronic kidney disease. Logistic regression and discriminant analysis were used to examine the sensitivity and specificity.

The study illustrated that discriminant analysis performed better than logistic Regression in the accuracy of prediction. The proposed model would help in deciding the type of surgery for the treatment of breast cancer patients. Furthermore, the significance of each characteristic needs to be discussed. Liong and Foo (2013) used five different types of datasets to compare the discriminant analysis and logistic regression. The result of the dataset violating multivariate normality assumption not badly shows that discriminant analysis correctly classified 93% of cases while logistic regression classifies 92% of cases. In all other datasets, the predictive accuracy of logistic regression was better than discriminant analysis. Balogun et al. (2015) studied 184 expectant Nigerian mothers for the classification of the mode of delivery. A total of 5 characteristics of the expectant mother were used as independent variables. The natural birth and caesarian section were considered to be the binary response variable. Two statistical techniques logistic regression and discriminant analysis were compared for said purpose. It was concluded that the classification accuracy of logistic regression was 65.8% while for discriminant analysis it was 64.7%.

It was concluded that due to violation of assumption, logistic regression should be preferred. Shayan et al. (2015) examined 243 patients of chemotherapy and radiotherapy in the ward of Shiraz Namazee
The main issue of this study was to classify the patient having or not having diabetes. The seven independent variables and diabetic level as the dependent variable for each patient were recorded. The discriminant analysis and logistic regression analysis techniques were used for said purpose. The linear discriminant analysis correctly classified 84% while logistic regression correctly classified 95.6%.

The logistic regression performed better than the discriminant analysis. Zangmo and Tiensuwan (2018) analyzed the case of cancer patients with a dependent variable as a patient’s status. The data of 3013 cancer patients with 1657 females and 1356 males were collected from the record section of JDWNRH. The main aim of this study was to apply a logistic regression model to identify the variables associated with cancer patients' last status for all cancer patients and individual gender. The significant interaction between independent variables was also incorporated into the model. Moreover, the logistic regression and discriminant analysis techniques of classification are not only appropriate for breast cancer patients or clinical studies, but it is also equally good for any type of real-life phenomena studies having binary response variable under consideration and classification. Few of them are reported here for consideration and clarity. Montgomery et al. (1987) examined the case of dairy cows.

The statistical techniques discriminant analysis and logistic regression were used. The overall predictive accuracy of logistic regression was 83.2% while the predictive accuracy of discriminant analysis was 94.2%. It was concluded that logistic regression should be preferred as it is robust while discriminant analysis has assumptions that are rarely met in a real-world situation. Keeping in view the above-mentioned classification work, it has been noted that only the main effects in logistic regression have been studied and discussed whereas the significant interaction effects have their importance in classification. In addition, most studies belong to foreign countries ‘contexts. However, insufficient studies on breast cancer for classification purposes have been seen in Pakistan's context. It is, therefore, needed to discuss the classification techniques on type of breast cancer surgery data in the context of Pakistani females.

Materials & Methods

Data description
The data used in the study is about the breast cancer patient’s undergone surgery during 2015-2019. A purposive sample of 365 breast cancer patients’ information was collected technically under the guidance of a medical specialist, Pakistan Institute of Medical Sciences (PIMS), and Maroof International hospital Islamabad and investigated. The information about seven characteristics was recorded from each patient including a binary response variable having two types of surgery i.e., Mastectomy and Breast Conservative Surgery whereas the other six variables were dealt with as an explanatory variable. The explanatory variables considered in this study are the age of the patient at the hospital. The main purpose of the study was the prediction of depression in cancer patients. Twelve independent variables were recorded for each patient. Five samples of different sizes (50,100,150,200,220) were randomly selected, and classification errors were calculated using logistic regression and linear discriminant analysis. In some cases, logistic regression performed better and in others, linear discriminant analysis performed better. It was concluded that the classification error index was not an appropriate criterion for classification. Barznjji (2018) studied 250 patients at Erbil Layla Qassem center of diabetes in Kurdistan.
time of surgery, Neoadjuvant Chemotherapy (NACT), Tumor size, Progesterone Receptor (PR), Estrogen Receptor (ER), and HER2 Receptor.

Methods
According to the significance of the study and objectives, the most prevalent techniques for similar research purposes available in the literature are logistic regression and discriminant analysis.

Logistic Regression
Hahs-Vaughn (2017) discussed in detail the logistic regression model for binary response variables and test statistics to test the significance of the parameters, symbolically the model can be written

\[
\text{logit}[\pi(x)] = \alpha + \beta_1 x_1 + \beta_2 x_2 + \cdots + \beta_p x_p
\]

Upton (2017) described the logistic regression model with interaction for two variables as under

\[
\text{logit}[\pi(x)] = \alpha + \beta_1 x_1 + \beta_2 x_2 + \gamma_1 x_1 x_2
\]

Agresti (2007) explained the most common tests for the significance of logistic regression coefficients are Wald Test, Score Test, and Likelihood ratio test. Johnson and Wichern (2007) also discussed the classification and confusion matrix in logistic regression and discriminant analysis. On the other hand, Hosmer et al. (2013) illustrate the significance of the Receptor Operative Curve (ROC) and plot the probability of detecting the sensitivity and specificity for the entire range of possible cut points. The ROC curve is more informative and has a larger area under the curve is considered much better.

Fisher Linear Discriminant Function
Rencher (2002) and Hair et al. (2010) illustrated that Fisher’s linear classification rule for two groups is nonparametric since no distributional assumptions were involved in its derivation. The predictors in the discriminant analysis are often quantitative variables as well as may include dummy coded variables that contain information about group membership. Huberty and Oslejnik (2006) stated that the binary variables are scaled by assigning 0 and 1. These variables are then treated like measured variables. In Fisher’s linear classification rule, classification functions one for each group, are used for classifying observations. For each observation, values for independent variables are inserted in the classification function and a classification score for each group is calculated for that observation. The observation is then classified with the highest classification score.

The formula used for finding the linear classification function is

\[
L_i(y) = C_{i0} + C_i^T y = C_{i1} Y_1 + C_{i2} Y_2 + \cdots + C_{ip} Y_p + C_{i0}
\]

Where 
\[
C_{i0} = -\frac{1}{2} \bar{Y}_i^T S_p^{-1} \bar{y}_i \quad \text{and} \quad C_i^T = \bar{Y}_i^T S_p^{-1}
\]

Statistical significance of individual variables and the overall model can be assessed by using Wilks Lambda.

Goodness of fit
Hahs-Vaughn (2017) discussed the multivariate goodness of fit test statistics i.e., Wilks’s lambda. Which may be interpreted as the proportion of discriminant functions that are not associated with the group membership. It is equivalent to the proportion of unexplained variance in one-way ANOVA. The Wilks lambda value lies between 0 and 1. The degree of freedom corresponding to Wilks’s lambda is (k-1, n-2) when it is converted to the F-test, where k is the no of groups of response variable and n is the number of observations

Prime assumptions
The common assumptions of discriminant analysis and logistic regression are multicollinearity and lack of outliers. The equality of variance covariance’s assumption is specific to discriminant analysis. if the primary goal is classification along with the high percentage of actual correctly classified (ACCR) and
low APER. The effect of violation of the assumption of discriminant analysis is assumed to be the slightest.

### Table 1:
Frequency Distribution and Multicollinearity Test of breast cancer patients

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics</th>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>BCS 89 (24.4%)</th>
<th>MX 276 (75.6%)</th>
<th>Total 365</th>
<th>VIF</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age (years)</td>
<td>&lt; 40 = 0</td>
<td>17(19.1%)</td>
<td>50(18.1%)</td>
<td>67(18.4%)</td>
<td>1.043</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>40-59 = 1</td>
<td>51(57.3%)</td>
<td>158(57.2%)</td>
<td>209(57.2%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>60 + = 2</td>
<td>21(23.6%)</td>
<td>68(24.6%)</td>
<td>89(24.4%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tumor Size (cm)</td>
<td>&lt; 2 = 0 (T₁)</td>
<td>29(32.6%)</td>
<td>5(1.8%)</td>
<td>34(9.3%)</td>
<td>1.505</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2-5 = 1 (T₂)</td>
<td>58(65.2%)</td>
<td>111(40.2%)</td>
<td>169(46.3%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&gt; 5 = 2 (T₃)</td>
<td>2(2.2%)</td>
<td>160(58%)</td>
<td>162(44.4%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estrogen Receptor (ER)</td>
<td>Negative = 0</td>
<td>22(24.7%)</td>
<td>68(24.6%)</td>
<td>90(24.7%)</td>
<td>1.187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Positive = 1</td>
<td>67(75.3%)</td>
<td>208(75.4%)</td>
<td>275(75.3%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Progesterone Receptor (PR)</td>
<td>Negative = 0</td>
<td>22(24.7%)</td>
<td>98(35.5%)</td>
<td>120(32.9%)</td>
<td>1.210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Positive = 1</td>
<td>67(75.3%)</td>
<td>178(64.5%)</td>
<td>245(67.1%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HER2 Receptor</td>
<td>Negative = 0</td>
<td>56(62.9%)</td>
<td>193(69.9%)</td>
<td>249(68.2%)</td>
<td>1.019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Positive = 1</td>
<td>33(37.1%)</td>
<td>83(30.1%)</td>
<td>116(31.8%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neoadjuvant Chemotherapy</td>
<td>No = 0</td>
<td>71(79.8%)</td>
<td>72(26.1%)</td>
<td>143(38.4%)</td>
<td>1.539</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes = 1</td>
<td>18(20.2%)</td>
<td>204(73.9%)</td>
<td>225(61.6%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

MX: Mastectomy, BCS: Breast-Conserving Surgery, HER2: Human Epidermal Growth Factor Receptor 2

### Table 2:
Parameter Estimates of Interaction effect Models and Test Statistics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Effect</th>
<th>-2Log Likelihood</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Chi-Square</th>
<th>P-value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Main effect only</td>
<td>201.860</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main effect + Age*PR</td>
<td>201.860</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.606</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main effect + Age*Tumor Size</td>
<td>201.846</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.092</td>
<td>0.608</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main effect + PR*Tumor Size</td>
<td>201.855</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.014</td>
<td>0.607</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main effect + ER*Tumor Size</td>
<td>201.812</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.048</td>
<td>0.746</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main effect + Age*ER</td>
<td>198.331</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3.529</td>
<td>0.968</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main effect + ER*PR</td>
<td>200.839</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1.021</td>
<td>0.721</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 3:
Parameter Estimates of logistic Regression and Discriminant models and Goodness of fit

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics</th>
<th>Logistic Regression</th>
<th>Discriminant Analysis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>β-Coefficient</td>
<td>Wald Statistics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>0.038</td>
<td>6.320</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tumor Size</td>
<td>1.342</td>
<td>54.860</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ER</td>
<td>-1.099</td>
<td>5.513</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PR</td>
<td>-0.269</td>
<td>0.489</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HER2</td>
<td>0.563</td>
<td>2.038</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NACT</td>
<td>0.598</td>
<td>1.596</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

-2Log Likelihood = 201.86, \( \chi^2_d = 203.63, P = 0.000 \)

Wilks Lambda = 0.592, \( \chi^2_d = 188.56, P = 0.000 \)

### Table 4:
Sensitivity, Specificity, ACCR & APER (%) using Logistic and Discriminant model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Technique</th>
<th>Logistic Regression</th>
<th>Discriminant Function</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sensitivity (%)</td>
<td>93.1</td>
<td>92.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specificity (%)</td>
<td>70.8</td>
<td>71.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACCR (%)</td>
<td>87.7</td>
<td>87.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APER (%)</td>
<td>12.3</td>
<td>12.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ACCR = Actual correctly classified rate; APER = Apparent error rate
Results and Discussion

In this section, the data of 365 breast cancer patients were analyzed and interpreted. Table 1 reveals that there is a total of 365 breast cancer patients. A large number of patients i.e., 276 were treated with the procedure of MX surgery while the remaining 89 with BCS surgery. Whereas out of these 365 patients, about 209 (57.3%) patients belong to the age group 40 to 59 years while 67 and 89 patients are of age bracket less than 40 and 60+ respectively. It means age has an insignificant role in suggesting and performing a type of surgical procedure.

The above-mentioned surgical procedures are equally recommended and implemented for breast cancer patients irrespective of their age groups. Similarly, out of these 365 breast cancer patients, about 169 and 162 patients have tumor sizes 2-5 cm and 5+ cm respectively and among these 111 patients and 160 patients were treated with the type of MX respectively. It indicates only a few patients were treated with the type BCS. On the other hand, the tumor size has a vital role in recommending a type of surgery, because the patients of stage 1 and stage 2 are treated by BCS procedure while the stage 3 patients had been treated by MX Procedure. It means tumor size has a significant influence on the decision of the type of surgery.

As far as regarding the Estrogen Receptor (ER) characteristic, both surgical procedures were equally applicable in patients having ER-positive or negative. So, it may be expected that ER does not have a major concern that which surgical procedure to be adopted. Referring to both levels of PR and HER2, the rate of MX and BCS was approximately equal so it can be inferred that PR and HER2 are non-significant. There were about 204 patients with positive Neoadjuvant chemotherapy (NACT) treated by MX surgery while 72 patients with negative Neoadjuvant chemotherapy (NACT) were also treated by BCS surgery. On the other hand, only 89 breast cancer patients irrespective of NACT positive or negative were treated by BCS. Almost the same percentages have been observed for the characteristic progesterone receptor (PR) as that of the NACT characteristic.

The values of the variance inflation factor (VIF) for each characteristic were also calculated to diagnose the assumption of multicollinearity and indicated the non-desecration of the multicollinearity assumption for each of the explanatory variables. In addition, Box’s M test statistic was also computed i.e., 67.445 to test the equality of the variance-covariance matrices and found P = 0.000. It indicates the non-equality
of both surgery groups' variance-covariance matrices. Table 2 reveals the testing of six models containing main effects and one different interaction effect in each model. It was observed that all the two-factor interactions were found to be non-significant. It indicates that the parsimonious model would have consisted of main effects only. Table 3 reveals the parameter estimates and test statistics of logistic regression and discriminant model along with the goodness of fit of each model. The logistics regression indicated that age, Tumor size, and ER are the significant characteristics with $P = 0.012$, $P = 0.000$ and $P = 0.019$ respectively while according to the discriminant model, only three characteristics Tumor size, PR, and NACT were found to be significant with $P = 0.000$, $P = 0.06$ and $0.000$ respectively.

This difference might be because of the violation of the assumption equality of variance-covariance matrices in discriminant analysis. It is a robust assumption, and its slight departure may be overlooked. Logistic regression model may be considered a parsimonious model and can be used for the classification purposes of breast cancer patients regarding which type of surgery be suggested. Table 4 illustrates the sensitivity and specificity percentage of each of the logistics regression and discriminant models. The table also presents the actual correct classification rate (ACCR) and apparent error rate (APER).

The logistic regression model sensitivity and specificity percentages are 93.1% and 70.8% respectively whereas the discriminant model sensitivity and specificity percentages are 92.8% and 71.9% respectively. Although it has been seen a minor difference in specificity and sensitivity percentages of both the models, Moreover, the ACCR (%) and APER (%) are 87.7% and 12.3% respectively of both the above-mentioned fitted models. The table also consists of the area under the Receptive Operative Curve (ROC) using logistic regression and discriminant model are 0.933 and 0.923 respectively and both are asymptotically significant with $P = 0.000$. Consequently, it may be concluded that when the ACCR (%), APER (%), and area under ROC are the same by both the fitted models and are equally good. Consequently, tumor size was affirmed significant by both these techniques and coherence with the findings of Moiel et al. (2019) and Al-Gaithy et al. (2019). The predictive accuracy was found to be 87.7% using logistic regression which has 93% sensitivity and 71% specificity respectively. Lo (1986) stated that logistic regression is more robust than discriminant analysis, particularly when the purpose is parameter estimation.

The findings of discriminant function and logistic regression were almost the same with a minor difference i.e., 1% in specificity. These results are consistent with that of the studies by Montgomery et al. (1989) and Musa et al. (2019). Thus, the logistic regression model with fewer assumptions may be preferred for classification purposes. Figure 1 displays the area under the Receptive Operative Curve (ROC) of the logistics regression and discriminant model. As both, the models have equal area under the ROC curve and indicate that area under the curve was significantly different from the half. It stipulates that both the models are equally good for classification purposes. However, logistic regression may be preferred due to fewer assumptions.

**Conclusion & Recommendations**

The main purpose of this research was to study the significant factors which play a vital role in deciding on one of the two types of surgery i.e., Mastectomy or Breast-Conservative Surgery. The information of seven characteristics was recorded from each of 365 breast cancer patients who had undergone surgery from two main hospitals of Islamabad territory i.e., PIMS and Maroof international hospital Islamabad during the period 2015-20. Initially, descriptive statistics were computed to comprehend the primary information of the case study. Furthermore, the discriminant analysis model was found significant using the Wilks Lambda test. Univariate analysis of variance was also applied to find the significance of each individual variable. Out of seven variables, Tumor size and NACT were found to be significant variables indicating that both these variables play a significant role in differentiating the breast cancer patient for appropriate surgery type. In other words, we may say that the Tumor size was the more important variable than the NACT for said purposes. It was concluded that with increasing tumor size, the chances
of MX increase.

In addition, the patient receiving NACT mostly underwent MX surgery. Both the models i.e., logistic regression and discriminant analysis formed better with minor variation in sensitivity i.e., around 93%, and specificity i.e., around (71%). However, the overall actual correct classifying rate was found to be 87.7% and the minimum apparent error rate i.e., 12.3% using the logistic regression and discriminant analysis model. Consequently, logistic regression may be preferred due to lesser assumptions. The likelihood ratio test was used for the goodness of fit of the logistic regression model and concluded that the fitted model was adequate. Furthermore, the tumor size, age, and ER were found to be significant. On the other hand, the age and ER were non-significant. The variable NACT was found to be significant in discriminant function and non-significant in logistics regression. The minor inconsistency among parameter coefficients between these two techniques might be because of the desecration of equality of covariance matrices assumption. This study can be extended to districts, provinces, and the national level taking some other dichotomy diseases and therapeutic classification decisions. In addition, some other new significant factors may also be documented which may be helpful for classification purposes.

Acknowledgment

The authors would like to thank the PIMS ethical committee for providing the authentic breast cancer patient data for research purposes. Likewise, special thanks to Dr. S. H. Waqar and Dr. Kashif Khan to facilitate in data collection and providing the clinical guidance to complete this project.

References


Perception and Behavior of Teachers about Teacher Targeted Bullying and its Prevention in Tertiary Education Institutes

*Fariha Gul*, Assistant Professor, University of Management and Technology, Lahore, Pakistan  
Sadaf Jabeen, Mphil Scholar, University of Management and Technology, Lahore, Pakistan  
Saba Hanif, Assistant Professor, University of Education Lahore, Lahore, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email address: fariha.gul@umt.edu.pk

**ARTICLE DETAILS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>History</th>
<th>ABSTRACT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Revised format: May 2022</td>
<td><strong>Purpose:</strong> In the past, a number of research studies have been done on bullying, but most of them are in the context of student’s bullying students. The present study highlighted an important issue of teachers being bullied by their students. The purpose of the study was to examine the perception and behavior of teachers about teacher targeted bullying (TTB) and prevention of TTB.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Available Online: Jun 2022</td>
<td><strong>Design/Methodology/Approach:</strong> This study was quantitative in nature. The sample comprised of all public and private tertiary education institutions/colleges of Lahore. The data was collected from one hundred fifty teachers through cluster sampling technique from six public and private tertiary education institutions/colleges. A self-developed instrument, comprising of statements on frequency, perception, behavior and preventive measures on teacher targeted bullying was used to collect data from respondents.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Keywords                        | Findings: The results indicate that the teachers’ awareness level about TTB is low. Furthermore, they are also not aware about the types of bullying they are facing. The response of teachers on preventing bullying is also not very positive while very less teachers are prone to take preventive measures to stop or reduce bullying. The tests on demographic variables indicate that there is difference in opinion on basis of age and work experience of teachers towards teacher targeted bullying. |
|---------------------------------|**Implications:** Based on results it can be recommended that there is need to aware teachers and administrators about teacher targeted bullying so that they can voice up against it. Additionally, this can also be recommended that the policy clauses should be added and displayed at institutes about teacher targeted bullying. |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>JEL Classification</th>
<th>© 2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-4.0</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A20, A24</td>
<td>Open Access</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Introduction**

Bullying has been emphasized as a major problem in the school environment because of its serious consequences for its victims. Olweus, (1993) defined bullying as frequent, destructive behaviors or bad acts by more powerful organizations or people against groups or persons who are viewed as powerless to protect themselves. Furthermore, bullying may take many forms, including learner-to-learner, staff-to-staff, and learner-to-teacher. Teacher Targeted Bullying (TTB) expresses itself in a variety of ways, including continuous hatred toward teachers, abuse of teachers, ignoring teachers, swearing/scoffing at teachers, talking about teachers, and destroying their belongings (Jacobs & De Wet, 2018).

Bullying can occur by students to other students, by teachers to students, by admins or other staff members towards the teachers and by student towards the teachers. The students bullying toward the teachers referred to as "teacher targeted bullying". TTB is defined as continuous violence against teachers such as teacher harassment, disregarding teachers, insulting or making jokes about teachers and whispering against teachers with other fellows’ and destroying teachers’ belongings (De Wet, 2010; Pervin & Turner, 1998). Good amount of research is available about students bullying student, however, very few studies have explored TTB.

Although TTB has dramatically increased in the last ten years, not many researchers have investigated this issue (Kõiv 2015). Some international studies conducted in Estonia, Finland, Ireland, Malaysia, New Zealand, South Africa, Turkey on TTB have strongly inspected the problem in terms of its nature, spread, negative effects and risk elements among teachers (Billett; De Wet, 2006; De Wet 2006; Kõiv, 2015; Özkiliç, 2012; Santos & Tin, 2018; Uz & Bayraktar, 2019). In addition, there is an agreement that satisfactory teaching and learning cannot take place when students bully or harass their teachers (e.g. De Wet, 2010; Pervin & Turner, 1998).

Bullying is designed to inflict the victim psychological and emotional suffering as well as harm to their social position among their peers (Bjorkqvist, et al., 2004). TTB and students’ violence against teachers are two similar terms. Researchers used both terms to describe the negative attitude against teachers (Pervin & Turner, 1998, Kõiv, 2015, Zhang, Musu-Gillette & Oudekerk, 2016). The outcomes of these studies proved that TTB is serious issue in real life. The issue in past literatures was that the mixed use of terms in describing bullying and negative behavior would distract teachers. Teachers may have trouble understanding bullying or failed to learn that how to get protected from bullying behaviors. The teacher may not notice the bullying, until the students' behavior escalates and they become more violent and traumatic.

TTB has been shown to have a significant negative influence on educators' health and well-being (Woudstra et al., 2018), and it is far less well understood than other kinds of bullying. TTB has mostly been studied in terms of frequency, kind, and demographic-related prevalence (Chen & Astor, 2009; De Wet, 2010; Pervin 14 & Turner, 1998). TTB victims suffer from a variety of emotional and physical consequences (such as increased loneliness, peer rejection, anxiety, sadness, and low self-esteem) (Oade, 2009; O'Donnell et al., 2010; Woudstra et. al., 2018). TTB has also been proven to cause significant distress among educators, with those who are disrespected and powerless feeling helpless. ETB can cause "battered teacher syndrome," which includes lots of stress-related symptoms like anxiety, an eating problem, depression, and sleep disturbances (Wilson et al., 2011). Moreover, stress can cause a drop in life and job satisfaction. (Kauppi & Pörhölä, 2012; Wilson et al., 2011).

Teachers play critical roles in preventing the bullying behaviors. Teachers need to have behavior management abilities, expertise and knowledge, and experience about how to save and negotiate with bullying. In other words, they need schooling to deal with bulling behaviors. High quality practices are strategies which are superior to others as they are supported through evaluations that produce useful results and have been attempted many times. This approach targets to involve the entire school and community considering that behaviors associated with bullying are part of the values and standards of
the society ("Anti-Bullying Intervention", 2017). According to a recent study, preventative techniques targeted at reducing bullying have the potential to be successful if they are considered as a long-term commitment (Smith, Salmivalli, & Cowie, 2012). This exercise may be very useful when it's far targeted on four areas: 1) making use of an anti-bullying policy via the entire faculty. A study through Ttofi and Farrington (2011) confirmed that schools which consist of anti-bullying policy of their programs have minimum level of bullying than different schools. However, a research through Hirsch, Lowen and Santorelli (2012) indicated that those rules need to be carried out efficiently and that the scholars ought to be aware of these policies so as for them to achieve success. 2) Targeting the environments where maximum bullying occurs frequently, within the lecture room and playground. Ttofi and Farrington (2011) observed that lecture rooms which can be controlled correctly and implement no bullying policies have fewer quantity of bullying behaviors. Assisting teachers and creating development programs for team of workers is a critical aspect for the fight against bullying in schools.

Though many research studies have been carried on workplace bullying (focusing on bullying from peers), and bullying among students, however, the less focus has been paid on bullying of teachers by students. The current study is an effort to provide empirical evidence on perceptions of teachers on bullying, frequency on bullying, and response and preventive measures on teacher targeted bullying.

**Statement of the Problem**

Teacher targeted bullying is relatively newly surfaced term after pandemic. The current study focus on exploring the perceived existence and frequency of bullying by students, response of teachers and the preventive measures taken by teachers.

**Objectives of the Study**

Based on statement of the problem, the objectives of the study are as follows:

1. To identify level of perceived existence of bullying of teachers by students
2. To identify perceived frequency of teacher targeted bullying TTB by teachers
3. To explore perceived behavior of teachers on teacher targeted bullying
4. To explore preventive measures taken by teachers to reduce phenomenon of teacher targeted bullying
5. To examine the influence of demographic variables on perceptions and prevention of Teacher Targeted Bullying

**Research questions**

The research questions based on objectives of the study are as follows;

1.1 What is the perceptions of teachers about teacher targeted bullying TTB?
2.1 To identify perceived frequency of teacher targeted bullying TTB by teachers
3.1 What is the teacher's behavior when they are a victim of bullying?
4.1 What measures teachers take to prevent the Teachers from bullying?
5.1 How demographic variables affect the teacher targeted bullying TTB?

**Conceptual Framework**

Bullying is a term used to describe acts of hostility that are harmful to the victim's psychological or physical well-being, and when the aggressor's and victim's power is uneven (Jankauskiene et al., 2008, p. 46). Educator-Targeted Bullying (ETB) or Teacher-Targeted Bullying (TTB) is the term used to describe the bullying behavior of students who target those who provide the education. (De Wet & Jacob, 2006, De Wet, 2010, De Wet, 2012, Ozkilic & Kartal, 2012, & Pervin & Turner, 1998). TTB is a term used to describe students who bully their educators. Students bullied teachers in a variety of ways, according to Kauppi and Pörhölä (2012b), including verbal bullying, physical bullying, sexual bullying, cyberbullying, and relational bullying.
Cyberbullying has become one of the most common forms of teacher victimization by students in recent years, this is due to the proliferation of increasingly sophisticated electronic communication devices and widespread instant internet access (Cook et al., 2010; Kauppi and Pörhölä, 2012, (Juvenen, 2008). School administrators should conduct training sessions for teachers about bullying, says De Wet (2013). Learners can physically attack their teachers, use vulgar language against them, insult them, degrade and spit on them, and knock them around. Perpetrators can be manipulative and domineering, and their actions might be difficult to recognize (Indvik & Johnson, 2012).

According to Orange (2018), the major reasons teachers are bullied are their age, their union connection, and their behavior. Misawa (2015) identified three forms of bullying: (a) positional bullying, (b) counter-positional bullying, and (c) unintended comparative positional bullying, all of which allow individuals to bully someone in a position of authority, regardless of race, gender, or sexual orientation. It has become clear to the public that student bullying against teachers does not occur in the open space in the school workplace, but is influenced and influenced by dangerous factors such as gender, age, degree, experience, class size, class level, rank and type of institution etc. (Burton (2008).

Fig 1. Conceptual framework of the study presenting factors of TTB and perceptions, behaviors, prevention

Methodology
The present study was descriptive in its nature and quantitative survey research design was used to achieve objectives of the study.

Population and Sample of the Study
The population of the study was comprised of all the public and private colleges of the Lahore city. Six colleges three from each sector were selected in convenient basis. The selection at this stage was carried out on the basis of availability and permission from administrators of institutions to collect data. At second stage the cluster sampling technique was used to collect data from respondents, the questionnaire was distributed to all available teachers, however, the return ratio was less than sixty percent from each institute. Around three hundred questionnaires were distributed, amongst only one hundred and fifty were complete and usable. So the sample, on which the analysis was carried out was one hundred and fifty respondents from public and private sector tertiary education institutions. Following table presents spread of sample;

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>1.7800</td>
<td>.41563</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>78</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>25 to 30</td>
<td>1.4933</td>
<td>.58787</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>31 to 35</td>
<td>40.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>36 Above</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qualification</td>
<td>Masters</td>
<td>1.8333</td>
<td>.37393</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mphil</td>
<td>83.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experience</td>
<td>Less than 5 Years</td>
<td>1.5067</td>
<td>.57634</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1. Spread of sample of study
Institute of the Study
A self-developed Questionnaire was used to collect data from participants of the study. The instrument was composed of four components; first part dealt with collection of demographic information of the respondents including gender, qualification, teaching experience and sector. While second part consisted of statements of perceptions and frequency of teacher targeted bullying (28 statements). Third part was composed of 19 statements about behavior of teachers about bulling, while the Fourth and last part was composed of preventive techniques used by teachers to tackle teacher targeted bullying (seven statements). The likert scale was used to take opinion of respondents. The instrument was validated through the expert opinion from the two teacher educators and three experts from educational psychology. The Cronbach’s alpha values were calculated to establish reliability of the instrument. The following table present reliability of the instrument;

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Alpha</th>
<th>No. of Items</th>
<th>No. of respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Perceptions</td>
<td>.712</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Types</td>
<td>.673</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behavior</td>
<td>.642</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prevention</td>
<td>.717</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total questionnaire</td>
<td>.715</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Results
The data was collected through a self-developed instrument to achieve target of the study to identify perceptions, behavior and preventive techniques of teachers in colleges. The following section presents results of the study according to each objective and consequent research question.

First objective of the study was to identify the perceived level of teachers about presence and occurring frequency of teacher targeted bullying, while the second objective was to identify the perceived behavior of teachers about bullying and third objective was to identify the preventive measures taken by the teachers. The descriptive statistic was found more suitable to achieve these objectives. Following table present the results;

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>MPI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Perceptions</td>
<td>21.840</td>
<td>7.301</td>
<td>1.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Types</td>
<td>40.366</td>
<td>15.480</td>
<td>2.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behavior</td>
<td>121.44</td>
<td>29.630</td>
<td>2.24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prevention</td>
<td>14.953</td>
<td>7.5336</td>
<td>2.13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The results indicate that the teachers’ awareness level about TTB is low. Furthermore, they are also not aware about the types of bullying they are facing. The response of teachers on bullying is also not very positive while very less teachers are prone to take preventive measures to stop or reduce bullying.

As discussed earlier teacher targeted bullying is directly influenced by demographic factors
including gender, age and experience of the teacher, so the t-test and ANOVA were used to identify the mean difference between groups based on scores of perceptions, behavior and preventive measures. Following table present details of each category:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>t-value</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Perceptions</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>18.0303</td>
<td>6.93940</td>
<td>3.521</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>22.9145</td>
<td>7.06445</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Types</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>42.2424</td>
<td>30.60742</td>
<td>.787</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>39.8376</td>
<td>6.93561</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behavior</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>46.0606</td>
<td>26.05036</td>
<td>.693</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>43.7863</td>
<td>12.89402</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4. Mean difference on the basis of gender on scores of perceptions, behaviors and preventive measures

The t-test was carried out to identify mean difference based on gender regarding the perceived levels of bullying, behavior about bullying and preventive measures adopted by respondents. The results indicate that Table 2 indicates that there is significant difference (.001) in opinion of teachers on score of perceptions about teacher targeted bullying. Similarly, there is significant difference (.000) between males and females on score of types of bullying. The table also indicate that there is no significant (.489) difference based in gender self-reported response of teachers towards teacher targeted bullying. The mean score between male and female is slightly significant (.009) on score of perceived preventive measure taken by respondents. The age of teachers also plays a vital role in developing perceptions, facing bullying, response to bullying and then preventive measures to tackle bullying. The ANOVA was carried out to examine the mean difference between different age groups and aforementioned factors.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Perceptions</td>
<td>25 to 30</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>20.7711</td>
<td>4.15060</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.702</td>
<td>.003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>31 to 35</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>23.0667</td>
<td>9.47766</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>36 Above</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>24.0000</td>
<td>13.0000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Types</td>
<td>25 to 30</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>39.1446</td>
<td>11.85289</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.803</td>
<td>.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>31 to 35</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>42.8833</td>
<td>19.74077</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>36 Above</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>33.2857</td>
<td>7.52140</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behavior</td>
<td>25 to 30</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>38.7952</td>
<td>12.98100</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12.196</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>31 to 35</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>51.7500</td>
<td>17.46340</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>36 Above</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>45.4286</td>
<td>24.04757</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 5 shows that a one-way between groups analysis of variance was conducted to explore the impact of age on levels of optimism, as measured. Participants were divided into three groups according to their age. There is statistically significant difference (.001) at the p-value <.05 level. F (.611) = 400, P=.608 regarding Teacher Targeted Bullying. The experience of teachers also plays an important role in perceptions about bullying, perceived types of bullying, behavior about bullying and preventive measures. The ANOVA was carried out to identify mean difference between different categories on scores of above mentioned factors.

Table 6. Mean difference on scores of respondents on perceptions, types, behavior and prevention TTB based on experience

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>f</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total TTB</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less than 5 years</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>113.4625</td>
<td>22.63689</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6.700</td>
<td>.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 – 10 years</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>130.5781</td>
<td>33.56293</td>
<td>147</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 – 15 years</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>121.4467</td>
<td>41.07919</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceptions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less than 5 years</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>21.9625</td>
<td>4.67540</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6.939</td>
<td>.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 – 10 years</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>22.6563</td>
<td>9.36935</td>
<td>147</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 – 15 years</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>11.5000</td>
<td>.54772</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Types</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less than 5 years</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>39.8250</td>
<td>11.57887</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>.978</td>
<td>.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 – 10 years</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>41.7344</td>
<td>19.77672</td>
<td>147</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 – 15 years</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>33.0000</td>
<td>1.09545</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behavior</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less than 5 years</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>38.0000</td>
<td>11.47479</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>19.652</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 – 10 years</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>49.8750</td>
<td>12.00595</td>
<td>147</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 – 15 years</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>68.5000</td>
<td>50.93820</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prevention</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less than 5 years</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>13.6750</td>
<td>4.21202</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.590</td>
<td>.078</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 – 10 years</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>16.3125</td>
<td>9.84463</td>
<td>147</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 – 15 years</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>17.5000</td>
<td>11.50217</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5 shows that, one way between groups analysis of variance was conducted to explore the impact of experience, as measured. Participants were divided into three groups according to their level of experience. There is statistically significant difference (.002) at the p-value <.05 level. F (6.700) regarding Teacher Targeted Bullying.

Discussion
The major purpose of this study is to analyze the teachers of Higher Education Institutes' about their perceptions, their behaviors, and prevention of students bullying their teachers. Because of technological advancements, this concept is popular among higher education institutions, because the era of social
media is just around the corner. As a result, teacher bullying has never been more "passionate." We have no idea that such exists in the workplace, despite the fact that this study focused on teachers who bully by their students, teacher’s behavior, and prevention about it. According to the literature, bullying of teachers is intolerable because it is cruel and represents unjustified violence by the "strong" against the "powerless" (Colorosa, 2005). Bullying of teachers must be acknowledged and regulated in order to eliminate the bad consequences on the teacher, which might have a negative impact on the students' learning. Stress is exhibited as a result of their perception of their teaching profession as dangerous (Clark, Folkman & Moskowitz, Pandey, et al., 2010; Spector, 2006). This study of teacher targeted bullying in higher education institutions found that grabbing/shoving, punching/kicking, verbal abuse, stealing personal property, and physically threatening a teacher was linked to teachers perceiving their job as unsafe. The objectives of this study was to identify the teachers perceived level and their perceptions regarding Teacher Targeted Bullying, frequency of TTB, Preventive measures taken by teachers and to identify demographic variables role in this perspective. So, these objectives fulfilled by asking some question by questionnaire which is based on perceptions on existence of Teacher Targeted Bullying, types of bullying which are (Physical, verbal, cyber, relational and sexual), behaviors of the teachers and the preventive measures. The results of this shows that in today’s life TTB is the most highlighted and repeated issue. Every teacher is well known about the term TTB. The TTB frequency take higher place in teachers. Demographic variables vary with the teacher targeted bullying that Gender has little influence on teachers differ with teacher-targeted bullying. It makes no difference whether the victim is male or female; both are victims of teacher-targeted bullying. The effect of age on instructors is that younger teachers are more susceptible to TTB. Qualification have little impact. While experience matters, newer instructors are more vulnerable to TTB. Class size has an impact. TTB is a prevalent cause in a classroom with a big number of students. Students insult their professors more when they are intermediate or BS level classes. Teacher positions differ as well. TTB can be found in both the public and private sectors. More research is needed to acquire a better knowledge of bullying by analyzing the views of all parties involved in bullying in order to develop adaptable bullying prevention initiatives. A training workshop focusing on increasing awareness of bullying verification, acknowledging bullying behavior, preventing bullying and enhancing self-efficacy is recommended. A bullying prevention program comparable to the entire school approach should be developed, which targets bullying on many ecological levels.

Conclusion
This study contributed to the understanding of the problem of teacher-targeted bullying and the effects of bullying on teachers' health and safety perceptions. Bullying can only be defeated if all members of educational institutions share the same values and aims and actively work to create an anti-bullying atmosphere. It takes the entire educational system to combat bullying, and it is anticipated that this study will raise awareness of the issue of teacher-targeted bullying. (Misawa 2015) stated, three categories of bullying, each of which allows bullies to bully a person in a position of authority by using their own race, sex, or ethnicity to bully them. At the conclusion of this study, we found that Teacher Targeted Bullying is prevalent in educational institutions. It has an impact on the teacher's emotional and physical health, causing stress and disruption. TTB is now commonly adopted. We need to get a grip on this quickly. To secure teachers' status and honor, more emphasis should be paid to the prevention of Teacher Targeted Bullying.

References


Indvik, J., & Johnson, P. R. (2012). Lawsuits walk in on two feet: The bully in the workplace. Journal of Organizational Culture, Communication and Conflict, 16(2), 73 77


Food Security and Social Inequalities from the Perspective of Women's Rights: Case Study of District Torghar

*Fatima Sana Alam, MPhil Scholar, Department of Rural Sociology, The University of Agriculture Peshawar, Pakistan
Naila Awan, Ph.D. Scholar, The Agriculture University of Peshawar, Pakistan
Abdus Samad Khan, Assistant Professor, Department of Law, Abdul Wali Khan University Mardan, Pakistan
Afeera Saeed, M.Phil Scholar, The University of Agriculture Peshawar, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email: mustafa455khan@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

Purpose: The research study was designed with the sole aim to explore the food security status in the purview of women’s rights in the District Tor Ghar, KP, Pakistan
Methodology: A sample size of 291 out of 760 household heads was selected randomly from 3 villages of Khander Tehsil namely Bilyani, Bimbal, and Dharo. The conceptual framework comprised of an independent variable (availability of food) and one dependent variable (food insecurity). Data on study variables were collected using the Likert scale. The Chi-square test was applied to test the strength of association among study variables.
Findings: The study found that the limited availability of vegetables, fruits, bread, and meat required for a daily meal for women alongside sufficient milk/dairy products and dry fruit to feed women at home, were found significant (p <0.05) in association with food insecurity. Thus, lack of availability of food is the root cause of food insecurity among women of the study inhabitants.
Implications: A policy drive led by an awareness-raising campaign at an institutional, cultural, and societal level that ensures the availability of a sufficient amount of quality food to all social segments to overcome the problem of food insecurity, especially concerning women folk was the major study recommendations.

© 2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-4.0


Introduction

“Food security exists when all people, at all times, have physical and economic access to sufficient safe and nutritious food to meet their dietary needs and food preferences for an active and healthy life”
The food availability approach has been popularized by Thomas Malthus (1789) and its core idea was outlined by Venetian thinker Giovanni Botero (1588). This idea describes food insecurity as an imbalance between food and population. To maintain the balance the growth of food availability should not be less than population growth and the availability of food should be sufficient for the population (Rezaul et al. 2015 Pangaribowo et al., 2013) and available on a consistent level for an individual in the practical and affordable range (FAO, 2006, 2009). The adequacy of food is accepted as a fundamental right, especially by the developed nations for everyone, and a proper set of standards of living for advancement. (Article 11, Para. 1, Para. 2) (ICESCR, 1966). The United Nations Committee on (CESCR) defined the right to adequate food as; the “Right of every individual to have accessibility in terms of economic and physical, to food according to their requirement and availability of quantity and quality and free from chemical substances for healthy and secure living”.

Thus access to sufficient food of good quality is one of the internationally recognized basic human rights and the government are responsible to secure this important human right in the best possible way without any discrimination. Food insecurity results from complex interacting factors as these reasons can be seasonal or chronic but unequal distribution of food on the regional level, countries, households, and individuals are the consequence of poor governance and lack of institutional support. As in the world still, there is plenty of food but the poor are still food insecure. In addition, lack of income and access to adequate food is closely related to poverty and food insecurity. As poor have few assets to benefit from and they profit only from what they raise in the fields. In the agriculture sector with few effective mechanisms, the growth of crops can increase profit. Natural resources and transparent allocation of land rights require sustainable use of these resources. Poor people especially women have the right to access legal processes to maintain security over land is vital (DFID 2002).

Gender inequality and food insecurity are inter-linked in the context of food availability which further impacts gender-based differences in the status of health, education, and family. Women, children, and old age people are more vulnerable to food insecurity and face discrimination i.e. economically, educationally and other services (Agarwal, 2018). Food insecurity is a high-risk threat in Pakistan. Despite the surplus availability of food, 60 percent of the population faces food insecurity. Therefore, many poor people are unable to afford good quality and adequate quantity of food and its subsequent health consequences like stunted growth and diseases (Sleet, 2019).

In the national scenario, the state of food security for women is at its lowest ebb due to cultural constraints in their awareness and empowerment. The women of rural areas are major contributors to the process of food production. However, the state of their food security is unsatisfactory due to the availability and social inequality issues faced by them to access their required dietary needs. This research study is designed to highlight the state of food insecurity faced by women about the availability of food to them in a remotely located District (Tor Ghar).

**Material and Method**

The research study was carried out in District Torghar (Khandar Tehsil) with the purpose to define and conclude the link between food insecurity and the independent variable i.e. availability. The present study was conducted in three selected villages (Bilyani, Bimbal, and Dharo) of Tehsil khandar respectively, because of the severe condition of food insecurity in the area thus, 291 sample sizes were determined as per Sekeran (2003) criteria. The study respondents included the households head from each selected household. Additionally, the sample size was proportionally distributed to each strata using the proportional allocation method (Ullah et al., 2021).

The formula for proportional allocation is given in Equation-I.

\[ n_i = \frac{(n) \times N_i}{N} \]  

A conceptual framework was designed with one independent variable (availability of food) and one dependent variable (food insecurity) as shown in Table 1. The study variables were measured on three levels of Likert scales with responses ranging from disagreeing to agreeing. Furthermore, Uni-variate
analysis was applied through percentage and frequency distribution and reflected in the tables. To test the associations between independent variables (availability of food) with the dependent variable (food insecurity) chi-square statistics were used (Kothari (2004). Chi-square values were calculated by using the formula given in equation-II and explained below (Ullah et al., 2021).

\[ \chi^2 = \sum_{i=1}^{k} \sum_{j=1}^{n} \frac{(O_{ij} - e_{ij})^2}{e_{ij}} \]  

…………………… (Equation-II)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S.no</th>
<th>Independent variable</th>
<th>Dependent variable</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Availability of food</td>
<td>Food Insecurity</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Results and discussions**

**Availability of Food**

Availability is the main component of food security that pertains to the availability of all required food components to all masses in physical terms. Due to population growth and degradation of soils, agricultural production is not increasing at a pace with the growing population. Therefore food availability is a growing global issue. Responses on the perception of the respondents on food availability are given in Table 2 and explained below. The results in the table show that the majority (73.9 %) of respondents reported that the vegetables required for the daily meal were available in their homes. While (25.1%) of respondents disagreed with it. Vegetables are important daily food ingredients that are necessary for the growth and vitality of humans. The majority of respondents had this important food component available to them. However, almost one-fourth (25.1%) negate the availability of vegetables to them which is a threat to their food security. These findings are similar to Bangladesh Bank, (2014) report that the availability of food items has increased from 2004 to 2013. As the land released for major crops and productivity amplifies the food items. However, marginalized groups like females still face problems in the availability of vegetables.

The results further show that fruit was unavailable to 56.7% of respondents. Furthermore, 67% of respondents disagreed that the required quantity of meat was available to them, while 33% of the respondent the required quantity of meal was available to them. Similarly, 59.1% of respondents expressed those sufficient milk/dairy products for daily uses were not available to them, whereas; it was available to 40.9% of the respondents. In addition, 56.7% of respondents stated that dry fruit was not available at home for them to eat, and for 39.2% of respondents, the dry fruit was available for them at home to eat. These results project a bleak picture of the availability of some of the very basic food components like; fruit, meat, milk, and dry fruit to the respondents. The non-availability of these food components will surely affect their consumption and its subsequent negative repercussions on the health of the masses, especially the deprived groups like women. Several research studies pointed out the widening gap between food production and the growing population. These international studies report that the population growth of developing countries has surpassed all the aspects of agricultural production, including food production (Talukder et al., 2015; Hepburn, 2019). The UN, sustainable development goals have also pointed to this state of emergency and called for multilateral efforts to control population growth and enhance agricultural production (Hepburn, 2019). Therefore, the global population is at high risk of food insecurity due to imbalances in population growth and production systems (Malthus, 1789; Botero, 1588). Consequently, the population of developing countries, especially their marginalized groups like ethnic minorities and women are extremely vulnerable to low availability of food to them (UN, 2019).

With respect to the availability of reading to the respondents, the majority of them (73.9%) agreed that this important food commodity was available to them at home, while for 25.1% of respondents its availability was a problem. Bread is a staple food, especially in the south Asian region of the world. Most commonly it is consumed three times a day. Therefore, all efforts are made by the family head to ensure its availability to the family members. In extreme poverty, however, this important daily food
intake ingredient is missed by the poor masses. Consequently, the poor societal components are at high risk of food security. Several international reports, therefore, emphasize improving the mechanism of food redistribution to improve its availability to needy people at low prices (UN, 1975; Napoli, 2010).

### Table 2: Availability of Food

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S.no</th>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Don’t know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>The vegetables required for a daily meal are available to you at home.</td>
<td>215(73.9)</td>
<td>73(25.1)</td>
<td>3(1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>The fruit required for the daily meal is available to you at home.</td>
<td>114(39.2)</td>
<td>165(56.7)</td>
<td>12(4.1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>The meat required for a daily meal is available to you at home.</td>
<td>96(33)</td>
<td>195(67)</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>You have sufficient milk/dairy products to feed you at home.</td>
<td>119(40.9)</td>
<td>172(59.1)</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Availability of bread at home is not a problem for your family.</td>
<td>215(73.9)</td>
<td>73(25.1)</td>
<td>3(1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>The dry fruits are available at home for you to eat.</td>
<td>114(39.2)</td>
<td>165(56.7)</td>
<td>12(4.1)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Number in the table represents frequencies and the number in parenthesis represents the percentage proportion of respondents

### Association between Food Availability and Food Insecurity

Food consumption primarily depends upon the presence of food commodities in local markets that are approachable to local communities. A person who has the opportunity of availability of food on their premises can opt for accessing, purchasing, and utilizing food. On the other side, the non-availability of items in required quantities to the masses can create a food crisis and expose them to food insecurity. The association between food availability and food insecurity is given in the table- and explained below.

Results in the table- show that non-availability of required vegetables for daily meals at home a highly significant (p=0.000) with food insecurity. Similarly, deficiencies of the required food in daily meals at home show a highly significant association with food insecurity. Moreover, insufficient availability of required meat in daily meals exhibited a highly significant association (p=0.000) with food insecurity. Food insecurity starts with the availability of the required quality and quantity of nutritious food for healthy living. Fruits, vegetables, and meat are some of the very basic food components that are required to meet the protein, starch, and vitamins related dietary needs of humans. The above result shows an unsatisfactory state of availability of these food components in regular food availability at the household level which led to a state of food insecurity among the community members evident from the highly significant association. A series of research studies linked food insecurity to the unavailability of the basic food components at household, community, regional and national levels due to administration, institutional and political failures. Other studies further added that the repercussions of the non-availability of food items are specifically harsh on marginalized groups like women ethnic minorities, children, and old age people from poor and lower (Smulders et al., 2013, Ishaq et al., 2018). Literacy, awareness, and good governess can help in approving the access of masses to required food commodities through its ensured availability. However, low awareness, the poor state of literacy, and adverse government policies constrained the marginalized group by reducing available items to them and exposing them to food insecurity (Abegaz, 2017, Habtezion, 2012).

The result further shows that insufficient availability of milk and dairy products at home exhibited a highly significant association (p=0.000) with food insecurity. Moreover, insufficient availability of bread to feed family members also shows a highly significant association (p=0.000) with food insecurity. In addition, a low intake of dry fruit at home also shows a highly significant association (p=0.000) with food insecurity. Bread, milk, and dry fruits are the other important food ingredients consumed by the human in their daily diet intake. Wheat constitutes the most important component of
the daily diet in terms of quantity it provides the carbohydrates, starches, and glucose that are required for normal body function. Iron and zinc are additional trace elements that are supplied through the consumption of wheat in a routine diet. Milk and nuts are the basic sources of vitamins consumed on regular bases. The above results point to an insufficient state of accessibility to these basic dietary components that are subjective to the community members to food insecurity. These results are validated by (FAO, UNICEF, WHO, IFAD, and WFP, 2019) according to which more than one-third (1/3) of the population of developing countries suffer from food insecurity due to their limited access to their basic dietary needs. The insufficient access to food commodities is streamlined by the poor governance and poverty in association with each other. The patriarchal structure further deteriorates the institutional functions by depriving women of accessing their basic dietary needs under the cover of cultural, economic, and social inequalities (Ghanem, Smulders, FAO, 2008). Natural and manmade disasters are the additional factors that exposed marginalized groups like women and ethnic minorities to food insecurity by disrupting the process of food availability (Tandon et al., 2017). Food availability is the starting point for securing human beings from food insecurity. The political institutions, the administrative setup, and the production systems working in coordination secure the basic dietary needs of human beings through its availability. On the other side, the socio-economic status of the masses and their socio-cultural inequalities subject the poor and marginalized groups to consume an insufficient quantity of basic food ingredients and expose them to food insecurity. The natural and manmade hazards pose additional hindrances to reducing food availability as external factors. On the other side, poverty, illiteracy, and low state of awareness are conglomerate internal factors that restrict food availability to extremely vulnerable people and subject them to food insecurity.

| Table 3: Association between Food Availability and Food Insecurity |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| S. No | Statement | Agree | Dis-agree | Total | P-Value & Chi-square |
| 1 | The vegetables required for the daily meal are available to you at home. Agree | 27(9.3) | 149(51.2) | 176(60.5) | \(x^2 = 117.402\) \(P= 0.000\) |
| | Dis-agree | 91(31.3) | 24(8.2) | 115(39.5) | 0(0.0) | |
| | Neutral | 0(0.0) | 0(0.0) | 0(0.0) | 0(0.0) | |
| 2 | The fruit required for the daily meal is available to you at home. Agree | 8(7.1) | 105(92.9) | 113(100) | \(x^2 = 85.847\) \(P= 0.000\) |
| | Dis-agree | 110(61.8) | 68(32.2) | 178(100) | 0(0.0) | |
| | Neutral | 0(0.0) | 0(0.0) | 0(0.0) | 0(0.0) | |
| 3 | The meat required for the daily meal is available to you at home. Agree | 0 | 98(100) | 98(100) | \(x^2 = 97.716\) \(P= 0.000\) |
| | Dis-agree | 118(60.5) | 77(39.5) | 195(100) | 0 | |
| | Neutral | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | |
| 4 | You have sufficient milk/dairy products to feed you at home. Agree | 8(6.7) | 111(93.3) | 119(100) | \(x^2 = 95.565\) \(P= .000\) |
| | Dis-agree | 110(64) | 62(36) | 172(100) | 0 | |
| | Neutral | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | |
| 5 | Availability of bread at home is not a problem for your family. Agree | 48(22.3) | 167(77.7) | 215(100) | \(x^2 =113.497\) \(P= .000\) |
| | Dis-agree | 67(91.8) | 6(8.2) | 73(100) | 0 | |
| | Neutral | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | |
| 6 | The dry fruits are available at home for you to eat. Agree | 7(6.1) | 107(93.9) | 114(100) | \(x^2 = 92.916\) \(P= .000\) |
| | Dis-agree | 105(63.6) | 60(36.4) | 165(100) | 0 | |
| | Neutral | 6(50) | 6(50) | 12(100) | 0 | *

* Values in the table represent frequencies and values in parenthesis represent the percentage proportion of respondents

**Conclusions and Recommendation**
There was an insufficient supply of basic food ingredients like wheat, vegetables, fruits, meat, milk, and nuts to the local community members at the household level. The causes of food unavailability are
multi-dimensional ranging from the problem of low awareness, poverty, and inequality to institutional and administrative failures to ensure sufficient food availability at the household level. The poor state of food availability exposed the community members to a high risk of food insecurity. Creating awareness among the masses to improve the knowledge of availability, accessibility, and better utilization of nutritious food in sufficient quantity and to avoid food insecurity by using mass media, social media, social campaigns, awareness raising drives, and interpersonal channels. Broadening the economic basis of income and employment generation to ensure the economic security of marginalized groups to sustain their living through improved availability, accessibility, and utilization of food according to the international standards of food security.

References
Sleet, P. (2019). Food security in Pakistan: surplus food is not enough to create a food secure country. Global Food and Water Crises Research Program, Australia.
Role of Agile and Lean Supply Chain Strategy on Firm Performance: Evidence from Drinking-Water Industry of Sindh, Pakistan

*Ikramuddin Junejo, Assistant Professor, Department of Management Sciences, SZABIST Hyderabad Campus, Pakistan
Mehtab Begum Siddiqui, Assistant Professor, Institute of Commerce, University of Sindh, Jamshoro, Pakistan
Noureen Bhutto, Assistant Professor/PhD Scholar, Department of Public Administration, University of Sindh, Jamshoro, Pakistan
Jalil Ahmed Thebo, Faculty Member, Department of Management Sciences, SZABIST Larkana Campus, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email: ikramuddin.junejo@hyd.szabist.edu.pk

ARTICLEDETAILS
History
Revised format: May 2022
Available Online: Jun 2022

Keywords

JEL Classification
L00, L10, L25

ABSTRACT
Purpose: The objective of present was to determine the role of agile and lean supply chain strategy on firm performance in drinking-water industry of Sindh, Pakistan. For obtaining the research objective of this study primary data gathered through questionnaire from previous studies.

Design/Methodology/Approach: Questionnaire was self-administered and printed questionnaire distributed among employee which are working in the drinking-water industry of Sindh, Pakistan. Total 200 questionnaires were distributed among only 180 received back complete filled. Hence, the response rate was 90% which good response rate for concluding findings of present study. Reliability analysis performed in SPSS version 25 but hypotheses were tested via multiple regressing analyses in AMOS version 25.

Findings: Findings, confirmed positive and significant impact of agile and lean supply chain strategy on firm performance in drinking-water industry of Sindh, Pakistan. However, the agile supply chain strategy has more significant impact on firm performance due to higher beta value.

Implications/Originality/Value: Based on limited knowledge of authors, this is the first study which applied resource based-view theory in context of drinking water industry of Sindh, Pakistan.

©2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-Non-Commercial4.0


Introduction
The instability into drinking water industry has been observed from both perspectives downstream as
well as upstream (Giri & Bardhan, 2014). In regards, many firms in drinking water have adopted the agile and lean strategy in their supply chain strategies for addressing the instability into drinking water strategy. However, the consumers always look for the flexible supply chain in this competitive industry due to easy to entry of new suppliers (Gligor et al., 2015 & Blome et al., 2013). The agile SCS plays an important used for launching the innovative product among the competitive market in order to retain into industry (Qi et al., 2011). This strategy only be implemented if, a quick response shown by the firms with necessary adjustments (Yusuf et al., 2004). In addition, the recent economic conditions of Pakistan the supply chain disruption are the on peak. It is necessary for the firms for the survival into industry to response these uncertainties through quick and supply chain strategies such as the lean SCS and agile SCS for long run survival with better bottom-line (Tse et al., 2016; Junejo et al., 2022). The drinking-water bottle firms mainly depend on plastic pellets which are very expensive nowadays due to instability of oil prices and exchange rate particularly in developing countries like Pakistan (Abiodun et al., 2021; Rehmani, and Siddiqui, 2019). The economic problems should be addressed through the effective supply chain strategies (Sugeng et al., 2010).

Furthermore, the supply chain strategies including the agile and lean supply chain strategy if not managed then firm performance is mainly affected badly (Dobrzykowski et al., 2016&Bevilacqua et al., 2017). There are numerous studies also revealed that the lean supply chain strategies are important for the stable supply chain performance which will enhance the firm performance in terms of inventory cost and reducing waste so on (Prajogo et al., 2016; Nawairi et al., 2013; Chavez et al., 2015; Antony et al., 2012). In addition, the case of failure agile SCS also leads to diseconomies of scale that ultimately lose the cost leadership among industry (Gligor et al., 2015; Um, 2017). Besides, the internal importance of these strategies, they also play vital role to fulfill the customer requirements through effective and efficient response supply chain (Tse et al., 2016; Martinez-Sanchez & Lahoz-Leo, 2018;Chan et al., 2017;Alzoubi & Yanamandra, 2020 & Eckstein et al., 2015). The objective of this study is in order to fill the research gap the role of agile and lean supply chain strategies on firm performance in drinking-water firms in Sindh, Pakistan have been studied.

Literate review
Theoretical Framework
The research based-view theory suggested that the long run strategies can benefit the firm in long run (Barney, 1991). In this regard, the supply chain strategies including the agile and lean supply chain strategies can improve the overall financial performance of firm. The effective supply chain strategies can improve the customer responsiveness as bottom-line supply chain performance leads to firm performance (Melnyk et al., 2010). Lean SCS and agile SCS can benefits to firms in various ways are answer time, lithe supply chain capabilities and cost (Yusuf et al., 2004 & Qi et al., 2011). The lean supply chain strategy basically covers the overall supply chain effectiveness whereas the agile mainly focus on overall competitive advantage in competitive market (Ben et al., 1999). Therefore, the present study the two supply chain strategies lean and agile have been drawn from the theory of resource based-view theory for examining the role on firm performance financial performance in drinking-water industry in Sindh, Pakistan.

Past Studies and Hypothesis Development
Lean
There are various forms of lean supply chain such as TQM (total quality management), JIT (just in time) and Kanba (Ardalan & Diaz, 2012). According to Bortolotti et al., (2015), through the TQM the lean can be achieved in supply chain which will reduce the overall cost of respective firm. The effective lean also can decrease the great level of rework and defects within firm (Yin et al., 2016). The implementation of lean supply chain strategy is better due to higher reduction of cost of raw material (Shah et al., 2020). The lean supply chain strategy usually helps in the reducing the overall inventory cost and as results better turnover of finished products produced (Shashi et al., 2019). In addition, the manufacturing firms save the cash flows from raw material with proper implementation of lean supply chain strategy within firm. Thus, the following hypothesis is suggested:
H1: Lean supply chain strategy positively related to firm performance.

Agile

There are two important aspects of agile supply chain strategy: the timely supply of goods and services to market and to gain competitive advantage among competitive industry through meeting the customer expectations and introducing new products with key current demand of market (Lee, 2004; Whitten et al., 2012). In addition, the various advantages also cannot be ignored including loading time, schedule sharing and inventory mobility so on (Swafford et al., 2006 & Awasthi & Omrani, 2019). The agile supply chain strategy mainly addresses the problems of supply chain dynamic and response the supply chain with current situation (Qrunfleh & Tarafdar, 2014). Furthermore, all the efforts of agile supply chain strategies end results are the better firm’s financial performance (Chan et al., 2017). The full rate or replenishments also can be achieved through effective implementation of agile supply chain strategy within firm. Therefore, the following hypothesis has been developed.

H2: Agile supply chain strategy positively related to firm performance.

Methodology

The primary data is gathered from drinking-water bottled firms of Sindh, Pakistan, which are operating in Karachi. The middle level and top-level employees were targeted. The data has been obtained on printed self-administrated questionnaire. Total 200 employees was requested to fill the questionnaire. However, 180 questionnaires were completely filled; hence the response rate was 90 percent.

The questionnaire was taken from the past studies in order to measure construct such as lean supply chain strategies so on. This study is based on convenience and snow ball sampling strategies which are type of non-probability sampling type. These sampling strategies were chosen due to time and non-participative behavior of respondents for this research. There are three variables are considered in this study one dependent variables (financial performance) and two independent variables (Lean supply chain strategy and agile supply chain strategy). The questionnaire was consisting of five likert scale ranging from negative strongly disagree to positive strongly agree (1 to 5). Lean supply chain four items were adopted from the study of (Qi et al., 2017). Items were based “supply chain reduces any wastes; selects supplier based on cost; selects supplier based on quality; has to maintain a long relationship of suppliers”. The agile supply chain strategy was taken from the study of (Qrunfleh & Tarafdar, 2013). Research items were “supply chain provides the customer with customized products; selects supplier based on flexibility; selects supplier based on responsiveness; has to maintain a short relationship of suppliers”. Lastly, the financial performance was taken from the study of (Chan et al., 2017). The four items were “Return on Investment (ROI), Return on Asset (ROA), production cost, Return on Sales (ROS)”.

Results & Discussion

Profile of Respondents

Table 1 represents the profile of respondents. There are 3 categorized are given below including the gender of respondents, age of respondents and work experience of respondent. In the first category gender of respondents’ female employee are consists of 83 and male employees are consisting of 97 respectively. Second category, age of respondents is consisting of less than 25 years 105, 26-35 years 47, 36-45 years 19 and 46-above are 18 respectively. Lastly, work experience of respondents less than 5 years 126, 5-10 years 26, 11-16 years 14 and 17-above 14 respectively.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender of respondent</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>46.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>53.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Reliability Analysis

The Table 2 Represents The Reliability Analysis Of Gathered Data Through Adopted Questionnaire. It Is Important To Calculate The Internal Consistency Of All Collected Data (Sekaran And Bougie, 2010). The Key Decision To Be Taken Is The Value Of Cronbach Alpha Value Which Is Suggested By Hair Et Al., (2014) Should Be 0.70. If, All The Studied Variables Found To Have Cronbach’s Alpha Value Equal Or Greater Than 0.70 Than It Can Be Conclude The Research Instrument Is Reliable. You Can Notice In Our Study All Variables Have Cronbach’s Alpha Value Greater Than 0.70. However, The Highest Value of Cronbach’s Alpha Value Is .0896 (Firm Performance) And Lowest Value Of Cronbach’s Alpha Value Is .838 (Agile Supply Chain Strategy).

Table 2: Reliability Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Cronbach’s Alpha</th>
<th>Number of Items</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Firm Performance</td>
<td>0.896</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agile supply chain strategy</td>
<td>0.838</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lean supply chain strategy</td>
<td>0.881</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Authors’ Estimation

Hypothesis Testing

The multiple regression analysis was applied in AMOS version 25 for measuring the impact on independent variables (agile supply chain strategy and Lean supply chain strategy) on dependent variable firm performance. The results of present study are shown in Table 3. Findings revealed that all agile supply chain strategy and lean supply chain strategy are found to have positive and significant impact on firm performance (beta value = 0.332, p<0.05) and (beta value = 0.513, p<0.05) respectively.

Furthermore, it is necessary to measure the issue of multicollinearity among independent variables because if there is high collinearity among independent variables than the results of regression analysis usually considered as the overestimated (Hair et al., 2014). Thus, in the present study you notice all VIF (variance inflation factor) values are less than suggested value 5. Therefore, the current results are not overestimated.

Table 3: Multiple Regression Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dependent variable</th>
<th>Independent variable</th>
<th>Value of Beta (Standard coefficient)</th>
<th>Significance Value</th>
<th>VIF</th>
<th>Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Firm Performance</td>
<td>Agile supply chain strategy</td>
<td>0.332</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>1.394</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lean supply chain strategy</td>
<td>0.513</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>1.394</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note**Significance level at 0.05
Source: Authors’ Estimation
Discussion and Theoretical Implication
The present study’s findings are aligned with previous studies. The lean SCS has the influences on the financial performance (Nawanir et al., 2016; Prajogo et al., 2016; Shashi et al., 2019). Similarly, the agile supply has significant impact on financial performance, the findings are confirmed by other research scholars as well of (Wahyuni et al. 2020; Martinez-Sanchez and Lahoz-Leo 2018; Tse et al., 2016; Eckstein et al., 2015 & Chan et al., 2017).

In the present study theory of resource-based view theory is related to two important supply chain strategies including lean supply chain strategy and agile supply chain strategy in order to confirm the financial performance of water-bottled industry of Sindh, Pakistan. In order to fill the theoretical gap a research model is developed and checked. Empirical findings, suggested that the resource-based theory outcomes are aligned with lean supply chain strategy and agile supply chain strategy such as timely delivery of raw material, proper scheduling and effect use of scare resources so on. In long run through applying these strategies various bottom line can be achieved such delivery of finished products on time, better sales projections and better cash flows in terms of financial performance.

Concluding Remarks and Future Research Directions
The key objective of present was to examine the role of agile supply chain strategy and lean supply chain strategy on financial performance of drinking-water firms based on Sindh, Pakistan. Primary data gathered via research instrument questionnaire. Findings, revealed that there is statically significant impact of both agile supply chain strategy and lean supply chain strategy on financial performance of drinking-water firms based on Sindh, Pakistan. Furthermore, the lean supply chain strategy is more positive and significant on financial performance as compare to agile supply chain strategy due to higher beta value.

There numerous limitations of present study which open doors for the future researchers. This study based on cross-sectional research design but in future longitudinal study design can be applied for confirming the existing findings of study. Second, present study is based on a single industry so the results cannot be generalized for the entire manufacturing. Third, mediation effect can be checked through a complex research model.

References


Cotton Growers Perception Level Regarding Pesticides Practices and Toxic Effects of Pesticides on Cotton Plants as Well as the Environment in Sindh

*Muhammad Ismail Wasan, Ph.D. scholar, Department of Statistics, University of Sindh, Jamshoro, Pakistan
Muhammad Rafique Daudpoto, Assistant professor Department of Statistics University of Sindh Jamshoro, Pakistan
Uzair Essa Kori, Statistical officer at State Bank Pakistan Karachi, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email address: mismailwassan110@gmail.com

**ARTICLEDETAILS**

**ABSTRACT**

**Purpose:** Pesticides are used to stop or control insects, for instance, weeds, dreadful little creatures, and plant pathogens. The perception among cotton growers of beneficial and harmful effects of pesticides on cotton plant and environment, factors concerning with pesticides applications have a very essential role to get maximum yield.

**Design/Methodology/Approach:** The 300 samples were collected for this study and the reliability of the questionnaire is checked by Cronbach’s Alpha test its worth was 0.92 and items were perfectly correlated to one another. The majority of respondents' age was 31-40 years with education level matriculation. Unfortunately, the low literacy rate and education level of the respondents is discouraging. It is also noticed that a large number of respondents had 31- above acres size of land from which 16-20 acres were used for cotton cultivation. The test statistic provided all probability values are highly significant

**Findings:** In conclusion, cotton growers have sufficient knowledge about pesticide practices and excessive usage of pesticides harms the cotton plant as well. It is quite right that pesticides are the major cause of environmental pollution.

©2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-4.0


**Introduction**

Agriculture is the guideline channel of giving crude materials to industry similar to the business community for present-day items. Cotton is the certified fiber yield and lifesaver of Pakistan's economy. A tremendous green thing gives the work to cultivators in Pakistan and unrefined material to the business. Cotton is a significant fiber yield and helps Pakistan’s economy. A significant agrarian ware
gives business to ranchers in Pakistan and natural substance to the material business. Cotton contributes 7% worth of increased to farming and 1.5% to the GDP of Pakistan. Be that as it may, 2012-13 isn’t a useful year for cotton cultivators of Pakistan. Whiteflies and thrips caused the greatest harm to the cotton in the cotton belts of Punjab and Sindh. (Shahid et al. 2013) Cotton is a significant fiber crop planted in the dry climate of Pakistan on an area of 3.20 million hectares with an all-out creation of 2.15 million tons. (APTMA 2016).

Pesticides are substances that are utilized for controlling creepy crawly/insects which harm the harvest, manage the development of the plant, build the yield of harvest, and so forth. Two billion chemical pesticides each year, within which at least US$ 819 million are considered toxic enough to be classified as dangerous by the World Health Organization. The pesticide is used successfully in controlling several diseases, such as malaria and typhus World Health Organization. (Whitehouse et al., 2005). Pesticides are used to stop or control insects, for instance, weeds, dreadful little creatures, and plant pathogens, while diminishing the measure of work, fuel, and apparatus used for creepy crawly/bother control (Osteen and Szmedra, 1989; These points of interest convert into lower creation costs, higher collect yields just as quality, and improved advantages for cotton cultivators. The favorable circumstances for U.S. cotton cultivators are exhibited by their readiness to spend around $12 billion on pesticides in 2008 (USDA/ERS, 2010). Pesticides were used for the first time in 1950 in Pakistan to battle creepy crawly ambush. In 1954, imports of substance pesticides meant 254 tones and in 1980; the organization controlled the imports and maintained the dissemination of pesticides. As showed by the Prime Minister's Task Force on Agriculture, generally 90% of the creepy crawly/bother splashes and pesticides are used on cotton crops. That infers most of the 6.62 million segments of land used for the improvement of cotton crops for instance the target of pesticide use (PAN International Website, basic social affair, PANAP p.2). It has been reported that consistent indiscriminative utilization of pesticides has made super durable harm to the climate and created opposition in bug species against these synthetic substances. The cultivating networks are less mindful of the suggested measurements and techniques for insecticidal application and as result, the regular fruitfulness of the dirt is diminished. (Shetty, Barik and Gautam 2014).

This study describes the hazards of pesticides/ Insecticides and herbicides but the benefits of pesticides/Insecticides and herbicides cannot be denied. Few benefits of pesticides/ Insecticides and Herbicides are given below.

**Benefits of Chemical Pesticides**
The top advantage of pesticides is their adequacy against bugs that would somehow demolish crops huge and little. By controlling bugs and rodents, pesticides forestall the spread of infection and safeguard structures from termite pervasions. Pesticides additionally keep the cost of dress and food somewhere around disposing of hunters that would annihilate crops, raising the expense of things like corn and cotton. Indeed, even careful instruments and working rooms are cleaned with pesticides, as per the Environmental Protection Agency. The yield assurance advancements influence the expense of food, where without them, food creation would decline. Many products of the soil would be hard to find and the costs would rise. They are utilized to control termites, bugs, subterranean insects, rodents, and different vermin, they permit the purchasers to have excellent harvests that are liberated from bug imperfections and bug pollution.

**Negative Impacts of Pesticides**
Substance pesticides cause compound contamination for the dirt, the water, and the air, they cause serious well-being dangers like a malignant growth, sensory system sicknesses, and concepetive issues in individuals who are presented to the pesticides through home and nursery openness. They can harm the rural land by hurting the helpful bug species, the dirt microorganisms, and the worms which normally limit the irritation populaces and keep up with the dirt wellbeing. Pesticides are poisonous substances delivered into our current circumstances to kill living things. They kill weeds, bugs, the organism,
rodents, and others. Short openings to certain pesticides might kill or nauseate the natural life. They are harmful to live creatures. They cause air contamination when they are suspended in the air as the particles are conveyed by the breeze to different regions, and They decrease the centralizations of plant supplements in the dirt like nitrogen and phosphorous. They debilitate the plant root foundations and the resistant frameworks. Numerous honey bees and butterflies are lost, they are the pollinators that do cross-fertilization normally, they assume a significant part in the plant cycles and development and the plants that are prepared to utilize pesticides become quicker.

**Objectives of The Study**

To examine the perception level of cotton growers regarding pesticides usage
To study the impacts of pesticides on cotton plant
To study the impacts of pesticides on the environment

**Hypotheses**

H₀: There is no perception of pesticide usage among cotton growers.
H₀: there is no negative impact of pesticide usage on the cotton plant.
H₀: there is no negative impact of pesticide usage on the environment.

**Material and Methods**

**Study area:** Sindh represents 18% of the nation's territory region, 16% of its absolute edited region, and contributes around 23% to the public horticulture esteem added. (Sindh Agriculture Policy (2018-2030). Matiari contributes significantly to the agribusiness area of Sindh because its environment is appropriate for the development of different harvests, including the Kharif yields of maize, rice, sugarcane, cotton, and bajra and Rabi harvests of wheat and grain. Also, organic product plantations are bountiful in this region. This locale is popular, all over Pakistan, for its Bananas and mangoes. The total population of the district is 655065 from which 196520 live in the urban area and 458 545 live in rural areas, The majority of the population of rural areas depends upon agriculture. The present study was carried out in the tehsil Matiari, tehsil Hala and tehsil Saeedabad of district Matias.

**Sample Size and Sampling Procedures for Data Collection**

The primary data were collected by an organized questionnaire consisting of four sections demographic
information, pesticide impacts, cotton growers' PERCEPTION, and farm expenditure. The questionnaire was designed in English language and translated into the Sindhi language for easiness for the respondents. The Likert five option scale was used 1. Unsatisfied, 2. Poor satisfied, 3. Neutral, 4. Satisfied and 5. More satisfied. The survey was started in June 2018. The data were collected from district Matiari and the whole district is consisting of three tehsils (Matiari, Hala, Saeedabad) and 30 union councils. The four U/Cs were randomly selected from each tehsil Twelve U/Cs from the Whole district of Matiari and five villages were selected randomly from each U/C and five questionnaires were filled to respondents from each village, the total sample size of cotton growers was 300 samples for this study. The field survey was completed through simple random sampling for selecting union councils and villages from the whole district.

**Statistical Analysis**

Data were compiled in a spreadsheet for further processing and following analysis in the statistical software SPSS (23–versions). Descriptive techniques are exceptionally useful tools for presenting information, investigating the information, and describing the data. The reliability of the data is checked through the statistical test Cronbach's Alpha. The gathered information is presented in frequency distribution and percentage. The non-parametric statistical tool the Kuraskul-Walis H Test was applied to examine the toxic impacts of pesticides and the perception of pesticide utilization among the cotton growers.

**Results and Discussion**

The demographic profile of the respondents (figure2) describes the characteristics of a particular rural society. It is quite evident from the fact that all respondents were mature, and experienced. A huge number of respondents were landlords and farmers, they were oneself concerned with pesticide practices. The majority of respondents' age was 31-40 years with education level matriculation. Unfortunately, the low literacy rate and education level of the respondents is discouraging. It is also noticed that a large number of respondents had 31- above acres size of land from which 16-20 acres were used for cotton cultivation. The maximum interval of farming experience was 16 20 years among the cotton growers.

**Age**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>41 to 50</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31 to 40</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21 to 30</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 to 20</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Education**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Illiterate</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Any Other</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intermediate</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metric</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Reliability Statistics of the Questionnaire
It is fundamental to test the reliability of the instrument and questionnaire. The reliability test quantifies the consistency of items and crosses the information. Reliability coefficient determines the sum to which results on a scale can be estimated as inside steady of solid. The reliability coefficient called Cronbach’s alpha is a proportion of between class connection and its range is from 0 to 1. The value of Cronbach's Alpha for reliability obtained through SPSS is 0.944, which means that the data were excellent and the questionnaire was valid for the research.

Cotton Grower’s Perception Level Regarding Pesticides Practices
Before applying pesticides on crops it is very essential to get information about the toxic effects of pesticides on different things, crops, vegetables, fruits, animals, birds, and the perception of the pesticide applications among growers. (Bush 2016) Accomplished the cotton cultivators consciousness approach on the utilization of insect control systems, application supported insecticides against objective difficulties and came about that cotton cultivators don't depend upon any set heap of manufactured substances or materials and by and large, they depend upon the information given by the pesticide vendors to the utilization of insect showers in their cotton crop in South Asian countries.

### Table 1: Cotton grower’s perception level regarding pesticides practices

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Perception level regarding pesticides practices</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std</th>
<th>Chi-square value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Harms of pesticides are known</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>184</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>3.60</td>
<td>1.085</td>
<td>188.567</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Necessary precautions are known</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>199</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>3.50</td>
<td>1.007</td>
<td>406.733</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The technical application of pesticides is known</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>176</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>3.38</td>
<td>.999</td>
<td>297.967</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proper pesticides product for disease can be chosen</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>2.14</td>
<td>1.181</td>
<td>186.633</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A precautionary costume is used</td>
<td>172</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3.45</td>
<td>1.160</td>
<td>179.867</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dosages information</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>171</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>1.93</td>
<td>1.222</td>
<td>284.033</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disease knowledge</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>176</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>3.62</td>
<td>1.273</td>
<td>155.576</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instruction is read and understood as mentioned on the bottle</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>152</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>3.45</td>
<td>1.160</td>
<td>179.867</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Harms of pesticides were well known among the cotton growers because 188.567 at the degree of freedom 4 and P-value 0.000 is highly significant. Hussain et al. (2011) conducted a cross-sectional survey in the district Jhang of Punjab and invited 99 farmers to their perception of pesticide application (Hussain et al. 2011). Necessary precautions and technical applications were known among the cotton growers because statistical tool values 406.733 and 297.967 with p values 000 do not fall in the critical region indicating that cotton growers have good information about the precaution and technical applications, they had good knowledge to choose proper pesticides product information. But the majority of the respondent had not received training about pesticide applications, they were traditionally skilled mostly of them do not use precautionary costume. The researcher asked about diseases and dosages information they had good knowledge about the diseases and dosages as the values of test statistics 284.033 and 95.567 lie too away from the critical region and probability values are also less than the specified level of significance. Singh et al. (2013) Analyzed the ranchers' view of the utilization of suggested pesticides for legitimate techniques and measurements and surveyed the effect of key financial and institutional variables on the reception of suggested pesticide application. Singh et al. (2013) it is also noticed that instruction and expiry date of the pesticides product were red carefully by them the results are mention table no 1, after applying pesticides mostly respondents used to wash their hands and face immediately as $\chi^2 = 55.55$ is highly greater than critical region value and probability value 0.000<0.05. Most cotton growers are unconscious of the potential toxicities of pesticides. They have no data about the sorts of pesticides, their level of harm, hazards, and wellbeing measures to be taken before utilization of those pesticides. Because of this reason, dangerous and environment-constant synthetic concoctions are utilized to kill insects/pests which can likewise rapid deliberate, accidental, or word-related introduction. These mixes have long time impacts on the health of humans (Sharma et al. 2012). (Amera 2015) analyzed the impression of ranchers concerning the utilization of pesticides for controlling bug bothers in cotton involving undeveloped ranchers in cotton creation. One hundred 82 ranchers (half of the prepared and the rest undeveloped) were chosen by advantageous examining from 8 towns. (Amera 2015).

**Toxic Effects on Cotton Plant**

The positive effects of pesticides cannot be denied on different kinds of crops, vegetables, and foods, especially cotton crops. Insecticides are often the only practical way to control the insects that spread deadly diseases such as malaria, resulting in an estimated 5000 deaths each day (Ross. (2005)).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Toxic impacts on cotton plant</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std</th>
<th>Chi-square value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Stop the Growth of plant</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>143</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>3.47</td>
<td>1.152</td>
<td>157.067</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harm Branches of plant</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>3.19</td>
<td>1.232</td>
<td>159.767</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Excessive use damages roots</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>3.43</td>
<td>1.210</td>
<td>135.567</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Excessive use is the cause of infertility</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>2.67</td>
<td>1.376</td>
<td>71.333</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kills friendly Insects</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>3.82</td>
<td>0.973</td>
<td>250.433</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Furthermore, those pesticides have a toxic impact on the various parts of cotton plants as well. In this study toxic effects were found on the growth of the cotton plant and roots of plants due to excessive usage of pesticides; the test statistic chi-square provides results 157.067 and 159.667 do not fall in the critical region, and p values are less than the specified level of significance, showing that excessive usage of pesticides damages the plant growth as well as roots of plants. The majority of pesticides reduce the fertility of the land and kill the friendly insects which help in the enhancement of cotton production is also resulting through statistical analysis with the values of chi-square 71.333 and 250.333 are less than the critical value of 9.46 and probability values 0.000 are highly significant, those are main evidence that pesticides utilization is the major cause of infertility and kill the friendly insects of crops.
Earthworms accept a huge activity in the soil organic framework by going about as bioindicators of soil debasement and as models for soil hurtfulness testing. Worms also add to soil lavishness. Pesticides have not spared earthworms from their toxic effects and the latter is displayed to the past principally by methods for spoiled soil pore water.

**Pesticides' toxic impacts on the environment**

Pesticides are known in the world for their toxic effects. Those pesticides are very beneficial for the protection of crops, fruits, and vegetables. Besides, those pesticides harm many atmospheric things also. (Sharma et al. 2013) Most cotton growers are unconscious of the potential toxicities of pesticides. They have no data about the sorts of pesticides, their level of harm, hazards, and wellbeing measures to be taken before utilization of those pesticides. in this research, a few objects were taken and found effects of pesticides on them

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Toxic impacts of pesticides on the environment</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std</th>
<th>Chi-square value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cause of Underground water contamination</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>2.64</td>
<td>1.297</td>
<td>72.500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cause of environmental pollution</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>119</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>3.15</td>
<td>1.254</td>
<td>79.767</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harms the biological life</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>178</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>3.49</td>
<td>1.016</td>
<td>299.233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negatively affects human health during spray</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>159</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>3.57</td>
<td>1.121</td>
<td>207.700</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

During a survey in India, 58% of drinking water samples drawn from various hand pumps and wells around Bhopal were contaminated with Organochlorine pesticides above the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) standards (US EPA, 2001). Pesticides have a severe negative impact on underground water, during the survey it is observed water has been contaminated due to pesticides usage and respondents also informed that the water position is not the same after applying pesticides the man evidence is statistical measure provide result 72.500 with probability value 0.00 is highly significant it indicates water has contaminated due to pesticides usage. (Agrawal et al 2010) There are organochlorines, which are utilized as pesticides. These pesticides are the least biodegradable and their utilization is prohibited in numerous countries. Other than this reality, organochlorines are much utilized in numerous places in the world. This outcome has real health hazards. Water contamination is on the ascent because of these pesticides, even at low fixation, these pesticides have a danger to the environment Environmental pollution is the major problem of the world, there is the major influence of pesticides to make it polluted, in this research also observed that pesticides have polluted environment with chi-square value does not fall in the critical region and p-value is highly significant. Biological life and human health are also affected with test statistic values 299.233 and 207.700 lies so far to the region and probabilities values 0.000 < 0.05 those are indicating that biological life and human health are also disturbed by using of those pesticides on the various crops, foods.

