INTRODUCTION

The journal Sustainable Business and Society in Emerging Economies (ISSN: 2708-2504 and ISSN-E: 2708-2172) is an open access peer-reviewed research journal published bi-annually by CSRC Publishing, Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan. The journal seeks to bridge and strengthen the link between business activities and society development around myriad of sustainability issues with focus on emerging and developing economies. The content coverage highlights how business organizations can be responsible towards society in pursuing their value added activities. The journal also bring forward issues in social and behavioral sciences for their implications for business organization and their activities in emerging and developing economies. The journal is a platform for business people, academics, and others involved in the contemporary debate about the responsible role of business organizations and society towards each other. Coverage includes various areas of social and behavioral sciences including management sciences. The journal welcomes papers from all those working in this important area, including researchers and business professionals, members of the legal profession, government administrators and many others.

SCOPE AND MISSION

The journal strives to highlight theoretical and policy issues related to sustainable business practices and social issues faced by society in emerging and developing economies. The SBSEE seeks to integrate the actors and institutions in business and society given that sustainability issues are though found in market yet their solution requires deep and coordinated understanding of these issues from perspectives of various disciplines of social sciences, arts and humanities. With this background SBSEE aims to be a premier forum for policy and theoretical discussion of high impact research related to sustainable business and social development in emerging and developing economies.

The journal aims to cover sustainability topics and issues in various sub-areas of business, social and behavioral sciences in context of emerging and developing economies. Purpose is to highlight the theoretical and practical issues faced by businesses and society in these economies. The journal also welcomes submissions which focus the broader areas of business, management sciences and various areas of social sciences, arts and humanities.
EDITORIAL BOARD

Patron

• Prof Dr Hayat Muhammad Awan, President, Center of Sustainability and Research Center

Editor In Chief

• Prof. Dr. K. Kuperan Viswanathan, Senior Member Advisory Board, Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan: kuperan@gmail.com; sbsee@globalcsrp.org

Associate Editors

• Dr. Adeel Rana, University of Sahiwal Pakistan
• Dr. Athifah Najwani Shahidan, Associate Fellow, Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan
• Dr. Owais Shafique, Department of Management Sciences, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur Pakistan

Editorial Advisory Board

• Prof. Dr. Abdul Wajid Rana, Lahore School of Economics, Pakistan.
• Prof. Dr. Ruswati Suryasaputra, Universitas Wijaya Kusuma Surabaya Indonesia.
• Prof. Dr. Mohd Noor Mohd Sahriﬀ, Universiti Utara Malaysia.
• Prof. Dr. Norshuhada Shiratuddin, Universiti Utara Malaysia.
• Prof. Dr. Raja Suzana Raja Kasim, Universiti Malaysia Kelantan Malaysia.
• Prof. Dr. Cornelia Pop, Babes-Bolyai University Romania.
• Prof. Dr. José G. Vargas-Hernández, University of Guadalajara Mexico.
• Prof. Dr. Maria Alejandra Gonzalez-Perez, Universidad EAFIT Colombia.
• Prof. Dr. Arkadiusz Mironko, Rutgers University, New Jersey USA.
• Prof. Dr. Anayo Dominic Nkamnebe, Nnamdi Azikiwe University Nigeria.
• Prof. Dr. D. E. Laouisset, Nottingham Business School, UK.
• Prof. Dr. Mauricio Garita, Universidad Francisco Marroquín Guatemala.
• Assoc. Prof. Dr. Johanan Zamilpa, University of Guanajuato Mexico.
• Assoc. Prof. Dr. Malgorzata Bartosik-Purgat, Poznan University Poland.
• Assoc. Prof. Dr. Rana Dilshad, Bahauddin Zakariya University Multan Pakistan.
• Assoc Prof Dr Jose E. Munoz, Point Loma Nazarene University California USA.
• Assoc. Prof. Dr. Vasyl Taras, University of North Carolina at Greensboro, USA.
• Assoc. Prof. Dr. Silvia Testarmata, Università degli Studi Niccolò Cusano Rome, Italy.
• Assoc. Prof. Dr. Artew Aggrawal, Amity University Navi Mumbai, India.
• Assoc. Prof. Dr. Barbara Jankowska, Poznan University of Economics and Business Poland.
• Assoc. Prof. Dr. Ernesto Tavoletti, University of Macerata Italy.
• Assoc. Prof. Dr. Sara Poggesi, University of Rome Tor Vergata Italy.
• Assoc. Prof. Dr. Shankar Chelliah, School of Management Universiti Sains Malaysia.
• Assoc. Prof. Dr. Ali Malik, University of Hertfordshire, UK.
• Asst. Prof. Dr. Aasma Safdar, Bahauddin Zakariya University Multan Pakistan.
• Asst. Prof. Dr. Omer Faruk Genc, Abdullah Gül University, Kayseri, Turkey.
• Asst. Prof. Dr. Pawel Bryla, University of Lodz Poland.
• Asst. Prof. Dr. Anju Mehta, University of North Carolina at Greensboro USA.
• Asst. Prof. Dr. Khawaja Khalid Mehmood, Bahauddin Zakariya University Multan, Pakistan.
• Asst. Prof. Dr. Husnul Amin, International Islamic University Islamabad Pakistan.
• Asst. Prof. Dr. Sehar-un-Nisa Hassan, NUST Islamabad Pakistan.
• Dr. Diana Bank Weinberg, Berlin School of Economics and law (HWR), Germany.
• Dr. Muhammad Haroon Hafeez, Bahauddin Zakariya University Multan Pakistan.
• Dr. Waheed Asghar, Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority Punjab Pakistan.
• Dr. Otega Okinono, Delta State University, Nigeria.
• Dr. Muhammad Rizwan, Middlesex University Business School, London.
INDEXING AND ABSTRACTING

The journal Sustainable Business and Society in Emerging Economies is indexed and abstracted by following institutions. The publishing manager and editorial team are committed to enhance quality and outreach of the journal by expanding the indexing and abstracting of its content further.

- SocioRepec
- EconPapers
- SUNCAT
- Google Scholar
- Crossref
- Scilit
- OAI-PMH Compliant Repositories
- RePEc
- Copac
- EDRIC
- IDEAS
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Vol. 1, Issue 1, June 2019

### Journal Information

### Introduction-Scope and Mission

### Editorial Board

### Indexing and Abstracting

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Consumers’ Attitude towards Use and Adoption of Online Shopping in Bahawalpur, Pakistan</td>
<td>01-14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muhammad Zeeshan Muneer</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impact Attitude towards Green Consumption among College and University Students in Bahawalpur Pakistan</td>
<td>15-28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asma Fazal</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credit Risk Oracle: The Bifocal Approach</td>
<td>29-42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Areeba Khan, Zulaiha A. Zubair, Erum Fayyaz, Iffat Hussain</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toward Socially Sustainable Tourism: the Impact of Tourism on SMEs and Livelihood Development at Tourism Destinations in Bahawalpur Pakistan</td>
<td>43-54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rahim Mukhtar</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Does Consumer’s Attitude Towards Green Supply Chain Practices and Its Impact on Their Intentions to Buy at Fast Food Restaurants in Bahawalpur, Pakistan</td>
<td>55-64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sabeen Shahid Rehmani, Sulaman Hafeez Siddiqui</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Author Guidelines
Consumers’ Attitude towards Use and Adoption of Online Shopping in Bahawalpur, Pakistan

1 Muhammad Zeeshan Muneer

1The Islamia University of Bahawalpur Pakistan, zeesidhu@gmail.com

The purpose of this study is to understand consumer attitude towards online shopping in Pakistan and the subsequent increasing ratio of online shopping. The study describes the consumer attitude towards online shopping. Promotion and Culture Refund has significant positive relationship with consumer attitude and price has negative relationship with the attitude of consumer. Data was collected through a questionnaire. Around 250 questionnaires were pitched to those who used the internet extensively for online shopping. Said data was then analyzed with the help of SPSS. The data was gathered mainly from Bahawalpur, Pakistan. The generalization of the model and findings to other developed areas required additional research. The findings suggest improvement in consumer attitude towards online shopping. Attitude is the most important factor among the four other variables. Online vendors should ensure to provide Refund options and increase the ratio of promotion as prices highly effect consumer attitude.

© 2019 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

DOI: 10.26710/sbsee.v1i1.997

1. Introduction
Internet is one of the several channels of medium for selling and buying goods and services online. Online shopping means to place the order to buy the goods or services and the consumer can receive it while staying home. Consumers can use their credit cards and gain awareness about product features from different websites. Now-a-days it is becoming more and more convenient for the masses. Online shopping can be done through diverse sources like OLX, amazon, and daraz.pk by visiting the websites of different brands. Online shopping is a time saving process because people are too busy with their schedules which doesn’t leave them with enough time to go visit the stores and peruse through shelves. Many people are satisfied and feel comfortable with online shopping because they are psychologically satisfied by using the online products, by their quality as well as by their pricing.
Every type of product or accessory can be purchased online these days like, electronics, transportation booking, stationery, food items, clothing etc. Even selling of products is done on online websites. E-trail is beneficent for both seller and buyer by reducing space and time hurdles. For buyers, e-trail provides platform of buying with far above the ground information and easiness of buying and the main thing is online shopping provides relief to the customer like there’s no parking tickets or crowds to worry about. For seller, E-trail provides high interactive and accessible display place. Online shopping is changing the trend of spending. Its biggest advantage is that we can check the feedbacks or rating given by the customers who have already consumed those products and seeing good ratings can bring about psychological satisfaction. No doubt, the trend of online shopping is increasing day by day in Pakistan. Online shopping in sectors such as garments, mobile accessories and business-to-business transactions are growing in Pakistan. While online shopping is not at peak level in Pakistan, its growth rate is increasing steadily because of increase in day by day internet usage in Pakistan. The ratio of internet users in Pakistan in 2017 has exhibited exponential boom traits during the last few years – with US$30 million being spent on line purchases presently – depict an extraordinarily advantageous photo for the future and the dimensions of Pakistan’s e-trade market is predicted to reach over US$800 million by means of 2018 (Ahmed, 2015). The total population of Pakistan is almost 200 million and internet user in Pakistan is 35.1 million on the other hand active social media user is 31 million, the numbers of smart phone users in Pakistan are 40 million, and the number of people who accessed social media from their smart phones is 28 million. The total value of e-commerce is estimated to cross the 10 billion mark by 2020. (Aurora)

E-commerce can be considered one of the most progressive and flashy businesses in the entire world. Rather it may be given the name of an abstract industry which is not only paying to an individual but increasing the revenue of states as well as countries also. According to a keen survey, the biggest countries (also known as super powers) whether economically, socially, in force or technologically and enhancing their revenue day by day with the help of ecommerce, or in simple words, online shopping.

The root reason of online shopping is to save time especially for those who are too busy in their social and practical life. The reason of this study is to examine the potential purchase behaviour of online shoppers in Pakistan with a purpose to gain insights into their attitudes, alternatives, decision-making body paintings, and lifestyles patterns. The target population examined for this consisted of the city consumers who’re educated and belong to the top of the food chain and have socio-economic training. Within online purchasing, two primary classes will be set up, particularly “Electronics” and “garb.”

Online shopping trend is rising in Asia rapidly but lot of problems were found in the way of its growing like price, promotion, refunds, trust and cultural factors. Amazon, eBay and OLX, along with many other companies have launched their services and products and get good response but it’s not as satisfactory as in Asian countries like China, Pakistan, India and Japan. One of the major problem in online shopping in Asian countries like India, Pakistan, Sri Lanka, Malaysia, Iran, Turkey and Bangladesh is the literacy rate. The literacy rate is lower than we are thinking and if the right kind of education and awareness is provided, then you can see the positive signs in online shopping.

The biggest problem in online shopping is lack of trust. Most of the companies engage in fraudulent behaviours and the items are not the same as are shown on display. This practice not only breaks the customers trust but also damages the image of same well known reliable online firms which deters many from shopping online (rahim, 2012). Though same global level companies have provided quality, quantity and originality for the customers at the same level as Amazon, eBay and OLX etc. Promotions and discount play an important role in online shopping. Because 60% to 80% of the consumers wait for their trusted brands to put out seasonal sales, limited time period discounts and special offers for the holiday season. 59% of consumers search for promo code before buying online product while 22% of consumers purchase product from their preferred brands only when on sale or with coupon. (Shamout, The Impact of Promotional Tools on Consumer Buying Behavior in Retail Market, 2016)
The improvement of E-trade is tested by a few components related both market interest sides. Despite the fact that organizations broadly created value-based sites for their customer’s satisfaction, but most of the online sites not fulfil the requirements of the consumers (Kooli). Online retail market provided a special services for their customers and introduce lot of a new products of relief on a daily basis like provide special product of daily base discount and consumers are more attract though the product. Online retail market introduce a separated market for all the products where you can easily find your product and save your time or expenses. The most effective advantage of online shopping is deals like buy get one get one free, coupons, discount. Most of the people don’t prefer online shopping due to the security reasons and trust issues but when they watch different discount offers they are swayed into making a purchase because it’s easy and on a less price as compared with offline market. (Shamout, The Impact of Promotional Tools on Consumer Buying Behavior in Retail Market, 2016)

The purchasing power and purchasing decision scene has changed all over the world since online shopping is directly affected by the consumers. Because in the 21st century you can’t sale your product without advertising. When a marketer make their product, they always choose a channel for promoting or advertising their product. In today’s world you must be promote your product through online or sell it online because you can easily deliver your message to the audience. For an effective growth marketers must introduce different discounts and offers to their customers from time to time to attract them and build with their long term relationships. The main purpose of online shopping and advertising it online, is the ease of access. It’s a speedy, effective and time saving process among other had increased the usage of online shopping to end the user. (Folarin, 2016)

As per marketing research on internet shopping in different nations, it was found that internet shopping in Philippines had been done by 62% of Filipino’s web clients while 61% of Indonesian web clients shop on the web, 58% of Thailand and Vietnamese web clients utilize web based shopping, in any case, contrasted with these creating nations, web based shopping had been done in Malaysia by just 47% of Malaysian Internet clients. This level of internet shopping in Malaysia is generally low, along these lines it realized the motivation behind this examination which is to distinguish and look at the impact of seen hazard on shopping goal in Malaysia, explicitly in Malaysia's attire industry. (Folarin, 2016)

In different countries different consumers have different concern while purchasing any product online. The main advantage of online shopping is easily accessible and saves time but the disadvantage is facing security and privacy issues. Most of the developed countries decrease the security concern but lot of the developing countries like Pakistan and India still struggle with them. It’s not a just a matter of concern for consumers, but also for all the online shopping companies who fear data leaks and tampering of sensitive data (Abrar, 2017).

It’s a fact that web shopping has increased worldwide but, some online customers are still more partial towards offline shopping. They get information like price, specification or discount offers then they visit offline stores and purchase its online. (Shi, 2016) Buyers carefully buy online as a result of such obstructions as online dangers or security issues. Many researchers claim that risk is a main concern while any person is purchasing online. If any company or an organization satisfied their customers about their privacy or security they can easily survive in today’s market and increase their sales very effectively (Sims, 2012).

China and UK are two developed countries, but when you compare these two nations, China’s economy is three times bigger compared to England. But when you check out the ratio of internet users or online shopping users England’s ratio is much higher than China’s. There are a few motivations to choose the UK and China for correlation: right off the bat, they have altogether different social foundations, China, with its Asian culture, has conventional conviction and qualities which differ from those in a Western
nation. For instance, the UK has a great broadband framework, 74% of UK family used the broadband web associations, and 82% of the populations are internet users. In China the quantity of individuals utilizing broadband was 364 million. At last, Internet clients are keen on web based shopping in both nations. 51.07% of the grown up population of UK had occupied with the web shopping, as compare with China they have just 26% Chinese internet users shopping online. Out of these two developed nations UK internet client of online shopping ratio is much higher than China because China is a typical Asian country and UK is a developed western country. In UK online shopping users ratio increased due to the trust factor, because most of the UK Companies provided better security or privacy to their customers. Due to the better security and privacy UK online shopping ratio is increased day by day as compare with China. (Julian, 2012)

The quantity of internet consumers is expanding, especially in western and Asian nations, be that as it may, analysts have not given adequate consideration to why, how and at the point when purchasers utilize the Internet for their shopping, or why they don't pick on the web shopping. Online customers and offline customers may buy a few items on the web but not others. We must suss out the reasons for why people don’t shop online or why some people just search on web about product specification. After search specification they don’t buy it online (Sims, 2012).

In main concern of shopping online is some factors they have effect directly like trust, refund, culture, privacy, security and discount and offers. Through the four independent variables in our study we will check their impact on internet shopping and how much will be effect it. We will also check indirectly in our research the impact of other factors that can directly affect online shopping. And why in today’s world in 21st century most of the people don’t prefer online shopping.