**Conclusion**

This study was carried out to know the PERCEPTION of cotton growers regarding pesticide utilization on cotton crops and the toxic effects of pesticides on the cotton plant as well as the environment. The results of statistical analysis are indicating that cotton growers have adequate knowledge about the harms of pesticides and they apply the necessary precaution of pesticides while using the spray. They can choose proper pesticide products for disease and have good knowledge of crop diseases and dosages of pesticides. it is also observed that they were traditionally skilled they had not got training in pesticide application. Instructions about pesticide applications and expiry of the date of pesticide product were read and followed by them, after applying pesticides face and hands were washed by them immediately. Toxic effects of pesticides were found on the growth of a plant, branches of a plant, roots of a plant, fertility of the soil, and friendly insects which were damaged badly due to excessive usage of pesticides. Besides, pesticides are a key factor to pollute the water and environment they have contaminated the water and environment because of that biological life and human health is also affected negatively.
References


Hussain, M., Sarwat Zia, and A. Saboor. (2011). The adoption of integrated pest management (IPM) technologies by cotton growers in Punjab. Soil Environ. 30(1):74-


Regime Shift Behavior and Interconnectedness of Stock Market Volatility and Exchange Rate Movements: Empirical Evidence from Emerging and Developed Economies

Attaullah, Research Scholar, Institute of Business Management Sciences, University of Agriculture Faisalabad, Pakistan
*Kashif Hamid, Lecturer, Institute of Business Management Sciences, University of Agriculture Faisalabad, Pakistan
Muhammad Yasir Saeed, Visiting Lecturer, Institute of Business Management Sciences, University of Agriculture Faisalabad, Pakistan
Shareen Hussain, Lecturer, National University of Modern Languages, Faisalabad, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email address: kashif.boparai@gmail.com

**ARTICLE DETAILS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>History</th>
<th>ABSTRACT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Purpose:</strong> The purpose of this study is to examine the regime shift behavior and interconnectedness between stock market volatility and exchange rate in a pre and post COVID context.</td>
<td><strong>Design/Methodology/Approach:</strong> For this purpose Pakistan India and China has been taken as emerging economies and USA UK and Japan as developed economies. Daily data of exchange rates and stock market indices have been used from Jan, 1 2011 to Apr 30, 2021. Markov regime switching model, GARCH model and Granger causality test has been used.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Keywords:</strong> Stock Market volatility, Exchange rate, GARCH, Regime Shift Behavior</td>
<td><strong>Findings:</strong> The outcomes of this study empirically confirmed that the Markov regime switching model is flexible model because it captures regime shifts in the mean and variance equation of all sample economies. Moreover, the sum of GARCH (1,1) indicates that volatility shocks are persistent except India. Study also concluded that exchange rate volatility has significant positive impact on stock market of Pakistan, USA and Japan in a pre COVID context.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JEL Classification</td>
<td><strong>Implications/Originality/Value:</strong> A post COVID context has significant impact on the stock market of India, U.S.A. and U.K. Granger causality results indicates unidirectional relationship for Pakistan, China and USA. Whereas for Japan bi-directional relationship is found but for India and UK no directional causality exist.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**O24, F62, E42**

©2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-4.0

Introduction

Volatility is a statistical indicator of ups and down in a price of a particular security or stock market indices. Greater the uncertainties in stock prices the higher the risk. Volatility is usually calculated as the standard deviation or variation of returns from a single stock or security market index. Volatility is also synonymous with significant shifts in all directions in the securities markets. If the stock price, for instance, increases and decreases by more than one percent over the long term, it is considered a volatile market (Yadav, 2017). The stock market activities substantially impact both the national economy and investors’ daily lives. Changes in the financial market are expected to affect exchange rates Rajkovic et al., (2020). The decline in share price is more likely to lead to the prevalent economic collapse. Term volatility can be interpreted as the difference in stock prices that may change over time. In stock return, the deviation in portfolio values differs over some time. The ups and downs in the exchange rate are characterized as risk, linked towards unpredictable swap rate fluctuations. Swap rate refers to the concerning of currency of one country to another. In a somewhat different view, it can be viewed as a price Bagh et al., (2017). In past studies, several researchers identified the relationship between stock market volatility and exchange rate movements. The exchange rate can be described as the currency swap rate between two countries (Abbas, 2010; Bagh et al., 2017; Saeed, et. Al., 2020).

Kumar (2013) claims that understanding the dynamic connection between stock prices and exchange rates is critical because this link may affect policymakers’ monetary and fiscal policy choices. The study of associations is widely acknowledged as a simple way to understand how information is transferred from stock markets to foreign currency markets and vice versa Mozumder et al., (2015). Existing literature identifies two ways of linking trade and stock values. The first is the market canal for commodities, which shows that exchange rate fluctuations affect foreign company’s competition and income and stock values. Depreciation of local currency reduces export product prices, leading to a rise in international demand and revenue.

On the other hand, as domestic currency is appreciated, the selling company’s external market reduces such that the company’s earnings will fall and its stock price decreases. While on the other hand, its reverse impact is true for importers. Moreover, the exchange rate fluctuations influence the value of a firm’s outstanding and foreign currency payable receivables (Dornbusch and Fischer, 1980; Cakan and Ejara, 2013). According to this argument, exchange rate volatility affects stock prices depending on both the weight and the extent of trade imbalances within a region Pan et al., (2007). This situation assumes the causal influence on the stock market of swap rate.

A second link is an asset market or fund balance approach that indicates that stock price movements will influence exchange rate changes. Currency exchange rates are determined on the basis of the portfolio balance strategy via the market mechanism. An anticipated rise in market prices resulting from hopes of economic growth will draw international money, which is why the demand for the country’s currency rises and vice versa. As a result, higher stock values are linked to local currency appreciation. On the other hand, stock price fluctuations can pressure exchange rates because investment prosperity and demand for the currency rely on stock market success (Gavin, 1989). As in the financial crisis, for example, a sudden disturbance in demand for assets will result from investors’ herding conduct or a lack of confidence in economic and political stability, such as 1998 Russian government bond default, or the 2001 Turkish currency crisis, which shows that stock prices movement cause exchange rate fluctuations (Yasir Saeed et al., 2018).

This study covers the gap of present regime shifts prevailing in the emerging and developed economies. The study is essential in this era because the changing dynamics of world trade during the COVID-19 pandemic have shifted the demand and supply forces across the economies. The stock returns and exchange rate have been exploited. This study contributes to testing the regime shift behavior and interrelatedness among ups and downs of the stock market and exchange rate, causal linkage, and impact of the stock market on the exchange rate in emerging and developed economies. This study is intended
to seek the following objectives. Firstly to investigate the regime shift behaviour in stock returns of emerging and developed economies to capture the interrelatedness of exchange rate and stock return. Secondly, to examine the causal linkage between the stock market and the exchange rate of emerging and developed economies. Thirdly to determine the impact of stock market return on the exchange rate of emerging and developed economies. Lastly to provide directions and policy guidelines for the literature, investors, stock market brokers, and currency dealers in developing and emerging economies.

The remainder of the paper is laid out as follows. The prior literature on the relationship between exchange rates and stock markets is presented in Section 2. The Markov-switching regression, GARCH model, and data are discussed in Section 3. Section 4 contains a discussion of the empirical findings. The significant results are summarized in Section 5.

**Literature Review**

Liang et al. (2013) investigated the connection between currency exchange rates and stock markets in Indonesia, Malaysia, the Philippines, Singapore, and Thailand using 2008 to 2011. They utilized panel Granger causality and panel DOLS techniques. They used stock indexes as dependent variables and the foreign exchange swap rate as an independent variable. They found evidence supporting portfolio balancing theory.

Mustaq and Shah (2014) directed an experimental study on connection amid swap rate also equity index in Pakistan. Investigation stretches across the period of ten years, from 1997 to 2013. They used the Granger causality test to inspect the relationship. The results show that rates of swap and equity prices are connected in the long run, and this supports the long-term connections of the variables. The link between swap rates also the market of equity index is bidirectional. As a result, information travels in both directions, and because of this, bidirectional causality exists.

Caporale et al. (2014) inspected the interrelationships amid equity return and swap rate return variations during the 2008 financial crisis to better understand the processes through which exchange rate and stock return changes are linked. To build country-specific UEDCC-GARCH models, applied. They used daily data from 2003 to 2011. The study’s findings confirmed that the forex market influences the US and the UK stock market, while the stock market influences Canada’s forex market. This was true across Europe and Switzerland as well. In this instance, the co-integration test showed that Japan and the Euro area were no longer synchronized when the financial crisis began.

Ejaz et al. (2016) investigated the correlation path amid the rate of swap as well as equity market price ups and downs spillovers in India. From January 1992 to February 2013, monthly time series data of Bombay Stock Exchange rates (BSE-100 Index) and India’s exchange rate (Rupee against US Dollar) were used. The Phillips Person (PP) unit root test was used to ensure stationery. To calculate the variance, the GARCH model was applied to each vector. Granger causality analysis is performed on the sequence of each attribute. The Granger causality test reveals a bidirectional association between ups and downs in India’s swap rate and equity market price.

Ahmed (2019) examined the occurrence of excess possessions of swap rate fluctuation on stock prices over two altered reality-based regimes (soft peg period secondly free float one). He used the ARLD (autoregressive distributed lag modelling framework) model to find short and long-run asymmetries. In the soft peg regime period, stock returns are significantly affected by positive or negative EGP/USD exchange rate fluctuations. In the free-float period, long-term asymmetric exists while the short-term asymmetric disappears. It was confirmed that currency devaluation had a substantial effect on stock returns compared to currency appreciation.

Nguyen (2019) conducted a study over seven years on six countries between 2007 and 2013 to inspect the short and long term dynamics of currency and equity values. He used stock indices as a dependent variable as well as currency swap rate as an independent variable. The findings of multivariate causality
analyses in China and India revealed no short-run connection between the variables. In the case of Brazil, however, there is bidirectional causation amid equity values as well as swap rates.

Methodology
The purpose of the current study is to investigate the regime shift behaviour and interrelatedness between stock market volatility and exchange rate movements, causal linkage, and impact of the stock market on the exchange rate. From 1st Jan 2011 to 30th Apr 2021, secondary daily data was used regarding emerging stock markets of (Pakistan, India, and China) and developed stock markets (the USA, UK and Japan). The web source of yahoo finance is used to obtain the indices data of emerging markets Pakistan, India, and China and developed markets USA, UK, and Japan; secondly, oanda.com and other exchange rate data websites are used to get currencies exchange rate. To confirm the volatility impact amid rate of swap and equity market of developed and emerging economies (Pakistan, India, China, USA, UK, and Japan) variables GARCH (1, 1) model used with explanatory variable change in the exchange rate and COVID period. Markov switching regression applied to check the regime shift behavior among the sample economies. Granger causality test was used to measure the causal association between swap rate and equity market of developed and emerging economies (Pakistan, India, China, USA, UK, and Japan).

Markov switching regression
Markov switching regression was applied to check the regime shift behaviour among the sample economies. According to the first-order Markov assumption, there must be a relationship between the likelihood of entering a given regime and its initial state.

\[ y_t = \mu_s + x_t\alpha + z_t\beta_s + \varepsilon_{s,t} \]

Where
- \( y_t \) = Dependent variable
- \( \mu_s \) = state dependent intercept
- \( x_t \) = vector of exog. variables with states invariant coefficient \( \alpha \)
- \( z_t \) = vector of exog. variables with states dependent coefficient \( \beta_s \)
- \( \varepsilon_{s,t} \sim iid \ N(0, \sigma^2_s) \)

GARCH
To confirm the volatility impact of exchange rate on equity market of developed and emerging economies (Pakistan, India, China, USA, UK, and Japan), GARCH (1, 1) model applied with explanatory variable change in the exchange rate and COVID period.

\[ h_t = \alpha + \beta x_t + u_t \]
\[ u_t | q \sim iid M(0, h_t) \]
\[ h_t = \beta_0 + \sum_{i=0}^p \beta_1 h_{t-1} + \sum_{j=0}^q \gamma_1 u^2_{t-1} \]

Variance Regressor
Variance regressor is the further addition in the GARCH model. The other independent variables are calculated in this that substantially influence the gain of equity markets.

\[ h_t = \beta_0 + \sum_{i=0}^m \beta_1 h_{t-1} + \sum_{n=0}^m = 0 \beta_2 u^2_{t-1} + \sum_{n=0}^0 v_i X_b \]

Granger Causality Test
The Granger Causality test was performed to see whether there was a relation between the stock and currency markets. In situations when we know that two variables are linked, but we don’t know which one affects the other, the Granger Causality test is utilized. We might conclude that the stock and currency market crises occurred simultaneously because of the similarity in their timing. However, the Granger Causality test determines whether the link flows from the stock market to the currency market or the other way around. It goes like this:-

Suppose that E and S are two variables that represent the exchange rate and the stock index. Using the
following equations, we can determine whether S or E granger is to cause.

\[ E_t = \beta_0 + \beta_1 E_{t-1} + \ldots + \beta_p E_{t-p} + a_1 S_{t-1} + \ldots + a_p S_{t-p} + \varepsilon_t \]

In order to verify the directionality of the link, the Granger Causality test requires running two tests simultaneously. As a result, the second assessment is

\[ S_t = \beta_0 + \beta_1 S_{t-1} + \ldots + \beta_p S_{t-p} + a_1 E_{t-1} + \ldots + a_p E_{t-p} + \varepsilon_t \]
### Result and Discussion

Markov Switching regression

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>KSE Coefficient</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>z-Statistic</th>
<th>Prob.</th>
<th>BSE Coefficient</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>z-Statistic</th>
<th>Prob.</th>
<th>SSE Coefficient</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>z-Statistic</th>
<th>Prob.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Regime 1</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R_EXRAT</td>
<td>0.019045</td>
<td>0.03449</td>
<td>0.552189</td>
<td>0.5808</td>
<td>-0.6308</td>
<td>1.389822</td>
<td>-0.453841</td>
<td>0.6499</td>
<td>-0.025198</td>
<td>0.013749</td>
<td>-1.832712</td>
<td>0.0668</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LOG(SIGMA)</td>
<td>-5.010629</td>
<td>0.039</td>
<td>-128.4769</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>-2.4849</td>
<td>1.06435</td>
<td>-23.3463</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>-4.937497</td>
<td>0.030499</td>
<td>-161.8914</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Regime 2</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R_EXRAT</td>
<td>-0.1406</td>
<td>0.070828</td>
<td>-1.985086</td>
<td>0.0471</td>
<td>-0.1196</td>
<td>0.03074</td>
<td>-3.89005</td>
<td>0.0001</td>
<td>-0.017426</td>
<td>0.010032</td>
<td>-1.736986</td>
<td>0.0824</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LOG(SIGMA)</td>
<td>-4.140119</td>
<td>0.043499</td>
<td>-95.17666</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>-4.6629</td>
<td>0.016485</td>
<td>-282.8658</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>-5.556744</td>
<td>0.022444</td>
<td>-247.5815</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Transition Matrix Parameters</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P11-C</td>
<td>3.018443</td>
<td>0.2296</td>
<td>13.14653</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>-0.1494</td>
<td>0.397032</td>
<td>-0.37636</td>
<td>0.7066</td>
<td>4.180497</td>
<td>0.423176</td>
<td>9.878851</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P21-C</td>
<td>-2.179251</td>
<td>0.241554</td>
<td>-9.021784</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>-5.2941</td>
<td>0.444822</td>
<td>-11.90156</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>-4.738516</td>
<td>0.379698</td>
<td>-12.47968</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Akaike info criterion</td>
<td>-6.468107</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-6.342992</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-7.771481</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schwarz criterion</td>
<td>8004.58</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>7964.112</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>9724.351</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Log likelihood</td>
<td>-6.444592</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-6.319757</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-7.748185</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Transition Matrix Parameters

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>NYSE Coefficient</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>z-Statistic</th>
<th>Prob.</th>
<th>LSE Coefficient</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>z-Statistic</th>
<th>Prob.</th>
<th>TSE Coefficient</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>z-Statistic</th>
<th>Prob.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Regime 1</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R_EXRAT</td>
<td>0.22074</td>
<td>0.032477</td>
<td>6.796784</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.282216</td>
<td>0.036381</td>
<td>7.757334</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.836339</td>
<td>0.13361</td>
<td>6.259569</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LOG(SIGMA)</td>
<td>-5.181608</td>
<td>0.028518</td>
<td>-181.6964</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>-5.012547</td>
<td>0.025746</td>
<td>-194.6905</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>-3.812203</td>
<td>0.052068</td>
<td>-73.21578</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Regime 2</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R_EXRAT</td>
<td>0.388966</td>
<td>0.119793</td>
<td>3.246981</td>
<td>0.0012</td>
<td>-0.599875</td>
<td>0.128398</td>
<td>-4.672004</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.45237</td>
<td>0.04346</td>
<td>10.40885</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LOG(SIGMA)</td>
<td>-3.995327</td>
<td>0.037959</td>
<td>-105.2549</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>-4.032953</td>
<td>0.038667</td>
<td>-104.2994</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>-4.67894</td>
<td>0.026701</td>
<td>-175.2365</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Transition Matrix Parameters</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P11-C</td>
<td>3.762744</td>
<td>0.22178</td>
<td>16.96612</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>3.686151</td>
<td>0.246851</td>
<td>14.93268</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>2.406152</td>
<td>0.299222</td>
<td>8.041369</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P21-C</td>
<td>-2.616209</td>
<td>0.222995</td>
<td>-11.73217</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>-2.395445</td>
<td>0.252489</td>
<td>-9.487342</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>-3.900106</td>
<td>0.287684</td>
<td>-13.55693</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Log likelihood</td>
<td>-6.778609</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>8583.916</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>7659.945</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Akaike info criterion</td>
<td>8784.909</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-6.613125</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-6.073795</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schwarz criterion</td>
<td>-6.755978</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-6.590523</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-6.050645</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
We see, from the upper part of the table, the differences in the regime specific means (Regime 1, Regime 2:) for the emerging (Pakistan, India, China) and developed (USA, UK, Japan) economies, we termed the pre and post COVID (in this case, the pre and post-COVID) growth rates for the emerging (Pakistan, India, China) and developed (USA, UK, Japan) stock market price for the period under study (2011 – 2021). We can also observe that both regimes are significant at (p<0.10, 0.05, 0.01) in the case of China USA, UK and Japan. This implies that the dynamics in both regimes are substantial. We can also observe that regime 2 is significant at (p<0.05, 0.01), while regime 1 is not because (p>0.05) in the case of Pakistan and India. This implies that the dynamics in the first regime is not substantial. Further, the transition probabilities (P11) are also higher than (P21) in the case of Pakistan USA and the UK. It indicates the persistence of two different volatility regimes. Whereas the transition probabilities (P11) are less than (P21) in the case of India, China and Japan, which indicates the no persistence of two different volatility regimes. The bottom section of the table shows the standard descriptive statistics for the equation. AIC, SIC and log-likelihood confirm that model is good fit or not.

- GARCH

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statistics</th>
<th>Parameter</th>
<th>KSE</th>
<th>BSE</th>
<th>SSE</th>
<th>NYSE</th>
<th>LSE</th>
<th>TSE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mean Equation</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>0.000906</td>
<td>0.001658</td>
<td>-0.0000336</td>
<td>0.000696</td>
<td>0.000303</td>
<td>0.000893</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>p-value</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.7229</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.0429</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R_SI(-1)</td>
<td>0.176613</td>
<td>-0.013284</td>
<td>-0.086219</td>
<td>-0.033437</td>
<td>0.004797</td>
<td>-0.018914</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>p-value</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.616</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.1411</td>
<td>0.8298</td>
<td>0.4017</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variance Equation</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>0.00000757</td>
<td>0.0000409</td>
<td>0.00000208</td>
<td>0.00000437</td>
<td>0.00000424</td>
<td>0.0000088</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>p-value</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RESID(-1)^2</td>
<td>0.149979</td>
<td>1.337006</td>
<td>0.031277</td>
<td>0.209544</td>
<td>0.145298</td>
<td>0.141647</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>p-value</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GARCH(-1)</td>
<td>0.779288</td>
<td>0.136992</td>
<td>0.960709</td>
<td>0.737739</td>
<td>0.805472</td>
<td>0.811104</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>p-value</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R_EXRAT</td>
<td>0.000549</td>
<td>0.000299</td>
<td>-0.00000446</td>
<td>-0.000212</td>
<td>-0.0000639</td>
<td>-0.000691</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>p-value</td>
<td>0.0012</td>
<td>0.2627</td>
<td>0.5965</td>
<td>0.0428</td>
<td>0.575</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COVID Period</td>
<td>0.00000113</td>
<td>0.0000434</td>
<td>0.0000000434</td>
<td>0.00000596</td>
<td>0.00000686</td>
<td>1.21E-06</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>p-value</td>
<td>0.4362</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.3708</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.0002</td>
<td>0.4439</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diagnostic Test</td>
<td>AIC- statistics</td>
<td>-6.4647</td>
<td>-5.991772</td>
<td>-7.761829</td>
<td>-6.844312</td>
<td>-6.62642</td>
<td>-6.005779</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Log likelihood</td>
<td>8007.013</td>
<td>7529.67</td>
<td>9720.929</td>
<td>8877.228</td>
<td>8608.089</td>
<td>7580.287</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The table results showed GARCH (1, 1) with explanatory variables (R_EXRAT and Dummy COVID Period). The C and R_SI (-1) in the mean equation are positively or negatively significant and insignificant. The statistically current and past value is substantial because the p-value is lower than the level of significance. The α1+ β1 measures the degree of persistence of volatility shocks. The analysis also found that the sum of GARCH coefficients (α + β) is very close to one in the present study accept BSE, indicating that volatility shocks are pretty persistent and long retention in the conditional variance in five country’s stock markets accept BSE Findings also concluded that change in the exchange rate affects the stock market except for India China and UK. It was confirmed that the COVID period affected the stock market except for Pakistan, China and Japan. The bottom section of the table shows the standard descriptive statistics for the equation. AIC SIC and log-likelihood confirm whether the model is good fit or not.
The above table presents the results of Granger causality tests for the residual series. There is strong evidence of bi-directional Granger causality between stock prices and exchange rates. Granger causality test shows bi-directional causal relations between stock prices and exchange rates for Japan. There is a significant Granger causality from stock prices to exchange rate for Pakistan, but the reverse causality is not statistically significant. Results also reveal a unidirectional relationship for China and USA from exchange rate to stock prices; therefore, the reverse causality is not statistically significant. India and UK exhibit no significant causal relations in either direction. Similar to the results of the analyses, the majority of the countries show significant unidirectional causalities between exchange rates and stock prices. These analyses support both the goods market and portfolio balance hypotheses regarding the causal relations between stock prices and exchange rates.

### Conclusion
This research examined the volatility dynamics between the stock and currency markets in developing and established countries (Pakistan, India, China, the United States of America, the United Kingdom, and Japan) during the pre and post COVID period from 1st Jan 2011 to 30th Apr 2021. Firstly, the study concluded that the Markov-Switching Regression model is a high-degree flexible model because it captures regime shifts in the mean and variance equation of all economies. Moreover, the sum of GARCH coefficients ($\alpha + \beta$) is very close to one in all economies except India in the present study indicating that volatility shocks are pretty persistent. The study also concluded that change in exchange rate statically affect the stock market of Pakistan, USA and Japan, and the COVID period affect the India, U.S.A. and U.K. Granger causality test confirmed unidirectional relationship for Pakistan, China and USA, For Japan bi-directional relationship and for India and the UK no directional exist.

### References


Impact of Trade Facilitation Reforms on The Trade Volume of SAARC Countries

Kubra Siraj, Ph.D. Scholar, Applied Economics Research Centre University of Karachi, Pakistan
Muhammad Imran Khan, Ph.D. Scholar, Applied Economics Research Centre University of Karachi, Pakistan
Syed Kamran Abbass Naqvi, Assistant Professor, Applied Economics Research Centre University of Karachi, Pakistan

Corresponding author’s email: imran14pide@gmail.com

ARTICLE DETAILS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>History</th>
<th>Revised format: May 2022</th>
<th>Available Online: Jun 2022</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Keywords</th>
<th>Trade facilitation, Trade, South Asia, Trade liberalization policy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>JEL Classification</th>
<th>F1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

ABSTRACT

Purpose: The purpose of the study is to inform the ministry of commerce and trade about the significant implications of trade facilitation for the improvement of trade in the SAARC region. This paper attempts to estimate the relationship between trade facilitation indicators and trade volume and also explored the correlation between trade facilitation reforms and the trade volume in the case of SAARC countries.

Design/Methodology/Approach: This paper is an empirical approach, which is based on secondary data from SAARC countries for the period 2006 to 2013. The study uses Pooled OLS, Fixed effect, and a random effect model for the empirical analysis.

Findings: The results of the study show, that is a significant relationship between trade facilitation and trade volume. Decreasing the total number of documents required will make it possible for SAARC countries to trade with high frequency. The study also found that a marginal decrease in the total cost of trade also encourages traders to reach the targeted trade volume.

Implications/Originality/Value: The trade facilitation reforms can be an effective policy option on the regional level across all the SAARC countries. However other policy reforms and actions such as basic physical infrastructure, good governance, and ensuring political stability are also obligatory for the possible improvement of the trading capabilities of SAARC countries.

© 2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-Non-Commercial-4.0


Introduction

Trade and economic growth are interlinked phenomena and there exists a long-run causal relationship between the production of goods and trade volume (Khan M. I., 2017). The study supplementary contended that trade is one of the most important influencing factors for the
economic growth of a developing country. To enhance the macroeconomic indicators, a country is expected to engage in internal and external trade. Countries with an easy mode of doing business setups and trade-related facilitation policies have achieved successive economic growth. According to Wilson, et al (2005) is very essential to define the trade facilitation measures on the national level. The United Nations Centre for Trade Facilitation and Electronic Business (UN/CEFACT) has defined trade facilitation as the “simplification, standardization and harmonization of procedures and associated information flows required to move goods from seller to buyer and to make payment”. Assorted procedures and documentation raise costs and cause impediments not only for businesses but also for consumers’ Li, and Wilson (2009). This is quite a realistic approach for all economies of the world, but it has several negative implications, primarily for the developing countries of the world. that a 10% increase in export time reduces developing country’s export by 8-12% (Djankov, et al., 2010). Furthermore, Exporter’s governance indicator exhibits a positive impact on export performance in developed and developing countries. Only a 1% increase in the average tariff rate is associated with a 0.8% of reduction in exports in a country. Sadikov (2007).

There is a need for reforms in favor of trade facilitation for developing countries which can further accelerate the escalating growth in trade volume and Gross domestic product (GDP) of the developing countries. This implies that the trade facilitation hypothesis is yet to be validated in different cases. According to Afridi et al (2019), most of the SAARC member countries are the poorest and the lowest per capita income countries. The most important channels to raise the economic growth of a country are trade and foreign direct investment. To attract foreign investment, it is important to provide facilities to investors to sustain the markets against the fast-growing competition. Traders and investors can be encouraged by removing unnecessary requirements for doing business and trade. Trade facilitation has been a matter of great consideration for both public and private investors in the last few decades and has become a considerable part of the existing debate on trade liberalization policy all across the world. Based on the argument of Wilson, et al (2005), that trade facilitation indicators improvement should be at the center of trade development policies, especially in the case of developing countries. It can be observed that the world is talking about the expansion of trade through simplification. The WTO Doha Round discussion on trade facilitation is one of the important development in the matters of trade, particularly for developing countries because it is expected to create an ease of doing cross-border trade “to and from” developing nations. International trade has amplified extremely over the last few years due to reduction in tariff rates and liberalization policies, which also signify the implementation of trade facilitation in real economies of developing countries.

For the amplification of international trade flow, the key factors are the transaction cost of trade and the time that is consumed while delivering the products and services which if reduced can have a significant impact on trade volume (Diakantoni et al., 2017). The direct and indirect trade transaction costs involved in export procedures might amount to a maximum of 15 percent of the value of traded goods Grainger, A. (2016). A cut of 5 percent on the transaction cost can boost the investment in trade due to the increased margin of profit. Better trade facilitation indicators of a country can help a nation to gain several potential benefits for the economy. It also increases tax collection and pushes the distributor toward better use of resources, which increases trade compliance, and attracts foreign direct investments (FDI). Trade facilitation plays a vital role to promote free trade across countries. Trade facilitation implies how procedures and controls prevailing the movement of goods across national boundaries can be improved by reducing the associated cost burdens to make it more efficient. Countries that implement trade facilitation reforms to enlarge the trade efficiency and connectivity are generally likely to create a center of attention for more FDI inflows and other traders across the world. There are tons of research papers, which show that synchronization of trade patterns is very important for increasing the trade volume and numbers of products traded, but to my knowledge, none of the studies has yet empirically tested the relationship between trade facilitation and trade volume in the context of SAARC countries. This paper attempts to empirically estimate the relationship between trade facilitation indicators and
The trade facilitation measure is based on several sub-indicators, which include the number of documents required for a trade transaction, the time required in days, and the cost of export or import per container. Trade facilitation indicators show that trade barriers are comparatively higher in Afghanistan, Buttan, and Maldives as a result of a high number of documents required for the transaction. Trade time for Afghanistan is the highest and the lowest in Sri Lanka. Additionally, it also shows that trade time for Pakistan is less than India, indicating greater facilities for trading with Pakistan as compared to India. In terms of restrictions on imports, Buttan is the strictest among the selected countries, imposing the requirements of the highest number of documents. Pakistan has the lowest cost of imports among all the SAARC countries listed above in table no 1.

**Trade Facilitation and Trade Volume**

There are almost a million studies conducted on trade and economic growth and other important indicators of trade and economy. The literature shows that trade facilitation is a very important approach to boosting the volume of trade in emerging economies. The study of Mufti, and Ali (2020) indicates that trade labialization has significant implications for trade growth in SAARC countries. The study of Moïsé and Sorescu (2013) highlights the importance of trade facilitation policy areas under negotiation at the WTO in the context of developing countries. The report established that trade facilitation is a helping hand for a country, which has the potential to trade across borders. Hyo and Chong (2012) analyzed the impact of trade facilitation on trade volume in the framework of cross-sectional data from 150 developing and 26 developed countries. This paper employed a pooled OLS estimation technique and found that an improvement of 1 percent, in the trade facilitation measures will increase the extensive margins of primary export by 1.3 % and manufactured export by 2.4 % respectively. It will be quite interesting to explore types of margins in the case of SAARC countries. Low-income countries (LIC) and low-middle-income countries have better logistic efficiency traded with more variety of primary products, while in the manufactured sector higher logistic capability had the highest impact for upper middle-income countries. Shepherd, and Wilson (2009). Trade facilitation in ASEAN member countries: Measuring progress and assessing priorities. *Journal of Asian Economics*, 20(4), 367-383. pointed out in South East Asia that transport infrastructure and availability of communications technology are very important for trade volume in this region. The higher the efficiency higher will be the impact on manufactured export for the upper middle-income
countries, whereas the lower-income countries’ logistics efficiency has a more intensive impact on the exports of primary goods. Another study by Djankov et al. (2010) examined that each additional single day in the delay of products being shipped reduces trade by at least 1% for agricultural goods. The delay of one day reduces a country’s relative export by 6%. One additional signature required for exporting reduces the country’s export by about 4.5%. Business registration procedures affect exports of differentiated products due to the associated opportunity cost. A very comprehensive work by Iwanow and Kirkpatrick, (2009) analyzed 124 countries’ data set for the period 2003-2004 by using the second stage Hickman procedure and found that the trade cost is an important indicator of export performance. The findings unearthed that a 10% improvement in the regulatory environment increase 5% in manufactured export performance. Social factors, which include Common language and colonial heritage play a significant impact on bilateral trade. Furthermore, a study by Helpman, et al (2004) found that transport costs and tariffs have a strong negative effect on export sales relative to FDI. He also found that more heterogeneity at the firm level leads to significantly more FDI sales rebut to export sales. Lesser, and Moisê-Leeman, (2009). investigation proved that trade facilitation reforms improve the export performance of developing countries. The impact of physical infrastructure and information and communication technology plays an important role in the growth of exports on national and international levels. A conspicuous study by Hamanaka, (2014) found that an increase in physical infrastructure by 0.01 % corresponds to a 1.99% increase in TFP (total factor productivity). Similarly, 0.01 % increase in border & buss are associated with TFP growth of 0.36% & 0.37 % respectively. Control of corruption and openness are both associated with higher TFP. An empirical work conducted by Inma et al (2008) investigated that decreasing the number of days and low transport costs impact positively on the total volume of trade. Trade facilitation instruments have the potential to persuade traders to switch from informal to formal trade. It will also help to moderate direct and indirect transaction costs arising due to the mandatory obligations for imports and export-related measures. This mechanism helps to reduce trade-related regulations for some of the selected low-value transactions. [Caroline et al (2009)].

Data and Methodology
The data of the study is taken from World Bank Website, doing business Index, UNCTAD, and World Integrated Trade Solutions. The data is taken from multiple sources because of the integrated nature of this study. The study has applied Pooled OLS, Fixed Effect, and Random Effect regression models to estimate and compare results across different econometric techniques. The study used a fixed effect model to check the cross countries’ heterogeneities. In this model the parameters are fixed because it calculates the times series mean and process it as crosssectional unit. While, incongruous to the first model random effect model has random parameters because the variables are random across the time, which captures the time bound variations. Use of random effect model is chosen on the bases of houseman test. This test is utilized to understand two important aspects of panel data or pooled data analysis. First, to detect the endogenous variables in the regression, endogeneity exists in the model if the variable has values that are determined by the other variable in the model. Finally, to test and understand the performance of fixed and random effect model, the pooled OLS is employed as a baseline model.

Model Specification and Data Sources
The following baseline econometric model is estimated to evaluate the impact of trade facilitation indicators on the trade volume of SAARC countries: This section represents the equation to answer the question that “Does trade facilitation measures matters for trade volume in the context of SAARC countries? In order to scrutinize the robustness of the results, three estimation techniques pooled OLS, FE (fixed effect,) RE (random effect,) and various model specifications are tested for the validation of results estimates.
\[ \text{Trade}_{jt} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 \text{Ctrd}_{jt} + \beta_2 \text{Ttrad}_{jt} + \beta_3 \text{Dtrad}_{jt} + \beta_4 \text{GDP}_i t + \beta_5 \text{GDP}_j t + \beta_6 \text{pop}_i t + \beta_7 \text{pop}_j + \beta_8 \text{p} \text{opi}_{ij} + \beta_9 \text{trop}_{jt} + \beta_{10} \text{Trf}_{jt} + \beta_{11} \text{Y}_i t + \beta_{12} \text{Y}_j t + \beta_{13} \text{CB}_{jt} + \beta_{14} \text{CL}_{jt} + \beta_{15} \text{D}_{ij} t + \text{i}t \] (1)

Where

\( \text{Trade}_{jt} \) is the total volume of bilateral trade (calculated as import + export) between importing and exporting countries in the given time period \( t \) which is taken as a thousand US dollars. This is the dependent variable of the study.

\( \text{Ctrd} \) is the cost of trade measured in terms of US dollars per container from each SAARC country to the destination of the hosting country. This is an independent regressor, which indicates the trade facilitation in the model.

\( \text{Ttrad} \) is the time to trade taken as a number of days for declaration of the port. This indicates the port inefficiency which is expected to have an adverse association with trade volume.

\( \text{Dtrad} \) is the total number of documents required to trade (export/import) a standard container of merchandise, requires certain registration documents, which show and make the trade counted in our national accounts.

\( \text{GDP} \) is the gross domestic product at the constant price of the exporting country and importing country denoted by \( i \) and \( j \) respectively in the given time period, represented by the subscript \( t \) in the equation. Higher GDP can have two directional impacts on trade volume. Reduction in imports also reduces trade volume and it can be also in a manner that increases exports due to a greater amount of goods produced. These impacts are more of a definition concern in empirical studies.

\( \text{pop}_i t \) is the population of exporting country and importing country denoted by \( i \) and \( j \) respectively in the given time period \( t \). while \( \text{pop}_{ij} t \) are the number of common people in both countries.

\( \text{Trop} \) is trade openness which is taken as \( \text{(import + exports =TRADE/GDP)} \).

\( \text{Trf} \) is the tariff rate applied MFN which is applied by the host country to the other country.

\( \text{CB} \) is a dummy for common border 1 if trading countries share a common border takes value one and 0 otherwise.

\( \text{CL} \) is a dummy variable for a common language in exporting and importing countries, it takes value of one if the exporting and importing countries share a common language and 0 otherwise.

\( \text{D}_{ij} t \) is the distance between trading countries, taken in kilometres by CEPII.

\( \text{it} \) is the error term.

**Uniqueness of this work**

This paper is unique in terms of capturing the counterfactuals Vs causal effects to understand the difference of outcomes for something is happing or the SAARC countries do and something had done by any of the members.

**Empirical Results for Trade Facilitation Indicators and Trade**

The results of the study indicate that all the three measures of trade facilitation are significantly associated with trade volume across the SAARC countries, and these findings are largely consistent with the results and findings of previous studies. The sign of coefficients shows negative causal effects of growing cost of trade, increasing time to trade and number of documents on trade volume of the SAARC countries. The number of documents has a time oriented causal effects on trade volume. Documents requirements are increasing over time but remains almost same across the SAARC member countries.
The positive link between trade facilitation measures and trade volumes is well documented for developing countries before and SAARC block is not an exception. However, effects of trade barriers on trade are much higher out of SAARC region. It indicates that export promotion agencies of SAARC block are effectively contributing in safeguarding the value of trade markets in SAARC countries. The second important finding from the results can be seen as the tariff rate is negatively influencing the trade volume of SAARC member countries. Furthermore, all other macroeconomic indicators are statistically significant, indicating a positive association with trade volume. The study found that the GDP of importing and exporting countries both are highly significant, which implies that countries with high GDP are frequently involved in bilateral trade and thus contribute to the trade volume of these countries. The distance and tariff are the only control variables whereas the time and cross-sectional differences are observable across the different three models. However, the time effect is statistically stronger in this case. Detail results for all three models are provided in appendices a1, a2, and a3 right after the bibliographic references of the study.

**Discussion on Findings in Light of Literature**

The results of this study are consistent with the findings of previous studies in the literature. Trade facilitation for investment in infrastructure and regulatory reform can drastically enhance export performance, which is particularly true for (Portugal-Perez and Wilson 2012), and this study indicates such findings from the fixed effect model. Similar Studies have shown that Improvement in trade facilitation increases export diversification in developing countries (Dennis and Shepherd 2001). However, this study has some limitations, it doesn’t cover export diversification. The study by Wilson et al. (2005) pointed out that improvements in the customs and regulatory environment, port efficiency, and e-business infrastructure would raise exports of African countries by almost ten percent. Research findings reveal that simplifying and harmonizing the trade procedures increases the volume of trade in SAARC countries. This finding is in the line of study by Hausman, et al (2013). They found that a 1% reduction in the cost of trade would lead to an increase of 2.6% in export of that country. The second measure of trade facilitation; Time to trade is also negatively associated with trade volume. Coefficients of concern variable are highly significant and reveal that increase in time delay to complete the trade procedure would cause to decrease in the trade volume. this negative correlation finding of the current study is supported empirically by Sadikoun (2007) that a 1% increase in border delays would on average lead to the export volume being diminished by 0.44%. Finally, Documents to trade (the third measure of trade facilitation) is also highly significant and negatively related to trade. Empirical results suggest that by decreasing the number of documents required in completing the trade procedure would positively enhance the trade volume of the member countries of SAARC. This finding is consistent with the work of Moïsé, et al (2011). Trade facilitation indicators: The impact on trade costs. Control variables of host country and investing country both are highly significant and positively affect the trade volume. Increased GDP of any trading partner would boost the trade volume of that country. The Population of the host country positively impacts the trade volume. Trade openness is also positively associated with trade volume. The increasing effect of trade openness would also increase the total trade volume of that country. The tariff rate is highly significant and consistent with three measure of estimation technique pooled OLS, fixed effect, and random effect shows that a 1% reduction in tariff rate applied by a country cause to increase the trade volume by 5.53%. Per capita income of host and source countries is positively related to trade inflow. Increasing the impact of per capita income on the people of a country would encourage them to spend more and indirectly increase the trade volume of the country. Common border (CB) and common language CL are also positively correlated and have significant impacts on trade volume. Distance between trading partners shows ambiguous but significant results with pooled OLS and RE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2: Trade Facilitation and Trade Volume</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Independent Variables</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

398
Conclusion
This paper is based on secondary data and the study attempts to explore the relationship between trade and trade facilitation. The study explored in the literature that trade facilitation is important for the growth of trade volume and Export-trade-led growth theories have established that trade is one of the most important contributors to economic growth. Better trade facilitation indicators of a country help to gain several potential benefits for that economy for insentience, tax collection, use of resources and trade compliance, and the inflow of FDI, these indicators can be improved if the trade facilitation policies are implemented through powerful negation across the countries of interest. The main point of this paper is whether the trade facilitation indicators affect the trade inflow in the region of SAARC. To assess this research question, whether improved trade facilitation measures enlarge the trade volume of the SAARC countries? Three indicators of trade facilitation: such as time to trade is taken in a number of days, cost of trade is taken as US dollars per standard container, and a number of total documents required for trade procedure is included in the different model specifications to investigate their impact on the trade volume of SAARC countries. Overall all three measures of trade facilitation are significant, broadly consistent, and support the hypothesis, that trade facilitation increases the trade volume in the region of SAARC. Hence decreasing the cost of trade, time to trade and the number of documents to trade can increase the trade volume of sample countries. The results of this hypothesis confirm the very important link between trade facilitation measures and trade for SAARC countries. The findings on the trade facilitation measures support the hypothesis that improvement in trade facilitation and SAARC countries’ trade are positively linked. Poor trade facilitation indicators seem to be impediments to their trade performance and the results confirm that there is a dire need for the improvement of these measures. While other control variables of the model included in the model are the GDP of importing and exporting countries, the population of both countries, and trade openness (TROP) tariff rate (TRF) and show significant and consistent results with the expected sign of the theory. Common border (CB) and common language (CL) are
significant but with different signs of general theory show a negative relation between variables with trade volume in the region of SAARC. Overall findings suggest that trade facilitation is an effective policy tool to enhance trade volume of the SAARC region. So it is important to take action for the relaxation of the regulatory environment in SAARC countries. Unfortunately, trade facilitation indicators of the region are very disappointing as compared to other developing countries. Hence, the government and policymakers of the SAARC region need to pay special attention to reforms for improvement in these trade facilitation measures particularly for enhancing the volume of international trade.

References


**Appendix A1 Table: 3: Fixed Effect (independent variable: trade)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CTRD</td>
<td>-6.7E7*</td>
<td>-7.67e7***</td>
<td>7.5e7***</td>
<td>8.96e7***</td>
<td>7.65e7***</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.068</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.002)</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.003)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TTRD</td>
<td>-6.76e7*</td>
<td>-4.65e7*</td>
<td>-2.62e9**</td>
<td>2.97e7***</td>
<td>2.96e7***</td>
<td>-2.44e9**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.089</td>
<td>(0.051)</td>
<td>(0.024)</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.0267)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DTRD</td>
<td>-6.76e7*</td>
<td>2.66e7***</td>
<td>-2.95e7***</td>
<td>1.17e7**</td>
<td>2.96e7***</td>
<td>-6.41e9**</td>
<td>-8.37e7***</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.098</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td></td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDPI</td>
<td>2.46e7***</td>
<td>7.5e6***</td>
<td>2.68e7***</td>
<td>1.25e7**</td>
<td>2.17e7**</td>
<td>1.68e7**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.026)</td>
<td>(0.407)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDPJ</td>
<td>2.95e7***</td>
<td>2.66e7***</td>
<td>1.9e6**</td>
<td>1.3e6**</td>
<td>8.60e6**</td>
<td>3.83e7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.851)</td>
<td>(0.385)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POPI</td>
<td>-6.76e7*</td>
<td>-2.68e6***</td>
<td>-1.8e6***</td>
<td>-5.3e7**</td>
<td>-2.44e9**</td>
<td>-6.41e9*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.098</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.026)</td>
<td>(0.009)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POPIJ</td>
<td>2.24e7**</td>
<td>2.23e7***</td>
<td>2.7e7**</td>
<td>1.92e7**</td>
<td>2.17e7**</td>
<td>1.68e7**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.002)</td>
<td>(0.018)</td>
<td>(0.033)</td>
<td>(0.026)</td>
<td>(0.407)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRD</td>
<td>1.68e7***</td>
<td>-4.0e5</td>
<td>3.56e7</td>
<td>-8.60e9**</td>
<td>3.83e7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.358)</td>
<td>(0.429)</td>
<td>(0.851)</td>
<td>(0.385)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRF</td>
<td>-8.29e7***</td>
<td>-3.29e8**</td>
<td>-3.95e8**</td>
<td>-4.62e8**</td>
<td>-8.60e9**</td>
<td>-6.41e9**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.008)</td>
<td>(0.348)</td>
<td>(0.030)</td>
<td>(0.028)</td>
<td>(0.009)</td>
<td>(0.009)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yit</td>
<td>-6.76e7*</td>
<td>2.07e7</td>
<td>-4.86e6**</td>
<td>-4.88e7***</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.098</td>
<td>(0.275)</td>
<td>(0.017)</td>
<td>(0.009)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yjt</td>
<td>-6.76e7*</td>
<td>-6.28e7</td>
<td>-7.93e7</td>
<td>-9.0e7**</td>
<td>4.23e7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.751)</td>
<td>(0.693)</td>
<td>(0.633)</td>
<td>(0.682)</td>
<td>(0.830)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R²</td>
<td>0.4637</td>
<td>0.4929</td>
<td>0.4756</td>
<td>0.4620</td>
<td>0.5016</td>
<td>0.5037</td>
<td>0.4710</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDPi</td>
<td>2.89e7***</td>
<td>-6.41e9</td>
<td>-1.94e10*</td>
<td>-5.72e10**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.013)</td>
<td>(0.478)</td>
<td>(0.132)</td>
<td>(0.011)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDPj</td>
<td>2.89e7***</td>
<td>2.82e7***</td>
<td>2.84e5***</td>
<td>2.51e5***</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Appendix A2: Table: 4: RANDOM EFFECT (INDEPENDENT VARIABLE: TRADE)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CTRD</td>
<td>-8.8E7***</td>
<td>-8.37e7***</td>
<td>1.35e7***</td>
<td>1.15e5***</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TTRD</td>
<td>-6.76e7*</td>
<td>4.34e7*</td>
<td>-5.59e7***</td>
<td>1.25e7*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.098</td>
<td>(0.054)</td>
<td>(0.048)</td>
<td>(0.102)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DTRD</td>
<td>-6.76e7*</td>
<td>-2.58e7***</td>
<td>7.8e5***</td>
<td>1.40e5***</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.098</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDPi</td>
<td>-6.76e7*</td>
<td>-2.58e7***</td>
<td>7.8e5***</td>
<td>1.40e5***</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.098</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDPj</td>
<td>2.89e7***</td>
<td>2.82e7***</td>
<td>3.11e5***</td>
<td>2.40e5***</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td>(0.000)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Appendix A3: Table 5: Pooled OLS (independent variable: trade)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ctrd</td>
<td>-1.7e7*** (0.000)</td>
<td>-1.9e7 (0.585)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-7.4e7*** (0.000)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-8.97e7*** (0.000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>trrd</td>
<td>-1.89e8* (0.100)</td>
<td>-1.79e8* (0.061)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-2.86e9*** (0.000)</td>
<td>-2.98e9 (0.000)</td>
<td>-3.09e9*** (0.000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dtrd</td>
<td>-2.4e9*** (0.001)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDPi</td>
<td>10458.6*** (0.000)</td>
<td>7.59e7*** (0.000)</td>
<td>1.17e7 (0.076)</td>
<td>1.65e7 (0.657)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>7.96e7 (0.000)</td>
<td>8.06e7 (0.000)</td>
<td>1.18e7*** (0.000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDPj</td>
<td>2471.60*** (0.000)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2.43e7*** (0.000)</td>
<td>2.36e7*** (0.000)</td>
<td>2.43e7 (0.000)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2.11e7*** (0.000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POPi</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.39e7*** (0.010)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.32e7*** (0.000)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POPj</td>
<td>5984056*** (0.005)</td>
<td>7.94e7*** (0.000)</td>
<td>6.94e7*** (0.002)</td>
<td>7.95e7*** (0.000)</td>
<td>7.56e7*** (0.000)</td>
<td>8.30e7 (0.000)</td>
<td>8.36e7*** (0.000)</td>
<td>1.04e7*** (0.000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TROP</td>
<td>1034882* (0.060)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.52e7*** (0.006)</td>
<td>1.24e7*** (0.022)</td>
<td>1.67e7 (0.003)</td>
<td>1.67e9*** (0.003)</td>
<td>1.0e7* (0.055)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRF</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-2.34e8** (0.035)</td>
<td>-5.43e8*** (0.0078)</td>
<td>-5.11e8*** (0.006)</td>
<td>-4.60e8** (0.050)</td>
<td>-2.25e8 (0.033)</td>
<td>-2.23e8** (0.033)</td>
<td>-1.35e7* (0.091)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CB</td>
<td>-7.49e9*** (0.000)</td>
<td>-7.4e9*** (0.008)</td>
<td>-1.0e10*** (0.001)</td>
<td>-7.23e9*** (0.005)</td>
<td>-1.06e10*** (0.000)</td>
<td>-5.11e7 (0.006)</td>
<td>-5.99e49 (0.018)</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CL</td>
<td>-5.6e9*** (0.009)</td>
<td>-4.63e9*** (0.045)</td>
<td>-5.39e9*** (0.001)</td>
<td>-4.65*** (0.037)</td>
<td>-5.52e9 (0.008)</td>
<td>-5.60e9*** (0.008)</td>
<td>-6.19e9*** (0.004)</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dijt</td>
<td>-1.0e7 (0.677)</td>
<td>-4.85e7 (0.851)</td>
<td>-1.02e7 (0.671)</td>
<td>2.23e7 (0.377)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-1.18e7 (0.617)</td>
<td>-1.07e7 (0.673)</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yit</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>3.32e7*** (0.009)</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yjt</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-6.71e7 (0.913)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R²</td>
<td>0.5973</td>
<td>0.5743</td>
<td>0.4573</td>
<td>0.2143</td>
<td>0.5504</td>
<td>0.206</td>
<td>0.2756</td>
<td>0.2078</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>8.99e9 (0.256)</td>
<td>1.06e10* (0.086)</td>
<td>-1.26e8 (0.985)</td>
<td>9.24e8 (0.140)</td>
<td>1.21e10 (0.205)</td>
<td>9.95e7 (0.849)</td>
<td>1.72e7*** (0.000)</td>
<td>1.06e8*** (0.013)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Role of Social Media Reviews in Capturing Brand Trust & Brand Loyalty: A Case of Burger Joints in Karachi

Usman Ahmad, HOD MS, Assistant Professor, DHA Suffa University, Karachi, Pakistan
Abu Huraira, Assistant Professor, PhD Scholar, DHA Suffa University, Karachi, Pakistan
*Azam Anwar Khan, BBA Program Manager, PhD Scholar, DHA Suffa University, Karachi, Pakistan
Saima Sardar, Lecturer, MS Scholar, DHA, Suffa University, Karachi, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email: lionking853@hotmail.com

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

Purpose: The study's objective is to discover how social media reviews can be used to win over consumers' trust and loyalty to a brand. This research looks at the fast-food business (Karachi's local burger shops) to draw conclusions about the city and country. The methodology used in this study is quantitative.

Design/Methodology/Approach: The methodological approach taken in this research was quantitative. A deductive approach to test hypotheses has been applied within the context of this explanatory investigation. The questionnaires are research instrument that has been used, and SPSS software has been utilised in order to conduct correlation and regression analysis on the collected data.

Findings: This study's results reveal a favourable and statistically significant association between social media reviews (independent variable) and both brand trust and brand loyalty (dependent variables) (dependent variables). According to the results, customers' trust in and loyalty to a brand are more likely to increase if they place more stock in the opinions of those consumers expressed in online reviews.

Implications/Originality/Value: This research paper contributes new information to the existing body of knowledge on the subject of the role of Social Media Reviews provided by customers across a variety of social media platforms. This research paper will add value by deciphering and explaining the relationship that exists between reviews on social media platforms and the outcomes of brand relationships such as trust in the brand and loyalty to the brand.

© 2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-4.0
Introduction
Social media reviews are important for building brand trust and loyalty for organizations. This research paper examines how social media reviews affect brand trust and loyalty in the fast-food business. This research paper is penned down to give an essential insight into the fast-food industry and how it is being influenced or affected by the growing acceptance of social media reviews for consumers (Berthon, Pitt, Plangger, & Shapiro, 2012) with regard to the people living in Karachi, Pakistan. The use of social media has skyrocketed in recent years. According to a plethora of published works, the term "social media" refers to a set of internet-based applications that emerged as a technological apparatus with the advent of Web 2.0 (Berthon, Pitt, Plangger, & Shapiro, 2012). Online communities of people from different countries and different continents are formed in which users connect with each other and exchange their ideas and opinions about different things. Social media applications are usually available on internet-enabled devices like mobile phones, smart phones, tablet computers, personal computers (PC), laptops, and other internet generated devices which allow different users to connect with each other. It allows the users to have end-to-end personalized interaction and plays a role as an effective and efficient communication enabler for the users (Berthon, Pitt, Plangger, & Shapiro, 2012).

The study of Berthon et.al conducted in 2012 has been widely accepted as the grounds on which it is said that social media plays a vital role in generating consumer infused reviews of different businesses, their products, services, and the experiences they promise and the experiences the deliver. The consumer-generated social media reviews are distinguished as more trustworthy and reliable and are said to give accurate information more than a companies’ or businesses’ professional and official website gives. Social media has been ingrained as a tremendous opportunity for businesses and companies to create a strong bond with their customers or consumers (Tatar & Eren-Erdöğmuş, 2016).

Problem Statement
Recent developments in the field of marketing have led to a renewed interest in understanding the role of social media in consumer behavior (Berthon, Pitt, Plangger, & Shapiro, 2012). There is a need to identify the impact of social media reviews generated by consumers and its role in selection of fast food chains by consumers, concentrated on consumer market in Karachi, Pakistan. We have selected this problem to cater to because in recent times, there has been a drastic influence of social media on the general public (Berthon, Pitt, Plangger, & Shapiro, 2012) of Pakistan and a tremendous affect can be found on the lifestyle patterns of people, more specifically, general consumers. To the best of researchers’ knowledge no such study has been conducted in the quoted context of fast food restaurants, specifically local burger joints found in Karachi, Pakistan. Furthermore, it has been identified that there is a lack of study and examination on the role of brand trust in hospitality industry (Wang, Law, Hung, & Guillet, 2014) in the Asian specifically sub-continent region. For this reason, research conducted in Pakistan can be generalized to the sub-continent because of cultural similarities. The existing literature available comprises of research studies conducted on international fast food chains (Ehsan, 2012), neglecting the competition given by local fast food restaurants in different countries. Brand trust and brand loyalty play an important role in the performance of restaurants so it is important to identify their role in Pakistani context, considering the rise of fast food restaurants in Pakistan in the last five years.

Research Questions
Do social media reviews positively affect brand trust?”
Do social media reviews positively affect brand loyalty?”

Significance of Research
With the generalization of Web 2.0, there has been a continuous rise in how social media influences
the lives of people, their choices, their decisions, their consumption patterns, with a huge drastic change in the needs and wants of consumers (Šerić & Praničević, 2017). People are highly influenced by social media and consider social media reviews generated by other consumers as highly relevant for their own consumption (Berthon, Pitt, Plangger, & Shapiro, 2012). There has been a great rise in such consumers who first check into a potential sellers’ (brand or company) reviews given by other consumers about the quality of experience before they themselves take their buying decision (Šerić & Praničević, 2017). This has led to an increasing interest of marketers to understand the relationship of these consumer reviews in generating brand trust and brand loyalty of a certain brand or company. This study will help marketers to understand that how does reviews of one consumer affect another potential consumer’s buying decision and what role does it play in capturing trust and loyalty of the consumers for a brand.

**Literature Review**

**Social Media Reviews**

Social media reviews given by consumers is a new channel of product (or service) information which has been developed with the advent of Web 2.0 which is basically a creation and dissemination of consumer-generated reviews or opinions, through the medium of different social media platforms, which are visible and seen by masses, who are connected on the social media platforms (Goh, Heng, & Lin, 2013).

**Brand Trust**

In traditional marketing literature, Lindstrom (2001) defined brand trust as one of the most essential compulsion for a brand to be strong in the growing age of online marketing and social media. It is basically a commitment or a promise by a brand to deliver what it stands for and what it markets itself as. Brand trust means a general willingness of a customer or consumer to visit, purchase, or experience a brand over and over again (Tatar & Eren-Erdogmus, 2016).

**Brand Loyalty**

Brand loyalty can be defined as an intense preference or relatedness to a specific brand ensuring repeat purchases from the specific brand in future, without being influenced by the marketing and promoting activities of competitors and contemporaries (Tatar & Eren-Erdogmus, 2016).

**Theoretical Framework & Underpinning Theory**

The theoretical background of this research study comes from “IT paradox theory” or Information Technology theory according to which it is believed that technological advancements and the increased use of social media has now become more of a fundamental need or requirement rather than a feature giving the businesses a competitive advantage or a competitive edge among the rivals (Šerić & Praničević, 2017). The theory also states that as long as IT or information technology is becoming more like a commodity, its internal complexities are also increasing making it a basic requirement for businesses (Šerić & Praničević, 2017) so because of this reason, the use of Information Technology and social media is less likely to generate a significant impact on the general performances of a business, in this growing age of Information Technology and social media.

**Theoretical Framework**
The Relationship between Brand Trust and Social Media Reviews
In the existing body of literature, it has been evident that for any brand or firm to become reputable and known for good in online environment of social media, it is essential to build trust among the existing consumers and the potential consumers. Brand trust is basically a promise or a pledge undertaken by the brand or the firm to deliver certain specified functions and requirements to their consumers (both existing consumers and potential consumers). It has been found in the marketing literature that trust is usually composed of two components. First component is of ‘belief’ which relates to the expectations of the consumers from a brand created by marketing strategies of the brand and previously delivered service. Second component is of ‘intent’ which relates to the willingness of the brand to fulfil their promise and to deliver the service which they have marketed (Tatar & Eren-Erdogmus, 2016). From existing research studies, it has been established that brand trust is the positive expectation related to a specific brand in a customer’s mind, psychologically. It has also been found that consumers are more inclined towards social media and social media is more trustworthy from a consumers’ point of view compared to traditional marketing mediums. The reason behind why consumers’ consider social media to be more trustworthy is because of the free flow of information and interaction, quick responsiveness and instantaneous feedback. Another reason for this is the consumer-generated content and social media reviews which are more unbiased, impartial, and constitute of first-hand information dissemination (Tatar & Eren-Erdogmus, 2016).

H1: Social media reviews positively affect brand trust.

The Relationship between Brand Loyalty and Social Media Reviews
It has been outlined in previous studies that brand loyalty or repeat purchase behaviour of consumers and social media marketing have a positive relationship. It has also been found that social media marketing activities like online consumer-generated social media content and social media reviews, ratings of different products and services by existing consumers, and word-of-mouth of the existing consumers, exert a positive impact or influence on the brand loyalty of consumers towards a firm or a brand. This positive impact of brand urges the existing consumer base to conduct repeat purchase behaviour which is created by generating brand trust and brand equity (Tatar & Eren-Erdogmus, 2016). The extant body of knowledge available on brand loyalty suggests that brand trust is one of the major contributing factor to increase brand loyalty or repeat purchase behaviour by existing consumers. Underlining the positive relationship between brand trust and social media marketing activities and social media reviews, brand trust is anticipated to be playing a mediator between social media reviews and brand loyalty by creating trust of consumers on a brand, leading towards brand loyalty (Tatar & Eren-Erdogmus, 2016).

H2: Social media reviews positively affect brand loyalty

Methodology
The drafting of an applicable and suitable research methodology is the key to decode the meaningful knowledge from the data collection and its analysis (Soiferman, 2010). This research study is using deductive approach to decipher the information from the data. The deductive approach works in the “top to bottom” direction, starting from a theory, then coming down to hypothesis, collecting data related to the hypothesis, analyzing the data, and finally, accepting or contradicting the hypothesis. It is a more confined and narrow approach and tests the validation of the hypotheses and confirms the already determined and restricted research objectives (Soiferman, 2010). Two hypotheses have been developed for this research study based on an existing theory to be tested. This research study has used quantitative strategy for analyzing the data.

A Questionnaire has been used, in this research study, as data collecting tool with 20 questions to collect data from our respondents. The questionnaire design was developed from a previous empirical study of Seric & Pranicevic (2017). Keeping in view the perspective of local burger joints, the
questionnaire has been modified to target the consumers of different burger joints locally available in Karachi.

Since this study is being conducted in a Pakistani setting, the research data was collected from people in Karachi and due to time constraints, data was collected from only 320 consumers over a wide range of ages and socioeconomic backgrounds in Karachi, Pakistan, while a total of 384 were needed to adequately sample the population and answer the research questions. Data collected via questionnaires were entered into Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (SPSS) for analysis. Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (SPSS) was shown to be the most suitable programme for evaluating numerical data in a study (Chen, Fay, & Wang, 2011). Tests including simple regression, correlation, and descriptive statistics were run in the system for analysis.

**Data Analysis**

**Correlations**

The strength or degree of the association between two variables, dependent and independent, as well as their direction, has been examined by means of a correlation test for both of the hypotheses. This was done in order to determine whether or not the hypotheses are correct. The value of correlation can take on any value, from -1 to +1, depending on the circumstances. If the value is more than one, it indicates that there is a positive and robust connection between the variables; however, as the value approaches zero, it indicates that there is less of a connection between the variables. A negative number, which can range from 0 to -1, indicates a negative relationship between the variable being dependent and the variable being independent. The Pearson Correlation is a measure that can be used to determine the degree of a relationship (Coffman, Maydeu-Olivares, & Arnau, 2008).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Correlations</th>
<th>Social Media</th>
<th>Brand Trust</th>
<th>Brand Loyalty</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.646**</td>
<td>.633**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>320</td>
<td>320</td>
<td>320</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>.646**</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.688**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>320</td>
<td>320</td>
<td>320</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>.633**</td>
<td>.688**</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>320</td>
<td>320</td>
<td>320</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).**
From this table, the relationships can be deciphered between all the variables with each other. Here, the relationship between Social Media Reviews and Brand Trust is a significant because the significance value is 0.000 which is less than 0.05. A positive relationship exists because the Pearson correlation value is 0.646 which is a positive value. If role of Social Media increases (or decreases), Brand Trust will also increase (or decrease).

The relationship between Social Media Reviews and Brand Loyalty is also significant because the significance level is 0.000 which is less than 0.05 and positive because the Pearson correlation shows the value as 0.633 which is a positive value, so a significant positive relationship exists between Social Media Reviews and Brand Loyalty. If role of Social Media will increase (or decrease), Brand Loyalty will also increase (or decrease).

A positive and strong relationship is also identified between Brand Trust and Brand Loyalty as the Pearson correlation shows the value of 0.688 which is positive and significance level is 0.000 less than 0.05. So if there is an increase (or decrease) in the level of one variable, it will be followed by an increase (or decrease) in other variable.

**Regression**

Simple Regression Analysis has been used to analyze the relationship between an independent variable and dependent variable. In simple regression analysis, there is one independent variable and one dependent variable which tells the nature of relationship between both the variables (O'Connell, 2005). On the basis of co-efficient, the hypothesis are accepted or rejected.

**Hypothesis 1: Social media reviews positively affect brand trust.**

**Table 2**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model Summary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Model</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Predictors: (Constant), Social Media

The hypothesis being tested here is to check whether there is a positive role of Social Media Reviews in creating Brand Trust. Social Media Reviews is the independent variable whereas Brand Trust is the dependent variable. The coefficient of determination or $R^2$ in the model summary table shows that up-till what extent there is a variation in dependent variable due to the role of independent variable. Here, the $R^2$ value is .417 so it is deciphered that there is 41.7% variation in the dependent variable i.e. Brand Trust which is caused by the independent variable i.e. Social Media Reviews.

**Table 3**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ANOVA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Model</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regression</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Dependent Variable: Brand Trust

b. Predictors: (Constant), Social Media
The ANOVA results demonstrate a significant relationship between the independent variable (Social Media Reviews) and the dependent variable (Brand Trust). Here, the "p" value is less than 0.05, indicating that there is a positive but weak correlation between social media reviews and trust in the brand.

### Table 4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>1.356</td>
<td>.143</td>
<td>9.484</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Social Media</td>
<td>.614</td>
<td>.041</td>
<td>6.46</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Dependent Variable: Brand Trust

The significance value, in this table, is 0.000 which is less than 0.05. This shows that there is a significant relationship between Social Media Reviews and Brand Trust. Therefore, first hypothesis is accepted.

**Hypothesis 2:** Social media reviews positively affect brand loyalty.

### Table 5

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model Summary</th>
<th>Model</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>R Square</th>
<th>Adjusted R Square</th>
<th>Std. Error of Square</th>
<th>Std. Error of the Estimate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>.633a</td>
<td>.401</td>
<td>.399</td>
<td>.63021</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Predictors: (Constant), Social Media

The goal of this test is to see if Social Media Reviews play a positive role in making people loyal to a brand. Brand Loyalty is the dependent variable, and Social Media Reviews is the independent variable. In the model summary table, the coefficient of determination, or R2, shows how much the role of the independent variable affects the dependent variable. Here, the R2 value is .401%, which means that the independent variable, which is Social Media Reviews, causes 40.1% of the variation in the dependent variable, which is Brand Loyalty.

### Table 6

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ANOVA</th>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Regression</td>
<td>84.383</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>84.383</td>
<td>212.465</td>
<td>.000b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Residual</td>
<td>126.297</td>
<td>318</td>
<td>.397</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>210.680</td>
<td>319</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Dependent Variable: Brand Loyalty

b. Predictors: (Constant), Social Media
The ANOVA test shows the significance between the independent and dependent variables, with Social Media Reviews being independent variable and Brand Loyalty being dependent variable. Here the value of “p” is less than 0.05 i.e. 0.000 which shows that there is a weak positive relationship between Social Media Reviews and Brand Trust.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Std. Error</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(Constant) 1.144</td>
<td>.150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Social Media  .624</td>
<td>.043</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypothesis 1</th>
<th>Accept</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hypothesis 2</td>
<td>Accept</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Hypothesis 1: *Social media reviews positively affect brand trust.*

The first hypothesis of this research study has been accepted on the basis of correlation and regression tests. From this, it can be concluded that when consumers use social media reviews for opinions and comments on any local burger joint available in Karachi, their Brand Trust is positively affected which means that their Trust on a specific local burger joint brand in terms of service, quality, and management is established.

Hypothesis 2: *Social media reviews positively affect brand loyalty.*

The second hypothesis of this research study has been accepted on the basis of correlation and regression tests. From this, it can be concluded that when consumers use social media reviews for opinions and comments on any local burger joint available in Karachi, their Brand Loyalty is positively affected which means that their Loyalty with a specific local burger joint brand is established which promises repeat purchase behavior.

**Findings**

The findings of this research study from data analysis using statistical analysis techniques, Regression and Correlation, have proved both of the hypotheses of the study. A significant and positive relationship has been found between the independent variable, Social Media Reviews, and dependent variables, Brand Trust and Brand Loyalty. It means that Social Media creates a positive impact on brand outcomes, in this study, Brand Trust and Brand Loyalty. This has been earlier stated in a previous study that social media has the ability to exert a great impact and helps in building a positive relationship or a connection between the brand and its users, and positively impacts the brand outcomes (Tatar & Eren-Erdogmus, 2016). The research findings of this study are, therefore, said to
be in sync with this previous study, because of the positive relationship between Social Media reviews and the brand outcomes.

The results of this study are consistent to a previous study, conducted by Kim and Ko in 2012, which identified that online word of mouth and interactions among consumers, on social media platforms, enhances the positive effect on brand relational outcomes i.e. brand trust and brand loyalty. Another study, conducted by Schivinski and Dabrowski in 2016, proved that there is a significantly positive impact of consumer generated reviews on social media platforms that can enhance the brand relationships, by increasing, or giving rise to, trust and loyalty towards a specific brand.

Hypothesis 1: Social media reviews positively affect brand trust.

It has been found in the previous study that online interactions and communications, in the form of reviews, through social media among the consumers of a particular brand influences, significantly and positively, the brand trust in hospitality industry (Tatar & Eren-Erdogmus, 2016), which matches with findings of this research study that social media reviews positively affect brand trust. In the research study of (Šerić & Praničević, 2017), which dealt with the influence of consumer generated reviews on social media and brand relationship outcomes in fast food industry, the impact or influence of social media reviews on brand trust was found to be positive with a Beta value of 0.0066 but it was not statistically significant. However, in this research study, the Beta value is 0.614 which signifies positive and significant impact of social media reviews on brand trust. This is so, because this research has been conducted in a different time horizon, with different sample, belonging to a different region i.e. Karachi, Pakistan, so there are differences in results as compared to the earlier research study of (Šerić & Praničević, 2017) in the same context but conducted in a Mediterranean country with University students only. The hypothesis in this research study “Social media reviews positively affect brand trust” on the basis of positive and significant relationship between social media reviews and brand trust, whereas, the hypothesis in the same context in research study of (Šerić & Praničević, 2017) was not accepted because it was not supported by evidence of significant relationship.

Hypothesis 2: Social media reviews positively affect brand loyalty.

Results and Findings

As the hypothesis is accepted, the results of this study show that social media reviews have a positive effect on brand loyalty. This is in line with a previous study that says social media can make consumers more loyal and likely to buy again (Zhang, Shabbir, Pitsaphol, & Hassan, 2015). These findings also suggest that consumers can develop or generate a brand relationship through social media reviews, which is in line with a previous study which concluded that online word of mouth through social media exerts a positive impact or effect on relationships among a brand and its consumers (Laroche, Habibi, Richard, & Sankaranarayanan, 2012). In the research study of (Šerić & Praničević, 2017), which dealt with the influence of consumer generated reviews on social media and brand relationship outcomes in fast food industry, the impact or influence of social media reviews on brand loyalty was found to be positive but not significant with a Beta value of 0.0150. However, in this research study, conducted in Pakistani context, the Beta value of 0.624 shows the positive and significant impact of social media reviews on brand loyalty. The difference in results is because of different geographical regions because the previous study of (Šerić & Praničević, 2017) was conducted with a sample from a University in a Mediterranean country. The hypothesis in this research “Social media reviews positively affect brand loyalty” has been accepted because of positive and significant relationship between social media reviews and brand loyalty, whereas, the hypothesis in the research study of (Šerić & Praničević, 2017) was not accepted because the relationship between social media reviews and brand loyalty was found to be positive but not significant.
Conclusion
The present study was designed to determine the role of social media reviews in capturing brand trust and brand loyalty, in Pakistani context. There has been an increased trend of usage of social media among the general consumers, regardless of age, and online word-of-mouth has been identified to be very much influential on the lives of general consumers. In the light of the recent growing trends, it has been crucial to understand the role of social media reviews, which are consumer-generated and come under online word-of-mouth. These social media reviews are the opinions and judgments of consumers on any specific brand or product, in this case, local burger joints available in Karachi, Pakistan. The research objectives of this research study were set to analyze that whether social media reviews, given by consumers, are able to increase, give rise to, or enhance the trust and loyalty of consumers towards a specific brand. These research objectives were fulfilled as it was proved that social media reviews play an important and significant role in increasing brand trust and brand loyalty. A possible explanation for this can be that consumers tend to believe or perceive the consumer generated reviews more trustworthy as relative to a brand’s own generated media and marketing activities (Zhang, Ye, Law, & Li, 2010).

Recommendations
Taken together, the results suggest that marketing activities of various brands, regardless of their categories, especially the service brands, must interact with their existing consumers, and their potential consumers as well, and maintain personalized and customized relationships with the customers. This is essential for companies to maintain a personal relationship with all of their customers, which in turn will increase the customers’ trust and loyalty towards the brand. For survival in the contemporary age of social media, there is a crucial need for brands to indulge in interactions with their customers to keep up their pace and be informed about consumer preferences and needs (Šerić & Praničević, 2017). Social media managers of the brands must be well aware of the social media reviews given by consumers on the social media platforms, and the managers must work towards developing and maintaining consumer relationships in order to know how to satisfy the consumers in a much better way and strive for continuous improvement in the service quality. This is key for survival in a highly competitive market place, like fast food industry, where brands grow on the basis of the quality of the service they provide (Kim, Li, & Brymer, 2016).

Limitations
Because of certain restrictions, our research study cannot give an extensive view of customers from all over Pakistan as we constrained the survey in Karachi only. Another constraint of this study is that only the electronic social media was considered for consumers’ reviews and word-of-mouth reviews were not considered. Future works ought to embrace more explained scales and inspect different social media aspects with a deeper understandings to acquire a more profound comprehension of its conceivable outcomes and repercussions (Šerić and Praničević, 2017). Areas of Further Research This research has put forward many other research questions that can be further investigated and studied. This study has been conducted in Karachi, representing the Pakistani consumers. Further research can be conducted taking the similar research questions in different regions and cities of Pakistan. Also, only Brand Trust and Brand Loyalty have been studied as brand relationship outcomes. Whereas there are various different factors which come under brand relationship outcomes and can give more extensive insight into the research questions. Moreover, the research questions can be studied with a more extensive scale of Social Media, Brand Trust and Brand Loyalty with more items in each construct to increase the validity of the research study. Another limitation to our study was that Social Media Reviews, only given by consumers, were taken in account generated by online word-of-mouth. Further investigations can give an insight into the various other social media facets like that of user interactions, user entertainment, and personalization (J.Kim & Ko, 2012). This can help in gaining an insight into consumer preferences in a much better way. Additionally, one of the major limitations of this study is that it is constrained to perception of social media by consumers.
only, disregarding the point of view of marketers. Further studies can be conducted to understand the marketers’ responses to and for social media, to gain a meaningful knowledge on social media activities by various brands. Finally, this research study has been limited to only locally available burger joints in Karachi, Pakistan. Further studies can be conducted, taking into account, the international fast food brands, as well is in different industrial backgrounds.

References


Discursive Constructions of Child Rape in Pakistani Newspapers: A Study of Hussain Khan Wala Case

*Muhammad Waqas Butt*, Ph.D. Scholar, Department of Gender Studies, PU, Lahore, Pakistan
*Sahira Zaman*, Assistant Professor, Department of gender studies, Fatima Jinnah Women University Rawalpindi, Pakistan
*Raana Malik*, Professor, Department of Gender Studies, PU, Lahore, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email: dr.muhammadwaqasbutt@gmail.com*

**ABSTRACT**

**Purpose:** This study identifies the types and nature of media discourses of child rape that may be intended to maintain gender ideologies and power relations around normative sexual practices.

**Design/Methodology/Approach:** This research study is conducted from the social constructivist perspective about gender and sex in connection with the dynamics of power relations in the Pakistani social system. Data for analysis consisted of all editorials and opinion columns about the Hussain Khan Wala Case in the Urdu newspaper *Nawa-e-Waqt* and English newspaper *Dawn*. Hussain Khan Wala’s case was a highlight in the media in August 2015. The victims were minor and the incident grabbed the most attention of the press and public. For discourse analysis, newspaper articles (editorials and opinion columns) were selected because these texts present detailed discussion (nature of the problem, causes, effects, solutions, and value judgments) about the phenomenon.

**Findings:** In theoretical terms, Pakistani media dominantly discusses child sexual abuse including rape in the context of political power disparity in rural and urban areas. In Pakistani media, child rape is delinked from adult rape and sexual practices. The blame for child sexual abuse is shifted to political and administrative officialdom.

**Implications/Originality/Value:** The media is structurally and ideologically unsuitable for conservative values and unable to disseminate the values of shame, modesty, piety, and dignity.

© 2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0


**Introduction**

Rape is not only a release of sexual energy and a manifestation of sexual drive and desire but also a
form of revenge, the show of power, intimidation, psychological and physical damage, violation of body rights, stigmatization, hate for other's honor, the act of masculinist pride performance, sexual adventure and punishment, and a sub-industry for media, academia and the nation-state (Gaskin, 2019). Child sexual abuse is a global phenomenon (Stoltenborgh, Ijzendoorn, Euser, & Bakermans-Kranenburg, 2011) in which child rape and murder after rape or rape after the murder is the niche area yet to be explored. Child rape cases generally remain obscure under the general, broader category of child sexual abuse, and the gender dimensions are ignored under the rubric of violence against women. In Pakistani society, the perpetrators are men and the victims include women, girls, and minor boys. Sahil reports in 2019 that the reported child rape cases in 2018 numbered 537, apart from the 156 gang rape cases while an average of 10 boys were being sexually abused daily and the ratio of child sexual abuse is highest in Punjab (Imdad, 2019).

Child rape has become a prominent phenomenon in Pakistan but the legal framework still avoids the usage of the term. Criminal Law (Amendment) Act, 2016 criminalizes "child exposure to seduction, child pornography, cruelty to a child, trafficking in human beings and child abuse". In 2019, the Government of Pakistan's Report of the Senate Special Committee on the Issue of Increasing Incidents of Child Abuse admits the failure of social circles, law enforcement agencies, courts, media, and parents but at the same time consciously avoid "Child Rape" despite the widely reported cases of child rape. Child abuse may involve abuse of any form that is not strictly sexual or it may involve sexual abuse that bears fewer consequences such as kissing and caressing. Zainab Alert, Response and Recovery Act, 2020 acknowledges the "abduction", "rape" and "murder" of 7-year-old Zainab and defines rape as "any forcible and non-forcible sexual conduct with a child by another person". Therefore, the study analyzes the exclusive phenomenon of "child rape" instead of broader categories of child abuse or child sexual abuse.

Newspapers report the events of child sexual abuse regularly but this reporting and production of texts in media are constituted by dominant gender discourses and constitutive to the gender stereotypes. Terms such as sexual exploitation and child protection repeatedly appear in the media texts but one is never certain of the child rape cases due to the conceptual confusion of the issues. There are mere estimates of child sexual abuse and no systematic data exists about the cases of child rape (Jabeen, 2021). All the data on child sexual abuse is collected based on media reports. Hundreds of cases go unreported even by the media due to family honor and shame (Maul, Khan, Mian, Yousafzai, & Brown, 2019; Nadeem, Asad, & Hamid, 2020). Child abuse including rape may have a higher ratio than the reported cases as Pakistan has 70 million population below 18 years and a significant proportion of this young population is living in poverty and homelessness (Maul, Khan, Mian, Yousafzai, & Brown, 2019). Pakistani traditional practices and taboos also play a role in the underreporting of child rape cases.

Social and cultural conceptions of gender, power hierarchy, and sexuality reflected through media texts indicate a "rape culture" (Gaskin, 2019) where sexual assaults and rape cases are normalized and pervasive (Buchwald, Fletcher, & Roth, 2015). In recent years, rape culture has become an accepted and acknowledged term in the Pakistani English press. Pakistani film industry normalizes and legitimizes rape culture through the promotion and featuring of sexual aggression and cultural ideologies of honor and patriarchy (Ahmad, 2016). This rape culture idealizes gender traits and encourages sexual aggression. In Pakistani gender discourses rape is constructed as punishment and entertainment. Sadaf Ahmad (2016) argues that Pakistani patriarchal society labels women into "good" and "bad" categories based on obedience, sacrifice, domestication, and lack of independence. Women are judged on the bases of morality and morality is associated with the sexual behavior and body qualities of women (Khan, 2006). These moral divisions actively and exclusively work against the women who are morally policed and regulated in the structures of patriarchy (Saeed, 2001). A woman's sexual behavior is associated with family honor and this link serves as a structural
antecedent of rape culture. This rape culture then reinforces myths of rape in which victims are blamed and the rapists often go unpunished and excused. Thus, rape is encouraged in Pakistan through the permeating ideologies of honor, shame, hegemonic gendered norms, and chastity and has become a phenomenon of power, punishment, control, and revenge in Pakistani society (Ahmad, 2016). The cultural conceptions of honour help shift the blame of rape on the victims in rape cases of married women (Canto, Perles, & Martín, 2017). Fundamentalist interpretations of sacred texts to legitimize the patriarchal structures serve as the root cause for all problems according to feminists in Pakistan (Sarwar & Zeng, 2021). To uproot this cause, feminist scholars hope that media texts can play a role in subverting the subjugation of women and the all-pervasive culture of shame (Gershon, 2020).

Similar logical structures do hold in the case of child rape which has become a proportionally prominent phenomenon in Pakistani society. Rape, now, is not limited to adult women or "bad" girls but its tentacles have reached the bodies of the vulnerable, innocent, and normal boys and girls. Now six or seven-year-old girls and boys are not safe from rapists. The frequency, enormity, and expansion of rape cases cannot be left wrapped into softer labels of child abuse and child sexual abuse. The incident of Hussain Khan Wala indicates serious loopholes in our legal framework, certain gender ideologies, specific fatal traits of masculinity and femininity, patterns of parenting, moral decay, commercial motives, entertainment imperatives, repressed sexualities, repressive cultural norms, and stereotypical characterizations and presentations of these cases in the media texts. The majority of people in Pakistan believe in rape myths and sexual double standards bearing the gendered biases, masculine power, and authority (Jamhed & Kamal, 2019). It is need of the hour that now we explore the intricate associations of ideologies of gender, power, and sexuality and their reproduction and reinforcement in the media reports to inform and revise our policies on gendered values, power relations, and sexual taboos.

Newspapers not only report cases of child sexual abuse but also represent the social problems and act as a tool of advocacy (Nair, 2019). The role of media as a social institution is the focus of this analysis. This study identifies the types and nature of media discourses on child rape that may be intended to maintain gender ideologies and power relations around normative sexual practices. The study analyzed the press articles that discussed and interpreted child rape in Hussain Khan Wala. The editorials and opinion columns in the press are produced explicitly from an ideological perspective and intended to produce desired ideological norms. The discourses of power, gender, and sexuality are identified in the articles debating and discussing rape crimes.