**Problem Statement**
Due to the existing lack of information on consumer attitude towards and adoption of online shopping in Bahawalpur, where the trend of online shopping is on the rise, this study was conducted using specific variables and dimensions.

**Research Gaps**
Online shopping is becoming trendy in Pakistan as well as in the rest of the world and ratio of online shopping in Pakistan was low in 2018 and in 2019 but in 2020 the ratio of online shopping was quite high. Many consumers rely on online shopping because of their busy schedule of their office and social life.

The basic gap for the study is to check the impact of four independent variables price, promotion, refund and culture. Least study has been carried upon these four variables. No such study has been carried out in the region of Bahawalpur City.

**Research Objectives**
RO1: How price factor is correlated with the consumer Attitude, when shopping online
RO2: How Promotion factor is correlated with the consumer Attitude, when shopping online
RO3: How Culture factor is correlated with the consumer Attitude, when shopping online
RO4: How Refund factor is correlated with the consumer Attitude, when shopping online

**2. Literature Review**
The reason for writing literature review is to review discrimination purposes of variability of information including substantive discoveries and in addition will help shape hypothesis and methodology development. Other than that, writing audits otherwise called supporting sources, it just reporting the past examination and do not reveal any new or unique exploration data.
Researchers are curious to inspect online selling and buying of food and services by employing technologies such as web, electronic mail, electronic fund transfer and electronic data interchange. They have conducted many studies on those factors that link consumer to online shopping (Afizah, 2009). Investigated factors such as demographic profile, familiarity to internet, risk perception, convince, attitude about online shopping, prices of product, product variety, promotion of products, product and service quality, product warranty, product and service cost, social norms, and consumer repurchase attitude due to refunding option in online shopping.

The world’s total online industry is 1.5 trillion dollars and China is on the first number on this list. 7360 million people live in this world and total 2870 million people use internet, and 1200 million peoples are e shoppes. In this world total 160 billion dollars just invest on internet advertisement. This advertisement amount is 3x more than Pakistan’s total budget. In only Europe 487 billion dollar invest on online shopping in a single year and with 450 billion dollars invest on ecommerce in North America. Top online sites in these developed countries are eBay, Amazon, Alibaba.com and Walmart. These four online shopping sites revenue is more then all remaining online sites. (Omar, 2016)

Pakistan total population is 200 million and total internet user almost 60 million in whole country. And total mobile connections is 130 million and total 3G and 4G connection are almost 40 million. Total ecommerce sale is 350 million. In an upcoming years these figures will be increased 70% to 75%. Top online shopping sites in Pakistan are daraz.pk and Ali express. If you compare your ecommerce industry with a neighbouring country like India you can see rapid growth in last few years. The total Per Capita Spend on Ecommerce in India is 11.20$ and it’s 10 time more than Pakistan’s. (Omar, 2016)

According to the examination, 90% of online customers are planning to purchase more items online in which they feel positive experience of the clients. (Bhatt, 2014) Now a days shopping on internet is so difficult because even though internet consumers are faced with too many choices and facilities, most don’t buy due to security and privacy issues. In this study we will find out the reasons, why most of the users still refuse to purchase their product. These type of security and privacy issues you can see only in undeveloped or developing nations because in developed nations consumers are fully satisfied with the product. (Bhatt, 2014) Broad companies like Amazon and eBay have introduced many feature like easy search, all products on a single site, and their consumers all fully satisfied with the security and privacy. And their consumers effectively and cleverly purchase product without visiting any store. After purchase online product, consumer feels the product they purchase on a less price then offering on offline stores and they save time and money also. (Bhatt, 2014)

Consumer perceived risk directly affects the buying decision of the consumers because the latest research suggests that risk perception plays a minor role in online shopping. In developing nations most of the consumers prefer to pay cash on delivery because they are afraid to pay in advance through banking channel. After paying through banking channel they feel exposed to the risk of cybercrimes. (Chen, 2005) Trust is directly proportional to consumer risk because trust reduces the risk perception of the buyer. If the online buyer feel lack of trust on any online site they can’t purchase their product. (Mydheen, 2016) The study shows that 95% of the college students use internet and 91% of the students purchase products online. In all of 91% students ¼ spent 500$ annually on internet purchasing. They purchase tickets, banking services or entertainment products. Teenagers also buy motor cars and mortgages from the internet albeit in lesser figures. Ecommerce market sales increased every year in every country. In Pakistan growth rate of online sales increased every year, in upcoming years researchers feels that online sales market boost by 2X. As per statistics India online shopping market is only 2.5 billion dollar in 2009 and they increased to 8.5 billion dollar in 2012. After a single year in 2013 market rise by 88 per cent and touch the figure of 16 billion dollars and this is the boosting point for Indian online
shopping market. (Bhatt, 2014) In upcoming years researchers feels that these type of rising point for Pakistani online shopping industry.

While shopping online on internet we think about demographics such as gender, education, income and age because every consumer behaviour is different from each other. Online shopping mostly attracts elder and younger consumers because they are mostly attached with online shopping sites through internet. (Bhatt, 2014)

Mega cities of Pakistan like Lahore, Karachi and Islamabad are the hub of IT industry. They are well educated and easily adopt latest technology. They don’t have time to physically visit to offline stores, so most of the consumers prefer to shop online. They confirm their order online, save their traveling expenses and their time. All of the consumers they live in developing countries always prefer paid cash on delivery. (Pullokaran, 2018)

Ecommerce market’s future is very bright because online shopping giving a best way to purchase product on a less price sitting in your home and purchase product with in your range. For example in India, Flipchart is offering best prices for their customers, consumers are fully satisfied and have a better experience with that. The whole idea of online shopping is changed due to his remarkable policies. (Kothari)

Online clients are more satisfied when marketers give importance to them and provide sales discount or provide relief in product prices. In this aggressive time period, online shopping advertisers focus on consumer loyalty to hold their current users and attract new consumers by offering every day new plans and offers for online buyers. Also studies showed that online shopping depended on different factors like product quality, broad variety in products, product offering on different prices, product packaging, payment security, banking channel security and so on.

Online shopping marketers focus on latest technology to attract their customers and add usage value in their mind through internet or social media or other sources. For a better marketing, marketers always make strategies they always meet with consumers demand. For making these type of strategies they study about the consumer behaviour or consumer attitude towards web shopping. Profession, location, age, income, gender and family status are the factors they directly affect the online buying decision. In some researches, researchers found that reduced prices, quick services and product variety are the factors which influence directly online shopping in all over the world. (Rajesh, 2018)

The use of internet increased day by day and they directly influence online shopping. Internet advertisers have created different promoting methodologies to convert their potential online clients into a regular consumers. Online shopping is effected by the consumers perception, five leading factors security and privacy, ease of use, perceived enjoyment, perceived usefulness and information about the online product are the factors they directly effects consumers perception and consumers perception is effected online shopping. (Rajesh, 2018) Online shopping is a way in which buyer and seller improve relationship with each other and reduce administrative cost or save time and money. The Internet and electronic business were the two generally critical improvements in 1990s. There is a remarkable growth in the number of consumers who purchase from the internet, as well as sales are also increased worldwide through online selling. (James, 2015)

2.1 Online Shopping
Internet is one of the several channels or medium for selling and buying goods and service online. Customer can use their credit card information on different websites and make online orders and the products are delivered to them instantly. This is called e-commerce or simply online shopping
Online shopping came into existence because of the internet and has revolutionized the past trade partners. It plays an important role in the circulation of merchandise, capital and the information (Quresh & Sarwar, 2014).

Online shopping has become one of the important activities in the internet and information technology field. From the last few years, ample research has been carried out into adoption of information technology, testing a number of factors observed to be important for improved diffusion. Some information technology analysts characterized it as usefulness, as of use and source (Chiu, 2009) other focus on experience, attitude and emotions of user (Fiore & kim, 2007, 2011)

2.2 Attitude
An ongoing company of motivational, touching, perceptual, and cognitive techniques with admirers to a few factor of a person’s perspective (( Consumer Behaviour, July 2000) In easy conditions, an attitude is the manner we imagine, feel and do something in the direction of a few feature of our surroundings such as an alternate store, television application, or invention. (consumer behaviour, 2000). Numerous researchers have done research in their effort to study the factors influencing client mind-set and belief to make e-trade purchases via online purchasing. Attitudes closer to online purchasing are described as a customer’s high quality or bad emotions associated with undertaking the buying behaviour at the internet (Chiu et al. & Schlosser, 2005, 2003). Buying traits and internet adoption symptoms were visible as the general digital commerce value in Pakistan Growing from many folds quite hastily in Pakistan. Pakistan, despite the fact that a past due entrant to the arena of e-trade, has currently recorded a huge upward push in on-line purchasing developments and different e-trade businesses. Such exponential boom traits during the last few years – with US$30 million being spent on line purchases presently – depict an extraordinarily advantageous photo for the future and the dimensions of Pakistan’s e-trade market is predicted to reach over US$600 million by means of 2017 (Ahmed, 2015).

2.3 Price
Price is one of the crucial factors that affect when consumer buying online. (Sinha, 2001) If the price of the product is high then the consumer does not attract towards online buying. However, (al L. e., 1999) disagree that frequently online buyers are now not price-sensitive, the cause of those purchasers charge comparison among special e-business on every product became time-consuming and the fee distinction was very small. (Dholakia, 2003) Factor out that customers’ preference of buying channels is tormented by the perceived prices related to a selected web site. Online clients evaluate expenses throughout the identical services or products supplied via specific websites on the way to make the only financial choice (al C. e., 2014). Because they cannot usually bear in mind the objective charge of an item, clients generally, tend to encode buy charges in a way this is significant to them.

While there is a sizeable range of web sites from which customers can choose and acquire charge records, they are possibly to make their decision on the idea of perceived fee. Perceived price affects purchaser purchase conduct with the aid of affecting the whole utility of the product presented ((Kim, 2012). (Gupta, 2009) Suggest that purchasers are likely to consider the referral prices supplied by means of different merchants.
H1- There is a positive relationship between the price and online shopping.

2.4 Refund
Online purchasers demanded that e-stores must provide unconditional refund coverage if the web costumer has been no longer satisfied with the product (Lee, 2002). E-stores need to have refund regulations to persuade online purchasers that they without difficulty go back merchandise and get refunds if they may be no longer glad or alternate merchandise without cost inside an affordable time-frame (Bishop, 1998).
H2- There is a positive relationship between the refund and online shopping.
2.5 Promotion
E-outlets would possibly use promotions with time limits to inspire customers to keep on internet site (Haig, 2001). However, promotional activates for online services or products have been no longer a success for e-outlets due to the fact there were no longer powerful approaches to inform purchasers of promotional activities (Spiller, 1999).
H3- There is a positive & significant relationship between the Promotion and online shopping.

2.6 Culture
Culture refers to the increasing deposit of information, skill, thinking, morals, attitudes, meanings, hierarchies, faith, theory of time, roles, spatial relations, concepts of the universe, and material objects and possessions acquired by a cluster of persons in the path of generation from side to side person and cluster determined (Karakowsky, (2001)). Culture is one of the key factors that have an effect on buying of the client. Culture factor contain set of values, belief and the ideology of specific community. Our subculture teaches us that as a purchase we need to make payments in contract or pay on time, and study guidelines and a few responsibilities when in search of information. Every culture split into subculture on the source of age, environmental surroundings, destiny, and gender. (Buzzle.com, n.d.)
H4- There is a positive & significant relationship between the Culture and online shopping.

3. Conceptual Framework

![Conceptual Framework Diagram]

4. Research Methodology
This section discusses the research design, target population, sample size and research instrument and test used for empirical analysis in this study.

4.1 Research Design
A study’s design is the blueprint that outlines every process from the speculation to the evaluation. This study’s nature is explanatory. The outline of a few precise situations or some phenomenon is defined as explanatory research.

Explanatory research is examined planned to reveal the participant in a particular manner. More clearly placed, explanatory studies is all about recounting individuals who participate in the observing (https://study.com, n.d.)
The framework given above is for determining the consumer attitude towards online shopping. This model describes how consumer attitude are change due to the price, culture, promotions and refund.

4.2 Target Population
A population can be defined as including all people or items with the characteristic one wish to understand. Simple random sampling technique was used for population selection whereas simple random sampling techniques was used for population and data collection purpose. Simple random sampling is a sampling in which every person has an equal chance of being selected (Bryman & Bell, 2005). Population refers to the totality of people, events, thing of interest or object (which may be individuals, households, organizations and countries etc.) that researcher wishes to investigate. The study-targeted people are who do online shopping and have had experience of online shopping.

4.3 Data Collection
The research consists on primary data, collected from Bahawalpur. Efforts were made to collect data from both genders. Data was collected from people who buy online. Data was collected from 250 questionnaires. A questionnaire is pre-formulated written set of question to which respondents record their answer usually within rather closely defined alternatives.

4.4 Sampling and Sample Size
A subset of population selected to investigate the properties of the population because population are often extremely large or even infinite. It is usually impossible – for cost and practical reasons – to take measurement on every element of population. The study utilizes a simple random sampling. I have used the simple random sampling technique for data collection through questionnaire from those who are involved in online shopping. I have floated 270 questionnaires out of which 250 garnered responses. This method was adopted to speed up the researcher producer, by obtaining a large number of questionnaires efficiently and effectively. A statistical technique of drawing consultant data by using selecting human beings due to the convenience in their volunteering or choosing units due to their availability or clean access. (http://www.businessdictionary.com, n.d.)

4.5 Research Instruments
This study has collected data by method of self-administrated questionnaire and face-to-face interview. Questionnaire is made up of close-ended questions to find out the approximate accurate customer response.

4.6 Data analysis Technique
The next step was taken to enter, edit and analyse data to filter the measurement scales and guarantee their suitability by using SPSS (16.0) software using explanatory analysis techniques.

4.6 Correlation
The connection between two factors is estimated by relationship investigation. It expresses that the change in one variable is the reason the change in other variable. This test does not only measure the quality of connection between factors but also the course of relationship, whether it is negative or positive. Pearson correlation is the test which is run to measure the relation between variables to check that if there is any correlation between the variables. The result (called correlation coefficient) ranges from+1 to – 1, depicts the strength of relationship and sign with the result portrays the bearing of relationship either positive or negative separately. As expressed by Fidel and Tabachnick (2001), "Bivariate connection estimates the relationship between two

Cease less factors without building up directional causality". 
### Average Online Shopping

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Pearson Correlation</th>
<th>Average Online Shopping</th>
<th>Average price</th>
<th>Average promotion</th>
<th>Average Refund</th>
<th>Average Culture</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.005</td>
<td>.301</td>
<td>.379</td>
<td>.026</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>249</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Average Price

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Pearson Correlation</th>
<th>Average Online Shopping</th>
<th>Average price</th>
<th>Average promotion</th>
<th>Average Refund</th>
<th>Average Culture</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.005</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.861**</td>
<td>.837**</td>
<td>.715**</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>249</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Average promotion

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Pearson Correlation</th>
<th>Average Online Shopping</th>
<th>Average price</th>
<th>Average promotion</th>
<th>Average Refund</th>
<th>Average Culture</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.301</td>
<td>.861**</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.964**</td>
<td>.896**</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>249</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Average Refund

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Pearson Correlation</th>
<th>Average Online Shopping</th>
<th>Average price</th>
<th>Average promotion</th>
<th>Average Refund</th>
<th>Average Culture</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.379</td>
<td>.837**</td>
<td>.964**</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.885**</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>249</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Average Culture

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Pearson Correlation</th>
<th>Average Online Shopping</th>
<th>Average price</th>
<th>Average promotion</th>
<th>Average Refund</th>
<th>Average Culture</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.141*</td>
<td>.715**</td>
<td>.896**</td>
<td>.885**</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>249</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).

**Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed)**

### 4.7 Interpretation

Condensed aftereffects of coefficient relationship are given in the above table. A large portion of the qualities are noteworthy at 0.000 or under 0.05. The factor between which there is no noteworthy relationship are price with a value 0.939 which is more than 0.05. This means that price and online shopping have non-significant relationship hence the relationship between price and online shopping is non-significant. This means that when the price of a product in increased then the shopping is decreased.

The correlation between online shopping and promotion is significant with the value of 0.000 which is less than 0.05 hence the relationship between promotion and online shopping is significant. The Pearson correlation value is 0.301 which means that the correlation between promotion and online shopping is positively moderate. It means that when the promotion of a product is increased then the online sales are also increased.

The correlation between online shopping and Refund is significant with the value of 0.000 which is less than 0.05 hence the relationship between promotion and online shopping is significant. The Pearson correlation value is 0.379 which means that the correlation between refund and online shopping is positive. And it has a moderately weak relationship with each other. It means that when a customer buy a product and find any defect in that product and want to return it, and the company website offers the facility of refund then the online sales are also be increased. Because the customers don’t have to pay for the defective product.

The correlation between online shopping and culture is significant with the value of 0.026 which is less than 0.05 hence the relationship between promotion and online shopping is significant. The Pearson correlation value is 0.141 which means that the correlation between culture and online shopping is positively weak. It means that when the culture of the customer is changed to the higher level than online sales are also increased. Because usually it is seen that the people from villages of background areas don’t have the facility of online shopping.

### Regression Analysis
### Coefficients

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Std. Error</td>
<td>Beta</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>2.435</td>
<td>.306</td>
<td>7.959</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Average price</td>
<td>.236</td>
<td>.139</td>
<td>.207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Average promotion</td>
<td>-1.211</td>
<td>.254</td>
<td>-1.273</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Average Refund</td>
<td>.090</td>
<td>.039</td>
<td>.129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Average Culture</td>
<td>.860</td>
<td>.158</td>
<td>.768</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*a. Dependent Variable: Average Online Shopping*

### Interpretation

The 1st hypothesis that the significance value is .090 which is greater than 0.05. As we know that the significance value should be less than 0.05. If this situation occurs, then the hypothesis is accepted. But in our situation the significance value is greater. Hence it is not significant and our hypothesis is rejected which means that price don’t have the positive relationship with the online shopping. It means that when the price of products on online websites is increased then the sales on those sites is decreased.

The 2nd hypothesis that the significance value is 0.000 which is less than 0.05. So our hypothesis is accepted and it is said that if the promotions are increased then the sales on online websites is also increased. Similar studies discuss about the promotion of the products, like in Invalid source specified. It is stated that the promotions and the online shopping are significant.

The 3rd hypothesis that the significance value is 0.021 which is less than 0.05. So our hypothesis is accepted and it is said that if the refund policy is good then the sales will be also good on online websites.

The 4th hypothesis that the significance value is 0.000 which is less than 0.05. So our hypothesis is accepted and it is said that if the culture is changed positively or negatively then the sales are also effected respectively.

### 5. Conclusion

Internet is a useful medium for buying goods and services online. Customer can be made aware of goods and services through promotions, place their orders and those products are delivered in a timely manner. This is called ‘E-Commerce’ or simply online shopping. Companies can develop consumer attitude through promotion, refund and pricing strategies.
There are more than 10 million users of internet in Pakistan and this number is growing. A lot of internet users focus on promotion that is on social media from the company. The social networking websites also provide platform to attract customers from different pricing strategies and promotion and money back guarantee on different product. Culture plays vital role while shopping online. Price, promotion, refund and culture directly affect consumer’s attitude and change the buying behaviour of consumer.

This research addressed the gap in the literature on the relationship of price, promotion, refund and culture. As the primary aim of the study was to find out the factor-affecting attitude of consumer towards online shopping it started with an extensive review of the literature based on which hypothesis construct and relationships under examination were set out. Through fieldwork appropriate data was collected. The study used simple random sampling technique. It employed a survey strategy that used structured questionnaire to collect data. Finally statistical techniques, reliability of scale, regression analysis, and frequency test employed these were used in a confirmatory manner to seek answers establishing causality. Hence, all factor chosen supposed to affecting the consumer attitude towards online shopping. As per analysis, there is no multi collinearity in indicators.

According to my findings, Online Shopping is getting popularity in the young generation such as students and professionals. Students usually prefers to buy goods from the original source and they mostly prefer online shopping.

6. Research Limitations
The scope of the present research is limited. The first limitation is the population selected was only from Bahawalpur, Pakistan and that does not cover the population of whole country especially from the big cities where online shopping is all the rage. The results will definitely be varied if the research is conducted in the whole country. Time constraint along with the financial constraint is the second limitation of this research.

The main hurdle faced by the researcher is the inaccessibility of articles as well as books from library. Internet is not included in the review due to Refunding factor and hence the inaccessibility of the resources that is the third limitation of this study.

Another major limitation of this study is the cooperation of participants and honesty in answering the questions. In spite of these limitations, there’s hope that this research will be of considerable worth to the research stream of consumer attitude towards online shopping.

7. Future Research
This research has been done by taking four independent variable price, promotion refund and culture on dependent variable online shopping. There are many other ways to conduct the research like by taking into account things like website development, time saving and trust to check the impact on consumer attitude towards online shopping. Furthermore, this research can be conducted by taking price, promotion refund and culture independent variable, and also check the impact of attitude on online shopping with online shopping as the dependent variable.

This research has been done under certain limitations that can be removed in future research to get the more concrete results. Next time the population of whole Pakistan with more sample size can give results that are more valid. More time and sufficient financial resources are one of the major sources that can help to get better results. The access of wide range of books, articles and research papers are the basis of making strong background and literature review of the research.

References
Attitude towards Green Consumption among College and University Students in Bahawalpur Pakistan

1 Asma Fazal

1 The Islamia University of Bahawalpur Pakistan asmafazal397@gmail.com

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

Green consumption is using goods and services to fulfill needs, adopting a better lifestyle while decreasing the consumption of natural assets, unhealthy material and outflow of waste and impurities in daily lives to save the environment for future generations. The main objective was to identify the impact of Green Attitude on green purchase intention and green purchase behavior along with sub variables. The study was conducted in the area of South Punjab, Pakistan in which the students were taken as consumers to find out if the consumer attitude has any impact on green purchase intention and green purchase behavior. The population of the study was students enrolled in colleges and universities of South Punjab Pakistan which includes the levels of study intermediate, graduation, masters, MPhil and PhD with the sample of 250. SPSS software was used to interpret the collecting data to draw results. This study has limited data, limited time, limited and limited sources, limited population, due to which results of this study may not be generalizable to other population or place. The conclusion of the study was that there is a positive impact of Attitude on Green Purchase Intention and Green Purchase Intention and there is positive and slightly strong relationship between the independent and dependent variables.

© 2019 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: asmafazal397@gmail.com


DOI: 10.26710/sbsee.v1i1.1004

1. Introduction

The business landscape has changed drastically in the past years. Credit goes to the rise of capitalism many people attribute their self-worth with money and how much stuff they can buy with said money. The more people buy, the more they consume. Consumption of these services and goods is massive which feeds the constant cycle of demand and supply. Not all the products we use are environmentally or
socially friendly, for example, cigarettes which are detrimental to both, the human health and your surroundings. This is where the practice of sustainable consumption comes in. What is sustainable consumption? It is the procedure of consuming green services and products which have minimal impact on the environment, beneficial for human health, and do not destroy the natural ecosystem. By observing early literature we can say those who are interested in preserving the environment will apparently purchase the products which are not unsafe for the environment. This can be referred to as green consumption (Sreen, Purbey, & Sadarangani, 2018). Consumers can cause an increase and decrease in the demand and supply of products in the market.

According to Fien, et al.(2008) humans have used more natural material than in the past fifty years which is the most used in human history ever which is clearly unsustainable. That is why consumption is decisive in our survival (Fien et al., 2008). According to postmodern theories, consumption determines the lifestyle and culture. Different measures of consumption make consumers form new groups. For example, an environmentally conscious consumer does not act similar to a non-conscious one (Haanpää, 2007).


Sustainable consumption belongs to youth culture for historical causes. Young people and consumers had a key role in establishment of green consumerism in the international and national settings. For example, serious choices considered as ‘green lifestyles’ emerged as youth social behavior movements (Autio & Heinonen, 2004). According to a researcher, Ward (1974, p. 2) issued a paper in which he presented that there are issues that are necessary to get the knowledge about consumer socialization performances. These issues are: (1) how kids develop consumer skills, knowledge and attitudes, (2) on which these socialization processes contain and (3) how initial learning forms later thinking and opinion regarding green consumption (Promotosh, 2011).

Afridi Jan (2010) stated that in Pakistan the chances of our ecosystem getting damaged are increasing which is carrying over 160 million people, and our lack of resources on account of climate change has made the issue of green consumption more difficult. Before the Earth Summit in 1992 Pakistan was among the first few countries to prepare National Conservation Strategy (NCS) in the world. We also brought out early, among other countries, our National Environment Policy, National Energy Conservation, the policy National Sanitation and policy related to drinking clean water (“884Pakistan.pdf,” n.d.).

Examining why green values do not affect the people while making purchase decisions when it comes to actual purchasing a product is needed to understand and create a difference in consumer buying actions towards sustainable consumption.

**Problem Statement**

Day by day increasing amounts of pollution and the damages made by traditional production methods have made it necessary to be environmentally conscious (Shaikh, 2019). The solid waste rate in Pakistan is 48 tons per year generated from metropolitan areas, which is rising by 2% annually. In Pakistan waste is produced more than the resources to cope with it. In Punjab, only in Lahore is there a proper waste management system which has been outsourced from Turkish companies (Iqbal, 2019).
We want to examine the consumer’s attitude regarding the consumption of harmless (to environment) products and what are other factors affecting the attitudes of people and what impact it can cause on purchasing intention and purchasing behavior when it comes to sustainability. Consequences of the solution of this problem will make us aware of the attitudes of people towards green consumption what affects their green purchasing intentions and behaviors so we can make future preparations accordingly.

The current problem is the difference between the green buying intentions and green buying behaviors. Despite the willingness to preserve the environment people do not end up buying green products if they are pricey than non green products.

Research Gaps
There are two gaps in the study, theoretical gap and contextual gap, the theoretical gap in the literature is the attitude behavior gap by combining the Theory of Planned Behavior (TPB) and Pro-environmental Planned Behavior (PEPB) Model along with more variables like Long Term Orientation Collectivism and Man Nature Orientation with moderating role of Gender. We are using these 2 models to find out about consumers’ attitude towards green consumption and its influence on purchasing intentions and purchasing behaviors of green buyers.

We conducted this research in the area of South Punjab, Pakistan. Before this, in South Punjab, there is no research conducted in this area related to examining consumer attitude towards green consumption which depicts consumers’ green purchase intention and green purchase behavior. This study tends to fill this gap by finding out the collective perception of young consumers’ who are currently studying in colleges and universities about green consumption.

Research Objectives
- To investigate consumers’ Attitude towards Green Consumption.
- To investigate the impact of consumers’ attitude towards green purchase intention.
- To investigate the impact of consumers’ attitude towards green purchase behavior.
- To investigate the association between green purchase intention and green purchase behavior.

2. Literature Review
2.1 Attitude towards Green Consumption
Generally speaking, environmental activists believe that by buying environmental friendly products or that their packaging can be recycled, products that can be properly disposed of with non-biodegradable garbage, consumers can come up with the contribution to their environment slightly and significantly to make this world a better place (Abdul-Muhmin, 2007). Arli et al. (2018) represented the findings of Hansla et al. (2008) in his study that consumers’ are more ready to pay for green electricity with a massive demand. Similarly, he unfolded the same findings regarding Barber et al. (2010) for environmentally-friendly wines, and stated about green-hotel, many studies illustrated that intention of buying green products is positively influenced by attitude(Arli, Tan, Tjiptono, & Yang, 2018). A study was conducted to check household attitudes and judgment about recycling old products and discussed problems of recycling goods can turn responses into high material recycling levels. Results specified that households recycle in the first place to protect their surroundings but do not continue if there is inconvenience or time constraint. This was the largest barrier to recycling according to this study (Ramayah, Lee, & Mohamad, 2010).

2.2 Green Purchase Intention
By studying the previous studies of green consumer intention, researchers aim is to understand the motivation behind purchasing environmentally friendly goods (Y. C. Huang, Yang, & Wang, 2014). In previous marketing related studies purchasing intention has been a significant notion to estimate the modification of new products and services and also repetition of old existing products, most marketers use
consumers purchase intention to predict their demands. Prior studies have illustrated that, consumers who have intention to buy tend to display greater actual buying rates as compared to the customers who do not intend to buy at all (Brown, Pope, & Voges, 2003). Rizwan et al. (2017) stated in his study that the human beings with the attribute of external locus of control the entire time, assume that external conditions and reasons for their failures (poor fortune, no job are because of bad monetary situations and God’s force). Therefore, in his study he anticipated that individuals with the trait of external locus of control have not as much control over ecological affairs, and relatively, have lesser ecological buying intentions (Am M A D Rizwan, Mm A D Ha Ssa N, Wa N Qa I Ser Dan I Sh, & Ri, 2017).

2.3 Green Purchase Behavior
The correlation of green attitudes and similar behavior keeps changing, and depends on study of interest (Moser, 2015). The society and public are now more conscious and taking notice about environmental pollution which is caused by manufacturing and corresponding industries activities (Rizwan et al., 2013).

In literature, while searching for different indicators of buying green, many studies were carried out in developing countries like India, Taiwan, Malaysia, Brazil, Indonesia, and China. In the developed countries, most studies observed the highest rate of green purchases in the US (Liobikiene, Mandravickaite, & Bernatoniene, 2016). Cornelissen et al. (2008) stated, according to Straughan, R. D. and Roberts, J. A. (1999) an individual with favorable environmental behavior will possibly buy more sustainability supported products and services even on high rates more often, as this positivity indicates that a person’s actions towards environment will enhance the chances that he will go for ecological products more frequently (Cornelissen, Pandelaere, Warlop, & Dewitte, 2008).

2.4 Environmental Attitude and Green Purchase Intention
Behavioral intentions indicate a person’s personalized possibility of being involved in activities, which can get affected by the point of views about getting involved in that specific behavior (Nam, Dong, & Lee, 2017). Paul et al. (2016) further depicted that attitude has a straight and implicit capability to affect ecological concern and green behavioral intention, concluded that attitude plays a significant role which can mediate among the intentions of green purchasing and other variables (Paul et al., 2016).

Researchers like Paul (2016) also showed that there is constructive linkage between attitude regarding green products and green purchase intentions. Most of the studies reported that attitudes have an encouraging influence on green consumption and green buying intention.

H (1): For sustainable consumption, attitude has positive impact on the green purchase intention

2.5 Green Purchase Intention and Green Purchase Behavior
Yadav et al. (2017) in his experiment showed supported that the association between purchasing behavioral intentions and green buying behavior is quite positive (Yadav & Pathak, 2017). Chaudhry & Bisai stated that Green purchase behavior was said to be related positively with green purchase intention in studies from different areas across the globe in many areas of green goods and services just like unrefined food products, green lodging, beverages and tourism (Chaudhary & Bisai, 2018). Harun et al. (2012) stated that Chan and Lau (2000) designed a conceptual model which was about man nature orientation, green purchase intention, environmental concern and environmental knowledge. The result of the study was that real buying behavior was extremely relied on one person’s green purchase intention and the representation was supported by TRA theory and TPB theory discovered by Azjen and Fishbein (1980; 1991) (Aman, Harun, Hussein, & Author, 2012).

H (2): For sustainable consumption, green purchase intention has a positive impact on green purchase behavior.

2.6 Subjective Norms
Defranc et al., (2008) stated that according to Ajzen (1991) Subjective Norm is considered to be a societal aspect in nature (Defranc et al., 2008). Subjective norms cite that what an individual thinks how other people perceive them (those who are related or known to the individual) would like them to indulge in a specific behavior in a given situation. So, according to subjective norms we can say that people behave with the opinion of significant others (Yadav & Pathak, 2017). Subjective norms disclose the level to which a person thinks morally accountable for others by purchasing green products and how significant the positive social image is for them (Barber, Bishop, & Gruen, 2014).

2.7 Subjective Norms and Green Purchase Intention

Previous literature has argued that subjective Norms are the main indicator of Purchase Intention (Sreen et al., 2018). According to Mufidah et al. (2018) the consumers were expected to get influenced by social groups through social pressure, and prefer eco-label products. If the society supports people to use green products then consumers will consume more green products. It was proved that Subjective norms have a positive impact on buying intention which checks the environment total impact and assess their participation and green purchasing behavior (Mufidah et al., 2018). In some cases, the consideration of subjective norms has not proven to be sufficient to forecast the behavior of human beings (Tommasetti, Singer, Troisi, & Maione, 2018).

H (3): For sustainable consumption, subjective norms have a positive impact on the green purchase intention.

2.8 Perceived Behavior Control

Kumar, (2012) presented that Jager (2000) narrated that consumer purchasing decision contains many different and connected parts and at time many circumstance factors among which perceived behavioral control is one, it helps attitude to make a decision (Kumar, 2012). As mentioned in the TPB theory, PBC is related to the results of a person's previous first hand experiences and problems occurred during the experience that decides the level of the person's perception concerning how simple or hard is to carry out a behavior (Vantamay, 2018). It revolve perception concerning approach to what resources and how many chances are required to perform the behavior, which includes more finances, time, and other facilities, and individuals’ own self confidence in his capability to conduct the behavior (Gangwal & Bansal, 2016).