**Methodology**

This research study is conducted from the social constructivist perspective about gender and sex in connection with the dynamics of power relations in the Pakistani social system. The study is conducted with intersectional methodology using the discourse theory to analyze media texts. The intersection of discourse theory and textual analysis of media texts will delineate the connections of gender, power, language, and ideology within the broader Pakistani social context.

According to Fairclough, the best possible way to analyze the power relations of a system is to analyze its ideological constructions that require discourse analysis. Ideology is embedded in textual elements that sustain and maintain the power relations allowed by the ideology. When, through textual elements in a discursive manner, ideology is transformed into common sense then it is naturalized (Fairclough, 2010, pp. 26-30). Hence, in both theoretical perspectives, the focus of discourse analysis is on the dominant discourses that are seemingly natural and objective. Since the discourse is contingent so it can be deconstructed through the de-naturalization of ideologies (Fairclough, 2010, pp. 30-31). This means that power relations can be transformed through critical discourse analysis. The connection of discourse and construction of sex, gender, and rape are only
meaningful when the system and relations of power are considered in the analysis. Following the exemplary as explained by Fairclough (1993), the two levels (discourse practice and interpretation) are described and explained separately for each text but the third level (social practice) is an aggregate of all the texts. This helps draw the overall social and cultural context and interdiscursivity in which each text was produced and interpreted and the discourses were constructed.

For discourse analysis, newspaper articles (editorials and opinion columns) were selected because these texts present detailed discussion (nature of the problem, causes, effects, solutions, and value judgments) about the phenomenon. The purpose is to excavate organizational ideologies and newspapers' editorial stances that are best expressed in their editorial pieces. Opinion columns are the second most important text in a newspaper regarding the ideological and critical stances on social problems. Opinion columns are written by regular writers who are experts in their fields and aligned with the editorial policy. News items are generally read for information and coverage but the editorials and columns provide detailed analysis and viewpoints on various issues. Another difference is that editorials and opinion columns are always on the same pages whereas a news story can appear on any page and in whatever style and format.

Data for analysis consisted of all editorials and opinion columns about the Hussain Khan Wala Case in Urdu newspaper daily Nawa-e-Waqt and Dawn. Hussain Khan Wala’s case was the highlight in the media in August 2015. The victims were minor and the incident grabbed the most attention of the press and public. The children were pornographically videotaped. The media discussed various aspects of the cases and political leadership's response level was also high.

**Findings and Discussion**

**Dawn**

English newspaper *Dawn* produced 03 editorials and 06 opinion columns on the Hussain Khan Wala/Kasur Case. None of the texts mentioned, "sexual abuse" in the title headlines. Instead, "child abuse" or "abuse" was used in the title headlines of editorials and opinion columns. "Child abuse scandal" appeared on 10th August 2015. This editorial opens with the political dimension of the case and highlights the imbalance of political power among the social classes. The political aspect is made prominent by using "the political damage" and " politicization" in a single sentence. The editorial is written in narrative and descriptive style and quotes from another news report. The intensity of the case is highlighted through "national outrage", "shocking events", "anger", "denial" and "horror". Punjab government, its officials, and politicians are criticized while the "scandal" is portrayed at of national level. The public outrage is juxtaposed with the denial of the Punjab government. Provincial government and institutions are attributed with incapability and their institutional response is expected in the form of ambiguous "reforms".

This text highlights the "gross disparity" of power but this disparity is presented as the political and gender dimension of power is absent throughout the text. Nominalizations such as "national outrage", "Punjab government", "political damage" and "Kasur district" describe that the event took place in a limited geographic area on which there was a nationwide response but the provincial government is trying to save its political repute. "The terrible events" of "serial child abuse" were going on for "many years in rural Punjab". These descriptive elements imply that the crime is "horrific" because of its duration and continuity. The emphasis on "rural" is to focus attention that such abuses are not prevalent or existent in urban areas or other provinces. The political and administrative incapacity is constructed by stating that these events "were neither a secret nor hard to unearth". This element of impersonal institutional voice projects particular routine matters of sexual abuse and the lack of punitive action because of the negligibility of a particular ruling regime. The editorial acknowledges the exposure of "very shocking events" in "the area" on July 8. This means that the newspaper had not considered it worthy of editorial attention at that time because this editorial is published with
almost a delay of one month. Furthermore, the news was reported when the "villagers" protested and their "anger proved too much to ignore". This construction explicitly reveals the standards of newsworthiness and worthy victims. It means that scale of the crime matters not the nature of the crime itself. The anonymous construction of "gang" conceals the identity of the perpetrators as well as the broader sociocultural aspects of the crime. It entails that a particular group responsible for these events are criminals. Moreover, sex abuse is linked with the "extortion" of millions which indicates the political economy of the sexual abuse. The text uses "sex abuse" instead of "sexual abuse" and this discursive shift is important because of gender neutrality. A discursive distinction is made through different textual construction of gender. The word "sodomy" is used for boys and their age group is mentioned while "rape" is used for girls but their age group is not mentioned. The political and economic power imbalance is portrayed between the intimidating village and the "influential" suspects. The involvement of the police is made explicit by stating that they "acted under pressure" of local protest. The text first mentions just one village but then mentions the protests from 13 villages. The text then describes that the provincial government denied the occurrence of such events when it was known. The text then shows a low-level deontic modality (should have) and constructs the case from a legal perspective (to revisit its entire law-enforcement strategy). This construction indicates that sexual abuse is a matter of law enforcement through which the criminals should be punished. The social and political power of criminals is marginalized through the adjective "sadistic".

“Victims of abuse” appeared on 11th August 2015. Once again, this editorial is a mix of descriptive, narrative, and moral genres. Politicians, government, and society are mentioned generically without specific nominal attributions. This time, instead of "scandal", the editorial describes "child pornography", "gang of pedophiles" "sexual violation" and "films". The atmosphere of anguish is portrayed through "ghastly acts", "sensational coverage", "tales of horror" and "tragedy". Trauma, justice, power relations, and exposition are the main features of the narrative. Limited details of the nature of sexual abuse are presented and most of the text shifts attention to provincial administration and politicians.

In a neutral tone, the text describes that "horrific details" are "spilling out in the media". There is a contradiction in the description. In the first editorial, the newspaper explicitly mentions "hundreds of young boys and girls" but in this editorial, it narrates "if not hundreds". Several other shifts in the discursive nominalization are also significant. Now the "suspects" have become "perpetrators" and the "sadistic gang" becomes "a gang of pedophiles". Sex abuse, sodomy, and rape are now constructed as "sexual violations". There is no hint of violence. The victims are portrayed as young instead of children. Again, there is confusion about the attitude and response of the villagers and victims' families. Previously, the newspaper maintained that the entire village was aware of this but was intimidated, then it maintained that the villagers were threatened and now it maintains that the villagers were blackmailed and extorted. The discourse now blames the Punjab administration instead of the Punjab government for denial and downplay. A high-level epistemic modality (must be) is used for the administration's accountability and punishment for the perpetrators.

The last editorial of Dawn’s “Lest we forget” appeared on 24th August 2015. The horror genre dominates the editorial. The words "ghastliest of tragedies", "child sexual abuse horror", "monstrous crime", "humiliation", "intimidation", "outrage" and "shock" construct a discourse of trauma. This time, the number of sexually abused children is stated that is "almost 300". Victims have sympathized and justice for victims is demanded from the administration. The aspect of power is absent but the influence is implicitly mentioned indicating "collusion with criminals". Contrary to the negative effects of the "glare of media" on the victims, this editorial emphasizes the importance of media reminders of this "monstrous crime". This contradictory discursive construction reveals the dilemma of media coverage.
“Shame, guilt and child abuse” was published on 12th August 2015 by Rafia Zakaria. She constructs several discourses in her text that goes beyond the legal and political frameworks. Contrary to the editorials, the writer claims that pedophiles were "busted upon the complaint of some aggrieved parents". The nominal "aggrieved" specifies the effect on the parents alone and leaves behind the outrage of villagers. The quantifier "some" indicates that not all the parents were deterred by the "influential" criminals, as the editorials maintained. The scale of the phenomenon is also shown to be spread across villages instead of a single village. Instead of "young", the writer uses "children" to indicate child sexual abuse with the essential element of "force". The writer then constructs the "compliance" of the victims through blackmailing and contextualizes that this is a societal problem faced by the "weakest and more vulnerable". This discourse of visible morality questions social moral standards and contests the social praxis with explicit gender categories. This discursive construction of visible morality has liberal and secular undercurrents but at the same time questions the gender relations of power and hollow religiosity of Pakistani society. The text intends to say that a person offering regular prayers is not necessarily a pious man. The word "seen" is of crucial discursive importance in this textual strategy. It entails that the person is just visible without any imposition or obligation. Discursively, this also entails that piety is not necessarily attached to women, that is, men are also required to be pious in this society.

“Reflections on freedom day” is written by I. A. Rehman and published on August 13th, 2015. This article highlights the sexual abuse of children as an indicator of state failure. The state failure is discussed by several failures including failure to accept the abuses, failure to comply with children's rights, to limit child abuse as a crime, and failure of intelligence agencies. The article explains these points one by one.

“The guilt of Kasur” was published on August 14th, 2015 by Asha'ar Rehman. The text describes rejection and denial but this is attributed to "us" in a conversational genre. Children's "vulnerability" and sexual abuse are too common but "we" hide these realities. The text mentions political authorities without names and particular identities who are suspects in rape cases. This highlights the routine of sexual abuse in Pakistani society. Here again, the case is denied on the ground that it is "exaggerated". This writer tells that 400 hundred children were sexually abused and video-taped which brought "shame" to the families but society is in habit of "putting off" such cases. Once again, the discourse of silence and denial is invoked. This discourse calls for a detailed "investigation" of this "ugly story" but no particular measure is suggested.

“Combating abuse” was written by Bina Shah on 16 August 2015. This text describes the scale, causes, and preventive measures of child sexual abuse in Pakistan. Without any qualifier, the writer describes "a gang of men sexually assaulted several children" and sold their videos and now there is an "emotional" demand for hanging the perpetrators. There is a notable discursive transition in this construction. The text mentions that it was the gang of "men". It also mentions "sexual assault" which is almost omitted in preceding texts under the generic child abuse. But the text adds the quantifier "several" instead of hundreds or thousands or any definite number. This may indicate that the number is possible in tens. The "gang" without any attribution to the commercial aspect of selling videos "to other pedophiles" indicates that this was a gang of pedophiles. There is no mention of rape and all other aspects are omitted in the discursive foreground of the political economy of pornography. The writer then quotes "a BBC report" and maintains that "child abuse" is "incredibly hard to eliminate". Child sexual abuse is so common in Pakistan that it is almost reported daily in media which "means there is no deterrence" for the abusers. This combines the discourses of the prevalence of child sexual abuse and the lack of punitive measures.

“Vulnerable in court” was written by Amber Darr on 1st September 2015. By this time, the dust is settled down and the media have moved to other stories. This text does not reiterate the details and
particulars of the case that happened just 20 days ago. The text briefly mentions "organized child abuse" that "sparked intense moral outrage" in which some demanded, "death to the perpetrators". This construction avoids mentioning "gang" or the gender of the generic perpetrators and the word "organized" is attributed to the crime, not the criminals. Moral outrage appears counter-discourse to the discourse of "lack of moral vocabulary" projected in a preceding text. The generic "child" also hides the gender of the victims and "some" entails that the death penalty is preferred by the writer. The discourse is shifted to the post-case situation and the vulnerability of the victims in legal trials is discussed. The writer selects an example of child sexual abuse from England. In this case, the text specifically uses loaded words "gangs of Muslim men" that reveal both the religion and gender of the criminals as well as their organized grouping of them. By appreciating the legal reforms and amendments in the British criminal system to protect the witnesses and the victims the writer compares this with the Pakistani legal system.

The last opinion column “Lessons from Kasur” is written by Rafia Zakaria on 30th September 2015. This text is an interdiscursive mix of pornography, shame, sex education, legislation, child sexual abuse, and social dynamics of child sexual abuse discourses. The first half of the text describes the traumatic and terrific situation of the survivors and the second half explains the scale and nature of the phenomenon and protective measures for parents. This is the single text in the collection of Dawn's texts that introduces the voice of the victims: "death is a better option". This brief voice is then discursively explained and an attempt is made to educate the readers. The survivors are in "hundreds" who were "tortured and filmed while performing sexual acts". This is a clear indication of horror child porn but the text is punctuated with the characterization of the survivors and the situation of Pakistani children. The discourse omits any reference to girl victims, either among the abused or among the survivors. This blackout is embedded in the culture of stigma and shame that the writer vehemently criticizes but then ultimately conforms to it.

**Daily Nawa-e-Waqt**

Daily Nawa-e-Waqt produced four editorials about Kasur Case but only one editorial presents a detailed opinion. The first editorial appeared on August 09, 2015, in which the newspaper revealed that 284 children were sexually abused in the village of Kasur. The editorial mentions "a village" of Kasur and does not provide the name of the village. This anonymity is maintained in all four editorials. The newspaper politicized the event by declaring it a "challenge for government's governance" and demanded exemplary punishments for the accused. The event is constructed as a case of civil strife in which residents are "agitated" while the local administration is suppressing the incident in the name of national interest. This is the only newspaper that provides background details of the perpetrators.

Daily Nawa-e-Waqt produced five opinion columns on the Kasur case out of which only three were relevant to the study. Qayyum Nizami produced a monody mixed with railways record. This shows that the case is not so serious therefore it is suitable to discuss it along with railways. First of all, Nizami boasts that this newspaper group first broke the news of this scandal. This reveals the breaking news trend of the press in which every news channel tries to inform the readers before other news channels for the sake of rating. The text opens with the wording that "unfortunate children" were subjected to brutality. This may entail that sexual abuse was the fate of these children. It is argued that the report "terrorized" the nation. The report revealed a gang of "human-faced beasts" involved in child sexual abuse. The strategic world of "terror" is used to rejoice in the intensity of the report. This sensationalism is celebrated and a discourse of horror is introduced.

The second opinion column is written on August 16, 2015, by Naeem Qasim. This article also celebrates that this news of child abuse was first issued by a sister publication of this newspaper.
There is a sense of pride in this statement that indicates the race of rating. The writer applauds the efficiency of the newspaper staff and the owner of the newspaper. This news story is constructed as the breakthrough in Pakistan's journalism history, an unprecedented example that exposed for the first time an issue that is directly related to a real social problem. This statement is a confession from the press and it means that the Pakistani press is dominated by non-issues to the extent that any coverage of a social issue is marked with distinction and celebration.

The final relevant opinion article on the Kasur case is written by Muteeullah Jan on August 17, 2015. This text mocks the political response to the incident. The text explicitly questions the political wisdom, political responsibility, and efficiency of law enforcement agencies. Jan emphasizes the silence of affected families. According to discourse, this silence is the result of the hypocrisy of the judicial system and helplessness in society in such cases. This construction simultaneously challenges the judicial system, power relations, and gender ideologies that reinforce certain taboos.

Conclusion
The texts of editorials and opinion columns in Dawn reflect social practices as well as construct or deconstruct gender ideologies and power relations existing in society. Editorials of Dawn have constructed the Kasur case of child sexual abuse in a political context and have argued that the imbalance of political power impedes the weak and vulnerable not only from raising voices but also to seek justice. In the opinion columns of Dawn, child rape is constructed to challenge the existing ideologies of sexuality and gender emphasizing forced sexual relations. Moral ideology is criticized for contesting the notions of piety, virtue, modesty, and shame.

Social practices reflected and reinforced in the texts of daily Nawa-e-Waqt are similar to those of Dawn. Child sexual abuse is discussed dominantly in the light of the criminal perspective and the porn industry is highlighted in the texts. The texts of Nawa-e-Waqt are unanimous on the nature of punishment for the criminals of sexual abuse. These texts are aligned with the establishment through their proposals of trying the criminals in anti-terrorism courts. The number of criminals and victims is undecided and varies from 5 to 25 and 270 to 284 respectively. The judicial and political system is distrusted as this system appears to be reinforcing the unequal social and gender power relations in Pakistan. The moral fabric is disrupted and society no authority can control society. Religious and political leaders are themselves involved in social and sexual abuses.

References


Critical Appraisal of a Contemporary Residential Building: A Case Study in the City of Uch Sharif South Punjab Pakistan

Ayaz Mahmood, Associate Professor, The Islamia University Bahawalpur, (Ph.D. Scholar, UMT-Lahore), Pakistan
*Iftikhar Ali, Assistant Professor, Hazara University, Mansehra, Pakistan
Najma Kabir, Associate Professor, University of South Asia, Lahore, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email address: arch.iftikharali@hu.edu.pk

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

Purpose: In the city of Uch, if one looks critically at the current practice of demolishing old traditional houses and constructing new ones, it can easily be ascertained that in any society or a part of society there are internal and external factors that influence the local trends in every walk of life including building design and construction.

Design/Methodology/Approach: Whether those trends are socio-culturally appropriate or not in their entirety, we need to enquire if there is a justifiable and positive balance between those internal and external societal factors that result in the demolition of the traditional houses. In the field survey of Uch Sharif, one contemporary building was evaluated as compared to a traditional building for selection based on the approximate age of the building.

Findings: The degree to which the original design was modified, its cultural appropriateness, environmental comfort in terms of temperature and relative humidity audited inside the building, use of local materials and techniques, plan type and presence of architectural elements. The results show that traditional buildings are fast diminishing causing irreplaceable examples of traditional wisdom and ingenious craftsmanship to be struck down one after the other by the cyclone of urbanization supercharged by market forces.

Implications/Originality/Value: Through research, it was concluded that the Contemporary buildings, which are replacing traditional buildings, are less responsive to the local climate, culture, skills, and the issue of cost which core of the design criteria of traditional buildings.

© 2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution- Non-Commercial- 4.0

Introduction
Critical appraisal is the process of carefully and systematically examining research to judge its trustworthiness, and its value and relevance in a particular context (Burls, 2014). To ‘critically evaluate’, you must provide your opinion or verdict on whether an argument or set of research findings, is accurate. This should be done in as critical a manner as possible. Provide your opinion on the extent to which a statement or research finding is true.

A positive critique and experimentation can lead to an overall balance between internal and external influencing factors and can generate a sense of pride in a community towards what is from within. This in turn determines the trends which may strengthen what is local. On the other hand, if the thinkers, intellectuals, academicians, decision-makers, and professionals in society fail to generate a positive critique, it certainly allows external factors to affect the healthy balance. A loss of pride and identity towards what is within facilitates a kind of trend that weakens what is local.

Contemporary Residences in Southern Punjab
Contemporary architecture is the architecture of the 21st century. Contemporary architects work in several different styles, from postmodernism, high-tech architecture, and new interpretations of traditional architecture to highly conceptual forms and designs, resembling sculpture on an enormous scale.

Brief Description of South Punjab, Pakistan
Southern Punjab is the cradle of one of the oldest civilizations in the world, the Harappa Civilization. The remains of the civilization have been excavated in the 20th century on the left bank of a now dry course of the River Ravi, in the Sahiwal District. This historical place stands on an extensive series of mounds in which excavations since 1920 have disclosed the remains of a large city of the Indus Valley Civilization, second in size only to Mohenjo-Daro. The inhabitants were Dravidians and their cultural influence extended up to Tashkent through land communication in the north and the Middle East through the Arabian Sea in the south. Later the Scythian tribes occupied the area and spread far and wide because of their metal tools and their progressive agriculture. They traded through rivers and sea with Iraq and even with Greece. The cotton spinning and hand-weaving techniques were well advanced and were briskly traded even in those times (Islam, 2017).

Southern Punjab is defined to be the area constituting the divisions of Bahawalpur, Dera Ghazi Khan, and Multan. These lie roughly between the Longitudes 70° and 73 1/2° and the Latitude 30 1/2°. The history of the region can be traced through the local crafts. Most of the crafts date back centuries and were the easiest and the closest source of people’s identification. The crafts of the region include hand-woven textiles, ceramics & glazed building decoration, lacquer work, and jewelers. It is also apparent that the works of Central Asian artists of the early Muslim period influence the local arts and crafts. Besides the major changes that colonization, industrialization, and globalization have brought in the role of traditional arts and crafts in everyday life, they have sustained both at popular and elite levels.

Significance for Selection of the Building in Uch Sharif
Uch Sharif is well renowned for its historical, architectural, spiritual, and monumental significance (Cheema, 2013 #14). It has been observed that contemporary residential buildings in the historic city of Uch are replacing the cultural heritage of the region which was established after a trial-and-error
method since long time ago and is supposed to be the custodian of regional culture, built environment, and most appropriate for the user. Demolishing our cultural heritage and constructing new contemporary residences is vanishing wisdom that should prevail for the next generations (Islam, 2017).

In Uch, if one looks critically at the current practice of demolishing old traditional houses and constructing new ones, it can easily be ascertained that in any society or a part of society there are internal and external factors that influence the local trends in every walk of life including building design and construction. Whether those trends are socio-culturally appropriate or not in their entirety, we need to enquire if there is a justifiable and positive balance between those internal and external societal factors that result in the demolition of the traditional houses (Khalid, 2018).

A critical analysis of such selected residential building will evaluate it with the criteria of sustainability, cultural responsiveness, and cost-effectiveness which was present in the previous residence. After the critical analysis of this contemporary residential, we will be able to understand its compatibility in its context and possible measures which are essential at the time of design and execution to make it suitable for the user.

Literature Review
The situation in Southern Punjab as a whole, and specifically in Uch, clearly demonstrates the above-outlined framework. The traditional houses are a development of centuries of knowledge and experimentation (Vandal, 2011). They are no longer considered an element of personal and community pride and identity. The local community does not seem to turn to what is within for their ideas and inspirations for their houses. Modernity for them, therefore, is not a conscious break from tradition nor an extension of it. Instead, they seek motivation in some external ideas being practiced perhaps in nearby urban centers or even in remote metropolitan cities, and then bring them into practice, without realizing or considering that those solutions are in turn influenced by the said loss of pride and identity in the community who is practicing them (Hasan, 2009). With a conscious effort to avoid reductionism and realizing the fact that most commonly the issue of socio-cultural appropriateness is merely reduced to a balance between tradition and modernity, one can always take a critical stand on the whole issue of accepting, and so also negating, the new realities of emerging lifestyles and therefore the implications of such a discussion of socio-cultural appropriateness. South Punjab is an area that is vulnerable to extreme climate conditions (Aslam, 2017).

If one assesses the thinking of the local community in Uch, documented through interviews and field observation, their belief that old traditional houses are not compatible with new lifestyles, can easily be singled out as a major reason for the demolition of the old traditional houses and erecting new houses at the same or a new location.

Now if one tries to see this reality more rationally and more inclusively, one can always argue that it is true that the new lifestyles have developed new activities and requirements that cannot be accommodated in the old traditional houses. Without even going into finer details, the immediate reply would be perhaps yes. It can also be argued that lifestyles are influenced and reflect the production system which shapes the structure of the community. From a predominantly agriculture-based community, Southern Punjab is in an age where it is experiencing simultaneously agricultural as well as an industrial mode of production along with the new emerging services sector. This fact is restructuring the community and has implications for shaping new lifestyles.

One cannot negate the fact that old traditional houses were constructed for the activities and requirements of the lifestyle of their era. With time they were appropriated according to new forms of lifestyles. If we do agree that any development in the built environment reflects and should respect
the needs of the community, then the question of socio-cultural appropriateness can be judged from altogether another angle. It can frankly be stated that any development that reflects the present aspirations of the community must be considered appropriate.

If the professionals can see the issue of socio-cultural appropriateness from both angles explained above, then one can always be open, positively, to accept the change. Perhaps a situation where traditions are not considered a burden carried from the past and where changes are welcomed for a better future can answer many questions embedded in the issue of socio-cultural appropriateness.

Now to critically extend the framework developed, we can offer the following major concerns for further argument:

What are the different dimensions of quality assurance? How it can be guaranteed in contemporary times? What actions and actors are needed to attain quality assurance?

How has the system of governance affected the whole process of cost-effectiveness?

How do attain a balance between affordable technology and the best available technology? What are the practical and technical limitations to adapt old houses to state-of-the-art technology?

If we consider that the people decide to build a new house when their old property is insufficient to accommodate their changed life pattern, including increased spatial requirements, then the immediate response is to look for some extra space in the same house. Most often they convert verandahs, and in rare cases courtyards, into rooms. Most citizens of Uch cannot afford to buy land, hence either continue to live in their old houses or build on the land of their demolished houses. In the new house, they create more space by reducing the size of structural elements. Even when people can buy new land, they go for extra space to fulfill their space requirements, and in this way, they unintentionally agree to compromise the quality of energy efficiency or even cultural-appropriateness of their house.

As it is stressed and defended earlier that cost-effectiveness does not merely mean efforts to reduce the cost, keeping the same attitude, it is justified that the recommended appropriate methods and materials must consider the factors of material availability, the expertise required, social acceptance, security & safety concerns, aesthetic standards, and technological advancements (Foster, 2013).

To have a simplified overview and to be able to realize the variety of options available, among which we need to choose or which we need to modify for contemporary use, we can compose them under the heads of foundations, walls, roofs, floors, and finish (Barry, 1969).

**Significance of Research Methodology**

In the field survey of Uch Sharif, a contemporary building was selected and evaluated for selection because of the information below:

**Approximate Age of the Building**
The degree to which the original design was modified
Its cultural appropriateness
Environmental comfort
Use of local materials and techniques
Size of the building
Plan type
And the presence of architectural elements,
**Brief Introduction about Selected Residence**

The contemporary residential building was selected for detailed documentation on the conclusion of the field survey marked on the City’s map. This house is in Nawazabad Colony, about half km from the Shamas chowk, a reference point.

On the southeast side, which is the front of the house, there is a twelve feet wide road and is leading towards the Khair Pur Daha. On the northeast is the empty plot, on the Northwest is the land for agricultural purposes and on the southwest is the land for commercial purposes.

Its construction was done two years ago in partially local and mostly imported materials. The noted temperature in this house is 37.5 & humidity is 38.8%, which is not comfortable.

No alteration has been made after its construction.
Two families live in this house owned by Khwaja Barkat. The total plot area is 1251.5 Sq-m. The ground-floor covered area is 544.6 sqm and the first-floor covered area is 248.4 Sq-m. Four bedrooms, living space, bathrooms, servant quarter, guest bed, garage, drawing/dinning, porch kitchen are on the ground floor and two bedrooms, living space, bathrooms, and kitchen are on the first floor.

The electricity connection in the house is made from the main electric supply to the city passing at a distance from the house, which is coming from Ahmadpur and Kot Khalifa grid station about 20 and 15 k.m from the Uch city. The water in the city is supplied by the city water management dept. The house is located at a distance from the city, so no line is passing beside the house. The main source of water in the house is the electric water pump and water is stored in the overhead tanks.

No proper sewerage system is in the house; however, the water, coming from the house is collected in the front of the house in a covered gutter, and then that untreated wastewater is discharged through an open drain into the fields at some distance from the house. This gas supply line is not provided to the house due to the distance of the house from the city.

Culture Walls are constructed in brick masonry with cement mortar, having the cement sand plaster on it, with ceramic tile finish. The roof is three inches thick R.C.C. with two coats of hot bitumen layers, two layers of polythene sheet, and 3 to 4 inches of mud for sloping and insulation purposes. The molding with plaster of Paris is done on the ceiling. Floors are terrazzo, marble, and ceramics tiles with marble skirting.
Analysis of House Based on Air Movement Pattern in Plans
All doors are wooden in wooden and iron frames with two shutters of 30 mm thickness. All windows are in wooden & iron frames and wooden glazed casement. All lintels are reinforced cement concrete, and the lintel level is 2133 mm.
The staircase on the veranda is with wooden railing and balustrades and the finishing is marble. The presences of adequate and well-ventilated spaces make them environmentally comfortable. The structure is safe and sound and no attack by insects is reported.

Analysis of House Based on Air Movement Pattern in Section

Critical Appraisal & Conclusions

Contemporary urban structures which are replacing traditional buildings are commonly considered less responsive to the local climate, culture, skills, and cost efficiency - which were at the core of the design criteria of traditional buildings. Contemporary buildings are seemingly unable to replicate what traditional buildings offer. That is why the demolition of traditional buildings is considered irreparable damage to our valuable traditional asset.
Finally, if considering the new definitions of community in Uch, fueled by the new means of transport and communication, one can understand and explain the reasons for disrupting the neighborhoods based on community associations. In those situations, the whole neighborhood was the class symbol, in which individual houses were the basic units. This old system was based on place-based associations and class-based groupings. The individual house was even then a class symbol but was contributing to the whole neighborhood to represent the whole group.

In contemporary times, class-based groupings are no more place-based associations but rather mental associations. Such a reality permits and facilitates that different houses at different locations can be a class symbol and can still be a part of a class-based group.

It is an identified reality that such a fractured and ruptured built environment is an attribute for most of the developing societies who still must face their transition from the agriculture-based lifestyle to industrial or even post-industrial lifestyle and still have all the hybrid variations in between.

There are some of the admissions of this research that need to be highlighted, especially regarding the spatial structure and the use of spaces in the contemporary houses as that of the old traditional houses. Also included in this discussion are the changing definitions of public and private.

A critical look at the selected documented houses demonstrates how new spaces evolved in the designs of the contemporary house. Most striking among them is the living room (also termed the lounge). As the activities of the family at home extended over the late evening times and as indoor activities took over from outdoor ones, a new multi-purpose space evolved in the center of the house which is a semi-private space. This space not only marks the change in the use of outdoor spaces but also presents new definitions of public and private domains.

Another interesting shift in the use of spaces is the new role of the bedroom (also termed as a sleeping room, and very often just referenced as a room). Its new role where it also serves as a sitting room reveals the hybrid levels of privacy and the corresponding spatial structure of a contemporary house. In the new lifestyles the precise definitions of private and public domains, male and female quarters, and even day and evening spaces, have changed, which used to be the characteristic spatial structure of the old traditional houses.

**Recommendations and the Way Forward**

By projecting the discussion of socio-cultural appropriateness and the positive balance of internal and external factors to the issues of societal and cultural maturity of a community and the issues of modernity and tradition in a development process, it can be further extended that the sense of pride and identity in what is local in a community, stems directly out of the combined efforts and attitude of thinkers, intellectuals, academicians, decision-makers, professionals which will produce a contemporary design solution.

**References**


Theoretical Analysis of a Multi-Tier Supply Chain Management Process Integration: A Case Study Method

*Muhammad Nauman Abbasi*, Professor, Institute of Management Sciences, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, Pakistan
*Nadir Munir Hassan*, Assistant Professor, Air University, Multan Campus, Multan, Pakistan
*Javeria Abbas*, Assistant Professor, Institute of Management Sciences, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email address: abbasimna@bzu.edu.pk

**ARTICLE DETAILS**

**History**
Revised format: May 2022
Available Online: Jun 2022

**Keywords**
Supply chain integration, Supply chain process, Multi-tier, Automotive industry, Supply Chain process integration.

**JEL Classification**
M1, M2

**ABSTRACT**

**Purpose:** - Case studies of 12 automotive supply chains are used to build a theory of multi-tier supply chain management (SCM) processes integration which links patterns of multi-tier process integration with cost and differentiation strategies of the focal firms.

**Design/Methodology/Approach:** The cases build on previous researches by examining the rationales and extents in which a focal firm integrates the key supply chain management processes across first, second and third-tier suppliers, logistics service providers and authorized dealers. Data was collected in two rounds, followed by codification and analysis.

**Findings:** The analyses suggest that firms with lower scope and span of process integration prioritized cost efficiency and firms with larger scope and span of process integration prioritized both cost efficiency and customer service differentiation. As a result, propositions for explaining strategic priorities driving multi-tier SCM process integration are developed.

**Implications/Originality/Value:** This study provides managerial accounts and theoretical foundation to explain the needs for different levels, scopes and span of SCM process integration and the extent to which the span of integration (tiers) should be extended.

©2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-4.0


**Introduction**

It is acknowledged by scholars and professionals, that ‘integration’ is the basic ingredient for execution of supply chain management in practice (Vallet-Bellmunt & Rivera-Torres, 2013). By making chain members, integrate resources and abilities, it helps improving both financial and operational outcomes (Huo, Tian, Tian, & Zhang, 2019). To be specific, SCI has been defined as the "comprehensive collaboration between supply chain network members in strategic, tactical and
operational decision-making” (Alfalla-Luque, Medina-Lopez, & Dey, 2013). It’s a multidimensional concept, often considered from multiple view points, including: operational, relationship, information and process integration (Shee, Miah, Fairfield, & Pujawan, 2018). Likewise, SCI is also categorized as supplier, internal and customer integration (Song, Song, & Sun, 2019). While, certain scholars have inspected various integration types, including process (Shee et al., 2018), technology (De Vass, Shee, & Miah, 2018) and information integration (K. Yu, Luo, Feng, & Liu, 2018).

The need to integrate supply chain processes beyond the first-tier has been widely acknowledged (Cooper, Lambert, & Pagh, 1997; Croxton, 2003; Croxton, Garcia-Dastugue, Lambert, & Rogers, 2001) and supported by certain previous empirical investigations (e.g., Ragatz, Handfield, & Scannell, 1997; Salam, 2011). Unfortunately, there has been a lack of theoretical advancement since the seminal work of Cooper et al. (1997) and Lambert et al. (1998). However, despite acknowledging the benefits, previous studies have focused only on unilateral relationships (e.g., buyer-supplier relationship, bargaining power, and the comparison of single-tier value creation stages) and neglected the impact of the relationships within a multi-tier supply chain (Adner & Kapoor, 2010).

Initially, literature across the stream of supply chain management categorized it into eight key SCM processes (Cooper et al., 1997). Afterwards, Lambert et al. (1998) theorized that it is desirable for a focal firm to establish different levels of integration for different processes with different supply chain actors or tiers. The case studies of Lambert et al. (1998) provide some indications that some processes have been integrated to a greater extent with actors in specific tiers of a supply chain. Number of authors, have concentrated on multiple aspects of SCI, including available levels of integration (Robinson, Manrodt, Murfield, Boone, & Rutner, 2018; Wiengarten & Longoni, 2015), enablers (Mora-Monge, Quesada, Gonzalez, & Davis, 2019) and a detailed insights into the SCI and performance connection (Ataseven & Nair, 2017; Fabbe-Costes & Jahre, 2008; Feyissa, Sharma, & Lai, 2019; Zhao, Feng, & Wang, 2015).

Considering, the variety of outcomes available in literature, SCM researchers are prompted, to dig deep into other available aspects, related with integration in SC networks. For example, Wiengarten, Li, Singh, and Fynes (2019), responded to this, by providing additional details into the topic, they raised questions, on commonly accepted philosophy of higher SCI and performance relation, and termed it not to be universally true. According to him, SCI is a complex and dynamic process, with certain contextual aspects attached to it, which must be considered, before establishing the SCI and performance relationship. Additionally, Hassan & Abbasi, 2020 also highlighted, that execution and implementation of levels, extents and types of SCI need, configurational considerations. Still, it is unclear which strategic priorities drive the integration of which processes with which tiers. So, greater understanding can be achieved when we are able to develop a theory to explain the drivers behind the arcs or patterns of integration of different SCM processes in a multi-tier supply chain.

Therefore, this study builds onto previous research by examining how eight SCM processes (Cooper et al., 1997) are being differentiated for integration with multi-tier supply chain actors (Lambert, Cooper, & Pagh, 1998) and explains the key drivers behind this. The aim is to build a theory to explain the different arcs or patterns of integration of different SCM processes in a multi-tier supply chain. Particularly, we address the following research questions about multi-tier SCM process integration:

Is differentiating the integration of different SCM process (scope) with different tiers (span) desirable?
Are the different patterns of multi-tier SCM process integration driven by specific competitive priorities? If so, why?
Literature Review
Supply Chain Integration
Supply chain integration generally means “the level to which manufacturers strategically collaborate with its supply chain partners and collaboratively manages intra- and inter organization processes” (Flynn, Huo, & Zhao, 2010; p.59). In line with information processing theory, SCI results in improved quality, thoughtful decisions, by helping stakeholder both within and beyond firms, to interact effectively (Hendijani & Saei, 2020). Similarly, SCI is known for its diversified scope, starting from internal processes, till external coordination (Doering, De Jong, & Suresh, 2019). These definitions suggest that, cooperative mode of actions are at the very base of the concept of integrated supply chains. The literature has, in general, agreed that a better supply chain performance can be achieved when the strength of supply chain integration is greater or the arc of integration is ‘wider’ (Flynn, Huo, & Zhao, 2010; Frohlich & Westbrook, 2001; Swink, Narasimhan, Wang, 2007; Wong, Boon-itt, & Wong, 2011).

Furthermore, in order to establish proper conceptual and theoretical insights into the construct of integration, Autry, et al. (2014) explains integration from operational coordination (i.e. activities in support of planning, information exchanges, and system integration) to tactical cooperation (i.e. recognition and achievement of mutually beneficial activities) and finally a strategic collaboration and integration (i.e. establishment and maintaining of collaborative relationships). While integrating processes there is often a need to consider the integration of physical and information flow, technologies and systems across multiple actors and organizational structures. Process alignment also means that organizations, willing to organize resources in a differentiated manner, may generate better results, in comparison to firms, which don’t reflect on to it (Ganbold, Matsui, & Rotaru, 2020). Hence, process integration is an important perspective, as found across the studies related to the concept of supply chain integration (Chen, Daugherty, & Roath, 2009a).

SCM Process Integration
In the same way, number of authors (e.g. (Cooper et al., 1997; Croxton et al., 2001; Lambert, Cooper, & Pagh, 1998) have acknowledged the need to integrate the key business processes across supply chains. Previous studies have indicated that competitive organizational outcomes can be reaped by aligning SC processes, and activities. Yet, researches on enablers of SC process integration and its outcome are very few in number (W. Yu, Jacobs, Salisbury, & Enns, 2013). Supply chain process integration is defined as the interaction and collaboration between supply chain partners that intend to form a network (Huang, Yen, & Liu, 2014). Earlier, Cooper et al. (1997) identified eight key SCM processes i.e. customer relationship management (CRM), customer service management (CSM), demand management (DM), order fulfillment process (OFP), manufacturing flow management (MFM), supply management (SM), product development and commercialization (PD&C), and returns management (RM). These SCM processes cover both base line and generic business related actions which are eminent for smooth running of the basic supply chain operations.

Hence, activities that constitute these processes, such as inventory management (Aviv, 2003; Chu & Jorge, 2008; Shin & Benton, 2004; Weng, 2004;), procurement (Narasimhan & Das, 2001), transportation (Mason & Lalwani, 2006), anticipation (Aviv, 2001; Reiner, Natter, & Drechsler, 2009), manufacturing, marketing and distribution (Samaranayake, Laosirihongthong, & Chan, 2011), product enlargement (Naveh, 2005; Srivastava, Shervani, & Fahey, 1999), and reverse logistics (Brown, 2004) can arguably be improved through the integration of different SCM processes. Resultantly, integrating supply chains can result in superior outcomes, ultimately causing improved supply chain performance (Prajogo, Oke, & Olhager, 2016).

The literature also argues that not all SCM processes, actors and tiers within a supply chain are equally important and, therefore, they require different levels of integration. There are several
approaches to differentiate levels of integration in the literature (e.g., Stevens, 1989; Trkman, Mojca, Jaklic, & Groznik, 2007; Wagner, 2003) but only few specifically focus on process integration. Based on the process framework of Cooper et al. (1997), Lambert et al. (1998) suggested four levels of integration: managed process links, monitored process links, non-managed process links and non-members process links. According to them, managed process links are the links where a focal firm integrates a process with one or more customers/suppliers; monitored process links are the links where a focal firm simply monitors or audits their relations with their supply chain partners. Comparatively, non-managed process links are not links that a focal firm is actively involved in, nor are they critical enough to use resources, even for monitoring. Non-member process links are the process links between members and non-members of the supply chain. Non-member links can, however, affect the performance of the supply chain.

Based on case studies, Lambert et al. (1998) suggest that in any supply chain, a focal firm may maintain managed process links for specific business processes with suppliers and their corresponding firm. Meanwhile, for other processes the focal firm may choose to apply monitored process links or non-managed process links. More specifically, they found that DM was the only business process where the focal firms preferred to establish a managed process link with all their first-tier suppliers. They also observed that the focal firms preferred to maintain managed process links with only three (out of five) first tier suppliers in the PD&C. However, in terms of CRM and OFP, focal firms preferred to maintain managed process links just with two and one first tier suppliers (out of five) respectively. Contrasted with previous supply chain literature which suggests that all the business processes should be linked across the supply chain, the study of Lambert et al. (1998) provided some evidence that firms strategically choose to integrate some selected key processes and, instead, simply monitor some other processes.

The work of Lambert et al. (1998) was later extended in a more extensive study by Mejza and Wisner (2001). Their findings are: (1) a substantial proportion of firms that practice SCM integrate two or more processes with those of other firms in their supply chain; (2) a large proportion of firms practicing SCM integrate a larger number of SCM processes across their supply chains; (3) for some processes i.e. OFP, MFM, SM, CSM, and DM, firms manage moderate levels of integration with their supply chain members; (4) for firms where SCM is practiced, managers concentrate a fair amount of effort and resources to the integration of a broad, diverse array of key cross-functional processes; and (5) the length of SC actions are positively associated with the intensity with organizations arrange their processes in sync with other firms across their chains. So, the given research, may help to conceptualize patterns of SCM process integration: a broader scope of process integration involves more SCM processes in the integration efforts, and a longer span of process integration involves multiple tiers SCI (beyond first-tier). In the end they identify that certain processes, such as, OFP, MFM, CSM, SM and DM are being jointly managed to a greater level than others. Therefore, examining the supply chains from the view point of process integration is significant in causing supply chain performance (Rajaguru & Matanda, 2019). Additionally, chain wise integration of processes, causes the sense of fit among channel members, inspiring them, to become the even ingrained and useful part of diverse chains and networks (Skipworth, Godsell, Wong, Saghiri, & Julien, 2015).

Some researchers have particularly propagated the need for empirical work on how multiple SC process integration dimensions merge to effect organizational performance (Eriksson, 2015). The empirical evidence reported by Lambert et al. (1998) and Mejza and Wisner (2001) suggest that firms recognize the strategic importance of different SCM processes and relationships with different actors in a supply chain. This behavior can be explained by strategic choice theory (Miles & Snow, 1978) and competitive priority theory (Hayes & Wheelwright, 1984; Skinner, 1969). While, the Strategic choice theory reflects a firm’s responses to the competitive environment. Following the strategy-
structure-performance (SSP) framework of Miles & Snow (1978), Chen et al. (2009b) argue that a firm’s strategy has to fit with the competitive priorities. Strategic orientations tell us the strategic choices made by a firm in order to fit with the environment. Based on these arguments, Chen et al. (2009b) theorize that strategic orientation towards either cost efficiency or customer-orientation (differentiation) can have an influence on the emphasis in internal or external SCM process integration. In Chen et al.’s (2009b) theory, if the strategic priority is to achieve superior service performance for specific customers, then it is more likely for firms to emphasize the integration of OFP, CSM and DM processes with these customers. For firms where product innovation is rather critical and there might be a need to collaborate with suppliers to design and produce new products frequently then the PD&C and SM processes need to be integrated. For achieving cost efficiency there may be a tendency to focus on MFM, SM and OFM processes.

While different SCM processes have been linked with different competitive priorities the multi-tier perspective has not been taken into account. Hence, there is a need to explain why focal firms need to extend the integration of specific processes beyond the first tier.

Methods

Samples

Our research questions ask if differentiated SCM multi-tier process integration is desirable for anticipated performance outcomes or not. It is therefore important to study multiple case exemplars in a multi-tier SC setting. Initially, Pakistani automotive industry was considered for the following reasons. The Pakistani automotive industry largely works through franchises, alliances and specific partnership with Korean, Japanese, European, Chinese and Malaysian automakers. In the last five years the auto vendor industry of Pakistan enjoyed an annual growth rate of an average of 35%, reflecting a significant increase in the demand of automobiles. Resultantly, the industry contributed significantly i.e. 2.8% to the GDP of the country. The industry supply chain players vary from local small and medium enterprises (SMEs – 90% of the automotive industry) to multinational giants (MNCs – 10% of the automotive industry). In addition to fill local demand, firms in the automotive industry are also engaged in exports. Countries such as Sri Lanka, Malaysia, Gulf Estates, Singapore, Turkey, Poland, USA, Spain, Germany, Italy, Brazil, and England are the major buyers of Pakistani auto parts.

From two databases: Pakistan Automotive Manufacturing Association (PAMA) and Association of Pakistan Motorcycle Assembler (APMA), twelve automotive OEMs were identified. They are selected because some of them are known to have excelled in customer service, others with a focus on cost efficiency, and some who prioritize both cost and customer orientation (theoretical sampling). Also, they represent all of the major OEMs in Pakistan engaging in assembling/manufacturing, castings and/or forgings of major automotive products.

Data Collection

Data was collected through in-depth multiple case studies of twelve OEMs plus a survey questionnaire about the automotive industry in Pakistan. The case studies and survey questionnaires were guided by a structured questionnaire. To study the multi-tier automotive supply chains, we asked the OEMs to consider process integration with the first-tier suppliers (products - steel coils, body paints, tyres, etc.), second-tier suppliers (products – door hinges, brake assembly, door locks, rubber seals, plastic items), third-tier suppliers (products – aluminum, iron, cylinders, etc.), logistics service providers and authorized dealers. Such multi-tier automotive supply chain actors are chosen as the unit of analysis because it is evident from the literature (e.g., Brown, 2004; Frohlich & Westbrook, 2001; Hertz, 2001; Kim, 2006; Naveh, 2005; Reiner, Natter, Drechsler, 2009; Kannan & Tan, 2010; Samaranayake, Laosirihongthong, & Chan, 2011) that a higher level and broader scope and span of supply chain integration with both supplier and customer can lead to remarkable benefits.
We purposely chose a wide span or number of tiers in order to limit where the span of integration ends. Additionally, need for execution of SCM and SCI concept on a dyadic, triadic and network perspective, have been on a rise (Huo et al., 2019).

The multiple case studies for the twelve OEMs are conducted in two rounds. In the first round, questionnaires are distributed to targeted sample (two to six), from multiple sections such as marketing, sales & supply chain etc. within all organizations. Each respondent is asked to reveal the current and desirable levels of integration of eight SCM processes (according to Cooper et al. (1997) with the immediate and extended tiers of suppliers and customers, and provide further contextual explanations. When necessary, explanations of the meaning of each SCM process are given to the respondents, were asked to label their view point for existing and expected level of SCI across multi-layered SC participants (i.e. 1st, 2nd, 3rd tier suppliers, LSP and intermediaries) on each of the items measuring the SCI extent.

To develop shared opinion among respondents of single firm, variation in their responses was noticed. Second level of data seeking included, discussions on the differences. While, participants, with diversified viewpoints were asked to elaborate reasons behind their identified varied thought patterns. After fetching the base line information, all respondents were asked to reflect onto the question on, whether one given extent of integration can be considered across each of the SCM process, or not. Respondents are also asked to explain the strategic choices they made with regard to the levels of integration for each process-actor link.

**Coding and Analysis**

In addition to the data collected by the two-round data collection and verification processes, further triangulation of the data is carried out by examining supporting secondary (e.g. meeting memos, minutes of meetings, and training schedules etc.). The qualitative accounts of the desirable and actual levels of integration are compared with the quantitative responses calculated in terms of means and standard deviations. When large differences were found, further follow up interviews with the respondents were conducted until the results converged.

To code the levels of integration (current and desirable) without being biased, we draw onto the related literature (Croxtorn, 2003; Croxton et al. (2001); Goldsby & Garcia-Dastugue, 2003; Morris & Davis, 1992; Parvatiyar & Sheth, 2001; Rogers & Tibben-Lembke, 2001; Selen & Soliman, 2002; Vollmann, William, & Whybark, 1997) and divided following five levels of integration in to a Likert scale.

**Strategic collaboration:** the highest level of integration, where supply chain partners share resources, risk and rewards, promote teamwork and joint decision-making, and establish joint goals at strategic/corporate level to attain supply chain objectives.

**Functional interaction:** a medium level of integration, where supply chain members manage mutuality, particularity, and the firms’ abilities, whilst at the same time coping with and positively using inconsistency in its dealings with others.

**Operational cooperation:** a low level of integration, where supply chain members observe informal relations and low level of commitment to attain joint goals.

**Transaction-based interaction:** the level of integration that is limited to transactional interaction, where involvement of the supply chain member is limited to only one transaction.

**No integration:** the firm (intentionally or unintentionally) does not want to establish relationships with their supply chain member(s) because manager(s) may not be able to comprehend the contribution and/or effect of those members towards their supply chain objectives/performance.

Similarly, we refer to the definitions of strategic cost efficiency or customer-orientation (Chen et al.,
2009b) in order to examine the competitive priorities of the OEMs. For example, when cost efficiency has been repetitively mentioned it is a clear indication of cost efficiency orientation. Customer service orientation is normally demonstrated by the efforts to please the customers by providing additional services and product features. Additionally, the data analyses are conducted in two stages: within and across case analysis. Case analysis helped us to examine multi-tier SCM process integration in a single firm context, while the across case analysis helped to identify similar patterns in different setting or firm contexts (Yin 2013).

Cross Case Analysis
The cross case analyses below cover two aspects: (a) an analysis of the desirable and actual scope and span of integration of each of the eight processes at an aggregated level for the twelve OEMs, and (b) categorization of the twelve OEMs in terms of the patterns of multi-tier SCM process integration and competitive priorities.

Desirable and actual scope and span of process integration
Table 1 summarizes the desirable and actual levels of process integration for the twelve OEMs at an aggregated level. The numbers in brackets represent the average scores for the levels of integration by the OEMs. The higher the average scores the lower the levels of integration. The average scores of the current (labeled “C”) levels of integration clearly indicate that the OEMs had desires to achieve and actually achieved different levels of integration with different tiers for each process. SM is the only process in which the OEMs have achieved the highest possible level of integration (strategic collaboration) with authorized dealers. In average, OEMs are using the second highest level of integration (functional/departmental interaction) in other crucial processes such as CRM, CSM, DM, and OFP with authorized dealers but two of these processes have lower levels of integration with the suppliers, another evidence of customer-facing integration. However, OEMs are simply maintaining the third level of integration (operational cooperation) with authorized dealers in MFM and PD&C, and low levels of integration (transactional) in the process of returns management, indicating that not all processes require equal level of integration.

Table 1 – Average levels of integration between OEMs and actors from different tiers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Process</th>
<th>3rd Suppliers</th>
<th>Tier</th>
<th>2nd Suppliers</th>
<th>Tier</th>
<th>1st Suppliers</th>
<th>Tier</th>
<th>LSPs</th>
<th>Dealers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CRM</td>
<td>C: TI (4.66)</td>
<td>C: TI (3.99)</td>
<td>C: OC (2.71)</td>
<td>C: TI (4.42)</td>
<td>C: FI (1.83)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D: TI (3.70)</td>
<td>D: OC (2.59)</td>
<td>D: SC (1.50)</td>
<td>D: TI (3.95)</td>
<td>D: SC (1.39)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C: TI (4.12)</td>
<td>C: OC (3.26)</td>
<td>C: FI (2.09)</td>
<td>C: OC (2.84)</td>
<td>C: FI (2.37)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D: OC (3.28)</td>
<td>D: FI (2.38)</td>
<td>D: FI (1.53)</td>
<td>D: OC (2.75)</td>
<td>D: SC (1.38)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D: TI (3.34)</td>
<td>C: TI (3.81)</td>
<td>C: OC (3.01)</td>
<td>C: TI (4.04)</td>
<td>C: FI (2.22)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C: TI (3.59)</td>
<td>D: OC (2.71)</td>
<td>D: FI (1.92)</td>
<td>D: OC (3.49)</td>
<td>D: SC (1.47)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C: TI (3.80)</td>
<td>C: OC (2.97)</td>
<td>C: FI (2.07)</td>
<td>C: OC (2.71)</td>
<td>C: FI (2.24)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D: OC (3.27)</td>
<td>D: FI (2.29)</td>
<td>D: FI (1.68)</td>
<td>D: FI (2.23)</td>
<td>C: FI (1.64)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D: TI (3.21)</td>
<td>C: OC (3.48)</td>
<td>C: FI (2.23)</td>
<td>C: TI (3.81)</td>
<td>C: OC (3.36)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C: TI (3.38)</td>
<td>D: OC (2.66)</td>
<td>D: FI (2.41)</td>
<td>D: FI (1.70)</td>
<td>D: OC (2.75)</td>
<td>D: OC (2.66)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MFM</td>
<td>C: TI (4.21)</td>
<td>C: OC (3.48)</td>
<td>C: FI (2.23)</td>
<td>C: TI (3.81)</td>
<td>C: OC (3.36)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D: OC (2.66)</td>
<td>D: FI (2.41)</td>
<td>D: FI (1.70)</td>
<td>D: OC (2.75)</td>
<td>D: OC (2.66)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D: TI (3.78)</td>
<td>C: TI (3.31)</td>
<td>C: FI (2.06)</td>
<td>C: FI (2.24)</td>
<td>C: SC (1.41)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D: TI (3.31)</td>
<td>D: OC (2.66)</td>
<td>D: FI (1.92)</td>
<td>D: FI (2.19)</td>
<td>D: SC (1.39)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PD&amp;C</td>
<td>C: TI (4.20)</td>
<td>C: TI (3.53)</td>
<td>C: OC (2.61)</td>
<td>C: TI (3.83)</td>
<td>C: OC (3.05)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D: TI (3.62)</td>
<td>D: OC (3.00)</td>
<td>D: FI (1.94)</td>
<td>D: TI (3.75)</td>
<td>D: OC (2.91)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C: TI (4.50)</td>
<td>D: TI (4.05)</td>
<td>D: TI (3.54)</td>
<td>D: TI (3.88)</td>
<td>D: TI (3.76)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: The eight processes: Customer relationship management (CRM), customer service management (CSM), demand management (DM), order fulfillment process (OFP), manufacturing flow management (MFM), procurement/supply management (SM), product development & commercialization (PD&C), and returns management (RM); The five degrees of integration: strategic collaboration (SC), functional interaction (FI), operational cooperation (OC), transactional-based interaction (TI), and no integration (NI), current degree of integration (C), desirable degree of integration (D); numbers in brackets are means of the integration degrees (n=12 OEMs).
Moreover, it is observed that the levels of integration become weaker as the process moves upstream from the first tier suppliers towards second and third tier suppliers. For example, OEMs have functional interaction in most of their SCM processes (i.e. CSM, OFP, MFM, and SM) with first tier suppliers. However, comparatively weaker levels of integration for the same processes (i.e. operational cooperation or transaction-based interaction) with second and third tier suppliers are observed. Even though OEMs have functional interaction with first tier suppliers in many of their SCM processes, weaker levels of integration in some of the other processes (i.e. CRM, DM, and PD&C) are observed as well. This means the OEMs desired to integrate with lower-tier suppliers to some degree – is an indication of multi-tier SCM process integration differentiation. The results in Table 1 also reveal that OEMs have weaker levels of integration, either at operational level or transaction-based interaction in most of their SCM processes (i.e. CRM, CSM, DM, OFP, MFM, PD&C, RM) with logistics service providers. Surprisingly, SM is the only SCM process where OEMs are managing functional interaction with LSPs.

The desirable (labeled “D”) levels of integration indicate that dealers are the most critical actors requiring strategic collaboration and functional interaction in many processes. The above results suggest that the OEMs recognize the need to integrate certain processes with dealers at different levels of integration. In terms of the strategic priority, CRM, CSM, DM and SM require the highest level of integration (strategic collaboration). Other less prioritized processes such as OFP require functional interaction, while, MFM and PD&C require operational cooperation. Instead, RM only requires a transaction-based interaction. These observations reflect the strategic priorities which focus on processes matter to supplier and customer relations, demand management and customer service with respect to the dealers, indicating the priority in terms of customer-orientation.

The first tier suppliers are the next strategic partners for integration of SCM processes, after the dealers. However, only one process (CRM) is regarded as the process, which deserves strategic collaboration while most of the other processes need functional interaction or operational cooperation with the first tier suppliers (except for RM). The second tier suppliers are not regarded as strategic partners. For second tier suppliers, functional interaction is recommended as the optimal level for CSM, OFP, and MFM, which reflect the importance of the second tier suppliers in manufacturing, services and order management in the automotive industry of Pakistan. Among others, CRM, DM, SM, and PD&C processes are SCM processes where OEMs anticipate maintaining operational cooperation with second tier suppliers. RM remains a transaction-based interaction for dealers, first tier and second tier suppliers. Furthermore, for third tier suppliers and the logistics service providers, the desirable levels of integration for all processes falls to the operational cooperation and transaction-based interaction except for OFP and SM, where functional interaction is suggested with LSPs. It is interesting to see that the OEMs need an equal level of integration with the first tier suppliers and dealers in terms of SM and RM, have put more emphasis on OFP and MFM with the first tier suppliers.

While assessing the differences between the desirable (labeled “D”) and current (labeled “C”) levels of integration, some interesting gaps emerged. In five cases, the gaps between current and desire levels are greater than one level. Results in Table 1 reveal that OEMs want to establish strategic collaboration in CRM, CSM and DM with authorized dealers compared to the current level i.e. functional interaction. Furthermore, OEMs aim to establish operational cooperation with the logistics service providers as compared to transaction-based interaction in MFM. Similarly, higher levels of integration (as opposed to the current levels) are recommended for CRM with first and second tier suppliers, while, functional interaction has been suggested for MFM with second tier suppliers. From a process point of view, CRM, DM, OFP, MFM, and SM are clearly the processes experiencing many gaps between the OEMs and other members of the supply chain. These gaps reflect serious concerns
Multi-tier SCM process integration and competitive priorities

The above analyses broadly highlight the constant pressures to increase the level, scope and span of integration in the supply chains for cost reduction and service improvement. Cost reduction is the priority for all the twelve OEMs, it is mainly driven by the economy and competition. Even though the Pakistani automotive industry has enjoyed remarkable growth in last few years, tighter economic conditions and energy crisis place more pressure on OEMs to integrate with, especially, first-tier suppliers and dealers to reduce cost. The increased cost pressure to integrate is also driven by brutal market competition due to liberal trade policies of the government to import reconditioned vehicles and high interest rates by the government to demoralize banks for car financing and leasing.

Customer service is another strategic priority for some OEMs. Today, it is believed that the survival of firms in the Pakistani automotive sector is subjected to their service offerings. Therefore, the role of dealers has emerged substantially, with them emerging as an important source of interaction between OEMs and their clients. Hence, some OEMs believe that dealers are expected to act as a catalyst to promote the sales and to build long lasting relations with ultimate customers. Instead of working with general dealers, each OEM in the industry has established its own exclusive dealers’ network. The authorized dealers work as franchisees of the firm. Therefore, strategic collaboration is suggested as the desirable level for CSM, CRM and DM with authorized dealers for some OEMs.

The importance of CRM and CSM, particularly, is evident from the OEMs’ strategic collaboration with the authorized dealers, such as 3S (sale, spare-parts and services), 2S (service and spare-parts) and 1S (spare-parts). Additionally, OEMs are providing frequent trainings to technical experts, in anticipation of prompt and superior customer service. As the automotive industry in Pakistan is a demand-driven industry, and authorized dealers act as strategic partners of their firms, they are actively engaged in demand management processes. Today, firms launch their new products (models) in collaboration with their authorized dealers. Dealers aggressively promote the offerings (new & existing products) of their firms and use personal contacts to generate valuable demand for their firms. This also explains why DM is becoming very important. Similarly, OEMs aim to extend the integration efforts to their core (mostly 1st tier but also some 2nd tier) suppliers and strategic (part/modules) suppliers by actively involving them in inventory management, designing of new modules, implementing error-free production, and helping them to reduce operational costs. Additionally, OEMs expect to engage their suppliers even in the process of acquiring, partnering and retaining ultimate customers (e.g. CSM).

While the integration with dealers focuses on CRM, CSM and DM, the integration with suppliers and places more emphasis on CSM, MFM, OFP and SM in general. However, there are slight differences, depending on the dominant operations strategies. Our analyses reveal that Pakistan’s automotive OEMs can be broadly classified into three different patterns of SCM process integration each with distinct set strategic competitive priorities.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Integration typology</th>
<th>X – Low arc of integration, but not with 2nd tier suppliers</th>
<th>Y – High arc of integration, but not with 2nd tier suppliers</th>
<th>Z – High arc of integration, and also with 2nd tier suppliers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Case companies &amp; primary strategic priorities</td>
<td>PQML, SAML (Cost efficiency)</td>
<td>PSM, DYM, A-GTL, H-PML, H-HMPL (Cost efficiency)</td>
<td>IMCL, HACL, AHL (Cost efficiency &amp; customer-orientation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>MTL, GNDL (Cost efficiency &amp; customer-orientation)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Characteristics of case companies | Motor-bikes Pakistani & JV (Chinese) Low & high volume | Cars, pick-up, motor-bikes, etc. JV & technical cooperation Low, medium & high volume | Cars, pick-up, motor-bikes, etc. All JV (Japanese) Medium & high volume |
--- | --- | --- | --- |
Integrated processes with dealers | SM | CRM, DM, CSM, OFP, SM | CRM, DM, CSM, OFP, MFM, SM, PD&C |
Integrated processes with LSPs | Nil | OFP, SM | CSM, OFP, SM |
Integrated processes with 1st tier suppliers | Nil | SRM, DM, CSM, OFP, MFM, SM, PD&C | SRM, DM, CSM, OFP, MFM, SM, PD&C |
Integrated processes with 2nd tier suppliers | Nil | Nil | CSM, OFP, MFM, SM, PD&C |

Note: - Abbreviations used to maintain the privacy of the organizations.

The first group comprises of two firms include PQML and SAML, both with low level, scope and span of integration with the dealers and first tier suppliers, and almost negligible levels of integration with the lower-tier suppliers. They are those firms who aim to offer economical and standard products (vehicles). These firms produce low and high volume motorbikes. They prioritize only cost efficiency because they target low income group(s) with affordable prices. They have basically low levels of process integration with the multi-tier supply chain members (narrow scope and span of integration). Low level of integration is required because these firms are at the initial stages of investment and may have financial limitations to extend levels of integration in all processes. Secondly, high levels of integration in all SCM processes may extend operational cost which resultantly may restrict them to attain their strategic priority i.e. cost efficiency. Both of them have integrated SM process with dealers, while, only PQML is maintaining functional interaction in SM and OFP with LSP’s and 1st tier suppliers respectively.

The second group including firms such as PSM, DYM, DYL, AGTL, HPML, HMPL (focused on cost efficiency), while, MTL and GNDL (focused both cost efficiency and customer-orientation) have high levels of integration with the dealers and first tier suppliers, but little integration with the lower tier suppliers. These firms produce more variety of vehicles e.g., cars, pick-up and motor-bikes. They emphasize quality operations, reduction in fabrication time, error-free production, on-time delivery, flexibility in volume, design and operations, mostly driven by cost reduction, but some are already considering customer orientation. For these OEMs, the numbers of processes and the span of process integration are greater than the first group. Accordingly, they concentrate on SRM, DM, CSM, OFP, MFM, SM and PD&C and prioritize these processes for integration with their first tier suppliers, and for the dealers CRM, DM, CSM, OFP and SM have been prioritized.

The third group of firms (IMCL, HACL and AHL) focused on both cost efficiency and customer-orientation. They have high level and broad scope of process integration, also with the second tier suppliers for some processes (CSM, OFP, MFM, SM and PD&C). They produce all variety of vehicles. They mostly have joint ventures with the certain famous Japanese automakers (i.e. H & T). For these OEMs, the numbers of processes and the span of process integration are greater.

Accordingly, they concentrate on SRM, DM, CSM, OFP, MFM, SM and PD&C and prioritize these processes for integration with their first tier suppliers. They have made joint investments with key suppliers during the last few years, which have helped them to enhance their production flexibility and have allowed them to attain higher indigenization levels. At present, they are successful in attaining functional interaction in many of the processes like CSM, OFP, MFM and SM with first tier suppliers. Joint ventures and technical collaboration between H & J (bumpers, floor mats, etc.), H &
Sustainable Business and Society in Emerging Economies  
Vol. 4, No 2, June 2022

S. Japan (shock absorbers), TE & D. Japan (car air conditioners) are examples of such collaboration in the industry. These measures have extended levels of integration in processes such as PD&C and OFP.

Moreover, the OEMs have introduced e-source applications i.e. SAP, EDI, GLO etc., as e-source platforms to identify, negotiate, contact, select and evaluate suppliers. The measures taken have extended the levels of integration between OEMs and their first tier suppliers, especially in SM. For the dealers CRM, DM, CSM, OFP, MFM, SM, PD&C have been prioritized. More processes are being integrated with the dealers than the first and second group of firms. It is interesting to note that firms those which are focusing on customer orientation (as strategic priority) have greater span of integration (even with 2nd tier suppliers) as compared to firms focusing on cost efficiency only. One of the logical reasoning behind high scope and span of integration across multi-tier supply chain is that these firms are working under the umbrella of Japanese cultures and hence are more inclined towards high quality products with consistency and better services. It is observed that firms like, IMCL, HACL, and AHL are extending integration levels almost in all SCM processes across multi-tiers in order to ensure consistency in quality, reduction in delivery time, promote rapid innovations and error free production.

Interestingly, this third group of firms has chosen to integrate CSM, OFP, MFM, SM and PD&C with the second-tier suppliers. They recognize the need to maintain relationships with supply chain members beyond the first tier suppliers (including 2nd and 3rd tier suppliers). This is due to the fact that auto-part makers (second and third tier suppliers) in Pakistan are still relatively immature and incapable to providing their supplies in an integrated manner. This is reflected in the case studies: some OEMs have a weaker level of integration both with second and third tier suppliers, but other OEMs have extended their integration efforts to the second tier suppliers particularly in the CSM, MFM and OFP processes. These processes are crucial for maintaining the promised service levels and, therefore, at least operational cooperation is required.

Discussion

Our analyses suggest that different firms desire to achieve different level, scope and span of SCM process integration. Their patterns of SCM process integration are closely related to their competitive priorities. Firms focused on cost efficiency only would have a lower level and narrower scope and span of SCM process integration. Firms attempted to prioritize and excel in both cost efficiency and customer orientation put more efforts in improving the levels and expanding the scope and span of SCM process integration. These observations provide the platforms for developing the following propositions:

Proposition 1: Firms that compete on cost efficiency alone tend to have lower level and narrower scope and span of multi-tier SCM process integration.
Proposition 2: Firms which compete on cost efficiency as well as customer service they do so, by implementing higher level and broader scope and span of multi-tier SCM process integration.
Proposition 3: The higher the level and the broader the scope and span of multi-tier SCM process integration the better is firm performance in both cost and customer services.

When expanding the scope and span of integration firms are selective in terms of which SCM processes they focus on. Such firms that are customer-oriented generally maintain a higher level of integration for processes related to customers such as CRM, CSM, DM, OFP and processes related to suppliers such as SM with authorized dealers. In order to achieve cost sufficiency, CSM, OFP, MFM, SM with the dealers and first-tier (and beyond) suppliers are emphasized. There are also some fundamental levels and scopes of integration. Particularly, integration of CRM, CSM and DM processes with dealers is crucial, regardless of the competitive priorities. Integration of CSM, OFP,
MFM and SM are important for first-tier suppliers. Our analyses also extend Mejza and Wisner (2001) study by identifying the span (up to third tier suppliers and dealers) of some SCM process integrations across a supply chain. The analyses suggest that critical processes such as CRM, CSM, DM and SM have been integrated beyond the first-tier suppliers and dealers. This finding, which identifies CRM processes being integrated beyond immediate suppliers or customers, is novel in the literature. As expected, due to lower priorities, it was also found that processes such as PD&C and RM, OEMs are being simply maintained at transaction-based interaction level with the preceding channel actors and second and third-tier LSPs and other suppliers.

Proposition 4: Firms selectively maintain high levels of integration for processes that are highly related to cost and customer service performance with the first-tier suppliers and customers and further beyond the first-tier.

Overall, this study presents the first attempt to systematically develop a theory of multi-tier SCM process integration. The study has several contributions. First, this study adds a new perspective in the literature, especially in terms of the desirable level of integration for each of the eight processes, as well as in a multi-tier supply chain perspective. It contributes to the debates concerning the desirable or “right” levels of integration. It adds new perspectives to the concept of “equilibrium point” as suggested by Frohlich & Westbrook (2001). In their seminal work, by Frohlich & Westbrook (2001) argued that periphery-facing (i.e. internal integration along with integration at least at one tier level, either supplier or customer) is the natural “equilibrium point” in terms of integration. Our analyses suggest that the so-called “equilibrium point” of integration is more the actual level of integration constrained by capability gaps. The integration gaps in CSM, DM and OPF with dealers, CRM and DM with first tier suppliers, CSM, DM and MFM with second tier suppliers we found in this study, are largely explained by the lack of capabilities. A higher level and broader scope and span of integration are desirable, and therefore could be achieved.

Another novel finding worth noting here concerns the influence of the choice of cost and service differentiation strategies on the level and scope of SCM process integration. Furthermore, this is one of the very few studies that systematically demonstrate the strategic integration of SCM processes across a multi-tier supply chain. Previously Chen et al. (2009b) indicate that both cost-orientation and customer-orientation could be related to the scope and span of SCM process integration. Our analyses provide more insights into the processes and their levels and span of integration related to cost and service differentiation strategies. In particular, firms emphasizing cost efficiency are inward-looking, with relatively narrower span and scope of process integration. This corresponds to the theory suggested by Wong et al. (2011) regarding the sensitivity of internal integration to cost-related performance outcomes. Adapting this theory, we can, then, explain why firms with an emphasis on cost. They can more on reducing waste by smoothing the manufacturing flow (MFM) and building up relationships with suppliers (SM) in product development. In contrast SCM processes such as CRM, MFM, OFP and CSM are more related to delivery and flexibility performance and, therefore, firms with service differentiation strategies tend to have higher levels of integration in these processes with longer spans of suppliers and customers. This study further complements the findings of Mejza and Wisner (2001) and Lambert et al. (1998) and provides the basis for some practical implications. Even though greater levels of integration across multi-tier partners in processes such as CSM, CRM, DM, OFP, MFM, SM and PD&C appear to be desirable. There are many reasons why more asymmetric levels of integration across different tiers of the supply chain and different processes are desirable. In this regard. It is evident, that superior supply chain performance is a by-product of chain level associations, then that of dyadic or triadic ones. Which strengthen the argument favoring multi-tier SC integration, as a source of superior SCP planning and its implementation. Specifically, this study reveals that certain processes such as CRM, CSM, DM, and SM are the key processes to be integrated particularly with dealers, and first tier suppliers. In the context of Pakistan’s automotive supply chain,
an emphasis on the integration with the dealers is reflected in the competitive environment of the marketplace. Arguably, the roles of first tier suppliers and dealers in CRM are central in nature. Likewise, in order to achieve effectiveness with CSM process, increased integration is recommended through the entire SC. For better DM, this study highlights the primary significance of formal deals, along with first and second tier suppliers. According to the results some other SCM processes that need strong integration across the entire supply chain include OFP, MFM and SM. Finally, this study also reveals that the process of RM is still at its infancy, in countries such as Pakistan because of their squeezed target markets. The levels of integration with first tier suppliers, especially for CSM, DM, OFP, SM and even MFM, should be elevated to the strategic collaboration level in order to achieve better delivery and other operational performance.

Conclusion
This study is valuable because, so far, few studies have managed to examine multi-tier perspectives of SCM process integration (e.g., Forza, Romano, & Vinelli, 2000; Mejza and Wisner (2001); Hui, 2004). This study provides managerial accounts and theoretical foundation to explain the needs for different levels, scopes and span of SCM process integration and the extent to which the span of integration (tiers) should be extended. It builds a theory for explaining the competitive priorities as the drivers behind the choices of the level, scope and span of SCM process integration. It reveals that emphasizing on cost efficiency and service differentiation will have an influence on the types of processes being integrated across multi-tier supply chains. It reveals that, in practice, there is a notion of desirable levels of integration compared to the current levels of integration of various SCM processes across various supply chain actors and tiers. The study also identifies SCM processes that have to be integrated at adequate levels with the first tiers regardless of competitive strategies.

Limitations and Future Directions
Despite providing some novel findings, this study is not short of limitations. In order to provide a rich understanding of process integration within a multi-tier supply chain, multiple case studies are chosen. However, that also means the results are valid within the case study settings. To extend the validity of our theories and findings, our approach can be replicated in other industries and countries with larger sample sizes. To verify the competitive priority perspective, further work is required to also statistically prove the links between specific performance and the spans and levels of process integration. In addition, our focus on strategic priorities could have ignored other factors having an influence on the level of integration, one such factor is ability to integrate. Other structural and cultural factors could have an influence as well. Therefore, future studies are required to further advance the theory of differentiated SCM process integration, initiated by this paper.

References


Conflicts, Political Distance and Import Volume of Pakistan, a Gravity Model Estimation

*Abdul Muteen,* Assistant Professor, Women University AJ &K, Bagh, Pakistan
*Muhammad Masood Anwar,* Assistant Professor, Women University AJ &K, Bagh, Pakistan
*Ghulam Yahya Khan,* Assistant Professor, University of Azad Jammu & Kashmir, Muzaffarabad, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email address: amateen1986@yahoo.com

**ARTICLE DETAILS**

**ABSTRACT**

**Purpose:** This article, analyze causal relation of conflicts, political distance and Pakistan’s import flows. The severity of interstate military conflicts is higher between Pakistan and India. While the animosity and chauvinism between Pakistan and India increase the intensity of both armed and verbal conflicts. Comparing interstate armed conflicts and interstate military verbal conflicts, the former has more severity than later.

**Methodology:** The Gravity model is used to analyze the relationship between conflicts, political distance and Pakistan’s import volume. The panel data consist on 171 countries and 1980 to 2013 time period.

**Findings:** Conflict between Pakistan and India, the interstate armed conflicts are less impactful than interstate military verbal conflicts on import volume. The other important finding is the changing role of political distance. Political distance significantly reduces Pakistan’s import volume when we regress interstate military conflicts and political distance between Pakistan and its importing partners. Interstate military conflicts between Pakistan and India and political distance between Pakistan and its importing partners show less intensity to reduce Pakistan’s imports.

**Implications:** Pakistan replaced the United States of America with China as major partners that share a significant proportion of its import market due to close political preferences. At the same time, there was no significant trade between Pakistan and India because both countries indulge in military conflicts.

© 2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-4.0
Introduction

International trade is an analytical instrument that plays a sheer role in sustainable growth in all types of economies in general, especially in developing, and underdeveloped economies. The two components of international trade, export, and import, are essential to the economy of a country; export and import act like a mirror for trade partners, e.g., one’s country export is received as the import of other country. Whenever a negative event occurs between two countries, the immediate action is to impose restrictions on imports that may reduce the imports from all trading partners.

This article primarily focuses on interstate military conflicts between Pakistan and India, armed conflicts between Pakistan and India is a prominent problem for many decades and a threat to the world peace due to the existence of nuclear weapons. The problems between the two nations can solve through the foreign policy of each country, but the anger towards the opposite side dominates the foreign policy of both countries. We investigate the sheer role of military conflicts of these longstanding rivals; the political differences intensify these conflicts, which is a reason for reducing/raising the volume of imports of a country. Through this extraordinary case of bilateral interstate military conflicts and political differences, we can contribute to the literature of peace and international trade. The rapidly growing international trade and investment have given hope of peace and stability to the whole world after World War II. The hope of peace and stability based on the assumption of state interdependence, this interdependence revokes the countries to involve in hostilities that distorted bilateral trade. This issue attracts the attention of researchers, and the first serious development has taken place after the empirical research of Polachek (1980). Many empirical studies established that international trade initiate peace and stabilities and reduce the chances of involvement in interstate military conflicts (IMC) (Xiang, Xu, and Keteku 2007; Hegre, Oneal, and Russett 2010). A group of researchers had an alternative view about the decline in hostilities between states, and they argue that peace is induced by capitalism by promoting economic development, investment, and monetary and financial integration (Gartzke 2007; McDonald 2009; Mousseau 2013). While other researchers found that the tendency to engage in interstate military conflicts decreased by trade openness and bilateral trade (Gartzke and Li 2003; Souva and Prins 2006). Moreover, other researchers found that bilateral trade and openness reduce IMC by improving communication between combatants, and they are willing to resolve the issues and save the cost of war (Gartzke and Li 2003).

International trade reduces interstate military conflicts indirectly by the third party by allowing the third party for mediation (Dorussen and Ward 2010; Kinne 2012), and countries lie in the same trading community less likely to involve in MIC (Lupu and Tragg 2013). Katz (2013) investigated the historical conflicts and animosity that reduced the bilateral trade as well as restrict the investor to invest those regions that are specific to such military conflicts. And Davis, Fuchs, and Johnson (2019a) found that bilateral political events that are measured by voting alignment in the United Nations General Assembly (UNGA) and regional adverse events reduce import products from trading partners. Most of the literature focused on the relationship between interstate military conflicts and trade between combatant states. We find out only Katz’s (2013) empirical that explains the effect of animosity of Japan and China on their bilateral trade. Our study contributes to the literature that interstate military conflicts decline to trade in all situations; however, interstate military conflicts between Pakistan and India drove by animosity and chauvinism are highly harmful to imports of Pakistan. While the interstate military conflicts between Pakistan and all trading partners have a lower intensity to harm the import volume of Pakistan. Interstate military material conflict is more harmful than interstate military verbal conflicts in general, but it does not hold in the case of Pakistan and India. Moreover, the political distance between trade partners is a factor of reducing import volume; in our case, the political distance between Pakistan and its trading partners lead to decrease import volume of Pakistan. In addition, appearance of militarized conflict and political distance will
further decrease the import volume of Pakistan. Such situations create instable environment for trade activities, because of risk and instability trade will decline.

Conflicts, Political Relations, and Trade
Interstate military material conflict (IMMC) and interstate military verbal conflicts (IMVC) between states often involve full or partial embargo of trade. When government officials engage in interstate military conflicts, it results in a higher cost of trade of private agents to do business with the belligerent country and increase the risk premiums, violence, destruction, and burden of regulations on logistics. Nationalistic chauvinism distorts household and business activities and decisions.

In literature, a vast majority of empirical papers documented that any bilateral political relationship distortions create adversarial impacts on bilateral trade of all types of trading partners. In contrast, the impact of interstate military conflicts, political distance on import volume investigated by few empirical studies. Davis, Fuchs, & Johnson, 2019, found that adverse events between countries and political distance inversely related to import volume. Moreover, another empirical study found that militarized conflicts and physical distance between countries significantly declined the trade volume (Chang, Polachek, & Robst, 2004). We found one study that empirically investigates the rival or historically conflictual relation between trading partners (Che, Du, Lu, & Tao, 2015), they investigated the impact of Japanese invasion in china on trade relations, they found that historically animosity still influences bilateral trade in the presence of globalization. Interstate military conflicts create unrest and peace instability that lead to reduce business-driven trade between trading partners that are risk-averse in nature. In addition, the uncertainty of war and peace revoke the domestic investors to invest and shrink the proportionate of foreign direct investment (FDI). This situation leads to an overall decline in investment, this will results in a decrease in investment level that furthered results in a reduction of employment level. These three outcomes effect three-component of import volume. First, a decrease in investment leads to a decrease in imported capital goods and intermediate goods that used in industries to produce further goods. Second, through a reduction in employment and purchasing power, which results in a fall in consumption and a decrease in demand for imported products. On the other hand, an increase in political distance of trading partners and importing countries results in the imposition of trade barriers, in shape of importing tariff, quotas, and discouraging trade with a specific country by regulation and imposing limits. Moreover, we add the view of Lupu and Tragg (2013); they argue that countries in the same trading community are less likely to go to war with one another. However, Böhmelt (2010) finds the opposite: trade links to third parties actually reduce the likelihood of mediation. Moreover, any militarized conflict between trading partners significantly distorts the trade with other trading partners, and it affects the trade of both countries involved in a militarized conflict.

In literature, empirical studies explore the relationship of political relations and economic interdependence (Keshk, Reuveny, & Pollins 2010). However, governments today are less likely to use trade as a tool of carrot and stick in foreign policy. Due to globalization, WTO restricts the government from discrimination in trading partners, and the multinational producers create complications in using trade as foreign policy (Carnegie 2014; Davis 2019 ). Interstate military conflicts and political differences can increase international trade other than conflictual trading partners, which provides export destinations and import products substitution for those sectors that have lost their domestic production. For example, see the increase in trade of combatant states with Denmark, Norway, Sweden, and the Netherlands during the First World War(Gowa and Hicks 2015), as well as with the United States. Interstate militarized conflicts jeopardize transportation costs of international trade, especially when the transportation route is close to the war zone. The interstate militarized conflict create the risk of mistakenly hit the cargo transport to the adjacent geography of the combatant state, and intentionally disrupt the transportation of rival country to revoke the supply of goods. For example, during the Tanker War, as part of the Iran–Iraq war in the 1980s, mines or
missiles mistakenly hit some third-party vessels in the Gulf (Cordesman and Wagner 1990). Another recent example of Iran-Arab conflict brought into this situation, four ships were targeted on Sunday near the strategic Emirati port of Fujairah, in what the UAE described as a "sabotage attack." One was flying a United Arab, Emirate (UAE) flag, and another the Norwegian flag. The other two were tankers owned by Saudi Arabia, which described the incident as a threat to the security of global oil supplies. Interstate military conflicts do not affect international trade with other trading partners as trade suffers from the combatant country, the intensity of decline in trade with trading partners than the country with animosity and chauvinism. For example, during the tension between China and Japan over the Diaoyu/Senkaku islands in 2012, Chinese protesters rioted for several weeks damaging Japanese-made cars, vandalizing stores selling Japanese products, and setting a Panasonic factory on fire. Some Chinese state media outlets listed Japanese brands to boycott (Katz 2013).

In addition to these effects, in the presence of interstate military conflicts, in some incident trade increase and some cases lead to decrease inter-borders trade, the reasons behind this is the policy adoption of trading partners in wartime. Interstate military conflict with a joint partner affects differently from an interstate military conflict with a trading partner with animosity and chauvinism. Pakistan and India are well renowned rival countries, and both shape their foreign policy for their interest by viewing the interest of the rival country. We decompose the interstate military conflicts into interstate military material conflicts and interstate military verbal conflicts and try to investigate which interstate military conflicts are more harmful to trade? We believe that interstate military material conflicts have a higher intensity to create risk and instability for business activities and investment and increase transportation costs these factors lead to a decline in international trade. However, interstate military verbal conflicts can create rumors of a military material conflict; in this case, the risk of instability is lower than interstate military conflicts. Except for interstate military conflicts, political relations also play a shear role in shaping trade relations. We summaries this situation into the following hypotheses:

**Hypothesis 1:** When Pakistan involved in interstate military conflict with India it leads to a decrease in the import volume of Pakistan.

**Hypothesis 2:** When deviation in Political distance goes up between Pakistan and its trading partners, Political distance inversely related to the import volume of Pakistan.

**Hypothesis 3:** When interstate military conflict and political distance increase at the same time, it affects the import volume of Pakistan negatively.

**Hypothesis 4:** The intensity of interstate military material conflicts is higher than interstate military verbal conflicts.

States can limit their bilateral trade by taking formal steps such as embargo, boycott, and traffic and increase a wide variety of non-tariff barriers (Kuberski 2013). In addition, some primary steps can impose by the bureaucracy of the state like non-tariff barriers. Such special treatment can take the form of extended time for processing applications for permits or for clearing customs, unusually thorough inspections of traded goods, unusually comprehensive tax auditing, and stricter enforcement of laws in general. Secondary obstruction of trade is also possible by firms, investors, trade unions, and consumers. These reactions can be spontaneous if people share the government’s approach to the conflict, or if firms and households avoid trade with the target state in expectation of government action, even if such action fails to materialize. In doing so, they may be responding to government signals about the (un)desirability of trade with the target state. Sometimes public opinion actually leads policy, and the government is pushed to impose sanctions on a disliked state (Whang 2011).

**Data and Variables**

**Imports**
To estimate the impact of interstate military conflicts and political preferences on import. For this analysis, we use aggregated import data of Pakistan, for the period 1980-2013 comes from Observatory of Economic Complexity (OEC) (Simoes and Hidalgo, 2011). They combine export data from the World Trade Flows (WTF) Dataset (Feenstra et al., 2005) and data from the UN COMTRADE by Hausmann et al. (2011). This platform provides trade data facility on three dimensions country, product, and year; we took data of import of Pakistan on country and year biases, Pakistan, and it is all trade partners for 34 years from 1980 to 2013.

Conflicts:

In this paper, we use bilateral Military Interstate Conflicts data, and we use the Global Data on Events, Location and Tone data from Leetaru and Schrodt (2013). This dataset considered very comprehensively in events datasets, the dataset provides different types of conflicts and cooperation based on events reported in eleven global news outlets. It explains dyadic events between two states. We used the GDELT 1.0 Events data, which consisted on a larger dataset from January 1, 1979, to February 17, 2014, and we used this data for conflicts from January 1, 1980, to December 31, 2013. We measure conflicts as the intensity of conflicts measured by Goldstein Scale that varies from 10 to -10.

Political Distance

The relations and indexes are difficult to measure between countries. The political distance could be measured bilateral political differences through voting of countries in United Nation General Assembly. The political distance measured the difference between the ideal points of two countries on each resolution in UNGA, which are calculated by Bailey(2017) This is the major innovation of ideal point distances compared to real affinity or S scores (e.g., Gartzke 1998; Signorino and Ritter 1999). As Bailey (2017) emphasize, these similarity indices “weight all votes identically and will ebb and flow as these votes influenced by idiosyncratic factors come and go from the agenda.”

Methodology

In this section of the paper, we focus on empirical analysis to estimate the relationship of interstate military conflicts and imports; we also testify the impact of political distance on imports. To conduct the empirical analysis to test the hypothesis, our research study based on “gravity model” tons of trade literature of empirics based on this (e.g., Tinbergen 1962; Anderson and van Win coop 2003). Import volume expected to decrease with both horizons on the border, interstate conflicts, and foreign policy front between countries. It may increase trade cost or a reason for imposing restrictions to lower the imports, and both are a way forward to restrict imports from partner countries, less trade cost will encourage exporter and importers to trade more. Geographical distance is a proxy measure for iceberg trade cost aimed to negatively impact on international trade. In addition, some supplementary variables of least common culture and historical backgrounds that may helpful in cross border trade, like common official language, common ethnic language, and common colonial background. This piece of research intend to explore a different way to look into the relationship of import volume at the aggregate level and trade partners, interstate conflicts, and political distance among trade partners.

For empirical analysis, we use bilateral data for import, interstate military conflict, and political distance. The empirical method based on gravity model to estimate the coefficient of variable of interest we specify regression equations as follows:

\[
\log(\text{import}_{ijt}) = \beta_1 + \beta_2 \log(\text{conflict}_{ijt}) + \beta_3 \log(\text{GDP}_{ijt}) + \beta_4 \log(\text{distance}_{ijt}) + \beta_5 X_{it} + \alpha_j + \delta_i + \epsilon_{ijt} \quad \cdots \quad (1)
\]

\[
\log(\text{import}_{ij}) = \beta_1 + \beta_2 \log(\text{conflict}_{ij}) \times \log(\text{p.distance}_{ij}) + \beta_3 \log(\text{conflict}_{ij}) + \beta_4 \log(\text{poldis}_{ij}) + \beta_5 \log(\text{GDP}_{ij}) + \beta_6 \log(\text{distance}_{ij}) + \beta_7 X_{it} + \alpha_j + \delta_i + \epsilon_{ij} \quad \cdots \quad (2)
\]
Where log (import) represent import (logged) flows at aggregate level, the subscript \( i \) represents Pakistan and \( j \) represents the trading partner. Conflict expresses our four specifications of interstate military conflicts (between Pakistan and India, Pakistan and trading partners) in logged form. The term “P. Distance” described the political distance between exporter and importer. GDP represents the log of importer and exporter GDP. Moreover, distance measures the distance between capital of exporter and importer country also used in the logged form, \( X \) represents the vector of control variables, \( \gamma \) represents a set of partner-country fixed effects, \( \delta \) represents a set of year-fixed effects, and \( \epsilon \) expresses the error term.

**Results**

First, we represented the results based on the conflictual relationship between Pakistan and India. Moreover, we estimate the result based on interstate military conflicts between Pakistan and India and political distance between its importing partners. However, keep in mind that the interstate military conflicts are the critical variable that gives us the base to divide our analysis into two strands as interstate military armed conflicts and interstate military verbal conflicts between Pakistan and India.

Table 1 reports the results estimated with the Ordinary Least Square (OLS), which based on gravity-specifications estimation for model one, which estimate the relationship of interstate military conflicts and import volume of Pakistan. We estimate the impact of military material and verbal conflicts on import volume with time fixed effects and country fixed effects. We subsequently add country-pair fixed effects where all time-invariant repressors are absorbed in these fixed effects and standard errors adjusted for clustering on country pairs.

The negative sign (-) of interstate military conflicts estimator explain the inverse relationship of conflicts and imports. These results are similar to previous studies, e.g., (Martin, Mayer, & Thoenig, 2008) ensured a negative relationship between interstate military conflicts and imports. A 10% increase in interstate military armed conflicts reduce the import volume of Pakistan by approximately 6.8% per year.

**Table 1: Import Volume of Pakistan (1980-2013): Gravity Model Specification of Model I with OLS Estimation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>VARIABLES</th>
<th>(1)</th>
<th>(2)</th>
<th>(3)</th>
<th>(4)</th>
<th>(5)</th>
<th>(6)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Armed-Conflict</td>
<td>-0.517***</td>
<td>-0.458***</td>
<td>-0.676***</td>
<td>(0.0614)</td>
<td>(0.0609)</td>
<td>(0.167)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-2.467**</td>
<td>-2.452**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Verbal-Conflict</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP-Exporter</td>
<td>0.872***</td>
<td>0.872***</td>
<td>0.839***</td>
<td>0.839***</td>
<td>0.838***</td>
<td>0.836***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.0536)</td>
<td>(0.0538)</td>
<td>(0.0662)</td>
<td>(0.0662)</td>
<td>(0.0654)</td>
<td>(0.0655)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP-Importer</td>
<td>5.727***</td>
<td>8.343***</td>
<td>5.543***</td>
<td>8.360***</td>
<td>1.568***</td>
<td>1.588***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.417)</td>
<td>(2.333)</td>
<td>(0.426)</td>
<td>(2.337)</td>
<td>(0.278)</td>
<td>(0.297)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distance</td>
<td>-1.253***</td>
<td>-1.256***</td>
<td>-3.812***</td>
<td>-3.833***</td>
<td>-1.902***</td>
<td>-1.934***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.460)</td>
<td>(0.461)</td>
<td>(0.229)</td>
<td>(0.230)</td>
<td>(0.475)</td>
<td>(0.497)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adjacency</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3.884***</td>
<td>4.034***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(0.557)</td>
<td>(0.591)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Com-Language</td>
<td>0.623</td>
<td>0.623</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.508)</td>
<td>(0.510)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Com-Colony</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-2.716***</td>
<td>-2.702***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(0.432)</td>
<td>(0.426)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RTA</td>
<td>-0.250</td>
<td>-0.250</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.539)</td>
<td>(0.539)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTA</td>
<td>-2.049***</td>
<td>-1.981***</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.688)</td>
<td>(0.685)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trade-Policy</td>
<td>3.840***</td>
<td>13.14***</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.999)</td>
<td>(4.550)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Interstate military verbal conflicts also have significant negative impacts on the import volume of Pakistan; a 10% increase in interstate military verbal conflicts will lead to a decrease of 29% of the import volume of Pakistan. Moreover, it seems that the conflict between Pakistan and India has sheer importance globally due to their animosity behavior.

Results reported in Table 2 based on model II of our study through OLS estimation. The second model of our study consist on interstate military conflicts, political distance, and import volume. Every country has its standard lines of foreign policy. Our regression result is in line with the literature, the difference in political preference are negatively affected import volume, and the similarities in political preference could be enhanced trade between nations. Previous studies explored the negative relationship of political distance between countries and bilateral imports, as (Davis et al., 2019a) estimated that state-owned enterprises are most responsive to control of imports in case of political differences. He explored the politicization of trade by using data of UNGA voting dyadic data for China and India from 1990 to 2012, and he found that the voting difference and trade are negatively related. Political distance has a substantial impact on import volume than interstate military conflicts between Pakistan and India relatively.

Table 1: Import Volume of Pakistan (1980-2012): Gravity Model Specification of Model II with OLS Estimation
The results show that a 10% increase in Political deviation has reduced 3.2% of import volume of Pakistan; while a 10%, increase in interstate military conflicts caused around 6% decrease in import volume. The cross term has significant negative impact on import volume of Pakistan. A 10% increase in armed conflicts, and political distance at the same time will affect import volume of Pakistan further around 1.4%. The cross term of political distance, interstate military verbal conflicts have, a 10% increase in verbal conflicts and political distance will lead to further decrease in import volume of Pakistan around 2.8%. The appearance of verbal conflict and political difference at the same time is harmful for trade as it causes import volume negatively in our case. The interstate military verbal conflicts are more harmful than the interstate military armed conflicts. Political distance almost have the same impacts for both types of interstate military conflicts, however the cross terms have different impacts on import volume of Pakistan. Armed conflicts and political distance combined have less impact than cross term of verbal conflicts and political distance on import volume.

**Robustness Test**

In this section, we analyze the robustness of our finding of the previous section, and here we check the robustness of our finding through two methods: first, the estimation of regression through the Pseudo Poisson Maximum Likelihood (PPML) method. In the second method, we change the measure of import volume into positive and zero import with trading partners and interstate military material and interstate military verbal conflicts to a binary variable. Then we estimate the regression through a logistic model. This table explains that a 10% increase interstate military armed conflict

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Coefficient 1</th>
<th>Coefficient 2</th>
<th>Coefficient 3</th>
<th>Coefficient 4</th>
<th>Coefficient 5</th>
<th>Coefficient 6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Adjacency</td>
<td>-1.845*</td>
<td>-1.564</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(1.084)</td>
<td>(1.125)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Com-Language</td>
<td>-3.522***</td>
<td>-3.477***</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.643)</td>
<td>(0.634)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Com-Colony</td>
<td>-3.501***</td>
<td>-3.416***</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.540)</td>
<td>(0.525)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RTA</td>
<td>-0.168</td>
<td>-0.202</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.626)</td>
<td>(0.627)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTA</td>
<td>-2.164***</td>
<td>-2.272***</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.698)</td>
<td>(0.689)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trade-Policy</td>
<td>2.662**</td>
<td>10.75**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(1.166)</td>
<td>(4.524)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PD2</td>
<td>0.106</td>
<td>0.113</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.0879)</td>
<td>(0.0883)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cooperation</td>
<td>0.857***</td>
<td>-0.0514</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.226)</td>
<td>(0.308)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POCC</td>
<td>-0.105</td>
<td>0.147</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.398)</td>
<td>(0.778)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IOCC</td>
<td>-1.157</td>
<td>-0.822</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.748)</td>
<td>(0.802)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constant</td>
<td>-60.10***</td>
<td>-84.79***</td>
<td>-32.66***</td>
<td>-58.80**</td>
<td>-22.55***</td>
<td>-35.22***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(6.48)</td>
<td>(27.24)</td>
<td>(6.25)</td>
<td>(27.45)</td>
<td>(7.12)</td>
<td>(8.57)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year-Fixed Effects</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country-Fixed Effects</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R-Square</td>
<td>0.4378</td>
<td>0.4377</td>
<td>0.6852</td>
<td>0.6857</td>
<td>0.6867</td>
<td>0.6873</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Country</td>
<td>171</td>
<td>171</td>
<td>171</td>
<td>171</td>
<td>171</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Robust standard errors in parentheses and significance level are as follow:
*Significant at 10 percent.
**Significant at 5 percent.
***Significant at 1 percent.

The results show that a 10% increase in Political deviation has reduced 3.2% of import volume of Pakistan; while a 10%, increase in interstate military conflicts caused around 6% decrease in import volume. The cross term has significant negative impact on import volume of Pakistan. A 10% increase in armed conflicts, and political distance at the same time will affect import volume of Pakistan further around 1.4%. The cross term of political distance, interstate military verbal conflicts have, a 10% increase in verbal conflicts and political distance will lead to further decrease in import volume of Pakistan around 2.8%. The appearance of verbal conflict and political difference at the same time is harmful for trade as it causes import volume negatively in our case. The interstate military verbal conflicts are more harmful than the interstate military armed conflicts. Political distance almost have the same impacts for both types of interstate military conflicts, however the cross terms have different impacts on import volume of Pakistan. Armed conflicts and political distance combined have less impact than cross term of verbal conflicts and political distance on import volume.
lead to 0.50% decrease in imports volume. In column 4, results show a 10% addition in verbal conflicts result into a decline 0.68% in import volume.

**Table 3: Import Volume of Pakistan (1980-2013): Gravity Model Specification of Model I with PPML Estimation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>VARIABLES</th>
<th>(1) Imports</th>
<th>(2) Imports</th>
<th>(3) Imports</th>
<th>(4) Imports</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Armed-Conflicts</td>
<td>-0.0216***</td>
<td>-0.0665**</td>
<td>-0.0507**</td>
<td>-0.0675**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.00356)</td>
<td>(0.0310)</td>
<td>(0.0221)</td>
<td>(0.0334)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Verbal-conflicts</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP-Exporter</td>
<td>0.231***</td>
<td>0.235***</td>
<td>0.237***</td>
<td>0.134***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.01139)</td>
<td>(0.0121)</td>
<td>(0.0124)</td>
<td>(0.00428)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP-Importer</td>
<td>0.296***</td>
<td>0.283**</td>
<td>0.261***</td>
<td>0.269**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.0223)</td>
<td>(0.128)</td>
<td>(0.0624)</td>
<td>(0.114)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distance</td>
<td>-0.887***</td>
<td>-0.896***</td>
<td>-2.10***</td>
<td>-0.144***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.0728)</td>
<td>(0.0606)</td>
<td>(0.109)</td>
<td>(0.0130)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adjacency</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Com-Language</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Com-Colony</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTA</td>
<td>-0.251***</td>
<td>-0.212***</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.0389)</td>
<td>(0.0530)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WTO</td>
<td>-0.0166</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.0381)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cooperation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POCC</td>
<td>-0.0916***</td>
<td>-0.0186</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.0234)</td>
<td>(0.0662)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IOCC</td>
<td>-0.103**</td>
<td>-0.0291</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.0514)</td>
<td>(0.0644)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constant</td>
<td>4.017***</td>
<td>4.390***</td>
<td>-5.4***</td>
<td>-1.129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.657)</td>
<td>(1.614)</td>
<td>(1.57)</td>
<td>(1.385)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year-Fixed Effects</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country-Fixed Effects</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pseudo R2</td>
<td>0.3438</td>
<td>0.3853</td>
<td>0.3867</td>
<td>0.3796</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observations</td>
<td>5,814</td>
<td>5,814</td>
<td>5,814</td>
<td>5,814</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Robust standard errors in parentheses and significance level are as follow:
*Significant at 10 percent.
**Significant at 5 percent.
***Significant at 1 percent.

In table 4, we present the estimated result of the second model of our study. Column 3 report that a 10% increase in armed conflicts result in a decline around 2.34% in import volume.

**Table 4: Import Volume of Pakistan (1980-2013): Gravity Model Specification of Model II with PPML Estimation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>VARIABLES</th>
<th>(1) Imports</th>
<th>(2) Imports</th>
<th>(3) Imports</th>
<th>(4) Imports</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Armed-Conflicts</td>
<td>-0.0346*</td>
<td>-0.0518**</td>
<td>-0.234***</td>
<td>-0.0718**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.0189)</td>
<td>(0.0216)</td>
<td>(0.0216)</td>
<td>(0.0216)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Verbal-Conflicts</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political Distance</td>
<td>-0.0218***</td>
<td>-0.0194**</td>
<td>-0.0186**</td>
<td>-0.0221***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.00808)</td>
<td>(0.00813)</td>
<td>(0.00835)</td>
<td>(0.00819)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Armed-Conflicts*PD</td>
<td>-0.00445**</td>
<td>-0.00344*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.00186)</td>
<td>(0.00204)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Political distance has an estimator have a negative sign, which mean that a 10% addition in political distance will lead to reduce 0.19% of import volume of Pakistan. The cross term of armed conflicts and political distance further add 0.0344% inverse impact. In column 4, report that a 10% increase in verbal conflicts reduce the import volume of Pakistan by around 0.72%, and a 10% increase in political distance between Pakistan and its importing partners decrease import volume of Pakistan by 0.22%. In addition, cross term of verbal conflicts and political distance further reduce import volume of Pakistan by around 0.093%. An increase in political distance and verbal conflict will increase the probability of occurrence of interstate-armed conflict, which restrict the import volume.

### Results of Logistic Model

The second method, which we adopt to testify our empirical findings, is the logistic regression model. The reason behind the adoption of this method of estimation is the fluctuation in importing partners of Pakistan. This method gives an alternative picture of the relationship of interstate military conflicts, political distance, and import volume of Pakistan. The core thing is that this method of estimation is testify our main finding that military conflicts have negative impact on import volume.

**Table 5: Import volume of Pakistan (1980-2013): The Logistic Regression Estimation of Model I**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>VARIABLES</th>
<th>(1)</th>
<th>(3)</th>
<th>(5)</th>
<th>(7)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Armed-Conflicts</td>
<td>-0.678*** (0.0969)</td>
<td>-0.767*** (0.109)</td>
<td>-0.767*** (0.109)</td>
<td>-0.767*** (0.109)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Verbal-conflicts</td>
<td>-0.0765*** (0.012)</td>
<td>-0.115*** (0.012)</td>
<td>-0.115*** (0.012)</td>
<td>-0.115*** (0.012)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 6: Import Volume of Pakistan (1980-2013): The Logistic Regression Estimation of Model II

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>VARIABLES</th>
<th>(1) Imports</th>
<th>(2) Imports</th>
<th>(3) Imports</th>
<th>(4) Imports</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Armed-Conflicts</td>
<td>-0.426***</td>
<td>-0.527***</td>
<td>-0.527***</td>
<td>-0.283**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.119)</td>
<td>(0.131)</td>
<td>(0.142)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Verbal-Conflicts</td>
<td>-0.271*</td>
<td>-0.222***</td>
<td>-0.288***</td>
<td>-0.234***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.140)</td>
<td>(0.0491)</td>
<td>(0.0539)</td>
<td>(0.0497)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political Distance</td>
<td>-0.282***</td>
<td>-0.222***</td>
<td>-0.288***</td>
<td>-0.234***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.0533)</td>
<td>(0.0491)</td>
<td>(0.0539)</td>
<td>(0.0497)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Armed-Conflicts*PD</td>
<td>-0.258***</td>
<td>-0.239***</td>
<td>-0.239***</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.0671)</td>
<td></td>
<td>(0.0683)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Verbal-Conflicts*PD</td>
<td>-0.203***</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-0.170**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.0743)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(0.0760)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP-Exporter</td>
<td>0.364***</td>
<td>0.361***</td>
<td>0.390***</td>
<td>0.389***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.0345)</td>
<td>(0.0340)</td>
<td>(0.0352)</td>
<td>(0.0354)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP-Importer</td>
<td>2.174***</td>
<td>1.670***</td>
<td>2.295***</td>
<td>2.058***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.125)</td>
<td>(0.124)</td>
<td>(0.155)</td>
<td>(0.159)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distance</td>
<td>-0.0988</td>
<td>-0.0978</td>
<td>0.0419</td>
<td>0.0407</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.196)</td>
<td>(0.193)</td>
<td>(0.217)</td>
<td>(0.216)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adjacency</td>
<td>1.304</td>
<td>1.872*</td>
<td>1.872*</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(1.091)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Com-Language</td>
<td>0.570</td>
<td>0.582</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(0.381)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Com-Colony</td>
<td>-0.237</td>
<td>-0.244</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(0.365)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Robust standard errors in parentheses and significance level are as follow:

*Significant at 10 percent.
**Significant at 5 percent.
***Significant at 1 percent.

Table 6 represent the results of the second model, in column 3, the coefficient is around -0.527, which authenticate the inverse relationship with import volume of Pakistan. The coefficient of political distance is around -0.288, political distance and import volume are negatively related. The cross is around -0.239, which shows presence of armed and political conflicts are more harmful for imports.
The results supported the hypotheses of inverse relation between verbal conflicts and import volume. Political distance has negative impacts on import volume. The cross term of verbal and political conflicts has further negative impacts on import volume of Pakistan.

**Conclusion**

Anecdotal view about the relationship between international trade and militarized conflicts are; trade reduce interstate violence and closely work to decrease interstate violence through foreign policy tools. However, findings of this study provide evidence that interstate military conflicts decline international trade according to the severity of conflicts, and the voting pattern of trading partners plays a role in determining the trade relation and trade volume. Our study contributes to the literature by investigating the behaver of trading partners, rival and sane behavior towards the trading partner, and analyzing the effects of interstate military conflict. The findings support our hypothesis that interstate military conflict with a rival nation is more harmful to international trade activities. Second, the interstate military material conflicts reduce trade activities more than interstate military verbal conflicts. We inspect that interstate military material and interstate military verbal conflicts between Pakistan and India, and the political distance negatively related to import volume of Pakistan. Interstate military armed conflict show magnitude around 0.67 and the estimator of interstate military verbal conflicts is around 2.9. Furthermore, in logit regression model same result come out for interstate military material conflicts, and interstate military verbal conflicts, the magnitude are around 0.76 and 0.115 respectively. OLS result estimates estimator as political distance accelerates the impact of conflicts in both cases; it is either an interstate military material conflict or interstate military verbal conflict. These findings explain the importance of the behavior of trading partners.

**Reference**


Proactive Personality as Mediating variable between Career Skills, Servant Leadership and Subjective Career Success of Working Women: A Study from Private Sector Universities of Pakistan

Iqra Mobeen, MPhil Scholar, College of Commerce, Government College University Faisalabad, Pakistan
Ali Shahzaib, MPhil Scholar, College of Commerce, Government College University Faisalabad, Pakistan
Kashan Shahzad, BS (Commerce) Scholar, College of Commerce, Government College University Faisalabad, Pakistan
*Quaisar Ijaz Khan, Assistant Professor, College of Commerce, Government College University Faisalabad, Pakistan

* Corresponding author’s email address: qasir363@gmail.com

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

Purpose: To examine the effect of career skills and servant-leadership on intrinsic career success with surrogating effect of proactive personality traits.

Design/method/approach: Structural equation modeling has been applied to extract the statistical finding by applying MPlus Software.

Findings: Proactive personality traits mediates between the relationship of career skills, servant-leadership, and intrinsic career success.

Research implications: The model have a look at providing the suggestion for policy makers to hire and train highly educated faculty to participate in servant-leadership for the betterment of career skills and intrinsic career success, which improves institutional performance.

Originality: The research study examined the P-E fit theory and the model in this particular context of Pakistan is unique and constructed to suggest policy makers the techniques for advancing the career success of working women in academia.

© 2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0


Introduction

Recently in few decades the servant-leadership is getting attraction of researchers and Worker’s commitment is considered as an incredibly vital nature of representatives inside the institutional
environment. It relates to representative prosperity as well as character, organization, and hierarchical execution (Rehan, Mumtaz, & Khan, 2021). Besides, it's far related with the development of the career of the consultant as its miles connected with extended employability. Putting resources into work commitment is, subsequently, in mild of a valid issue for the cutting-edge and future association and representative. Pioneers often count on a important component in both the increment and reduce of work commitment in their devotees eventually, offered every other hypothetical status quo and measure for drawing in authority, mounted within the fundamental necessities of self-Determination idea (SDT). Drawing in authority changed into to make certain emphatically connected with work commitment, via the increment of adherents' work assets. Pioneers, anyways, accomplish greater than allot and inspire work belongings, they affect exclusive organization approaches too. These institution strategies have, for this reason, an effect in the prosperity at institution degree, as occupation belongings impact the satisfaction of important requirements at man or woman degree (Hubaut, Guichard, Greenfield, & Blandeau, 2022). Yet, how do those social belongings that the organization stocks, both pioneer and group methods, influence individual prosperity? Moreover, how a lot do pioneers affect these institution strategies?

This paper explores, the relationship among variables of the construct such as initiated and work commitment through essential requirements fulfillment and provides some other social asset of open clash requirements. To start with, work commitment and fundamental requirements achievement, as its proposed basic aspect, are offered. Then, the impact of pioneers on essential necessities success is examined, to at long final gift open war requirements as a social asset, to influence paintings dedication through a comparable tool (Mumtaz, Khan, & Rehan, 2021).

Review of Literature
In the current era, the interest in prosperity inside the operating environment has multiplied. The scholarly international and associations don't simply glance at execution but moreover whether representatives experience suitable working. This has brought about studies on commercial enterprise associated bad states as burnout and workaholism, yet similarly proper states as paintings commitment, according to the development towards a extra properly method in brain science. The final concept, work commitment, is full-size for institutions as representatives who are locked in help their prosperity, in addition to their presentation (Côté, Lauzier, & Stinglhamber, 2021; Rabiul & Yean, 2021). Work dedication is, for example, linked with effects as career execution, commercial enterprise execution, turnover expectation), hierarchical obligation, greater-job execution, patron reliability, but additionally consultant wellbeing Besides, drew in representatives assist their dedication via making their paintings and man or woman property and move their commitment to other humans. Putting assets into connected workers is, for this reason, an crucial desire that makes a at the same time beneficial situation for the individual and the affiliation (Ahad, Mustafa, Mohamad, Abdullah, & Nordin, 2021; Muisyo, Qin, Ho, & Julius, 2021).

Work commitment, some of the time alluded to as representative commitment or simply commitment, is characterized as a positive and fulfilling business associated attitude this is portrayed by means of life, devotion, and retention. Force is depicted as "increased degrees of power and intellectual versatility at the same time as working, the passion to place exertion in a single's work, and perseverance even notwithstanding hardships"; devotion is described by means of "sensations of a sense of significance, exhilaration, motivation, delight, and task", and assimilation is portrayed by "being completely idea and profoundly charmed in a single's paintings, via which time elapses unexpectedly and one experiences troubles with confining oneself” As a system to concentrate on paintings dedication, its predecessors and outcomes, the work requests property model (JD-R version) is habitually applied .The JD-R version shows that work traits can be characterized in one in every of two classifications: paintings requests, which are bodily, mental, social or hierarchical elements of the gig that require supported physical or doubtlessly mental exertion and are thusly linked with certain physiological in addition to intellectual prices; paintings assets, which can be bodily, intellectual,
social or authoritative parts of the gig that are beneficial in carrying out paintings targets, reduce work requests and the associated physiological and intellectual costs in addition to animate self-cognizance and improvement (Alsughayir, 2021; Chunyu & Liping, 2021). These paintings requests and assets incite two cycles. Initial, a well-being disability procedure, in which occupation requests foresee burnout, which is linked with terrible displaying and coffee worker health.

The next cycle, an inspirational interaction, hypothesizes that work belongings are emphatically related with execution and representative wellness via work dedication. Moreover, paintings property has a bad courting with burnout. Albeit the JD-R version has validated its helpfulness, it stays a clear model that determines relations between factors without giving a basic rationalization of why this dating could be so. One of the conceivable informative speculations is SDT, which proposes, in addition to other matters, a group of essential mental requirements which are characterized as "nutriments that ought to be secured via a living detail to preserve up with its improvement, honesty and well-being". The fulfillment of these requirements is essential for human beings to complete their proper ability, to thrive, feel linked with and to be safeguarded from weak spot and maladaptive running (Li et al., 2021; Utami, Sapta, Verawati, & Astakoni, 2021; Yudianto, Mulyani, Fahmi, & Winarningsih, 2021).

Three fundamental mental necessities are proposed: the requirement for independence (for example feeling the ability to act with a feeling of selection and volition), belongingness (for instance feeling loved and definitely focused on) and capability (for instance feeling effective). For positive, vital requirements had been observed to intercede the relationship among paintings assets and work commitment and, consequently, offer an predicted clarification for the persuasive interaction, as introduced approximately by the JDR model. The idea of necessities is not new in mind research and notion hypothesis. Need speculations are galore, going from conventional hypotheses as Maslow's necessities ordered development and McClelland's work on desires for accomplishment, connection and electricity, to later work on the requirement for reputation and SDT (Aina, Bratti, & Lippo, 2021; Gibari, Perez-Esparrells, Gomez, & Ruiz, 2021). As SDT is a common hypothesis that has shown its helpfulness in several existence spaces, for example, sports activities, schooling and paintings, there may be all of the more necessities, huge for the sphere of labor and hierarchical brain research regarding paintings commitment, than the 3 proposed needs inside SDT (as an instance independence, belongingness and relatedness). Accordingly, in mild of the work proposed an extra want, the requirement for significance.

This need alludes to seeing one's work as in particular large and big. Research proposes that representatives in positions with extra paintings belongings (for instance capability assortment and mission individual) experience extra significance, which, thusly, provides to their idea, execution, and fulfillment. Moreover, great work turned into considered as fundamental to a first rate (Crawford et al., 2020; Davis et al., 2020; Rashid et al., 2020). It can, consequently, be contended that seriousness acts an awful lot the identical manner as want would rise up of SDT. Although the relationship among work assets and important necessities has been concentrated previously, the emphasis changed into broadly speaking on belongings related with the substance of the paintings (project independence, know-how usage and enterprise associated enter, formative open doorways. Be that as it may, specific assets, as pleasant property, are massive too Engaging leadership (Besharati, Daneshmandi, Zareh, Fakherpour, & Zoaktafi, 2020).

One of the maximum compelling social assets inside the operating surroundings is the manner of behaving of the pioneer. In spite of the truth that management is one of the most concentrated on points in association sciences, its courting with paintings commitment isn't always extensively taken into consideration (Moretti et al., 2020; Sungu, Weng, Hu, Kitule, & Fang, 2020). discovered sixteen investigations resolving this inquiry, extra contemporary papers truely retain to cope with the
importance of this connection. Groundbreaking administration turned into located to increment paintings dedication, to a few degree interceded by using idealism, obligation, weightiness, and inventive manner of behaving. Other initiative patterns as legitimate, magnetic, and moral authority likewise had a high-quality courting with paintings commitment, interceded via task rationalization, hierarchical way of life and strengthening and boss help is for the maximum component determined to be related with extended stages of dedication (Alani, Khan, & Manuel, 2018; Geyer, Alexis, Putz, Jenni & Misra, 2017).

At first, administration changed into consolidated as a easy work asset inside the JD-R version. The effect of a pioneer, however, goes past that as pioneers have to distribute and alter both paintings requests and profession assets. Initiative is, definitely, emphatically related with distinct paintings traits as assortment, character, importance, independence and grievance, which, therefore, lead to work commitment as indicated with the aid of the JD-R version. To address the requirement for a extra great and nuanced spot of initiative within the JD-R model, the concept of drawing in management became provided. It expresses that pioneers inspire their representatives' levels of work commitment via zeroing in on satisfying their fundamental requirements. Through pleasing supporters' necessities, which had been gotten from SDT (as an instance independence, relatedness and capability) and crafted by Baumeister and Frankl; as an instance significance), drawing in pioneers enhance the tiers of dedication of their devotees (Muhammad, McElwee, & Dana, 2017; Zafar & Farooq, 2017).

All the more explicitly, fascinating pioneers persuade their supporters by expanding importance via transferring (as an instance enthusing them for targets and plans, reason them to experience that they upload to a sizable mission), expanding their talents through reinforcing (for example assigning undertakings, empowering to utilize their property), increasing relatedness via associating (for example empowering joint effort, advancing a excessive unity) finally expanding independence thru permitting (as an example conceding possibility and obligation, empowering to voice one's very own standpoint). Past exploration on different tremendous administration styles, as groundbreaking, genuine authority and Pioneer Part Trade (LMX), upholds the notion that fundamental requirements intrude the relationship amongst initiative and results additionally being and execution. Hetland located that groundbreaking initiative decidedly affected vital requirements fulfillment, even as dynamic management by means of unique case made a poor difference (Rahman, 2016; Sultana, Yousaf, Khan, & Saeed, 2016). Groundbreaking initiative likewise impacted work commitment via intervention of fundamental requirements success. A new meta-investigation on essential requirements confirmed that positive initiative approaches of behaving as a pioneer's independence and relatedness backing and pioneer element exchange are emphatically linked with nuts and bolts need fulfillment. For the requirement for significance, pioneers can saturate paintings with significance by way of motivating representatives to upward push above their very own requirements or targets.

This is found in groundbreaking authority, yet in addition characterised in valid pioneers. In light of this beyond examination and the conceptualization of drawing in authority in SDT, it is every day that vital necessities fulfillment intercedes the relationship between drawing in administration and paintings dedication. While initiative is vast, different social property likewise anticipate a important element for representatives. This is in particular valid for belongings at relational or institution degree, as maximum work in institutions is finished via cooperation. Groups assume an important part in each prosperity and performance, by using which some relational cycles are sizeable. One of those cycles is with no end in sight peace advertising (Kaabachi & Obeid, 2016; Ng, Gossett, Chinyoka, & Obasi, 2016). Where clashes have generally a massive, commonly regrettable, have an effect on in businesses and those, when valuable refereeing is capability, clashes aren't downright horrendous. Pioneers are, from their scenario, expected to take part in a few sort of peace promoting
referred to as outsider manner of behaving, to affect the prosperity of representatives. However, colleagues are not uninvolved and could likewise participate in conduct to control clashes in the group. Laying out open conflict requirements or liberal conversation is one of the ways of overseeing warfare in companies. It urges individuals to talk their questions, feelings and vulnerabilities, and its miles the standard of the group on how bunch people see and handle battle.

This advances, for instance, learning, as colleagues question their mind and look to parent out numerous viewpoints. This fantastic view on conflict advances receptiveness, collaboration and vital thinking and gives us another factor of view to offer peacemaking in the institution as some other social asset. The concept of open battle requirements and precious clash problems the traditional and well-known notion, which is likewise tested in different exploration that pioneers need to pursue selections without help from everyone else and in a while implement some type of consistence. All matters being identical, powerful pioneers consist of colleagues in liberal conversations and worth mind. It was contended that pioneers can have a getting through have an impact on by means of organizing more communique about with no end in sight peace promoting as a result foster the connections and essential abilities to clearly take advantage of it (Prouska, Psychogios, & Rexhepi, 2016). Past examinations observed that management changed into related with compromise viability of the group and that pioneers can urge colleagues to valuably address their competition. In SDT writing, it’s far pondered that pioneers support essential necessities to the diploma that they apprehend the representatives' standpoint in conversations, provide decision the way to establish tips and forgo constraining methods of behaving and language.

This strains up with advancing receptive conversations and standards as people must to begin with offer their standpoint, realise the opposite colleagues' perspective, coordinate the mind and settle on an answer, instead of the pioneer to compel an answer, in order to convey down stages of independence support. A connecting with pioneer will, on this way, increase open clash standards, because it will make bigger the success of their fundamental requirements as pondered earlier than, following SDT, social setting elements in the working surroundings that have an effect on representative prosperity are to a great volume intervened by using fundamental requirements success. These factors all percentage practically speakme that they aid independence and exceptional requirements. At the factor while representatives experience greater assist for independence, they likewise experience extra related to the affiliation and sense greater a hit (Ali, Seny Kan, & Sarstedt, 2016).

Open battle standards are representatives' view in their institution and whether or not they trust they are able to determine to impart their perception or clashing thoughts or no longer. In accordance with SDT, the selection of imparting insights/clashes will uphold their sensation of independence and, hence, increment their important requirements all in all and in this manner, via implication have an impact on paintings dedication, as essential necessities achievement is proposed because the hidden issue for work commitment.

As those peace-making approaches of behaving as open war standards will affect critical requirements fulfillment, as contemplated previous, a connecting with pioneer will improve open clash standards and urge and supply independence to colleagues to supervise clashes themselves and provide ok help to do as such, as this could amplify their tiers of essential requirements success and paintings dedication (Crawford et al., 2020). This is, be that as it is able to, no longer by means of any way the best method for growing essential requirements as they will impact a huge variety of belongings to steer their supporters and not just this asset. Pioneers will, on this manner, have an impact on fundamental requirements thru all of the while creating important necessities via numerous property, in which open clash standards are most effective such a belongings.
This argumentation prompts the accompanying speculation. The following research model is presented as follow in figure one. It can be seen there are five direct relationships, and two relationship are being mediated by proactive personality. Proactive personality mediates between servant-leadership and intrinsic career success of female faculty members working in private sector universities of Pakistan and another mediating relationship of proactive personality traits is between career skills and intrinsic career success of women working in academia. The data were collected from private sector universities of Punjab, Pakistan. The targeted population for this research study were female faculty members. Total 173 female faculty members participated in this study. Total 250 questionnaires were distributed from which 173 questionnaires were found fit for analysis after checking aberrant and missing values. Reliability and validity were also checked and found fit for structural equation modeling. SEM was applied by using MPlus software. The results have been found satisfactory and hypothesis of the study are being accepted upon meeting threshold values. The diagram is presented with statistical values to view the results and easy interpretations as follow:

\[ H_1: \] Servant-Leadership has positively significant relationship with Proactive Personality Traits

\[ H_2: \] Career Skills have positively significant relationship with Proactive Personality Trait

\[ H_3: \] Proactive personality traits have positively significant relationship with Intrinsic Career Success

\[ H_4: \] Servant-Leadership has positively significant relationship with Intrinsic Career Success

\[ H_5: \] Career Skills have positively significant relationship with Intrinsic Career Success

\[ H_6: \] Proactive personality traits mediates between servant-Leadership, career skills and Intrinsic Career Success

This takes a look at adds to the writing in numerous approaches. In the first place, we add to the legitimacy of the concept of drawing in administration by way of learning its motive and its effect on work commitment through vital necessities fulfillment. Second, it's miles, as a long way as all of us is involved, the primary evaluation to check a refereeing method as open war requirements in a plan that isn't always related with battle or peacemaking, yet to advantageous persuasive ideas as fundamental requirements achievement and work commitment and present it as a social asset. At long remaining, this overview assessments the notion that numerous property influences each other and in particular initiative, as it is predicated that drawing in management could be related with open clash requirements, in which a pioneer utilizes this asset to effect important necessities achievement and work dedication
Methodology
Members of the overview have been supporters whose pioneer took component in an authority improvement application in a good-sized public coverage employer in Pakistan. 250 respondents have been all approached to fill in a survey questionnaire but only 176 questionnaires were returned back, and 03 questionnaires were rejected due to missing values. The response rate remained 69.2% which is acceptable for such type of exploratory study. The researchers have used 7 point likert scale ranging 1 to 7. 1 stands for strongly disagree, 2 disagree, 3 moderately disagree, 4 neutral, 5 moderately agree, 6 agree and 7 strongly agree.

Essential want achievement was anticipated following the prescribed scales by way of Schaufeli to regulate the estimation of essential requirements fulfillment with the idea of drawing in authority .The commercial enterprise related fundamental necessities success scale (W-BNS) turned into applied, which incorporated the three essential requirements proposed by way of SDT: capability (check issue: I experience geared up at my unique employment), independence (check aspect: I sense like I can act certainly at my specific employment) and relatedness (take a look at component: At work, I feel a part of a gathering). These things were better by using a scale to survey the achievement of the requirement for significance (check factor: My occupation is large for me, individually. Both scales include each effective and pessimistic things, by way of which the preceding allude to require success and the remaining choice to require dissatisfaction. Costa, Ntoumanis, and Bartholomew and Vansteenkiste and Ryan contend that one shouldn't quantify need disappointment or maybe want unhappiness whilst investigating the connection among want fulfillment and prosperity, as need unhappiness and sadness are associated with sick being as opposed to prosperity. An unmistakable qualification was tracked down among the 3 awesome develops (as an instance want fulfillment, want sadness and want dissatisfaction) in addition to technique affects of fantastic and bad matters .Need fulfillment become truely observed to be all of the greater unequivocally connected with lifestyles success, imperativeness and high-quality forms of idea, even as want dissatisfaction turned into greater connected with discouraged impact, burnout and bodily protests .In any case, most scales have no particular subscales for these systems. Given our attention on prosperity and want achievement, we understood the thinking of Costa et al and simply included the want fulfillment (for instance nice) things, because the poor things reflect want dissatisfaction, we joined all things right into a preferred need achievement dormant build.

Technique of Examination
Stractal Equation Modeling (SEM) has been applied to look at the ampleness of the overall model and therefore accredited us to on the same time test the proposed speculations. The estimation model changed into first attempted to guarantee a reasonable qualification between the speculated thoughts and really check for normal strategy inclination and changed into differentiated to a one-element model thru confirmative element exam. The dormant builds of drawing in authority and important requirements had been addressed through their 4 specific aspects and requirements. Work commitment and open clash requirements have been displayed with the aid of their matters. At the point when the attack of the 4-thing estimation model is higher than the one-element version, the assault of the version can be advanced by way of using data from the trade lists, which recommends allowing errors to narrate. These sets will likewise be approved to correspond inside the underlying version. The following tables are presented to justify the findings as below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Carrer Success ON</th>
<th>Estimate</th>
<th>S.E.</th>
<th>Estimate / S. E.</th>
<th>Two-Tailed P-Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>S_Leadership</td>
<td>0.430</td>
<td>0.092</td>
<td>4.678</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pro_Personality</td>
<td>0.166</td>
<td>0.077</td>
<td>2.173</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table: 02 Model Results (Mediator):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Perceived Organizational Justice ON</th>
<th>Estimate</th>
<th>S.E.</th>
<th>Estimate / S. E.</th>
<th>Two-Tailed P-Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>S_Leadership</td>
<td>0.325</td>
<td>0.074</td>
<td>4.415</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C_Skills</td>
<td>0.210</td>
<td>0.068</td>
<td>3.091</td>
<td>0.002</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table: 03 Model Results (Intercepts):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Intercepts</th>
<th>Estimate</th>
<th>S.E.</th>
<th>Estimate / S. E.</th>
<th>Two-Tailed P-Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pro_Personality</td>
<td>1.402</td>
<td>0.211</td>
<td>6.658</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Career Success</td>
<td>1.033</td>
<td>0.275</td>
<td>3.756</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table: 04 Model Results (Residual Variances):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Intercepts</th>
<th>Estimate</th>
<th>S.E.</th>
<th>Estimate / S. E.</th>
<th>Two-Tailed P-Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pro_Personality</td>
<td>0.103</td>
<td>0.009</td>
<td>11.113</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Career Success</td>
<td>0.150</td>
<td>0.013</td>
<td>11.113</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table: 05 Model Results (R-Square):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Observed Variable</th>
<th>Estimate</th>
<th>S.E.</th>
<th>Estimate / S. E.</th>
<th>Two-Tailed P-Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Proactive Personality</td>
<td>0.290</td>
<td>0.049</td>
<td>5.960</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Career Success</td>
<td>0.329</td>
<td>0.049</td>
<td>6.726</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table: 06 Model Results for Total, Total Indirect, Specific Indirect and Direct Effect:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Effects from Proactive Personality to Career Success</th>
<th>Estimate</th>
<th>S.E.</th>
<th>Estimate / S. E.</th>
<th>Two-Tailed P-Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>0.166</td>
<td>0.077</td>
<td>2.173</td>
<td>0.030</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Indirect</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>999.000</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Direct Effect:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Career Success -&gt; Proactive Personality</td>
<td>0.166</td>
<td>0.077</td>
<td>2.173</td>
<td>0.030</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Conclusion and Future Recommendations

The study represents the following statistical findings (H1) Servant-Leadership has positively significant relationship with Proactive Personality Traits the T-values for the hypothesis are 0.325/0.074 = 4.392 which is higher that threshold 1.96, so the hypothesis is being accepted on
statistical grounds. (H2) Career Skills have positively significant relationship with Proactive Personality Trait has been proven true as the relationship aforesaid has $0.210/0.068 = 3.088$, which is higher that threshold values, so the hypothesis is being approved on statistical values. (H3) Proactive personality traits have positively significant relationship with Intrinsic Career Success is also accepted based on statistical findings which are $0.166/0.077 = 2.156$.

(H4) Servant-Leadership has positively significant relationship with Intrinsic Career Success is also true in accordance with statistical interpretation having path coefficient, and standard deviation above the threshold values which are $0.430/0.092 = 4.674$ it is beyond the threshold values. (H5) Career Skills have positively significant relationship with Intrinsic Career Success is true in statical analysis, having $0.172/0.083 = 2.0723$ and (H6) Proactive personality traits mediates between servant-Leadership, career skills and Intrinsic Career Success is also proved true and accepted on the statistical basis having T-vales 11.445. Future researchers are recommended for qualitative research design.

References


Analyzing English Translation of Premchand’s Urdu Short Stories: A Cultural Perspective

Muhammad Younas, Assistant Professor English, Higher Education Department, Government of Punjab, Pakistan
*Beenish Pervaiz, Lecturer in English, University of Education, Lahore, Pakistan
Muhammad Irfan Janjua, PhD English Scholar, Department of English, University of Sargodha, Punjab, Pakistan
Babar Riaz, Student, M.Phil in English, University of Gujrat, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email: beenish.pervaiz@ue.edu.pk

ARTICLE DETAILS

History
Revised format: May 2022
Available Online: Jun 2022

Keywords
Language, English, Urdu, Translate, Cultural.

JEL Classification
Z11, Z19

ABSTRACT

Purpose: The aim of this research is to look at the idea of mistranslation in English translations of Premchand’s Urdu short stories. The source text is Urdu short stories penned by Premchand and the target text is its English translation. Translating the culture of source language is considered to be one of the most challenging tasks faced by translators. The translators confront several challenges to translate the source culture.

Design/Methodology/Approach: The researchers use the model of Newmark in order to analyze the mistranslation from the cultural perspectives. It has always been a heated debate whether the cultural embedded ideas and concepts may be exactly translated into target language or not. Though the translators have been using various strategies in order to translate the culturally specific items both in form of material and expression, they are not fully successful in translating the culturally specific terms and concepts. These culture embedded concepts can be the religious beliefs or social dialogues that are only understandable for the source culture readers.

Findings: The study concludes that mistranslation occurs because of many reasons such as translator’s immature knowledge of the two languages, translator’s intentional use of mistranslation, cultural barriers, language differences on lexical level and ideological differences.

Implications/Originality/Value: The study also reveals that there are many problems in the translation of the cultural items both in material forms and expressions due to translators, incompetence intercultural pragmatics.

© 2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-4.0

and Society in Emerging Economies, 4 (2), 477-486.

Introduction
Scholars of translation have different attitudes towards the role and essence of translation. Researchers in this field are of the view that translation is an extraordinary broad notion. They state that it is a process or product or the act of transferring the text that is in written form. While some are of the view that it is translating the SL into TL by preserving the semantic or stylistic equivalence. According to Larson (1998), translation is not only about the text but also about the cultural context. As we all know, each culture has its own language, a language of idiomatic expressions, which presents a significant challenge for translators. There are many difficulties inherent in the translation of colloquial phrases. Each culture is unique. Cultures vary on a variety of levels, including social, material, and religious. Whenever a translator makes an error during the cultural translation process, mistranslation occurs. The term "mistranslation" refers to an inaccurate translation that obscures the original text's true meaning. The purpose of this research is to examine the problems that arose during the translation of an Urdu text into English. This article discusses mistranslation at the word, phrase, and sentence levels. Occasionally mistranslation occurs because there is no equivalence between two languages and sometimes the translator is deliberately responsible for certain reasons. There is a lack of equivalency between two languages, two cultures and the translator is responsible for this act and sometime translator deliberately does this in order to achieve certain objectives. In order to find out the phenomenon of mistranslation at the word or sentence level, the change in meaning during translation has been studied. Translator uses the model of Newmark that consists of following strategies like descriptive equivalence, compensation, cultural equivalence, functional equivalence, paraphrasing, omission and compensation. Actually, a great translator ought to be comfortable with the way of life, culture, and social settings of the source and target language speakers. He ought to likewise be acquainted with various styles of talking, and social standards of the two dialects. This awareness, can improve the nature of the translations and all things that are considered necessary. As indicated by Hatim and Mason (1990), the social setting in translating a book is most likely a more significant variable than its sort. The practice of translation happens in the socio-cultural setting. Thusly, it is significant to judge translational action just inside a social setting.

Sugeng Hariyanto says in "The Implication of Culture on Interpretation Theory and Practice" that culture manifests itself in two distinct ways when it comes to translating. To begin, the concept or reference of the vocabulary is, in some manner, unique to the specific culture. Second, the concept or reference is wide yet conveyed in a way that is clear to the source language. However, it is suggested that a translator should take the purpose of the translation into account when translating socially and culturally bound terms or idioms.

This research can be helpful for students and teachers to be familiar with the tribulation of cultural translation and the strategies that are applicable in this regard. The study will compare the concept of mistranslation to its original text. Indeed, the most significant and difficult issue encountered throughout the translation process is that of cultural differences. Individuals see other cultures and the world through their own lens. The term "culture" refers to a variety of objects, values, common ideas, and language. As a result, many civilizations have different focus. The difficult job that arises between the SC and TC is resolving the discrepancies that occur during translation. There are translators who use a variety of methods for cultural translation. The study examines the strategies used by translators to bridge the cultural divide between two different cultures. How the translated material takes on a new perspective for the target readers. The Study is limited to English translation of Premchand’s Urdu short stories by English translators.

Aims and Objectives
The aims and objectives of this research are to:
1. Investigate how does the mistranslation of different cultural terms happen?
2. Analyze the strategies used by English translators of Munshi Premchand’s Urdu Short Stories in translating cultural terms.

**Research Questions**

1. How does the cultural perspective in Urdu language cause mistranslation into English translation of Munshi Premchand’s short stories?
2. What are the strategies used by English translators of Munshi Premchand’s Urdu short stories for translating cultural terms?

**Literature Review**

It is a fact that notion of translation was mixed with that of culture. It is also fact that culture is considered a crucial part of translation. The role of culture can be seen by the point of view given scholar Armstrong (2005) who states that it is only possible for bicultural or bilingual to do that accurate translation. Nida (1964) is of the view that the problems in the translation of cultural terms are due to the linguistic and cultural gap between two cultures. He is of the view for sake of translation we cannot give weight to one thing rather the linguistics or cultural items of both SL and TL are of equal importance. Venuti (1995) describes that the process of translation looks for the similarities between the two cultures and languages. Said (1997) gives four factors that may influence that translation; translator, text being translated, purpose of translating a text and context of translation. In this way, one can say that translation process is not simple. It involves many dimensions. Each of the translated text involves four factors that can affect it. Here the reason behind mistranslation may lie. The source text may require a deep analysis and transcription on a deeper level but is translated at a minor level that may cause mistranslation. Sungar in his conference proceeding quoted that translation is an act of understanding what is foreign and translating it in a language that is one’s own. Therefore, it can be said that translation is a process of domestication (Sungar, 2015). He in his studies quoted Graham that translation is act of the “internalization of the other so that it can be rewritten in the language of the familiar.”

This article examines mistranslation as a massive problem in the area of translation. However, mistranslation has resulted in some severe consequences in recent years, as well as a few amusing and humiliating instances. When the US Prime Minister visited Poland and a person who spoke both languages but was unfamiliar with the art of translation mistranslated his remarks. He interpreted the prime minister's remarks as if he were delighted to grasp private aspects of Poland when, in fact, he meant that he was delighted to visit Poland. This has occurred many times throughout history (2014) (Gentzler). As it comes to translation studies, there are many academics that have different opinions on the importance of cultural understanding when they begin their study in this field. For instance, James Holmes explains that analyzing the qualities of poetry is not a matter of linguistics but rather of social culture and literature, as he considers diachronic aspects in poetry translation. Susan Basnett discusses the four branches of translation studies in depth, one of which is translation in the target culture.

According to Lingwei Yin's paper "English Lexical Mistranslation of Vocabulary List and Plausible Translation and Teaching Strategies," vocabulary is a critical component of second language acquisition. Errors of the vocabulary, words, syntax, and language usage all contribute to mistranslation and obstruct the true meaning of a translated document. Geoffrey Leech (1981) defines seven semantic meanings such as conceptual, connotative, social, emotional, reflected, collocative, and thematic. These meanings contribute to the process of translation by communicating the real sense and meaning. A lack of vocabulary skills may result in a mistranslation of meaning at these levels.
Culler (1976) states that if there was no difference between the cultures and languages and if they share a common set pattern of cultural concepts, then it would have a very easy-going task for translators to translate the culture. However, some serious problems come into its way. He was of the view that languages and culture differ and they organize the world differently. Newmark (1995) once stated that it is not difficult to learn language. Any old fool can learn language but to become translator there is need of being intelligent.

According to Snel-Hornby (1988: 40), Wilhelm Von Humboldt was the first to explicitly describe the relationship between language and culture. Language, for this German rationalist, was dynamic: it was a state of motion (energeia), as opposed to a static collection of objects as a consequence of movement (ergon). Simultaneously, language is a manifestation of culture and the speakers' individuality, since they see the world via language. Identical to Goodenough’s view of culture as the sum of information, this current view may see language as the psyche's representation of information.

Ayadi Amina said in her dissertation that lexical issues are an important component of translation which leads to mistranslation. (Amina, 2014). Nida (2001) focuses dynamically on the message rather than the form and views of translation, saying it is a communication process. Nida & Waard (1986) discusses dynamic and functional equivalence, which promotes the natural reproduction of the source text message in the target language. (Alhihi, 2015). Md. Ziel Haque in his article mentions that this definition includes three essential terms; Equivalent, which refers to the source-language message, Natural, which refers to the receptor language, and Closest, which “binds the two orientations together on the basis of the highest degree of speculation”. Hornby is of the view that is an element of universal and cultural overlap between languages.

Krings (1986) is of the view that translation strategy is basically a potential plan used by the translator in order to solve the difficult translation task of cultures.

These are some theoretical backgrounds on which study is being constructed.

**Methodology**

The study is descriptive in nature. It focuses on the data analysis and gives its theoretical explanation. The study explores and describes that how some problems are occurred and who are the agents of these problems. Research question are explored in the data analysis and conclusion is drawn. Researcher is keen to address the problem of mistranslation in which the following data is being explored. The study is confined to Urdu to English translations. Researcher chooses data randomly from Premchand short stories and its translations by English translators. Model of Newmark has been implied by researcher in order to look at the cultural perspective and to demystify the cultural gap between two language, source language and target language which results in mistranslation. Model of Newmark consists of different strategies for translation of culturally specific items. These strategies include descriptive equivalent, cultural equivalent, functional equivalence, generalization, omission, and compensation. There are various ways of translating culturally specific items. There are many reasons due to which translator do not find exact word in the target language. As it has been mentioned by Jacobson (1959/2000, p.114) that during the process of translation “there is ordinarily no full equivalence between code-units”. According to Newmark’s model there are some strategies which translator can use to fill the cultural gaps in the translation of culture specific items which are either religious, social or material. Many translation scholars describe these strategies. For Newmark (1988, p.82) the term cultural equivalent means “an approximate translation where a SL cultural word is translated by a TL cultural word”.

*Data involves short stories of Munshi Premchand’s Urdu short stories that are translated in English by Khushwant Singh, Fatima Rizvi and Frances W. Pritchett. For the sake of data analysis researcher...*
observed thirty short stories by Premchand and selected data randomly. By making comparison of these thirty short stories and their translation, researcher found various cultural gaps either they were in at religious, social or material level. Furthermore, researcher selected various examples but fifty example were strong in which cultural gap can be seen. These examples were analyzed and observed repeatedly in order to make the portion of data analysis stronger. Data involves short stories of Munshi Premchand’s Urdu short stories that are translated into English by Khushwant Singh, Fatima Rizvi, David Rubin and Rakhshanda Jalil

**Urdu Source Language**

جبیہے لوگ علی الصبح اٹھتے ہی بالوں پر چھرا کیوں چلاتے ہی؟ (پریم چند، صفحہ 63)

**English Target language**

For instance, why do men attack their hair with razor first thing in the morning. (Translated by Jalil. R. p. 86)

**Interpretation**

In this text source, the term "friendly" refers to the act of shaving and hair trimming, a habit of each person. In this sentence, the word چھرا is part of our material culture. When the translator translates this cultural material term, he interprets it as a razor. The similarity between these words is wrong. Catford (1988) says that the essential element for translators is that, when translating, they must take account of both kinds of variables, such as language and culture. He meant that aspects such as cultural and linguistic components should be derived from the original language. Cultural elements are those for Catford (1988) which cannot also be observed at the level of form and significance. But they exist because of prior information in the minds of readers and speakers. The similar situation occurs in this word's translation as he interprets it as a razor. The reader of the source text knows it quite well, while the readers of the target text have no clue about it. The translator attempts to establish a similarity based on its functions, and is therefore not successful. Here the translator employs a functional equivalence approach but does not give the correct term which leads to misinterpretation. Catford (1988) claims that translation is the process of replacing source culture text material with target culture text material equivalent. However, the obvious distinction between these two things may be seen in this sentence either on the basis of their working or on the structure.

**Urdu Source Language**

گویا فرشتوں کو اپنی معصومیت کا یقین دلا رہا ہو۔

**English Target language**

As though calling on the gods to witness his innocence. (omission)

**Interpretation**

In this source text example, the source text word فرشتوں refers to the idea of God’s creature. They are busy in their where they have been ordered by Allah almighty. The source text word for these فرشتوں is angles whereas translators translate these words as gods. It is belief of Muslims that فرشتوں are not gods rather they are creature of God performing their duties by remaining in their limits. Translator tries to create the equal reference of this religious belief about this creature but fails to provide the exact one. Although there is word angle called angle which is accepted and endorsed universally but translator provide us with the word gods. Translator here uses the strategy of omission. Translator omits the main word for the translation of فرشتوں and provides his target readers with the word gods. Hence, we can say that translator mistranslates the source culture belief. Larson considered that the terms which deal with the religious aspects are the most difficult one to translate for translators. He is of the view that these are the specific terms that are only known by the source text readers instead by the target text readers.
I spent whole morning playing the stick ball and came back exactly at the meal time. (Rubin, David, 1969, p. 160)

Interpretation
The terms گلی ڈنڈا in the original language indicates the sport, which mainly takes place in the towns and is a part of our cultural history. This game consists of two things: the first one is large stick and a short piece of stick about the length of half foot having width of one and half inch with its curved corner on both sides. This game has its own rules and regulation according to which گلی is placed on earth and its one corner is hit by the player as soon as it lifts up, boy with the long stick smashes far away in the air. When the translator into a target language translates this cultural game, he interprets it as a ball. Translator cannot keep the equivalence between these two games performed in two nations. The translator utilizes the terms stickball in the target language, which is a game called baseball played nearly everywhere else. Translator employs the technique of cultural equivalence between these two games, since in the source culture it is "functioning" and "stick ball," which leads to misinterpretation of the source culture. In the target culture, the translator fails to give a correct reference. The distinction between both sports is ball and stick. The opponent throws the former ball, while in the later the player himself hits a curved stick with a long general used stick. According to Aixela (1996), cultural elements are the primary elements of the text, linked to certain ideas that are unfamiliar to target readers in other cultures. This allows us to state that cultural translation may lead to a gap between the culture of the source and target culture. The translator as a whole cannot give the exact cultural equivalent of this cultural game which has its own importance in the culture of the source. Thus, the perspective of the two games is different.

If I show it to you, you will surely grab it in your arms. (Translated by Rizvi. F)

Interpretation
In this source text example, the word مرغابیاں refers to the bird whose translation is duck. During the translation of cultural items, the problematic situation arises when the translator does not have idea about the culture of the source text. Source culture can be in form of social, material, religious. It can be either the name of games, birds or sweets. So, during the translation of this source text translator uses the strategy of generalization. Translator generalizes the source culture bird into general bird. Translator tries to produce accurate referent but during process of translation he simply omits the main bird and generalizes it. According to Aixela(1996) cultural specific items are the main parts of text that have connection to specific concepts in the foreign cultures which can be unknown to the readers of target text. By this fact we can say that cultural translation can result in the existence of a gap between the source and target culture. Same is the case happened here with the translator who tried to translate the source culture bird but come into generalizing the bird which leads this one to the mistranslation of source culture bird.
In this sentence, word گودی is mistranslated as grab in arms. گودی itself contains its lexical meaning as lap but the translator mistranslates it with the above mentioned phrase and misleads the actual sense of the word. The source language word گودی has a strong implementation in our cultural perspective and has its own significance. In our culture almost each and every person takes some one into his lap. The correct translation for the source language word “گودی” is lap. Translator in this sentence is unable to link the word with its correct equivalent, therefore uses the word grabs into the arms. Grab into the arms gives the meaning of like embracing when two people meet each other. گودی is of different kind in which a child sits in the lap of elder instead of embracing. The translator uses the technique of descriptive equivalence as discussed by Newmark. In this sentence paraphrasing has been used as translator wants to clear the idea to his reader but mixes these two culturally specific items that show love. Translator tries to interpret but fails. The main problem with the cultural translation is of difference between two culture source and target culture. Both these words provide different perspective to the different reader either they are in source culture or in the target culture by application of this strategy, named paraphrasing the source culture has been misinterpreted by the translator and hence it is mistranslation of the important part of source culture.

**Urdu source language**

یہ نہیں کہ ایک پیسے کی ریوڑیاں لین تو چڑا چڑا کھانے لگا۔ (پریم چند، صفحہ نمبر 781)

**English Target language**

I am not the sort who buys a piece worth of lollipops to tease others by sucking them. (Translated by Singh. K)

**Interpretation**

This specific source text sample described here relates to the specific kind of sweet. This sweet is prepared by using unique components. This kind of sweet has a particular position in our culture of source. The translator converts a sweet culture name into sweet target cultures. He interprets ریوڑیاں as lollipops, which are various kinds of dishes mainly utilized in foreign cultures. The fundamental thing about language is the abundance of distinct objects belonging to various groups. When obstacles exist between language and culture, the challenge for the translator is to keep the same message as it was in the source culture. The second issue for the translator is that the same message should be kept in the target language and the source language. The source cultural object distracts him while the translator attempts to translate. Florin (1993: 122) believes that translations of particular cultural objects are not restricted just to the use of everyday language. He also discovers that these cultural terms are not exactly comparable in the target language since their creation is based on the local and historical color, which differs and is unique to each culture. Danyte (2006) highlights the challenge for the translator is not only to correctly comprehend such suggestions, but also to pass them on to target readers in an understandable manner (2006: 203). The translator utilizes Newmark's compensation strategy in this case. The precise meaning of this cultural treat does not exist in English culture and language, so the translation attempts to translate the ریوڑیاں and provides substitutes as lollipops. The word "ریوڑیاں" relates to the material culture and the translator mistranslates the word "lollipops," which is not the suitable substitute for the word of the original language.

**Urdu source language**

دو کھونٹیاں بمنزلہ قالین کے تھا

**English target language**

Two nails were driven into the wall, a plank put on them and a carpet of paper spread on the plank.

**Interpretation**

In this source text example, the word کھونٹیاں refers to the idea of hanger or peg whereas the translator translates it as nails. The difference between the two is of structure and being sharp. Nails are sharp
and they have a pointed head, on the other hand the source text word کھونٹیاں do not have a pointed head. کھونٹیاں are driven into ground or into wall in order to provide some of the assistance or support to anything. Translator here tries to provide exact referent to this source text word. Translator here fails to provide the equal reference regarding this word. Translator lack of knowledge or background knowledge of source culture creates hindrance in the accurate translation of this example Balfaqeeh (2009, p. 1) describes that every translator uses strategy as tool to overcome and to find-out solutions for idioms and cultural bound words. Translator here uses the strategy of functional equivalence on the basis of their function and hence fails which leads to the mistranslation.

Conclusion
Researchers in this article try to find out how the translation of different cultural terms becomes the cause of mistranslation when the Urdu short stories of Premchand are translated into English. Mistranslation is the wrong or incorrect translation that misleads the actual sense of source text. Mistranslation occurs because of many reasons such as translator’s immature knowledge of the two languages, translator’s intentional use of mistranslation, cultural barriers, language differences on lexical level, and ideological differences. The study concludes that there are many problems in translation of these cultural items either they are in material form or expressions. Stories are translated from Urdu into English. Urdu and English language are different on the different bases. Urdu language represents Indian culture that contains lexical items that differ semantically from those of English language. Cultural differences create a barrier in translation. English culture has different linguistic expression to represent its cultural values, norms and religion. Indian culture lacks its equivalent in English language and culture.

Translators sometimes lack the linguistic knowledge of languages, thus they are incapable of drawing equivalence which results in mistranslation of cultural items from Urdu language into English language. Translator tries to draw dynamic equivalence by translating a lexical item into a phrase in a target language that also creates sometimes mistranslation and hinders the actual meaning of the source text to be conveyed into the target text. Lack of equivalence among the meanings of lexical items and translator’s role in the translation process are main causes of mistranslation of cultural items.

References


Influence of Pakistanis and Chinese Cultural differences on different Projects of CPEC

*Ghulam Shabbir*, Ph.D. Scholar Department of Sociology, Ningxia University, Yinchuan, Ningxia, China

Liang Xiangming, Dean, Department of Sociology, Ningxia University, Yinchuan, Ningxia China

*Corresponding Authors: shabbier.g14@yahoo.com*

**ARTICLE DETAILS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>History</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Revised format: May 2022</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Available online: Jun 2022</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Keywords</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Project Success, Influence of Culture on CPEC, Development of CPEC</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>JEL Classification</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>O1, O18, O47</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**ABSTRACT**

**Purpose:** To identify the problems and barriers which are become due to cultural differences between Chinese and Pakistani cultures. This study helps to find out problems that create hurdles for the completion of projects which are happening due to CPEC.

**Design/ Methodology/ Approach:** Qualitative and quantitative research designs were employed and a non-probability purposive technique was recruited from the concerning region. A semi-structured in-depth interview was conducted with 10 businessmen directly concerned with the CPEC project. Here using thematic analysis 10 themes emerged required purposive methods that are directly involved with CPEC or its relevant projects. A total of 500 respondents were chosen and 10 thematic emerged with different categories of vendors and businessmen.

**Findings:** 76.4%) was said they like to do other cultural festivals and activities while 118(23.6%) said they don’t like any cultural activity. 2nd largest city of Pakistan Lahore in 4 markets Lahore those are the hub of business where out of 500 respondents 42.6% replied yes ethnic groups are also getting the same benefits in Pakistan while 46.4% said no they don’t are doing the same type of business as majority of the people are getting benefits.

**Implications /Value/Originality:** CPEC is the developmental approach for the welfare of society. Businessmen’s thinking level and approach should maintain proper special training which can suitable for both states’ cultures. Both side leadership should control and monitor every type of terms and condition that multinational companies will sign.

© 2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-4.0

Introduction
Many projects are running under CPEC in both countries which are very important for the future of both countries. It is also a fact both countries have different cultural values and different values so the study of both cultures and their influence on new projects are also important. Successful businessmen and managers always respect every culture even that’s the relevant majority of the community or minorities. Pakistan is the 5th largest country in the world and its uniqueness is its own culture in the name of Islam. 96% of people are Muslims so their thinking is very important which they have regarding their own culture and other cultures.

For the success of projects between two nations, cultural traits and their meaning are very important. Whole communities are representing their minds and thinking with their cultural practices, emotions, and attachments. Distributions of projects and benefits of projects are making on the demand of local areas as well for people. Here the distribution of benefits seems different. Many people in Baluchistan are feeling insecure. They claimed 60% of resources are using from their projects but they will get benefits just 5% which is not fair. Other districts are getting more benefits. So expectations of the local people of Baluchistan have many more from this mega project. They want to get more benefits from this mega project in the shape of income, job opportunities, and utilization of resources. (Ahmad 2017)

The first special economic zone (SEP) in the deep sea port of Gwadar. Gwadar and Xinjiang are connecting road transportation between one country to the second country. No doubt Pakistan enjoys its geographical location which is across the roads of south Asia. It is also called the one and last integrated region of the world. This project is important for both countries. Here is an idea of judgment that shipping costs will drop drastically if the proposed route of CPEC is used by China. The time of transit will minimize more than 10 days for its trade. (Aqeel 2016)

Haris (2015) explained that industrialization in the special economic zone (SEZ) with CPEC will rebuild Pakistan’s weak industrial units. Tong (2015) expected that employment opportunities will take place in the market. He further explained China will prefer local labor rather than China or a specific province. It’s also estimated due to CPEC local jobs will generate in different projects. Its truth Pakistan’s economy is a small comparison to china’s. It is a must for Pakistan will seek a special way from China’s expertise. It is also a must to seek special protection for local industries. (Hamid and Sara, 2012)

According to CGTN TV, one video is taken in Multan, Punjab, Pakistan, China Pakistan ties tour of the key project of China Pakistan economic corridor. Pakistan’s businessmen’s opinion is that this project is very good for farmers, Pakistan businessmen, and traders. Especially for the southern side of Punjab Multan to Karachi will be more prosperous because due to transportation their access to the selling of mangoes and cotton would be easy. They can use more advanced technology for Multan to Karachi highway which is part of CPEC. Pakistan’s businessmen are taking it as a mega project which would be a source of poverty reduction. They are considering it a long-term friendship credit and say thanks Chinese.

Research design
A qualitative research design is used for this study. According to (Denzin & Lincoln, 1994) the focal point of qualitative research is to interpret the phenomenon in their natural settings. It tends to focus on the responses and experiences of the subject rather than the perspective of the researcher. Since the present study is experiential in nature, qualitative design is appropriate to explore this phenomenon.

Sampling technique
Non-probability purpose sampling technique is used to recruit participants. This technique is appropriate for it because only those people targeted who were directly attached to the business and purchasing their trades from China.

Ten participants were recruited according to a non-probability purposive sample. Participants were selected from 4 big markets of business in Lahore, Pakistan. Lahore is 2nd largest city in Pakistan and a hub of business with different ethnic groups, four markets were chosen purposively. The sample size is selected keeping in mind Braun and Clarke (2013). Six to ten participants make up an ideal size for a small project of thematic analysis with a short time frame.

Sample inclusion criteria: businessmen in the market, directly purchasing trades from China, they also claim to protect and practice their culture. 125 total respondents were selected from each market. Ten respondents were chosen for open-ended questions.

Sample exclusion criteria: Participants were directly attached to a Chinese warehouse where they were purchasing materials. Those participants who were not part of the interview were unaware of CPEC and Chinese Culture. All participants knew the role of CPEC in Pakistan as well as the whole routes of silk roads.

Collection of Data
A semi-structured interview was selected for data collection. The researcher created some questions before the interview and some questions the researcher asked according to the situation. We create 21 questions for the interview guide. The interview guide was tested against a pilot study with 2 participants who were not partaking in the final project. Entire interviews were recorded and the researcher also took notes during the interview. The duration of the interview may vary between 30 to 40 minutes. Informed consent took from each participant before the interview. All questions were open-ended. I chose this method because through semi-structured interviews, one can collect more rich data and the researcher gets to know more things about the phenomenon that is being studied.

Data Analysis Procedure
The study was conducted with a qualitative method using an inductive thematic analysis approach. Braun and Clarke (2006) define thematic analysis as: “A method for identifying, analyzing and reporting patterns within data. “The approach to coding plan will be ‘semantic, inductive and descriptive’ to give voice to the data and to stay close to the data as much as possible. Inductive TA stays grounded in data instead of using any existing theory. Semantic TA focuses on the obvious surface meaning and Descriptive TA refers to summarizing and describing patterned meaning in the data.

The Researcher Followed the Following 6 Steps for Data Analysis
1. Read the transcript: Firstly, a researcher read the transcript at least thrice and he got familiar with the transcript.
2. Do the initial coding: After reading the transcript, the researcher identified and extracted essential phrases and then labeled them.
3. Searching for theme: After identifying the initial theme, the researcher transferred the initial coding into short phrases.
4. Reviewing the themes: At this step, the researcher clusters these themes together by identifying connections or relationships among the codes.
5. Defining and naming the themes: At this step, the researcher wrote the themes’ definitions and selects the themes, makes sure names for conceptual clarity.
6. Writing the report: At this step, the researcher translated the themes into a narrative account.
Quality Control
Make sure the validity is a significant part of the research at the end of the research. In qualitative research, researchers’ perspectives which are eliminated bias and increase the researcher’s truthfulness of a proposition about some social phenomenon (Denzin, 1978).

Member Checking
Member checking is known as participant feedback or respondent validation. It enhances the credibility of the study. Interpretation of the result was given to the participants that were part of the research to check the authenticity of the work and their feedback added to the report. I used this technique in this way, as I finished the interpretation of all interviews then I shared my results of interpretation with participants and took their opinions.

Ethical Consideration
The researcher took informed consent from the participants. A participant was able to leave the interview at any stage of the interview. All information was kept confidential throughout the research. If any participant does not want to answer any question then the researcher was not forced to Participant.

Results and Discussion
In this chapter, research is focused to explain findings in quantitative and qualitative both methods. Statistical problems and finds are also elaborated in detail. Proper statistical methods are also used here which are highlighting our main points. This chapter has been divided into two parts, Part A and Part B which are categorized in this way.

Age of Respondents
In this research total, the respondents were 500 from four markets of city Lahore. Up to 35 years old respondents were 91(18.2%) while 36-45 were 255(51%) and above to 45 years old were 154(30.8%). Miemsie et al, (2010) explained in their study the common sense of people regarding the future of South Africa in the coming years. The total respondent of his study were 1,326, and their age categories were as follows: 15-25 years (3%); 26-35 years (25.9%); 35-40 years (47.5%); 40-45 years (16.7%), and above 46 years (6.9%). His research findings showed specific age of respondents was (40–45 years), which was the original research intention. Gender distribution and their respondents were also ideal, i.e. 616 males (46.5%) and 708 females (53.5%).

Respondents Regarding Gender View
Research indicates the portion of gender distribution 444(88.8) male businessmen and 56(11.2%), female businessmen, out of 500 respondents. In Pakistani culture majority of the people are male side in the business side because of culture and religion.

Respondents Regarding Education Point of View
Data indicates that 22(4.4%) respondents were illiterate, 71(14.2%) were in middle education, 164(32.8) respondents were matric and 243(48.6%) were above matric in the education field. Howard and Masset (2004) explained that education and health are closely related to traveling and mobility. For local people’s benefits, easy transportation makes easy access to communicate with communities, education, and their health care facilities. Citizens are getting more benefits in all sectors of life if giving them easy mobility and transportation.

Participants Regarding Marital Status and Family Status
Data explain the marital status of the businessmen which is like this 66(13.2%) were single, 372(74.4%) Were married, 38(7.6%) were divorced and only 24(4.8%) were widows. The finding of
the research explained that 207(41.4%) belong to the nuclear family, 252(50.4%) are joint family while only 41(8.2%) were from extended families.

Participants Regarding Economic Status
Data was collected from 500 respondents from 4 markets of Lahore, where 36(7.2%) respondents were from the lower class 360(72%) belonged to the middle class and 104(20.8%) belong to the upper class. (Aqeel 2017) Every project is applied to the whole society if you want to see popular culture you need to go to the middle class which is a majority in many states.

Respondents Regarding Knowledge of CPEC
Data explained the knowledge of respondents about CPEC 432(86.4%) were aware and only 68(13.6%) respondents were not known of CPEC projects. PIPS (2016) published a paper titled is this how Pakistani perceive China Pakistan Economic Corridor? It is told in this report they took a survey in Pakistan on how Pakistani perceive CPEC. There their respondents were 157 which they took from four provinces of Pakistan. Selective districts were chosen in the area where CPEC will connect in the future. All respondents were administrative members of different institutions. The significance importance and awareness of respondents were counted as 38% relevant to CPEC. 53% responded they are aware of it only 9% were there who said they do not know about CPEC. Meanwhile, 91% of respondents gave a positive response they know CPEC. The majority of them knew it through print and electronic media. 46% of people responded they know it through their political affiliation with political parties.

| Table 1: Arrangements of the respondents regarding purchasing Chinese Products |
|---------------------------|----------------|--------|---------------|----------------|
| Purchasing Chinese products | Frequency | Percent | Valid Percent | Cumulative Percent |
| Yes | 382 | 76.4 | 76.4 | 76.4 |
| No | 118 | 23.6 | 23.6 | 100.0 |
| Total | 500 | 100.0 | 100.0 |

Data was collected from 500 respondents from whom 382(76.4%) purchased while only 118(23.6) were not purchasing Chinese products. The important point is chosen market’s members were already attached to Chinese products, and many things and expectations they already attached to CPEC and its projects.

Table 2: Arrangements of the respondents regarding the type of business
Research interpreted that out of 500 respondents 40(8%) were an electronic business, 105(21%) were involved in the garments business, 66(13.2%) were mechanics business and 289(57.8) were doing other business like cosmetics, plastics and pampers, etc.

| Table 3: Arrangements of the respondents regarding happy to contact face to face interaction with a foreigner as well as Chinese |
|-----------------------------------------------|----------------|--------|---------------|----------------|
| Face-to-face interaction | Frequency | Percent | Valid Percent | Cumulative Percent |
| Yes | 455 | 91.0 | 91.0 | 91.0 |
| No | 45 | 9.0 | 9.0 | 100.0 |
| Total | 500 | 100.0 | 100.0 |

Data was taken from 500 respondents from 4 markets of Lahore which showed 455(91%) was said yes they happy for face to face interaction while 45(9%) was said no they will not happy with this type of interaction.

Hussain and Ali. (2015) elaborated that CPEC will become the source of people’s connectivity for both countries. It is a significant way for both countries and will also increase the economy way in Pakistan. It was also argued in 2015 four sectors were mentioned for development due to CEPC which were transport, energy sectors, infrastructure, and industrial corporations.

Table 4: Arrangements of the respondents regarding any threat of political parties or social media to businessmen

Data taken from 4 markets of Lahore out of 500 respondents 182(36.4%) responded from political instability was a threat, 174(34.4%) was neutral while 144(28.8%) said there is no threat relevant to any political instability in Pakistan.

**Table 5: Arrangements of the respondents regarding interchange marriages experiences**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interchange marriage</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>8.0</td>
<td>8.0</td>
<td>8.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>460</td>
<td>92.0</td>
<td>92.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data was chosen from four markets of Lahore out of 500 respondents 40(8%) said yes they saw many couples who did marriages in different cultures while 460(92%) said they did not have any experience of interchange marriages. Ten respondents who gave open-ended questions in detail they had a negative attitude regarding the marriage concept between two different cultures.

**Table 6: Arrangements of the respondents regarding their opinions of likeness to other cultures’ festivals for celebrations**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cultural celebrations</th>
<th>festivalsFrequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>382</td>
<td>76.4</td>
<td>76.4</td>
<td>76.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>23.6</td>
<td>23.6</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data was taken from 500 respondents of four markets in district Lahore 382(76.4%) said they like to do other cultural festivals and activities while 118(23.6%) said they don’t like it. This table indicates hub of business is in Lahore and respondents don’t want any insecurity or fear of Chinese culture.

**Table 7: Arrangements of the respondents regarding learning the Chinese language**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Learn the Chinese language</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>388</td>
<td>77.6</td>
<td>77.6</td>
<td>77.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>22.4</td>
<td>22.4</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

18th no city in the world Lahore has a targeted population where 500 respondents were taken from 4 markets of Lahore where 388(77.6%) said yes they want to learn the Chinese language while 112(22.4%) said they don’t want to learn the Chinese language.

**Table 8: Arrangements of the respondents regarding insecurity from Chinese culture**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Insecurity from culture</th>
<th>ChineseFrequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Valid Percent</th>
<th>Cumulative Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>17.6</td>
<td>17.6</td>
<td>17.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>147</td>
<td>29.4</td>
<td>29.4</td>
<td>47.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>265</td>
<td>53.0</td>
<td>53.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data was collected from 500 respondents from four markets in Lahore 88(17.6%) said yes they are feeling insecure, 147(29.4%) were neutral and 265(53%) said they don’t feel any insecurity about Chinese culture.

(Christian Caryl 2002) On the other hand, Baluchistan’s instability is also a danger to Pakistan. Some small political parties are working against Pakistan’s development. Their connections are with foreign agencies that are anti-group of Pakistan.

**Discussion**

In this research influences of culture on CPEC’s projects were assessed view quantitative and qualitative research methods. The main thematic focus was those businessmen who are doing trade with China or are influenced by projects which are done through CPEC. Every project has its qualities and is concerned with their concerning communities, though CPEC is a mega project in Pakistan as well for China. Cognitive thinking and observation from Pakistani businessmen were seen
in this study. There is a discussion relationship between these variables science and art. This mega project is like a blessing for Pakistan. China and Pakistan’s relations are also very good. Pakistani respect the citizens of China. Their relationships are huge and strong for a long time. The attitude of both country’s citizens showed positive. The main purpose of the study finding the relationship between businessmen with this mega project. Their attitude is positive toward this project. Many expectations are attached to CPEC. Thoughts of businessmen were seen very clear they can get improve their business in future due to this project.

China planned a refinery at the port of Gwadar and the construction of pipelines for many things from Gwadar port to Kashgar. Many new projects are coming with CPEC which will reduce the distance and cost not only in China as well all for Pakistan. It’s estimated that 7 times the distance will short rather than now China is facing at the moment. China’s tankers are taking twenty days from China to the Persian Gulf, but after the completion of CPEC 48 hours are required.