2.9 Perceived Behavior Control and Green Purchase Intention

PBC is not only a strong factor that influences attitude to change behavior, but it is also silently believed that it is regarded as a significant resource for decision making (Ajzen & Madden, 1986). The more power and opportunities people think they control, and very less barriers or disadvantages they assume, the greater should be their perceived power over the behavior (Ajzen & Madden, 1986). Nam et al. (2017) narrated that Roberts (1996) also described that purchase intention and attitude can also get positively influenced by perceived behavior control (Nam et al., 2017). Degree of difficulty and ease depends on accessibility to a product, in which place to locate it and how they will obtain that product for consumption. If an environmentally friendly product is not available it may constitute a restriction for a highly motivated consumer (Kumar, 2012).

H (4): For sustainable consumption, perceived behavior control has a positive impact on the green purchase intention.

2.10 Perceived Environmental Concern

Aman et al. (2012) portrayed that Masud et al. (2003) elaborated that environmental concern is a belief, an attitude and the level of concern a person has for the environment (Aman et al., 2012). Pollard et al. (1999) further depicted environmental concern as the awareness and realization of consumers to the fact that the environment is in risk and inherent assets are restricted in size (Pollard et al., 1999). Another researcher depicted that according to Maloney et al. (1975) environmental concern is related to how much an individual is emotional about his environmental problems (Chan, Chan, & Lau, 2017).
2.11 Relationship with Attitude, Subjective Norms and Perceived Behavior Control
Bamberg (2003) argued about the environmental concern that it does not have that much influence on green perceived behavior control (Bamberg Sebastian, 2003). While Aman et al. (2012) presented that environmental concern plays a very important role when it comes to influence the consumer’s ecological buying intention. Attitudes tend to mediate the relationship between green purchase intention and environmental concern (Aman et al., 2012). Another study presented that green concerns indirectly influence specific behavior through when they create an effect on the generation and the way they evaluate the situation-specific norms in relation to the decision how they get information about these green products and the suppliers of these products (Cherian & Jacob, 2012).

H (5): For sustainable consumption, perceived environmental concern has a positive impact on attitude.
H (6): For sustainable consumption, perceived environmental concern has a positive impact on subjective norms.
H (7): For sustainable consumption, perceived environmental concern has a positive impact on perceived behavior control.

2.12 Perceived Authority Support
Perceived authority support is what a person thinks about how much support an authorized party or agency can provide them when it comes to conducting a behavior by an individual to social problems. The authority can be held by the government, any institute or any organization (Mufidah et al., 2018). The eco-label program conducted by the government is expected to create an impact on the consumer’s priority towards the eco label products. If the government conducts these programs efficiently, people will be more motivated to purchase the eco-label products (Tommasetti et al., 2018).

2.13 Relationship with Attitude, Subjective Norms and Perceived Behavior Control
A study carried out in Indonesia, proved that PAS tend to have a positive impact on Subjective Norms, Attitude, PBC, and PEC for environmental impact assessment participation (Lin, Nadlifatin, Amna, Persada, & Razif, 2017). Another study held in Taiwan also proposed that the perceived authority support positively influences attitude, subjective norms, and perceived behavior control in the eco-label product usage (Mufidah et al., 2018).

H (8): For sustainable consumption, perceived authority support has a positive impact on attitude.
H (9): For sustainable consumption, perceived authority support has a positive impact on subjective norms.
H (10): For sustainable consumption, perceived authority support has a positive impact on perceived behavior control.

2.14 Collectivism
Collectivism is a person’s quality in which an individual prioritizes others' benefits and advantages rather than his own personal benefits and makes an action which is harmful to the climate (McCarty & Shrum, 2003). Specifically, collectivistic people tend to care more about recycling unlike individualistic because they prefer more to work in collaboration, care more for their people, and publicly they are in the favor group instead of personal opinions and values and these people are pillars of the group (Tommasetti et al., 2018).

2.15 Relationship with Attitude, Subjective Norms and Perceived Behavior Control
According to Rizwan et al. (2017), Kim (2005) found a positive power of collectivism on consumers’ standards of behaviors about their recycling behavior Therefore, it can be said that the collectivists may show high tendency towards buying green products (Am M A D Ri Z Wa N et al., 2017). Based on the theories related to value, attitude and behavior hierarchy, two researchers Homer & Kahle have explained the remarkable influence of a man’s basic beliefs of collectivism on how their recycling behavior is, with the help of attitude as mediating variable toward recycling (Chan et al., 2017). As stated by Aswal (2017). Handique, (2014), on the other hand, suggests people with collectivist nature tend to keep
traditional ideas, stay inflexible in modifying their behaviors and intentions, which therefore shows that collectivism can also negatively influence the green purchase intention (Aswal, 2017). Another study found that a collectivistic person’s basic beliefs are positively related with sustainable environmental purchase behavior (Tommasetti et al., 2018).

H (11): For sustainable consumption, collectivism has a positive impact on attitude.
H (12): For sustainable consumption, collectivism has a positive impact on subjective norms.
H (13): For sustainable consumption, collectivism has a positive impact on perceived behavior control.

2.16 Man Nature Orientation
Man-nature orientation is elaborated as a capability of people to survive in consonance with the natural environment (Kluckhohn & Strodtbeck, 1961). Man-nature orientation can be described as connection that a man shares with his environment. Man nature orientation level is low in the societies who think they can conquer nature, while, the societies in which man nature orientation level is high, have a direct relation with attitude regarding ecological consumption and they live more healthy lives than those who have low level (Sreen et al., 2018).

2.17 Relationship with Attitude, Subjective Norms and Perceived Behavior Control
Wijaya (2009) in India found out that there is a direct relation between Attitude and Man-Nature Orientation and attitude. Most people in India bow before various kinds of nature like trees, different rocks and animals so, one may conclude that man nature orientation is high there and expected to live in a sound environment (Wijaya, 2017). Man-Nature Orientation is directly associated with the Attitude regarding green consumption while on green purchase intention it creates an indirect impact (Sreen et al., 2018). There is no or less literature in Pakistan related to analyzing the correlation of man-nature orientation and green purchase intention. Also, in the universal circumstance there are very few experiments in the literature that describe the rapport of man nature orientation with green purchase intention, green purchase behavior and attitude.

H (14): For sustainable consumption, man nature orientation has a positive impact on attitude.
H (15): For sustainable consumption, man nature orientation has a positive impact on subjective norms.
H (16): For sustainable consumption, man nature orientation has a positive impact on perceived behavior control.

2.19 Long Term Orientation
Long-term orientation is related to how a person perceives that where a society will stand while in a position while fighting with its current long term problems in the future (Leonidou, Leonidou, & Kvasova, 2010). Long term orientation is the encouraging development of intrinsic worth placed to get potential benefits, in particular, protection, carefully using the resources and non materialism (Sharma, 2010).

2.20 Relationship with Attitude, Subjective Norms and Perceived Behavior Control
Research by Leonidou et al. (2010) proved that people who have long-term oriented nature tend to be more optimistic about sustainable consumption and have a positive attitude because these products will proved benefits in the future (Leonidou et al., 2010). Other previous researches have shown the same that if a person is long term oriented by nature he/she will have a positive attitude towards sustainable ecological products (Sreen et al., 2018). According to Nguyen (2017), some pragmatic studies have verified that consumers with long term orientation identify the high environmental impact of cars when it comes to environmental protection and that they generally show a great concern and attitude toward the environmental protection (Nguyen, Lobo, & Greenland, 2017).

H (17): For sustainable consumption, long term orientation has a positive impact on attitude.
H (18): For sustainable consumption, long term orientation has a positive impact on subjective norms.
H (19): For sustainable consumption, long term orientation has a positive impact on perceived behavior control.
2.21 Green Consumption in Pakistan
Like other developing countries, Pakistan is also in its early period of development. That is why to perceive the relationship between attitude regarding green purchase and green buying intention, and to find out the factors through which we can meet the space between green purchase intention and green buying behavior, there is still need of moderating and mediating variables which may present the different angles of attitude (Ali, 2016). A researcher brought out the result of his research that Green purchasing intention of consumers in Islamabad people are concerned about environmental problems and they do not only support the idea of sustainable consumption but also go for ecological products when they have to do actual purchasing of products which means people who have intention of purchasing these products they will buy even if they have to pay premium as compared to the people who have little concern (Ali, Khan, Ahmed, & Shahzad, 2011). Rizwan et al. (2013) carried out the result of their study which was aimed to study what is the sustainability practices carried out by the owners of hotels in Pakistan. The result suggested that most of the sample hotels using sustainability as a business strategy and a proper systematic application in sustainability is missing and all their efforts are on growing the goodwill of the company by promising to reduce environmental problems through marketing campaigns and increasing commercial performance whereas, very few of them were executed that too only when needed (Rizwan et al., 2013). Another research was conducted in some departments of Punjab University of Lahore, to examine the relationship between green purchase intentions of consumers and man nature orientation, environmental concern, social image and self image. The researchers concluded that there is no direct link among environmental concern and green purchase intention and neither does it have any positive or negative impact on it (Zia-ur-Rehman & Dost, 2013).

3. Conceptual Framework

![Conceptual Framework Diagram](Image)

Fig. 1 Proposed Research Framework

4. Methodology
4.1 Research Design
Researchers believe that for investigating the social behaviors, quantitative research design is mostly used and appropriate (Memar & Ahmed, 2012). In this study, the research design we used is explanatory in nature because it investigates the problem after identification related to green consumption and it gives the cause to the relationship of independent and dependent variables. Explanatory study is quantitative in nature (checking the nature of objective theories by thoroughly investigating what impact a variable
causes to another variable). In order to be able to analyze all the hypotheses and conclude what factors affect the green buying behavior to answer the research questions which are considered to be social behavior, and the research method being used is quantitative in nature.

A deductive approach has been used throughout the research in which theories were developed first and made some tentative assumptions in the form of hypothesis, collected and analyzed data and accepted or rejected hypothesis based on that statistical and empirical analysis. Then, the study has shown solid developed theory. Statistical approach has also been used to dig out the correlation between variables by SPSS software.

4.2 Survey Instrument
The questionnaire used for this study was adapted and a survey method has been applied to collect data in which closed ended questions were asked from the concerned population. In questionnaire a five point Likert scale was used which includes 1 for strongly Disagree to 5 for strongly Agree. The questionnaires got filled by meeting respondents in person.

The questionnaire is divided into three sections. The opening portion of the questionnaire gives some basic insights of the topic like what it is. The next part gathers demographic information about the respondent such as, gender, age and nature of their institution. In the third section, different questions related to the variables and the different dimensions of those variables have been asked.

4.3 Population and sample size
The sample size of the study should be satisfactory so that we can use it to conclude prudent results out of it. The population of this research is the young students between the age of 16 and 38 years old studying in universities and colleges of South Punjab, Pakistan. As there are many colleges and universities in South Punjab so the unit of analysis we chose students from particular colleges and universities as a sample for our study. The size selected as a sample of our research is 250 and questionnaires were distributed among young students regardless of their gender.

4.4 Sampling Technique
Sampling technique plays an important role in collecting adequate data for the research. In this study Simple Random Sampling technique has been (probability method of sampling) adopted to get data from population. This means each one in the population has the equal chance of being chosen as a sample. The advantage of random sampling includes, it requires less expertise to choose a respondent. The following table shows the details of demographic details of respondent taken for the study.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table No. 1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Metrics</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16-22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23-28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29-32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33-38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education Level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intermediate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Masters</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5. Result and Data Analysis

5.1 Correlation analysis

### Table No. 2:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>A_avg</th>
<th>GPI_avg</th>
<th>GPB_avg</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>A_avg</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.747**</td>
<td>.665**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>248</td>
<td>247</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>GPI_avg</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>.747**</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.714**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>247</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>GPB_avg</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>.665**</td>
<td>.714**</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>246</td>
<td>247</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).**

In statistics, this evaluation method is a tool to calculate the strength of relationship between independent and dependent variables. This is used when the analyst wants to estimate if there is a possibility of correlation between two or more variables. As shown in the table the Pearson values of variables are 0.747 and 0.665 which signifies that the relationship between the main dependent and independent variables is positive and the strength of the relationship is average. Similarly, the relationship among other sub variables is also positive and moderately strong.

5.2 Regression Analysis

Regression analysis is used to observe the impact of independent variables on dependent variables. This test also tells how much changes one variable brings to another variable. To measure the influence of multiple factors all at one time multiple linear regression analysis is used by most researchers. In our study we will also be using this technique in SPSS software.

According to the result of regression analysis, hypothesis H1 “green purchase intention has positive impact on green purchase behavior” is accepted. Similarly, here the hypothesis H2: “Attitude has positive impact on GPI” is accepted. The significance value of SN is also the same so this hypothesis H3: “SN has positive Impact on GPI is also accepted. The hypothesis H4 is rejected because according to statistical analysis there is no impact of PBC on GPI. The impact of sub variables on the other variables the null hypotheses H6, H9, H10, H11, H12, H13, H14, H17, h19 are accepted and the hypotheses H5 H7, H8,
H15, H16, H18 fits the criteria of being rejected as they were failed to find any impact on the other variable.

6. Conclusion and Findings
By applying the correlation and regression analysis we came to know the result of our key questions also known as research objectives that all the dependent and independent variables used in this study are positively correlated with each and the relationship is slightly strong. According to the finding of this study the impact of attitude on green purchase intention and green purchase behavior is positive which denotes that if the attitude is positive towards green consumption the intention and behavior will also be positive. Moving on to the impact of sub IVs on dependent variables, the sub independent variables like MNO, PAS, PEC, collectivism, LTO has positive impact on some variables and on some variables it has negative impact, while PAS was failed to find any impact on Attitude which means people in Pakistan do not think the government of Pakistan has done anything for green consumption promote green consumption practices.

7. Future Recommendation
The future researchers can use more variables like green awareness, consumer skepticism, green marketing. The future researchers can also use different theories related to human behavior according to the nature of their variables. This study was limited to the area of South Punjab; in the future more studies can be conducted on national and even international level. In this study we assumed the student as the only actual consumers, so if in the future if the researchers use the general public as population the result will be different and more close to reality. The researchers in the future could narrow down the topic of sustainability like green printers, green energy, recycling, reduction of plastic use as this issue is gaining a lot of attention these days and people are worried about the fact that plastic is non degradable synthetic material which is increasing day by day, and green clothing etc. Apart from the general public, further studies can be conducted in different sectors just like hospitals since the hospitals produce waste and dirty material, food sector, clothing etc. Different sampling methods can be used in the future research which can represent the whole population adequately. The enhanced sample size could be used for better outcomes. Last but not least, we used the span of 6 months, whereas in the future a longer time span can be used.

8. Limitations of the study
In this research we have several following limitations:
- The use of college and university students in the sample which limits our understanding of the customer mindset regarding this phenomenon.
- We have considered green consumption in general instead of narrowing it down to the specifics for if that had been the case; the findings would have been different for different products.
- The sampling method of random sampling method can also be considered a possible limitation because the respondent we are choosing on random basis may not be reliable. So in future other sampling methods should be chosen which can represent the whole population.
- Due to time limitation we conducted this study only in South Punjab. Future studies can extend the area of analysis on the national level and can also extend the context of the research among various sectors of the country.

References


Kumar, B. (2012). 10260621182012-12-08.


Credit Risk Oracle: The Bifocal Approach

1 Areeba Khan, 2 Zulaiha A. Zubair, 3 Erum Fayyaz, 4 Iffat Hussain

1 The Islamia University of Bahawalpur, areeba.khan@iub.edu.pk
2 Federal University Dutsinma, Katsina State Nigeria, aibrz373@gmail.com
3 The Islamia University of Bahawalpur, erummf2015@gmail.com
4 The Islamia University of Bahawalpur, iffat.hussain.550@gmail.com

**ARTICLE DETAILS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>History</th>
<th>ABSTRACT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Revised format: May 2019</td>
<td>Financial This study aims to examine the macroeconomic and bank specific predictors of Credit Risk (NPL) and their relevant degree of impact on banks in Pakistan. For bank variables a sample of big 10 banks has been taken from 2009 to 2018. For macro-economic variables sample of 2009 to 2018 has been taken from the world bank. As financial institutions play their role to support industries and alleviate poverty in a country, this study checks the effect of banking variables as well as the economic variables on the credit risk of banks by taking industrial sector growth as a moderator. The study found that NPLs are negatively associated with Lending interest rate, Bank investment, Capital adequacy ratio, Domestic credit to private sector, Financial depth and GDP growth while positively associated with Lending capability, Return on equity, Interest spread and Liquidity Ratio. The moderation effect of Industrial sector growth on the relationship of Lending Capability and NPLs is found to be strengthening the relationship.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Available Online: June 2019</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Keywords**

Credit Risk, Non-Performing Loans, Macro-Economic, Bank Specific, Industrial Sector Growth

**JEL Classification:**

E51, E59, H81, H89

© 2019 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: areeba.khan@iub.edu.pk


DOI: 10.26710/sbsee.v1i1.999

1. Review of Literature

During the last decade, the previous studies on credit risk or NPLs has elevated speedily on the variables that could be a reason for financial crisis as an outcome of the treble of NPLs, which is commonly associated with bank failures and economic crises in both developing and developed countries (Mehmood, Hidthiir, & Nor, 2019). The credit quality of loan portfolios across most countries in the world have been unstable since the global financial crisis (GFC) in 2007–2008 and therefore the bank asset quality has deteriorated sharply over the years (Kjosevski & Petkovski, 2016).

There was a significant increase witnessed in the credit growth provided by the financial institutions (Cingolani, 2013). This growth is because of the non-intervention of regulatory body in the financial markets as well as the emergence of information technologies in the banking industry, that has led to the
cultivation of financial intermediation. Additionally, the deregulation has increased the competition among the banks and financial institutions in European and other markets. Increased credit risk of bank, the literature suggests, is because of the loan portfolios that are advanced by dissatisfactory screening of loans and relaxed borrowing criteria (Jeong & Jung, 2013). Makri & Tsagkanos, (2019) have found two major shortcomings in most of the studies. Firstly there is more emphasis given on the macro economic variables as compared to bank related indicators. Secondly, there is no exertion to avoid the constructural changes of Global financial crisis.

NPL is one of the most common indicators through which credit risk can be identified. Non-performing loans (NPL) increased significantly in Pakistan since 2008 when the financial crisis began globally. According to the researchers and the analyst, the forthcoming year will bring the increase in NPLs to the extreme point which will affect the banks' profitability and liquidity, and banking systems' financial stability.

Table 1: Non-Performing Loans of Pakistan as the percentage of GDP

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NPL's</td>
<td>22.0</td>
<td>17.0</td>
<td>12.0</td>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>7.6</td>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>12.6</td>
<td>14.7</td>
<td>15.7</td>
<td>14.6</td>
<td>13.3</td>
<td>12.3</td>
<td>11.4</td>
<td>10.1</td>
<td>8.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Asian Development Bank

1.1 Problem Statement

Financial crises are not a new marvel in less developed nations (emerging markets), but they have grown more common, and the financial flows involved have become loftier and more explosive in the past 20 years (Eichengreen et al., 1998). This passé corresponds generally with the era of "economic opening" in emerging markets, a time when most of the Latin American countries, the former Soviet republics, and several Asian countries theatrically reduced their barriers against foreign company undertakings such as imports, foreign direct investment, and foreign portfolio investment (“Global Financial Crises,” 2014).

Non-performing loans are also root cause of banking institutions failure(Campbell, 2007). Issue of non-performing loans is threat to the banking institution’s survival(Saba, Azeem & Kouser, 2012). NPLs indicate financial instability, operational risks as well as inefficient allocations of resources. Thus, determination of factors affecting NLPs is very important. Pakistan's Non-performing Loans Ratio stood at 8.8% in Sep 2019, compared with the ratio of 8.8% in the previous quarter.

1.2 Theoretical Premise for Bank Specific Factors Responsible for Credit Risk

The following hypotheses are summarized by Klein (2013) through which the relation of bank-specific factors with NPLs can be identified:

- Bad management hypothesis which shows the efficiency of the low cost of the banks which directly indicates the poor management practices, through which the NPL buildup on the control, monitoring, and underwriting of the poor loan.
- Another hypothesis called skimming which shows the efficiency of high cost can enhance the NPLs because the landing risks monitoring is celebrated by pure resources.
- an alternative hypothesis is called the moral hazard hypothesis which contends that NPLs can be pressurized by the moral hazard incentives if the banks are increasing low capital in the loan portfolio to increase the riskiness.
- excess lending contends that that is taking behavior aggressiveness of the bank is attributed by higher NPLs
1.3 Lending Capability (LC)
The economic activities of the banking system can be influenced by the lending method which is the popular method in the banking system. Therefore, bank lending is a very good and useful method for the banking system. One can observe that the economy does not have the power to maintain economic growth level without lending approach (Alejandro & Guerra, 2017). Some studies show that the lending method may affect the economic growth negatively for different countries (Tahir, Shehzadi, Ali, & Rizwan Ullah, 2015). However, (Tahir et al., 2015) analyzed that economic growth can be affected by bank lending but for short time intervals. Another researcher (Aurangzeb, 2012) reported that the economic growth of Pakistan has a bi-directional connection. The development of the country depends upon credit. The growth of the banking industry is limited because of the liquidity strains and the industrial sector of the developing countries such as Pakistan may be affected negatively in terms of growth. Another significant factor which affects economic growth is the credit distribution in different private sectors. In Pakistan, the distribution of the credit is done on the basis of the capital-intensive sector and the flow of credit to the priority sector. The bank and other institutions will mobilize the credit from income holders to others. Hence, savings can be converted into loans. These loans can serve the purpose of the financial needs of the investors to do their business (Tahir et al., 2015).

1.4 Industrial Sector Growth as a Percentage of GDP
To get a shift from a still/ surviving economy to self-sufficient economy, an expeditious industrial development is a main factor of this in developing economies like in Nigeria reports (Keji & Anderu, 2015). When industrial growth rate increase it will lead to an economy which is less dependent and achieve the objectives of income of per capita, generating more employment and developing local industry by increasing local sources of raw material. It is anticipated that immense industrialization will optimize the utilization of already present resources and cause an increase in the entire economic growth. Industrial sectors has sub sectors like manufacturing, quarrying, mining construction, manufacturing at large and small scale, gas distribution. Mohsen, Chua, & Sab (2015) conclude their study by stating that agricultural output, population growth and manufactured growth had a positive effect while oil prices had negative effect.

1.5 Bank Investment
Investment is crucial constituent of aggregate demand and directing cause of economic growth. Alteration in investment may affect aggregate demand as well as increase the economic growth. The current change in neo-classical model, endogenous growth theory has studied the significance of investment in raising economies (Bint-E-Ajaz & Ellahi, 2012). The relationship between investment and EG is in bi-causal but Madsen (2002) reports that economic growth greatly depends upon investment.

1.6 GDP Growth
The overall economic growth is measured by the gross domestic product (GDP). Economic expansion causes emergence in the income through higher employment, which bring down financial hardship on borrowers. It enables borrowers to assist their debts which will trim down Non-performing Loans for banks (Shingjergji, 2013). Studying literature (Skarica, 2014) reported that during the retardation of economy Non-performing Loan’s levels are exaggerated, attributed to increment in unemployment debtors default. Panel data regression study by Salas & Saurina (2002) reports that credit risk is directly affected by growth in GDP . Nkusu (2011) in his study on the affect of unexpected increase in the Non-performing Loan ratio on economy of 26 developed countries proves that a 2.4 %-point increment in the NPL ratio is connected with a reduction in private borrowing and a 0.6 % point decrease in Gross domestic product growth within the time of first years and the strong counter outcome endure for four years later on the initial shock.
1.7 Capital Adequacy Ratio (CAR)
Sufficient capital reserves with regular maintenance provides necessary financial stability which instill confidence and assurance in customers and creditors. Capital adequacy ratio is used to measure the strength of capital of a bank. It is calculated as regulatory capital expressed as percentage of bank’s risk-weighted assets. There are three core elements described by prudential guidelines to determine the capital adequacy which are market risk from banking activities, credit risk and the quality of capital held by bank to support exposures from credit risk (Ullah & Bagh, 2019). Tier I capital consists of common shares, statutory reserves, untaxed reserves (free reserves) and the amount generated from the sales of the asset. This is usually called as essential capital to tackle the risks and losses without compromising on the trade and business in which the bank is involved (Fatima, 2014).

Reserves like hidden reserves, revaluation reserves, hybrid capital, loss reserves and subordinated liabilities comes into the category of Tier II capital. It can be termed as an additional capital which provides cover when the liquidation happens and does not provide enough cover for depositors or customers. Capital Adequacy Ratio can be calculated using the following equation:

\[
\text{CAR} = \frac{\text{Tier I} + \text{Tier II}}{\text{Risk Weighted Assets}}
\]

1.8 Profitability Ratio; Return on Equity (ROE)
Profitability is the measure of the ability of a bank or company to generate profits. Banking performance and macroeconomic stability are related to an important ingredient of financial development which is bank profitability. If macro level is considered, an increase in profitability leads sustainable growth and development. However, regulations need to be in place to avoid higher interest on loans which is possible due to higher returns (Ullah & Bagh, 2019). The return on investment can be termed as profitability which can be calculated by the net income and the increase in shareholder’s total equity for a specific period. Profitability is a very significant measure of any bank’s stature as it tells how well the bank is being managed and how beneficial it is for its depositors and shareholders. (Chaibi & Fitti, 2015)(Malimi, 2017) through their study have shown that profitability is inversely proportional to NPLs. This means that the bank is not efficiently managed. Abid, Nejib Ouertani, & Zouari-Ghorbel (2014) agrees with this and further reiterate that there is a statistically significant proof that there is a negative relation between performance and profitability & NPLs.

1.9 Liquidity Ratio
Liquidity of a bank is measured by the ratio of loans to deposit. Liquidity calculates the proportion of funds that the bank use to issue loans from the deposits made by the customers (Makri & Tsagkanos, 2019). The more the liquidity of a bank is, the more it is entitled in taking big risks. The recent research also depicts a direct relation between liquidity and credit risk.

1.10 Bank Credit to Private Sector
Domestic credit by banks to private sector pertains to financial resources provided by depository corporations to the private sector (except central banks). These refer to loans, trade credits and other accounts receivable etc. for which a claim can be filed. Bank credit to private sector (BCPS) includes financing and providing credits by banks or banking institutions to private sector. Bank credit is considered as a valid and significant measure of financial development because traditionally, private sector utilizes the funds much more efficiently than public sector (Ang, 2009). If Pakistani economy is to be considered, it is evident that a lot of defaults have occurred due to unavailability of enough funds from banks for novel projects. The budget deficit is being countered by borrowing from private sector instead of central bank and it has created a pressure on private sector credit. Some studies have reported a positive
relationship between bank credit to private sector and credit risk, however, studies like Klein (2013) and Nkusu (2011) have depicted a negative relationship between BCPS and NPLs. BCPS as a ratio of GDP depicts the financial strength of a country and as expected it has been found to have a negative impact on NPLs. During the economic uprising, BCPS as indebtedness could impact NPLs negatively as shown by Nkusu (2011).

1.11 Financial Depth
Out of number of identified indicators (M. W. Klein & Olivei, 2008) from the previous empirical literature they focused on indicators of financial intermediary development. The selected proxy of financial depth was liquid liabilities indicator LLY which shows the ratio of liquid liabilities to Gross domestic product, which shows the complete size financial intermediary sector without excluding the credit provided to the governmental and quasi-governmental agencies. So, they also employed an indicator named PRIVY which is a ratio of the credit provided by financial intermediaries to Private sector to the gross domestic product.

1.12 Interest Spread
The interest is actually an amount paid by the borrower for the use of money borrowed by him over a period of time, or it can be supposed as a rent for the money to be used by the borrower Crowley (2007) It is affirmed in the case of Kenya banks that an increase in interest rate spread causes increase in the interest charged from the borrowers which causes a low in performance of assets. A recent study (Farhan, Sattar, Hussain, & Fareeha, 2012) found that bank advances loans at a higher interest rate to those clients who are unable to pay back the loan or it is harder for them to pay back. Further exploring the reasons, they found interest rates to be one of the reasons responsible that cause NPLs. So, moving towards the relationships we first learn about the deposit interest rate, lending interest rate, real interest rate. Also, to calculate the real interest rate GDP deflator is employed so we shall see the description of GDP deflator.

1.13 Real Interest Rate
World Bank defines real interest rate as the lending interest rate which is adjusted for inflation as measured by GDP inflator over a year. For the calculation of the real interest rate the conditions and terms are distinct country wise because of which this cannot be used to compare the countries data (“Real interest rate (%) - Pakistan | Data,” n.d.).

1.14 GDP Deflator
The ratio of gross domestic product in current local currency to the constant local currency to the constant local currency is said to be the GDP deflator. The constant local currency is taken constant of any base year and it is calculated annually. Basically, GDP deflator serves in the calculation of real interest rate. However, for each country the base year of constant value is different, despite being a macro-economic variable this shortcoming of real interest rate limits the comparability of the real interest rate of different countries.

1.15 Lending Interest Rate
The rate over which the banks provide debt to fulfill the short term and long -term financing needs of the private sector (over a year). While advancing the loan banks keep in view the goal to take the loan and credibility of the borrower this rate is varied defined by. Also, the terms and conditions to issue these loans vary which limits the comparability of this ratio among different countries (“Lending interest rate (%) - Pakistan | Data,” n.d.)

1.16 Deposits Interest Rate
As a return to the deposits tools that are demand deposits, time deposits and savings deposits. The rate paid by the commercial banks is the deposits interest rate. This rate is affected by the different conditions that are country specific. So, this fact also hinders the comparison of this rate.
1.17 Objectives
The main objective of research is to evaluate the effect of the factors affecting credit risk in banks of Pakistan.

- To check effect of bank investment on credit risk.
- To evaluate impact of some bank related variables like BI, CAR, Liquidity ratio, profitability ratio, interest spread on credit risk.
- To identify effect of macroeconomic variables including bank credit to private sector, GDP, Lending interest rate and financial depth on credit risk of banks in Pakistan.
- To identify the significance of Industrial Sector Growth as moderator between lending capability and credit risk.
- This study aims to examine the predictors of Credit Risk (NPL) and their relevant degree of impact on credit risk of banks in Pakistan.

2. Data and Methodology

Table 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Determinants</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Symbol</th>
<th>Proxy/measure</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Credit risk</td>
<td>DV</td>
<td>NPL</td>
<td>Non-Performing Loans /Total Loans</td>
<td>World Development Indicators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industrial Sector Growth (Salas &amp; Saurina, 2002)</td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>Industry</td>
<td>Industry as a Percentage of GDP</td>
<td>World Development Indicators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industrial Sector Growth</td>
<td>Moderator</td>
<td>ISG</td>
<td>Manufacturing, value added (% of GDP), Industry (including construction), value added (% of GDP)</td>
<td>World Development Indicators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lending Capability (Saeed, Ramzan, &amp; Hamid, 2018)</td>
<td>Bank related</td>
<td>LC</td>
<td>Loan to deposit ratio</td>
<td>Banks' annual financial reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bank investment (Saeed, Ramzan, &amp; Hamid, 2018)</td>
<td>Bank related</td>
<td>BI</td>
<td>Investment to total asset ratio</td>
<td>Banks' annual financial reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capital adequacy Ratio(Irum Saba, Sakina Narmeen, Rehana Kouser &amp; Harris Khurram, 2012)</td>
<td>Bank related</td>
<td>CAR</td>
<td>Tier I + Tier II / Risk Weighted Assets (RWA)</td>
<td>Banks' annual financial reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Profitability Ratio ROE(Waqas, Fatima, Khan, &amp; Arif, 2017)</td>
<td>Bank related</td>
<td>ROE</td>
<td>Net Income/Shareholders equity</td>
<td>Banks' annual financial report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liquidity Ratio(Kumar &amp; Kishore, 2019)</td>
<td>Bank related</td>
<td>LR</td>
<td>Total Loans / Total Assets</td>
<td>Banks' annual financial report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interest rate Spread Farhan, Sattar, Hussain, &amp; Fareeha, 2012)</td>
<td>Bank related</td>
<td>IS</td>
<td>Lending rate minus deposit rate</td>
<td>World Development Indicators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bank credit to private sector(Mehmood et al., 2019)</td>
<td>Macro-Economic</td>
<td>BCP</td>
<td>Domestic credit to private sector by banks (% of GDP)</td>
<td>World Development Indicators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP (Mehmood et al., 2019)</td>
<td>Macro-Economic</td>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>GDP growth (annual %)</td>
<td>World Development Indicators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lending Interest Rate (Mehmood et al., 2019)</td>
<td>Macro-Economic</td>
<td>LIR</td>
<td>Lending interest rate (%)</td>
<td>World Development Indicators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial Depth (M. W. Klein &amp; Olivei, 2008)</td>
<td>Macro-Economic</td>
<td>FD</td>
<td>Depth of credit information index (0=low to 8=high)</td>
<td>World Development Indicators</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The table is said to be the extract of literature reviewed. All the banking and macro-economic variables and proxy measures are given in the table and their sources from where the data will be obtained.