In this research, 51% of respondents were aged 36-45. 88% of respondents were male and are controlling the work. 48% of respondents’ education was above matric. The marital statuses of respondents were 74.4% of the selected population. As research indicated that the majority of the population belongs to joint families which was 48% of the selected population.

The main things were observed there 72% target population was from the middle class as it assumed this size majority of people were doing their own business. 56.2% of respondents were seen from independent families from four markets of Lahore. Research also find a good relationship between 86.4% of respondents knowing the term CPEC and its impacts on their business. This relationship between the respondents was a good gesture for research.

**Conclusion**

All data was chosen from four markets of Lahore, where every type of community is doing business. All ethnic and minority people were also part of the research even majority of the businessmen were Muslims. Different types of age were selected where old age respondents were seen as more influenced and attached to their culture. Mostly young age businessmen were seen as optimistic about different cultures’ acculturation. In every aspect, respondents were a social change in innovations without touching on their belief system. Young businessmen have no issues with interchange marriages while older businessmen felt unsatisfied. Minorities of businessmen were seen as more satisfied with the work of CPEC and its projects. The main thing is culture can’t ignore the success of CPEC projects and their implementations.

Strong affiliations are expected in jobs, small-scale businesses, and development in the agriculture sectors. Many official statements from both countries were seen they hope CPEC is the game changer for not only China and Pakistan but also for the region. The social prestige and status of businessmen will also increase in the future. Political and government involvements were also seen as positive toward the work of CPEC. Citizen of Pakistan has no issues to inter cast marriages with other cultures. Ethnic groups of Pakistan are also doing business in the same sense as other majorities of the people are doing there. In the field of adoption of innovations, the attitude of businessmen was observed from 4 markets of Lahore, where 500 respondents were taken 79% said they agree to adopt new technologies and innovations in their business,19.4% said neutral and only 1.6% was replied they don’t want to adopt innovations or technology in their business.

The main purpose of the thesis is primarily related to the theory of whether CPEC has an impact on businessmen’s cognition for the future and the Chinese cost of expenditure for future planning. The main point is seen the majority of respondents want to enhance their business but they also want to see their own culture on the safe side. If haram products will use in eating or using stuff their attitude will be negative in the future. Further 76% of respondents are ready to give prestige to Chinese
culture only 24% of respondents were neutral and made a negative attitude. 38.8% of respondents are very clear to maintain their previous culture while youngster opinion is directly concerned with business and their profits. Above the age of 45 years, old people are not ready to use innovations, especially in the money transformation process and other banking systems. Lahore is the 2nd largest city in Pakistan and the CPEC route is directly attached via Multan to Lahore which is very easy access to those businessmen.

Limitations of Study
This study is taken from four only markets in Lahore city, Punjab, Pakistan. Only businessmen were taken in questionnaires and interviews which are directly or indirectly related to China Pakistan Economic Corridor.

Recommendations
For the success of projects influence or role of culture should be maintained in the proper position. Businessmen and investors should be facilities with specific methods regarding their culture. Limitations and restrictions can’t need to touch any religious boundaries. Leadership should appoint competent authorities who can monitor these things very clearly.

Supervision in Safe Hands
After looking at the final study it’s an easy way to say new companies should use this new route which can save their time and cost also. The project should complete on time because many businessmen are ready to invest. The Supply chain and services should be reliable from both countries’ policies. It’s a good way for Pakistan to hand over this project to the Army of Pakistan. All routes should be connected with CPEC routes where security issues should be sure for businessmen. Small-scale business should be provided from the Pakistani side.

A Proper Organized Way of Transportation and Communications
Transportation services should be given to businessmen to save their time and fare. All security protections should be compulsory for businessmen. Agricultural sectors are important for CPEC so all basic niceties should provide them in the sense of transportation. Easy loan schemes are useful way if given to businessmen. Cultural values should maintain in every type of innovation. No need to cross cultural boundaries. Avoid talking about any anti-religious activity.

Law and Order Implication
Need to improve the law and order situation in Pakistan for the satisfaction of businessmen. Gwadar is situated in Baluchistan province which is sensitive regarding security issues. Pakistani government and army should apply their rules to serious biases need. Much propaganda on social media was roaming which is little danger for businessmen.

Cultural Limitations Compulsory
There is no need to think about any uncertainty but locals and nationalist leader should be taken in confidence for the safety of CPEC. Many locals and nationals are feeling insecurity so officials should brief them in detail. Meanwhile, locals and nationalists will support this Gwadar port. The need for monitoring in different aspects is also compulsory for the future safety of CPEC. Improvement and provision of basic facilities for the project should be important. Many facilities like electricity, purification of water, provisions of hospitals and good housing structure are much important. Many basic needs of life like eating stuff production are required on the route of CPEC. No need to rely on electricity in Iran, the source should be owned for the security of success.
The Local Community Should be Involved in Projects
The creation of new jobs should mainly be maintained and banned from dissident organizations, especially concerning the route of CPEC. Local people of Baluchistan should take on confident local people will get more chances for jobs and no anti-religion activity can be done regarding CPEC. Students organization should be banned who are influencing innocent people against the project’s activity. A peaceful environment is needed for this project.

Reference
CGTN TV 2019.
Govt of Pakistan data 2019.
Miemsie Stey, JO B, Kamper J Our voice counts Adolescents' view on their future in South Africa December 200930(2):169-188, DOI: 10.4314/saje.v30i2.55480
Modelling Cost of Quality for Defect Reduction

*Ijaz Yusuf,* Operations and Supply Chain Department, Dr Hasan Murad School of Management, University of Management and Technology, Lahore, Pakistan

*Tashfeen M. Azhar,* Operations and Supply Chain Department, Dr Hasan Murad School of Management, University of Management and Technology, Lahore, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email: ijaz.yusuf@umt.edu.pk

**ARTICLE DETAILS**

**History**
Revised format: May 2022
Available Online: Jun 2022

**Keywords**
Quality Costs, System Dynamics, Defect Reduction, Simulated Model.

**JEL Classification**
L10, L19

**ABSTRACT**

**Purpose:** This paper aims to develop the simulated computer model of cost of quality unveiling the underlying cognitive schemes based on case company under study. Normalized value of the defect percentage depicts the cost of non-conformance. System dynamics model is the result of balancing and reinforcing loops and their interactions. That makes the system dynamics model more robust and realistic.

**Design/Methodology/Approach:** Feedback notion and block diagram is developed to capture the real-world setting. The simulation software STELLA is used for programming the model.

**Findings:** Cost of Quality is a forgotten dimension in many companies. Most of the companies are not measuring the cost of quality as a powerful indicator for quality measurement and for process improvement. Defect level is the function of prevention, appraisal and failures (PAF) costs associated with the PAF model. System Dynamics is computer-based simulation methodology that gains the insight of the social, economic, and business problems and acts as a powerful tool for policy design for better decision making.

**Implications/Originality/Value:** Policy analysis clearly indicate that dynamics of cost of quality is quite complex and to identify the prioritized parameter for investment cannot be intuitively appreciated. System dynamics is a simulation-based methodology which can solve the complex interactions and different policy runs lead to the best appropriate mix of cost elements in order to reduce the failure costs (internal and external).

© 2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-4.0


**Introduction**

System dynamics research has made numerous contributions in the sub-fields of management like marketing operations, quality, finance, supply chain and organization behavior. The system dynamics is a method to depict, model and simulate (Grobler et al., 2008) corporate problems to gain the insight of the problem under study and propose some alternative solutions for problem resolution. Broadly
speaking the cybernetics, feedback concepts and control engineering are applied to economics, business and organizational systems (Din & Cheema, 2013) to have in-depth knowledge of the problem under study and understand the underlying structures. The aim of this research paper is to model the cost of quality and keep on experimenting with the model to analyze the effect of cost of conformance on reduction of internal failures and external failures. Efforts are made to determine the appropriate parametric values that lower the defect level over a period of time.

William Edwards Deming (Yusuf & Azhar, 2011) says “quality is a predictable degree of uniformity and dependability suited to the market at lowest cost”. Quality is in its essence a way of managing the organization (Feigenbaum, 1991) and quality is meeting the customer requirements (Besterfield, 1999). There is a management dictum that quality and productivity go side by side this a fact known to few. Productivity and complement of productivity (waste) are the reciprocal to each other. Poor quality means defects, rework and defectives that lowers the profitability of the organization. In order to reduce the defect level and to improve their processes; companies acquire quality certifications like product quality management system (ISO 9001), environmental management system (ISO 14001) and many others are used along with quality improvement initiatives like 5S, Total quality control, total productivity maintenance, and six sigma approaches. The ultimate goal is process improvement and defect reduction in operations.

**Background and Literature Review**

Cost of quality is the way to measure the health of quality system and to translate quality elements and quality practices in financial terms right from the idea conception to product development and making a saleable finished product demanded by the customer (Yusuf & Azhar, 2011). Several quality tools like graphs, pareto chart, scatter diagram, Ishikawa diagram, flow graphs, histogram and control charts (Moosa, 2000) are used to determine the implementation of the quality system. Cost of quality depicts the effectiveness of the quality system. In literature it is found that there is obvious correlation in maturity of the quality system and distribution of the various cost elements (Sower et al., 2007) fall into the major four heads prevention cost, appraisal cost, internal failure costs and external failure cost in figure 8. Inter-linkages, inter-relation and inter-dependence of elements of cost of conformance and cost of non-conformance are so complex that an ordinary methodology cannot handle such complexities. There is a need to develop the model of cost of quality to analyze the cost factors and its effect on defect reduction. Model is going to address the following research questions:

**RQ -1**

Do the cost factors affect the cost of conformance and cost of non-conformance?

**RQ - 2**

Is there any role of cost of conformance and cost of non-conformance for defect reduction?

System Dynamics is a computer-based method that can be used to enhance understanding of quality costs and improve learning (Sterman, 2007). Father of System Dynamics, Jay Forrester defines system dynamics as a methodology that starts with important problems, comes to understand the structures that produce undesirable symptoms, and moves on to finding changes in structure and policy that would make a system better behaved. System Dynamics is a guiding philosophy to analyze the dynamic behavior of model in terms of its feedback mechanisms (Yusuf & Azhar 2018). It is a method of dealing with questions about dynamic tendencies of complex systems, that is, the behavior patterns they generate over time (Meadows et al., 1994). System dynamics has been applied in many disciplines and many subject areas (Scott et al. 2015). In all disciplines below mentioned modeling protocol is used that starts from conceptual to technical (Hafeez, Maitlo, Lashari, & Rehman, 2021). The modeling protocol is described by Sabuncuoglu et al. (2015) is mentioned below:
Table 1. SD Modelling Protocol from Conceptual to Technical

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stages</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Nature</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Stage 1</td>
<td>Problem Statement</td>
<td>Conceptual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stage 2</td>
<td>Causal Loop Diagram</td>
<td>Conceptual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stage 3</td>
<td>Stock and Flow Diagram</td>
<td>Technical</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stage 4</td>
<td>Model Simulation and Policy Design</td>
<td>Technical</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Zagonal (2002) has mentioned heuristics of System Dynamics shown in Figure 1. It is a mixed method having the reflection of qualitative and quantitative techniques for policy formulation. System Dynamics modeling protocol shown in Table 1 guides to depict and develop the model in STELLA as shown in Figure 9. The dedicated efforts are made to identify the cost elements related to costs of quality and on the basis of system components model boundary is defined (Forrester 1968) comprehending all the costs which are linked with Prevention, Appraisal and Failures (PAF) model. The interactions of the cost components generate mode of behavior that leads to the determination of the defect level.

Diagramming Notation for Stocks and Flows
Building blocks of the block diagram are stock and flows. Stock is a system state represented by rectangle to reflect the condition or holding content at particular point in time (Sterman, 2000). Flows are the just like the valves that control inflow and outflow of stock. Feedback structure can be represented by block diagrams (George P. Richardson, 1986).

Model Structure and Behavior
Case Study
ABC Packaging was established in 1957 to cater growing needs of packaging of goods. The focus of company has been to develop innovative products so as to offer best packaging solutions to her national and multinational clientele. One of the major emphases is on import substitution and in this
regard ABC Packaging has been able to develop sister companies’ paper and board mill and ink factory to get the consistent quality of the major raw materials of the packaging products of carton line. To meet the national and multinational customers’ requirement, ABC Packaging has to acquire the compliances demanded by the customers. In the initial years of the company, ABC Packaging has got certification of Quality Management System ISO 9001, Environmental Management System ISO 14001 and Occupational Health and Safety System ISO 45001. Company has started numerous quality programs (Van & Pretorius, 2014) on the request of loyal customer, like Business Enabler Survey Tools, Total Preventive Maintenance, Zero Defect Supplies and Globe. These quality programs are the supplier evaluation criteria of world class companies like British American Tobacco, Pakistan Tobacco, Unilever Pakistan and Nestle.

The Cost of Quality is another quality initiative that the company under study has started at its own to monitor and measure the cost of conformance and cost of non-conformance see the figure 8 hierarchy of cost of quality. The company costs are divided into four major heads Prevention, Appraisal, Internal Failures and External Failures that determine the certain defect level. The one-year data of the carton line of ABC Packaging company has been taken to develop the perception maps (graphical functions) between prevention costs versus External failures costs, Prevention costs and internal failures cost. The effect of prevention cost on external failures and internal failures is measured and mapped. The effect of appraisal costs on internal failures and external failures is measured from the company past historical data and mapped developing using non-linear table function. Average value of the defect level is measured in defective sheets that are 66000 sheets per month showing waste percentage around 5.5 percent. To establish the initial conditions of the cost elements related to prevention cost, appraisal cost, internal failure cost and external failure costs average values of five years. The normalized values of company data have been taken to hide the proprietary information of the company under study.

Feedback Structure
STELLA is the simulation software that was used for computer simulation and the model of cost of quality contains 51 variables, 2 stocks, 3 flows, 46 convertors, 34 constants, 4 graphical functions and 15 equations. The system dynamics model is result of positive and negative feedback loops and model behavior is the outcome of the loops interactions (Lane, 2007). The model is the 2nd order differential equation with associated flows (Forrester, 1968), having two stocks; one stock represents cost of quality and the second stock represents defect level. 2\textsuperscript{nd} order differential equation displays the oscillatory waveform but it is interesting to know the mode of behavior is represented by straight lines depicting the actual story of the company having zero Eigen values. The reason is stock of cost of quality acts as a convertor just give us the cumulative value of cost of quality only the summation of cost of conformance and cost of non-conformance. Positive loops and negative loops are given as below:

**The reinforcing loops are:**

![Figure 2: CONC and Defect Level Loop](image-url)
Defect Level

Figure 3: COC and Defect Level Loop

The balancing loops are:

Figure 4: Prevention Costs and Internal Failure Costs Loop

Figure 5: Prevention Costs and External Failure Costs Loop

Figure 6: Appraisal Costs and Internal Failure Costs Loop

Figure 7: Appraisal Costs and External Failure Costs Loop

Figure 8 shows the hierarchy of the cost of quality where it is divided into two broad cost categories. Cost of Conformance and Cost of Non-Conformance. Cost of Conformance further sub-categories into Prevention Costs and Appraisal Costs (Kiani, 2009) whereas the cost of non-conformance comprises external failure costs and internal failure costs. Literature review indicates that cost of
Conformance always reduces the defect percentage and cost of non-conformance increases defect level. As per the description of PAF model there is optimal defect level where the curve of cost of conformance and cost of non-conformance interact and that point is acceptable quality level (AQL).

Reinforcing Loops are shown in Figure 2 and Figure 3. It has been observed the higher the costs of conformance mean lower the defect percentage as a result there is pressure on the management to spend more on the cost of conformance in terms of prevention costs and appraisal costs to reduce the defect level further. That forms the positive loops which is going to reinforce the defect level reaching to its lowest as the cost of conformance is increasing day by day. Higher value of costs of non-conformances is an indicator of higher defect level that shaken the confidence of the management to invest on cost of conformance consequently further increase in internal failure and external failures pile up the stock of defect level.

Figure 4 and Figure 5 form the balancing loops to make it obvious that investment in prevention costs is not a futile activity; it contributes in the reduction of internal failure costs and external failure costs. The company data shown in Figure 4, Figure 5, Figure 6 and Figure 7 represent the balancing loops to show the effect of appraisal costs on internal failure costs and external failure costs. The company data captures the mental model that ultimately ends up in level and rate diagram as the graphical functions. The effect of prevention costs and appraisal costs is observed on internal failure costs and external failure costs. This effect is translated in the form of ratios without hurting true slope of the curve that appears as table functions which is used as a multiplier to gauge its effect.

Higher the prevention costs mean lower the internal failure as well as external failure and reduced costs of internal failure and external failure is a motivating factor for management to spend more on prevention costs as mentioned in Figure 4 and Figure 5. Similarly, the investment in appraisal costs decreased the costs of internal failures and external failures consequently more investment will be encouraged to reduce the non-conforming items and products from the system shown in Figure 6 and Figure 7.

Figure 8 Hierarchy of the Cost of Quality
Model Validation
Model represents the external reality and its structure express the close resemblance of real-world situation. The behaviour generated by the model during simulation run must be close to the real-world setting (Pidd, 2010) to build the confidence and to establish its validity. Fore model calibration and validity, father of system dynamic Jay Forrester has highlighted details of tests for model validation (Forrester & Senge, 1980, Sterman, 2007). From the list of tests, few have been selected and used for model testing and validation.

Dimensional Consistency
Dimensional Consistency in the system dynamics model means the verification and checking of unit of measure of all parameters in the model equations are balanced and reflect the real world settings (Forrester & Senge, 1980, Qudrat-Ullah, 2010, Yusuf & Azhar, 2018).
Structure Verification

The structure of the cost of quality of company under study represents the structure of the simulated model. Quality Assurance Manager has incorporated all the cost elements of company in SAP: the enterprise resource planning system (ERP) to get the monthly data regularly for analysis purpose. Pareto chart, fishbone diagram and histogram are the supporting statistical tools used for analysis purpose. It is interesting to know that almost all cost components of PAF model and sub cost elements exist in literature (Qutrat-Ullah, 2008). See the table 2 for details.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables/Structures/Concepts</th>
<th>Sources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Extreme Condition Verification

Extreme Condition Verification test is used to assess behaviour of the model structure for the chosen parameters for justification of extreme condition (Qudrat-Ullah, 2008, Sterman, 2007, Forrester & Senge, 1980, Forrester, 1987) and exhibit the realistic pattern. In our case when appraisal cost and prevention cost is zero there is only cost of non-conformance. This is tested and evaluated substituting the values.

Parametric Verification

Parameter verification tells us how to compare values of the model parameters to the actual values of case company (Forrester & Senge, 1980). The data is normalized for company secrecy purpose.

Boundary Adequacy Test

Boundary adequacy test discusses the policy related issues of the model (Qudrat-Ullah, 2010, Sterman, 2007, Forrester & Senge, 1980). It identifies endogenous and exogenous variables. In our model the list of variables is mentioned in Table 3.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables/Structures/Concepts</th>
<th>Sources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Prevention Cost</td>
<td>Defect Level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost of Conformance</td>
<td>Cost of Non-conformance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost of Quality</td>
<td>Cost of Quality</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Behavior Reproduction Test

This test is being conducted for checking and assessing the real-world behavior with the model behavior unless there is some significant anomalies (Sterman, 2007, Qudrat-Ullah & Seong, 2010)

Historical pattern of the various parameters of ABC Packaging Company like defect level and cost of quality qualify this test. Change in cost elements correspondingly bring change in the related
parameters. Increase in appraisal cost or prevention cost reduces the defect level and increase in internal failure or external failure cost increases the defect level.

Policy Analysis
Experimentation in the simulation modeling is the key component for policy formulation. Various behavioral patterns are the outcome of the scenario analysis. Comparison between base run values and policy runs indicates the level of change due to existing policy intervention and new policy formulation (Saeed, 1991). Simulation software STELLA provides interactive environment for model development, analysis and policy exploration. Equilibrium state of the model is achieved using defect level increase fraction and defect level decrease fraction as a multiplier of rate equations of the defect level stock. Base run graphs have been observed in Graph 1 and Graph 2 values are mentioned in Table 4.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 4 Base Run Values and Assumptions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Appraisal Costs</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Base Run Values</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First Assumption</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second Assumption</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Base run values shown in the table 4 indicates the values of for the base year showing the equilibrium state. At that base year the defective sheets per month are 66 thousand. Look at the option 1, our assumption is focusing the prevention costs instead of appraisal costs that is why we have taken the value of all elements of appraisal cost equal to zero and we have seen its impact. Interestingly the cost of quality as gone done, internal failure costs have gone up from 46 k to 91k and defective sheets have increased tremendously over a period of 17 years from 66 thousand to 159 million. That indicates our internal system of the company is more tuned to inspection-oriented and removal of appraisal costs have serious impact of the productivity of the company under study. Increase in external failure costs from 50 k to 93 k indicates the higher level of customer dis-satisfaction that may appear in terms of order reduction or cancellation of the existing orders.

![Graph 1 Base Run value of Cost of Quality](image_url)

505
Our second assumption was measuring the impact if the prevention cost is zero. This option is even worse than the first one in this defective sheet have gone highest from 159 million to 629 million sheets indicates the higher values of internal and external failures. Internal failure cost from 49 k to 249 k kills the bottom-line productivity and rising external failure cost from 50 k to 241 k. That
causes dis-satisfaction of the customer and consequently reduces customer loyalty with company. That indicates that considering only one area either prevention costs and appraisal cost is not the wise decision, mix of both is a reduce the better option for the company management. See graphs 5 and graph 6

Experimentation with the model give further insight, few policy interventions have been modeled to see the behaviour of the model. Table 5 presents the following outcomes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Policy Interventions / Design</th>
<th>Appraisal Costs</th>
<th>Prevention Costs</th>
<th>Internal Failure Costs</th>
<th>External Failure Costs</th>
<th>Cost of Quality</th>
<th>Defective Level (Sheets)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Base Run Values</td>
<td>190 k</td>
<td>461 k</td>
<td>46 k</td>
<td>50 k</td>
<td>149 M</td>
<td>66k</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Policy Run 1 SPC Implementation</strong></td>
<td><strong>190 k</strong></td>
<td><strong>462 k</strong></td>
<td><strong>46 k</strong></td>
<td><strong>50 k</strong></td>
<td><strong>149 M</strong></td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Policy Run 2 Quality Program</strong></td>
<td><strong>191 k</strong></td>
<td><strong>461 k</strong></td>
<td><strong>46 k</strong></td>
<td><strong>49 k</strong></td>
<td><strong>149 M</strong></td>
<td><strong>0 at 38.5 months</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality Inspection</td>
<td>189.5 k</td>
<td>461 k</td>
<td>46 k</td>
<td>50 k</td>
<td>149 M</td>
<td>586 k</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Policy Run 3 Salary Increase of Quality Inspector</strong></td>
<td><strong>190.5 k</strong></td>
<td><strong>461 k</strong></td>
<td><strong>46 k</strong></td>
<td><strong>49 k</strong></td>
<td><strong>149 M</strong></td>
<td><strong>0 at 40 months</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Policy Run 4 Salary Decrease in Quality Inspector</strong></td>
<td><strong>189.5 k</strong></td>
<td><strong>461 k</strong></td>
<td><strong>46 k</strong></td>
<td><strong>50 k</strong></td>
<td><strong>149 M</strong></td>
<td>586 k</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Policy Run 5</strong></td>
<td><strong>191 k</strong></td>
<td><strong>462 k</strong></td>
<td><strong>46 k</strong></td>
<td><strong>49 k</strong></td>
<td><strong>150 M</strong></td>
<td><strong>0 at 27</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Policy Run 1 SPC Implementation

Statistical Process Control (SPC) implementation is based on prevention cost. Objective of this policy design is to strengthen the process control tools and techniques in the system as a preventive measure. My pre-simulation prediction is it will reduce the cost of quality and defect level immediately as soon as we implemented these tools and techniques. But the results are contrary to my pre-simulation prediction. Cost of quality remains same; defect level has gone down not immediately but over the period of time of 200 months. The gradual reduction in the defect level has increased the level of customer satisfaction and created positive impact of company productivity.

Understanding of statistical process control (SPC) tools and techniques is based on employee attitude and learning curve. Motivation level of employees and their involvement in the learning process took years to absorb the true concepts of SPC as a result the improvement is just like stair-case function slow, gradual but permanent holding the gain. In this policy the two test functions STEP and RAMP are used. After fifteen months, there is an increase of Rupees 500 using step function and every month there is increase of 10% using the RAMP function. Table 9 indicates that effect of these two test functions; five hundred rupees per month increase in statistical control process tools generate increase in prevention cost around 462 k and reduction in defect level 66000 defective sheets to zero over the period of 175 month. See graph 7 and graph 8.
Policy Run 2 Quality Program
Policy Run 2 Quality Program is designed on the basis of appraisal costs. Quality Programs like 5S, Quality Management System ISO 9001 and any other quality initiative not only creates the quality culture but also continuously assessed and audited using quality auditing practice. This parameter is prioritized in nature because the company gradually wants to change its focus from quality inspection to built-in quality (quality by production). Test function STEP is used to increase the Rupees five hundred every month for this any quality program, interestingly there is no reduction of cost of quality but defect level has decreased significantly from 66000 to zero at the time of 38.5 months. Graph 9 and Graph 10 indicate the defect level and cost of quality for the policy run 2. Application of any quality program helps to boost the company image as a result the perceived quality of the product is higher leading to enhanced customer satisfaction level.

Policy Run 3 Salary Rise of Quality Inspector
Salary of the Quality Inspector is one of the key sub-elements of appraisal cost. Assessment, judgement and auditing are the main characteristics of the quality inspector. The third world countries where the education level is low, employees are not properly trained and groomed for quality methods and highest level of frustration prevails within the company culture; quality inspector plays a vital role to ensure the quality of product while auditing and assessing during the production process. Incoming material supplies are inspected with respect to the raw material specifications and material
safety data sheets (MSDS); saleable products at the time of dispatch are evaluated as per finished product specifications.

Motivation of quality inspector is very much dependent on extrinsic variable employee salary. Rise in salary of quality inspector enhance the motivation level of quality staff and its impact appear on the defect level. Table 5 indicates that defect level has decreased from 66000 sheets to zero at the month of 40 whereas the cost of quality remains same 149 million. See the graph 11 and graph 12 for more details.

![Policy Run 3 Defect Level](image1)

**Graph 11 Policy Run 3 Salary Rise of Quality Inspector and Defect Level**

![Policy Run 3 Cost of Quality](image2)

**Graph 12 Policy Run 3 Salary Rise of Quality Inspector and Cost of Quality**

**Policy Run 4 Salary Decrease of Quality Inspector**

It is surprising to know that decrease in salary of quality inspector worsen the case. Highest level of demotivation stops all the activities of the quality inspector and incoming material kept lying days after days in incoming inspection area and posting of the good receipt notes are delayed enhancing the lead time of the raw materials. During the production process, quality inspector not visiting the operations and no control measure are initiating; consequently, there is significant rise in the defect level from 66 k to 586 k whereas the cost of quality remains same see the table 9 and graph 13 and graph 14 for more details. Even the things being assessed and judged are half-heartedly. Salary of the
Quality Inspector is the part of appraisal cost. Assessment, judgement and auditing are the main characteristics of the quality inspector.

Policy Run 5 Combining Policy 1, 2 and 3
Policy run 5 is combination of policy 1, policy 2 and policy 3, the impact of these three policies quite visible on defect level. The defect level becomes zero at the time 27 month almost after 2 and half year highlighted in table 5. Cost of conformance comprising prevention cost and appraisal cost has gone up consequently cost of quality has also increased. See the graph 15 and graph 16.
Conclusion
Different policy runs highlights that cost of quality in corporate sector is forgotten dimension and policy intervention and policy design is the complex phenomena. Decision regarding investment can be fruitful only if we propose the policies on the basis of simulated computer model comprehending the various elements of cost of quality. The company can set any plan for the defect reduction from current level to proposed new key performance indicator (KPIs) (Syed, Rehman, Ali, & Ramish, 2021) and keep on experimenting with the model to identify the areas under the umbrella of appraisal costs and prevention costs which can generate the reduction in defect level and reduce the cost of quality. Feedback loops depict the explicit and tacit knowledge about the system (Akbar, Muzaffar, & Rehman, 2012), explores the prioritized parameters either related to prevention costs and appraisal costs over a period of time. This paper highlights that on the basis of existing model; Cost of Quality simulator (game based on this model) can be developed for educational purpose and it can also be used for consultancy assignments to reduce the defect level that ultimately determines the sigma score of the company (Pyzdek & Keller, 2010).

References


Grobler et al. (2008) System dynamics as a structural theory in operations management, Production and Operations Management Vol. 17, No.3


Lane, C. David (2007) “The power of the bond between cause and effect: Jay Wright Forrester and the field of system dynamics” System Dynamics Review Vol. 23 No. 2-3 Summer/Fall 2007


Richmond, Barry (1993), Systems Thinking: critical thinking skills for the 1990 and beyond Systems Dynamics Review Vol 9 No. 2 (Summer 1993)


Sabuncuoglu et al.,(2015), Industrial Engineering Applications in Emerging Countries published by CRC Press, Taylor and Francis Group


Scale Development to Measure Creating Shared Value adoption as a Strategy in the Developing Countries

Mubashar Majeed Qadri, Ph.D. Scholar, University of Management & Technology, Lahore, Pakistan
Maqbool Hussain Sial, Professor (Chairperson Department of Quantitative Methods, Director CGR), University of Management & Technology, Lahore, Pakistan

* Corresponding author’s email address: mubashar_qadri@hotmail.com

**ARTICLE DETAILS**

**History**
Revised format: May 2022
Available Online: Jun 2022

**Keywords**
Creating Shared Value, Instrument Development, Organizational Longevity, Corporate Social Responsibility, Business & Society

**JEL Classification**
M1, M2

**ABSTRACT**

**Purpose:** “Capitalist system is under siege” is the signal that businesses are going to lose legitimacy and ultimately survival is under question. However, “Creating shared value” (CSV), a resolute solution for organizations is proposed, and overwhelming organizations claim to have adopted CSV. However, in the absence of a standard for CSV success, yearly financial and sustainability reports are presented to validate such claims. Therefore, a yardstick is needed to determine whether companies have implemented CSV as a key strategy. To verify this claim, a scale is proposed to measure the level of adoption of CSV.

**Design/Methodology/Approach:** An interview protocol was created for data collection from CSV adopters. Twenty interviews were conducted with 15 informants coming from 10 shortlisted organizations.

**Findings:** The interview data were transcribed and analyzed to extract the key and sub-themes. A total of 58 items were generated with the help of five experts, and an average score of 0.859 on the S-CVI (scale level content validity index) is achieved with a Kappa (K) coefficient of 0.810.

**Implications/Originality/Value:** So, it is concluded that this instrument will help to differentiate CSV adopters and those who involve in CSR projects. As a future direction, instrument testing and scale evaluation are designed.

© 2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-4.0


**Introduction**
The opening statement that the “Capitalist system is under siege” by Porter and Kramer (2011) in their landmark article in which they presented the idea of “Creating shared value” (CSV), got
overwhelming attention from scholars. The statement got attention because of the alarming signal that today’s business is going to lose its legitimacy and ultimately its survival and longevity are under question. It is also important that both Porter and Kramer (2011) argued to reinvent capitalism because when a business collapses, it has an aggregated impact not only on business but on society as a whole as well. Therefore, both authors anticipated a resolute solution and direction in the form of CSV. They argued that earlier tools like corporate social responsibility (CSR) are mainly used for corporate branding (Mahmood, Niazi, Asghar, & Hussain, 2021; Pratihari & Uzma, 2018), establishing legitimacy (Johansen & Nielsen, 2012), competitive advantage (Sohail, Iqbal, Asghar, & Haider, 2020; Yu, Kuo, & Kao, 2017), and improving performance (Singh & Misra, 2021), but the focus is little on the well-being of society, fixing societal issues, and creating value for society. They proposed a solution and argued that innovation and restoring the missing link between business & society (B&S) can be done if organizations adopt CSV as a central strategy to connect the profit orientation of businesses with social rationales and it can offer a design for a new business model that can tackle the legitimacy issue the contemporary businesses are confronting.

However, the adoption of CSV is not as simple as presented by the authors as a lack of conceptual coherence and diverse opinions fragmented the CSV literature. It becomes hard to identify the success or failure of CSV as a concept or strategy. The cheery-picking success stories of adoption of CSV by organizations are reported as contributions of CSV, which is misleading as in such stories, the CSV as a strategy is highlighted as a sole explanation for such success (Dembek, Singh, & Bhakoo, 2015). The success stories are portrayed from a specific CSV lens by the “Shared Value Initiative” – an initiative of Porter and Kramer’s business consultancy “Foundation Strategy Group” – that welcomes businesses to apply the CSV in practice (Beschorner & Hajduk, 2017). It is also argued that organizations adopted CSV as a business strategy for strategic signaling with the aim that it addresses both social and environmental issues simultaneously, but the main motive behind such strategic move is to use CSV as a shield against criticism to address ethical dilemmas faced by the organizations due to the ‘bad business practices’ or some inherent negative impact their products have on society (like Tobacco) (Crane, Palazzo, Spence, & Matten, 2014). Another trend is reported in the literature in which the organizations tend to upgrade their CSR programs to CSV strategies (Kaplan, Serafeim, & Tugendhat, 2018) and therefore the organizations are unable to produce potential impact and as a result, CSV bears the criticism. It is also found that the annual financial and sustainability reporting of various activities of such organizations has just changed the title from CSR to CSV and nothing else. Therefore, it is critical to have a yardstick to identify whether organizations have adopted the CSV as a core strategy. In the presence of competing constructs like CSR, Bottom of the Pyramid (BOP), etc. and it is critical to make a crystal-clear distinction between whether organizations have adopted CSV as a strategy or philanthropic and CSR activities are camouflage with CSV cover. To find the answer to this question, the current study is conducted to determine the status of the adoption of the CSV strategy. Secondary data or survey data may predict whether a strategic tool is adopted by an organization or not. Similarly, a questionnaire is necessary to forecast the status of CSV adoption; however, the questionnaire development is a difficult, yet lengthy procedure composed of three phases, i.e., item development, scale development, and scale evaluation. However, in the current study, only the first step i.e., the dimensions and item generation, as well as content validity, are considered.

**Literature Review**

**Organizational Longevity**

Longevity which is primarily concerned with the length of existence of organizations in years is the biggest common challenge for companies (Martin & Lisanne, 2015). Organizations have a limited lifetime as the average life span shrinks to 18 years by 2016 from 61 years in 1958 and which is further projected to fall to only 12 years by 2027 (Gilbert, Eyring, & Foster, 2013). Boston Consulting Group’s (BCG) findings and indices of the S&P and Fortune 500 companies are not only
indicative but also validate the perception that business lifespan is shrinking as the average life of an organization dropped from 60 years in 1970 to 30 years in 2010 (Martin & Lisanne, 2015). The reasons for the low life expectancy of organizations — of a collapse to suffer — are well-reported and one can identify various patterns causative to the declining lifespan. These reasons are mergers & acquisitions, bankruptcy, closures & sell-off, liquidation, and many more (Martinez, Zouaghri, Marco, & Robinson, 2019). The uncontrollable factors like government regulations, financial crisis, socio-economic jolts, regional characteristics, market dynamics, etc. are also very influential and affect the organizations’ longevity (Lagares, Ordaz, & del Hoyo, 2018).

A long list of reasons that contributed to the low lifespan of organizations can be summarized into two broad facets i.e., lack of innovation ambidexterity and distorted links and connectivity between organizations’ internal and external environments. Porter and Kramer (2011) also contributed and recognized that the missing or deteriorating link between B&S is also a threat to business survival and urged organizations to change the way of conducting business to re-establish the link. Both added their voices to those who asked organizations for transformation, innovation, and reinvent a link between organizations and their environment for enlarging business lifespan. According to Bertolini, Duncan, and Waldeck (2015), no business could survive for a longer period without reinventing and transforming. A large majority of executives of large enterprises (80%) recognized that for long-term sustainability, transformation in businesses is a must (Bertolini et al., 2015). To achieve many potential benefits of CSV, both Porter and Kramer (2011) proposed three strategies to relink the B&S through reconceiving products and markets, redefining productivity in the value chain, and enabling local cluster development. The strategies demand the scanning of internal and external environments to serve better in the existing markets or to explore new opportunities to sell its current products as well as to serve new markets. Such demand from the current or new market can drive a new wave of exploration and exploitation and for some scholars, the exploration and exploitation can boost the longevity of organizations (Kim & Huh, 2015; Riviezzo, Skippari, & Garofano, 2015). In addition to this, the distorted link between B&S is a great challenge for the longevity of the organization and if it can be addressed through exploration and exploitation, then it means the link between B&S can be bridged because of one common denominator that is shared value between the B&S which can easily be nullified among multiple stakeholders and society by negotiating the meaning of shared value (Høvring, 2017).

**CSV as a Core Strategy**

Porter and Kramer (2006, 2011) are the first who coined the CSV term. According to them, the CSV is the “[…] policies and operating practices that enhance the competitiveness of a company while simultaneously advancing economic and social conditions in the communities in which it operates. Shared value creation focuses on identifying and expanding the connections between societal and economic progress (p. 6)”. Both authors emphasized that CSV focuses mainly to connect social as well as economic progress as it can unleash the next wave of global economic expansion by developing strategies that create new opportunities for profit and benefit to society. According to Menghwar and Daood (2021), unlike competing constructs, CSV has an additional dimension that emphasized integrate it as a corporate strategy in responding to societal problems, which we define as how companies might fix societal problems pertinent to their value chain while still maximizing their profits. In their respective works, Porter and Kramer (2011) emphasized the CSV's importance as a new means of achieving both economic and social improvement, therefore, it must not be at the border of what companies do or taken as an addendum, but rather at the center of their strategy to ensure the well-being of both social and environmental domains. Both urged to achieve the required benefits of CSV, it is imperative to make CSV a central part of the strategy. However, the impediment to making CSV a core strategy is due to blurring distinction with interrelated constructs from their inventors and their proponent who viewed CSV as a catchphrase, or a buzzword against (Beschorner & Hajduk, 2017; Crane et al., 2014; Dembek et al., 2015; Visser, 2013). Such historical
criticism adds complexity and confusion to the concept's meaning and importance. To ease the complexity of CSV, scholars of various domains and perspectives have studied, discussed, and criticized from diverse viewpoints, contexts, markets, and nature of the businesses (Moon, Pare, Yim, & Park, 2011). Some scholars tried to explain, expand, or revamp the CSV concept (Glauner, 2019). Some focused on its applicability (Ilmarinen & Akpinar, 2018; Islam & Hossain, 2019). According to Beschorner and Hajduk (2017), the idea that CSV can be used as a business strategy is flimsy and more vulnerable to criticism. Responding to this criticism, both Kramer and Pfister (2016) argued that no doubt, businesses are facing several challenges and have to scan social issues for business opportunities additionally all social issues could not be converted into a business opportunity, but it is not a hurdle or excuse to adopt CSV as a business strategy. When it is said that strategy is always about making choices, and businesses are asked to choose CSV as strategy, then there is no difference at all as it is about choosing which social issues to focus on and to address those social issues, various tracks are provided by Porter and Kramer (2011) which organizations need to opt. The choice of strategy is dependent on the close alignment of business with the external environment. In this interaction and relationship, strategy serves as a medium that facilitates organizational success and guides the organization to attain a competitive edge over competitors. Several apt typologies or frameworks about strategies for organizations have been proposed in the literature to investigate the dynamism of interaction of organizations with their competitive environment (Shortell & Zajac, 1990) to get a unique answer to a common question “what course of action is appropriate in a current business scenario?”. Due to dissimilarity in approach regarding how to react environment, the pattern of adopting different strategies is also not the same among businesses. A company can identify the societal issues that it is most suited to help address and from which it can earn the most competitive advantage. Both Porter and Kramer (2011) argued that CSV as a new mental paradigm is needed for businesses to maintain their competitive advantage as it has the power and potential to be a new mental model and perform its function. That is the reason, both authors are suggesting that the companies must acknowledge first the pivotal role of CSV in their strategic decision-making because to achieve a goal, a company must first identify its distinct positioning and then develop an appropriate value chain to support it. A similar argument is provided by Reyes, Scholz, and Smith (2017), who argued that there are two possible outcomes: win-win or lose-lose for the businesses involved. B&S can both benefit from the first option, which provides a win-win situation for everyone, whereas in the second option, profit is made at the expense of society, or the other way around. Three tracks are proposed by Porter and Kramer (2011) to implement it.

**Reconceiving Products and Markets**

In the first track to extract the benefits of CSV, businesses have to reconceive products and markets for "serving disadvantaged communities" and "satisfying unmet social needs", by improving their quality of life. The main goal for the companies in the absence of any other options is either redesign items to match new demands or implement distribution strategies that are significantly different from those commonly used in the conventional market. In this way, the organizations would be able to not only assist society but also create a stronger customer base for themselves as well.

**Redefining Productivity in the Value Chain**

Every company in addition to having fundamental operations along with support activities has an established and well-developed value chain. In a value chain that has several tiers, each needing a certain number of resources, chances to produce shared value occur due to the economic impact that social issues might have on each tier. The second track to create shared value consists of an evaluation of value chain productivity in terms of energy use, logistics, resource utilization, and procurement as well as distribution and location. The value chain of a company affects and is affected, by several societal problems. These problems might have a negative impact on the value chains of businesses and can create costs therefore, the opportunity for CSV is opened. The authors' concept of "shared value" basically entails using resources, energy, suppliers, and employees in
different ways than what is currently being done. Both authors have recognized major categories in which significant improvements can be made for both the company and society.

**Energy Use and Logistic**
Some significant energy use is required in the value chain and transportation processes. Using the shared value approach, the companies can reexamine their core processes to see if there are ways to save energy. In recent years, the cost of using energy has risen sharply, not only for the company but also for the environment. The company and the environment can both benefit from reducing waste. Better usage of energy could be achieved as a consequence of the company's superior technology, recycling, as well as other actions that add value to its stock.

**Resources Use**
Many large corporations use enormous amounts of natural resources, such as water. Resources like these are not only becoming scarcer, but they also pose a social problem in many places. In the authors' view, more efficient use of resources is necessary, and this issue permeates the entire value chain.

**Procurement**
Third parties, such as suppliers, also play a role in the value chain. Cost-cutting is a priority for every organization, for that purpose, the organizations might think to move operations to another site or exert a strong negotiation position over the vendors they work with. Even though this approach isn't sustainable in the long run, businesses are coming to recognize that disadvantaged suppliers can't remain competitive and sustain a high standard over time. It is possible to empower suppliers and thus improve the quality and quantity of the products they supply, all through the use of the shared value approach. As a result, productivity will rise, and prices will fall.

**Employee Productivity**
Human resources are widely regarded as the most important factor in the success of a company. However, they are a financial burden due to the wages, taxes, and health care costs they accrue during their employment. Historically, many businesses have attempted to reduce costs by either keeping wages flat or reducing the amount they spend on health insurance. However, over time, leading companies have come to realize that a healthier workforce boosts productivity. By acknowledging the positive impact that employee empowerment has on the workforce, the firm may build shared value with its employees.

**Enabling Local Cluster Development**
Cluster development is the final step in implementing shared value initiatives. Every company's success is influenced by the supporting businesses and infrastructure that surrounds it. According to prior studies, clusters support parent organizations' shared ideas (Bell, 2005). When a corporation builds clusters in its primary areas of operation, it improves the link between its success and the community's prosperity. The expansion of a company creates additional jobs in linked areas, new businesses, and an increase in demand for complementary services. The companies need to identify significant gaps and limitations in areas such as logistical support, vendors, channels of distribution, consultancies, and educational institutions to support cluster development in the communities in which they operate. This is where the biggest chances for creating shared value can be found.

**Research Methodology**
**Research Philosophy**
Philosophy guides researchers to find what kind of research design is fitting, what kind of data will be collected, and how the researcher will analyze the collected data. In this study, to find the answer to the research question, a qualitative methodology and to collect qualitative data, interviews were
conducted. The nonexistence of any instrument needed to measure the adoption of CSV strategy was the reason why this methodology was adopted.

**Target Population**
The target population was all organizations involved in CSV activities and operating in Pakistan irrespective of size (small, medium, large), nature, ownership, and geography (local, regional, national, international). There is not a single body that maintains the record of all those organizations involved in CSV activities. Therefore, the documented sampling frame was not available. However, an attempt was made to develop a sampling frame by collecting the names of such organizations involved in CSV, listed on PSX (Pakistan Stock Exchange), and reporting CSV activities in their annual reports.

**Sampling Strategy and Sample Size**
Initially, organizations located in Lahore (the Capital city of Province Punjab and 2nd largest city in the country) were shortlisted but later this restriction is not followed as the physical visit was not possible due to COVID and computer-aided interviews were conducted. The organizations were selected through a simple random sampling technique. The informants were the CEOs or top management having enough information about the organization’s strategic decision-making and performance. For qualitative methodology and interviews as a data collection method, the calculation of sample size is very critical. In qualitative studies in which interviews are used for data collection, the “saturation” technique is used to determine the sample size. However, according to Malterud, Siersma, and Guassora (2016), the concept of “information power” is more fitting to find the acceptable size of the sample for qualitative studies. This concept specifies that the more relevant information the informants have, the fewer participants are desirable for data collection. As the sample units are the top management, therefore a sample of 10 top managers from each shortlisted organization was sufficient who possess the bulk of the information about the adoption of CSV strategy. In the literature, a sample ranging from 2 to 70 interviews is identified in which the content analysis technique is used (Mason, 2010).

**Interview Protocol**
An interview protocol was developed containing open-ended semi-structured questions rooted in literature. The questions about the understanding of CSV and the various tracks proposed by CSV authors were included in the protocol. The detailed guidelines to conduct interviews, schedule, and related components were also ensured. Initially, a language expert evaluated the interview protocol to ensure the use of common vocabulary as the informants represented diverse industries. The protocol was pretested in non-sampled organizations before initiating the actual study. Two different informants were interviewed in-depth. These interviews were not included in the actual sample and were not used in the analysis. The final interview protocol was updated after reviewing the pre-testing results and discussions with experts.

**Data Collection Procedure**
Informants were approached multiple ways and asked to schedule interviews. However, during this study, the COVID pandemic situation surfaced, and the country has observed a third wave of COVID in most parts of the country. Due to this reason, public interaction/gatherings were banned by the government and the organizations discouraged public dealing or visitors’ entrance on their premises. Keeping these hurdles, with the consent of organizations, the interviews were conducted online. The prime purpose was the exploration of potential variables that predict the adoption of CSV. The duration of each interview was ranging from 60 to 90 minutes long.

**Secondary Data**
The informants provided financial and CSV records during the interview. For two reasons, the reports
Findings and Results
Researchers always call on the right target to get correct information, and in this case, the most relevant informants were CEOs and upper management (Table 1). Access to executives was difficult and time-consuming. Therefore, when contacting the shortlisted organizations, the next most appropriate source of information was recommended. Over the ten months, the researcher carried out 20 interviews involving 10 different organizations of all natures.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Firms</th>
<th># of Informants</th>
<th>Informants</th>
<th># of Interviews</th>
<th>Mode</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Director Marketing</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Skype</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Public Relations Director; Manager Marketing</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Google Meet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Marketing Manager</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Zoom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Customer Relationship Manager</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Zoom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>R&amp;D Manager; Sales Director</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>WhatsApp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Procurement Officer; PR Manager</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Skype</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>CSR Manager</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Zoom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Marketing Manager</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Zoom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Sales &amp; Marketing Manager; R&amp;D Manager</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>WhatsApp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Sales Director; Customer Relationship Manager</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Google Meet</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Themes and sub-Themes
Primarily, the interview protocol was developed to validate firms’ CSV adoption claims. Using naturalistic research methodologies and ongoing comparison approaches (Strauss & Corbin, 1990), the researcher started analyzing each interview independently based on the words or phrases spoken by the informants (i.e., first-order categories). It's important to read each interview a few times to see whether there are themes or patterns across the informants and organizations. Concept patterns were discovered by comparing concepts across many sources of information. When possible, informant language is used to group similar codes. The patterns are grouped into four main themes and sixteen (16) sub-themes (Table 2). One of the main components of those themes was about ‘awareness of CSV’ and other themes were the same (tracks) as identified by Porter and Kramer (2011). The question of whether a business has implemented CSV isn't as simple as it may seem because top management claims, CSV reporting, and social projects aren't enough to back the claim.

Theme 1: CSV Adoption
Informant responses revealed the trend of “CSV Adoption” and are reflected in four sub-themes: level of awareness, adoption intention, preliminary impression, and CSV reporting. CSV awareness is the most important question; therefore, these organizations were asked about their knowledge of CSV, and how can they differentiate CSV from competing concepts. The top management of the shortlisted firms includes MNCs, thus they are familiar with CSV. Local organizations claim to have adopted CSV, but senior management is unfamiliar with it and can't distinguish it from CSR. One of the informants responded:

When it comes to CSV, Pakistani businessmen are completely unfamiliar with the concept; even consulting services aren't available to fill the gap. No one at the middle or operational levels is aware of the CSV in large organizations like MNCs, despite it being
known at the top. To be honest, Pakistani businessmen can’t tell the difference between CSR and CSV right now. They are doing philanthropy or involved in CSR projects. At this point, there appear to be only one or two companies in Pakistan that dominate the perception that CSV is readily available.

Table – 2: Themes and Sub-Themes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sub-Themes</th>
<th>Informants’ Comments/Feedback</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Theme 1: CSV Adoption</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Awareness           | • CSV is a new concept and awareness of this concept is very rare even at the top level.  
                      • In Pakistan, there is a lack of understanding of CSV, even no professional consultancy services are available to bridge the gap.  
                      • When it comes to distinguishing between CSVs and CSRs, my top management knows exactly what needs to do.  
                      • CSV is known at the top level, but no one at the middle or operational level is aware of it.  
                      • While we are aware of CSV, our partners, and other stakeholders are not at the same level of understanding.                                                                                          |
| Adoption Intentions | • As an MNC, our parent company has set forth a social mission for us to pursue.  
                      • My company is still following a CSR strategy to meet the social vision; however, my parent company is using the CSV strategy in advanced countries.  
                      • In my opinion, CSV has the potential to address social issues and generate economic profits and social wellbeing.  
                      • Because of the flimsy ethical business standards, we believe that CSV will not work in developing countries like Pakistan.  
                      • Adoption of CSV is nothing else but like CSR is a tool for signaling and promoting brand image, strengthening legitimacy.  
                      • Only the first of the three suggested tracks appears to be appropriate for developing countries like Pakistan.                                                                                                    |
| CSV Prerequisite     | • My organization learned from past experiences and adopted CSV by transforming its mission to meet the current challenges.  
                      • Adoption of CSV encourages me to make the shared value an integral part of my organization’s strategy for delivering innovative solutions.  
                      • To adopt CSV, my organization reshuffled its key priorities and the well-being of employees become more on the top than the society as a whole.  
                      • My organization revisited its mission after adopting CSV to deliver breakthrough solutions to customers of a wide range.  
                      • With the limited resources, my organization can have a bigger impact on the issues of direct stakeholders than on the community as a whole.                                                                 |
| CSV Reporting        | • After implementing CSV, the traditional reporting patterns were restructured to ensure more transparency, and to highlight both social/economic impact.  
                      • It is too early to comment on the success or failure of CSV as a strategy because we have no empirical yardstick so far.  
                      • The current reporting patterns for CSV impact need critical evaluation as it is difficult to distinguish between CSR, sustainability, and CSV contributions.  
                      • Our company exclusively publishes yearly reports on CSV to keep stakeholders updated.  
                      • No mechanism is in practice to report social & economic impact in financial terms.  
                      • Most organizations did nothing; they updated the mission and published their CSR or sustainability reports with the new title of ‘CSV Report’.                                                                                   |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sub-Themes</th>
<th>Informants’ Comments/Feedback</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Theme II: Reconceiving Products and Markets:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Redesign Existing Products/Services/Processes | • After scanning the social needs, my company has redesigned its offerings.  
• As a result of improving products and services to meet unmet social demands, my company’s market share went up.  
• Following an analysis of social demands, my company has revamped its offerings to improve lives, not just meeting customer “needs”.  
• We are just offering the same products which our parent organization after implementing the CSV strategy has redefined.  
• Instead of redefining or developing new products and services, the company must launch social projects to pursue social commitment.                                                                                                                                 |
| Redefine Value Proposition          | • We have redefined our value proposition and shared benefits will be expanded by safeguarding human, societal and environmental health.  
• A metric of social engagement is added to the organizational performance mix.  
• The overall economic value system at my company has been rebalanced to consider the social and environmental impacts.                                                                                                                                                                           |
| Redefine Market                     | • My company has broadened the scope of the current market for its products and services and as a result, both market share and review increased.  
• Company penetrated an untapped niche after revisiting the business goals.  
• My company expanded its existing market mix by integrating the most marginalized sections of society.  
• Re-defining the company's mission has allowed us to see the possibilities in untapped markets.                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| Introduce New Products/Services/Processes | • Since the parent company has adopted CSV, we frequently launch new products & Services.  
• We tracked the interdependency between social and business results, so we explored new opportunities for innovation and long-term social impact.  
• Our R&D department launches new products for underprivileged segments.  
• Our R&D department is continuously working on designing efficient production processes to produce low-cost products.                                                                                                                                               |
| Expand Portfolio Breadth & Depth    | • Our organization's goal is to expand our product portfolio and give customers from all layers of society innovative solutions.  
• My company is now offering low-cost products as well to reach the poorest untapped markets.  
• The primary goal of my organization is to offer novel high-quality products at reasonable prices to meet the diverse needs of a wide range of customers.                                                                                                                                 |
| **Theme III: Redefining Productivity in Value Chain**                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| Efficient Resource Utilization      | • We have declared an emergency to identify and mitigate climate-related risks that have a potential impact on the organization’s value chain.  
• The resource management policy ensures the commitment to finding ethical, economical, and efficient ways to reduce waste volume.  
• My organization has improved production flexibility, and capacity and therefore achieve economy of scale.  
• Our ROI improved due to efficient and effective resources utilization policy that evolved after the revisiting business mission.                                                                                           |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sub-Themes</th>
<th>Informants’ Comments/Feedback</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Energy use and logistic             | • Acknowledging social responsibility, my company invested most in energy-efficient plants.  
• Firm is committed to energy consumption to minimize carbon emissions.  
• We revamped our supply and distribution channels for multiple reasons like cost reduction, fuel efficiency, and time management.  
• Plants with high energy efficiency are too expensive for developing countries and therefore not available to us.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| Procurement and Vendor Relationships| • Suppliers' environmental, and ethical policies are vital to my organization despite business strengths, financial health, and strategic alignment.  
• Our company has a ZERO tolerance policy for vendors if they violate environmental, social, and ethical standards.  
• My company invested to sensitize our suppliers about adhering to environmental standards essential for long-term business relationships.  
• Always worked with suppliers who adhered labor rules and regulations.  
• In developing countries like Pakistan, companies have no control over suppliers to force them to adhere to ethical business practices.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
| Employee Productivity               | • When it comes to Health & Safety issues, we have adopted a ZERO tolerance policy for our employees as well as for our vendors’ staff.  
• After implementing the CSV, we invest more in in-house training and capacity-building workshops to raise employees’ level of proficiency.  
• Our aim is if we grow, our employees must as well, thus we invest in building a continuous learning culture to meet current business challenges.  
• Excellent work-life balance policies for our employees are an effort to boost the productivity of our workforce.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| Theme IV: Enabling Local Cluster Development |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| Collaboration                      | • To assure raw material supply and strengthen our value chain, my company made investments to promote and collaborate with vendor companies.  
• To boost the industry's collective competitiveness, we form alliances and linkages with auxiliary organizations and suppliers.  
• To tackle the societal challenges that can't be solved on their own, we collaborated with our subsidiary companies to build a resource pool.  
• Form local clusters, my company benefits from the availability of a pool of skilled labor, tacit knowledge, and new ideas to create innovative solutions.  
• To carry out the social mission we have transcribed after CSV adoption, there is no organization in the country to partner with.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| Support & Networking               | • My organization frequently interacts with universities and R&D institutions to explore new opportunities and solutions to meet unmet social needs.  
• My company has extended its networking with academic institutions to increase the supply of highly skilled workers for the industry.  
• My company engaged government officials frequently to enforce Labor Laws and Standards to protect the industrial workforce.  
• Our industry's trade association generated funds for scholars who help the industry by exploring business solutions for social issues.  
• My organization frequently interacts with universities and R&D institutions to explore new opportunities and solutions to meet unmet social needs.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
The adoption intentions of the top management of the shortlisted organization are explored by getting the answer to why the decision is made to adopt CSV as a strategy. The intentions of organizations to adopt CSV is very obvious for some organizations as their parent organization has already adopted it globally, therefore, they must adopt CSV. For CSV adoption there is a need to know what preliminary impressions or tasks are conducted for successful CSV adoption. One participant pointed out that, there is no need to perform any additional or specific activity; nonetheless, it is required for the local chapters of global MNCs to follow the same kinds of tasks. In contrast, local businesses or those that have no prior knowledge of that CSV updated that the most important task was to identify stakeholders and reorder their priority. Whether or not an organization has adopted CSV is a matter of some debate until that organization can show or convince the stakeholders that this is indeed what has happened. There may be financial reporting that can be used as the basis for the justification. In some cases, the organization published specific CSV reports in addition to financial reports to persuade the stakeholders as well as the funding agencies. Some of the informants felt that this kind of reporting was inaccurate and that the success of CSV should be measured by other metrics to gauge the success of CSV in the form of economic revenue and social goodwill. Similar viewpoints were recorded during an interview.

Theme II: Reconceiving Products & Markets
The other themes that emerged from the data are the same three tracks discussed earlier. The reason to keep those tracks in the interview protocol is that to date, the adoption of single or multiple tracks has been considered equivalent to implementing CSV. Therefore, when questions about the first track were asked to informants, the patterns of answers to questions are grouped into three sub-themes i.e., Exploitation, Exploration, and Redefining Value Proposition. The exploitation aspect suggested the organizations tried to improve the existing products, services, and even processes. In the search for a new market in some cases, the organizations have redefined the market for their products and services. The second sub-theme was an exploration in which the organizations’ intention to develop new offerings is identifying for current identified markets. Some informants record their observations that such kind of option required very heavy investment and time and in such a competitive environment, no business can afford to leave the market for a longer period until new offerings are available for the market. To adopt CSV through the first track offers two options either redefine the offering and develop a new one, the third option also surfaced during sub-themes development and that is redefining the value proposition. According to the informants, current business activities produce diverse values and the traditional metrics for value calculations generated by company operations are insufficient and are not appropriately predicted for stakeholders. Therefore, it is more appropriate to redefine value propositions and their measurement.

Theme III: Redefining Productivity in Value Chain
This theme allows secondary stakeholders to be added. The four sub-themes included efficient resource utilization, efficient energy usage and logistic, procurement and vendor selection, and employee productivity. Inefficient resource utilization, sub-theme, the informants’ responses predicted a wide range of concepts which indicated that this concept was a broad one. For instance, in some cases, this has resulted in a greater ROI, while others have realized economies of scale, and some have adopted waste management policies as a result. According to an informant:
Pakistani firms aren’t as aware of how they use their resources as businesses did in developed countries. Every firm tries to cut costs by adopting waste management policies. Little attention is paid to the efficient use of natural resources, due to a lack of regulation, poor enforcement mechanisms, and an inefficient judicial system.

The second sub-theme is efficient energy usage and logistic which is about the level of concern for ecosystem health among organizations. Because of the variety and intensity of activities carried out at the sites, the level differed from one organization to other. Ecosystems were discussed by the interviewees, but they were reluctant to invest in reducing carbon emissions. The response patterns of the third sub-theme procurement and vendor selection emphasized that firms are increasingly being held responsible for their influence on society and the environment and that these consequences extend far beyond their operations to cover the whole supply chain. Businesses manage their operations but are compelled to compromise in the selection of vendors owing to fierce competition. According to the informants, regardless of the organization’s business strengths, financial health, and strategic alignment, suppliers' environmental and ethical policies are critical to the organization, but it is very hard to find such suppliers that fulfill all ethical obligations. Companies can devise a ZERO tolerance policy, but implementation required the awareness and finances to follow CSV philosophy. The last sub-theme was employees’ productivity about which almost all informants were keen and provided very interesting facts after implementing CSV. One of the informants said, that in his business, productivity is not only equated with completing more tasks in a given amount of time but also encouraged employees to do tasks consistently with zero errors. This is the only facet about which the informants have consistent views and agree that both businesses and workers stand to gain. The statement of an informant highlights the main crux of this sub-theme.

Theme IV: Enabling Local Cluster Development is the fourth and last main theme extracted from the responses of the interviews. In this theme, three sub-themes collaborations, support & networking, and legislation & regulations were extracted. Despite being one of the most challenging tracks, this one needed the most careful consideration and a lot of thought. A strategic choice on cluster growth necessitates the involvement of many public and commercial sectors and stakeholders. When it comes to encouraging cluster growth, most informants aren't even aware or interested in participating since the industry environment doesn't favor it. Such concerns are reflected in the first sub-theme i.e., collaborations. To promote or develop a cluster, individual efforts will not enough; instead, a collective effort is required and in a rivalry environment, it is hard for businessmen to sit together and advance. According to an informant that his firm invested in promoting and collaborating with vendor companies to ensure raw material supply and enhance the value chain, but cluster development is the next level of collaboration that is not available.

My firm made agreements with auxiliary organizations and suppliers to improve the competitiveness of the industry. We propose to develop a resource pool in collaboration with our partners to address social issues that could not be resolved on their own. Those resources include a pool of qualified workers, tacit knowledge, and fresh perspectives for developing new solutions.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CSV Dimensions</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Experts</th>
<th>No of Consents</th>
<th>CVR</th>
<th>I-CVI</th>
<th>K</th>
<th>Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Theme I: CSV Adoption</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSV Awareness</td>
<td>Item 1</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Item 2</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Item 3</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Item 4</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Item 5</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adoption Intentions</td>
<td>Item 6</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Item 7</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Item 8</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSV Prerequisite</td>
<td>Item 9</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Item 10</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Item 11</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Item 12</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-0.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSV Reporting</td>
<td>Item 13</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Item 14</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Item 15</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Theme II: Reconceiving Products and Markets</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exploitation</td>
<td>Item 16</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Item 17</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Item 18</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Item 19</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Item 20</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Item 21</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value Proposition</td>
<td>Item 22</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Item 23</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Item 24</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exploration</td>
<td>Item 25</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Item 26</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Item 27</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Theme III: Redefining Productivity in the Value Chain</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resource Utilization</td>
<td>Item 28</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Item 29</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Item 30</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Item 31</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy and Logistic</td>
<td>Item 32</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Item 33</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Item 34</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procurement</td>
<td>Item 35</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Item 36</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Item 37</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Item 38</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Item 39</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Item 40</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The second sub-theme is about the necessary support and prerequisites required for cluster development. Support or facilitation from a variety of stakeholders is needed, including R&D institutes, academic institutions, and public-private partnerships. For this reason, the informants identified those involved in cluster development and also highlighted the fundamental factors which are documented in the support and networking sub-theme. The third sub-theme is legislation & regulations essential for cluster development. In the current business environment, due to their mushroom-like expansion, clusters cannot be utilized to implement CSV since they lack a legal foundation and fair competition. SMEs make up the bulk of firms in clusters, but government initiatives aimed at helping them thrive and endure are lacking.

In nutshell, CSV adoption was discussed in depth for each of the organizations. The interviews were transcribed and specific quotes against each sub-theme are also produced for reference. The next step is item generation and the best source for that purpose is quotes and transcripts.

**Dimensions & Items Generation**

The next step was to get a list of probable dimensions and items for the instrument. Deductive, inductive, or a mix of the two methods are recommended (Raykov & Marcoulides, 2011). Items are generated using deductive approaches based on comprehensive literature reviews and previously developed scales; however, in this case, no prior questionnaire is available. Contrary to this, a construct may also be derived from a target population's opinions by using inductive approaches.

Qualitative data gathered during the interviews is a good resource for the generation of instrument
items (Tilden, Nelson, & May, 1990). For this purpose, it is essential that these items have to be relevant to the construct (CSV adoption) and the target demographic of interest (informants) as well as to the context in which the instrument is meant to be used (organizations). The final count of themes was the same as identified earlier but the sub-themes were reduced to fourteen (14) dimensions (Table 3). After interviews, a bulk of preliminary but pertinent information in the form of quotes is reproduced in Table 1. Repeated readings of these quotations and interview transcripts were conducted to identify recurrent keywords, and language specialists who were familiar with these keywords were contacted to ascertain their context meanings. It is done because the literature suggested that items should capture the lived experiences of the target demographic (Healy, Proctor, Borman, Klimoski, & Ilgen, 2003) and current interview data offered rich life experiences of the informants. According to Kline (2013) and Healy et al. (2003), the initial pool of items should be twice as long as the final scale.

For item generation, the panel of experts is recommended in the literature (Grant & Davis, 1997) to ensure that the new scale has content validity to ensure that the initial item pool accurately represents the desired construct. This is because the validity of the item content underpins the validity of all subsequent inferences. To ensure content validity, experts' opinions are sought on operationalized items pool. These may be the views of experts (such as linguists, professionals, consultants, and industry representatives) or members of the intended audience (such as people who will use the scale), to make sure that any hypothesis derived from this research accurately reflects the relevant concept (Grant & Davis, 1997). Estimating the total number of experts has always been subject to some degree of subjective judgment. A minimum of five persons is recommended for a chance agreement (Zamanzadeh et al., 2014). In this case, one linguistic expert, two content experts, and two lay experts (informants of shortlisted organizations) were selected. According to Davis (1992), the lay experts are potential survey recipients, and content experts are those who have field experience in research. The use of lay experts guarantees that the population for which the instrument is being designed is represented. They are chosen based on the expertise, clarity of thought, and profundity of their answers to questions during the interviews. These experts were only picked because of the high value put on their concept knowledge, skills, experience, and qualifications in the area of content, which are all clearly outlined in the literature (Zamanzadeh et al., 2014). They were contacted and requested to rate and comment on the items generated after analysis. In the qualitative content validity technique, content and linguistic experts were requested to advise on grammar, using suitable and accurate terms, applying for correct word order in items, and appropriate scores. Experts were asked whether any item might be reworded and put in a different context if it was deemed improper. The lay experts were requested to guide on items' clarity and context. However, almost everyone who took part in the review of questionnaire items said that the items are well-drafted and easy to interpret with some exceptions. The questionnaire was deemed appropriate in length by all experts, and none of the items were seen as unpleasant or uncomfortable by any of the reviewers. The experts also validated that the items are free of any potential biases in terms of social identity, i.e., gender, religion, ethnicity, race, economic status, or sexual orientation. However, to maintain confidence in selecting the most significant and proper content in an instrument, the content validity ratio (CVR) (Table 3), an item statistic that is significant in the rejection or retention of certain items is used (Lawshe, 1975). The parameter is rated on a Likert scale ranging from 1 (Item is Irrelevant) to 4 (Item is Relevant).

The content validity index (CVI) for the whole instrument is calculated once items have been selected for inclusion in the final form. There are two CVIs, one I-CVI (Item CVI) and the other S-CVI (Scale CVI). I-CVI reflects the percentage of experts who think an item is clear or relevant and give ratings of 3 or 4. S-CVI is the average of all I-CVI scores for all items or the average of proportional relevance determined by all experts throughout the scale. The panelists provided their ratings for each item and different index values I-CVI, and S-CVI were estimated. The I-CVI index
reflected that a total of 47 items attained the approval ratings of experts, and the ratings were either 3 (17 items) or 4 (30 items). These items were interpreted as either “appropriate” or “appropriate with minor changes”. The content validity of S-CVI at the complete scale level is calculated by two methods as recommended (Zamanzadeh et al., 2014). The first method is the S-CVI$_{avg}$ and the second method is the S-CVI$_{UA}$. The ‘UA’ means universally rated items about which all experts agreed and rated as 3 or 4. The S-CVI$_{avg}$ value is 0.859 whereas, the S-CVI$_{UA}$ value is 0.810 (Table 3). Despite being widely used, the CVI index does not consider the likelihood of exaggerated readings due to chance agreement. Therefore, the probability of chance agreement among experts is also calculated, and Kappa Coefficient widely reported in instrument development literature is used (Davis, 1992; Haron, Ariffin, & Idrus, 2019; Lawshe, 1975; Zamanzadeh et al., 2014). Using Kappa, which removes chance agreement and assesses inter-rater agreement while accounting for the effect of random variation in the data, researchers have access to additional information (Polit, Beck, & Owen, 2007). According to Cicchetti and Sparrow (1981) the threshold values for K are: Poor = K < 0.40; Fair = K > 0.40 & K < 0.59; Good = K > 0.60 & K < 0.74; and Excellent = K > 0.74. The overall K value for the scale is 0.81. The summary is available in Table 4.

**Table 4: Content Validity Statistics**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Construct</th>
<th>Dimensions</th>
<th># of Items</th>
<th>Kappa Coefficient Interpretations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CSV Adoption</td>
<td>CSV Awareness</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Excellent 2 Good 1 Fair 6 Poor 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Adoption Intentions</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Excellent 2 Good 1 Fair 6 Poor 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CSV Prerequisite</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Excellent 2 Good 1 Fair 6 Poor 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CSV Reporting</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Excellent 2 Good 1 Fair 6 Poor 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sub-Total I</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>15</td>
<td>5 6 3 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reconceiving Products and Markets</td>
<td>Exploitation</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Excellent 2 Good 1 Fair 6 Poor 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Value Proposition</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Excellent 2 Good 1 Fair 6 Poor 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Exploration</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Excellent 2 Good 1 Fair 6 Poor 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sub-Total II</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>12</td>
<td>5 6 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Redefining Productivity in the Value Chain</td>
<td>Resource Utilization</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Excellent 2 Good 1 Fair 6 Poor 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Energy &amp; Logistic</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Excellent 2 Good 1 Fair 6 Poor 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Procurement</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Excellent 2 Good 1 Fair 6 Poor 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Employee Productivity</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Excellent 2 Good 1 Fair 6 Poor 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sub-Total III</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>17</td>
<td>8 3 5 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enabling Local Cluster Development</td>
<td>Collaboration</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Excellent 2 Good 1 Fair 6 Poor 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Support &amp; Networking</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Excellent 2 Good 1 Fair 6 Poor 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Legislation &amp; Regulations</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Excellent 2 Good 1 Fair 6 Poor 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sub-Total IV</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>14</td>
<td>12 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total = I+II+III+IV</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>58</td>
<td>30 17 9 2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In nutshell, the results indicated that the majority of the items in each dimension of the construct are accepted for inclusion in the questionnaire. S-CVI (average) for all themes are 0.79, 0.88, 0.81, and 0.97 respectively whereas, the overall S-CVI is 0.859 and these values indicated high content validity. Few items need revision, and some items needed to be excluded. An extensive investigation and data-based analysis have shown that the dimensions and item generation process is thorough, and the outcome adequately matches the scope of the content domain.
Conclusion and Future Directions

The process of developing scales requires making connections between theoretical frameworks and concrete, observable indicators. Studies in the social sciences sometimes require the creation of ideas at a very high degree of abstraction, which is typically hard to measure. Content validity needs to operationalize ideas via quantifiable items so that concepts may be comprehended in a standardized manner. Through this study, an effort is made to reduce the incoherence that existed between the academic perspective and the industry view on CSV adoption by the computation of content validity for the concept. There are two stages to the study of content validity: a systematic stage and a more subjective one. At first, a bulk of the information is collected through direct observations in the form of interviews for instrument creation, followed by judgment/quantification of items and content experts examining the agreement between theoretical and operational definitions in the second stage. To ensure instrument reliability and construct a valid instrument in terms of content for the preliminary test phase, such a method as primary research in the process of instrument development is used.

The process of developing an instrument is scientific and systematic, but it is also complex and time-consuming; the next step of the study will consist of carrying out two more significant phases of development. These steps comprised the scale development and scale evaluation. The pilot testing, as well as tests to determine reliability and validity, will be carried out throughout these phases. In a few studies, despite these, CVI and Kappa statistics, it is recommended to ask another or the same panel members to assess the instrument's comprehensiveness. The argument is that inter-rater agreement might be acceptable, however, the instrument may not cover the topic area (Grant & Davis, 1997; Lynn, 1986; Zamanzadeh et al., 2014), therefore an instrument's whole collection of items must be evaluated to see whether it adequately reflects the content domain. The output of that evaluation would be the inclusion or elimination of items.

References


Consumer Intention towards Webrooming Behavior in Emerging Economies: A Conceptual Framework based on Behavioral Reasoning Theory

*Sarah Zafar, Lecturer, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Bahawalpur, Pakistan
Rana Muhammad Shahid Yaqub, Assistant Professor, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Bahawalpur, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email address: sarah.zafar@iub.edu.pk

ARTICLE DETAILS

History
Revised format: May 2022
Available Online: Jun 2022

Keywords
Webrooming,
Omni-channel Retailing
BRT

JEL Classification
M1, M2

ABSTRACT

Purpose: Recent research about consumer webrooming behavior has conferred the importance and wide prevalence of this behavior and indicates the impelling need for the exploration of this emerging phenomenon in the omni-channel retail environment. The purpose of this study is to understand consumers’ reasons related to channel attributes, acting as determinants and resistance factors for the consumers’ intention towards webrooming behavior, based on the framework of the Behavioral Reasoning Theory (BRT).

Design/Methodology/Approach: Using the framework of BRT, postulations related to webrooming behavior have been proposed. The postulations are based on the literature review on webrooming conduct in the omnichannel shopping scenario.

Findings: The proposed model imparts understanding about webrooming behavior on the basis of consumers’ reasoning and values underlying their attitude and intention towards webrooming behavior to provide a comprehensive view for understanding webrooming behavior in omni-channel retail environment.

Implications/Originality/Value: This study contributes to the literature on the important research area of changing consumer buying behavior due to transforming retail structure, herein, the webrooming behavior, in the context of omni-channel retailing, in emerging economies.

© 2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-4.0


Introduction
With the digitalization of traditional retailing structure, retailing trends have shown a drastic transformation from single channel to multi-channel and omni-channel retail structure (Flavián, Gurrea, and Orús, 2020). Due to this shift, the purchasing behavior of consumers has also converted from single channel shopping to cross-channel shopping behavior where the consumers use
combinations of online and offline channels to get better knowledge about products for smart decision making and purchase experience (Flavián et al., 2020). Currently, the widely practiced webrooming behavior has a significant impact on individuals’ purchase patterns (Flavián et al., 2019; Aw et al., 2021). In webrooming behavior consumers search and evaluate products at online channels but later move to physical stores for final purchase. With omnichannel retailing at global level, consumers are increasingly demanding impeccable shopping experiences across digital and physical channels, according to Sebald and Jacob (2020). Due to this, many challenges and pressures have arisen for purely online and offline retailers. To overcome these challenges and to align with the omni-channel retail landscape and changing consumer purchasing behaviors like webrooming in the market, many retailers are converting from single-channel strategy to multi-channel and omni-channel retail strategies in their businesses (Aw, 2019; Arora & Sahney, 2017; Verhoef, Kannan, and Inman, 2015). According to a consumer research report by JRNI (2019), 74% of consumers prefer to shop through webrooming behavior.

It has been shown that many Asian consumers follow webrooming behavior in their purchases (Aw et al., 2021). Pakistan is among the fastest-growing Asian e-commerce markets in the world. Alibaba Group is a giant online business in Pakistan. This trend has tremendously changed the purchasing behavior of Pakistani consumers as well. In Pakistan, about 89% of consumers search for women’s fashion wear, and 82% of consumers search for smartphones before closing the final purchase, according to www.brandsyanrio.com (2019). The ubiquity of webrooming behavior has greatly affected the dominance of e-commerce at global level. The giant online retailer Amazon has shifted to multi-channel strategy to overcome considerable losses in its sales (Aw et al., 2021). It has been found that 69 percent of smartphone-using Millennial consumers prefer webrooming behavior in their purchase process. Research has shown that consumer purchase behavior is influenced by attributes of shopping channels at different stages of decision-making process (Verhoef et al., 2015; Kang, 2018), such as unwanted free-riding behavior of consumers which is created by webrooming behavior as they may switch shopping channels and retailers during their purchase process (Heitz-Spahn, 2013).

Despite an emerging phenomenon, there exists a paucity of literature on the important concept of webrooming with a consistent call for studies to explore and examine the determinants of webrooming behavior (Arora & Sahney, 2019; Aw et al., 2021). Existing studies have revealed valuable findings about webrooming in a single channel context but very little is known about “reasons” and values underlying consumer webrooming behavior in omnichannel shopping context.

Thus, the objectives of the present study are to (i) address the gaps discussed above by investigating and proposing consumers’ reasons that influence consumer webrooming behavior, utilizing theoretical model of the Behavioral Reasoning Theory (BRT) by Westaby (2005). BRT is extension of the Theory of Planned Behavior (TPB) (Ajzen, 1991). The concept of “reasons” gives unique understanding of underlying motivations behind specific behaviors of individuals but has not been addressed by behavioral theories other than BRT (Westaby, 2005). This gives rise to an important theoretical question because the concept of “reasons” has shown predictive validity in various contexts of judgment and decision-making (Pennington & Hastie, 1988; Westaby et al., 2005) (ii) What strategies the retailers can use to provide seamless shopping experience to the customers? Within the single framework of BRT, the study will examine how consumer ‘reasons for’ or drivers, ‘reasons against’ or barriers influence webrooming intention in omni-channel retail context. BRT has been recently utilized in various studies to examine behaviors in specific contexts, however, Behavioral Reasoning Theory has not been applied in extant literature on consumers’ webrooming behavior so far. This study is a pioneer study in utilizing BRT to address the theoretical gap in the literature on Webrooming Behavior. Hence, the theoretical and practical contributions of the present study are enhanced.

Rest of the paper is organized as follows. Firstly, literature review related to webrooming is
presented. Next, the conceptual model for this study, is proposed. After the proposed model, research methodology will be suggested, and anticipated results will be presented. Next to it, discussion and implications will be presented. The paper will end with the limitations and suggestions for future research.

**Literature Review**

**Webrooming**

Webrooming has been claimed to be the most prevailing shopping behavior in this era of omni-channel retailing (Aw, 2019), and is anticipated to increase with passing time. Latest research has indicated that consumers use digital channels mostly for information search but switch to offline channels for final purchases. (Chou et al., 2016). The concept of ‘Research shopping behavior”, described as “the propensity of consumers to research about the product in one channel and then purchase it through another channel” is associated with webrooming (Verhoef, Neslin, and Vroomen, 2007).

Despite being a widely exhibited behavior, webrooming has been given relatively less attention in the research literature. A literature review on webrooming behavior is summarized in table 1 below, which presents different factors that influence webrooming behavior. It has been shown that need for immediate possession positively affect webrooming intention while motivation for efficient shopping, perceived cost of webrooming and bargain hunting negatively influence consumers’ webrooming intention (Aw, 2019). Perceived risks associated with online shopping motivate consumers towards webrooming behavior (Reid, Ross, and Vignali, 2016). Usefulness of online search has a negative impact on consumer webrooming intention. On the other hand, socialization and need for touch positively influence consumer intention towards webrooming. Other studies have also revealed different factors that influence webrooming behavior. However, the factors explored are not comprehensive in elucidating webrooming phenomenon. Hence, this study intents to examine antecedents of webrooming behavior based on the framework of behavioral reasoning theory (BRT), thus contributing to the existent sparse literature on webrooming in the omni-channel context.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Research studies</th>
<th>Context of the study</th>
<th>Findings of the study</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Verhoef, Neslin, and Vroomen (2007)</td>
<td>Research-shopping phenomenon</td>
<td>Research-shopping behavior characterized by search online-buy offline phenomenon, is greatly prevailing cross-channel shopping behavior. Significantly influenced by channel benefits, consumers search product information at online channels but move to offline stores for final purchase.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chiu et al. (2011)</td>
<td>Cross-channel free riding conduct</td>
<td>Increase in consumer perception of multichannel self-efficacy leads to increase in free-riding behavior across channels. Consumers search for product information at digital channels because of lower costs but the competitors’ better offline service quality and lesser risk in purchasing at physical stores positively affect their cross-channel free-riding behavior.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heitz-Spahn (2013)</td>
<td>Cross-channel free riding behavior in a multichannel context</td>
<td>Customers’ need of product comparison, flexibility and convenience leads to cross-channel free riding behavior. Increased free-riding behavior results in negative consequences of multichannel retailing. Moreover, the cross-channel free riding behavior varies across different product categories but has no influence on sociodemographic variables.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wang, Malthouse, and Krishnamurthi (2015)</td>
<td>Multichannel research shopping behavior</td>
<td>Consumer attitude towards channel selection is significantly influenced by consumer perception about channel attributes. Also, channel characteristics differ in online and offline channels.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Juaneda-Ayensa, Mosquera, and Murillo (2016)</td>
<td>Omni-channel consumer buying behavior</td>
<td>Using UTAUT2 framework, it was found that personal innovativeness, effort expectancy and performance expectancy are the salient factors that influence consumers’ omnichannel purchase behavior.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Authors</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Summary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reid, Ross, and Vignali (2016)</td>
<td>Influence of consumer motivations on cross-channel buying behavior</td>
<td>Consumers motivated by price efficiency and product (clothing) comparison prefer showromming behavior, while consumer motivated by tactile judgement of the product (clothing) prefer to make purchases performing webromming sequence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arora and Sahney (2018)</td>
<td>Understanding webromming behavior based on Theory of Planned Behavior</td>
<td>Access to online reviews influenced consumers’ visit to online store, whereas access to touch and online risk perceptions influenced consumers to purchase product from offline store.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boardman and McCormick (2018)</td>
<td>Consumer motivations for shopping channel preferences.</td>
<td>Different ages have different motivations for shopping which effects their preferences for shopping channels. The trend of multi-channel shopping has been found with the rise in consumer’s age.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kang (2018)</td>
<td>The impact of consumers’ psychographic traits on showromming/webromming intention. Subsequently impact of showromming/webromming on omni-channel consumers’ generated content creation.</td>
<td>Consumer intention towards creation of user-generated content on social media is positively influenced by consumer’s webromming and showromming behaviors. There is moderating effect of SoLoMo practice on the relationship between webromming and intention towards creation of user-generated content on social media platforms.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aw (2019)</td>
<td>Impact of consumer motivations on webromming phenomenon</td>
<td>Negative association of consumer motivation for efficient shopping and bargain hunting, with webromming intention, has been reported. Moreover, webromming intention was positively affected by consumers’ need of immediate possession of the product and negatively affected by perceived cost of webromming.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flavián, Gurrea, and Orus (2019)</td>
<td>Influence of webromming behavior on consumer’s search process satisfaction.</td>
<td>Consumers feel more satisfied by performing webromming behavior instead of showromming behavior. Perception of money saving has significant influence on consumer satisfaction while time/effort saving has no effect on consumer satisfaction.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aw et al. (2021)</td>
<td>Determinants of webromming intention</td>
<td>Consumer attributes and channel characteristics have influence on intention towards webromming behavior, either directly or indirectly due to the mediating role of smart shopping perception. Effect of moderation of product category was also found in the proposed model.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shankar and Jain (2021)</td>
<td>Factors influencing luxury consumers’ webromming intention.</td>
<td>Usefulness of online search, need for touch and socialization significantly influence webromming intention. Mediation effect of perceived hedonic and perceived utilitarian value was found on the relationship between variables and webromming intention. Moderation effect of consumers’ online risk perceptions was also found in the proposed framework.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Source: Authors’ compilation)

**Behavioral Reasoning Theory (BRT) as Underpinning Theory**

BRT explains that intentions towards behaviors in different contexts are extensively influenced by attitudes, subjective norms, and perceived behavioral control, described as global motives. An individual’s intentions and global motives are influenced by an individual’s reasoning, defined as “specific subjective factors people use to explain their anticipated behavior” (Westaby, 2005). An individual’s reasoning is influenced by his values and beliefs. Thus, the reasons create an important association between values, beliefs, global motives, and intentions for specific behaviors.