### Table 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. No.</th>
<th>Bank Name</th>
<th>Sr. No.</th>
<th>Bank Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>National Bank of Pakistan (NBP)</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Meezan Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Bank Alfalah</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>Allied Bank (ABL)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Standard Chartered Bank</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Askari Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Habib Bank Limited (HBL)</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>MCB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>United Bank Limited (UBL)</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Bank al Habib</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Corporate Finance Institute (CFI)

### Research Framework

![Research Framework Diagram](image)

**Figure 2** Research Framework

The data obtained from Pakistani banks for bank variables and world bank indicators shows the following trends and relationships with credit risk.
So, we can assert that as the more accurate and transparent information is available to the financial intermediaries, they use it at optimum level and make the non-performing loans to reduced

Estimating Equation 1

Table 4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Coefficient</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>t-Statistic</th>
<th>Prob.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>118.17</td>
<td>29.96</td>
<td>4.09</td>
<td>0.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BI</td>
<td>-0.74</td>
<td>0.20</td>
<td>-3.55</td>
<td>0.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAR</td>
<td>-1.33</td>
<td>0.97</td>
<td>-1.37</td>
<td>0.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCTPS</td>
<td>-2.94</td>
<td>0.69</td>
<td>-4.21</td>
<td>0.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FD</td>
<td>-0.17</td>
<td>0.33</td>
<td>-0.49</td>
<td>0.66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDPGROWTH</td>
<td>-2.92</td>
<td>0.39</td>
<td>-7.29</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LC</td>
<td>0.06</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>2.32</td>
<td>0.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ROE</td>
<td>0.022</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>2.27</td>
<td>0.15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

R-squared: 0.99
Adjusted R-squared: 0.96
S.E. of regression: 0.01
Sum squared resid: 0.02
Log likelihood: 0.06
F-statistic: 35.82
Prob(F-statistic): 0.03
Mean dependent var: 12.06
S.D. dependent var: 2.69
Akaike info criterion: 1.47
Schwarz criterion: 1.72
Hannan-Quinn criter.: 1.21
Durbin-Watson stat: 2.06

Table 5 depicts the summary of the regression results which are obtained by applying ordinary least square method. Data ranges from 2008 to 2019. The adjusted R-squared value is 96%. It means that all above mentioned variables cumulatively express NPLs by 96%. It means that independent variables contribute to NPLs by 96%. The probability values shows the significance of all independent variables in this data with the dependent variable.
In this table domestic credit to private sector and GDP growth are significant with NPLs whereas other variables like BI, CAR, FD, LC and ROE have insignificant relation with NPLs. Probability value less than 0.05 shows that respected independent variables explain the dependent variable in a good way.

Lastly Durban-Watson test show the autocorrelation between the variables of the dataset. For a good regression model Durban Watson has to be value of 2. if its value is less than 2 it means positive autocorrelation of the dataset. Value above 2 show negative autocorrelation.

**Estimating Equation 2**

**Table 5**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Coefficient</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>t-Statistic</th>
<th>Prob.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>-2.85</td>
<td>5.19</td>
<td>-0.55</td>
<td>0.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTSP</td>
<td>2.72</td>
<td>2.12</td>
<td>1.28</td>
<td>0.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIR</td>
<td>-0.09</td>
<td>0.84</td>
<td>-0.11</td>
<td>0.91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LR</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>0.71</td>
<td>0.50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

R-squared 0.85 Mean dependent var 12.06
Adjusted R-squared 0.77 S.D. dependent var 2.69
S.E. of regression 1.29 Akaike info criterion 3.64
Sum squared resid 10.00 Schwarz criterion 3.76
Log likelihood -14.19 Hannan-Quinn criter. 3.50
F-statistic 11.11 Durbin-Watson stat 1.04
Prob(F-statistic) 0.007

In this table it has negative autocorrelation dataset.

In this table of dataset no variable is significant and adjusted R-squared value is 77 %. Durban Watson shows value of 1.04 which means that there is positive autocorrelation of the dataset.

**Estimating Equation 3**

**Table 6**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Coefficient</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>t-Statistic</th>
<th>Prob.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>-19.24</td>
<td>8.15</td>
<td>-2.36</td>
<td>0.065</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTSP</td>
<td>2.78</td>
<td>1.17</td>
<td>2.38</td>
<td>0.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIR</td>
<td>-0.63</td>
<td>0.55</td>
<td>-1.16</td>
<td>0.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MODEFFECT</td>
<td>-7.55E-05</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>-0.09</td>
<td>0.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INDUSTRY</td>
<td>1.32</td>
<td>0.39</td>
<td>3.32</td>
<td>0.02</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

R-squared 0.95 Mean dependent var 12.06
Adjusted R-squared 0.91 S.D. dependent var 2.69
S.E. of regression 0.80 Akaike info criterion 2.71
Sum squared resid 3.22 Schwarz criterion 2.86
Log likelihood -8.53 Hannan-Quinn criter. 2.54
F-statistic 24.17 Durbin-Watson stat 2.19
Prob(F-statistic) 0.02

In this table moderator effect is shown. Industry has probability value of 0.02 which is less than 0.05. It means that industry has significant relation with NPLs. Moreover, adjusted R-square value increases from 77% to 91% which shows that moderator has created significant increase in the model. We may say that by introducing moderation non-performing loans increases as industrial effect increase.
3. Conclusion
Credit risk is the risk of failing to fulfill an obligation on any liability by borrower. In any economy, as financial sector considered is the backbone of any economy. That’s why it has strong interaction with the survival of any economy. As Pakistan is a developing country so in our economy banks act like financial intermediaries and cycle deposits into lend-lease. In different portfolios of banks loans are main earning asset of banks which it earns by giving different lending. In order to earn profits, if banks give more loans then there are also chances or threat of risk increases. So, proper allocation of loans is necessary.

Macroeconomic factors are like some events of a bigger scale of the geographical, political, seasonal, natural or any other types that may affect economy of any country through affecting the businesses in a monetary measure. These factors are not only monitored by government authorities but also by private agencies to interpret the occurred events, check the causality of events as well as predict any forthcoming event.

NPLs are also the main cause of bank failures(Campbell, 2007). In fact, NPLs issue is critical to the survival of banking institutions(Saba, Azem Kouser, 2012). Also, it is one of the financial stability indicators and it shows both credit and operational risks as well as represent efficient allocation of resources. Therefore, determining the factors that influence NPLs is of prime importance. It is also taken as proxy of credit risk.

An increase in NPLs demand higher provisions for bad loans and they cause the fall in the efficiency indicators of banks that are basically liquidity ratio and profitability ratios which hoovers the income efficiency of banks. The liquidity problem arises due to the mismatch of the maturities in assets and liabilities following the matching principal and corrosion in the credit rating also a decay in bank image in a long run(Badar & Yasmin Javid, 2013). The matching of assets and liabilities is a technique to measure the risk faced by banks and over which the banks’ credit rating is based(Thakker & Chakraborty, 2018).

After getting results by employing data it is concluded that
• GDP and DCTPS are statistically significant. So, they are affecting the non-performing loans.
• Coefficient of GDP is negative which means that when GDP increases NPLs reduces. It means borrowers are capable to repay their loans.
• Domestic credit to private sector also shows significant and negative relation to NPLs which means that when credit to private sector increases NPLs reduces.
• Industry has significant and positive relation with non-performing loans. Which means when industrial sector grows non-performing loans will increase.
• Lending capability shows positive relation with NPLs that means as lending capability increases NPLs also increase. But statistically it has proved insignificant.
• With the introduction of moderator which is industrial sector growth and it has taken by multiplying industry with lending capability the value of adjusted R square increases which shows that moderator has strengthening impact on the relationship of dependent variable which is non-performing loans and independent variable which is lending capability.
• Bank Investment, CAR, Lending Interest rate, liquidity ratio, ROE, Interest spread and Financial Depth were found to be insignificant with non-performing loans.

4. Recommendations From Research are as Follows
• Firstly, the banks should focus on the ratio of industry as the percentage of GDP and make the forecast of the growth in industrial sector and the demand of loans from the industrial sector. Because there is a positive and strong relation between credit risk and industrial growth. So, if there is a growth in industry be forecasted then ultimately be rise in demand for loans.
• As there is positive relation between lending capability and credit risk. So, there is a need to make such policies that should prevent the growth in NPLs. It can be asserted that when the demand for loans from industrial rises then banks will have to make more lending as it is a supply side.
• As moderator strengthens the relationship between lending capability and NPLs so the banks should project growth in the industrial sector in order to control the ratio of NPLs.
• State Bank of Pakistan may use the resulting information to formulate policies that may support banks in minimizing the NPLs.
• State bank and bankers should take comments or suggestions from industrialists. Investment division should do this on priority basis and after taking recommendations from them they should implement the required policies on broader spectrum. Government should make policies which tighten the lending process so that NPLs can be reduced.

References
Depth of credit information index (0=low to 8=high) - Pakistan | Data. (n.d.). Retrieved February 16, 2020, from https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/IC.CRD.INFO.XQ?locations=PK
Industrial and Business Management, 05(08), 565–576. https://doi.org/10.4236/ajibm.2015.58056
Ullah, K., & Bagh, T. (2019). Finance and Management Scholar at Riphah International University Islamabad, Pakistan, Faculty of Management Sciences, 10(10), 84–91. https://doi.org/10.7176/RJFA
Toward Socially Sustainable Tourism: the Impact of Tourism on SMEs and Livelihood Development at Tourism Destinations in Bahawalpur Pakistan

1 Rahim Mukhtar

1 The Islamia University of Bahawalpur Pakistan: Rahim.mukhtar2040@gmail.com

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

Financial The purpose of this study is to analyse the impact of tourism on SMEs and livelihood development at local area (tourism destination). The idea behind preparing this thesis is to study and relate to this particular scenario which is green tourism within Pakistan. Sustainable tourism should provide a better vacation experience, and for local residents to seek better tourism business opportunities. Higher quality of life is achieved through societal and cost-effective benefits. The information is based on the response of the individuals surveyed. It also includes the current and past data of tourism. To accomplish the purpose of the research, the data was acquired from the tourism related SMEs owners and managers with a sample of 250, chosen randomly of South Punjab, Pakistan. The scope of the comprehensive thesis is limited to the responses of the individuals. This thesis is a modest attempt towards the conclusion that tourism research is very important because in previous years there has been a significant increase in tourism, which helps in boosting the economy. This paper is about the sustainability of tourism in which the small scale tourism related SMEs, personal improvement of SMEs owner manager, and livelihood development of local communities are the independent sub variable and the dependent variable livelihood development in the local area (tourism destination). Data analysis was conducted using a reliability test, Multicollinearity, correlation, regression, demographic and normality test. Finally, the results of this intended study revealed that there is a moderate significant of local area (tourism destination) with respect to small scale tourism related SMEs and livelihood development of local community, not significant with respect to personal improvement of SMEs owner manager. Government should try hard for the promotion and revival of tourism to increase the community development and SMEs development. Furthermore, this study recommends future researchers to focus on internal and as well as external factors of tourism and its related SMEs in Pakistan.

© 2019 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0
Corresponding author’s email address: mukhtar2040@gmail.com

**Recommended citation:** Mukhtar, R., (2019). Does Toward Socially Sustainable Tourism: the Impact of Tourism on SMEs and Livelihood Development at Tourism Destinations in Bahawalpur Pakistan. *Sustainable Business and Society in Emerging Economies*, 1(1), 43-54

**DOI:** 10.26710/sbsee.v1i1.1005

1. Introduction

The idea of sustainable tourism has established noticeable consideration in 2002 by intellectuals of the travel field Spensley et al., who have said that responsible tourism should provide a better vacation experience, and for local residents to seek better tourism business opportunities. Higher quality of life is achieved through societal and cost-effective benefits. The use of resources in a tourist destination without harming nature is also of utmost importance. Having established that it is necessary for the sector to expand their business in order to create more opportunities, this idea has become mainstream in tourism literature. However, most studies were conducted in the context of tourists or service providers. In 1998 SMEDA came into being, with the main motto of this organisation being to give ideas to different people. It also solved the financial issue of SMEs sector. To lend a helping hand in creating jobs and value addition is their primary goal. They are also conducting different studies for the betterment of the business, and if there is a new addition in the international market, they promote it in the Pakistani market. They are trying their best to give support to young entrepreneurs. Here to quote Eva Zubeck, a famous travel vlogger, “let me give you a few arguments as to why I think so, starting with the mountains of Pakistan. One of the greatest assets that nature has bestowed on this country. Beyond the current resort of Malam Jabba and Naltar. Why can’t ski resort dot the peak of mountains? Beyond that, hiking at the beautiful landscapes of Skardu, Hunza and Swat. Why can’t Pakistan become the next Bhutan or Nepal with mountaineering and maintain trekking infrastructures that rival those of neighbouring countries with 8 out of the world’s 20 tallest mountains. This should be the epicentre of the world’s trekking, adventure and mountain tourism. And just look at the mountains of the south, the hingol national park of Baluchistan. Why can’t this become the next Grand Canyon? Just imagine tourists trekking, hiking and camping among the beautiful nature made structures. How can we forget the entire coast of the Arabian Sea, with the right attitude has become one of the world’s prime beach destinations for all seasons? Imagine five star resort, private islands and beach shacks lining the beautiful coastline.” Next is culture and the arts; Sindh, Lahore, Bahawalpur, Multan etc., have so much to offer. The craftsmanship, artistry and handicrafts I have seen are unlike anywhere else in the world. This could grow to be Pakistan’s prime export. Imagine hundreds of thousands of tourists bringing bits of Pakistan back home with them, to share with their communities. There is also the concept of religious tourism: Pakistan has such an incredible Islamic heritage, and everyone knows of the Sufi trail of Sindh, which can appeal not only to Muslim tourists, but anyone interested in history and culture. Pakistan also happens to be the birthplace of Sikhism, and the travels of Guru Nanak. It is also home to some of the most important Hindu sites in the world, as well as Buddhist stupas, and the remains of a rich Buddhist heritage. Why don’t more people around the world know that Pakistan is where one of the world’s oldest civilizations, the Indus civilization was found? What exactly is preventing Pakistan from becoming the world’s top destination for history buffs? Furthermore, there is the food of Pakistan. Pakistan has such a rich culture of food and cuisines, and the diversity from province to province is just astonishing. Why can’t small places become some of the world’s top culinary hubs for foodie tourism? Such is the state of Pakistan, and it is going to take much time, effort, dedication, and investment to turn our vision into reality. But everyone knows that the gifts that Pakistan has been blessed with are endless. This is how tourists see the future of tourism in Pakistan”. The city is located near the traditional Derawar fort within the Cholistan Desert near the Indian Republic Border and is located in Pakistan's Red Sohanra National Park. Bahawalpur was once the capital of the former state of Bahawalpur under the Nawab. There are many tourism places because Bahawalpur is considered as a heritage city. Places like Bahawalpur Museum, Dubai Palace, Central Library, Jami Masjid al Sadiq, Noor palace, Darbar palace, SS World, the Zoo, Derawar Fort, National Park, Bahawalpur Gates, Gulzar Palace, Quaid-e-Azam Solar Park, Abbasia Mosque and Sadiq Public School,
SD School and Canner Peer ka mela are main tourist attractions of Bahawalpur. Tourism contributes $8.8 trillion and 319 million employments to the world economy in 2018, which is almost 3.9% more than previous years’ data given by world travel and tourism council. However, this proves the command of Travel & Tourism as an instrument for administrations to produce success while generating jobs which mostly support youth, women, and other, often help groups of the public. World Travel and tourism Council say that tourism contribute approximately $19.4 billion in 2018 which is about 6.9 percent of the total GDP. WTTC expecting $36.2 billion in coming 10 years. The people and businesspersons should participate in developing and start their minor industries to sell fruits, teas, handiwork sweets, wood carving, pottery and accommodation etc. people now have finance with tourism awareness started their hotel services, elephant riding, travel agency, souvenir, nature tracking, and handicraft shops etc. Some are financed in foreign partnerships that are more aware and network in overseas connection. Tourism and travel contain that businesses, food, and wholesale trade housing services, drink services, carriage services and cultural, sports and entertaining services. It is projected that approximately 90 per cent of the business in tourism connected industries are SMEs (European Union (EU), 2015). Formal SMEs generate almost 60% of employment and almost 40% of total (GDP) in developing economies. These numbers are considerably higher when informal SMEs are included. According to World Bank report, 600 million jobs are required in coming 15 year to control unemployment. In developing markets, most formal jobs are produced by SMEs, it also generate 4 out of 5 new post. According to the Small & Medium Enterprise Development Authority (SMEDA) SMEs create almost 90 percent of all firms in Pakistan, and give jobs to 80 percent of non-agricultural labour force which is almost 40% of the total GDP. Yet, in developing countries, while tourism can carry economic benefits to a host country, it also get thoughtful long-term difficulties we have to be careful about these problems. We need proper planning and power to tackle all the concern. Most of the research study on the effect of tourism or SMEs or socio economic impact of tourism, but my study is a combination of both.

Gaps of the study

Theoretical Gaps

Many Researchers have been based on different theories. The researcher used theories to determine socio economic impact of tourism. In past research concentrate concentrated on assessment of the impacts of the going on progression, close by systems and to see the tempers and impression of close by systems towards the movement business improvement in their neighbourhoods. This examination will centres around Small scale the travel industry related SMEs, individual improvement of SMES and occupation of nearby network. The travel business has converted into an important part in both created and creating nations, including Pakistan. Tolerating positive aspect of interest of the travel, much research has been completed on SMEs in the travel industry. Be that as it may, direct effect of the travel industry on business execution and improvement in neighbourhood absolutely unnoticed.

Contextual Gaps

This research study specifically focuses on the context of south Punjab in Pakistan. One of the developing countries districts that has many tourist places. There is a significant growth of tourism is south Punjab. Yet, there is no research study to inspect the impression of tourist on SMEs and local development of south Punjab, mostly along the profile of tourism related industries. This investigation will discover execution of the travel industry on the individual improvement of business visionaries. Impact of cityhood of local community and perception of overall livelihood development of local area. This study tends to fill this gap by finding out what is the condition of entrepreneurs’ who are currently working in the field of tourism related business.

Scope of Research Study

This examination study has a very broad scope in future for the people and specially Government, economists, NGOs’, policy makers, SMEs managers and Owners Managers of Pakistan because tourism is growing day by day in Pakistan. The market of tourism is almost $19.8 and increasing very fast. The
research study was conducted within the context of South Punjab (Pakistan), SMEs located in South Punjab (Pakistan). The economy of Pakistan is considered important for SMEs. This study is helpful for local community to find out the condition of Small-Medium enterprises for developing their area. This examination finding the figures that would set up to improve aptitudes in addition to creative plays out that may build up the lives of individuals and business people specifically. This investigation will ready to reveal potential outcomes that can address the opening of the projects in the travel industry and business enterprise that upgrade work in South Punjab.

**Research Objectives**

RO1: To analyse the impact of tourism on tourism related SMEs and Livelihood development in the local area.

RO2: To analyse the impact of tourism on Personal improvement of SMEs owner manager and livelihood development in the local area.

RO3: To analyse the impact of tourism on Livelihood development of locals and livelihood development in local area.

2. Literature review

2.1 Conceptual framework

From the sustainable tourism model my study will base on only two dimensions social and economic, study based on SMEs and local community development.

2.2 Small scale tourism related SMEs

(Othman & Rosli, 2011) The difference is that tourism create on entrepreneurship. It create entrepreneurial development and performance of business is sighted is the literature. Tourism creates opportunities for small entrepreneurs in various tourism business activities because of low initial cost entry is quite easy. It also creates good opportunities for local agricultural, construction business, Manufacturing firms and business related to services. The most important accommodation, food chain, sport facilities retails, tourist guides are needed in tourist place. It also provides a clear indication that efforts by governments to promote the tourism industry will have a positive impact on the performance of small tourism businesses. Researcher found in this study that foreign tourists have become the largest source of African business. young (1973) makes reference to a contextual investigation of the Caribbean island of St. Lucia, where the travel industry shows up bringing about a trip of wages from the nearby banana industry, which is the principle wellspring of outside salary. Those who are left on the earth cannot cope with the labour requirements of the banana crop, which in turn reduces productivity and income. As a result of tourism, food imports have increased tremendously and at the same time there has been tremendous pressure on the balance of payments. If such a study is undertaken, a better local or foreign policy can be devised. Better policy can be devised to attract tourists or to develop the tourism sector in the future. Based on the researchers’ observations, it was found that owners have little information in business management because many of them do not even have accurate records of business transactions, thus allowing for more complex accounting systems. In this way, a research about this area will help small businesses improve their performance.

2.3 Personal Improvement of SMEs Owner Manager

(Gnanapala & Sandaruwani, 2016) International Journal of Economics and Business Administration stated that, the effects of tourism on locals and views and awareness of local people towards tourism
progress in their region. The learning shown that this industry is increasing day by day and local are satisfy with the progress, developing project and tourism related activities. The study was directed in a less technologically advanced and waterless zone, the area that is badly affected by climate change and poverty. The people of this area mainly dependent on agriculture and their income is not fixed and it is unstable. As an effect of that, the people of the area is interested to be the part of tourism business and opening their personal minor scale organizations or give physical work to the development of the travel industry. Many tourism related improvement activities are going on that areas and furthermore the structure administrations of the territory are blasting alongside those advances. The administration specialists need to have an appropriate discourse with local people for the best possible contribution for the travel industry improvement exercises likewise attempt to engage local people so they would ready to get the benefits of the travel industry advancement as a designers and supervisors of the travel industry in the district. Further, it is important to give financial and moral support to local for getting benefits of tourism. The fully participation of locals will help economical, socio-cultural and environmental sustainable tourism business. It is recommended to made small scale tourism project through community involvement along with the government checking. Yet, it is required to grow a suitable planning to attract community participation.so they should have to form community organization. The government and other accountable organizations should follow all this and try their best to made development and empowerment of locals. The standard and big scale development projects are essential for local public. There should be joint venture public and private for development projects. Government must manage all these things for the betterment of industry sector and the benefits of that city people.

2.4 Livelihood Development of local Community
(Sutawa, 2012) state in is study Community power is a main key. If local people standard of living increase then area will also develop because of tourism. Village tourism developments one of the important areas which we have to focus on. Village tourism is a u age thing which increase the standard of rural people, and gives power to that people i.e. Improvement on tourism information for public and tourist persons and give knowledge about sustainable tourism, its mean how we develop tourism area without harming the environment. By empowering the local community can give fully independence to every people of the society that knowledge will help individual to find out how to use our resources and implement different things improve their prosperity. Empowerment is completed step by step with the correct perceptions and interpretations so as to avoid wrong empowerment that is not supporting sustainable empowerment principles. Condition well-disposed the travel industry improvement is worry of all partners. All issues on the travel industry advancement that make harming impact must be constrained by every on edge partner, for example network, government, NGO, Local individuals etc. would stop or circumvent ruin environment. By contribution of all stakeholders tourism development are going to be easy to achieve.

2.5 Livelihood Development in Local Area (Tourism Destination)
(Jaafar, Rasoolimanesh, Mohd Bakri, & Rasoolimanesh, 2015) discusses the involvement of local communities in the development of rural tourism and the importance of rural development for tourism. This study is conducted in Malaysia kinabalu national park which is situated in the centre. Kinabalu Park was awarded world heritage site by UNESCO for its value and is ironic diversity. Due to its natural attraction, biodiversity and local community researcher get attracted toward it. This study is about the local idea toward development in neighbouring area. This data collected from mountain area as well local community people. Most of the people from the age of 21-30 started their own tourism related business. Due to the lack of education in local people, it’s an ideal business for resident. Most of the young people involved in tourism industry from pass 1 to 10 year. For past 13 year there is a very dramatic change in the perception and idea of tourism industry in the mind of resident. There is a significant increase in self-employment and farming business which rise the salary of people. According to Macdonald & Jolliffen research paper food and beverage, Accommodation and handicraft industries are to most common sector that support in the development. There is improvement in local product due to increase in demand
because of tourism development. Most of the responses were positive about tourism development because they have given chance to participate in that developing activities. It also concluded that tourism will not promise a magical increase in development and extra source of generating income. But it is important for local area residents because it is beneficial in Eco. Social development of household income. Advantages to country occupants, both in financial and social terms, become negligible where there is an absence of nearby association in the travel industry improvement, or where local people can't or kept from reacting to the work openings emerging through the travel industry.

2.6 Relationship Between the IV and DV
(Ranasinghe, 2014)stated the relationship between variables say that most of the young and middle age entrepreneurs are hardworking and doing their work in a good way, they are capable of running their business. Females are also doing good and going neck to neck with men. They are greater risk taker than males as per the findings. Most of them already have their own families and that’s give them motivation to start their business for their families. Business is gives good earning to them now it’s possible for them to provide better life to family and give hope for a brighter future. Religion is most important factor that is fully related to the respondent perception toward business however some have believed hard work is worship, if we want to do some we have to pay for that. Payment is not all about money it’s about your dedication, honesty and hard work. If we did all this things it help us to succeed in life and business. Now, education very greater factor in creating awareness of business. Most of them got the standard instructional accomplishment they might obtain under the conditions and upraised their chance of forming a business in the tourism section. Others who have not been able to get the chance of an honest education went into line of work faculties and offered into business just to take care of their elementary wants and provide their kids good schooling. Some of the peoples have been in business field for the many years’ but are quiet struggling in their lives and others who are just started or at the beginning of their project are apparently more popular than the ones who have been in the industry longer than they have been. The impact of touristry and entrepreneurship is increasing because every establish industry is trying to develop a tourism related business. More and more and businesses are coming in that area so there is a healthy completion between people. This help locals to expend there shops or what kind of business they have. It’s difficult for someone to establish their business without government assistants. Additionally, entrepreneurs have to hire workers in their business for help so it produce jobs which increase the living style of locals, Labours get jobs and earn money for better future. Government assist them in their entrepreneurial activities and observes through the conduct of extra exercise for them. Government also helping in the promotion of their product in different tourist places and cities. On the impact of tourism and entrepreneurship on the personal improvement of the entrepreneur, people are now have an opportunity to interact with many customers for building new good relationship and business relationship business. Due to government different teachings, skill development programmes and coaching programmes there is good change in people’s decision making, Skills, responsibility and attitude toward. They know where to invest, how to get profit and what decision we have to take. They also manage their time for families. They do all the swot analysis before expansion. They attend different coaching programmes, conferences and workshops to lift themselves and their business management. On the impact of cityhood to tourism in Dam bulla City, this city has many tourism place. Srilanka is earning more from tourism and tourism related thing. After becoming city there is very sound increase in tourists. There are some negative effects also just like change in climate due to heavy development. In that city there are many tourist and entertaining places to visit. Development in that area also improve the facilities for tourists and make their trip entertaining and comfortable and pleasant. Researchers find that we should encourage investors to invest in different areas related to tourism sectors. There is an issue of transport in that area, so investor should invest in transport sector. Rent a car is a very popular or new age business. It will solve the problems and inconvenience of tourists. Government started different English speaking courses for the convenience of local community, because sometimes it’s difficult for locals to understand foreigner language. English is an international language and medium of connection. There is also and need of business of lodging and food services. Following study will help in changing the perception of
people toward tourism and tourism related business. (Mathew & Sreejesh, 2017) investigation was an effort to build up an apparent economical goal the board model for traveller goals with the aim of improving the quality of life of the community. The finding of this study is all about local community consist of these dimensions, like community development, empowerment, skills and awareness. All these measurements imitate responsible tourism observation of the local people toward sustainable tourism of local community and individual. There are four sub aspects of destination sustainability such as environmental, economic, social and cultural. This examination was completed to discover the connection between capable the travel industry and goal manageability by view of nearby network as seen by the neighbourhood system. It was discovered that individual's observations about great the travel industry has a noteworthy impact on manageability and cordial demeanour toward the travel industry goal. The role of maintain sustainable destination is to increase in the livelihood. Engagement and environmental sustainability. That all things lead toward a sustainable management of a destination. While that destination try to maintain an equality between sustainability and improvement, if there is a responsible tourism there will be a sustainable development because they both linked with each other. All this discussion will helpful for the improvement of community life and awareness of resident to tourism improvement.

H1: There is significant association between tourism on tourism related SMEs and Livelihood development in local area (Tourism destination).
H2: There is a significant association between the impact of tourism on Personal improvement of SMEs owner manager and Livelihood development in local area (Tourism destination).
H3: There is significant association impact of tourism on Livelihood development of locals and Livelihood development in local area (Tourism destination).

3. Research Methodology

3.1 Research Design
In this research study, Causal research design is being adopted to find out the SMEs’ improvement, livelihood development and local community development. It is the study based on cause and effect of relationships among variables. Previous research study also adopts the same pattern of research design.

3.2 Research Analysis
In previous research study many researchers used different models to test SMEs’ improvement, livelihood development and local community development. In this research, SPSS was one of the best statistical tools applied for the analysis stage.

3.3 Sample Size and Population
The sample size of this research study to consideration of SMEs’ located in South Punjab (Bahawalpur city), where the research is conducted. In this research study there are 250 respondents and the data is collected from different SMEs’, which is located in South Punjab (Bahawalpur City).

\[ N = \left( \frac{Z_s}{e} \right)^2 \]

\[ N = \text{Sample Size} \]

As we are using a 5 point rating scale so standard deviation is calculated as follows:
Standard deviation = Maximum Rate – Minimum Rate / 6

\[ = \frac{5-1}{6} = 0.67 \]

\[ e = \text{Tolerable error. That will be determined by the investigator. For this research we presumed 0.1} \]
Putting all this in equation we get sample size 250

4. Data Analysis and Interpretation
In this research study data analysis and interpretation method through Ms Word software will be used.

4.1 Sampling Framework
As title suggests the study was conducted in Bahawalpur City. So the sampling framework is the SMEs of Bahawalpur.

4.2 Sampling technique
Non-probability sampling was selected as sampling methods.
In this research study Simple Random sampling is being adopted for data collection and previous research study follow the same pattern.

4.3 Data Collection Tools
Questionnaires were used as a Data construction tool.

4.4 Survey Method
Direct Questionnaire Survey Method.

4.5 Result and Discussion

4.5.1 Correlation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>SM_avg</th>
<th>PI_avg</th>
<th>LD_avg</th>
<th>DD_avg</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Small scale tourism related</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMEs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.772**</td>
<td>.814**</td>
<td>.523</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.022</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>248</td>
<td>246</td>
<td>248</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal improvement of SMEs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>owners manager</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>.772**</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.780**</td>
<td>.104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.103</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>246</td>
<td>248</td>
<td>248</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Livelihood development of</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>local community</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>.814**</td>
<td>.780**</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.772</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.042</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>248</td>
<td>248</td>
<td>250</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Livelihood development in</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>local area (Tourism destinatio</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>n)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>.523</td>
<td>.104</td>
<td>.772</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.022</td>
<td>.103</td>
<td>.042</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>248</td>
<td>248</td>
<td>250</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
From the table we can see that Pearson correlation values of all variable Livelihood development in local area (Tourism destination) is 0.523 due to Small scale tourism related SMEs, that means there is a positive and moderate relationship. The value of sig is 0.022 which is less than 0.05 so it’s significant.

From the table we can see that Pearson correlation values of variable Livelihood development in local area (Tourism destination) is .103 due to Personal improvement of SMEs owner manager which means there is a positive but weak relationship. The value of sig is 0.104 which is less than 0.05 so it’s not significant. So if in the area there are Personal improvement of SMEs owner manager it’s not factual that owner manager improvement doesn’t mean the improvement in local area development.

Pearson value is .772 which there is a positive strong relationship, and sig value is 0.42 which is less than 0.5 significant exist.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>R square</th>
<th>Adjusted square</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>Std. Error of the Estimate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>.53</td>
<td>.319</td>
<td>.007</td>
<td>.599</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

By testing the value of R is .538 which mean the relationship between dependent variable and independent variable is moderate, form the value R square show that there is a change of 31.9% in Livelihood development in local area (Tourism destination) with respect to variables Small scale tourism related SMEs, Personal improvement of SMEs owner manager and Livelihood development of local community.

### 4.5.2 Coefficient

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Std. Error</td>
<td>Beta</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3.412</td>
<td>.227</td>
<td>15.026</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SM_avg</td>
<td>.158</td>
<td>.032</td>
<td>.290</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PI_avg</td>
<td>.154</td>
<td>.087</td>
<td>.194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>LD_avg</td>
<td>.148</td>
<td>.042</td>
<td>.200</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Hypothesis 1**

Form the table the sig value for the impact Small scale tourism related SMEs on local area (Tourism destination) is 0.000 which is less than the alpha value of 0.05. Therefore hypothesis accepted, so the relation significant.