BRT dominates alternative behavioral theories like Theory of Reasoned Action (TRA), Theory of Planned Behavior (TPB)(Ajzen, 1991), and Technology Acceptance Model (TAM) (Davis, 1989) because researchers have posited that theories like TAM, TRA and TPB cannot independently anticipate individuals’ behavior in effective manner (Calisir, Gumussoy, and Bayram, 2009). The concept of “reasons” gives unique understanding of underlying motivations behind specific behaviors of individuals but has not been addressed by behavioral theories other than BRT (Westaby, 2005).
Research based on BRT has endorsed that conceptually distinct antecedents i.e., reasons for and reasons against a particular behavior can be examined within a single framework (Claudy, Garcia and O’Driscoll, 2015; Tudor et al., 2007). Secondly, theories, such as TAM and TPB can examine general beliefs of individuals about a specific phenomenon, or behavior, whereas BRT examines the antecedents of specific behaviors in specific contexts (Tudor et al., 2007; Westaby et al., 2010). BRT has been used to understand consumer behavior in varied contexts (Claudy et al., 2015; Gupta & Arora, 2017), which justifies and supports the logical application of BRT as underpinning theory to examine consumer webroming behavior in this study.

The following section elucidates the theoretical rationale for the proposed linkages between constructs of the research model of the study.

**Postulated Research Model and Hypotheses Development**

**Attitudes and Intentions**

Attitude is defined as an individual’s judgement expressed by evaluating a particular entity with some degree of favor or disfavor (Eagly & Chaiken, 1993). Intentions account for 28% variance in an individual’s behavior (Sheeran, 2002). BRT as well as other behavioral theories have affirmed that attitude significantly predicts intention (Basha & Lal, 2019; Tandon et al., 2020).

H1: Consumer’s attitude towards webroming behavior will have a positive influence over webroming intention.

**Reasons**

Reasoning is the process that individuals utilize to determine their actions and behaviors (Myyry et al., 2009).

**Reasons for Attitude and Intention for Webroming**

‘Reasons for’ are the motivating factors which individuals can use in developing positive perceptions about a particular behavior. Extant literature has shown that haptic evaluation and sales staff assistance positively influence attitude towards webroming (Aw, 2019; Arora & Sahney, 2018; Gensler, Neslin, and Verhoef, 2017).

**Haptic Evaluation**

Haptic evaluation is the active examination of product with hands to gather information about the product’s texture, weight, and other features (Peck & Childers, 2003). Haptic information required for product evaluation varies among consumers as well as product categories because of different tangible and evaluative attributes (Peck & Childers, 2003). Haptic evaluation helps consumers feel confident and at lesser risk about product selection and motivates consumers to switch from virtual channels after information search, to offline channel for final purchase (Mehra, Kumar, and Raju, 2018; Aw et al., 2021). Physical channels have advantage over digital channels as they offer haptic assessment of the products (Balasubramanian et al., 2005; Mehra et al., 2018).

**Sales-Staff Assistance**

Studies have shown that consumers prefer to be assisted by sales personnel during their buying process (Sharma & Stafford, 2000). In addition to family and friends, sales personnel are an important source of product information and recommendations for customers in choosing better-fit products, mostly available only at offline stores (Mehra et al., 2018). Interaction with salespeople helps reduce consumers’ uncertainty and perceived risk in purchase activity. In-store sales staff assistance is a competitive advantage of offline stores over online stores and constitutes an important determinant of consumers’ positive attitude towards webroming (Arora & Sahney, 2019).
In line with past literature, this study considers haptic evaluation and sales staff assistance as components of ‘reasons for’. Positive impact of ‘reasons for’ on consumers’ attitude and intention towards specific behaviors has been found in various domains (Claudy et al., 2015; Tandon et al., 2020). Therefore, it can be expected that ‘reasons for’ webrooming will positively influence attitude and subsequent intention towards webrooming behavior. Hence, it is proposed that:

H2a: Consumers’ ‘reasons for’ will positively influence their attitude towards webrooming behavior
H3a: Consumers’ ‘reasons for’ will positively influence their webrooming intention

Reasons Against Attitude and Intentions
‘Reasons against’ represent the constraint factors that can negatively influence an individual’s perception towards a certain behavior (Sahu, Khan, and Gupta, 2021). In the present study, factors of cost-saving and offline purchase effort, are taken as ‘reasons against’ attitude and intention towards webrooming behavior.

Cost-saving
Studies have shown that consumers search and compare prices on digital channels to find the best prices available for cost saving, before finally purchasing the product from offline store (Kim & Park, 2019; Bodur et al., 2015). Whereas, it has also been found that consumers first search for information about the products and their prices at offline stores and then switch to online channels for final purchase to avail price benefits available on digital channels (Gensler et al., 2017). Digital retailers can save the cost of store rent and other expenses incurred to run offline stores. Moreover, they can provide price benefits like offers, deals and discounts, which cannot be offered by offline channels, so consumers get inclined towards showrooiming for greater financial benefits (Aw, 2019). The value barrier is generally related to the perceived financial loss suffered by the customer (Kushwah et al., 2019). Price differences between digital and physical channels in terms of cost-saving, can be a value barrier for consumers’ attitude and intention towards webrooming. Hence, consumer may prefer to purchase from digital channels if they expect cost-saving at digital channels as compared to offline channels.

Offline Purchase Effort
In this study, offline purchase effort comprises of perceived effort, time, and cost incurred by the consumers when shopping from offline channels. Consumers need to put more effort and time to purchase from a physical store as compared to purchasing from online channels (Lala & Chakraborty, 2015). For consumers who are motivated by shopping convenience, the nuisance of time and effort would act as constraints and would incur costs in an offline shopping tour, thus decreasing consumer attraction for offline buying (Wagner & Rudolph, 2010). Moreover, Boardman and McCormick (2018) found that young shoppers perceive purchasing from offline stores as tedious. Digital channels provide more enjoyable, and convenient shopping experience round the clock, 7 days of week, regardless of place or weather (Wolfinbarger & Gilly, 2001). It can be expected that if consumers perceive offline purchase effort to be high and a usage barrier towards offline buying, they may prefer shopping from online channels. Thus, offline purchase effort is considered an important component of the ‘reasons against’ webrooming behavior. Studies have affirmed a negative relationship between ‘reasons against’ and consumer attitude and behavioral intention (Claudy et al., 2015). Therefore, it can be set forth that ‘reasons against’ will have negative influence over attitude and intention for webrooming behavior. It is proposed that:

H2b: ‘Reasons against’ will have negative influence over attitude towards webrooming behavior.
H3b: ‘Reasons against’ will have negative influence over webrooming intention.

Values and Reasoning
Values are cognitive patterns utilized by individuals to evaluate and respond to people, matters, and phenomenon (Schwartz, Sagiv, and Boehnke, 2000). Research has demonstrated that consumers
justifies adoption of a certain behavior based on reasons which are influenced by deep-rooted values they hold (Baker et al., 2004). Research has shown that shopping values influence consumer purchase behavior (Babin et al., 1994). Consumers prefer to make purchases from the shopping channel that is compatible with their values for shopping (Avnet & Higgins, 2006). For consumers who possess utilitarian values, shopping is an activity which they want to accomplish efficiently (Büttner, Florack, and G’oritz, 2013). Nonetheless, consumers can also experience smart shopping by integrating multiple shopping channels in their purchase process (Aw, 2019). Thus, it is necessary to understand the association between values and the ‘reasons for’ and ‘reasons against’ the webrooming behavior. It is postulated that:

**H4a:** Utilitarian values will have a positive influence on consumers’ reasons for webrooming behavior

**H4b:** Utilitarian values will have a negative influence on consumers’ reasons against webrooming behavior.

### Values and Attitudes

Values are the guidelines that influence individuals’ attitude which ultimately influence individuals’ distinct behaviors (de Barcellos et al., 2015). In BRT, Westaby (2005) described that attitude substantially determine intentions and behaviors across distinct disciplines. It has been validated that hedonic and utilitarian shopping values influence consumer purchase behavior (Babin et al., 1994). Importance of individuals’ values in determining their attitudes has also been endorsed by other behavioral theories, such as the TPB and TAM. Hence, it can be proposed that consumer values influence attitude towards webrooming. The following statement is hypothesized:

**H5:** Utilitarian values will have direct positive influence over attitude towards webrooming behavior.

### Research Framework
Proposed Methodology
The model proposed in the present study needs to be tested for empirical validity. For this purpose, quantitative research based on survey should be conducted. A qualitative study can also be carried using in-depth interviews and focus group discussions to explore deeper insights about the reasons acting as antecedents towards the webrooming behavior in omni-channel environment.

Discussion and Implications
This study contributes theoretically to the existing literature about webrooming behavior by examining consumers’ reasons influencing consumers’ webrooming intention in omni-channel environment. Utilizing BRT framework, this study has proposed hypotheses based on previous literature and calls for empirical verification of the proposed model. There has been a call for research to investigate and examine critical determinants of webrooming conduct (Aw et al., 2021). Existing studies have revealed valuable findings about webrooming behavior but there has been no study so far about consumer reasons that influence consumer webrooming intention in omni-channel context. This study is the pioneer study to utilize theory of BRT to examine webrooming conduct. The study accentuates that consumers’ “reasons” significantly influence attitude and intention towards webrooming behavior. The study reports that haptic evaluation of the products significantly motivates consumers towards webrooming behavior because it helps consumers to be confident about their purchase (Flavián, Gurrea, and Orus, 2016). The sales staff assistance helps consumers in better fit selection of the product by providing information about the products (Arora & Sahney, 2018). However, the impact of sales staff assistance on webrooming behavior needs to be explored and examined further as the relationship has limited and different findings (Aw et al., 2021). In line with previous literature (Juaneda-Ayensa, Mosquera, and Murillo, 2016), it is proposed that offline purchase effort negatively effects consumer webrooming intention. Similarly, conforming with past studies (Aw, 2019), it is proposed that perceived cost-saving has a negative influence on consumer webrooming intention have shown that digital channels offer greater price benefits, which impel consumers towards showrooming instead of webrooming behavior. However, the relationship between cost-saving and webrooming intention needs further investigation as studies have different findings.

The findings of this study are useful for the single and multi-channel retailers dealing with cross-channel purchase behavior of consumers, to devise and implement omni-channel retail strategies, in order to retain their customers. Webrooming behavior erodes the sales of online retailers (Chiu et al., 2011), so the online retailers need to implement strategies to create positive consumer attitude towards online buying, for instance, use of advance technologies like 3D videos, flexible zoom-in options and augmented reality could replace the tactile evaluation of the products and would make the purchase experience entertaining (Duarte & e Silva, 2018). Similarly, by providing instant digital customer assistance to provide product information and answers to queries of customers, online retailers can overcome lack of physical sales personnel assistance which motivates consumers towards webrooming. On the other hand, offline retailers can offer competitive price deals, discounts, and promotional offers to counter consumer perception of cost-saving available on digital channels. Moreover, offline retailers can make use of advanced technologies like mobile apps to help consumers locate retailers offering their desired products (Dekimpe, Geyskens, and Gielens, 2020) thus offering consumers a quick, convenient and efficient shopping experience.

Limitations and Future Research.
The present conceptual study lacks empirical evidence. The findings of the empirical study may vary from the expected results. The future studies can investigate the influence of other consumer reasons for/against attitude and intention towards webrooming. Besides consumer reasons, impact of other factors such as online customer reviews, product assortment and constructs related to latest technologies, can also be examined. Hence, the limitations in the present study offer many
opportunities for future research to gain deeper understanding about webrooming behavior in omni-channel context.

**Disclosure Statement**
The authors report no potential conflict of interest.

**References**


Calisir, F., Altin Gumussoy, C. and Bayram, A. (2009). *Predicting the behavioral intention to use enterprise resource planning systems: An exploratory extension of the technology acceptance*


https://www.jrni.com/blog/webrooming-vs-showrooming


Socio-Cultural Interest and Motivational Barriers for Female Sports Participation in Pakistan: A Comparative Study of Universities and Colleges

*Muhammad Raza*, Research Scholar, School of Sports Management Department of Sports Humanities and Sociology Beijing Sport University, Beijing, China  
*Huang Ya Ling*, Professor, Beijing Sport University, Beijing, China  
*Syed Muhammad Zeeshan Haider Hamdani*, Lecturer, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, Pakistan, Research Scholar, Shanghai University, Shanghai, China  
*Syed Ghufran Hadier*, Department of Sports Sciences, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email: razasandhal12@gmail.com*

**ARTICLE DETAILS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>History</th>
<th>ABSTRACT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **History**  
Revised format: May 2022  
Available Online: Jun 2022 | **Purpose**: This study's primary objective was to analyze the situation of Pakistani females' sports participation and to determine which Socio-Cultural, Interest, and Motivational barriers currently impede their sports participation and how these barriers can be reduced by adopting the feministic approach in sports, which is based on Bandura's social cognitive theory. |
| **Keywords**  
Socio-cultural, Sports participation, Social cognitive theory, Mixed methodology, Interest and Motivation. | **Methodology**: This study employed mix-method research methodology, based on both qualitative and quantitative research design. Qualitative data of 8-HODs and quantitative data of 592-female students from the 8 selected public colleges and universities in Southern Punjab-Pakistan was collected through close-ended and open ended questionnaires with convenient sampling technique. For data analysis, SPSS v.20 was used. Descriptive and correlations analysis was conducted to find the differences and association among the variables. |
| **JEL Classification**  
Z0, Z2 | **Conclusions**: Regarding sociocultural factors, this study shows that family support, interest, and motivation are significantly and positively correlated with female sports participation, whereas religious and cultural limitations have an nonsignificant and negative impact on female sports participation. Although these socio-cultural factors impact is not much significant in the colleges as compare to the universities, but overall, their parents’ negative attitude, expectations for academic performance and unawareness regarding sports benefits, females feel uncomfortable, less passion and interest in sports participation. Further, it was also found, in both universities and colleges, that Islamic dress code, male permission, no proper changing rooms, cultural conflicts, mix-gender sports, less freedom of solely movement, discouragement by society/culture are the major dimensions of religious and cultural limitations towards sports participation. Along with new dimensions and locality, the current study was a first attempt to provide the practitioners, |

547
policy makers and researchers to understand the issues of cultural and religious, interest and motivation and family support towards female sports participation in Pakistan.

© 2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-4.0


**Introduction**

In today's society, when the digital world makes us all sedentary and sluggish, physical activity is crucial. Exercise and physical activity are necessary for attaining physical, mental, and emotional wellness. Physical activity has a significant effect on sport skills, psychological, social, and physical development (Hussain et al., 2011; Khan et al., 2012; Edim and Odok, 2015). Sport is a human activity that helps differentiate individuals' interests and is open to everybody, regardless of age, socioeconomic standing, or religion. Sport is a structured and institutionalized activity containing intense physical exertion, competition, and power (Ajadi and Kayode, 2021). In addition to health benefits, sports in universities assist to integrate youth from varied backgrounds, orientations, and socioeconomic status into a variety of healthful activities. The establishment of educational sports programming helps realize social cultural aspirations for women in sports. This is how sport promotes cultural values in society.

According to studies by Knapp (2011) and Aquilina (2013), the majority of elite Olympians during the past two decades came from universities, and participated in international sports competitions. In Pakistan, female college and university athletes are not trained adequately to compete in national and international sports tournaments. According to the history of international sports, Pakistani athletes once dominated in cricket, hockey, polo, kabaddi, snooker, etc., but this status has been lost owing to societal restraints. The researcher desired to determine the true causes for the decline in sports participation in Pakistan. Consequently, the researcher intended to investigate the socio-cultural, interest, and motivational factors influencing women's engagement in sports in Southern Punjab-Pakistan. For this objective, the researcher focuses on female students at public universities and colleges. This research is comparative in nature because it was conducted at public colleges and universities in Punjab-Pakistan.

Previous studies indicated that exercise has a greater scope during this time and benefits health. Society must recognize sport's cultural, economic, and social relevance to create a positive attitude toward competitions (Eraslan, 2015; McMorris, 2016). Previous research has shown a correlation between sports and education. Due to its vitality and significance for physical growth, physical activities are no longer regarded a kind of recreation at educational institutions (Li et al., 2014; Kee et al., 2018). Incentives for college athletes improve rankings, these incentives include scholarships, jobs and cash prizes. The motivation of athletes can improve student enthusiasm and sports involvement in schools (Gavin et al., 2014; Howie et al., 2020). Physical exercise, parental support, and self-esteem all play a role in academic achievement (Sad 2012; Loprinzi et al., 2013). Sport is a component of almost every healthy community (Bashir et al., 2017). Similar to other social challenges, "equality in sport" has roots in the history in sport (Ullah & Ullah, 2020), and research demonstrates gender differences in sports participation (Henderson, 2014). Men participate in more professional and recreational sports and physical activities than women (Ullah et al., 2013, Laar et al., 2019). To discover characteristics and causes such as female interest and motivation in sports, additional research is required.
Previous study has demonstrated that factors influencing the internal and external motivation of athletes lead to a decline in athletic participation and that motivation influences decision-making. (Aanerud, 1997; Van Heerden, 2014; Arajo and Dosil, 2015). Diverse sporting incentives can increase sports participation and athlete engagement. It can be used to evaluate progress and motivate behaviour modification. When it comes to introspection, there are two important factors: regularity and closeness. Regularity involves always observing the behaviour, and closeness means observing it when it happens or soon after. Self-observation isn't adequate because motivation depends on results and effects Bandura (1995).

According to a study by Tekin and Güllü (2010), female students do not comprehend religious teachings, and their perception of recreational sports is influenced by social and cultural norms rather than the Quran and hadiths. Yet another study conducted by Agergaard (2016) to comprehend the impact of religion and culture, as well as how Danish Muslim girls interpret religion and culture in sports, reveals that the cultural interpretation of religion has a substantial effect on the participation of Muslim girls in sports. The above discussion of cognitive social theory of Bandura (1995) explains the various dimensions of women's participation in sport. Based on these dimensions, the researchers drew a conceptual framework in Figure 1.

![Figure 1: Conceptual Framework](image)

**Methodology**

The core objective of the study was to find out the impacts of Socio-Cultural, Interest and Motivational barriers on females’ sports participation at university and college level in Pakistan. This study was conducted through mixed-methodology (both qualitative and quantitative) as suggested by (Teddlie and Tashakkori, 2009; Morgan, 2014) in this type of studies. Two questionnaires, based on socio-cultural dimensions i.e. cultural and religious, interest and motivation, family support and sports participation, were developed and administrated.

**Population, Sample and Data Collection**

Concerning the difference between 'University' and 'College,' it should be noted that in China, each university has its own college within it, but in Pakistan, colleges and universities provide education separately because colleges are affiliated and registered under the Board of Intermediate and Secondary Education, which provides only intermediate (2-Years) certification, while universities are registered and affiliated with HEC, Pakistan. Therefore, in the current study, the two sampling technique were used i.e. convenience sampling for data collection and Stratified proportional sampling for sampling size. Due to the social distancing during COVID-19, it was not possible to access all universities and colleges located in the study area, therefore, the selection of universities and colleges was made by convenience sampling approach. Dornyei and Taguchi (2009) and Etikan et al. (2016) propose convenience sampling if certain practical conditions are met, such as easy accessibility, geographical proximity, willingness to participate, and availability at a particular time. Then, the data was categorized by district, education, and institute under stratified proportional allocation. Population from the selected public colleges and universities was measured 11343 female students and 65 HODs (Punjab Bureau of Statistics, 2017-18). Researchers typically use the 95% confidence interval and 4% error margin proposed by Slovin's method to determine sample size when the characteristics of the population being studied are unknown (Ellen 2012). For sample size measurement, the details of Slovin's formula as under;

\[ n = \frac{N \cdot \sigma^2}{1 + N \cdot \sigma^2} \]
Where
\[ n = \text{Number of populations} \]
\[ N = \text{Total Population} \]
\[ e = \text{error Margin (4\% = 0.04)} \]

so
\[ n = \frac{11343}{1+11343(0.04)^2} \]
\[ n = \frac{11343}{1+18.1488} \]
\[ n = 592 \]

Thus, 592-female students and 8-HODs were sampled. The respondents’ demographic characteristics of academic program, gender, university/college and district were examined. Five point likert scale (from 5= Strongly Disagree to 1=Strongly Agree) was used for data collection and thereafter for coding in SPSS v.20.

Measurement of the Study’s Variables
The Scale of Sports Interest and Motivation (SMS) was designed by Pelletier et al., (1995) to measure five elements of interest and motivation using 5-point Likert options. The scale of Family Support (FS) was established by Dunst and Leet (1985) to measure five elements of family support using 5-point Likert options. The scale of Cultural and Religious (CR) developed by Khodayarifard et al., (2018) to measure five cultural and religious traits on a 5-point Likert scale. In order to interpret Mean Scores against the responses of 5-likert scale, the ranges of mean scores are considered as Mean Score 1.00-2.99 is equal to Disagree/Never (Negative) and Mean Score 3.00-4.00 is equal to Agree/Always (Positive).

Data Analysis
SPSS version 20 and Microsoft Excel version 10 were used for research-based data analysis. SPSS version 20 was employed for quantitative analysis (descriptive, frequency, percentage). Also applied regression analysis, reliability analysis, one sample t-test, and correlation analysis.

Reliability
A pilot test was conducted before the final research in which 33 female students from Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan was surveyed using the same scales, which were revised and changed based on expert opinion and pilot study results. Therefore, the final and valid questionnaire was used in this study. To check reliability, data of 592 participants against 20 items through final questionnaire of this study was collected and the scale reliability analysis was conducted. All four scales achieved the minimum required Cronbach's Alpha value (>0.7), as indicated by the results reliability scale.

Results
In the table 1 descriptive analysis of demographic characteristics of 592 respondents were processed along with percentages. Table 1 reveals that majority of respondents are; Bachelor degree holder (246, 41.6%), University students (361, 61%) and students belong to Multan (260, 43.9%) out of 592 respondents. These statistics show the current status of students in which majority of female students are currently studying in Bachelor program in universities of Multan which supports the statistics of Pakistan Sports Board (PSB, 2021) that the majority of females who are currently participating in sports bearing bachelor degree holder and belong universities of Multan district in Southern-Punjab, Pakistan.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1: Demographic Statistics</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Education-wise</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intermediate</td>
<td>231</td>
<td>39.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor</td>
<td>246</td>
<td>41.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Master</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>19.4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Interpretation of Responses

In order to interpret mean scores against the responses of 5-likert scale, the ranges of mean scores are explained as; a). Mean Score 1.00-2.99 is equal to Disagree/Never (Negative); b). Mean Score 3.00-4.00 is equal to Agree/Always (Positive). Under the Interest and Motivation in table 2, mean values of 1.77, 2.10, 2.26, 2.29, 2.38 scored by colleges and 2.15, 2.19, 2.38, 2.36, 2.51 scored by universities are negative (less than 3.0) which also reveals the universities have comparatively better level than colleges while the female students of both type of educational institutes disagreed that; firstly, they want to participate in sports because they have a passion and interest for it, secondly, they want to get sports participation to be more accepted in society, thirdly, sport is a source of happiness and health, fourthly, sport increases social integration and they want to be famous through sports, fifthly, they want to remove their academic stress through sports participation. Further, the highest total score of mean 2.79 among 5-items indicates the strongest factor of happiness and health on their participation while the weakest factor (total score 2.15 < 3.0) of sports participation on their more acceptances in society.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>SA</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>UN</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>I participate in sports because I have a great passion for it.</td>
<td>College</td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
<td>16.6%</td>
<td>12.3%</td>
<td>5.9%</td>
<td>3.0%</td>
<td>1.2%</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>University</td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>155</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>361</td>
<td>2.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
<td>24.7%</td>
<td>26.2%</td>
<td>4.2%</td>
<td>5.1%</td>
<td>0.8%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>244</td>
<td>228</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>592</td>
<td>2.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
<td>41.2%</td>
<td>38.5%</td>
<td>10.1%</td>
<td>8.1%</td>
<td>2.0%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>I want to get sports participation because it enhances the more acceptances in society.</td>
<td>College</td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
<td>12.2%</td>
<td>17.2%</td>
<td>4.7%</td>
<td>3.5%</td>
<td>1.4%</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>University</td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>122</td>
<td>141</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
<td>20.6%</td>
<td>23.8%</td>
<td>5.9%</td>
<td>6.8%</td>
<td>3.7%</td>
<td>0.2%</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>194</td>
<td>243</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
<td>32.8%</td>
<td>41.0%</td>
<td>10.6%</td>
<td>10.3%</td>
<td>5.1%</td>
<td>0.2%</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Sport is a source of happiness and health so I want to get sports participate.</td>
<td>College</td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
<td>17.6%</td>
<td>16.4%</td>
<td>2.7%</td>
<td>1.7%</td>
<td>0.7%</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>University</td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>157</td>
<td>151</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>361</td>
<td>2.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
<td>26.5%</td>
<td>25.5%</td>
<td>5.1%</td>
<td>2.2%</td>
<td>1.7%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>261</td>
<td>248</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>592</td>
<td>2.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
<td>44.1%</td>
<td>41.9%</td>
<td>7.8%</td>
<td>3.9%</td>
<td>2.4%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Sports increase social integration so I want to be famous through sports.</td>
<td>College</td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
<td>15.0%</td>
<td>10.6%</td>
<td>4.1%</td>
<td>5.7%</td>
<td>3.5%</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>University</td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>133</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>361</td>
<td>2.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
<td>18.9%</td>
<td>22.5%</td>
<td>7.9%</td>
<td>8.3%</td>
<td>3.4%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>201</td>
<td>196</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>592</td>
<td>2.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
<td>34.0%</td>
<td>33.1%</td>
<td>12.0%</td>
<td>14.0%</td>
<td>6.9%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
I remove my academic stress through sports participation.

The table 3 shows mean values of 3.01, 3.15, 3.01, 3.01 scored by colleges and 3.09, 3.27, 3.07, 3.03 scored by universities are positive (above than 3.0) which also reveals the universities have comparatively better level than colleges while the female students of both type of educational institutes agreed that; firstly, students sports activities are less due to their parent’s negative attitude towards their sports participation, secondly, parent’s expectation regarding their children’s best academic performance negatively influence their sport participation, thirdly, regarding the usefulness of sport, parents’ unawareness is a barrier towards prompt participation. Fourthly, parents’ fear for their children to be injured during sports activity reduced sport participation. Table 3 also shows negative (less than 3.0) mean values of 2.36 scored by colleges and 2.19 scored by universities which reveals the college have better level than universities while both disagreed that, family financial problems of the students negatively affect their sports participation. Further, the highest total score of mean 3.46 among 5-items indicates the strongest effect of parent’s expectation regarding their children’s best academic performance on their sport participation while the weakest factor (total score 2.30 < 3.0) show the family financial problems on their sports participation.

**Table 3: Responses to Family Support**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>College</th>
<th>University</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Students sports activities are affected by their parent’s negative attitude towards their sports participation</td>
<td>Count 80</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>193</td>
<td>3.01</td>
<td>1.082</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% 13.5%</td>
<td>19.1%</td>
<td>32.6%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count 95</td>
<td>176</td>
<td>271</td>
<td>3.12</td>
<td>1.170</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% 16.0%</td>
<td>29.7%</td>
<td>45.8%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count 28</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>1.75</td>
<td>0.804</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% 4.7%</td>
<td>3.2%</td>
<td>7.9%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count 18</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>1.70</td>
<td>0.800</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% 3.0%</td>
<td>6.8%</td>
<td>11.7%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count 10</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>1.75</td>
<td>0.804</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% 1.7%</td>
<td>3.7%</td>
<td>4.2%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count 231</td>
<td>361</td>
<td>592</td>
<td>3.17</td>
<td>1.070</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Family financial problems of the students affect their sports participation.</td>
<td>Count 82</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>2.36</td>
<td>1.125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% 13.9%</td>
<td>10.6%</td>
<td>24.5%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count 70</td>
<td>181</td>
<td>251</td>
<td>1.89</td>
<td>0.944</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% 11.8%</td>
<td>30.6%</td>
<td>42.4%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count 47</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>1.80</td>
<td>0.896</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% 7.9%</td>
<td>8.8%</td>
<td>16.7%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count 24</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>1.75</td>
<td>0.804</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% 4.1%</td>
<td>3.7%</td>
<td>11.3%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count 8</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>592</td>
<td>3.15</td>
<td>1.170</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% 14.5%</td>
<td>30.6%</td>
<td>24.4%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Parent’s expectation regarding their children’s best academic performance influence their sport participation.</td>
<td>Count 58</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>138</td>
<td>3.15</td>
<td>1.170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% 9.8%</td>
<td>13.5%</td>
<td>23.3%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count 86</td>
<td>155</td>
<td>241</td>
<td>1.79</td>
<td>0.896</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% 14.5%</td>
<td>30.6%</td>
<td>40.7%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count 39</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>1.80</td>
<td>0.896</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% 6.6%</td>
<td>8.8%</td>
<td>16.9%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count 36</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>1.75</td>
<td>0.804</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% 6.1%</td>
<td>10.3%</td>
<td>14.9%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count 12</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>1.75</td>
<td>0.804</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% 2.0%</td>
<td>2.2%</td>
<td>4.2%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count 231</td>
<td>361</td>
<td>592</td>
<td>3.15</td>
<td>1.170</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Regarding the usefulness of sport, parents’ unawareness is a barrier towards prompt participation.</td>
<td>Count 76</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>151</td>
<td>3.01</td>
<td>1.172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% 12.8%</td>
<td>12.7%</td>
<td>25.5%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count 81</td>
<td>196</td>
<td>277</td>
<td>1.86</td>
<td>0.950</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% 13.7%</td>
<td>33.1%</td>
<td>46.8%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count 37</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>1.75</td>
<td>0.804</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% 6.2%</td>
<td>6.4%</td>
<td>12.7%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count 24</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>1.75</td>
<td>0.804</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% 4.1%</td>
<td>6.2%</td>
<td>10.3%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count 13</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>1.75</td>
<td>0.804</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% 2.2%</td>
<td>2.5%</td>
<td>4.7%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count 231</td>
<td>361</td>
<td>592</td>
<td>3.01</td>
<td>1.170</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Parents’ fear for</td>
<td>Count 77</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>151</td>
<td>3.01</td>
<td>1.183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>College</td>
<td>University</td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count 90</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>186</td>
<td>1.83</td>
<td>0.947</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% 12.0%</td>
<td>13.1%</td>
<td>25.5%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count 23</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>1.75</td>
<td>0.804</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% 3.2%</td>
<td>6.4%</td>
<td>12.7%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count 13</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>1.75</td>
<td>0.804</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% 2.2%</td>
<td>2.5%</td>
<td>4.7%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count 231</td>
<td>361</td>
<td>592</td>
<td>3.01</td>
<td>1.183</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

552
The table 4 shows mean values of 3.05, 3.12, 3.08, 3.03 scored by colleges and 3.10, 3.21, 3.02, 3.14 scored by universities are positive (above than 3.0) which also reveals the universities have comparatively better level than colleges while the female students of both type of educational institutes agreed that; firstly, most of the athletes are refrained to participate in sport activities due to religious restrictions and beliefs, secondly, females are not allowed to participate in sports due to cultural grounds, thirdly, females avoid to participate in sports due to co-cultural values, fourthly, female athletes are restricted to participate at international and national level competitions due to their socio-cultural limitations. Table 4.13 also shows negative (less than 3.0) mean value of 210 scored by colleges and 2.39 scored by universities which reveals the universities have better level than colleges while both disagreed that, veil (Parda/ Hijab) and other cultural values are hurdles to promote sports among female. Further, the highest total score of mean 3.70 among 5-items indicates the strongest effect of socio-cultural limitations on female sports partition while the weakest factor (total score 2.28 < 3.0) show that Veil (Parda/ Hijab) and other cultural values on sports among female.

### Table 4: Responses to Religious and Cultural Limitations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>College</th>
<th>University</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Most of the athletes may be refrained to participate in sport activities due to religious restrictions and beliefs.</td>
<td>Count 48</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>138</td>
<td>3.05</td>
<td>1.193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
<td>8.1%</td>
<td>15.5%</td>
<td>9.5%</td>
<td>1.5%</td>
<td>4.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>15.2%</td>
<td>24.7%</td>
<td>13.0%</td>
<td>3.9%</td>
<td>4.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count 92</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>238</td>
<td>3.10</td>
<td>1.120</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
<td>19.9%</td>
<td>23.8%</td>
<td>11.3%</td>
<td>4.4%</td>
<td>3.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>23.3%</td>
<td>40.2%</td>
<td>22.5%</td>
<td>5.4%</td>
<td>8.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Females are not allowed to participate in sports due to cultural grounds.</td>
<td>Count 52</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>158</td>
<td>3.12</td>
<td>1.103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
<td>8.8%</td>
<td>16.9%</td>
<td>8.4%</td>
<td>2.0%</td>
<td>2.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>17.9%</td>
<td>23.8%</td>
<td>11.3%</td>
<td>4.4%</td>
<td>3.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count 100</td>
<td>141</td>
<td>241</td>
<td>3.25</td>
<td>1.113</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
<td>26.7%</td>
<td>40.7%</td>
<td>19.8%</td>
<td>6.4%</td>
<td>6.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Veil (Parda/Hijab) and other cultural values are hurdles to promote sports among female</td>
<td>Count 92</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>2.10</td>
<td>1.236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
<td>15.5%</td>
<td>12.7%</td>
<td>5.6%</td>
<td>1.7%</td>
<td>3.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>21.6%</td>
<td>16.2%</td>
<td>9.1%</td>
<td>6.1%</td>
<td>7.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count 75</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>171</td>
<td>2.39</td>
<td>1.390</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
<td>37.2%</td>
<td>28.9%</td>
<td>14.7%</td>
<td>7.8%</td>
<td>11.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Females avoid to participate in sports due to co-events of sports competitions.</td>
<td>Count 57</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>3.08</td>
<td>1.184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
<td>9.6%</td>
<td>15.2%</td>
<td>6.9%</td>
<td>4.4%</td>
<td>2.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>10.3%</td>
<td>25.5%</td>
<td>13.7%</td>
<td>6.2%</td>
<td>5.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count 90</td>
<td>151</td>
<td>241</td>
<td>3.02</td>
<td>1.145</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
<td>19.9%</td>
<td>40.7%</td>
<td>20.6%</td>
<td>10.6%</td>
<td>8.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Female athletes are restricted to participate at</td>
<td>Count 51</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>3.03</td>
<td>1.322</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
<td>8.6%</td>
<td>12.5%</td>
<td>8.3%</td>
<td>4.1%</td>
<td>5.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>10.9%</td>
<td>15.6%</td>
<td>10.7%</td>
<td>4.5%</td>
<td>6.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The table 5 shows mean values of 2.29, 2.65, 2.52 scored by colleges and 2.74, 2.81, 2.66 scored by universities are negative (less than 3.0) which also reveals the universities have comparatively better level than colleges while the female students of both type of educational institutes disagreed that; firstly, they are regular participants in their institutional sports activities, secondly, they feel themselves healthier and physically fit due to their sports participation, thirdly, due to sports participation, they sustain their attachment with their class fellows. Further, the highest total score of mean 2.92 among 3-items indicates the strongest factor of regular participant in institutional sports activities while the weakest factor (total score 2.76 < 3.0) of sports participation on their attachment with their class fellows.

**Table 5: Responses to Sports Participation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>College Count</th>
<th>SA</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>UN</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>I am a regular participant in my institutional sports activities.</td>
<td></td>
<td>% 6.9%</td>
<td>7.9%</td>
<td>5.2%</td>
<td>4.7%</td>
<td>14.2%</td>
<td>39.0%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>University Count</td>
<td>% 13.3%</td>
<td>14.2%</td>
<td>10.3%</td>
<td>9.0%</td>
<td>14.2%</td>
<td>61.0%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total Count</td>
<td>% 20.3%</td>
<td>22.1%</td>
<td>15.5%</td>
<td>13.7%</td>
<td>28.4%</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>I feel myself healthier and physically fit due to my sports participation.</td>
<td></td>
<td>% 14.4%</td>
<td>7.3%</td>
<td>4.9%</td>
<td>2.5%</td>
<td>10.0%</td>
<td>39.0%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>University Count</td>
<td>% 24.2%</td>
<td>13.2%</td>
<td>10.5%</td>
<td>6.8%</td>
<td>6.4%</td>
<td>61.0%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total Count</td>
<td>% 38.5%</td>
<td>20.4%</td>
<td>15.4%</td>
<td>9.3%</td>
<td>16.4%</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Due to sports participation, i sustain my attachment with my class fellows</td>
<td></td>
<td>% 10.1%</td>
<td>7.3%</td>
<td>7.9%</td>
<td>2.9%</td>
<td>10.8%</td>
<td>39.0%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>University Count</td>
<td>% 20.3%</td>
<td>11.5%</td>
<td>9.5%</td>
<td>8.3%</td>
<td>11.5%</td>
<td>61.0%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total Count</td>
<td>% 30.4%</td>
<td>18.8%</td>
<td>17.4%</td>
<td>11.1%</td>
<td>22.3%</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6 shows the Institute-wise comparison in which highest mean score 12.21 shows that the majority of females sports participants belong to Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan while the rest of mean scores 10.94, 8.31, 7.83, 7.60, 7.53, 7.50, 6.58 belong to Islamia University (Bahawalpur), University of Education (Multan), Ghazi University (D.G.Khan), Govt. Girls College (Bahawalpur), Govt. Associate College (Multan), Govt. Post Graduate College (D.G.Khan) and Govt. Girls College (Multan) respectively.

**Table 6: Institute-wise Comparison**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institute Name</th>
<th>Interest and Motivation</th>
<th>Family Support</th>
<th>Religious and Cultural Limitations</th>
<th>Sports Participation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BZU (n=88)</td>
<td>Mean 12.80</td>
<td>12.33</td>
<td>13.08</td>
<td>12.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>S.D 4.29</td>
<td>4.42</td>
<td>6.30</td>
<td>3.37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UE (n=81)</td>
<td>Mean 10.57</td>
<td>10.53</td>
<td>12.40</td>
<td>8.31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>S.D 3.30</td>
<td>3.17</td>
<td>4.38</td>
<td>3.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IUB (n=141)</td>
<td>Mean 9.98</td>
<td>11.13</td>
<td>11.82</td>
<td>10.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>S.D 3.51</td>
<td>3.12</td>
<td>3.50</td>
<td>2.55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ghazi (n=51)</td>
<td>Mean 9.69</td>
<td>12.25</td>
<td>12.16</td>
<td>7.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>S.D 3.23</td>
<td>4.73</td>
<td>3.32</td>
<td>3.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GAC Chungi 6 (n=36)</td>
<td>Mean 11.28</td>
<td>10.08</td>
<td>11.67</td>
<td>7.53</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 7 shows that, the correlations among study variables are examined through Pearson correlation test. In this study, table 12 indicates the correlations values among four variables of this study. Pearson Correlation and 2-tailed values are shown significant and positive (p>.05) relationship of Interest and Motivation, Family Support with Females Sports Participation while an insignificant (p<.05) and negative relationship is found between Religious and Cultural Limitations with Female Sports Participation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Interest and Motivation</th>
<th>Family Support</th>
<th>Religious and Cultural Limitations</th>
<th>Sports Participation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Interest and Motivation</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family Support</td>
<td>.292*</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religious and Cultural Limitations</td>
<td>-.191</td>
<td>-.389</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sports Participation</td>
<td>.387*</td>
<td>.001</td>
<td>-.071</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).

Discussion

Physical activity is crucial in today's digitally sedentary world. Physical and mental health depend on exercise and physical activity. Sports and games are important physical activities that help nations establish healthy lifestyles. Previous research (Hussain et al., 2011, Khan et al., 2012; Edim and Odok, 2015) revealed that sports involvement benefits a country's health and economy. In Pakistan, despite the growing recognition of the importance of sport for physical, mental and emotional health, sport opportunities for girls and women are very limited. Women, regardless of age and ethnic origin, do less sport than men in Pakistan (Ullah et al., 2013). In order to examine the impacts of internal and external socio-cultural factors on females sports participation generally and in Pakistan particularly, this research was conducted. Being a home town of the researcher, four public universities and colleges in Southern Punjab-Pakistan were selected and quantitative data of 592-female students and qualitative data of 8-HODs was collected through well-developed Questionnaire. Findings of this study show that statically the relationship of socio-cultural factor interest and motivation of females in sports participation is found significant and positive. Although, the universities’ students have comparatively better level than colleges but the female students of both type of educational institutes don’t want to participate in sports because they haven’t any passion and interest for it, secondly, they don’t want to get sports participation to be more accepted in society, thirdly, they don’t consider that sport is a source of happiness and health, fourthly, they don’t want to be famous through sports because sport increases social integration, fifthly, they don’t consider that their academic stress is removed through sports participation.

Moreover, correlation of interest and motivation with female sports participation is found significant and positive which means female sports participation may be increased if interest and motivation among females are increased. Further, the findings of qualitative data analysis of HODs shows that less interest and motivation has strongest negative factor on their sports participation while Sports Policy, Security and Health Facilities, Gender Discrimination and Access to Sports Equipment are major other negative factors respectively. These findings match the results with (Li, Chi et al. 2011; Ellapen, Bowyer et al. 2014; Warner, Schüz et al. 2014), in which they found that an active lifestyle is what motivates young people to exercise. This research supports the view that beauty and attractiveness are a top priority for teenagers, and most of them believe that by participating in this sport, they can achieve both. Physical aspects include health, attractiveness, appearance, and increased muscle strength; while the psychological aspects of mental strength, self-esteem, vitality, spiritual energy, prices, etc. In most sporting activities, these physical and psychological benefits complement each other. Gaining exercise through dietary supplements / prizes is a very important...
driving force that can motivate people to exercise. This is certainly a good reason for sports tourism.

Findings of this study show that statically the relationship of socio-cultural factor family support of females in sports participation is found significant and positive. Although, the universities’ students have comparatively better level than colleges but the female students of both type of educational institutes don’t want to participate in sports because, firstly, students sports activities are less due to their parent’s negative attitude towards their sports participation, secondly, parent’s expectation regarding their children’s best academic performance negatively influence their sport participation, thirdly, regarding the usefulness of sport, parents’ unawareness is a barrier towards prompt participation. Fourthly, parents’ fear for their children to be injured during sports activity reduced sport participation. These results are in line with the findings of the studies by (SARDAR, Reed-Knight, Blount et al. 2014; Edim and Odok, 2015; Aminat, 2016; Osai and Whiteman 2017, Chukwurah, Malete et al. 2022) in which they concluded that the role of parents in encouraging schoolgirls to engage in healthy physical activity is very important but, unfortunately, the traditional patriarchal family system is a major obstacle for female athletes. They, usually, banned their daughters to participate in sports. These studies found that, on the participation of girls in sport, the parental education and their attitudes towards sporting activities of girls as well as the school environment are the main factors.

Findings of this study show that the relationship of socio-cultural factor religious beliefs of females in sports participation is found significant and positive. Although, the universities’ students have comparatively better level than colleges but the female students of both type of educational institutes don’t want to participate in sports because, firstly, most of the athletes are refrained to participate in sport activities due to religious restrictions and beliefs, secondly, females are not allowed to participate in sports due to cultural grounds, thirdly, females avoid to participate in sports due to co-events of sports competitions, fourthly, female athletes are restricted to participate at international and national level competitions due to their socio-cultural limitations. These findings are similar with the studies of (Edim and Odok 2015, Kubayi 2015, Akyüz, Agar et al. 2016; Lenneis and Pfister, 2017; Naseer, Javed et al. 2019) reported that Religious beliefs can influence the participation of Muslim students in sport because most Muslim female students refuse to participate in sports because of their cultural and religious beliefs. Muslim faith and culture have always safeguarded Muslims’ sanctity, hence they can't wear sportswear. Each culture adheres to its cultural conventions and traditions. Theoretically, the above findings also prove the concepts of Bandura (Bandura, 1995), who defined sports related religious and cultural beliefs as “self-control is also becoming a key factor in religious life. By controlling peoples’ beliefs and faith, people can be restricted from sports activities due to their cultural ethics. Peoples’ social and cultural based on the principle of self-regulation reduce their social and physical activities” Bandura (Bandura, 1995).

Conclusion
The findings of this study show that the participation of female students in sports is much lower than male students in Pakistan due to the Socio-Cultural, Interest and Motivational Barriers. The study reveals that without family and religious support, females sports participation could not be increased, therefore, guardians/parents as well as religious icons must be coordinated and engaged to conduct such sports activities in the specific areas. Further, this study has targeted universities and colleges, therefore, the higher education commission and education department should emphasize the critical situation and make plans to conduct such regular events in universities and colleges with the coordination of civil society to increase awareness regarding benefits of sports activities with focusing females participation in sports without any internal and external hurdles as mentioned in this study.

Study Limitations
This study is limited to the socio-cultural, interest and motivational barriers for female sports
participation. Further studies may be conducted on other barriers of female sports participation. Similarly, this study is also limited to study area of southern-Punjab, Pakistan. Further studies may be conducted in other areas of Pakistan to know geographical factors related to the female sports participation. Moreover, this study targeted the females only from universities and colleges, while schools are also targeted under the same factors of this study to know to what extent female sports participation is influenced by the nature of educational institute.

**Practical Implications**
This study has addressed the most critical socio-cultural issues which are currently negatively influence females’ sports participation in Pakistan. Females are 55% of total population of Pakistan but, unfortunately, only 5% participates in sports while 50% among them are still inactive due to socio-cultural factors. Findings of this study highlight the core issues which are need to be addressed in order to increase female sports participation rate in Pakistan. Policy makers, sports boards, universities, colleges and society can move forward with the help of this study’s findings. Sports bodies and boards should reduce the socio-cultural barriers by facilitate females best opportunities, nearest and easily accessible sports ground and activities wherein females, whether they are students or not, invited with pick and drop facilities while the incentive and awards are also need to encourage females to participate these sports activities.

The researcher recommends that students, teachers, and management in public and private universities and colleges emphasize the benefits of girls' sports involvement and related activities. Sports involvement isn't just for fun; it's necessary for a healthy society. Sports equipment, grounds, schedules, and events must be suitable, easy to access, separate for girls and boys, and have the newest security and health facilities. Female athletes must arrange how and when to do sports to avoid personal, family, cultural, and religious issues. Universities must give students and professors with moral, technical, and financial support to encourage more women to play sports. Teachers' encouragement and direction of female students' athletics is key to mainstreaming sports. In Pakistan, girls and women are really not allowed to play sports because the field is considered sexist. From ethical and moral norms, Pakistani society spawned nepotism, favoritism, criminality, injustice, and violence. Because of these cruel behaviours, it's hard for women to overcome the threshold and participate in sports and competitive activities. Future opportunities for female engagement in sports must be built in a problem-solving environment for sports. Therefore, this study’s topic has a great theoretical and application value with the above theoretical and practical additions; this study will be a valuable effort in the Social Cognitive Theory of Albert Bandura's, (1995) for investigation of the current internal and external factors which are influencing the participation of Pakistani women in sports.

**Conflicts of Interests**
All of the authors have no vested financial or other personal interests that would compromise their objectiveness regarding this research paper.

**Funding**
There is no research funding from any organization to conduct this research project.

**Author Contributions**
Each author made significant contributions to the study's inception, design, statistical analysis, interpretation of data, and drafting/revising the paper.

**Acknowledgments** The first author thanks to all authors who participated in this study. A special thanks to the Prof. Dr. Huang Ya Ling for reviewing the whole process of research.
References


Lenneis, V. and G. Pfister (2017). "When girls have no opportunities and women have neither time nor energy: the participation of Muslim female cleaners in recreational physical activity." Sport in society 20(9): 1203-1222.


Employee Perception, Barriers towards Career Development and HRM Strategies tenacity Employee Career Development

Ayesha Malik, Ph.D. Scholar, Department of Education, Universidad Azteca, Mexico  
Muhammad Ahsan Ali, M.Phil. Scholar, Institute of Management Sciences, Bahauddin Zakariya University (BZU), Multan Pakistan  
Sidra Rafiq, Lecturer, National College of Business Administration and Economics (NCBA&E) Lahore, Multan Sub-campus, Pakistan  
Muhammad Adnan, Head of Department (HOD), National College of Business Administration and Economics (NCBA&E) Lahore, Multan Sub-campus, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email: dr.adnanmalik1989@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

Purpose: The aim of this study is to examine the influence of Employee Perception, Barriers towards career development and HRM Strategies on Employee Career Development in the telecommunication sector of Pakistan.

Design/Methodology/Approach: This study adopted a quantitative approach using questionnaires. The data was collected from 203 employees working in Telecommunication companies of Pakistan. The selection criterion of the respondents was based on convenient random sampling. Statistical analysis was performed using Structural Equation Modeling – Partial Least Squares (SEM-PLS).

Findings: The findings revealed that Employee Perception and HRM Strategies significantly impact Employee Career Development. At the same time, Barriers to career development also have insignificant impact on Employee Career Development.

Implications/Originality/Value: This study shall significantly contribute in developing fair Human Resource Management (HRM) strategies, positive employee perception and which can improve the performance of employees and help them develop the skills they need to establish a human resource sector.

© 2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-4.0


Introduction

For a better future for organizations, their workforce is often changed due to their lower usefulness (OECD, 2015). The capacity to hold and foster competent workers is fruitful for the organization. Perception of employees or their ability is the most significant resource for the organization, particularly in emerg
ing sectors like telecoms. It helps industries and corporations configure work so employees can keep working most effectively (Phillips & Siu, 2012; Kanfer & Ackerman, 2004). It is generally witnessed organizations can accomplish this through ideal human resource management (HRM) (Truxillo et al., 2012). Organizations constantly endeavor to introduce new business sectors, more clients, more deals, and so forth. Many organizations are market situated and set execution targets. A portion of these objectives is to decrease costs, accomplish deals, increment client base, increment piece of the pie, increment efficiency and quality, and foster creative items. These objectives are performed because of the best administration of the organization's HR. As the way to progress, the labor force will add to the accomplishment of hierarchical execution (Loosemore et al., 2003).

Background of Study

HR is viewed as one of the main assets in organizations today. Human resource is a priority for businesses because it utilizes individuals most effectively to accomplish objectives. So organizations should initially comprehend the expectations of their representatives to achieve specific targets. Productivity of ideal business results from collaborative efforts of the administration, specialized supervisor effort, laborer cooperation, worker skills, inspiration, commitment, fulfillment, and working of employees (Chopra, 2017). Due to different perspectives and implementation objectives, HR viability information is now divided into empowerment, motivation, and attractive business development. It makes it challenging for specialists to settle on informed choices about conceptualization models of HRM (van Veldhoven & Peccei, 2015), sets of HR practices (Kooij et al., 2014), and a framework to categorize outcomes by employee occupation (van der Heijden, 2012). Technological, organizational, and social change describes the current organization that led to the development of new professional forms. However, while there is a clear shift towards more personal career management responsibilities, the organizational career management function remains a core element of human resource management. Rather than delegating full responsibility for career management to individual employee, it is better to ensure that they are competent and flexible in meeting different career needs (Lips-Wiersma & Hall, 2007).

Previous studies conducted by Wright et al. (2010), Singh & Kassa (2016) & Zehir et al. (2016) identified and demonstrated that human resource management processes affect career development. Human resource management does a lot of work to promote career development. In related terms, these studies show that HRM practices foster career development in all aspects of work. Researchers have conducted several studies to identify the differences between the HR process and their impact on the promotion of staff performance in the telecom industry. This study will focus on studying the link between Employee Perception, Barriers towards career development and HRM strategies on employee career development in the telecom industry of Pakistan.

In order to achieve management goals, teams and individuals strive to continually improve business processes and skills as part of professional development. This contributes to the attainment of management goals. The concept of Employee Career Development (ECD) is a way of ensuring that an employee's personal goals are aligned with organizational goals, as long as the employer is supportive of the employee's goals. It is essential that human resources are prioritized as one of the key pillars to success and creativity in an organization in order to strengthen employee career development. Human Resource Management, therefore, performs a wide range of tasks in order to improve the career development of employees. It is in the interest of human resources management to develop strategies that are conducive to the development of the careers of their employees. Numerous studies have shown that HRMS applications can facilitate employee career development across all work areas, especially in the context of organizational development (Sattar et al., 2015; Singh & Kassa, 2016; Zehir et al., 2016).
Literature Review

Employee Career Development
Employee Career Development is the link between setting work goals and finding ways to achieve them. Employee Career Development is also a process involved in organizing human activity. Furthermore, Employee Career Development is a tool to motivate employees to contribute to the organization success (Wright et al., 2010).

Barriers towards Career Development
Swanson & Woitke (1997) defined barriers towards career development as "individual or ecological occasions or conditions that make vocation improvement troublesome".

Employee Perception
Thurstone (1931) defined Employee Perception/attitude as manipulation for location. Companies need to pay attention to structured changes. To overcome resistance to change, the organization should prepare a clear plan and awareness of change among employees to create a well-organized workplace and appropriate work environment to reduce stress and insecurity.

Hypothesis Development

Relationship between Employee Perception and Employee Career Development
Supervisors apply HR practice daily, which influences the strengths of the employee perceptions of the HR practices used to them (Purcell & Kinnie, 2009). Employee perceptions of organizational career management activities determine whether individuals initiate career self-management activities internally or externally. On the other hand, committed individuals are more likely to engage in self-directed career management activities (Guest, 1997).

H1: There is a significant relationship between Employee Perception and Employee Career Development.

Relationship Between Barriers towards Career Development and Employee Career Development

The concept of social justice ensures that individual barriers, especially environmental ones, influence the link between interest and work objectives and can make people think twice about objectives. Individuals are less inclined to interpret expert interests into goals when they observe that their endeavors are vulnerable to natural factors like there is no strong barrier or no emotional support network (Lent & Brown, 2019).

H2: There is a significant relationship between Barriers towards Career Development and Employee Career Development.

Relationship Between HRM Strategies and Employee Career Development

There are different strategies of HRM used in enhancing career development, such as strategies of organizational career management, strategies of technology and environment, strategies of recruitment and hiring, strategies of training and development, strategies of human resources following-up, strategies of career planning and strategies of social capital. It is not the only technical impact on the professional sector. The recent use of information technology supports the ability to move critical responsibilities for employee job development. Perhaps the most important innovation is a technology approach that allows employees to independently explore the differences between their current skills or abilities and those essential to career success (Gould-Williams & Davies, 2005).

H3: There is a significant relationship between HRM strategies and Employee Career Development.
Theory Underpinning

Social Exchange Theory (SET)

A key component of this study was the foundational application of the social exchange theory (SET), which holds that good people management practices can lead to a positive exchange between management and employees, especially since a successful employee career leads to a better future (Gould-Williams & Davies, 2005). Social exchange theory (SET) offers an essential framework for defining various types of behaviors in associations (Cropanzano & Mitchell, 2005) and may contribute to the development of business relationships (Shore & Barksdale, 1998). Specifically, SET can be used to clarify the link between different HR practices and engagement with group representatives (Eisenberger et al., 1990). Therefore, Social Exchange Theory is empirically tested in this study and provides the basis for exploring how specific people management practices (e.g., career management) can help foster positive employee attitudes.

Research Framework

![Research Model](image)

Methodology

Research Design and Data Collection

This study used descriptive analysis methods based on the data provided by the research tool to analyze and justify the objectives. This study collected data from employees working in Telecommunication companies of the Multan region in Pakistan. The selection criterion of the respondents was based on convenient random sampling. A sample size of 203 respondents was chosen for this study. According to the study by Hair et al. (2019), 100–200 respondents are sufficient for response collection in order to analyze data using SEM-PLS through SmartPLS. This study used quantitative data from questionnaires and numerical descriptive data in addition to qualitative data from related studies. The collected data was analyzed in SPSS to get frequencies, percentages, mean, and STDEV scores. While reliability and validity, structural and measurement models were analyzed using SmartPLS to find out relationships among variables of this study.

Research Instrument and Scale Measurement

The researcher used a questionnaire to collect data. As shown in Table 1, the questionnaire was designed in the light of previous studies (Lee et al., 2013; London, 1997; D’Cruz and Noronha, 2010). These researchers used these scales in their studies; therefore, this study's questionnaire was designed to keep in mind these previous studies and the variables of this study. The Employee Perception Scale was developed by Lee et al. (2013) to check the impacts of employee perceptions on their career development process. There are five items in this scale that are evaluated using a 5-point Likert scale (on a scale of 1 = strongly disagree to 5 = strongly agree). In a study conducted by London (1997), barriers to career development were investigated to determine whether these barriers affected employees' ability to accelerate their careers. The scale consists of ten items, each of which
is rated on a five-point Likert scale (1 = strongly disagree to 5 = strongly agree). In order to examine the impact of Human Resource Management Strategies on the career development of employees. D’Cruz & Noronha (2010) developed the HRMS (Human Resource Management Strategies) scale. The scale consisted of 10 items; each item is rated on a 5-point Likert scale (from 1 = Strongly Disagree to 5 = Strongly Agree). We adopted the Employee Career Development Scale from Pinnington et al., (2022). Each of the 3 items is evaluated on a 5-point Likert scale (1 = strongly disagree to 5 = strongly agree).

### Table 1: Instrument Items Description

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scale Name</th>
<th>Study Authors</th>
<th>Items</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employee Perception</td>
<td>(Lee et al., 2013)</td>
<td>5-items</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barriers towards Career Development</td>
<td>(London, 1997)</td>
<td>09-items</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employee Career Development</td>
<td>(Pinnington et al., 2022)</td>
<td>03-items</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRM Strategies</td>
<td>(D’Cruz &amp; Noronha, 2010)</td>
<td>10-items</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>27-items</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Data Analysis and Results

This study intends to determine the Impact of Human Resource Management strategies, Employee Perception and Barriers towards career development on Employee Career Development in the Telecom Industry of Pakistan. For this purpose, data from 203 respondents from Telecommunication companies in Pakistan was collected.

### Demographic Characteristics

The demographic characteristics are based on the data collected through the questionnaire's demographic part, which contains 5-questions of respondent number, working experience, age, and gender. The details are shown in table 2 below;

### Table-2: Demographics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Demographics</th>
<th>Respondent</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gender</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>73%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age of Respondent</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50-years &amp; above</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41-50 years</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-40 years</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21-30 years</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less than 21 years</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Year of Experience</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 years &amp; above</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-10 years</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-4 years</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less than 1 year</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Analysis of Data Reliability and Validity

Table 3 indicates the values of AVE, composite reliability, factor loading, and Cronbach's alpha. Hair et al. (2013) reported that more than 0.7 in Cronbach's alpha (α > 0.9) is considered excellent among the researchers. Cronbach's alpha is found in this study (Table 3) above 0.7, which is the accepted value. Moreover, the Average Variance Extracted (AVE) must be more or equal to 0.5, while the CR must be 0.7 or above. In the current study, CR and AVE are within a more than acceptable range.

### Table 3: Factor Loadings, Reliability and Validity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Loadings</th>
<th>Cronbach’s Alpha</th>
<th>rho_A</th>
<th>Composite Reliability</th>
<th>Average Extracted (AVE)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employee PE1</td>
<td>0.721</td>
<td>0.832</td>
<td>0.875</td>
<td>0.861</td>
<td>0.563</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Statistical consistency and reliability is the outcome of a study that evaluates how well indicators are related to each other based on their consistency. Hair et al. (2019) suggest reporting internal consistency and reliability using average variance extracted (AVE), composite reliability, rho_A, and Cronbach alpha. Table 3 shows the reliability of all scales in which Cronbach's Alpha values of employee perception, barriers towards career development, HRM strategies, and employee career development are found at 0.832, 0.923, 0.771, and 0.795, respectively. Further, values of all scales and 21 items under CR, rho_A, average variance extracted (AVE), and Cronbach Alpha also meet the required minimum values. Statistically, convergence validity is related to construct validity. Convergent validity implies that assessments based on the same or similar constructs should be highly related. It is necessary to report the scores of the AVE in order to determine the convergence validity of the instrument. The dataset was analysed using a PLS-SEM algorithm implemented in Smart PLS. As shown in Table 3, the AVE scores should be equal to or greater than 0.500; they should explain at least 50% of the variance. The AVE scores of all constructs were above 0.500 and explained more than 50% of the variance. Hence, all scales and their items have good internal consistency; therefore, the scales and items of this study are reliable.

### Table 4: Discriminant Validity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PE</th>
<th>CB</th>
<th>HRMS</th>
<th>ECD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PE</td>
<td>0.748</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CB</td>
<td>0.177</td>
<td>0.729</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRMS</td>
<td>0.193</td>
<td>0.674</td>
<td>0.861</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECD</td>
<td>0.197</td>
<td>-0.928</td>
<td>-0.955</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Values in Italic represent Square-root of AVE.

The discriminant validity of a construct is the extent to which it differs from other constructs (Hair et al., 2019). When the Fornell-Lacker criterion is applied, the AVE scores should be lower than the
shared variances for all model constructs as indicated in Table 4. Accordingly, discriminant validity was evaluated based on the Fornell-Lacker criteria.

**Measurement Model**

Outer Model is also called the measurement model in which the structural equation modeling (SEM) technique is used. In research, Structural Equation Modeling (SEM) has great statistical features to test the relationship between dependent and independent variables. SEM provides various options to its users to check the data structures for solving questions simultaneously (Hair et al., 2019). Similarly, through SEM, users can apply different analyses, i.e., mediating analysis, moderating analysis, covariance analysis, linear regression analysis, and factor analysis. Further, the reliability and validity of the constructs can also be examined through factor loadings in SEM (Hair & Ortinau, 2010). In this study, the researcher used both types of models, i.e., the Structural Model and the Measurement Model, according to the standards of (Hair & Ortinau, 2010). According to Becker et al. (2018), the measurement model is based on PLS-SEM, which is particularly analyzed in Smart PLS 3.0. The researcher used discriminant validity, average extracted variance (AVE), Cronbach's alpha, factor loading, and composite reliability to assess the measurement model. The results of these tests for the reflective items in the examination are exhibited in the going with subsections.

**Figure 4: Measurement Model**

**PLS Bootstrapping Results (Path Analysis)**

The purpose of this part is to examine the bootstrapping results through the use of path analysis, which will be used to test the measurement model in order to determine the relationships between variables. In PLS (SEM), the purpose of the analysis of the bootstrapping model is to assess the hypothesized relationships among study variables. Three critical information is analysed through bootstrapping model is investigated considering, i.e., the path coefficient (β) and the qualities from bootstrap assessments such as certainty spans, p-worth, and t-esteem. Not entirely settled to the bootstrap procedure since it makes the critical bits of knowledge for assessing the meaning of the
constants (Hair et al., 2013). The thing estimates the standard blunder, t-measurements, and certainty stretches that are utilized to foster the meaning of the way examination.

![Figure 5: PLS bootstrapping](image)

**Structural Model Assessment**

As part of the assessment process, the VIF (Variance Inflation Factor) is used to indicate the level of collinearity based on the computerization of the collinearity threshold. In the second step, we examined the relationship between the two variables. In addition, a coefficient of determination ($R^2$) has been calculated based on the data. The $f^2$ (effect size) of the variable was also determined, which was supposed to contribute to the explanation of the endogenous constructs. Additionally, to determine the $f^2$ and effect size of the regression coefficients for the values of $R^2$, the data were also processed in PLS-SEM using a blindfolding procedure to the values of $Q^2$ in order to predict the $f^2$ (effect size).

**Table 5: Coefficient of Determination ($R^2$)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Constructs</th>
<th>$R$-Square</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employee Perception</td>
<td>0.515</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barriers towards career development</td>
<td>0.732</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRM Strategies</td>
<td>0.608</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Coefficient of Determination ($R^2$) is the result worth investigating of relapse deciphered as the different extent in endogenous factors that the exogenous variable can anticipate. It estimates the accuracy and precision of a proposed model. This is considered the reciprocal connection between two endogenous constructs. The $R^2$ ranges from 0 to 1; a higher value results in a more significant level of $R^2$; 0.75 is significant, 0.50 is moderate, and 0.25 is regarded as powerless (Hair et al., 2019). From the results of the study, table 5 depicts the results of $R^2$; Employee Perception ($R^2=0.515$), Barriers towards Career Development ($R^2=0.732$), HRM Strategies ($R^2=0.608$), Employee Career Development ($R^2=0.406$). In conclusion, the results of $R^2$ show a sufficient level of $R^2$. 
As shown in the table above, the effect size ($f^2$) of exogenous constructs on endogenous constructs is a measure of the impact of a predictor construct on a dependent variable. Whenever an exogenous construct is removed from the model, the $f^2$ statistic examines the change in the $R^2$ value that results from the removal of that construct. Based on a study by Hair et al. (2019), the value of $f^2=0.35$ is described as significant, the value of $f^2=0.15$ is described as medium, and $f^2=0.02$ is described as a small effect. Here is the table that describes the three correlational effect sizes that have been examined in this study. It has been found that employee perceptions of career development have a medium effect size (i.e., $f^2=0.651$). Employee career development barriers have the largest effect size ($f^2=1.275$). In contrast, HRM Strategies to employee career development has a medium effect size ($f^2=0.563$).

### Table 7: Final Result (PLS bootstrapping Results of Path Analysis)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypothesis</th>
<th>$\beta$</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>STDEV</th>
<th>T-Statistics</th>
<th>P-values</th>
<th>Result</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>H1 Employee Perception -&gt; Employee Career Development</td>
<td>0.715</td>
<td>0.608</td>
<td>0.035</td>
<td>14.089</td>
<td>0.015</td>
<td>Accepted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H2 Barriers towards Career Development -&gt; Employee Career Development</td>
<td>-0.096</td>
<td>0.799</td>
<td>0.051</td>
<td>1.711</td>
<td>0.057</td>
<td>Rejected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H3 HRM Strategies -&gt; Employee Career Development</td>
<td>0.444</td>
<td>0.448</td>
<td>0.041</td>
<td>13.045</td>
<td>0.019</td>
<td>Accepted</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Results Discussion

In order to check the direct relationship between endogenous and exogenous constructs, path coefficients are shown in above table 7. Results show the assessment of the sample bootstrapped through 5,000 sub-sampling by applying a 5% significance level. Employee Perception was found to have a positive relationship with Employee Career Development, i.e., **H1** ($\beta=0.715$; $t=14.089$; $p=0.015$), and HRM Strategies also have positive relation with Employee Career Development, i.e., **H3** ($\beta=0.444$; $t=13.045$; $p=0.019$) while Barriers towards Career Development have insignificant relation with Employee Career Development, i.e., **H2** ($\beta=-0.096$; $t=1.711$; $p=0.057$). Hence, hypothesis **H3** is not supported.
significantly impacted employee career development. At the same time, barriers towards career development have insignificant and negative impacts on employee career development.

Conclusion
This study focuses on the best Human Resource Management (HRM) strategies that can improve the performance of employees and help them develop the skills they need to establish a human resource sector. There are weaknesses in implementing the HRM strategy of all types. The organizational structure covers all aspects of human management, including collaboration, coordination and acquisition, project management, project coordination, component management of project management, work-life balance, employee welfare, professional certification, research, shared work HR, management, development, support, and human resources. Global leadership, project design, organizational development, policy compliance, employee engagement, complete payroll, performance appraisal, human resource management, employment, training and development, staff selection, empowerment, acceptance, HR communications, metrics and terminology, and nomenclature. This can be concluded that employee perception and HRM Strategies play a significant role in employee career development.

Limitations and Dimensions of Future Research
This study will be limited to the HRM regarding career development of the employees currently working in the telecom Industry of Pakistan. For future research directions, it is suggested to implant green HRM, green knowledge and organizational citizenship behavior as a mediating variable in the undergone research. It is also suggested to examine the same research framework to different industrial sectors across the Pakistan and other countries, in order to generalize its results globally. This study's results and findings may differ from the telecom industries of other locations and territories. Future research can also be done on a larger sample of all the industries because the results were limited to the specific region.

Managerial Implications
This study can contribute in particular to the employers to maintain the performance of their employees in balancing their work life. Employers can see how their employees need a flexible management to meet their obligations as employees in the organization. It also covers all aspects of human management, including cooperation, collaboration and acquirement, program management, team leadership, component management of projects management, and human resources. By offering more opportunities for promotion, it lowers employee turnover. It raises the motivation and morale of workers. It lessens labour disputes over promotional issues and gives the company the chance to maintain a peaceful work environment. This study is also helpful for managers and researchers to gain knowledge and insights about HR strategies and their impact on employee career development. The findings of this research have special significance for the senior administration and HR on board in the media communications industry. The outcome helped them notice the chances to foster their representatives' professions. The research is necessary because it joins human assets and the board procedures to the vocation improvement of representatives in the telecommunications industry of Pakistan. This study is vital because it endeavours to distinguish between the HR and board procedures in the telecom business.

References


Truxillo, D. M., Cadiz, D. M., Rineer, J. R., Zaniboni, S., & Fraccaroli, F. (2012). A lifespan perspective on job design: Fitting the job and the worker to promote job satisfaction,


Forestry and Governance as Two Pillars of Sustainable Development: Empirical Verification

*Bilal Mehmood*, Director, Center for Economics and Business Research/ Associate Professor, School of Economics, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan  
*Mohsin Raza*, Master’s Student, Department of Economics, Swedish University of Agricultural Sciences (SLU), Uppsala, Sweden  
*Abida Ramzan*, MPhil, Department of Economics, Government College University, Lahore, Pakistan  

*Corresponding author’s email address: dr.bilal.eco@pu.edu.pk*

**ARTICLE DETAILS**

| History   | Revised format: May 2022  
| Available Online: Jun 2022 |
| Keywords  | Forestry, Sustainable Development, Governance, System Generalized Method of Moments (Sys-Gmm). |

**JEL Classification**  
L73 Q01 C23

**ABSTRACT**

**Purpose:** One of the most common global concerns is Sustainable development for last three decades. For it, good governance of forestry can play a significant role. Accordingly, current paper empirically analyzes their relationship.  

**Design/Methodology/Approach:** An index of Sustainable development is built. Then the data of forest area and governance indicator for period 2005-2019 for 128 countries, is subjected to estimation. In regression analysis, system generalized method of moments (SYS-GMM) is used for dynamic panel data specification, which can cater the issue of endogeneity in micro panels. Additionally, sample is bifurcated into developed countries and developing countries for segregated estimates.  

**Findings:** Empirical results reveal positive effect of forestry and effective governance on sustainable development index.  

**Implications/Originality/Value:** Recommendations include improving the governance practices and adoption of contemporary forms of forest management.

© 2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial- 4.0


**Introduction**

Though most of natural resources, forestry included, are renewable yet their extensive use and mismanagement costs heavily on society, environment and economy. Economic development is not enough for social welfare and environmental protection; rather sustainable development is needed. Sustainable development is a visionary development paradigm and a more concerned phenomenon for almost all countries for last three decades, but still there is no universal consensus on its definition. The term was popularized by Brundtland report, which is being credited for its conceptualization. According to Brundtland report, classical definition of sustainable development is development that fulfills the needs of the present generation without compromising the ability of future generations to fulfill their own needs. Sustainable development has three interdependent and
mutually reinforcing broader dimensions: social wellbeing, economic development and environmental protection. Few models on sustainable development are Three-Ring Circus model, Russian Doll model and Night Owl model of sustainable development.

Forestry is being credited for introducing the concept of sustainable development as the perception of sustainability was first created in forestry science 300 years back, primarily pointing the regeneration and growth of trees and later enriched with social, economic and environmental aspects of forest management. Forests can be potentially sustainable channel of resource rents (World Bank, 2006). Mostly people appreciate that forests contribute to a green economy, but many people do not realize the fact that this part is mandatory for a sustainable world. Forests play can also stabilize the concentrations of greenhouse gas in the atmosphere causing sustainable development (Article 2; Kyoto Protocol).

Governance can play a central role in management of the resources of a nation (Mehmood et al., 2014). An ameliorated society and economy can be a subsequent result of it (North, 1990; La Porta et al., 1999; Kaufmann et al, 2000). Since sustainable development is a visionary development which is given by government and is reflected through policies. It is crucial platform in coordinating modern socio-political and economic scenarios with the environment and its role is fundamental to negotiate successful policies, programs and related projects. Therefore, governance is required to play a leading role for sustainable development by adopting a balanced approach in its dimensions and regulating effective policies for it. Figure 1 is a flow chart depicting the framework of how forestry and governance are related to sustainable development.

![Figure 1: Conceptual Framework](Source: Authors' formulation)

This study attempts to explore the contribution of forestry and governance in sustainable development. Therefore, the objective of this research is to empirically analyze the contribution of forestry and governance in sustainable development. Hypothesis of the study is as follows:

$H_A$: Forestry and good governance contribute to sustainable development.

**Literature Review**

Literature, pertaining to variables of interests, is reviewed for the current state of debate. Sustainability as suggested by Gow (1992) is similar to happiness, everyone trusts in it but pertaining to it everyone has a different definition. Stedman & Hill (1992) discussed that sustainable development fundamentally is concerned to human well-being, about human dependence on natural resources and the universal wish for economic development. Pearce et al. (1996) portrayed the concept of weak and strong sustainability characterizing them by the variables such as green GDP and genuine savings (loss
of assets-adjusted savings). They discussed two methods, resilience and carrying capacity and brought out that method of resilience is possibly more attractive for sustainable development. They concluded that genuine savings are the main indicators for sustainable development and are complementary to measures of changes in stocks of critical natural assets.

Further, Harris et al. (2003) following the definition of sustainable development established by Arrow et al. (2003) proposed the measure of sustainable development for Australia using inclusive wealth as a indicator for sustainable development. They concluded that country was reaching towards sustainable development if its measure of inclusive wealth is non-decreasing. Whereas inclusive wealth is the summation of capital stocks of an economy (human, manufactured and natural), weighted by their shadow prices for each stock. Moran et al. (2008) by using UN Human Development Index (HDI) and ecological footprints found out that the minimum requirement for sustainable development is the value of HDI should be greater than and equal to 0.8 and ecological footprint to bio-capacity ratio should be less than and equal to 1.0. Another study on Italian regions is presented by Bruni et al. (2011) they use the methodology of data envelopment analysis (DEA) to address the challenges of benchmarking sustainable development. They considered energy consumption and gross domestic product (GDP) as economic input and economic output respectively for each region. Additionally, CO\textsubscript{2} emissions and poverty rate are introduced as environmental output and social output respectively to analyze sustainable development. Appendix – I, tabulates the studies with indicators of sustainable development.

From the perspective of forestry, Mehmood & Ramzan (2015) analyzed it as factor of growth by investigating its causal relationship with economic growth. They resorted to data of forest products and other pertinent variables for 2000-2012 of selected Asian countries. Using system GMM estimator, they found expected results.

Duguma (2018) studied the role of Community based forest management (CBFM) frameworks in achieving SDGs in sub-Saharan Africa. Examination of literature and interviews were conducted. They found that, largely, the contribution of CBFM was mostly positive with a few exceptions of negative impacts. Baumgartner (2019) analyzed positive and negative effects, of direct nature, of forestry on sustainability (SDGs). Findings shows that forestry not only helps in achieving positive sustainability effects but can also have negative impacts. Authors emphasize the importance of Sustainable Forestry Management (SFM) in contributing to sustainable development.

Aryal, Laudari & Ojha (2020) conducted is comprehensive analysis for contribution in SDGs of Nepal’s community forestry (CF). Authors used policy analysis, literature review and expert consultation for the analysis. Findings revealed that CF was contributing to 80 targets of the SDGs at various levels of institutional interface. Socoliuc et al., (2020) developed an econometric model for sustainability of non-financial performance in the forestry sector in Romania. They found different performance in firms with different Statistical classifications. Octavia et al., (2022) reviewed the existing situation along with opportunities and challenges in the process of mainstreaming of Smart Agro-Forestry to support the SDGs in Indonesia. Although there exists literature in which sustainable development that tries to develop indicators for it, yet existing researches have not empirically analyzed the role of forests and governance in sustainable development. Therefore, this paper attempts to fill this gap in the literature.

**Data and Methodology**

Data set used for empirical analysis comprises of 128 countries and time span of 15 years from 2005-2019. Appendix – 2 has the list of these countries. Sustainable development is a vision that increases and shares the prosperity without surpassing the carrying capacity of the ecosystems of earth. This gives the rationale to develop Sustainable Development Indicator by combine using the Human Development Index (HDI) and Environmental Performance Index (EPI). EPI was developed in 1999 by Yale University and Columbia University in collaboration with World Economic Forum and the Joint Research Center of the European Commission. HDI is a commonly used measure of level of human development while EPI concentrates on lessening the environmental pressures to human health and along with this on the protection of ecosystem as well. HDI and EPI are combined with the help of
principal component analysis (PCA). Graphical representation on formation of index is given following:

![Figure 2: Development of Indicator for Sustainable Development](source: Authors’ own design)

The data set of countries is divided into subsets of developed and developing countries as per IMF’s world economic outlook reports. A micro panel is formed for which system generalized method of moments (System GMM afterwards) is suitable. Dynamic panel estimators, difference- and system-GMM, developed by Arellano & Bond (1991), Arellano & Bover (1995) and Blundell & Bond (1998) are general estimators designed for situations with 1) “small $t$, large $i$” panels, 2) a linear functional relationship, 3) dynamic model, 4) independent variables that are not strictly exogenous, 5) heteroskedasticity and autocorrelation within individuals but not across them.

**Results and Interpretations**

Estimable model is as follows:

$$SD_{it} = \alpha_i + \beta_1(SD_{it-1}) + \beta_3(FA_{it}) + \beta_3(GE_{it}) + \epsilon_{it}$$  \hspace{1cm} (1)

Transformed model after first differencing (used to control country specific effects for analyzing only the effect of explanatory variables on dependent variable) turns out as:

$$\Delta SD_{it} = \beta_1(\Delta SD_{it-1}) + \beta_3(\Delta FA_{it}) + \beta_3(\Delta GE_{it}) + \Delta \epsilon_{it}$$ \hspace{1cm} (2)

Here

- $SD_{it}$ = Sustainable development.
- $SD_{it-1}$ = Lagged dependent value of sustainable development.
- $FA_{it}$ = Forest area ($km^2$)
- $GE_{it}$ = Government effectiveness.
- $\alpha_i$ shows the country specific effects.
- Government effectiveness (GE) is used as explanatory variable; data on GE has been taken from Worldwide Governance Indicators (WGI). Another explanatory variable is forest area taken from WDI which is simply the area of the earth covered with forests; it is a signal of the relative

In case of dynamic panel data model fixed effects does not give consistent and unbiased results as endogeneity problem arises there, while use of the micro-panel difference GMM estimates have the problem of providing weak instruments and it cannot be used if there is unit-root problem in the variables. System GMM is presented by Arellano & Bover (1995), Blundell & Bond (1998) and Bond et al. (2001). The basic idea of system GMM is to estimate a set of equation in both first differences as well as in levels, where the instruments used in the level equations are lagged first differences of the series; similarly, for the first difference equation valid instruments are the lagged valued of the level of the series. System GMM even with non-stationary or unit root problem and measurement error performs well with its additional moment conditions. System GMM gives us choice of instruments and has two sets of equations first at level and the second is transformed one into first-difference equation.
significance of the forests. Data is log-linearized, except for governance indicator, since the value of governance effectiveness lies in between -2.5 to 2.5.

In homogenous slope model $i$ denotes the countries (cross-sections) $i = 1, 2, ..., 128$ and $t$ shows the time period of 15 years i.e., 2005-2019. Here 3-year average values are used so the time period with 3 years average reduces to 5 years. To detect the multi-collinearity, variance inflation factor (VIF) is employed which is below than 10, as a rule of thumb suggested by Wetherill (1986). Table 1 shows results for 34 developed countries. VIF is 1.02 which shows that there is no serious problem of multi-collinearity in the model.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Pooled OLS</th>
<th>Fixed Effect</th>
<th>Difference GMM</th>
<th>System GMM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$SD_{lt-1}$</td>
<td>0.2997 (0.000)</td>
<td>0.1260 (0.000)</td>
<td>0.0897 (0.001)</td>
<td>0.2779 (0.003)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$FA_{lt}$</td>
<td>0.0084 (0.010)</td>
<td>0.3331 (0.000)</td>
<td>0.3376 (0.000)</td>
<td>0.1763 (0.000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$GE_{lt}$</td>
<td>0.0647 (0.000)</td>
<td>0.0488 (0.052)</td>
<td>0.0174 (0.697)</td>
<td>0.4474 (0.000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constant</td>
<td>2.2120 (0.000)</td>
<td>-0.3775 (0.078)</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$AR(1)$</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>0.128</td>
<td>0.067</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$AR(2)$</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>0.340</td>
<td>0.265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hansen test</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>0.019</td>
<td>0.392</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F-statistics</td>
<td>16.86 (0.000)</td>
<td>233.97 (0.000)</td>
<td>318.95 (0.000)</td>
<td>551.67 (0.000)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: p-values are in ( ).

Source: Authors’ estimations

Coefficient of lagged-value of sustainable development equals 0.2779 and is statistically significant at 1%. The coefficient is smaller than 1 ($0.2779 < 1$) which implies a stable dynamic relationship in the model (Roodman, 2009). It means sustainable development achieved last year positively affects the current level of sustainable development. In the presence of country-specific effects pooled OLS shows an upward-biased estimate of the lagged dependent variable, whereas the within group (fixed effects) shows downward-biased estimate of this coefficient (Blundell & Bond, 1998). It holds true, as the coefficient of $SD_{lt-1}$ using Pooled OLS is 0.2997 and using FE is 0.1260 while its value using System GMM gives 0.2779 which occurs in middle Pooled OLS and FE. Therefore, both the upward and downward biases are avoided, rendering the GMM estimates consistent. Forest area is found to be positively related and statistically significant in all of the estimations. Therefore, positive role of forests in achieving sustainable development is evidenced. Forests provide numerous benefits to economy and society such as timber, source of living and employment, recreation and source of foreign exchange via exports of forest products, biodiversity, soil and air quality, protection from floods etc. Also, forests mitigate climate change and give us healthy environment to live. The positive coefficient value of governance effectiveness depicts that governance also contributes positively in sustainable development. $AR(1)$ and $AR(2)$ represent 1st order and 2nd order, residual-based, serial correlation, correspondingly. $AR(1)$ is statistically significant (p-value = 0.067) whereas, $AR(1)$ is not (p-value = 0.265). This is desirable. Hansen test following the distribution show the validity of instruments. Both of the statistics are insignificant, showing the validity of instruments. F-statistic shows the overall significance (also measure of good fit) of the model, p-value in all the specification ensures that all lagged-value of sustainable development, forests area and governance have joint influence on the sustainable development.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Pooled OLS</th>
<th>Fixed Effect</th>
<th>Difference GMM</th>
<th>System GMM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$SD_{lt}$</td>
<td>0.5100 (0.000)</td>
<td>0.0989 (0.000)</td>
<td>-0.0549 (0.477)</td>
<td>0.1111 (0.005)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$FA_{lt}$</td>
<td>0.0081 (0.004)</td>
<td>0.3415 (0.000)</td>
<td>0.3429 (0.000)</td>
<td>0.3318 (0.000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$GE_{lt}$</td>
<td>0.0516 (0.000)</td>
<td>0.0023 (0.708)</td>
<td>0.0029 (0.588)</td>
<td>0.0735 (0.004)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constant</td>
<td>1.5747 (0.000)</td>
<td>-0.3694 (0.009)</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The value of VIF for the set of overall 128 countries is 1.38 which is satisfactory and p-value of F-statistic portrays overall significance of the model. It explains that the coefficient values of lagged level of sustainable development, forest area and governance are different from zero. Estimates of overall countries show the tendencies of estimates as obtained from developed and developing countries. Developed countries (DCs) in European and North American regions have gone through the forest transition. But recently these countries are focused on recovering and expanding their forest covered area, as per FAO’s statistics on forests products, USA is highest in producing and consuming industrial round-wood, sawn-wood and pulp for papers. Governance is relatively effective in DCs and thus it contributes to sustainable development along with being statistically significant. Similarly, forest area is also positively related to sustainable development and is statistically significant. There is presence of 1st order serial correlation as p-value is 0.067 but not the 2nd order serial correlation in residuals, as p-value is 0.926. Under SGMM 0.227 p-value of Hansen test shows the validity of instruments used.

Table 3 shows the regression results of 94 UDCs. Same interpretations given above for Table 1 results, hold for the results in Table 3. The model is a good fit and most probably free from multi-collinearity. In real-life scenario developing countries are following the pattern of developed countries for the development i.e., resource-intensive methods. But now few countries like China due to growing awareness and after realizing the worth of forests have given prime priority to forests and their preservation. Governance appears as the main issue for developing countries which leads to mismanagement of the available resources and thus forest sector. Nearly 90% of terrestrial biodiversity is located in the forests, with an uneven share in the forests of UDCs. Forests dependent people are more in developing countries. Forests are one of the most mismanaged resources of UDCs, as found in analytical work and consultations. Forests are very undervalued, as their environmental benefits are not marketed. Due to lack of good governance, illegal activities are also common. The interplay of forests on other sectors’ investments and policy is not well-stated. The rapid rates of deforestation in recent decades are mainly a consequence of the externalities of ill-designed macroeconomic and commercial policies.
Since overall countries include developing and developed countries both, so the estimates are somewhere in between of both for $SD_{lt-1}$. As DCs have experienced the forest transition due to this coefficient value is lower as compared to LDCs and overall. But there is mismanagement in forestry particularly in LDCs. Governance is effective in DCs and much poor in LDCs so due to this reason overall value is low and in between of both.

**Conclusion and Recommendations**

Sustainable development is basically a balanced approach to development in terms of economy, environment and society, its modern idea is very much driven by the notion that mankind should not create economic and social prosperity at the expense of future generations. Therefore, in this study an indicator for sustainable development is proposed using HDI and EPI and impact of forestry and governance is empirically estimated using mainly the system GMM technique with three datasets for dynamic model. Findings ensure that forestry contributes in sustainable development and governance is also very crucial to achieve it. Governance is the leading factor responsible to regulate desired policies needed to achieve higher level of human development along with the environmental protection which reflects their vision for sustainable development. Better governance is the requirement, to achieve economic and social stability as a global public good particularly in developing economies. Another important factor, forestry which is basically the sector credited for introducing the concept of sustainable development, is enriched in economic, social and environmental benefits. Since developing countries are more dependent on forests resources these countries should not follow forest transition as experienced by developed countries. Illegal logging should be banned. There is need to improve governance in developing countries specially which is quite better in developed countries as it is the only factor which can take the desirable actions by implementing mutually interconnected appropriate policies for the economy, society and the environment for the benefits of present and future generations. The key focus of the countries should be to preserve forest area to enjoy its numerous benefits now and for future generations for which sustainable forest management (SFM) and Community based forest management (CBFM) are the suitable options. These concepts encourage the community to use the forests while maintaining their biodiversity, vitality, productivity, and regeneration capacity. A poise between the demand for forest products and forest health preservation, can benefit both consumers and the environment. SFM requires that trees are used but should be replaced with new ones. Sustainability in production wood products can save forests from forest degradation. The implementation of SFM for all countries is also important since sustainable development goals (SDGs) have been implemented, in which specific goals are set on forests to meet the targets for sustainable development.

**References**


FAO, state of world’s forests 2012, retrieved from: http://www.fao.org/docrep/016/i3010e/i3010e.pdf

Global forest resources assessment 2010: progress towards sustainable forest management. Rome, FAO.


Estimation and Validation of Adapted Household Food Insecurity Access Scale in Lahore – Pakistan

*Bushra Pervaiz, Assistant Professor, Lahore Leads University, Lahore, Pakistan
Muhammad Qasim Manzoor, Associate Professor, Institute of Business & Management, University of Engineering and Technology (UET), Lahore, Pakistan
Rabia Pervaiz, MS Scholar, Institute of Business & Management, University of Engineering and Technology (UET), Lahore, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email address: bushra19@live.com

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

History
Revised format: May 2022
Available Online: Jun 2022

Keywords
Food insecurity, Food accessibility, HFIAS, Lahore, Pakistan.

JEL Classification
M1, M2

Purpose: Food insecurity is not only the problem of all developing countries but developed countries are also facing this issue especially after COVID-19. Food security is the combination of food availability, accessibility and utilization. However, the food accessibility is associated with household income and wealth. More than one third of Pakistan’s population is living below poverty line and also facing food insecurity. Household Food Insecurity Access Scale (HFIAS) developed by USAID is a tool for measuring prevalence of food insecurity. HFIAS treats food insecurity as a condition that can be identified and measured by experiences and behavioral responses that appear to be common for low-income households. Current study is meant for the estimation and validation of HFIAS in the context of Pakistan, and to look for the relationship between food insecurity and socio-economic characteristics of the community.

Methodology: A dedicated survey was conducted in Peri-urban areas of Lahore district from January to February, 2021. Responses from 316 households were recorded on a structured questionnaire which was adapted from HFIAS due to cultural context and socio-economic conditions.

Findings: Results showed that 30.2% of the households were food secure whereas 22.3% were mildly food insecure, 40.2% were moderately food insecure and 7.3% were severely food insecure. HFIAS was found to have good internal consistency (Cronbach’s Alpha = 0.684).

Policy Implication: HFIAS is a valid and reliable tool to measure the food accessibility at the household level in Pakistan.

© 2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-4.0


Introduction
The concept of food security is quite vast which ranges from production of food to its utilization. In
other words, food security can be categorized with rest to its availability, accessibility and utilization by the people. Food availability means that the food either produced locally or imported is available in market for all the people of a country. Whereas, food accessibility means that the people have enough resources to buy food from the markets. Similarly, utilization of food refers to proper diet, clean drinking water, sanitation and healthcare (FAO, 1996). Food security of so important that any country which does not has the capacity or resources to fulfill the food needs of their population cannot be considered nourished sovereign country (Pinstrup-Andersen, 2009).

Moreover, the incidence of household food insecurity may be transitory or long-lasting. Food insecurity could be of transitory nature if it has been caused by inflation in food prices and high rate of unemployment. This severely erodes the accessibility of food for such people. The natural disasters may also cause transitory food insecurity by severe loss to food production systems and create problems in food availability (Re'tlinger, 1986). The food insecurity caused by absolute poverty is long-lasting in nature. People may stuck into vicious circle of abject poverty, poor health outcomes and meagre earning capacity which runs through generations (Shah, 2021). Further, the repeated spells of transitory food insecurity may also force people to experience long-lasting food insecurity if they fail to exhibit necessary resilience over a certain period of time (Re'tlinger, 1986).

Food insecurity is a global issue but its intensity differs from country to country. Pakistan is ranked as world’s top 5th country with largest population and its per capita income is estimated as USD 1,798 (GOP, 2022). Whereas, 16% of population is still undernourished meaning that nearly 35 million of people in Pakistan do not get nutritious food on daily basis. All this translates into prevalence of 7.1% wasting among young children which is rather worse in the world (GOP, 2021). World Food Program in a study estimated that the burden of malnutrition in Pakistani children was approximately 3% of country’s GDP or USD 7.6 billion annually (WFP, 2017). According to the global hunger index 2021, Pakistan has been ranked 92nd out of 116 countries with the score of 24.7 and the level of hunger is “serious” (GHI, 2021).

It has been an objective and also a challenge for the governments and policy makers in Pakistan to attain self-sufficiency in the production of staple food crops. Pakistan has an agrarian economy which contributes 22.7% value addition in country’s GDP. Globally, Pakistan stands at 8th number in the production of wheat, 10th in the production of rice and 5th in the production of milk (GOP, 2022). Despite this, only 63.1% of population is estimated as food secure. Primarily, the problem of food insecurity does not appear to be related to availability of food in Pakistan but it relates to the earning capacity of the people. Altogether, food is more or less sufficiently available for the people but they cannot afford to buy food in required quantity (GOP/UNICEF, 2018).

The availability of food is extremely important for achieving food security at the national level (Sana Alam, 2022). However, at the household level, family’s income and wealth have been found closely associated with food insecurity (Pervaiz, 2017). In other words, the families which have more assets like land, house, vehicles etc are more food secure as compared to those who do not (Rose, 1999). Similarly, there are many studies in which household surveys were conducted to check the household food insecurity. The results of such studies substantiated the same point of view that food insecurity was due to lack of resources (Radimer K. L., 1992), (Wehler, 1992), (Hamilton, 1997).

The food insecurity at the household level is usually assessed by calculating per capita calories consumption. Such method of measuring food insecurity is laborious and complicated vis-à-vis its implementation is concerned, and it is also costly to collect reliable data from people (Maxwell, 1996). The American Agency for International Development (USAID) implemented a project titled “Food and Nutrition Technical Assistance (FANTA)” for the development of an improved method for the assessment of food insecurity. Finally, a Household Food Insecurity Access Scale (HFIAS) was developed by USAID witch was relatively easy to employ. HFIAS was successfully tested and validated as relatively better measurement tool for assessing food insecurity experience across different cultures and nations (Coates J, 2007). HFIAS aims at estimating the household food accessibility by registering people’s responses based on their memory or recall over last few weeks.
This scale assesses food insecurity on three domains namely (i) feeling of uncertainty and anxiety about shortage of food, (ii) inadequate quality about variety and preference of food, and (iii) inadequate quantity of food consumption (Radimer K. L., 1990).

As mentioned above, HFIAS is relatively new method of measuring food insecurity which has also been proven successful across diverse cultural contexts and countries. The instant study was conducted to check the validity and reliability of this tool to measure household food insecurity in Pakistan. It was also planned to estimate the socioeconomic characteristics of households and their relationship with food insecurity for improved understanding. This could be regarded as the pioneer published study in which HFIAS is employed for assessing the incidence of food insecurity in Lahore, Pakistan.

Data and Methodology

Pakistan has four provinces – Punjab, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK), Sindh and Baluchistan. Punjab is the most populous province wherein 55% of total Pakistani people live. This province has special importance with respect to large agricultural production and relatively better economic development. Lahore is vibrant metropolitan and provincial capital city where there is a wide diversity of both the rich and the poor. The city of Lahore has vast sprawls of population.

The main aim of this research is to look into the actual condition of food insecurity in Lahore, Punjab. The instant research study was primarily based on field survey but it also employed the secondary sources of data to cross check and collaborate the results and conclusions. Primary data was collected from residential areas in the periphery of Lahore city during January to February 2021. These areas have been categorized as urban area, however, a lot of differences could be seen in the living conditions if compared with planned and well off housing societies of the city.

HFIAS has been designed not only to measure the incidence of food insecurity i.e. uncertainty of food, inadequate quality of food, inadequate quantity of food, reduction in food consumption, and people’s coping strategies but also the stages or gradation of people’s such experiences. A detailed questionnaire was developed with certain adaptation from standard HFIAS questions. This questionnaire was first piloted for incorporating necessary amendments and improvements. The sampling size of 316 households was proportionately distributed among targeted residential areas depending on their population size. Adapted HFIAS questionnaire was then used to recode the personal experience of households regarding specific conditions associated with food insecurity prevailed during last one month.

All the conceptual framework and definitions were derived from HFIAS Indicator Guide of USAID (Coates J, 2007). HFIAS is based on nine questions which was used with necessary modification to measure the household food insecurity. These questions were related to peoples’ experiences regarding inadequate quality of food, limited quantity of food and sleep hungry. This questionnaire was briefly explained to team members who interviewed the households.

According to the guidelines of this instrument (Coates J, 2007), “household” meant those people who shared a kitchen, dined together and lived in the same house. “Lack of resources” for the households meant that they did not have sufficient money to buy their meal. Three meals per day was considered normal routine. During the survey, questions were asked to the mothers to recall their memory for last four weeks and carefully register their own and other household members’ experiences regarding pre-structured nine situations related to food insecurity. If they replied positively then they were further asked to recall their memory to register frequency of occurrences. The frequency of occurrences in the last four weeks was recorded as “Seldom” if it happened one or two times, “Occasionally” if it happened 3 to 10 times, and “Many” if it happened more than 10 times. Later on, the responses of the respondents were scored and evaluated. A higher score represented worse situation of food insecurity and vice versa.

Results and Discussions

Social-economic Situation
It was observed from the analysis of professional background of the respondents that out of 316 household heads, a total of 194 household heads were self-employed, 99 were privately employed, 16 were senior citizens, and only 7 were government employees. It was also observed that there were only 3 household heads who were female.

Further, the calculation of the earning capacity of the households found that there were 181 households whose average per month income ranged from Rs. 10,000 to Rs. 20,000 whereas, the average per month income of 109 households ranged between Rs. 21,000 to Rs. 30,000. The average per month income of only 10 households fell in the category of Rs. 31,000 to Rs. 40,000 and only 16 households had average per month income more than Rs. 40,000. The overall monthly income of most of the respondents were much below national minimum wage rate of Rs. 20,000 per month for the year 2021. It could be due to the relatively poor economic conditions of the respondents in the locality (Ahmad, 2022). Moreover, such results could be affected by cultural inclination of common people in Pakistan to register a modest profile perhaps due to avoidance of any possible legal action by income tax authorities or expectation of receiving subsidy/social protection from government.

Validity and Reliability of HFIAS
The internal consistency of the questionnaire was required to ascertain its validity and reliability for measurement of incidence of food insecurity in Pakistan. The internal consistency of the questionnaire was estimated by driving Cronbach’s Alpha. In order to calculate Cronbach’s Alpha, full scale food insecurity and two sub-scales i.e. food quality and food quantity were estimated. The full scale of food insecurity included all the nine items of HFIAS. However, the first sub-scale of food insecurity included four items of HFIAS related to food quality whereas second sub-scale of food insecurity included five items of HFIAS related to food quantity.

The results of analysis as given in the Table-1 showed that the measurement of Cronbach’s Alpha for full scale was 0.684. Similarly, the measurement of Cronbach’s Alpha for the food quality was 0.752 whereas its value for food quantity was 0.600. The commonly accepted value of Cronbach’s Alpha ranges from 0.6 to 0.7 which represents sufficient reliability of the instrument (Hulin, 2001). The results confirmed the internal consistency of HFIAS that was used in the instant research.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. No.</th>
<th>Scale</th>
<th>Cronbach’s Alpha</th>
<th>HFIAS Items (N)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Food security (Full Scale)</td>
<td>0.684</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Food Quality (1st Sub-scale)</td>
<td>0.752</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Food Quantity (2nd Sub-scale)</td>
<td>0.600</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Respondents’ Responses Against HFIAS questions
According to analysis, the affirmative responses on HFIAS nine item questions i.e. “Seldom”, “Occasionally” and “often” ranged from 96.8% to 0.9% as shown in Table-2. It was observed that the most frequent affirmative response was recorded against question No. 2 wherein 306 respondents confirmed that they could not have the variety of food as per their preferences since last month because of limited financial resources. The question No. 9 received the least affirmative responses. Only 3 respondents shared that during last month, they had to wait for a full day and night for next meal because they did not have any food available in their house.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. No.</th>
<th>HFIAS Questions Statements (Coates J, 2007)</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>“In the past four weeks, did you worry that your household would not have enough food?”</td>
<td>275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>“In the past four weeks, were you or any household member not able to eat the kinds of foods you preferred because of a lack of resources?”</td>
<td>306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>“In the past four weeks, did you or any household member have to eat a limited variety of foods due to a lack of resources?”</td>
<td>303</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>“In the past four weeks, did you or any household member have to eat some foods</td>
<td>292</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
that you really did not want to eat because of a lack of resources?"
5 “In the past four weeks, did you or any household member have to eat a smaller meal due to lack of food?” 296 93.7
6 “In the past four weeks, did you or any household member have to eat fewer meals in a day because there was not enough food?” 301 95.3
7 “In the past four weeks, did you face the situation that there was absolutely no food to eat at your home because of lack of resources?” 111 35.1
8 “In the past four weeks, did you or any household member go to sleep at night hungry because there was not enough food?” 97 30.7
9 “In the past four weeks, did you or any household member go a whole day and night without eating anything because there was not enough food?” 3 0.9

HFIAS Related Domains
Anxiety and Uncertainty
According to nine items of HFIAS, the 1st question – “In the past four weeks, did you worry that your household would not have enough food?” - represented the uncertainty and anxiety of the respondent about food (Coates J, 2007). This question was specifically asked to the mother because under most of the cultures, it is the mother who was responsible for household’s food and she better knew the condition of her family members. The results showed that a total of 275 respondents replied positive against above-mentioned question related to uncertainty an anxiety about food which was 87% of total households surveyed.

The next question – “How often did this happen?” - was follow-up question of previous one and asked about the frequency of happening if 1st question had already been replied positively by the respondent (Coates J, 2007). The analysis showed that a total of 63 respondents (22.9%) replied as ‘Seldom’, 194 respondents (70.5%) replied as ‘Occasionally’ and only 18 respondents (6.6%) replied as ‘Many. The results are represented in Table-3 as below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question No.</th>
<th>HFIAS Question Statement (Coates J, 2007)</th>
<th>Responses categories</th>
<th>Response Frequency (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>“In the past four weeks, did you worry that your household would not have enough food?”</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>87.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td>12.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>“How often did this happen?”</td>
<td>Seldom</td>
<td>22.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Occasionally</td>
<td>70.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Many</td>
<td>6.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Inadequate Food Quality
The question No. 2, 3 and 4 in the HFIAS questionnaire were related to experience of the households regarding quality of food. The results are reproduced in Table 4 as under:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question No.</th>
<th>HFIAS Question Statement (Coates J, 2007)</th>
<th>Responses categories</th>
<th>Response Frequency (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>“In the past four weeks, were you or any household member not able to eat the kinds of foods you preferred because of a lack of resources?”</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>96.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td>3.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>“How often did this happen?”</td>
<td>Seldom</td>
<td>23.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Occasionally</td>
<td>67.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Many</td>
<td>9.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>“In the past four weeks, did you or any household member have to eat a limited variety of foods due to a lack of resources?”</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>95.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td>4.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>“How often did this happen?”</td>
<td>Seldom</td>
<td>29.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Occasionally</td>
<td>61.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Many</td>
<td>9.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“In the past four weeks, did you or any household member have to eat some foods that you really did not want to eat because of a lack of resources?”

Yes 92.4
No 7.6

“How often did this happen?”

Seldom 32.2
Occasionally 59.9
Many 7.9

It can be seen from the above findings that on an average or cumulatively, a total of 95% respondents showed their concerned about inadequate quality of food. Over a period of last four weeks, these households could not eat the adequate variety of food as per their preferences, they ate fewer kinds of foods, and they ate the kind of food they disliked. In other words, due to lack of resources, these households had limited choices in the type of food, they were forced to eat monotonous food and lacked necessary diversity in their food, and they had to consume socially and personally undesirable food.

Moreover, it was also observed that, cumulatively, 28.2% respondents experienced for at least one or two times the inadequate quality of food whereas 63.1% respondents three to ten times and only 8.7% respondents more than ten times experienced the same problem.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question No.</th>
<th>HFIAS Domain</th>
<th>Responses categories</th>
<th>Response Frequency (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2, 3 and 4</td>
<td>Inadequate quality of food</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>95.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td>5.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1, 3.1 and 4.1</td>
<td>How often did this happen?</td>
<td>Seldom</td>
<td>28.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Occasionally</td>
<td>63.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Many</td>
<td>8.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Inadequate Quantity of Food Consumption and its Consequences**

The question No. 5 to 9 in the HFIAS questionnaire were related to experience of the respondents regarding inadequate quantity of food and its consequences. The analysis of results is reproduced in Table 6 as under:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question No.</th>
<th>HFIAS Question Statement (Coates J, 2007)</th>
<th>Responses categories</th>
<th>Response Frequency (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>“In the past four weeks, did you or any household member have to eat a smaller meal due to lack of food?”</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>93.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td>6.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>“How often did this happen?”</td>
<td>Seldom</td>
<td>32.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Occasionally</td>
<td>61.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Many</td>
<td>6.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>“In the past four weeks, did you or any household member have to eat fewer meals in a day because there was not enough food?”</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>95.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td>4.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>“How often did this happen?”</td>
<td>Seldom</td>
<td>21.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Occasionally</td>
<td>48.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Many</td>
<td>29.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>“In the past four weeks, did you face the situation that there was absolutely no food to eat at your home because of lack of resources?”</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>35.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td>64.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>“How often did this happen?”</td>
<td>Seldom</td>
<td>78.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Occasionally</td>
<td>20.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Many</td>
<td>0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>“In the past four weeks, did you or any household member go to sleep at night hungry because there was not enough food?”</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>30.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td>69.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>“How often did this happen?”</td>
<td>Seldom</td>
<td>70.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Occasionally</td>
<td>27.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
It can be seen from the above findings that on an average or cumulatively, a total of 51.2% respondents showed their concerned about inadequate quantity of food consumption. Over a period of last four weeks, these households ate meals in lessor quantity; had fewer meals in a day; had no food of any kind in their home; went to sleep hungry; and spent at least a full day and night without having any meal. In other words, almost half of total respondents had to face a situation due to lack of resources when there was limited amount of meal available for at least any member of household; they had to skip at least one meal in certain day; there was not any food available for the household members from the usual means of household income; they had no food and they were aware that at least one household member had to sleep while feeling hungry; and a full day was experienced without having meal only due to financial constraints.

Moreover, it was also observed that, cumulatively, 53.7% respondents experienced inadequate quantity of food consumption for one or two times in the past one month whereas that of 38.5% respondents three to ten times and only 7.8% respondents more than ten times experienced the same.

**Table 7: Cumulative HFIAS results regarding inadequate quantity of food and its consequences**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question No.</th>
<th>HFIAS Domain</th>
<th>Responses categories</th>
<th>Response Frequency (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5, 6, 7, 8, and 9</td>
<td>Inadequate quantity consumption and physical consequences</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>51.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td>48.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5(A), 6(A), 7(A), 8(A), and 9(A)</td>
<td>How often did this happen?</td>
<td>Seldom</td>
<td>53.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Occasionally</td>
<td>38.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Many</td>
<td>7.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Incidence of Food Insecurity**

The responses on the specific questions included in the questionnaires regarding incidence of food insecurity accessibility were assigned scores and accordingly ranked. The analysis of final results revealed that 30.2% of population was food secure, 22.3% of population was mildly food insecure, 40.2% of population was moderately food insecure whereas 7.3% of population was found to be severely food insecure.

These finding were not in consonant with National Nutritional Survey 2018 (GOP/UNICEF, 2018) and depicted a worse situation of food insecurity in the peri-urban areas of Lahore. As per National Nutritional Survey 2018, the Punjab province’s average value for food secure people stood at 67.6% whereas the mildly and moderately food insecure people were jointly estimated as 18.2% of the population. The current study highlighted a grave situation where people previously food secure appeared to have shifted towards mildly food insecurity and moderately food insecurity. The shrinkage of food secure category of people might be due to devastating spell of COVID-19 and deteriorating economic and social situation since 2018.
Conclusions
It is concluded from the study that HFIAS has validity and reliability in the context of Pakistan. HFIAS can be applied safely for measurement of incidence of food insecurity and its gradation in Pakistan. On the basis of study results, it can be generalized that nearly 87% population in the surveyed area and largely in Pakistan felt anxiety and uncertainty about food, 95% population experienced inadequate quality of food, and 51.2% population faced inadequate food consumption. Further, less than one third (30.2%) of population in surveyed area was food secure whereas 22.3% of population was mildly food insecure, 40.2% of population was moderately food insecure and 7.3% of population was severely food insecure. The current study highlighted a grave situation where people previously food secure appeared to have shifted towards mildly and moderately food insecurity. The shrinkage of food secure category of people might be due to devastating spell of COVID-19 and deteriorating economic and social situation since 2018.

References


Evaluating Persons with Disabilities about Awareness of their Rights as Citizens of Pakistan: A Survey with Reference to ICT Rights of PWD’s Act 2020

*Muntaha Ahmad, MPhil Scholar, Institute of Special Education, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan
Ayeesha Raza, PhD Scholar, Institute of Special Education University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan
Ghulam Fatima, Associate Professor, Institute of Special Education University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email address: muntahaahmad068@gmail.com

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

Purpose: Awareness of human rights are significant in the safety of the citizen of a country. While the government has set up detailed rights for people with disabilities, due to the lack of awareness many people with disabilities in Pakistan are not able to access educational, vocational or employment facilities. The purpose of this study was to evaluate people with disabilities’ awareness of their rights as citizens of Pakistan.

Methodology: The study was quantitative in nature. To collect and evaluate data, the researcher designed a questionnaire of twenty-four statements. The variance was calculated to evaluate awareness based on the age, gender, employment status and disability of the participants.

Findings: Major findings of the study revealed that participants of age twenty-seven and above and who were employed, were aware of most of the mentioned rights, while participants who were below age twenty-seven or students, were unaware or partially aware of most of the mentioned rights.

Implications: Seminars and webinars should be conducted to the awareness of the rights of people with different abilities in educational institutions for people with disabilities, for parents of children with disabilities as well as for the common public so, that people with different abilities feel included and safe in society.

© 2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-Non-Commercial-4.0


Introduction

According to the latest studies, done in 2020, the total population is 220.09 million and 3.41% population of Pakistan is suffering from mild to severe disabilities (Pakistan Social & Living Standard Measurement, 2020). This ratio includes people from both rural and urban areas. But this isn’t just the ratio of people who have disabilities, this is the ratio of people for whom there are rights...
but those rights are only on the people. People with disabilities in Pakistan are a minority that is being and for whom close to no services are provided by the government. According to Pakistan Social & Living Standard Measurement powered by the Pakistan Bureau of Statistics (PBS) in 2019-20, 10.69% of the population is living with “functional limitations.” It is observed from data that 10.69 per cent population of 5 years of age and above are suffering from functional limitations or at least one disability (PSLM District Level, PBS, 2019-20). Murray and Nadel define functional limitation as “the restriction or lack of ability to perform an action or activity in the manner or within the range considered normal that results from impairment” (Murray & Nadel, 2016). This means that 10.69 per cent of the population of Pakistan is not able to perform day-to-day activities due to impairments.

Oliver (1996) presented a definition of a person with disabilities which contains three elements. These three elements include the ‘experience of externally imposed restrictions, the presence of an impairment and ‘self-identification as a disabled person. He believed that a person identifies himself as disabled when he faces limitations in society. If we presented our society as free of barriers and easy to access, people with disabilities shall not feel excluded.

Persons with disabilities do not have access to public places, buildings, transportation, education, employment and safety in their society because of their impairment. Research has shown that the overall level of access to public transportation has been poor for people with physical disabilities (Ahmad, M. 2015). Poor environmental conditions such as inaccessible facilities at, unfriendly vehicles, the behaviour of transportation staff, and travel safety and security threats made access to routes difficult and sometimes nearly impossible in Punjab. The findings indicated that it would be impossible to promote the rights of persons with disabilities in local transport. In developing societies like Pakistan, not having a clear understanding of the transport-accessibility challenges at transport-planning levels and adopting equities in practice creates a lot of issues in the implementation of the rights of persons with disabilities (Ahmad, M. 2015).

In such a situation, it becomes the government's responsibility to make sure that every citizen has access to all facilities in the country. Because it is every person’s right to have the freedom to access their facilities as a citizen. But the reason for their inaccessibility is not that there are no rights established by the government of Pakistan. It is contrary to that because, in 2020, the government of Pakistan passed a bill called The Islamabad Capital Territory Rights of Persons with Disability Act 2020 for the rights of persons with disabilities.

The bill although passed yet its implementation has been overlooked. Public places and buildings, such as banks still do not have disabled-friendly access, neither ramps nor availability of braille-translated instructions and labels are available in the buildings. The person with physical disabilities, as well as visual impairments, finds barriers in the built environment, healthcare delivery processes, and the ceiling of health subsidies (Ahmad, M. (2013). Though it is difficult to say what could be the possible reason for this negligence one of the many reasons for the lack of implementation and awareness could be due to the negligence of the local representatives of the country who, sadly, are elected by none other than us.

It has been studied that fewer than half of the elected local representatives in Pakistan have an accurate knowledge of certain types of disability and their conceivable causes (Ahmad, M., & Ahmad, M. M., 2011). Only 16% of the politicians or public representatives had some knowledge of the special needs specific to a certain disability that are necessary to be added to the delivery of service and local development plans. This raises the question of whether they deserve and should be public representatives or not. Because as stated in the public policy on disability, district governments are primarily accountable to keep a strict check on the inception of disability and counselling required to the special needs at district level (Government of Pakistan, 2006).

Mehtab & Makbol (2011) further explained that some of the public representatives who had inadequate awareness of the matter had a view that disability might be a ‘personal matter’ of a family.
hence families may feel disinclined to share the discreet issues of the disabled members of their family publicly. In policies presented for persons with disabilities, it is the obligation of local governments to enforce policies of disabled persons to claim rights of disabled at the local level. However, only 16% of the total respondents had awareness regarding a few rights and laws for PWDs. Meanwhile, just 9.7% had clarity of a few laws and rights, whereas rest of the respondents has neither clarity nor awareness (Ahmad, M., & Ahmad, M. M., 2011).

Despite the district government being solely responsible to endorse and protect the rights of various segments at the local level, only 4 out of the 31 participants acknowledged themselves as accountable for promoting disability rights (Government of Pakistan 2006). Approximately 60% of the participants had no idea regarding the local offices in charge of implementing the rights of persons with disabilities. The respondents with some understandings of the matter were officials of social welfare who execute disability certificates on appeal, and provide charity based inclusive aid to those in need (Ahmad, M., & Ahmad, M. M., 2011).

This behaviour of the society leaves the disabled population confused, neglected, excluded and unaware of their rights as citizens of Pakistan. To know one’s rights as a citizen it is important to realize one’s importance as a society member. The reaction of society changes when society members and minorities speak up about their rights and leaves no choice to the stakeholders. J. Abascal & C. Nicolle (2005) explain this phenomenon as a social revolution that has advanced as a result of the combat against social exclusion ever since disabled people became conscious of their rights and needs. In their study regarding the advancement towards inclusive design, they explained that the advancement towards technology in education cannot be ignored as people with hearing impairment are now more aware of its importance in their lives.

It is revealed that the choice of a person’s social role and position in the system of social relations is based on an understanding of their goals in life. It implies that the active inclusion of the person in the system of social relations is understood under self-actualization (Lunev et al., 2014). It was further explained that the process of self-realization is structured by a dialectical unity of desire to participate in the social community and the longing for individuality, and allocation out of this community as an individual itself (Lunev et al., 2014). Hence, it proves that the awareness of the rights of persons with disabilities by themselves is important to bring change in the attitudes of the government and structural and moral development of society. It plays a major role in people with disabilities getting their rights and being equal members of this society.

In this study, we will be evaluating Persons with Disabilities' awareness of their rights as citizens of Pakistan in light of the PWD Act 2020. This act was first presented before the Standing Committee on Human Rights on April 24 in 2019. The bill was composed by the Minister of Human Rights Dr Shireen Mazari. However, the original draft needed certain amendments because due to the lack of inclusions.

This bill is called **The Islamabad Capital Territory Rights of Persons with Disability Act.** This bill enlists the rights of persons with disabilities regarding non-discrimination, equity before the law, right to ease of access and mobility, privacy, protection from abuse, violence and intolerant discriminatory behaviour, equity in education and employment, equity in health and medical rehabilitation services, right to live independently in the community, right to home and family, freedom of expression, right to political participation, right to justice, own property, participation in sports, cultural and recreational activities and Protection of persons with disabilities in risk and disaster situation.

**Objectives of the Study**

The purpose of this study is to evaluate if Persons with disabilities are aware of their rights as citizens of Pakistan or not. The purpose of this study was also to shed light on the importance of the self-realization of the awareness of the rights of persons with disabilities.
Methodology
The study was quantitative. A survey method of research was used to design the study. The population included the disabled population of Pakistan from age nineteen and above. The sample of the study was chosen through snowball and convenient sampling and was composed of fifty people with disabilities of age 18 and above from Lahore.

The data was gathered from the sample through a close-ended questionnaire which was composed of 6 sections. The first section of the questionnaire was composed of the demographic of the participant, and five general statements which evaluated the current awareness level of the rights of persons with disabilities. The second section was composed of three statements to assess the rights related to Protection from abuse, violence and intolerant discriminatory behavior. The third section evaluated the awareness of the rights of equity in education and included four statements. The fourth section evaluated the awareness of rights of equity in employment through four statements. The fifth section evaluated awareness of the rights of Equity in health and medical rehabilitation services through six statements. The last and sixth sections of the questionnaire evaluated the rights to Participation in sports, cultural and recreational activities and were composed of five statements. The data were analyzed by calculating frequencies and the relationship between awareness and age, gender and disability was found by applying the t-test using SPSS software.

Procedure Opted for Data Collection
The first step was to pilot test the instrument design by the researcher. After pilot testing the questionnaire a soft version of the questionnaire was created using google forms and was sent to the required sampling group through social media and WhatsApp. As the sample was collected through convenient and snowball sampling, most of the data were collected through online means. Interviews with participants were also conducted to find out about their experiences and observations regarding the practice of rights of persons with disabilities in Pakistan. Data was collected from forty persons with disabilities. The return rate of the questionnaire was 100%.

Findings
The results are presented in the form of tables and interpretations below:
Table 1 shows the demographic information of the participants:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age Of the Participants</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18-22</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>10.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23-26</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>15.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27-30</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>17.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30+</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>56.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender of Participants</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>64.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>35.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Disability of participants</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Physical Impairment</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>43.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visual Impairment</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>33.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hearing Impairment</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>20.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDD</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Work status</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>56.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 1 shows that 43.6% of participants were below the age of thirty and 56.4% were above thirty. According to table 2, the percentage of male participants was 64.1% and female participants were only 35.9%. It was also calculated that the percentage of participants with physical impairments was 43.6, the percentage of participants with visual impairments was 33.3, the percentage of hearing-impaired participants was 20.5% and people with IDD were only 2.6%. Lastly, the work status of the participants showed that 67% of the participants were employed, 21% of participants were students and 13% of the participants were unemployed.

**Discussion**

It was observed that the number of participants who were employed was mostly aware of their Employment, Educational, and Health rights. While most of them were unaware of their rights in case of abuse or violence and rights related to sports and cultural activities.

Participants who were unemployed or were students were aware of their educational rights but were only partially aware of their health, and employment rights and mostly unaware of their rights in case of abuse, health issues and sports and cultural activities.

While being interviewed for the research respondents agreed that they got to know most of their rights after or during their graduation and they and their peers were mostly unaware of their rights as PWDs in Pakistan till higher education and employment. It was recorded, during the interviews that uneducated, unemployed or people with only primary to secondary education were still unaware of their rights as PWDs in Pakistan.

During the interviews, the respondents gave common reviews regarding the implementation of rights which was that most of the mentioned services promised by the government in the ICT Rights of PWD’s Act 2020 with regards to education, employment and health services are being practised in Pakistan in public sectors, while the private sectors still need improvements. However, the legal services as well as the services mentioned regarding the inclusion of people with disabilities in cultural, sports and entertainment activities are not completely in practice. For example, accessibility to buildings such as theatres, cinemas, stadiums and other such public places of entertainment is not available. Shopping malls do have ramps but the number of wheelchairs is either less than five or none at all. Bathrooms and food courts are not disabled friendly and braille-embossed directions in malls are not available.

**Recommendations**

The following recommendations have been made based on the findings:

1. Seminars should be conducted on awareness of the rights of PWDS to make sure that people with disabilities, their families and peers are aware of their rights and how to practice them.
2. The special educational institutions and general education institutions of Pakistan, whether government or private, should organize workshops and awareness seminars for students as well as parents regarding the awareness of the rights of PWDs. These can be conducted on world disability day, blind person day etc.
3. The government needs to keep check in the private sector whether places of entertainment, such as shopping malls etc. are accessible for people with disabilities.
4. In similar future research, disabled people of low economic status, education, and rural areas should be included and evaluated. As this research was not just for evaluation but awareness as well.
5. Common public, influencers, celebrities, politicians and other influential figures need to be more aware of the rights of people with disabilities and should talk about this on TV social media etc.
Conclusion
The govt of Pakistan has given many rights to people with disabilities “on paper.” While most of the services mentioned in the ICT Rights of PWDs Act 2022 are in practice in public educational, work and medical sectors, these however are not being practised in private sectors. Because the problem lies, not in the availability of resources, but in the awareness of the common public and people with disabilities. Due to most of PWDs being unaware of their rights, they cannot protest for being discriminated against, excluded and treated unfairly. Most of the people with disabilities, as mentioned by many respondents, have “accepted their situation” of inaccessibility. I request all public and private organizations striving to provide a better life for PWDs to not ignore this trivial yet significant matter and work on the awareness of the rights of PWDs in Pakistan among the disabled as well as the common public.

References
Challenges Limiting the Role of Deaf Parents in Academics of their Children with Normal Hearing

*Asma Kanwal*, Lecturer, Department of Special Education, University of Education, Lahore, Pakistan  
*Faiza Jaleel*, Lecturer, Department of Special Education, University of Education, Lahore, Pakistan  
*Rukhsana Bashir*, Assistant Professor, Institute of Special Education, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan  
*Komal Shahzadi*, Govt. Training College for the Teachers of Blind, Lahore, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email: asma.kanwal@ue.edu.pk*

**ABSTRACT**

**Purpose:** The goal of this research was to investigate the difficulties that deaf parents have when it comes to the academic performance of their hearing children.

**Methodology:** Case studies based on qualitative paradigms were used for this study. Participants in the research were parents who were deaf themselves but whose children had normal hearing. The sample comprises of 14 deaf couples from two divisions of Punjab—Lahore and Gujranwala. The data collection method consisted of a self-developed interview schedule with open-ended questions. Thematic analysis, a qualitative method, was used to analyze the data.

**Findings:** Deaf parents have to deal with a number of obstacles, the most significant of which are communication barriers, attitudes they confront, and misunderstandings held by the community as a whole, all of which limit their capacity to participate in their children's academic lives who have normal hearing.

**Implications:** It was suggested to the various stakeholders that they should be required to play their respective contributing roles in the process of reducing the constraints that restrict the engagement of parents in the academics of their children on a consistent basis, beginning with the most fundamental level.

© 2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0


**Introduction**

Parental involvement is a crucial component of effective education for children of all ages (Epstein 2001; Hill and Tyson 2009; Hornby 2000, 2011; Jeynes 2005, 2007; Wilder 2014). Research showed that parents have an effect on how well their children do in school by helping them learn at home and taking part in school activities (Harris & Goodall, 2008).

Different levels of parental participation in their children's education are accounted for by a typology
proposed by Epstein (1987, 1992, 1996). Epstein (1987) recognized four categories of parental engagement in schools in her early research as fundamental responsibilities, school-to-home communications, parent involvement at school, and parent involvement in learning activities at home. Epstein (1992, 1996) added to the typology and came up with six types of school-related ways for parents to be involved by means of helping parents learn how to raise children, communication between schools and parents, involving parents in school volunteer opportunities, involving parents in home-based learning, involving parents in school decision-making, and involving parents in school-community partnerships.

The results of the study conducted by Fan and Chen (2001) indicated a weak to moderate, practically significant correlation between parental participation and academic success. Through moderator analysis, it was shown that parental aspiration/expectation for children's educational accomplishment has the highest association with kids' academic achievement, but parental home monitoring had the least relationship. Moreover, the association is greater when academic accomplishment is reflected by a worldwide measure (e.g., GPA) as opposed to a subject-specific indicator (e.g., math grade).

Better student results are supported by parents' economic level or social class, financial assistance, decision-making skills, and learning capacities. Students said that their parents provide direction and counselling for their further education as well as assistance in coping with emotions of stress and loss. Academic success and job choice have a strong relationship. Academic success and the obstacles, challenges, and concerns connected to parental engagement had a substantial, somewhat favorable association (Batool & Raiz, 2020). It is generally accepted that parenting and education are two distinct but related aspects of a child's existence. Parenting is a crucial ability, and the research has also recommended that parents get training in this area (Lundahl et al., 2006).

Schools acknowledge that there are a variety of ways to engage parents along a spectrum of parental involvement, ranging from attendance at traditional school events to active involvement in the child's education to higher-level parental engagement with the child's learning and recognition of the parent's own educational needs. Schools appeared to acknowledge that the children in their care can only flourish if parents and partners are actively engaged in an ongoing discourse that listens to and is sensitive to home and community realities. This obviously necessitates that schools work together to seek mutual understanding and viable solutions. The effectiveness of programs and tactics is seen to depend on strong parental involvement leadership (Hornby & Blackwell, 2018).

Teachers often join the teaching profession after obtaining formal technical/professional training or relevant work experience. Parents, on the other hand, do not have the same chance to obtain such official instruction. Parents' lack of formal technical or professional expertise or experience with educational matters may be the main cause of their dissatisfaction or obstacle to their engagement. According to the researcher, parents also need instruction in educational topics such as teaching techniques, pedagogical tactics, mechanisms for assessment and evaluation, the whole-child approach in an inclusive setting, technology use, etc. (Pasha et al., 2021).

Over 90% of deaf people are born to parents who can hear (Mitchell & Karchmer, 2004). Deafness is defined not just by audiometry, but also by cultural and social affinity. In the Deaf culture, audiological deafness is not viewed as a handicap, but rather as a linguistic minority. This group has its own language (ASL), customs, values, sense of humor, art, famous people, and so on. A person doesn't have to be deaf, hard of hearing, or have gone deaf later in life to be part of the Deaf community. Hearing people who work with the Deaf community, such as interpreters, family members of deaf people, and hearing children of deaf parents could also be considered part of the Deaf community (Singleton & Tittle, 2000). More than the amount of hearing loss, what makes someone a part of the deaf community is their choice, history, behavior, and ability to sign (Pizer, Walters, & Meier, 2013). You can be born into this culture or choose to join it (Singleton & Tittle, 2000).

Over 90% of deaf parents have hearing children (Myers, Marcus, & Myers, 2010). Hearing Children of Deaf Parents create a unique group since their parents are members of a distinct cultural and
linguistic group. They have unique language and cultural experiences, as well as roles (e.g., interpreter, advocate, etc.) that are distinct from those of their hearing-parented peers (Filer & Filer, 2000; Preston, 1996; Singleton & Tittle, 2000).

Deaf parents often use their culture and needs as Deaf individuals to communicate with hearing children or others. Children of deaf adults showed that they were directed through the use of signing and spoken languages, however not all could sign. Their Deaf parents may not be fluent signers, thus they used spoken language or hybrid ways (Preston, 1995).

Lack of communication is a frequent experience shared by deaf people. This communication hole and inability to connect with the world is the first of many cultural experiences that demonstrate the individual is unique and a member of the deaf culture. As deaf people are exposed to use sign language with other deaf people, the enculturation process is completed, and deaf people are identified as ethnically deaf (Miller, 2010). There are several forms of deaf-parented households with hearing children, which should be noted. Both parents may be deaf signers, or one parent may be hearing and the other deaf signer or oral deaf. Both deaf parents could not know sign language; they might be oral, and they might not identify with the Deaf culture.

Deafness in parents and other key caregivers has an impact on the psychosocial development of their children (Zarem, 2003). Children of deaf parents as a group considered themselves to have a low reputation, to be physically unattractive, to have bad managerial capabilities, to be interested in making friends, and to have weak academic and cognitive abilities (DeLuigi, 1991).

Deaf parents may not have equal access to knowledge on successful parenting practices (Singleton & Tittle, 2000) and may lack exposure to suitable parent models (Hoffmeister, 1985). However, research demonstrates that Deaf parents are often capable, loving, and caring (Clark, 2003; Mallory, Schein, & Zingle, 1992; Preston, 1994; Schein, 1989) and committed to nurture their children in the most effective manner possible. Parents of young deaf children were found satisfied and engaged in the key ECSE components of speech, speech reading, reading, writing, mathematics, guidance and counselling. Regardless of how involved parents are in the education of their deaf young children, how satisfied they are with the academic help offered by the schools does significant (Fatima et al., 2020).

Hearing children of deaf parents reported that Sign language was the first language they learned, their connection with their parents is fairly shallow and lacks depth, such as discussing politics or laughing at a joke, etc. due to poor vocabulary of their deaf parents, and they were delayed speakers and have issues even with their writing skills. They have to shield their parents from hearing remarks, glances, and other unpleasant circumstances. They have to play the role of interpreter (Moroe & De Andrade, 2018) to bridge the gap between deaf and hearing community. They sometimes had to alert their parents to potential threats, odd sounds, etc. The impact of technology observed in reducing Deaf parents' reliance on hearing children and facilitating communication on both sides. Hearing children of deaf parents reported that their parents never or rarely came to school to talk to teachers or do other things. This was mostly because of communication problems. Instead, family members like aunts and grandmothers did this job. Sometimes, the parents were even there. Some participants took advantage of the situation, and in some cases, they didn't tell their parents about school meetings, their progress, and other things. Other family members helped them with their homework when their deaf parents couldn't (Hadjikakou et al., 2009).

A little data is to be found from literature about deaf parents having hearing children concerned with academic accomplishments. There is a serious need to identify the obstacles that restrict the participation of deaf parents in their hearing children's academics.

**Objectives of the Study**

The following were the objectives of the study:

1. To investigate the challenges of deaf parents limiting their role in academics of their children with normal hearing
2. To compare the challenges of participants on the basis of their demographic information.

**Questions of the Study**
The following were the questions of the study:

1. What are the challenges faced by deaf parents in playing a contributing role in academics of their hearing children?
2. What is the difference between the challenges limiting the role of deaf parents in academics of their hearing children on the basis of their socio-economic status?
3. What is the difference between the challenges limiting the role of deaf parents in academics of their hearing children on the basis of their qualification?
4. What is the difference between the challenges limiting the role of deaf parents in academics of their hearing children on the basis of their geographic universe?

**Research Design of the Study**
The purpose of the research was to investigate the obstacles experienced by deaf parents that prevent them from contributing to the academic success of their hearing children. The type of the investigation was qualitative case study.

**Population and Sample of the Study**
The population of the study was deaf parents having children with normal hearing living in different districts of Lahore and Gujranwala Divisions of the Punjab, province of Pakistan. The sample of the study consisted of 28 deaf persons as 14 deaf couples (14 Fathers + 14 Mothers = 28) having children without hearing loss. The sample of the study was selected through snowball sampling technique. 8 Deaf couples (57.1%) having children with normal hearing were selected from Gujranwala division; 4 couples from Gujranwala district, 1 couple from Gujrat district, 2 couples from Hafizabad district, and 1 couple from Sialkot district. 6 Deaf couples (42.8%) having children with normal hearing were selected from Lahore division; 3 couples from Lahore district, 1 couple from Kasur district, and 2 couples from Sheikhupura district.

**Instrumentation and Data Collection**
Data was collected through self-developed, open ended and semi-structured interview schedule. The interview schedule was comprised of 20 questions with many other questions to inquire the in-depth truth of the reality. The instrument of the study was finalized and validated by a panel of field experts. The researchers interpreted the instrument in sign language and interviewed the sample by personal visits and video calls. The informed consent from interviewees was ensured, video recordings were made and responses were note down. A demographic sheet was also developed to collect the demographic information of the respondents. Data was analyzed by thematic analysis to draw the conclusion.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender (28 deaf persons)</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>50.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>50.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Division (28 deaf persons)</td>
<td>Lahore</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>42.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Gujranwala</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>57.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age of 14 Fathers</td>
<td>Less than 26 years</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(26-30)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>28.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(31-35)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>35.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(36-40)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>28.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Above 40 Years</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age of 14 Mothers</td>
<td>Less than 26 years</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>14.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(26-30)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>35.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(31-35)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>28.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(36-40)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>21.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Above 40 Years</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Occupation of 14 Fathers</td>
<td>Laborer</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>64.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Public</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>14.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Private</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>21.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Occupation of 14 Mothers</td>
<td>Housewife</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>78.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Public</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Private</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>21.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salary of 14 Deaf Couples</td>
<td>Less than 11000</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11000-20000</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>28.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>21000-30000</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>35.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>31000-40000</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>21.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Above 40000</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>14.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education of 14 Fathers</td>
<td>Illiterate</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>21.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Elementary</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>35.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Matric</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>14.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>FA</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>14.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>BA</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education of 14 Mothers</td>
<td>Illiterate</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>14.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>35.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Elementary</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>21.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Matric</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>21.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>FA</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level of Hearing Loss of Parents</td>
<td>Mild/Hard of Hearing</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Moderate</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>14.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Severe</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>35.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Profound/Deaf</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>42.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Kids of Each Deaf Couple</td>
<td>One</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>14.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Two</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>28.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Three</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>35.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Four</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>21.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Five</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Above Five</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family System of Each Deaf Couple</td>
<td>Separate</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>21.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Joint</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>78.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School Sector of Children with Normal Hearing</td>
<td>Public</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>42.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Private</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>57.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Kids with/without Hearing Loss of Each Deaf Couple</td>
<td>Deaf Couples With Normal Hearing Without Normal Hearing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Couple I</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Couple II</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Couple III</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Couple IV</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Couple V</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Couple VI</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Couple VII</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Couple VIII</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Couple IX</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Couple X</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Couple XI</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Couple XII</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Couple XIII</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Couple XIV</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Thematic Analysis

Q.1 How do you assist your child with normal hearing in their academic endeavors?
The majority of interviewees stated that they want to assist their hearing child in his/her educational activities, but there are many factors that limit their ability to do so. However, they do their best to assist their children with normal hearing by focusing on their educational needs, providing them with a tutor, all the stationary items, books, uniforms, shoes, and bags, visiting their school officials, and dropping them off at school.

“I wake up early in the morning to make preparations for school of my children by providing them ironed uniform, polished shoes, breakfast, lunch box and checking their bags or copies whether all the things are complete. I attend school meetings and annual result day to know about the progress of my children with normal hearing”.

“I earned money to make available all the provisions necessary for the academics of our children. I pick and drop my children from school in time, give pocket money to them, pay school and tutor’s fee, check their copies, daily diary, test and papers. I admire when my children earn good marks”.

Q.2 How do you communicate your hearing child’s educational needs to his/her teachers?
The majority of respondents reported that they use sign language to interact with their hearing children’s teachers. The most of the time, instructors cannot comprehend even local, transparent and iconic signs. Teachers are unfamiliar to use of sign language. The teachers interact with us either orally or in writing. Due to this communication gap, neither side can grasp the educational concerns of the other. Therefore, a mediator is required for a good interaction.

“Teachers of my child with normal hearing try to tell me about the performance of my child in the school by written expression. But I don’t have enough vocabulary to understand what they ask to me. They use oral-aural method which creates misunderstanding, irritation, unfamiliarity or avoidance between both parties. Teachers or school staff cannot understand and use sign language. So, I visit the school with my sister-in-law who play the role of mediator, interpreter and translator for the interaction between us”.

“Teachers don’t try to talk with us, they ask us to visit school with the person who can make interaction possible”.

“Sometimes, my child plays the role of mediator between teacher and parents”.

“My father-in-law assist me when I need to convey a message to the teacher of my children with normal hearing, he writes a note for teacher. Similarly, when teachers share something through written note on diary, he reads to me”.

“I try to convey my message to the teacher of my children with normal hearing with the use of WhatsApp emojis, stickers and gif”.

Q.3 In what ways does the school of your child with normal hearing collaborate with you for your child's academic success?
The majority of the respondents said that the school did not go above and beyond to work with us. The management of the school doesn't seem to care about our needs. They don't employ any consultants, sign language interpreters, or other support personnel. Some of the school staff members act sympathetically toward us because we are deaf.

“They simply have only one option of mediator. Most of the time, they ignore us and ask us to bring any person who convey their message to us”.

“School principal doesn’t take interest to know about our issues and problems regarding academics
of our children with normal hearing”.

“School staff doesn’t allow us to visit principal office. They ask us to send a person with normal hearing who can hear and speak in proper manner”.

“School administration and other staff don’t encourage us, motivate us and acknowledge our efforts towards the academics of our child with normal hearing.

“We most of the time feel ignored and misfit during gatherings in schools such as result day, parent-teacher meetings, or annual days etc.”

Q.4 Who does share the responsibilities of academics of your child with normal hearing with you?
Majority of the respondents responded that family members have to cooperate with us in sharing the responsibility of academics of our children with normal hearing. It was reported that grandparents are most collaborative individuals who share the responsibility of academics of their grandchildren with normal hearing having deaf parents in true sense. It was also reported that most of the time, we have to wait for the availability of the hearing persons. Sometimes, it seems frustrating for them to sidestep their own circumstances.

“My parents-in-laws live with us because they know we both husband and wife are deaf and we need their company more than their other children. They both invest their time, energy and belongingness to our children’s betterment, academics and independency. My father-in-law visit the school on regular basis to monitor the progress of our children with normal hearing”.

“I request my sister-in-law to contact school teacher and home tutor when needed. She is very nice to us even sacrificing her own household chores mostly but not easy for her all the times”.

“I have to request tuition teacher to interact school teacher for communicating our concerns regarding child’s educational performance”.

“We have to wait for the availability of the persons with normal hearing who can help us to cope up the educational needs of our child”.

Q.5 Which challenges do you encounter when teaching your child at home?
Majority of the interviewees reported that they face difficulties while teaching their children with normal hearing at home because they lack sufficient English and Urdu vocabulary, and a rich educational background. Consequently, it is difficult for deaf parents to educate their child how to pronounce and utilize words in sentences and in daily life. Children with normal hearing also get confused and become frustrated between sign language and oral mode of communication.

“I don’t know the meaning of written text in English or Urdu language. I can teach basic mathematics such as addition and subtraction to my child with normal hearing in sign language”.

“I can teach drawing, sketching and painting to my children with normal hearing without any help of others but other subjects are out of my capacity due to my deafness”.

“I cannot tell my child the meaning of text, spelling corrections, word pronunciation, and use of words because of my deafness and low education”.

“My child with normal hearing doesn’t bother my concerns about his/her education. He/she shows uncomfortable or confused being bicultural/bilingual”.
“When my child was at primary school level, it was easier for me to help him/her in his/her education but now the syllabus is very difficult to understand for me”.

**Q.6 What kind of support do you need to help your hearing child with his/her homework?**
The majority of participants indicated that they require the physical and moral support of sign-language-fluent hearing individuals. Deaf parents mentioned that their children usually ignore their instructions while doing homework, a person with normal hearing can make it easier for parents to monitor them.

“I need a person who have understanding that how to use total communication method. He/she can bridge the gap between me and my child while doing homework”.

“Family members should give specific time to me and my child for doing homework”.

“The availability of video tutorials is good for me to assist my child in homework”.

**Q.7 How does your child with normal hearing respond to your efforts for his/her academics?**
The majority of participants said that their hearing children are already aware of their deaf parents' shortcomings. They are aware of their parents’ restricted language, inability to comprehend written information, and limited means of communication. Therefore, they pay little heed to the efforts of their deaf parents. Participants noted that hearing children conceal teacher-to-parent messages, their progress report, and homework assignments.

“My child with normal hearing feels more comfortable with hearing people to discuss their educational problems than me”.

“Once class teacher of my child with normal hearing said that she sent the progress report and messages to me for visiting school to discuss the poor performance of my child. But my child with normal hearing confessed that he torn the paper of diary where the message from teacher was written”.

“My children with normal hearing show carelessness to my efforts for their education but more responsible when their aunt teaches them”.

**Q.8 How does your family respond to your efforts for academics of your hearing child?**
The majority of the respondents mentioned that most of the family members uninterested in the academic pursuits of hearing children. They don’t value our efforts and have low expectations of us. Some family members actively support and inspire us about the academic achievements of our hearing children. But others don’t have enough time, interest and concern to know how we manage educational needs of our children with normal hearing.

“My cousin said to me that you don’t have any pressure of academic achievement of your child as hearing parents have”.

“Family members make us realize that they are burdened due to the shared responsibility of education of our children with normal hearing”.

“My aunt said that you don’t need to worry about the education of your child with normal hearing, he/she will manage by his/her own efforts”.

“Others give me such expressions as “they have to share the responsibility because I cannot perform my parenting duty due to my deafness”.”
Q.9 How does society acknowledge your contribution to the academics of your child with normal hearing?

The majority of the participants mentioned that society doesn't have time to address our struggles, efforts, and needs in relation to our participation in the academic success of our hearing children. Family, neighbors, and friends don't take the trouble to find out on their own how we cope with hearing counterparts. Some of the respondents mentioned that society members are available to us only when we request them for their cooperation. There is no institution for deaf parents' counselling and consultation.

“My neighbors help me when I need their assistance in academics of my child but I have to request them to be available”.

“I want to discuss my problems and challenges with someone but people don’t have time to listen to us”.

“My neighbors have strange expressions when I request them to help me about educational activities for my child”.

“When I ask my neighbors to guide me about home assignments of my child, they prefer to guide the child rather than me because it seems time consuming to them”.

“We seek some meaningful sources for our guidance regarding education of our children with normal hearing”.

![Thematic Analysis Diagram](image)
Conclusion

Children's academic accomplishments at all levels are significantly impacted by parental engagement. Deaf parents encounter several obstacles that restrict their contribution to the academic success of their hearing children. Similarly, children with normal hearing who have deaf parents face several challenges as a result of their parents' hearing impairment.

The findings of the research indicate that deaf parents provide their hearing children with the physical, moral, and economical necessities for academic success, but struggle to educate their children owing to a lack of educational background, a limited language, and a communication gap.

Due to having different modes of communication between deaf and hearing community, communication gap is found major challenge to interact with academic officials such as teachers, school staff and administration. There is always a dire need of having mediator to make interaction possible for discussing child’s educational needs.

It was reported that school does not do something meaningful to address the needs of deaf parents of children with normal hearing. Instead, school personnel shift all the responsibility to the shoulders of deaf parents by requiring them to have mediator or interpreter. Deaf parents confront challenging situations in school, including lack of awareness, lack of interest, peculiar conduct, and administration avoidance.

Few family members, including parents-in-law, sisters-in-law, siblings, and aunts, share the academic responsibilities of deaf parents for hearing children. However, it may be challenging to make sure that a family member with normal hearing is available when they are most in need of their services as mediator.

Less vocabulary, particularly in English and Urdu, a rigorous curriculum, lack of understanding about the pronunciation and usage of words, poor educational background, and a communication gap are the reasons that restrict parental participation in the home assignments of children with normal hearing. Deaf parents need the assistance of hearing persons in order to manage the educational activities of their hearing children.

Being bilingual and bicultural, children with normal hearing perform the role of mediator. By bridging the gap between the deaf and hearing communities, they support their hearing parents in a variety of ways. However, they also experience frustration and confusion as a result of the delay in speech and language development since they are able to comprehend both oral and sign language but are not proficient in either. Children with normal hearing take advantage of their parents' deafness by concealing information that is crucial for their academic achievement, lying to their parents about their progress, and causing miscommunication between parents and instructors.

Family members and society make little attempt to appreciate the significance of deaf parents' contribution in the education of their hearing-children. They leave deaf parents with the impression that their efforts are in vain. Hearing community indicate that they lack the time, energy, desire, and aptitude to really share the responsibilities. The availability of hearing members of society is contingent on a request, not a choice. A significant obstacle for deaf parents is the lack of accessibility to resources such as guidance and counselling centers in their communities.

During interviews with deaf parents, it was discovered that those with a higher level of education were more worried about their hearing children's academic performance than those with a lower level of education.

Deaf women were more concerned about their hearing children's education than deaf fathers.

The socioeconomic situation of deaf parents impacts the worries of hearing parents over their children's academic success. Parents with a high socioeconomic standing want their hearing
children to have a conventional education. Public and private schools confront deaf parents with the same obstacles. Parents who live in a system of separate families confront greater challenges than those who live in a system of joint families. Parents below the age of 40 were shown to be more interested in the academic success of their hearing children than those over the age of 40.

**Recommendations**

1. Government should provide accessible guidance and counselling services to deaf parents for their children’s intellectual, social and emotional development.
2. School administration should foster the needs of deaf parents of hearing children by employing sign language interpreters.
3. School personnel should be trained to deal with deaf parents having children with normal hearing meaningfully.
4. Awareness campaigns should be organized by governmental and non-governmental organizations on regular basis.
5. Institutions should endeavor systematically to follow up deaf persons throughout their life.
6. Most importantly, there should be parent education programs organized by governmental, non-governmental organizations on regular basis.

**References**


740–763.
Impacts of Covid-19 on Global Inflation and Unemployment

*Bushra Fatima*, PhD International Relations, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan
*Fareeha Maqbool*, MSC Finance and Investment University of Strathclyde, Glasgow, United Kingdom
*Hina Maqbool*, PhD Scholar Sociology, University of Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email address: bushrafatima696@gmail.com*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ARTICLE DETAILS</th>
<th>ABSTRACT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>History</strong></td>
<td><strong>Objective:</strong> The COVID-19 virus disrupted the international system and trade patterns, resulting in panic and public health crises throughout the globe. The COVID-19 epidemic sparked a financial catastrophe with far-reaching consequences that outstripped the global financial crisis. The goal of this research is to see how the changes brought on by the COVID-19 epidemic affect global inflation and the jobs of individuals causing unemployment. This article is divided into two sections, considering inflation and unemployment the COVID-19 globally.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Keywords</strong></td>
<td><strong>Methodology:</strong> The methodology adopted for this study is empirical documentary research selecting first-hand research produced by international governmental and non-governmental organizations, newspapers, research articles of all categories as well as research published in scholarly journals available at online databases such as Taylor and Francis and JSTOR. The analysis has been done by applying the technique of content analysis.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>JEL Classification</strong></td>
<td><strong>Findings:</strong> According to estimates, the virus slowed global economic growth in 2020 to roughly -3.2 percent on an annualised basis, with a recovery of 5.9 percent expected in 2021.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>M1, M2</strong></td>
<td><strong>Implications:</strong> According to consensus projections, the economic slump in 2020 will be less severe than previously anticipated, thanks in part to the fiscal and monetary policies implemented by governments in 2020.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

© 2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-4.0


**Introduction**

COVID-19 was dubbed a pandemic by the World Health Organization (WHO) on March 10, 2020, hitting the $90 trillion worldwide economies, affecting more than 200 countries around the globe, and taking global economic growth as low as -4.5% to -6.0% in the year 2020, which potentially will improve to 2.5% to 5% in 2021, as projected by the US’s Congressional Research Service (Jackson et al., 2021). However, Jackson et.al (2020) findings also suggest that the world’s major economies would underperform at least until 2024. Though the last quarter of 2020 witnessed some recovery in
the economic growth in the global north, however, the developing states in the global south could not recover from the slump as the majority of them were dependent on trade which saw a negative growth of -9.0% in 2020 (Crayne, 2020).

The most significant factor in creating inflation and unemployment globally was the policy of lockdowns advised by the WHO, taking inspiration from the Chinese way of tackling the virus – while that policy curbed the virus to a great extent, it caused severe gaps in the demand and supply channel, therefore impacting the labour class the most as well as increasing the prices of commodities. It is still early to observe clearly whether increased prices have caused inflation on the same patterns globally or had different impacts on different regions of the world (Ebrahimy et al., 2020). However, inflation in Asian countries is reported to be high with a response by the governments highlighted and afterwards focused to resolve. China and Russia generally elaborate on the causes and nature of inflation in these regions at the government level. In the second section, the unemployment caused by the pandemic situation has been discussed at the global level. Studies were reported in a similar pattern as the inflation covering regions of the global north and global south, recording the differences between them. Lastly, this paper concludes by interpreting the future outcomes of the pandemic (Mimoun, Ben & Margalit, 2020).

It is pertinent to mention here that a few regions of the world could not receive consideration in this study due to time constraints and the availability of separate data. However, the available data and regions discussed in this paper are sufficient to understand the nature of inflation and unemployment globally post-COVID-19 (Embrahimy et al., 2020).

The prices of medicines and lifesaving drugs shot up to 10 % throughout the world (Bunis, 2020). There was panic buying reported in the western countries which resulted in a shortage of daily utilities and packed food. Similarly, there were incidents of hoarding of food items and medical equipment worldwide. Furthermore, the industrial sector in the global north and global south was dependent on the migrant workers and the lockdowns forced them to move back to their homes, which resulted in shortages of supply as well. In addition to this, inflation was also increased because of reliance on imported goods which depreciated the currency in many states of the global south (Fernandes, 2020).

As per the World Trade Organization (WTO), the hoarding of critical goods such as medical supplies and food items by the exporting states also caused inflation in various states, as the exporter states feared a crisis-like situation at home (Maliszewska, Mattoo & Mensbrugghe, 2020). The US under the Trump administration banned the selling of surgical face masks outside the US. WTO reported in April 2020, that at least 80 states blocked exports in the wake of COVID-19, thus disrupting the global supply-chain market. Most of the items on the prohibition list for exports were related to medical equipment such as face masks, ventilators, and medicines (WTO, 2020). More recently, it was noted that many vaccine-producing countries have imposed restrictions on exports as well before vaccinating their population under the export authorization scheme – the list included the European Union, the United States, and the UK (BBC News, 2021; Boffey, 2021; Vela, 2021).

These restrictions were imposed in a scenario where article XI of the WTO’s General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade bans such measures by the member states, nonetheless, it allows to take such actions for the time being to keep up with the internal situation. This situation while reducing the cost in the export states, gives rise to inflation in the importing states, as the demand there increases and the hoarding starts at the local level which creates food and equipment shortages

**Aim and Purpose of the Study**

Inflation was witnessed at different levels in different regions of the world. It is reported that face mask prices went up by 200% throughout the world. In the earlier phase of the pandemic, medical supply inflation was seen in the EU, but it was not evident in the US, as it was hit later than in the EU. Similarly, there was also witnessed a trend in deflation in the non-essential services, the demand for which reduced because of the lockdowns. However, the food items remained inflated throughout
the pandemic in the EU, as well as the US (Embrahimzy, 2020). There was an amended need to evaluate the combined effects of low trading due to the pandemic of COVID-19 worldwide attack to analyse the estimation of unemployment and inflation.

**Methodology**

The data suggest that a decline in inflation was more common in the global north compared to the global south, for instance, the global north was reported to have recorded a 54.3% decrease in inflation, while two categories in the global south, such as emerging market states, and low-income states, have recorded 45.9% and 26.3% respectively. The IMF predicts that even during the reopening phases globally, there would not be seen much deflation, as by then there would be accumulated debt on the large sections of society as well as states in the global south which will keep the inflation curve steady. This will be aided by reduced supply and large demands in various sectors, such as food and medical equipment (World Bank, 2020; WTO, 2020; Ehnt & Paetz, 2020; Ebrahimy et al., 2021). Ebrahimi et al. state that openness to trade is also a factor in inflating and deflating the market. For instance, export-dependent states would have to rely on the domestic market which would reduce their income and spending at home will witness deflationary trends.

Blanchard (2020) by taking into account the Philips curve suggested that inflation would not go high in the global north, as people were saving more money than spending in the global north, specifically in the United States, moreover, once the restrictions ease there will be a surge in the spending which will create inflation, however, it is not expected to be high. Blanchard believes that in the US it is more significant to control deflation rather than inflation, as uncertainty would not potentially find any new investments, nor do the people will spend because of precautionary measures, therefore, there will be an increased supply which will be needed to be sold at the low costs If the government did not sustain it.

However, Blanchard also suggests that inflation could be high in a case where the debt to GDP ratio is very high. The relief packages in the west will create deficits in the government's bonds, especially when the fiscal and monetary policies are not aligned, and governments pay more in relief packages and forcing the central bank to keep the interest rate low. This will put an extra burden on the central banks, cause overheating of the economy, increase the debt to GDP ratio, and finally result in hyperinflation. As far as inflation in the Eurozone is concerned, the European Central Bank is optimistic that there will not be inflation in the region as people are not spending and the demand is quite low in the EU countries (European Central Bank, 2020).

**Results**

Coming to the emerging economies, COVID-19 hit the economy of Asian countries badly. The economy of Asia was $9.34 trillion just before the pandemic, making the region the fourth-largest economy in the world. After the pandemic hit the region, the Asian governments immediately took the task of reducing inflation; therefore, decreased taxes initiated relief packages, and gave stimulus packages to households and companies. However, despite these steps, the economic growth of the region witnessed negative growth in the year 2020 with Thailand, Indonesia and Singapore witnessing reduced levels of output. Furthermore, the fiscal incentives too were not as high as required to reduce inflation – yet the steps are expected to not take the region into hyperinflation (Chong et al., 2020).

**South Asia**

The economic outcomes of Covid-19 are highly impacting South Asian states with unusual speed and extremity. In South Asia, India introduced a stimulus package of $22.5 billion, meanwhile, Pakistan gave a package of $7.6 billion to help its poor class mostly comprised of daily wage labourers. However, the governments in both states could not control the food and medical equipment and lifesaving drug prices shot up – the basic food items such as wheat, sugar, and the price went up. In India, the long-term impact on inflation would also depend on the method of recovery of the economy. In case the recovery is weak, it would negatively impact inflation because consumption would not be holding below a certain limit. Supply control from the government would also have
limitations and therefore regularity in the supply chain would only make sure that the inflation is kept under observation (Barbate, Grade, & Raibagkar, 2021).

**Economic Crises in Asian Countries**

In Pakistan, the depreciation of the currency, the balance of payment issues and food shortages have already resulted in hyperinflation, COVID-19 made the situation worse for the cash-starved economy. In Afghanistan, food insecurity led to hyperinflation as its demands increased and states were hoarding. In Bangladesh, $3 billion in textile orders were cancelled by global importers, and its $310.0 billion economy witnessed a downward trend of 40%. Sri Lanka on the other hand was already in bad economic shape before COVID-19 and was facing a low currency, fewer taxes, and 90% debt of total GDP – COVID impacted its remittances sector and tourism sector which generate money to run the state. Nepal’s economy is dependent on its 26% remittances and large tourism industry, the lockdowns forced labourers to come back from the gulf and other states, as well as tourism, ended (Stone, 2020; Islam et al. 2020). The lower growth and less tax base will further increase inflation in south Asia causing high gaps in the debt to GDP ratio. Another pushback faced is in the shape of remittances as it is sent by migrant workers who work in the Gulf countries and the pandemic has locked down the work there.

**China**

As far as China is concerned, it faced extreme jolting in its export and production sectors, as the world entered lockdown the demand for supplies lessened from China which disrupted the balance of demand and supply in Chinese trade resulting in inflation and regression in the economy by 6.8% (Zhang & Wang, 2020). However, the inflation in China was short-lived, and limited to the only first quarter of 2020, in the second quarter, the Chinese economy started improving, and recorded a growth of 3.2% in the second quarter, and more recovery of 4.9% in the third quarter. The Chinese focus in the pandemic was on innovation and the digital economy which have revolutionized to a great extent, furthermore, even in the times of protectionism, deglobalization and trade wars, the dependence of Europe and other Asian and African markets increased, thereby increasing the scope of Chinese industry. The Chinese government spokesman recently stated that in the first quarter of 2021 total retail sales of consumer goods reached 6.97 trillion yuan ($1.79 trillion). The value-added industrial output which went down to -32.5% from 6.5% in January-February 2020, is now up by 32.5% an exponential rise never seen in history. Similarly, investments in fixed assets went up to 4.5 trillion yuan, an increase of 34.1% in the first quarter of 2021, which went down to -24.1% in the first quarter of 2020 from 2.5% in the last quarter of 2020. The foreign trade which went down to -9.2% in the first quarter of 2020 is now up by 22.5% (Zhao, 2021).

China being the world’s leading supplier of manufactured consumer goods increased a vital disinflationary force. As the globe modified to the pandemic, China did not take benefit of greater US demand to increase prices but rather rising Producer Price Index (PPI) inflation at the domestic level. It is because China’s manufacturers are afraid of losing world market share and secondly China’s companies do not as the market supposes, always expand profits. Despite the focus to maintain social stability, preserving market share, output growth and decreasing costs via technologies (Lo,2021).

**Monetary Policy**

The IMF recommends that the states with more aggressive monetary policies will reduce the inflation curve. The policy, taking care more of output stabilization resulted in more inflation in the times when there was no major supply. Public debt purchases in the global north did not create many problems as they were measured. However, in crises like situations central banks finance the governments. In this situation, central banks’ balance sheet increases as it mints more money to pay for the government’s debt. This will not create problems for central banks as they will not lend money and encourage smaller banks to put the excessive money within banks and pay higher interests on them, however, during the recovery phase, it will create problems when to recover those amounts the banks will go for higher interests from the consumers (Ebrahimy et al., 2020). This situation can occur in the global south where central banks are not independent and states like India.
and Pakistan have given hefty relief packages for political mileage which their governments would not be able to bear in the years to come, thus, resulting in hyperinflation.

Discussion
The International Labour Organization (ILO) estimates the figure for extreme poverty to be around 115 million globally, approximately 10% of the total population of the world. The labour force throughout the globe faced such a crisis after the 1930s great depression. Meanwhile, those who lost their jobs were mostly related to the services sector which could not find work because of the lockdowns. The ILO estimated that at least 81 million people lost their jobs globally (Lakner et al., 2020). The Covid-19 crisis has impacted the unemployment rates for every country and their economy.

Furthermore, as Embrahimy et al. (2021) study suggest, unemployment is equally linked to inflation as well, therefore, during the rebound phase as there would be debt, less work available, demand for more salaries, and an inability by the employers to pay more – the unemployment crises will remain unsolved for at least some time in the global north as well as global south. However, there is a difference in both regions in terms of wage bargaining, while bargaining for the employers in the global north would be at the lower end, the bargaining for the labourers in the global south would be at the lower end because of the overall bad shape of the economy of the emerging and low-income states.

In the global north, specifically in the United States, unemployment was extremely high during the early phases of COVID-19, however, Blanchard (2020) suggested it will be matched by more vacancies when the pandemic subsides. In Europe, COVID-19 has hit the more volatile southern Europe more aggressively which was already facing an economic meltdown with soaring unemployment rates even before the pandemic. Today, the European economies are going through challenges due to the spread of Covid-19 and its effects on different macroeconomic factors like unemployment. In Europe, the pandemic has brought a long-term economic crisis.

The unemployment rates in Italy were 10.0%, Greece 17.3% and Spain 14.1%. If this region is pushed for austerity post-COVID-19, it could perhaps announce exit from the EU region as it will increase the pace of economic recession and income will also decrease as well as growing gaps between debt to GDP ratios (Ehnts & Paetz, 2021). They suggest that to overcome the unemployment issue in the EU region, the governments must spend more to cut the cost of household spending which will save the debt to GDP ratios and solve the labour problems. However, as per the European Central Bank data, it is significant to note that unemployment in the Euro area was not as high as in the United States, Canada, Australia, or other developed states. As per the PMI indicators, unemployment increased in April because of the lockdowns, it decreased from 51.4% in February to 33.4% in April and gained momentum in July to 43.1% because of the relaxation in lockdown.

However, the most affected industries were services, warehousing, and transportation. Furthermore, the manufacturing sector also witnessed a decline. Similarly, the total working hours also declined by 3.1% in the first three months of 2020 in the entire EU area, and it was double that of the financial crisis of 2009 which also contracted the GDP of the region by 3.6%. However, significant to note EU did not lose more persons in the labour market as unemployment decreased by only 0.2% in the entire area. Meanwhile, on the other hand, 19.5 million people lost jobs in the US, noting an unemployment increase to 9.8%. The key difference between the two regions was the governments’ financial support offered to the labour force and organizations in the shape of short-term work schemes, temporary layoffs, which contained labourers being unemployed, a total of 26% of the employees in Germany, 47% in France, 42% in Italy, 23% in Spain, and 21% in the Netherlands were protected by these schemes (Botelho et al., 2021).

Chong et al. (2020) state that among Asian countries, Singapore recorded the highest growth in unemployment increasing the levels from 2.4% pre-pandemic to 2.9% post-pandemic. The reason for such a high rate in Singapore was its dependence on 1.43 million migrant labourers. This has
spillover effects for other Asian countries as the majority of these workers come from within the region and they're going back to their home countries increasing the levels of unemployment there as well. Malaysia also recorded 5.1% of unemployment, a growth from 3.2% pre-pandemic. Meanwhile, the Philippines has recorded the highest unemployment in the region recorded at 17.7%. Chong et al. believe that unemployment is expected to stay for a long period even after the pandemic is over as there is slow economic growth as well as an increased level of inflation.

According to the ILO (2021), the greatest number of jobs were lost in the Americas, whereas, the least was recorded in Europe and Central Asia. As far as the trends in unemployment are concerned, the African continent recorded 0.2% unemployment which is the least in the world, followed by Europe and Central Asia at 0.6%, Asia and the Pacific reported to have 0.7% unemployment, whereas, the percentage of unemployment in Arab states and Americas was at 1.7% and 2.7% respectively. Worldwide lost working hours were estimated to be around 8.8% of the total working hours compared to the last quarter of 2019, and these lost hours are comparable to 255 million jobs. If seen quarterly, the second quarter of 2020 reported the highest number of working hours lost at 18.2%. Worldwide trends showed half of the working hours lost were due to losing jobs while the rest of the half was because of inactivity.

Throughout the globe, 114 million people lost their jobs. Women and young employees lost the greatest number of jobs, 5% and 8% respectively. Global labour income, meanwhile, faced losses of $3.7 trillion, recording 4.4% of the global GDP (ILO, 2021). ILO projects continued job losses for the year 2021, at the optimistic level they project 36 million full-time jobs losses, while pessimistically the projections are around 130 million jobs. There is also inequality reported in the employment market, for instance, the communication and IT sector witnessed growth while physical labour witnessed a decline (Stone, 2020). Afghanistan’s poverty after the pandemic was projected to be around 80% of the total population, while Pakistan’s poverty rate is projected to be around 40% of the total population by the IMF. Only in the garment sector of Bangladesh did, the lockdown causes 1 million job losses (Stone, 2020).

Americas reported the highest number of incomes lost at 10.3%, followed by Africa at 9.4%, Arab states, at 8.4%, Asia and Pacific at 6.6%, and Europe and Central Asia at 8.7%. In Africa, sub-Saharan Africa was affected the most with 22 million jobs. The least affected region of Africa was South Africa which lost 2 million jobs, however, the region had to face the greatest number of lost working hours at around 26.8% (ILO, 2021).

**Conclusion**

There will be uneven recovery from COVID-19, though the projections suggest that the global economy will improve by the end of 2021 however it is not a straight line globally. There might be fluctuations on the way depending on the performance of the virus as well as the response by the various governments in developed, emerging markets and low-income states. The ILO (2021) is to have predicted an uneven rebound by world economies after the pandemic. After analysing the data above, it is believed the way low-income states in South Asia (which were hit hard by the pandemic) have responded by stressing the monetary regime to cover the fiscal policy will come back to bite them in the long run when the central banks would increase the taxes, resulting in inflation.

It is significant to mention that WTO Director-General Roberto Azevêdo called on participant states to chalk out the utmost limitations while applying export restrictions and similar actions that could upset supply chains. He also advised WTO members to expand fairer policies on new trade-related initiatives in the wake of the COVID-19 pandemic (WTO, 2021). Likely options for a fairer trade policy are: Guaranteeing that the new actions are sufficiently printed at the state level and keeping them on the websites to be available for everyone to see, including foreign state authorities so that they can devise their policies accordingly. Meanwhile, the ILO (2021) encourages a rebound that is healthy and considers the entire globe, especially the low-income states. It advises considering employment, wages of workers, their rights, and inclusion in the future economy (ILO, 2021). As Covid-19 keep on to be a major problem all over the globe, states must address the unemployment
that the pandemic heightened. Nations must keep on going to generate strategies and programs designed to safeguard the poverty-stricken.

**Implications of the Study**
To sum up, the best helps the rich states in the global north can provide for the low-income states in these times is to support them in the vaccination drive, as well as waive off some of their debts which would be a great service in helping their economy as without the support it is expected they would not be able to recover in near future.

**Data Availability Statement**
Data for the present study were collected after reviewing the systematic literature from previous studies exploring the global effects of COVID-19 on economic status and tendencies of unemployment. Empirical documentary research selecting first-hand research produced by the international governmental and non-governmental organizations, newspapers, research articles of all categories as well as research published in scholarly journals available at online databases such as Taylor and Francis and JSTOR were included in the data.

**Acknowledgements**
The present study was knowledge of Allah Almighty and the efforts of the supervisor during the whole journey of conducting, formulating and concluding the research findings.

**References**


Bunis, D. (2020, June 30). Companies Raise Prices on COVID-19 Drugs, Others in Middle of Pandemic. AARP.
Boffey, D. (2021, March 11). Covid vaccine row: EU has exported 34m doses – including 9m to UK. The Guardian.
Causes and Effects of Domestic Violence against Women in Pakistan: An Analytical Study

Nabeela Falak, The University of Lahore Sargodha campus, Pakistan

Corresponding author’s email address: nabeelafalak@gmail.com

Abstract

Purpose: Despite of implementation of many laws and legislation in Pakistan, domestic violence is still present and increasing day by day. The aim of the study is to point out what are the causes and effects of Domestic Violence (DV) against women in Pakistan. The Pakistani scenario has been described and theoretical bases are presented.

Design/Methodology/Approach: Research follows the qualitative research method as it is descriptive and analytical in nature. To make the research important, investigative, and analytical, material has also been collected through random survey. Opinions have been collected from women intellectuals, doctors, psychologists and lawyers of the country through a questionnaire.

Findings: Domestic violence is not an appropriate subject for assessment, interventions, or policy reforms in Pakistan because it usually occurs within the family. According to surveys, between 35% and 70% of intimate relationship violence occurs in Pakistan. Major factors contributing to domestic violence in Pakistan include women’s low levels of education and empowerment, misconceptions about Islamic beliefs, traditional customs, poverty, the dowry system, having a girl child, infertility, and drug and alcohol usage. Due to these reasons women are physically, verbally and emotionally, psychologically, sexually abused. Slapping beating, kicking against women cause physical problem.

Implications/Originality/Value: Research proves that the risk of attempting suicide is four times more in the victim of domestic violence and they are likely to develop stress, depression, and drug dependency. Study reveals that a large number of women suffer with domestic violence in Pakistan and the causes identified are preventable. Further research is also needed in this regard.

© 2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-4.0
Introduction
The term ‘domestic violence’ is used when there is a close relationship between the offender and the victim. “Pattern of abusive behavior in any relationship that is used by one partner to gain or maintain power and control over another intimate partner (Gender, n.d). The subject of understanding violence against women is complicated. To comprehend the occurrence, numerous hypotheses have provided a number of explanations. Worldwide research studies demonstrate that violence against women still happens, however it takes different forms depending on the country and culture. Due to the serious physical, psychological, social, and emotional repercussions it causes, it is a significant public health and social issue that requires significant attention. Domestic violence is not a proper subject for assessment, intervention, or policy reforms in Pakistan because it occurs within the home and is seen as a private affair. Due to the cultural and religious traditions that Pakistani society upholds, women must deal with prejudice and violence on a daily basis. An estimate states that between 35% and 70% of Pakistani women experience domestic violence. Domestic abuse can take many different forms, including physical, mental, and emotional abuse. Honor killings, spousal violence, including marital rape, acid attacks, and being burned by family members are a few typical examples. Unless it takes the extreme form of murder or attempted murder—such as driving a woman to death or staging an accident spousal abuse is rarely seen as a crime in society

Research Methodology
Research follows the qualitative research method as it is descriptive and analytical in nature. Information and materials on the subject have been taken from various primary and secondary sources, which have been included in the list of references. Content taken from various newspapers and articles and websites has also proved to be very important in this regard. To make the topic important, investigative, and analytical, material has also been collected through random survey on various points. Opinions have been collected from women, intellectuals, doctors, psychologists and lawyers of the country through a questionnaire. The information obtained was presented in an analytical manner. Ratio of Domestic violence and its effects in Pakistan have been presented in the form of different tables. Therefore, this research will prove to be a source of very extensive and important research material on this subject.

Legislation on domestic violence in Pakistan
Domestic violence against women and other weak members of the family is a very serious and severe issue in Pakistan which requires a special attention and legislation. In Pakistan many laws have been made in recent years to stop this social evil. According to the Constitution of Pakistan no discrimination shall be made on the basis of gender (The Constitution of Pakistan, n.d.). Legislation on domestic violence started in 2007. The United Nations Convention on Human Resources (CEDAW) prohibits the use of sexism against women, and the country of Pakistan has endorsed it. Especially CEDAW means: (Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women) Under the Act, all states have been asked to enact legislation to protect women in domestic life. Pakistan has also enacted legislation to prevent domestic violence under an agreement with CEDAW (Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, n.d.). The agreement reached with CEDAW provided the basis for enacting, passing, and enforcing the law on domestic violence. For this purpose legislation on domestic violence has been made in different provinces at different times. The details of legislation is being described in the form of table below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr.</th>
<th>Legislation</th>
<th>Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Sindh Province</td>
<td>2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Baluchistan Province</td>
<td>2014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Punjab Province</td>
<td>2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>KPK Province</td>
<td>2016&amp;2020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Capital Islamabad</td>
<td>2021</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Despite of implementation of many laws and legislation in Pakistan, domestic violence is still present and increasing day by day. According to a report 1173 cases of violence including domestic violence were reported in 2007 and 2008 (M.Idrees & Quratulain, 2019). According to annual report of 2010
issued by the commission for the Human Rights, 373 cases were reported about domestic violence (M.Idrees & Quratulain, 2019). Domestic violence increased in 2011, Aurat Foundation collected the Statistical number of 4448 cases reported of violence against women, including 366 cases of domestic violence (Aurat Foundation, n.d.). In 2012, 4585 incidence reported (Aurat Foundation, n.d.). 56 women were murdered in 2013 due to give birth to baby girls. According to media report 389 incidences of domestic violence were happened (M.Idrees & Quratulain, 2019).

More than 800 women commit suicide due to domestic issues in 2013 and in 2015, 279 cases reported and in 2016, 386 incidence of domestic violence against women reported (M.Idrees & Quratulain, 2019). A record 52,370 cases of violence including domestic violence against women and children reported in year 2021 (TheNews Epaper- e.Thenews.Com.Pk, n.d.). To identify the basic reasons, it is necessary to have a closer look at the laws which are not proving so effective to prevent and decrees domestic violence. The vast majority of ordinary women, men, and children are still victims of violence. According to a United Nations report: “Despite efforts by governments and campaigns carried out by the international organizations, violence against women continued on a wide scale in both developed and developing countries.” (Ertürk & UN. Human Rights Council. Special Rapporteur on Violence against Women and Girls, 2009). This situation means that there are other causes of domestic violence that need to be search and addressed.

Causes of Domestic Violence

It is a fact that violence has a negative effect on the individual as well as the society. Women are more affected by it than other members of the society, because they easily fall victim to it. Violence against women in our society is not limited to the cruel acts of an individual that occur at the individual level, but the basis of violence is often based on values and social attitudes that consider women to have an inferior status in society. According to the data collected from random survey questionnaires and interviews. Following are the common and major causes of domestic violence against women in Pakistan:

Poverty

Poverty and domestic abuse frequently go hand in hand. approximately one-third of people are considered to be poor. Domestic violence occurs more frequently among low-income populations. An economically underprivileged guy may turn violent toward his wife in order to vent his resentment at not being able to provide for his wife and kids (M. Hussain, 2002). Then the woman responds by abusing the kids, which upsets the household's order. Lack of education brought on by financial constraints results in ignorance of women's rights. Many women who experience the aftereffects of domestic violence do not receive proper care.

Low Literacy Rate

According to the country's current literacy rate of 62.3, there are an estimated 60 million illiterate people living there (Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training, n.d.). People who are fed up with the way society is run develop a violent and murderous mentality and harm the weaker and disabled people because they lack education and understanding. And because they are uneducated and unaware of their rights, women are subjugated. They have to put up with it. Lack of education and awareness in women:

In Pakistan literacy rate of females is very low than males of society especially in the rural areas. Due to the low level of education among women, they face difficulties in understanding and solving their domestic affairs (M. Hussain, 2002). Sometimes quarrels and arguments are of minor nature which can be resolved wisely but due to lack of education and awareness among women, they cannot avoid such situation and it leads to domestic violence.

Unemployment

A major cause of domestic violence today is unemployment, a social problem that plays a central role in fueling men's feelings of violence against women. Not being able to bear the expenses of wife and children due to inflation and unemployment and violence against wife and children due to
helplessness has become our normal social behavior (M. Hussain, 2002).

**Dowry**

Dowry is also an important cause of domestic violence in the Indian subcontinent. Many women face psychological and physical torture when their husbands and mother-in-law cannot meet their dowry demands, and they have to listen to the taunts of mother-in-law and father-in-law. Sometimes they are killed by burning and sometimes by beating them badly (A. Sadiq, 2004).

**Inheritance Disputes**

Depriving women of inheritance is also a big problem in our society. Due to this reason women have to face many problems in their in-laws, including violence (M. Idrees & Quratulain, 2019). The husband forces the wife to take a share of the estate and the brother and other family members threaten her to break the relationship because of demand of share. Due to depriving the woman of her father's property, she is subjected to mental and physical violence. If these types of cases go to the courts, the delay tactics adopted by the courts and the judicial system due to the many flaws in the court system. And the painful steps that women have to go through for years to get their rights is a form of severe oppression from which it is the responsibility of the government to save women.

**Birth of Daughters**

It is a tragedy of our society that due to being under the influence of Hindu society, many Hindu thoughts and rituals are still present in our society, one of them being unhappiness at the birth of girls and blaming the woman for it. In many cases the birth of daughters has been described as the reason for violence against a woman, divorce and her murder (M. Hussain, 2002).

**Patriarchy**

One of the reasons for domestic violence in traditional societies is the patriarchal system in Pakistan (M. Hussain, 2002). The practice of treating women as property of men has reduced the status of women in the society. In traditional society, a man considers it his right to physically beat his wife. In some instances, particularly in relation to the mother-in-law, women themselves support patriarchy and domestic violence. Many women are expected to be housekeepers and handle other important domestic tasks, but if a woman falls short of her mother-in-law's expectations, law's the mother-in-law may discipline the woman through her son.

**Child Marriages**

Pakistan has a high rate of child marriage, which is associated with domestic abuse. Most rural, low-income, and uneducated homes experience child marriage (M. Idrees & Quratulain, 2019). In the Pakistan Demographic and Health Survey conducted in 2012 and 2013, it was discovered that 47.5% of married women between the ages of 15 and 24 had their first marriage before turning 18. In these child marriages, one-third of the women reported experiencing domestic violence. Girls struggle to find solutions because they lack intelligence at this age.

**Social Customs**

There are many ignorant social customs being practicing in our society, one of them is Marriage to Quran (M. Hussain, 2002). The landlords like to save their lands, estates, etc., They pretend to marry young girls with Quran. This is how these landlords oppress women in this country. In the same way, it is an ignorant and cruel custom of the Wanni, means If a person kills someone, he gives his sister or daughter in exchange for this murder, that is in return for their unjust oppression, they make up for their injustice by marrying young girls to old men and oppressing innocent girls. In-laws treat these girls as they wish (M. Idrees & Quratulain, 2019).

**Cousin Marriages**

In Pakistan, family or cousin marriages are regarded as being a part of fraternity or tradition. Two-thirds of marriages take place within the family, according to a survey. Family unions typically involve more violence. They have to put up with this pressure from their families their entire lives. Family marriages are where the majority of allegations of psychological, emotional, and financial violence are found.
Transfer to the Cities
Another factor is the growing urban population. There is no one to prevent violent relationships between young couples as individuals move from rural to urban regions. This type of violence can be prevented by family members. Similarly, women who go to cities with their husbands, women suffer such situations due to the deprivation of his family support and other social assistance.

Misinterpretation of Religious Directives and Ignorance of Islamic Teachings
Sometimes aggressive men turn to religion to defend their behavior due to misreading of religious rules. This concept is referred to as "rank" in the Qur'an. According to what is considered to be fair, wives have rights comparable to those of their husbands, but men are ranked above them, according to Allah." (Al-Quran Ibn Kathir Tafsir | Alim.Org, n.d.). Man is referred to as "Qawam" (head) in the Qur'an because of this duty. Men are qawam (protectors) of women because some of them are superior to others and because they spend their resources on them, according to the Qur'an." (Al-Quran Ibn Kathir Tafsir | Alim.Org, n.d.) - "A Qawam is a person who performs a task very well. A woman's value or status is a person who performs her duties and takes care of her." (Abdul Majid,2008). The Messenger of God (peace and blessings be upon him) said:"The man is the guardian of his family and he will be asked about his subjects." (Hadith+ Search - By IslamiCity.Org, n.d.). Islam makes it clear that giving men the responsibility of “qawwam” is not a violation of women's rights nor an insult to them. Allah says in Sura al-Nisaa, "As for those from whom you apprehend (nushuz) infidelity, admonish them, then refuse to share their beds and finally hit them (lightly) then if they obey you, take no further action against them. For God is High, Great.” (Al-Quran Ibn Kathir Tafsir | Alim.Org, n.d.). According to the religious scholars hit means just to train and educate them not violence and beat them. Islam instructs men to treat women with kindness. Almighty Allah says: “ live with them in accordance with what is fair and kind.” (Al-Quran Ibn Kathir Tafsir | Alim.Org, n.d.). The Holy Prophet said: "Treat women well" (Hadith+ Search - By IslamiCity.Org, n.d.). Islam especially commands the respect of women's rights. However, it has been seen that women are generally deprived of the rights granted by Islam in our society and exploitation of women is based on human-made customs and traditions and misconceptions.

Use of Alcohol and Drugs
Use of drugs and alcohol is also a cause of domestic violence. According to the report of UN 6% of Pakistan's population uses drugs and one of its negative effects is domestic violence. In Pakistan, men of the lower class use alcohol and drugs due to poverty and anxiety. That is why they torture the women of their house. Domestic violence and divorce rates increase due to drug use in Pakistan (M. Hussain, 2002). In fact, above mentioned are major causes of domestic violence that need to be addressed. Major causes of domestic violence must be focused and need to be solve these causes. Government should try to prevent poverty, must increase education level among the public, and especially women education must be focused.

Effects of Domestic Violence on Women
Domestic violence has very detrimental physical and psychological impacts on women, which have a negative impact on their physical and mental health, according to doctors and psychologists (A.Sadiq, 2004). Some major of these Physiological and Psychological effects are listed below in table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr.</th>
<th>Physiological effects</th>
<th>Psychological effects</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>injuries (from lacerations to broken bones and injuries to organs)</td>
<td>Frustration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>complications related to pregnancy</td>
<td>Anxiety</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Miscarriage</td>
<td>Fear</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Diseases of inflammation in the middle part of the body | Inferiority complexes and depravation

Pain in the middle part of the body | Sexual aversion

Headaches | Eating and appetite problems

permanent disabilities | Depression and negative thinking

Asthma | Diseases caused by stress

Stomach disorders | Disappointment

Smoking

Suicide

Murder

Effects on the Family Life

Domestic violence against women adversely affects the family system. Mistreatment with women does not have good effects on the home system. It effects mainly on the below areas:

- Women remain under stress all the time due to fear of punishment.
- Women feel difficulty to fulfill their duties and responsibilities.
- Obstructing the moral training of children and other members of the family.
- Development of rebelliousness in children.
- Spousal relationship affected.
- Leading to an increase in divorce rates.

Conclusion

It is reality that domestic violence is a serious problem in Pakistan and the government’s intentions behind the legislation on domestic violence was good, but in fact this was not the case with its approach. Despite of all efforts and legislations on domestic violence, domestic violence against women is still present in Pakistan. And ratio of this violence is up to 70%. Laws are not proving so effective to prevent and decrees domestic violence in Pakistan. It is a fact that violence has a negative effect on the individual as well as the society. Women are more affected by it than other members of the society, because they easily fall victim to it. Apart from this, cultural, social, economic, legal factors increase their vulnerability. Misinterpretation of religious beliefs, prevailing social values and customs have also caused negative behavior against women. Sometimes violent men resort to religion to justify their actions. But the truth is that no religion in the world allows violence against human beings, especially women. Islam especially insists and commands the respect of women's rights. Dependence on men in economic matters and women being considered inferior in society is the cause of violence against them. It is also worth noting that the roles assigned to women and men in society tend to favor one gender over the other, which also encourages violence against women. Violence against women in our society is not limited to the cruel acts of an individual that occur at the individual level, but the basis of violence is often based on values and social attitudes that consider women to have an inferior status in society. Poverty and lack of education are also major causes. When an economically inferior man cannot meet the needs of his wife and children, he takes out his anger in the form of violence on his wife. And then the wife retaliates by beating the children, which destroys the order of the house. Sometimes quarrels and arguments are of minor nature which can be resolved wisely but due to lack of education and awareness among women, they cannot avoid such situation and it leads to domestic violence. Dowry and Inheritance is also a cause of domestic violence against women in our society. Due to depriving the woman of her father's property, she is subjected to mental and physical violence in their in-laws. There are many ignorant social customs being practicing in our society like Merry to Quran and Wanni. Women are being oppressed through these customs. According to medical doctors and psychologists, domestic violence has very serious
physical and psychological effects on women. The physical and mental health of these women is badly affected. Due to these reasons women are physically, verbally and emotionally, psychologically, sexually abused and women may also undergo abuse which cannot be placed into any category. Slapping beating, kicking against women cause physical problem. Emotional abuse leaves deeper scars and more lasting effects than physical violence. Research proves that the risk of attempting suicide is four times more in the victim of domestic violence and they are likely to develop stress, depression, and drug dependency. Study reveals that a large number of women suffer with domestic violence in Pakistan and the causes identified are preventable.

Suggestions
The information collected for this article provides a comprehensive overview of domestic violence prevention. In the light of the results, some suggestions for the prevention of domestic violence and for improving the legislation are being presented to the government legislative bodies, concern officials, public and scholars:

- Government should try to prevent poverty, use of drugs, and the bad social customs related to women.
- Literacy rate must be increased and especially women education should be improved.
- Teachings related to the family and family system of Islam should be included in the curriculum and scholars should make it a part of Friday sermons.
- Courses and counseling should be organized for every boy and girl for training and education before marriage.
- Full awareness of legislation on domestic violence should be awakened among the general public and women.
- Proper implementation of laws regarding domestic violence can minimize the DV

Government should remove the deficiencies in the police department, especially to train the policemen who are assigned to investigate women's problems, and to recruit women officers for this work.

References
Hussain, M, (2002). islam Qanoon Ur Mazloom Pakistani Aurat/ page77-82
Post Pandemic Research Trends on Challenges and Outcomes in Education: A Case-study of HEC Recognized Journals of Education 2020-2021

*Naila Siddiqua, Assistant Professor, Dept. of Education, University of Karachi, Pakistan
Rida Batool, M.S. Scholar, Dept. of Education, University of Karachi, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email address: naila_ss@yahoo.com

Objective: The purpose of the present study is to explore the research trends on challenges and outcomes of post pandemic education. The researcher has conducted a meta-analysis of HEC recognized journals of education published in post pandemic period that is 2020-2021.

Methodology: The study has adopted qualitative approach following case-study design. The population of the study is comprised of each of 2 issues of 14 journals of education recognised by higher education commission of Pakistan. The sample was selected using purposive sampling technique. The sample size was 21 articles based on the inclusion criteria which directs to select only those articles discussing the post COVID context of teaching-learning process. The data was collected through a literature review matrix which was developed to classify the articles for various themes generated after critical review.

After reviewing the selected articles, different themes were generated such as Pandemic and higher education, psychological aspects of post pandemic context, learning experiences in Covid-19, remote teaching and challenges, assessment and distant learning using content analysis technique.

Findings: This content analysis revealed that COVID-19 has increased the scope of online education by showing an increasing trend of Hybrid model in education. The research has highlighted the effect of COVID-19 on teachers and learners particularly and the system of education generally. It further explored the issue related to depression and anxiety and challenges related to energy crises.

Implications: This study recommends that to overcome such issues and challenges there should be provision of professional development programs for the teachers to prepare them for future circumstances.

© 2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-4.0


Introduction
The Novel Coronavirus disease (COVID-19) pandemic, which has already infected nearly 3 million people in 148 countries, has killed over 200,000 people and caused widespread chaos. The crisis has already become an economic and labor market shock. We are only now beginning to understand the economic impacts of COVID-19, but many other issues have emerged that must be addressed immediately, such as school closures and their impact on learning, as well as the burden of education on students, parents, and teachers.

Statement of the Problem
As part of a global response to stop the COVID-19 virus from spreading, governments issued urgent national statutes and decisions affecting all facets of the economy. Public health professionals and government officials implemented measures like forced social isolation, self-isolation, quarantine, bolstering medical facilities to control the disease, requiring people to work from home, requiring people to wear masks in public places, and temporarily closing places of worship and educational institutions (Gennaro et al., 2020; The World Bank, 2020). In order to safeguard faculty, staff, and students from COVID-19 viral infection, almost all universities throughout the world cancelled on-campus events and activities (The World Bank, 2020). University core operations like teaching, research, and community service have all been significantly impacted by the interim closure (UNESCO, 2020). Present research is aimed at finding the post pandemic research trend on challenges and outcomes in education.

Significance of the Study
The present study is significant for the teachers to adopt the appropriate methodology for online teaching, students to be sounder e-learner to grab the concept in online learning and parents so that they can help out their children to fill the remained gaps of online learning because it focuses on suggesting the measures to overcome the effects of COVID-19 on education.

Scope of the Study
The scope of the study is limited to the HEC recognized educational journals and from those journals only those articles are selected which are related to the post pandemic theme.

Purpose of the Study
The purpose of the present study is to explore the post pandemic research trends on challenges and outcomes in education. The researcher has conducted a content analysis of HEC recognized journals of education published in post pandemic period that is 2020-2021.

Objectives of the Study
There are the following objectives of the study:
1. To explore the post pandemic research trends on challenges and outcomes in education.
2. To suggest some measure to overcome the challenges and issues of post pandemic education.

Research Questions
1. What are the challenges and outcomes of post pandemic education?
2. What are the possible measures to overcome the challenges faced by teachers and students in post pandemic period?

Literature Review
COVID-19 has strong effects on everything especially on education system as well as on the learning of the learner of every age. According to UNESCO, 1.6 billion students in 190 countries are affected by the education system. In the early stages of the pandemic, there were no firm plans for school openings. Schools and other educational institutions were thought to be more vulnerable to the virus's spread due to their intensive interaction during school hours. Children, in particular, have become movers, spreading the virus to members of society such as their grandparents. Children have suffered serious consequences as a result of COVID-19 because their cognitive, emotional, social, and psychological development patterns have been disrupted. (Asim & Farooq, 2021)
The psychological response of public to an infectious illness outbreak has a considerable impact on how quickly the disease spreads, how quickly emotional trauma and social unrest arise after the outbreak, and how quickly both of these phenomena occur (Cullen, 2020).

This pandemic has been observed to have an impact on children's intellectual and psychological development. School teachers have noticed that their younger students are suffering from mental health issues and require counselling and psychotherapy in these affected situations of Covid-19. In the United States, nearly 13% of adolescents receive mental health and psychotherapy from their schools. (Park, 2020)

Anxiety, fear, or depression are natural reactions of normal people when confronted with dangerous or threatening situations (Wang, 2020). From the standpoint of biological and psychological health, if people begin to respond to Covid-19 in an appropriate and positive manner, it can increase the human body's drive to combat the challenges of the current corona virus spread.

Almost 29 countries completely closed their educational institutions, affecting half of the world's student population (UNESCO, 2020; Viner et al., 2020). In other countries, there was a partial closure, often involving a combination of classroom and online learning. Distancing from society has now become an essential way of life.

On March 31, 2020, the Higher Education Commission (HEC) of Pakistan advised all universities to begin online classes to assist their students during the Pandemic (Xinhua, 2020). This necessitated a rapid shift away from traditional face-to-face teaching and learning and toward online teaching and learning. Open universities frequently provide extensive online resources, but they also provide opportunities for students to meet locally and, in some cases, more centrally. However, recorded lectures and a wide range of printed materials continue to play an important role. Because the academy can constantly adapt to this new paradigm, online education has become the accepted norm (Massan et al., 2020).

The availability of technical equipment and reliable internet connectivity is a major issue in many countries, including Pakistan. The problems caused by a lack of reliable internet connectivity are most severe in rural areas, and the Pandemic has widened the urban-rural divide in educational opportunities. The lack of a good internet connection was a major issue, and as a result, many learners do not choose to learn online because they are unsure that they will have access to efficient and reliable internet connectivity during their online learning (Noreen & Reid, 2021).

The biggest difficulty in sustaining the quality of online instruction is ensuring that instructors are reasonable and considerate about best practices and that organizations have the tools and policies required to guarantee quality instruction. It was obvious that educational institutions would not be able to instantly switch all educational programmes from face-to-face to online resources given the readiness of university systems to execute quick changes in such a short amount of time. There were challenges including distance, technology, and individualized instruction (Liguori & Winkler, 2020).

For financially disadvantaged students to benefit from online learning, universities must now offer scholarships or student loans. This need to be a necessity in universities, and those who can't afford it ought to be allowed to pay for it with the aid of grants or student loans. HEC suggested that universities, as members of society, make guarantee that every student has access to all sources of knowledge (HEC, 2020).

Researchers have discovered that parents of young children are also suffering with the issues of virtual learning because they are closely involved with their children's educational activities, in addition to teachers and administrators who are working hard to address learning challenges. (Machado, 2019; Barnard, 2005; Sheldon and Epstein, 2005).
With this pandemic, parent involvement may be increased as their children engage in online learning, where students are more likely to encounter organizational difficulties, self-regulation issues, encouragement issues, and difficulty understanding learning resources when the teacher is not substantially present (Liu et al., 2010; Stevens & Borup, 2015).

Research engagements have also been impacted by the closing of higher education institutions. Postgraduate students who were gathering data in the field were unable to finish their dissertations on time, and even when they were finished, there were uncertainty regarding the chances of presenting research articles at conferences (Japanese, 2020).

Faculty have found it challenging to work together on research projects locally and internationally due to social distance and travel limitations, which has a negative impact on the completion of field research projects and laboratory work (Marinoni & van't Land, 2020). On-site research operations have been impeded in Australia, the United States, Europe, and China, claim Wigginton et al. (2020). Additionally, researchers must deal with dwindling research funding, which is predicted to get worse as countries recover from the COVID-19 pandemic’s economic effects.

**Methodology**

The present research is qualitative in nature. The content analysis of HEC recognized journals of Education of post pandemic period 2020-2021 has been conducted. The study follows case study design. The population of the study was comprised of 2 issues of 14 journals of education. The sample size of the study was about 21 article which are related to the theme of post pandemic education. The sampling technique used in the study is non-random, purposive sampling. The data was collected through a literature review matrix which was developed to classify the articles for various themes generated after critical review. After reviewing the selected articles, different themes were generated such as Pandemic and higher education, psychological aspects of post pandemic context, remote teaching and challenges, assessment and distant learning.

**Data Analysis**

This section is based on the theme wise analysis of selected articles. There were 21 Articles which were divided into five themes following is the summary in the table given:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Research Topics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Challenges and Responses of Higher Education institutions to align higher Edu with COVID-19 Realities: A Thematic Analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. COVID-19 Pandemic and University Teachers’ Experiences about Challeng Online Teaching: A Phenomenography Approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psychological aspects</td>
<td>1. Depression, Anxiety and Fear due to COVID-19 in Pakistan: A Study bas Learning Perspective</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>of pandemic context</td>
<td>2. Lived Experience of Overcoming the Feeling of Isolation in Distance Learning: Philippines: A Phenomenological Inquiry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Relationship among Online Learning, Time Management and Self Anxie University Students during COVID-19</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Learning experiences in COVID-19

1. Learning Experiences of Students from Sindh and Baluchistan about Online Learning during Covid-19 Pandemic Crisis.


3. The Effects of COVID-19 on Education in Pakistan: Students’ Perspective

4. Tele-Schooling as Distance Learning Approach in Schools of Pakistan during the COVID-19 Pandemic

5. Home Learning in Times of COVID: Experiences of Parents


8. Digital Transformation in Distance Learning: Problems and Challenges during COVID-19 Pandemic

9. Teaching the Privileged? Observations on the (UN) Inclusiveness of Online Education during Pandemic


Assessment and distant learning

1. Assessment of Distance Learning in the Algerian Universities during the COVID-19 Pandemic

Remote Teaching and Challenges

1. Preparation for Emergency Remote Teaching: A Personal Reflection

2. Teaching Early Years Children during COVID-19 through Digital Technologies


Pandemic and Higher Education

Kara (2021) has performed a desktop review to determine how the pandemic would affect higher education in the future. The researcher used a qualitative methodology and thematically analyzed papers from 2020 open access, peer-reviewed journals. The current trend in higher education that is blended learning is the main topic of this study. After reviewing the data this study suggested that institutions require to create the room for online learning. The framework of e-learning should be design in a holistic way in order to achieve the goals of Maslow’s Hierarchy of needs. Higher education institutions should deliver blended learning strategically in order to fill the gaps in learning. The study concluded that institutional collaboration is the key to increase efficiency and sustainable growth.

According to Zai & Akhunzada (2020), professor and student roles were discovered to be willing to investigate their positions at the individual, educational, and national levels. They were cut off from the universities due to the main concerns that were found with internet access and internet equipment. Due to problems with the surroundings and the house, no enthusiasm was found. They found that the online system was the most effective. Faculty and students primarily advocated for unity, internet connectivity, teacher empathy, and the establishment of learning objectives. HEC’s role was deemed to be the most outstanding. For faculty and students, HEC has every solution and piece of equipment imaginable. The study discovered that faculty members, students, and HEC had more positive outcomes.
Shahzad & Aurangzeb (2021) investigated about the teaching strategy and tool used by teachers during the period of COVID-19 and students’ perspective regarding online classes. It was observed that most of the student were not satisfied with online system of education as they reported that their institution didn’t provide any learning management system which caused problems for both students and teachers. Students were not happy with online classes because they faced numerous problems such as internet issues, lack of resources, inability to understand online lectures. Some of the student also showed urge to stop online classes and turn this period into semester break with the compensation of fees.

Sufiana et.al (2021) discussed the challenges and problems of online teaching in post pandemic period at higher education level in Pakistan. The findings of the study revealed that teachers are under pressure because of the sudden shift in teaching paradigm as they were not trained enough to teach online. Teachers also dissatisfied by the training and infrastructure for online classes provided by the universities. Students also faced numerous issues like unstable internet and electricity as well as inability to operate the ICT tools for online classes. Therefore, the study recommends that before starting any online course it is required to plan properly and need assessment should be done throughout the country before launching any course.

Psychological Aspects of Post Pandemic Context

Jan et.al (2021) conducted the cross- sectional research and collected data though online survey as it was impossible to travel all over the country at the time of pandemic. The goal of the study was to determine whether people experience anxiety, depression, or terror as a result of the Covid-19 epidemic in various parts of Pakistan. The considerable positive link between anxiety, depression, and fear has been found. The study found that, compared to men, women typically experience higher degrees of anxiety, fear, and despair. The results showed that intermediate, graduation, and post-graduate students as well as undergraduates had higher mean scores, indicating greater dread, anxiety, and depression. Therefore, it is necessary to improve public psychological well-being in order to mitigate the psychological effects of COVID-19.

Núñez (2021) conducted a qualitative research based on phenomenological design. The study described a graduate student’s lived experience with remote learning and how she overcame feelings of loneliness and obstacles. It also outlined the efforts taken by the respondent to overcome isolation in remote education and avoid dropping out of the course. In order for a distant learner to succeed in the mode, a network of connections between learners and the university must be present.

In order to examine the association between university students' self-anxiety, time management, and online learning during the COVID-19 pandemic, Hassan et al. (2021) undertook a cross-sectional study. Time management was a very powerful predictor of worry in one's self, according to regression analysis. For students to manage their issues, it is advised to offer guidance and counselling. The COVID-19 pandemic, it was determined, causes problems with academic stress for the majority of higher education students. The majority of students exhibit a positive attitude about online learning because of the urgent switch from the traditional model to online learning, but lockdown has a significant negative impact on their time management abilities. Students' personal and social lives have been badly impacted by the significant increase in their workload. The main contributor to psychological issues among university students is poor time management.

Learning Experiences in COVID-19

A focused group discussion and a semi-structured online interview were employed in the qualitative research by Rehman et al. (2021) to address the research issues. Using a purposeful sample, fifteen pupils from private schools in Baluchistan and sixteen from federal public schools in Karachi were chosen for interviews. Participants from Karachi and Quetta each participated in three focused group talks. Thematic categories and transcriptions of the qualitative raw data were created. The study's conclusions indicated that the use of digital social media by students significantly affects
their teaching and learning processes. It is widely considered as a commendable initiative and a suitable substitute strategy for preserving educational activities that, in the absence of such measures, could cause a serious loss of educational opportunity. These online courses offer a positive and creative method of connecting with students, despite some drawbacks.

A quantitative research design was used by Adnan and Uddin in 2021. There were 200 undergraduate and graduate participants in the study from different public and private universities in Pakistan. The Covid-19 pandemic has not only revealed the weakness of the educational systems around the world, but it has also left students with uneven and sporadic access to online learning alternatives. In light of Pakistan's second Covid-19 pandemic wave, the following poll was created to evaluate the effectiveness of online education. The majority of higher education students in Pakistan have significant doubts regarding the efficacy of online learning, according to the study's findings.

When compared to the first wave of the Covid-19, students have reported more productivity in their online classes during the second wave. Ineffective online teaching methodologies/styles, ineffective learning content, poorly scheduled assessment criteria, a lack of access to a dependable internet connection, a lack of classroom socialization, and a lack of self-motivation were some of the major online learning challenges mentioned by Pakistani higher education students. People are still unsure as to whether the sudden acceptance of online learning as a result of the Covid-19 outbreak will continue through the three-year mark given this unanticipated movement away from traditional classroom learning and toward online education. The creation of educational systems with all the tools required to quickly adjust and lessen the negative effects of any potential future disruptions is crucial.

Malik & Ajmal (2020) adopted quantitative methodology and collected through a descriptive survey design. The students of Karachi have been taken as sample. The intermediate, undergraduate, graduate, and postgraduate students were given the questionnaire on a five-point Likert scale. In order to analyze the data, SPSS 23 was used. The results of the study showed that students face problems in understanding the lecture in online classes and also faced internet issues along with the issues in operating technology due to the lack of prior guidance. The same problems were faced by teacher too and online classes also increase the workload of teachers.

Ahmad et.al (2020) have conducted a descriptive study based on survey and correlational approach. The data is collected from the study about tele-schooling during the times of global pandemic and current situation of the world during the pandemic especially in Pakistan. There is negative impact of corona virus on the system of education. This study reveals that the tele-schooling is the most powerful approach to meet the learning outcomes in post COVID-19 period. It is also discovered that the students enjoyed tele-schooling and want it to continue even after pandemic periods.

Bharuchi et.al (2020) conducted a research based on qualitative research design is used to get insights into parents’ real-life experiences during COVID 19. The impact of COVID on children's learning, school support, and caregivers’ at-home learning practices are the three main themes that emerged from the data analysis. It was determined that educators from all over the world and the entire country have stepped forward to promote learning at home by providing a wide range of free online platforms to assist parents in facilitating home-learning. In these difficult times, parents should also modify the measure to close any learning gaps that have appeared in their children's education.

Asgaroval et.al (2021) have conducted a research which is qualitative in nature that is why individual and focused group interviews were conducted to know about the experiences and challenges of online learning in the context of china during the Pandemic. The data has been taken from students of different countries in order to know their online learning experience. After the analysis of data, there were several challenges were found. Apart from challenges and difficulties it
was found that the online learning is the most convenient and cost-friendly alternative of face-to-face classroom.

Usmani (2021) evaluated the link between independent, dependent, and moderating variables using a quantitative study methodology. The six-layer onion model from Saunders (2016) was used to build the technique for the current investigation. According to the study's overall findings, blended learning is superior to traditional classroom-based learning in terms of effectiveness. The students' learning experiences are improved by the blended courses. The students view blended learning as the best substitute for traditional classroom instruction. This study focuses on how technology is incorporated into blended learning. According to the survey, training courses on how to use LMSs for efficient blended learning must be made available. Universities must also recruit support personnel to educate teachers on the software applications and important pedagogical principles in order to improve the delivery of blended learning.

Noreen & Reid (2021) has conducted a study on digital transformation in distance learning: problems and challenges during covid-19 which is qualitative in nature and based on phenomenological design. The major objective of their study is to identify the problems faced by students and the faculty of AIOU in moving into online education. The findings of the study indicate that it was impossible for the teachers and students to remain online with the unstable internet connection during their classes. It is also reported that repeated voice was also another issue caused by poor internet connection during online classes. According to the findings it is also discovered that it is difficult for an education institutions in Pakistan to run online learning efficiently.

Ajaz (2021) used data from extensive covert (non-participant) observation and casual talks with young female university students at the undergraduate level in Pakistan over a seven-month period to respond to the research question. Between March 15 and October 15, 2020, observations were made. An author saw five courses with a combined total of about 90 pupils, most of whom were between the ages of 18 and 22. The author had established a rapport with the pupils and had easy access to the classes as an insider. The Pakistani pupils were drawn from a range of socioeconomic backgrounds and geographic areas. Their family structure, level of education, the jobs that their parents and other family members held, as well as the assistance they received from their families, differed. Despite the fact that the majority of the students who were observed eventually succeeded in taking part in online lessons, assignments, quizzes, and exams, this paper represents the voices of those disadvantaged students who, for a variety of reasons, found it difficult to participate in online education. Four days during the week, the researcher observed for a minimum of 13 hours. People were still mingling even after the monitoring period had ended. The report advises further investigation into the incidents and their ramifications for those who were barred from online learning during the Coronavirus outbreak.

**Assessment and Distant Learning**

Guemide (2020) has conducted research about online system adopted by the universities of Algeria for the provision of online courses in the period of Global pandemic. As higher education in Algeria was completely dependent on electronic system of learning for the first time, so that it is important to bring improvement in the practices, to identify the mistakes and to analyze the overall experience of learning. After the analysis of data, it is found that the teachers face difficulties in shifting to the online teaching because of the lack of resources and lack of training in ICT. The study recommends that there should be planned learning objectives for online teaching and learning in order to make the process of online learning smooth and effective.

**Remote Teaching and Challenges**

Based on their own experiences with the planning of emergency remote teaching, Saqlain and Laurier (2021) have prepared a reflective paper. The researcher has also listed other elements that are beneficial in getting ready for remote teaching, such as his own expertise in online learning,
training for remote teaching, course development and design, employing both synchronous and asynchronous methods, student engagement, and presences.

Asim & Farooq (2021) have conducted a study which is based on qualitative research design. The data was collected through interviews and these interviews were recorded face-to-face, as well as online due to COVID-19 isolation and social distancing. This study revealed that the effect of digital technology on child’s education at ECE level during COVID-19. Different types of technologies can be used to provide learning experiences at home. There are some negative aspects of online learning found after data analysis such as frequent power breakdown, lack of technological resources, students and teachers are not well aware of the usage of technology, internet connection problems, lack of attention from students etc. This study recommends that all school administrators, educators and policymakers need to develop more holistic and constructive system to facilitate learning at early childhood level to fill the arising gaps in learning.

In order to gather data, Saifi et al. (2020) used a descriptive design and a survey method. This study was only undertaken with the second semester B.Ed. students of the 1.5 year programme due to time constraints and a lack of funding, and a sample was taken from both an online university in Pakistan and a university that operates in the traditional method. The data was analyzed by using SPSS version 21, descriptive statistics and t-test were applied on the data to analyze the results. According to the results students faced difficulty in purchasing the internet bundles during the pandemic. Teachers and students both were unable to use technical and e-services devices. Teachers were unable to provide proper instructions in online classes. It is concluded that the pandemic and online teaching affected badly on students and teachers both, students were highly demotivated due the improper environment of education.

Findings and Discussion

Findings
After the analysis of related articles, the overall findings of the study revealed that:

1. There were five themes generated for the post pandemic research trend which are Pandemic and higher education, psychological aspects of post pandemic context, Learning experiences in COVID-19, Assessment and distant learning, Remote Teaching and Challenges.
2. Most of the researches are related to the theme of learning experiences in COVID-19. 47% of the articles based on this theme. Almost half of the post Pandemic researches have identified the learning experience as the most challenging aspect.
3. It was found that 4% of the articles are related to the theme of assessment and distant learning.
4. It is discovered that COVID-19 has negatively affected on the psychological state of a learner as we can see in the analysis section there are 14% articles related to the theme of psychological aspects of post pandemic context.
5. The teachers also faced different kind of challenges while paradigm shift in post COVID-19 as it was found that there are 14% of the articles related to the theme of remote teaching and challenges.
6. The data analysis revealed that Higher education was also facing a challenging situation. 19% research articles have investigated to address the challenge.

Discussion
This study was conducted to see the research trends on challenges and outcomes in post pandemic education. There were numerous challenges that the learners faced during the corona virus outbreak such as lack of training in ICT, internet issues, frequent power failure, lack of technological resources, and lack of interest in online classes etc. The biggest challenge which occurred during post pandemic period was to maintain the quality of education. Teachers and administrators faced many hurdles while developing the framework of e-learning. Along with the teachers and administrators, parents were also equally disturbed due to the post pandemic paradigm shift as it was new for them as well. Parental involvement was increased which is considered as the positive aspect as they were equally taking part in their child’s learning to fill the gaps. If we talk about higher education, it is one of the major areas which was affected by Covid-19 as we can see that in the literature review section, Jappie (2020) has highlighted that post-graduate level students faced
difficulties in their data collection procedure for the thesis writing which is the reason they were failed to submit their thesis on time. The psychological aspects like fear, anxiety and depression also affected the learner progress in remote learning. The Pandemic period was the most challenging period for the teachers because it was tough to engage students online. On the other hand, teachers also suffered in using technology as teachers were not trained enough to manage online mood of teaching. Apart from challenges and difficulties in online learning it is discovered that some learners enjoyed online learning and consider online learning as a best alternative of face-to-face classroom teaching. There were number of articles found on learning experiences in COVID-19 but there was only 1 article related to the assessment in remote learning which shows that this area is neglected and need more research. The assessment area demands more researches in order to find out the best possible ways to assess the students in such situation so that educator can get ready to deal with this kind of crisis in future. As we all are aware of the advantages of remote learning during the pandemic period that it is the best alternative of face-to-face learning, but it has several disadvantages as well such as students were facing difficulties in socializing with each other after being at home during lockdown and it has negatively impacted on the mental and physical health of a learner because excessive screen time developed eyesight problems along with some other health issue. The impact of remote learning on learner’s health is the area which needs more investigation.

Conclusion and Recommendations

Conclusion

COVID-19 has effected human life in many ways, one of the most important area which has been effected due to the Pandemic outbreak is education. When lockdown was started education was completely neglected in the beginning but after few month the government took decision to shift towards the online delivery of education which was tough for everyone in the start due to the lack of knowledge and training. After sometimes it was realized that online classes are the best alternative of physical classes. On the other hand majority was unhappy with the online delivery because teachers faced many challenges and problems while conducting online classes and it was discovered after the present content analysis that the training provided by an intuitions were not useful and enough for teachers to conduct online classes smoothly. Teachers and students both were frustrated because of the technological issues, unavailability of internet and unorganized system of management during the post pandemic education.

Recommendations

1. Assessment is the most neglected area found in the research published in HEC recognized journals of education. This area requires serious attention, and we need to work on developing effective online assessment plans in order to make true evaluations about students’ abilities.
2. It is discovered that teachers were not satisfied with the kind of training their institutes provided them during the post pandemic period in order to improve their performance in online classes. There should be comprehensive and organized training program to facilitate teaching, learning, and assessment.
3. The increasing screen time due to online learning has become a health hazard in many ways. This increased screen time is badly disturbing the vision of both teacher and student. Moreover, a constant sitting posture has decreased the muscular mobility which has resulted in obesity and overweight issues. This crucial situation needs to take necessary measures to reduce the screen time to a certain extent.
4. There should be some accountability for the check and balance in online classes to ensure the presence and participation of students during online classes.
5. It is recommended for the future researchers to conduct the study on a broader scale so that we can understand the research trends round the globe on challenges and outcomes during pandemic as the present study was limited only to the context of Pakistan.

References


Factors Associated with the Participation of Children with Autism Spectrum Disorder in Leisure Activities

*Rukhsana Bashir, Assistant Professor, Institute of Special Education, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan
Hafiz Muhammad Hamza Younas, MPhil Scholar, Institute of Special Education, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan
Samina Ashraf, Assistant Professor, Institute of Special Education, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email address: rukhsana.dse@pu.edu.pk

ABSTRACT

Purpose: The aim of the present research is to identify various factors related to the participation of children with autism spectrum disorder in various leisure activities.

Research Methodology: The study is descriptive in nature. The population of the study comprised parents of children with ASD both public and private schools. Data were collected from four districts including Nankana Sahib, Sheikhupura, Kasur and Lahore. In the study, 88 parents took a part and responded to the questionnaire. A validated and self-created Likert-type questionnaire was used by the researchers. In addition, the data was coded and analyzed by using Statistical Package of Social Sciences. It was then tabulated to find out the mean and standard deviation of the respondents.

Findings: Key findings were that children with ASD showed willingness to take part in different leisure activities. It is, however, important to note that their participation in such activities differ and varied by the types of activities. It was identified that different personal factors such as the family’s socioeconomic status, health issues, family pressure, job responsibilities, gender, lack of training and age affect their participation.

Recommendations: Parental training sessions may be arranged by schools where parents should be guided to create and implement different games to exhibit the strengths of their children in different leisure activities.

© 2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-4.0


Introduction

In general, the core features and aspects of social communication and interaction deficits suggest transformation in choices of activity involvement by children with ASD (American Psychiatric
Association, 2013). For leveraging and using these intervention codes, the comprehension of factors and aspects related to the participation of children in different leisure activities is helpful in creating and designing different group activities and interventions (Taylor & Fisher, 2010; Koegel et al. 1987, 2010).

“Participation,” described as individuality in different existing circumstances and situations, during the past decade, has grown to be a rather effective concept (Coster & Khetani, 2008). In addition, it is often considered individual existence’s important indicator. International Grouping of Functioning and the WHO had emphasized surroundings and their roles in either inhibiting or facilitating involvement (WHO, 2007).

The capacity of a person by participating is apparent due to the outcomes of interplay among different factors related to their circumstances and provisional factors that cover and encompass various private and surrounding elements. Within the literature, it is documented extensively that engagement in different activities, particularly recreational activities, are rather critical for the development of kids or children with autism and similar disorders (King et al., 2008).

For children, time-out engagement might be explained or identified as involvement in activities other than just compulsory sports like playing different competitive games and even being a member of sports club. When they participate in these activities, they also develop emotional wellbeing, self-esteem, self-identify, gain physical and intellectual health, and shape their relationships, all of which are critical for them (Potvin et al. 2013).

Certainly, there exists significant evidence that the involvement of children with autism in different recreational sports is limited or insufficient as compared to their peers or other children. It is important to note that the prevalence of children with ASD has increased with 1 child being affected out of 86 children (CDC, 2014). Typically, leisure activities even involve sports in which people tend to participate in their spare time outside of their work, classes, and sleeping routine. In other words, it is an activity that is based on unfettered choice, open-mindedness, and it is derived from the creation of different enjoyable and playful experiences including shopping, social interaction, sports activities that are enjoyable and effective way to improve well-being and health (Kidd, 2008).

The aim of recreational schooling is concerned with training children ASD to consider and utilize their spare time in an effective and positive manner. For the achievement of goal, it is necessary for sports to be appropriate for the social, emotional, mental, and physical needs of such children. Actually, it indicates that a careful choice of sports should be considered in their spare time to make sure that life of a child is made more fruitful and productive. Typically, these children spend time such as playing with toys video games watching television (Reynolds et al, 2011). In the literature, it has been pointed out and affirmed that leisure activities are not only beneficial for general people but also for children with special needs. When children with ASD tend to engage in different recreational activities and tasks, it improves their interaction, communication and the contentment that they require (Garcia., & Dattilo, 2011).

In addition to it, recreation is essential for the development of identity, self-determination, and competence of children with ASD. Taking a part in different leisure and purposeful sports is concerned with the development and wellbeing of children when these sports match their needs and their choices, particularly when these children have a specific disability. Furthermore, taking a part in different meaningful sports is positively associated with the happiness and wellbeing of children with disorders such as ASD (Shikako-Thomas et al., 2012). Typically, when it comes to ASD, different factors such as a lack of engagement are often identified and found among children. Since there is decreased verbal and social exchange, it reduces the ability of children with ASD to see their peers and even participate in different activities. In fact, communication barriers are also often identified and determined that contribute to a lack of engagement with peers and participate in different extracurricular tasks (Shattuck et al. 2011).

Another affecting element has been personal relations. Actually, it has been identified that around
half of children with ASD did not have any friends. In addition, as compared to their peers, they were more likely to not have any friends and be involved in different social activities. They tend to spend time in maladaptive behaviors and passive play and they are less likely to participate in organized leisure activities such as sports (Anderson et al. 2004; Bauminger & Kasari, 2000). It is important to note that economic constraints can also prove to be a hurdle to inclusion in different leisure activities.

An important feature is the natural environment which involves both domestic factors and the weather. It is a factor that must be considered when planning for different sports for children with ASD. Even though outdoor or external settings were identified facilitators and enablers of physical activity, different fearful external conditions were identified to be barriers to them for such children. When it comes to different factors that facilitate participation and involvement in leisure activities, an aspect or part of the environment is access to different playgrounds and parks. For such children, different harmful objects like baseball, bats or trampolines were identified to serve as barriers for their participation or involvement in different leisure activities (Obrusnikova & Miccinello, 2012).

Parents play a key role and most important resource in almost all treatment modalities for ASD. Parental participation shows significant and strongly positive outcomes in children with ASD (Lakin et al., 2004). Similarly, parental involvement in physical and leisure activities is imperative and have positive influence on health and social inclusion of ASD (Warren et al., 2012). Bremer et al. (2016) reported martial arts and horseback riding as the two best forms of physical intervention for ASD to be, where as DeJesus et al. (2020) considered dance to positively affect children and improved their social behaviors and communication skills.

Obrusnikova and Miccinello (2012) conducted study on parents’ views about recreational activities especially physical activities for children with ASD. They concluded that parents fully realized the advantages of these activities of children with ASD. The parents however discussed barriers that hamper physical activity participation of their children, such as lack of self-motivation and lack of time.

Objectives of the Study
The objectives of this study were:
1. To determine the opinion of parents about different factors related to the involvement of children with ASD in leisure activities.
2. To compare the opinion of parents on the basis of their socio-economic status, gender and cities.
3. To lay foundations for future research in this area in Pakistan.

Research Methodology
In nature, the research was descriptive and it was carried out using a survey and a self-developed Likert type questionnaire as a research tool.

Population and Sample of the Study
Actually, this research study involved the parents of children with ASD from the division of Lahore and its districts including Nankana Sahab, Sheikhupura, Kasur. The technique of snowball sampling was used because information about parents were not available in institutions. 88 parents participated in the research.

Instrumentation and Procedure of Data Collection
Cloze ended questionnaire comprised of 5-point Likert scale was developed and used for data collection. To establish validity of the scale, this was offered to different experts and professionals working in the educational sector. In addition, their feedback played an important role in improving
instrumental quality. On the basis of sample, the instrument was piloted for the measurement of reliability. Estimated reliability was (0.87). Instrument was administrated by the researcher via personal visits, Google form, and WhatsApp. The researchers followed all ethical considerations and protocols during the data collection process.

Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1</th>
<th>Demographics of the sample</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Male 34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female 54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>18 to 25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>26 to 30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>31 to 35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>36 to 40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>40 and above</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cities</td>
<td>Lahore</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Kasur</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sheikhpura</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Nankana Sahab</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qualification</td>
<td>Matric</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>FA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>BA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monthly income</td>
<td>20 to 30 thousand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>31 to 40 thousand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>41 to 50 thousand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>51 and above thousand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age of child (years)</td>
<td>3 to 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6 to 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9 to 11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>12 to 14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>15 and above</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other disability</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Blindness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ADHD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>HIC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Down Syndrome</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School duration (years)</td>
<td>1 to 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4 to 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7 to 9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10 and above</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School type</td>
<td>Public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Private</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2</th>
<th>Descriptive statistics indicating mean and standard deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Statement</td>
<td>Mean</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feel difficulty due to my health problems</td>
<td>3.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difficulty in reaching the activity area like parks etc.</td>
<td>3.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do not get enough support from community</td>
<td>3.78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No proper environment for leisure activities of ASD child</td>
<td>3.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not enough trained to engage with ASD child</td>
<td>3.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consider leisure activities as waste of time</td>
<td>2.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My financial position is insufficient</td>
<td>3.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leisure activities do not have positive effect on my child</td>
<td>2.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Give priority to academic success than leisure time</td>
<td>3.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is no fitness/leisure center</td>
<td>3.53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of time due to social and family responsibilities</td>
<td>3.31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Due to lack of interest</td>
<td>2.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feel difficulty due to age to perform leisure activities</td>
<td>3.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job responsibilities prevents me to participate</td>
<td>3.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost of program is high</td>
<td>3.50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
I prefer scheduled activities program
3.55 1.18
Family's culture, beliefs do not give importance to leisure activities
3.10 1.23
Not confident to implement leisure activities
3.30 1.06
It required too much work/efforts
3.44 1.22
Previous leisure activities not observed as fruitful
3.40 1.18
Low-monthly income does not permit me to participate
3.42 1.16

Above table indicates that parents reported difficulty in reaching the activity area like parks, lack of community support, absence of proper environment and fitness/leisure center. Cost of program is high, mostly parents did not have any effective training for the engagement of children with ASD and were not capable of executing different leisure activities with them because guidance is not offered by schools.

**Table 3**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>t-value</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>77.3235</td>
<td>13.69742</td>
<td>-1.81</td>
<td>0.55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>79.2778</td>
<td>16.06287</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The table above compares the responses of both female and male parents, and it finds that their opinions on different factors influencing children’s leisure activities are not different (t: 1.81; sig: 0.55)

**Table 4**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of School</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>t-value</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>75.2647</td>
<td>9.63676</td>
<td>-1.61</td>
<td>0.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>80.5741</td>
<td>17.53337</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is important to note that an independent t-test was considered and used for the comparison of responses of parents based on the school type which is not significant. (t:1.61; sig:0.11). It indicates that parental opinions regarding different factors related to children’s leisure activities were not different.

**Table 5**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>Df</th>
<th>MS</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Between Groups</td>
<td>6438.84</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1545.295</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within Groups</td>
<td>15310.071</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>182.263</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>19945.955</td>
<td>87</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The test of ANOVA was carried out for comparing parental responses based on their cities. The test was significant when it was performed (Sig: 0.000)

**Table 6**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(I) Location</th>
<th>(J) Location</th>
<th>Mean Difference</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lahore</td>
<td>Kasur</td>
<td>10.54808</td>
<td>5.45829</td>
<td>.057</td>
<td>(.3063, 21.4025)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sheikhpura</td>
<td></td>
<td>15.52653*</td>
<td>3.64623</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>(8.2756, 22.7775)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
At the level of 0.05, the mean difference is significant. LSD compares parental responses based on their cities. In addition, parents of Lahore exhibited a greater mean (sig: 0.057) in comparison to the mean of Kasur, Nankana, and Sheikhupura cities. It identifies and highlights that Lahore city’s residents reported more factors than others.

Table 7
ANOVA on qualification of parents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>Df</th>
<th>MS</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Between Groups</td>
<td>477.792</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>119.448</td>
<td>.509</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within Groups</td>
<td>19468.162</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>234.556</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>19945.955</td>
<td>87</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The test of ANOVA was carried out and performed for comparing the responses of parents based on their qualifications and it not identified to be significant in the analysis (Sig: 0.72). In addition, parental opinions were not different regarding factors related to ASD-diagnosed children’s leisure activities.

Conclusions
Overall, the objective of this research study was concerned with identifying different factors related to the participation and involvement of children with ASD in various leisure activities and exercises. It is indicated by the findings of this study that parents of such children showed willingness to take a part in different leisure activities. Parents reported difficulty in reaching the activity area like parks, lack of community support, absence of proper environment and fitness/leisure center. Cost of program is high, mostly parents were not enough trained to engage with ASD child and they are not really capable of performing leisure activities and exercises because guidance is not offered by the school.

It is revealed by the results of parametric statistics that parental opinions are not different about factors that affect children’s leisure activities on the basis of type of school and gender. In addition to it, parental opinions are not different about various factors that are related to leisure activities based on their income and qualification. Furthermore, it is important to note that the mean of parents in Lahore is actually higher than others in other area such as Nankana Sahab, Sheikhupura, and Kasur. It highlights that parents in Lahore determined and highlighted more factors than others. In addition, it has been identified that different personal factors like health issues, job responsibilities, gender, and age also affect and influence involvement in leisure activities and exercises. In this study, most of the involved families indicated that they did not have a significant effect on the activity preferences of their children.

Discussion
The findings revealed that parents of children with ASD had been willing to take part in recreational task. Parents reported difficulty in reaching the activity area like parks, lack of community support, absence of proper environment and fitness/leisure center. Cost of program is high, mostly parents were not enough trained to engage with ASD child and they are not really capable of performing leisure activities and exercises because guidance is not offered by the school. Majnemer et al. (2010) found that children with ASD tends to have problems in social environment disturbance as they live in a more dependent in home and schools.

The results reflect the importance of leisure activities and had significant impact on health, social skills, wellbeing etc. As a results, parents and schools give high priority to these recreational activities for children with ASD. Similar findings of Pretti-Frontczak, Barr, & Macy, (2003) were discussed in their research. Bult et al. (2014) found that absence or inadequate opportunities for families of children ASD has major obstacle to participate in activities. Huang et al. (2012) found that families usually have overprotective behavior with their children, these results are in line with
the current study. Therefore, it is important to guide families to have positive attitudes, provide support, manage financial problems and place childcare assistant.

**Recommendations**
Following were the recommendations of the study:

1. Parental training sessions may be arranged by schools where parents be guided to plan and execute different game plans to highlight their child’s strength in leisure activities.
2. School management may ensure that their staff should provide the individual support that children with ASD might require for participating in and enjoying different activities without any type of discrimination.
3. The significance of different leisure exercises should be highlighted by media for children with ASD by broadcasting awareness programs periodically.
4. Different costs of different sports activities and exercises should be affordable and bearable for not only parents but also people with ASD to make sure that their involvement in such sport activities can be promoted.

**References**


Understanding the Impact of E-Wom on Purchase behavior Using Information Acceptance Model

Reham Yahya, BSBA Student, Department of Management Sciences, Balochistan University of Information Technology, Engineering & Management Sciences (BUITEMS), Quetta, Pakistan
Jonathan Fazal Ellahi, BSBA Student, Department of Management Sciences, BUITEMS, Quetta, Pakistan
Rafia Noor Davi, BSBA Student, Department of Management Sciences, BUITEMS, Quetta, Pakistan
*Sajjida Reza, Assistant Professor, Department of Management Sciences, BUITEMS, Quetta, Pakistan

*Corresponding author’s email: sajida.reza@buitms.edu.pk

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

Purpose: This study aims to determine the influence of information gained from electronic word of mouth (e-WOM) on the purchase behavior of customers.

Design/Methodology/Approach: The conceptual model developed for this research has been derived from the Information Acceptance Model (IAM) and the work of other researchers. The pre-existing model has been modified by increasing the factors which augment the information usefulness of e-WOM. The factor of trust inclination towards the information received through online forums has also been incorporated in the model to further develop an understanding regarding the variables in the purchase decision process. This study also highlights some aspects of theory of reasoned action and theory of planned behavior as a base for this work. Structural Equation Modelling (SEM) has been used to analyze the relationship between all existing variables in the linear model.

Findings: The results of this research show how usefulness of information obtained through social networking sites and other online media influence the adoption of this information, eventually leading to developing intention and terminal purchase behavior. However, the relationship of credibility of information, perceived risk and argument quality with information usefulness, as its antecedents, has been found insignificant, one of the primary reasons for which is the unawareness of e-WOM among the general public.

Implications/Originality/Value: The practical implications of this paper include guidance to manufacturers and service providers to understand the factors involved in influencing consumer purchase behavior when subjected to e-WOM.

© 2022 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

Recommended Citation: Yahya, R., Ellahi, J. F., Davi, R. N. and Reza, S. (2022). Understanding the Impact of E-Wom on Purchase behavior Using Information Acceptance
Introduction
Online social networking has become a part of our daily lives, which greatly influences our mentality and actions. Pertinent to online marketing exists a concept known as electronic word of mouth (e-WOM) which is believed to have a crucial impact on the purchase decision of a customer (Suwandee et al., 2019). Though e-WOM is not a recent term however, with social media platforms it has now been reinvigorated with newer concepts and implications (Erkan & Evans, 2016a).

e-WOM is a reflection of customer feedback (positive/negative) about a brand, regarding any of its product offering which is made public through online forums (Hennig-Thurau et al., 2004). Information disseminated through e-WOM can be in different forms such as social media posts and threads, interactions with brand posts or posting reviews regarding products and surveys (Erkan & Evans, 2016a). Online reviews are the most important and effective means of generating e-WOM (Park et al., 2007). Traditional means of communication are becoming less effective as people doubt the reliability and credibility of information provided through them (Prendergast et al., 2010). Word of mouth (or e-WOM) which directly involves customers has become much more effective in terms of credibility (Brown et al., 2007).

Though there have been researches regarding the purchase intention under the influence of e-WOM, however this study primarily aims to explore the viability of the information gained from e-WOM reflecting on customers’ purchase behavior. The underpinning conceptualization of the study is based on information acceptance model (IAM) (Sussman & Siegal, 2003).

The factors determining the usefulness of e-WOM have been derived from the works of various researchers over the years while the concept of trust has been incorporated in the model, extracted from the research work of Gefen et al. (2003).

Theoretical Background
Usefulness of Information from e-WOM
The term ‘usefulness of information’ was introduced in the technology acceptance model (TAM) of Davis in 1985. Information usefulness can be understood in terms of how valuable that information is perceived by the audience (Luo et al., 2018). Therefore, if readers consider some information regarding a brand/product as useful then they would opt for the product in case of favorable or discard the idea of buying it, otherwise (Coursaris et al., 2018). The perceived usefulness of an information influences the extent of its adoption (Gefen et al., 2003) which can have an impact on the purchase behavior.

Quality of Information
Since information on e-WOM can easily be accessed by any internet user so this demands quality and credible information. Information quality refers to consumers personal judgment regarding information attributes and whether it satisfy their demands or not (Wang & Strong, 1996). Information quality can be viewed as the caliber of the content of a consumer review being judged on the basis of information attributes (Park et al., 2007). Information quality in social media sites/platforms is the antecedent of consumers purchase intention (Nabi & Hendriks, 2003).

Quality of Information and Information Usefulness
People find information useful and beneficial when they realize that the particular information will enhance their performance. A person encountering high quality information is more likely to adopt and accept the provided information than low quality information since information usefulness acts as a key predictor for information adoption/acceptance (Davis, 1989).

People incline towards information they find useful which is only possible if the information is of high quality as people face a great amount of e-WOM information on the internet; therefore good
quality information will be adopted by the consumer because of its usefulness (Chu & Kim, 2011). Therefore:

**H1: Information quality has a significant impact on information usefulness**

**Credibility of Information**

At the most simplest, credibility means believability and trustworthiness (Fogg & Tseng, 1999). In views of Wathen and Burkell (2002), information credibility acts as a first step in the convincing of an individual. Information given out by a source thought to be credible will be valuable and reliable (Cheung et al., 2008).

Research over the years have proved that there is a positive influence on product assessment by the consumers through high quality consumer reviews (Park & Lee, 2008).

**Credibility of Information and Information Usefulness**

People adopt information for its usefulness which is based on a number of factors including information credibility. A credible source positively influences the usefulness of information (Chen, 2014). The information received will be beneficial if it is from a credible source. Research shows that reviews from an expert source are perceived to be helpful and useful (González-Rodríguez et al., 2016). Similarly, opinions of expert writers are considered more useful (Jamil & Hasnu, 2013). Thus it is proposed:

**H2: Information credibility has a significant impact on usefulness of information**

**Need of Information**

‘Need of information’ which explains why consumers engage in information seeking, is frequently used in research but the concept has some ambiguity (Savolainen, 2017). One of the early researchers to work on Information need was Taylor (1962) who defined it as a personal, psychological, inexpressible and an unconscious state. Further studies has also implied this concept as “advice seeking” and “opinion seeking” (Hennig-Thurau et al., 2003). Taylor (1962) says that consumers are often unable to clearly define what they want but deep down they know why they need it, they cannot state their information needs but can state the situation that gave rise to their information needs.

**Need of Information and Information Usefulness**

Internet consumers usually seek information which is beneficial in their decision making (Erkan & Evans, 2016). Need of information also influences consumer’s purchase intention (Chu & Kim, 2011). People search for information so that it could satisfy their needs and wants, if the information received fulfill their demands then it leads to information adoption because of usefulness of the said information (Wolny & Mueller, 2013). Therefore, it is suggested that:

**H3: Need of information has a significant impact on information usefulness**

**Attitude towards Information**

Attitude can be defined as our negative or positive response towards an object or behavior (Ajzen & Fishbein, 1975). A person’s attitude towards e-WOM wholly depends on his trust on its source. Since the last decade, e-WOM is considered a powerful marketing tool (Zhang et al., 2012). So customers are focusing on social media for brand information (Barreda et al., 2015). The customers will use the information or e-WOM messages in their decision-making process after they accept it (Sussman & Siegal, 2003).

**Attitude towards Information and Information Usefulness**

Beneficial online reviews aid customers to use e-WOM data (Cheung et al., 2008). Attitude towards information greatly influences information usefulness, which further inspires information adoption (Park, 2020). This premise is also supported by Erkan and Evans (2016). So it is hypothesized that:

**H4: Attitude towards information has a significant impact on information usefulness**
Argument Quality
Argument quality indicates convincing element in an instructive message (Bhattacharjee & Sanford, 2006). It is a reflection of the persuasion degree considered by the message recipients (Cheung et al., 2009). Argument quality effects recipient's mentality in virtual settings (Sia et al., 1999) It is considered valid on the basis of its correctness, completeness, persuasiveness, application and being up to date (DeLone & McLean, 2003).

Argument Quality and Information Usefulness
Argument quality of a persuasive message influences perceptions (Bhattacharjee & Sanford, 2006) and comprehension of its usefulness (Li, 2015). In the light of such studies there clearly exists a relationship between argument quality and usefulness of information gained from e-WOM which will further be investigated in this study along with its ultimate impact on purchase behavior. Therefore:

H5: Argument quality has a significant impact on information usefulness

Perceived Risk
According to various researchers perceived risk encompasses consumers feelings, beliefs and emotions which play a very vital role in there purchase decision (Cunningham, 1967; Hussain et al., 2017). Consumers focus on managing their doubts by seeking information from a large number of alternates from different means in order to reduce or eliminate their perceived risk and make better decision about a product or service (Zhang et al., 2012). Perceived risk can be characterized as a purchaser's conviction to experience the ill effects of negative and unsure outcomes when purchasing on the web (Park & Tussyadiah, 2017). There are many division of perceived risk such as monetary, physical, functional and temporal (Forsythe et al., 2006).

Perceived Risk and Information Usefulness
Individuals, when experiencing high perceived risk, tend to rigorously explore different information sources (Cho & Lee, 2006; Flanagin et al., 2014). An individual when perceives the usefulness of the information source then relies heavily on it for risk reduction (Cho & Lee, 2006). So it is proposed here that:

H6: Perceived risk has a significant impact on information usefulness.

Trust Inclination
Trust has been defined in various ways by researchers over the years. It has been expressed by Moorman (1993) as the willingness to rely on someone on whom one confides in. Similarly it is also defined in terms of confidence in reliability and integrity on another person. Therefore, trust plays an important role in gaining reliable online information (Tang et al., 2015). Trust is integral in the e-WOM context as individuals rely on the information disseminated through an online source they consider trustworthy (Khwaja et al., 2020). Trust influences the views of information seeking customers and it is increased by high levels of interactions (Gefen et al., 2003).

Information Usefulness and Trust Inclination
Shen (2013) offers that information adoption is determined by two factors: information usefulness and trust. Information usefulness implies the satisfaction of objectives of the user and provides “the context in which trust is embedded” (Shen et al., 2013). Peng (2019) proposes that usefulness of online information and services have a positive impact on interaction and trust. Therefore the proposed hypothesis in this regard is:

H7: information usefulness significantly impacts trust inclination.

Information Adoption of e-WOM
Information adoption refers to the extent of acceptance of information perceived as meaningful after validating its source (Watts et al., 2008). Information adoption is the process of purposefully engaging in utilizing information received from any source (Cheung et al., 2008). It is the internalization phase of knowledge transfer (Nonaka, 1994). Any information that is considered
important in the mind of the receiver is proceeded by acceptance or adoption according to IAM (Sussman & Siegal, 2003).

**Trust Inclination and Information Adoption**
The process of adoption is a form of trusting behavior where individuals puts themselves in a position of taking risk (Kim & Prabhakar, 2000). Previous studies have indicated that trust impacts adoption of recommendation agents (Benbasat et al., 2005). Trust inclination is therefore considered to play part in the influence of e-WOM on the purchase behavior of customers. It has been included in the conceptual model as an antecedent to the adoption of information disseminated through e-WOM. Though previous researches have emphasized how information usefulness influences information adoption, this study proposes the role of trust towards information adoption. Therefore:

**Hs**: Trust significantly impacts information adoption.

**Purchase Intention**
Consumers will buy products reflecting emotions and attitudes (Chu & Kim, 2011). There is a strong tie between intention to purchase and customer’s preference of acquisition for the product of a brand. This indicates that relationships of a brand to its customers are grounded on attributes of a brand shaping consumers attitude (Hsu et al., 2017). In addition, Tariq et al. (2017) empirically found that the same purchase intention is also increased by price and promotion, brand recognition and increased awareness of the brand.

**Information Adoption and Purchase Intention**
According to Erkan and Evans (2016) information adoption process presented in the IAM has a direct influence on purchase intention. Their studies confirm an existing relationship between these two variables. Other studies have also shown a significant relationship between information acceptance and purchase intention (Wang et al., 2012). Consequently, it is submitted that:

**H9**: Information adoption significantly impacts purchase intention.

**Purchase behavior**
Customer purchase behavior posits that consumers make efforts to fulfill their requirements through goods and information which leads to the formation of purchase intention which further leads to purchase behavior (Lee & Lee, 2015). Many researchers agree that purchase behavior comprises of intention of purchase and decision of purchase (Rimal et al., 1999). The subjective likelihood that a buyer wants to acquire a product but not actually purchasing the product is referred to as purchase intention (Rimal et al., 1999). This is the early phase of purchase behavior. Decision to purchase occurs when the buyer have an intense intention to purchase and have already purchased or is ready to purchase a product/service. Culmination of shopping process occurs here (Rimal et al., 1999; Lee & Lee, 2015).

**Purchase intention and Purchase behavior**
The idea of intentions being good indicators of purchase behavior reinforces its extensive use as a forecaster of actual purchases (Armstrong et al., 2000). However, a contradictory trend is observed where individual-level purchasing behavior is concerned. This contradiction is not applicable across the board, resulting in a gap between overall mean claimed purchase intentions and the proportion of buyers. Likewise, some research merely acknowledge a fraction of these inconsistencies and produce false forecasts and skewed evaluations of the situation. (Young et al., 1998). Since purchase intention comes into play before the actual purchase, it considers the psychological factors impacting customer behavior (Armitage & Conner, 2001). It is offered here that:

**H10**: Purchase intention significantly affects purchase behavior of customer.

**Theory of Planned Behavior**
Theoretically this study is being backed by a well-known psychological model by Ajzen (1991) known as Theory Of Planned Behavior. It is a refined form of theory of reasoned action (TRA) and covers up the limitations of TRA. It is a model which assumed that a rational individual converts
available information into a systematic pattern and considers the action prior to implication in other words individual goes through a system to decide whether to engage in a behavior. Hence TRA is a combination of two factors effecting the behavior which are, ‘attitude’ and ‘subjective norms’. Attitude is a personal factor of an individual which is formed by the behavioral outcomes, evaluation and believes. Subjective norms arise from the social pressures (Hansen, 2008; Yousafzai et al., 2010). These factors are further elaborated by Li (2010) as attitude is an emotional state of a person having positive or negative intent with which a person is more towards performing a behavior. If the outcome of a behavior is positive it is followed by a positive intent of attitude and vice versa. On the other hand subjective norm is all about normative belief, that is, believes which is being infused by the people around to make ones perception for performing a behavior. Hence it is a social pressure that compels a person to be engaged in the behavior (Ajzen, 1991; X. Li et al., 2010; Yousafzai et al., 2010).

Methodology

Instrument Development

Deductive technique was used to apply positivist research philosophy. The survey instrument was created using metrics that have been validated in previous researches. Variables and constructs were adapted from e-WOM literature review in particular.
The survey consists of 47 items (Table 1) and uses a five-point Likert scale with anchors ranging from ‘completely disagree’ to ‘completely agree’.

**Sampling**
Data is collected, using simple random sampling, from respondents involved in online purchasing. Random sampling was determined to be an appropriate method. The survey sample size for the study was 209 people who are social media users. Data was collected from various cities in Pakistan using an online medium as well as through the physical distribution of structured questionnaires on university campuses. SPSS 24.0 software is used for initial data cleaning.

**Data Analysis**

**Measurement Model Analysis**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. #</th>
<th>Construct</th>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Author</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Quality of Information</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Park et al. 2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Credibility of Information</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Davis, 1985; Prendergast et al. 2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Need of Information</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Flynn et al., 1996</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Attitude towards information</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>Park et al., 2007; Prendergast et al. 2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Perceived risk</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Bettman, 1973</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Argument quality</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Cheung et al., 2008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Information usefulness of e-WOM</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Bailey &amp; Pearson, 1983</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Trust inclination</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Doney &amp; Cannon, 1997</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Information adoption of e-WOM</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Cheung et al., 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Purchase intention</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Coyle &amp; Thorson, 2001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Purchase behavior</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Guo &amp; Barnes, 2011</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

![Image of Measurement Model](image-url)
Table 2 analyzes collectively the validity and reliability of indicators. Indicator reliability have been assessed through loading values and rho A. Convergent validity has been measured using average variance extracted (AVE) values. Internal consistency is measured through composite reliability (CR).

<p>| Table 2 |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measurement Model</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Items</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality of Information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credibility of Information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need for Information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attitude towards information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceived Risk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Argument Quality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information Usefulness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trust Inclination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information Adoption</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchase Intention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchase Behavior</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a All item loadings > 0.5 indicates indicator reliability (Hulland, 1999)
b All Average Variance Extracted (AVE) > 0.5 indicates Convergent Validity (Bagozzi & Yi, 1988; Fornell & Larcker, 1981)
c All Composite Reliability (CR) > 0.7 indicates Internal Consistency (DeVellis et al., 2000)
d All Rho A > 0.7 indicates Indicator reliability (Olzak et al., 2013)

Table 3 illustrates Cross loadings between the items and variables showing that each item is well and truly defining its designated construct.

<p>| Table 3 |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cross Loadings Criterion Result</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Items</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality of Information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credibility of Information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need for Information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attitude towards information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceived Risk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Argument Quality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information Usefulness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trust Inclination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information Adoption</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchase Intention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchase Behavior</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 4 shows how the values of the respective indicators are highest for the intended construct.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>IA</th>
<th>AQ</th>
<th>CI</th>
<th>QI</th>
<th>IU</th>
<th>NI</th>
<th>PR</th>
<th>PB</th>
<th>PI</th>
<th>TI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.784</td>
<td>0.52</td>
<td>0.518</td>
<td>0.432</td>
<td>0.423</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td>0.257</td>
<td>0.288</td>
<td>0.363</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.748</td>
<td>0.421</td>
<td>0.865</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td>0.76</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Structural Model

Structural model lays emphasis on the inner model highlighting the relationship between constructs of the model. The resultant model is obtained through SEM technique. Hypotheses are tested through t-value and p-value. The acceptable values of which are >1.96 and <0.05, respectively. According to these criteria 7 out of 10 hypotheses have been found significant while the remaining 3 are insignificant. The results depict that H₂, H₅ and H₆ have been rejected which means that credibility...
of information, perceived risk and argument quality do not hold significant relationship with information usefulness and are not considered as necessary antecedents to information usefulness.

![Figure 3 Structural Model](image)

In Table 5 low standard error shows that values do not show much deviation form mean values (standard beta), hence indicating normality of data. According to the obtained results credibility of information, perceived risk and argument quality have insignificant relationships with respect to information usefulness whereas, all other relationships have been found significant and their respective hypotheses have been accepted.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relationship</th>
<th>β</th>
<th>S.E.</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>p</th>
<th>Decision</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Quality of Information -&gt; Information Usefulness</td>
<td>0.396</td>
<td>0.083</td>
<td>3.972</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credibility of Information -&gt; Information Usefulness</td>
<td>0.032</td>
<td>0.088</td>
<td>0.365</td>
<td>0.993</td>
<td>Not supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need for Information -&gt; Information Usefulness</td>
<td>0.250</td>
<td>0.055</td>
<td>4.545</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attitude towards Information -&gt; Information Usefulness</td>
<td>0.240</td>
<td>0.062</td>
<td>3.892</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceived Risk -&gt; Information Usefulness</td>
<td>0.064</td>
<td>0.061</td>
<td>1.059</td>
<td>0.290</td>
<td>Not supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Argument Quality -&gt; Information Usefulness</td>
<td>0.116</td>
<td>0.062</td>
<td>1.770</td>
<td>0.077</td>
<td>Not Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information Usefulness -&gt; Trust Inclination</td>
<td>0.559</td>
<td>0.059</td>
<td>9.351</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trust Inclination -&gt; Adoption of Information</td>
<td>0.539</td>
<td>0.054</td>
<td>9.090</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adoption of Information -&gt; Purchase Intention</td>
<td>0.551</td>
<td>0.057</td>
<td>9.547</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchase Intention -&gt; Purchase Behavior</td>
<td>0.463</td>
<td>0.068</td>
<td>5.330</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Results and Discussion**
This study predicts impact of e-WOM on purchase behavior using Information Acceptance Model. The results indicate that argument quality, credibility and perceived risk have insignificant relation with respect to information usefulness of e-WOM.

The research suggests that argument quality has insignificant relation with usefulness of information obtained through e-WOM aligned to the study of Cheung et al., 2009. The possible reasons for this insignificant relationship could be based on the interpretation that the majority people of Pakistan may not rely on the argument quality believing it to be paid publicity, as many online pages now a days pay respondents to make fake comments to promote their products creating a paid form of buzz marketing. Another reason for this insignificance can be the sense of self- efficacy that people have making them reluctant to gather any information regarding any product as depicted in studies conducted by Wall and Warkentin (2019).

While, credibility of information which in accordance with the views of Wathen and Burkel (2002), plays the role of the first step in compelling an individual and, is the degree to which information receiver believe an information source is truthful. Cheung (2008) also showed insignificant relation to information usefulness. Since Pakistanis, especially from Quetta are not much into gathering information before purchases as well as to know the reliable source of information could be one of the reasons of this insignificant relationship.

Perceived risk’s insignificance can be explained through the fact that the availability of variety of information makes a risk averse customer to become indifferent toward the information causing its usefulness to fade away.

Additionally, the significance found between attitude of information and information usefulness follows the findings of Park (2020). The reason of this could be that when a person finds information disseminated on online forums/platforms to be valuable or in accordance with the needs and wants of consumer, he will find it useful and the consumer would develop a favorable attitude towards information (Ajzen & Fishbein, 1975).

Moreover, the relationship between information quality and information usefulness is found significant as per pervious researches (Erkan and Evans, 2016; T. Park, 2020) because people always find information useful if that particular information enhances their knowledge in one way or another and is according to their needs and wants which is only possible if the information bears good quality content. Therefore, people's adoption or acceptance of information is highly influenced by the usefulness that the information holds which depends on the information quality.

The significant relationship of need of information with information usefulness shows that the need of information provides result and output that is of some value and usually matches the needs and wants of consumers so it is considered useful by the end consumer. Also, the fulfillment of needs and wants leads to information adoption and acceptance which also was only possible if the information was perceived to be useful by the consumer.

Furthermore, if we take a look at significant relationship between information usefulness and trust inclination we can speculate from both primary and secondary data that those consumers that find information useful are more inclined towards that particular information in terms of trust. Trust inclination and information usefulness combine together to form purchase intention and are also important factors in the adoption and acceptance of information by the consumer.

Likewise, significant relationship between trust inclination and information adoption depicts that trust plays a vital role in consumers’ adoption process because consumers only take calculated risk. People’s adoption or acceptance of information is the result of people trusting the information and the information source, only if the source or information is considered to be credible and trustworthy will consumers adopt the information.

The significant relationship between information adoption and purchase intention is found because it is said that the willingness of a consumer to buy a product or service in the future is only possible if the consumer finds the information for that product according to his requirements. When the
information adoption or acceptance takes place then the consumer forms an intention to buy. Erkan and Evans, (2016) also emphasize the relationship of information adoption with purchase intention.

Lastly, the association of purchase intention and purchase behavior is observed significant as per the findings of Armstrong et al. (2000). The significance of using purchase intention to forecast potential purchase behavior should not be undervalued. Purchase intention is a good indicator for predicting purchase behavior of current and potential customers.

Conclusion
The research aims to understand e-WOM’s effect on purchase behavior using IAM and more specifically to answer the following questions: what is the impact of perceived risk and argument quality on information usefulness of e-WOM; the relationship of information usefulness of e-WOM and trust inclination; the impact of trust inclination on information adoption; and the relationship of purchase intentions made through the following information process with purchase behavior.

The empirical research based on 201 users of social networking sites in Pakistan validated the model, supporting the integral model for the Pakistani market. This model considers only social networking sites as reference and not social media as a whole. The model combined the characteristics of additional variables such as argument quality and perceived risk. Trust inclination and purchasing behavior developed the essence of contribution of framework. The findings revealed a variety of implications, both theoretical and managerial. The primary contribution is the differences induced by added variables and the observation of their function with the information acceptance model. Pakistani buyers who are predisposed to using e-WOM information from social networking sites, have a perception of utility that lead them to use such information in their purchase decision-making process. When company's potential audience includes all social media users then the marketers need to make the feedback available and accessible online to consumers, not only for problem reduction, but for problem solving as well.

Future Recommendations
It is proposed that research on e-WOM via IAM be conducted introducing new variables. These may be precedents of user's attitude towards information, determinants of perceived information quality, and identifying their relationships with purchase behavior either directly or with intervention of moderators and mediators. Similarly, research on the impact of extrinsic factors of online marketing strategies on information acceptance could also be considered. Furthermore, research on the effects of incentives on the credibility of information provided by social networking sites be considered as well. Future studies can involve the development of new empirical models incorporating variables, or re-examining insignificant relationships discovered with the addition of moderators and mediators, in order to better understand the process of information acceptance.

References