**Hypothesis 2**

Mention in the table the sig value for the impact of Personal improvement of SMEs owner manager on local area (Tourism destination) is 0.077 which is greater than the alpha value of 0.05. Therefore hypothesis is rejected.

**Hypothesis 3**
The sig value for the impact of Livelihood development of local community on local area (Tourism destination) is 0.01 which is less than the alpha value of 0.05. Therefore hypothesis is accepted.

5. Limitations of the Study
There are many causes that deteriorate the quality of the study

- Some people showed slight attention in the questionnaires and several respondents find difficulty in understanding the content of the questionnaire. We have to respond to those questions which may have led some influence on the perception of these respondents.
- Tourism related Small and Medium Enterprises is an immense topic that most of the people may have no idea about.
- Sometimes people may not intentionally show their true judgment due to some biases.
- There is a chance that all the information which is useful for this research work may not have been completed by the people because of privacy rules, so the results are based on the existing materials only.
- In spite of these limits, a lot of effort was made to ensure that all the data will be obtained through authentic means. We chose samples very carefully that it will signify.

6. Conclusion and Findings
After studying the impact of tourism on SMEs and local development, we found that most of people have a sound knowledge about tourism and related SMEs. That was about tourism, in this study there are sub variables to find the tourism impact with respect to tourism related SMEs, personal improvement of SMEs owner manager and livelihood development of local on Livelihood development in local area (Tourism destination). This study elaborate that tourism related SMEs has a positive impact on Livelihood development in local area (Tourism destination). Number of client increased and competition between them increased too. Because of tourism healthy competition between SMEs improved. When we talk about the profit of SMEs it’s quite difficult to elaborate. Because most of the respondent felt nervous to talk about that, but from overall discussion we find that tourism increase profit also. Due to the fear of taxes people don’t talk about profit. So the administration specialists need to have an appropriate discourse with the nearby region to get their dynamic interest for the tourism advancement exercises additionally they need to enable the area through tourism. Most of the owners are trying to expand their business due to the unexpected increase in tourism. This study talk about impact of SMEs owner manager improvement on Livelihood development in local area (Tourism destination) is quite imaginary. Because improvement of owner manager has nothing to do with locals development or tourism destination development. This research cannot judge the overall condition of community by one or two individuals. This study also says that there is not a significant impact of owner manager improvement on overall society. The effect on the individual improvement of the business people is not so satisfactory. Other point to discuss get-togethers and exercises improves their style of business was evaluated as not satisfactory, that mean not significant. Decision making presentation is considerably more significant in view of the necessities of visitor and neighbourhood towns in Bahawalpur City. They have the chance to go to instructional meetings, workshops, gatherings for improving their businesses. But they are not satisfied enough. Moral of the analysis is that this condition is not satisfactory. In the condition of impact of livelihood of local community on Livelihood development in local area (Tourism destination) .This research explain individually tourism has an impact on the development of local and destination development, their relationship say that they both have a positive relationship. It mean if the people in society is happy and living good life, overall condition of the destination area will be satisfactory. Some of the respondents have been in business for the longest time but are still struggling in their lives and others who are just at the beginning of their venture are seemingly more successful than the ones who have been in business longer than they have been. Question about government assistant, environment issue, community involvement, cultural impact and infrastructure also present there for knowing the other sustainable tourism issues.
7. Future Recommendation

- In the future, research will be conducted on why a personal improvement of SMEs don’t have a positive effect. Moral of the analysis is that tourism has a positive impact and it will increase the living life of locals and development in tourist area.
- Research in other areas of South Punjab, Pakistan and international is strongly suggested in light of current events
- Sustainable tourism can be explored in regard to other dimensions such as environmental and socio eco dimension etc.
- Future researchers can use different theories related to their sustainable tourism according to nature of their variables.

Reference

Consumer’s Attitude Towards Green Supply Chain Practices and Its Impact on Their Intentions to Buy at Fast Food Restaurants in Bahawalpur, Pakistan

1 Sabeen Shahid Rehmani, 2 Sulaman Hafeez Siddiqui

1 The Islamia University of Bahawalpur Pakistan, sabeen.shahid.rehmani@gmail.com
2 The Islamia University of Bahawalpur Pakistan, sulman.siddiqui@iub.edu.pk

ARTICLE DETAILS

ABSTRACT

Financial The purpose of this study is to find the impact of consumer perception on green supply chain practices in fast food places in South Punjab, Pakistan. Green supply chain practices focus on assimilating environmental thinking into the conventional supply chain, including areas like product design, material sourcing and selection, manufacturing processes, delivery of the final product as well as end-of-life management of the product after its useful life. To put it simply, green supply chain practices deal in creating an environmentally friendly supply chain that will result in an organization that not only sustains itself, but also the environment around it. This research work was conducted in South Punjab, Pakistan to see whether or not people perceived green supply chain practices important and whether that would affect their decision to dine at a certain place. To serve the purpose of the research, the data was acquired from the general population of South Punjab. The respondents included students from intermediate, people who held jobs, housewives etc. with a sample of 260 chosen randomly. The overall findings state that consumer perception is significantly affected by green supply chain practices in the fast food industry. The research is limited due to the time constraints, financial constraints and limited availability of the data. The results of this research study may not generalize to other province of the Pakistan as the study is conducted only in the context of South Punjab.

© 2019 The authors, under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0

Corresponding author’s email address: sulman.siddiqui@iub.edu.pk


DOI: 10.26710/sbsee.v1i1.1006
1. Introduction
Sustainability has been a crucial aspect of any business’ longevity, especially for global companies, it is essential for them to put in the work to sustain themselves. There are many ways to sustain oneself; one of them being via green practices.
The term green supply chain management (GSCM) has been defined as the integration of environmental concerns into supply chain management practices. (Zhu & Sarkis, 2004). It incorporates all the elements of a traditional supply chain along with other processes such as product design, material sourcing and selection, manufacturing and production, operation and end-of-life. Out of the multiple ways through which an environment’s sustainability could be maintained, the concept of GSCM was brought forth for businesses.

Green supply chain management has been noted to be a potential solution for the improvement of environmental performance. Thanks to the advent of industrialization, commercialization and capitalism, the need for the incorporation of GSCM in today’s world - a world that is struggling with issues such as global warming, water crisis, plastic problems, forest fires and so much more – into the fabric of business operations is crucial as well as vital.

Due to the alarming upsurge in global warming and other issues, people (producers and consumers alike) have started paying attention. People are more environmentally and socially sound than before. Western countries, the States, Malaysia and many others are working to make sure that businesses run smoothly while causing as little damage to their surroundings as possible. Numerous research and studies have been done over the years to find out how to incorporate green practices into business operations in a manner that won’t have an adverse effect on the profits and improve the image of the business. In the world of business research, the focus revolves around sustainability and how to further the green agenda. Many areas of a business can be modified to be made more eco-friendly, but in this study, we’re going to look at it from a supply chain point of view.

Problem Statement:
Aside from environmental factors, consumer and stakeholder pressure plays a significant part in making the companies turn to adoption of green practices (Khan & Qianli, 2017). Sure, there are issues with adoption of green performances. If it’s been found out that the business in question are polluters then no one will want to buy from them. And implementation of green measures is costly and can cause a drain on company profits. On the other hand, environment friendly practices in supply chain not only lead to increased environmental performance but also enhance economic performance. (Zhu & Sarkis, 2004)

Studies have shown that consumers find products more desirable when they perceive that a firm uses green management systems, engages in resource recovery efforts, and behaves in socially responsible ways. However, in some cases, when consumers see high-priced green products, they tend to disregard these efforts completely.

For example, the paper McDonalds uses in its packaging does not come from deforestation and is biodegradable. The cost of that paper is covered by the money McDonalds charges its customers. Often customers would think that ‘it’s too expensive’ and go for the less expensive and not so friendly alternative.

Research Gaps:
Theoretical Gap:
Green supply chain management is a constantly evolving field. There’s much to explore and learn, many gaps to be discovered and filled. Handfield’s (Handfield, Walton, Seegers, & Melnyk, 1997) research showed that it studied the application of its principles across the customer order cycle whereas Sarkis
focused on its incorporation into the conventional supply chain and took into account reverse logistics as well. (Zhu & Sarkis, 2004)

This study will seek to fill the gap between Green Supply Chain Practices and Practices and their Impact on Consumer Perception. Previous researches shows that a myriad of variables and dimensions were chosen to measure the impact of green supply chain management and practices in different contexts. In this research, we will be using relevant theories and other variables such as green products, selection of products based on their life, recycling and pollution control.

**Contextual Gap:**
This research is being carried out in the South Punjab area of Pakistan. This study will seek to fill that gap so we can know the attitude of consumers towards food places that implement green practices as compared to the ones who do not implement them.

**Research questions**
The main objective of this study is to measure the impact of green supply chain management on consumer perception:
- To check the impact of on green supply chain practices on consumer perception
- To investigate the association between consumer perception and green supply chain practices

**Research objectives**
- What is the impact of green supply chain practices on consumer perception in the fast food sector?
- What is the relationship between consumer perception and green supply chain practices?

2. Literature Review:
Why is conservation of resources important? Logically speaking, on a surface level, the answer to that might seem simple. Why shouldn’t we preserve the environment around us? Why shouldn’t we give back to Mother Earth as she gives to us? You’d be surprised, that such a basic concept, wasn’t this easy to comprehend in the earlier times. In the seventeenth century, an English cleric by the name of Thomas Malthus wrote a book called an Essay on the Principle of Population, in which proposed a theory which would later be come to known as the Malthusian Theory of Population Growth. (Harley, n.d)

The essence of the theory is that population growth increases exponentially, meaning the greater the birth rate, the higher the rate of population growth. Now, you might think that’s basic math but bear in mind this was the seventeenth century, they had other issues to worry about; like religion and politics and basic hygiene. Before that it was the rats with the plague. Malthus was among the first to highlight the dangers of excessive population growth. If left unchecked, populations can outgrow their resources which will lead to issues such as scarcity. The theory posed two types of ‘checks’ that can reduce a population’s growth rate: preventive and positive. Preventive checks are voluntary actions people can take in order to keep from adding to population growth. Moral restraint is key here.

Positive checks on the other hand are things which may lead to the shortening of an average lifespan like disease, warfare, famine, poor living and work environments. If not controlled, these things could lead to ‘a Malthusian catastrophe,’ which is a forced return of a population to basic survival. A famous example of this is the Irish potato famine of the 19th century. Another incident of note is when in the 1850s, a carnie peddler named George Gale, heard of California redwood tree, which was said to have been 600 years old around the time Jesus was present. Upon seeing magnificent tree, he ordered it to be cut so it could be displayed in his sideshow. The public outrage to this was huge. Imagine chopping down a tree that is almost something of a public landmark, along with the pinnacle of conservation, and someone just comes along and chops it off for personal gratification and gain.
Incidents like these are what gave rise to the green movement (Lallanilla, 2018) and are the reason why we need measures that protect the environment around us and sustain it. In order for humanity to go on without being on the brink of extinction we need to take care of the environment we live in. And one way to do that is undertake green measures in whatever manner possible. Especially today when global warming is a serious issue, the rainforests are depleting, pollution is increasing, population growth is out of control etc. Everyone does their part to protect the environment, businesses as well.

Several studies use different dimensions to study green supply chain management. One paper used green manufacturing, green purchasing, green information systems, cooperation with customers, and eco-design to study the impact of green supply chain management on the performance of firms. (Khan & Qianli, 2017) Pakistan, despite its tumultuous struggle for continued, steady existence is also getting on the green train. According to PakistanToday, the country is in the top five for those whose highest mortality rate is due to pollution. (AGENCIES, 2019) Among the many detrimental effects of pollution, one is shortening of life expectancy. The article stated if the top five countries mentioned would invest in air pollution control, the mortality rate would fall considerably. In the past years, several companies and businesses have come forward with their green initiatives for a Naya Pakistan. After former Minister for Climate Change, Mushahidullah revealed the devastating figure of 55 billion plastic bags used by Pakistan in January 2018, (Yawar, 2018) several businesses have joined together for a pro-environmental movement. Sapphire switched out plastic bags for biodegradable ones. A bonus feature of these bags is that you can plant them! Time Store, a local store in Bahawalpur, has swapped out plastic bags for clothed ones, which customers can purchase for Rs. 25/- only. Such measures will encourage consumers to bring their own bags from home, cutting down significantly on plastic bag consumption. It will also stir a sense of warmth and sincerity towards the brand implementing these practices. They will curry favor.

Another thing you might be wondering by now. Do consumers even invest in green supply chain management? A question posed and answered by Dara Schniederjans and Christopher Starkey where they conducted an empirical assessment using data from previous researches, the theory of planned behavior and other factors that affect the purchase intention of a consumer to make a model that later revealed that yes, green practices did matter to consumers while making purchases. Their approach was to pose a scenario to the respondents, which stated that there were two types of shirts. One type of shirt had a label boasted that it was transported using energy efficient fuel. The other had no label. Both shirts had the same make, design and color. Majority of the consumers chose to wear the one with the label. (Schniederjans & Starkey, n.d.)

According to Webster's Revised Unabridged Dictionary (1913), perception has been defined as an idea, a notion that has been formed by the human consciousness by collecting ideas, beliefs, and knowledge regarding a certain thing based on which decisions about it are made later. To perceive, is to adapt reality and mold it according to our personal standards. Philip Kotler posed that individuals can have different perceptions of the same thing due to three things: selective attention, selection distortion and selective retention. Selective attention is the tendency for people to screen out most of the information to which they are exposed. Marketers work hard to catch the attention of their customers so they can get past those filters and into their heads (Kotler, 1999).

Selective distortion occurs when stimuli is not perceived in the way senders wanted it to be perceived. If five people saw the same shampoo ad, chances are not all of them will remember similar details. One might focus on the design while the other would remember the jingle. Selective retention (also known as selective memory) is a process through which some information is stored in the brain (and is thus available for retrieving) and other information is disregarded (and is thus forgotten). Both the storing and discarding are dependent on the bias of the consumer (Stroud & Choi, 2017).

Customer perception is affected by a number of factors:

- Price
- Quality
Perception plays a vital role in the grand scheme of things. After all, it is the consumer’s perception that makes or breaks an organization, that changes the game and forces businesses to reevaluate their stance. Similarly, the inverse is also true. How a business practices, will be of interest to their stakeholders. Their vested interest will be shaped by how you choose to run the show.

Jiayao Hua and their co-authors (Hu, Liu, Yuen, Lim, & Hu, 2019) conducted a research on whether green supply chain practices really did attract consumers and postulated that companies should emphasize the social benefits of green products and address these society practices to attract and motivate more consumers because people are observed to take action when there is the promise of societal acceptance involved. Still, it is important to remember that overtime, a consumer’s motivations can change and affected by the increasing trend of environmental protection awareness and in the future, more consumers will go actively addressing environment concerns and implementing green practices.

3. Conceptual Framework:

After extensive perusal of literature, our framework was developed which comprises of the following:

3.1 Purchase of Green Products:

In 2018, Sdrolia and Zarotiadis published a paper that explained the various definitions of green products. The paper covered everything from origin to implementation in various literatures and evaluated all present definitions. It cited the famous Andrea K. Moser, who has defined green products as “products that are less or not at all harmful for the environment in comparison to a substitute of the same product category,” (Sdrolia & Zarotiadis, 2019)

Johnstone and Tan defined them as products that consumers identified as environmentally friendly, whether due to the types of materials used, the production process, packaging, promotion, and so on.” A
point worth noting is that in a study conducted in Karachi last year, consumers in Pakistan did buy green products they did complain about how expensive they were as compared to other products.

3.2 Product Life Selection:
The product life cycle has five stages: introduction, growth, maturity, saturation, and decline. A conventional product follows that cycle, but for a green product the aim is to prolong the maturity stage. By buying products with extended life cycles, it will put less stress on the business as less production would mean a decrease in the amount of emissions, thus lessening the carbon footprint (National Renewable Energy Laboratory, 2016).

3.2 Recycling
Collection of waste products so that they can be repurposed so they can be consumed again is referred to as recycling. (Cousineau, n.d.) Laurent Cousineau states that recycling is the best way to reduce your ecological footprint. Selling raddi or scrap, is the go-to recycling method used in Pakistan which has been popular since time immemorial. People hand over used paper (in the form of old newspapers, used books, or any other paper that is to be discarded), old boxes, and other old items to hawkers who take these to the junkyard where they are disposed or reused.

3.3 Pollution Control
The process of reduction and elimination of toxicities and pollutants in the environment via environmental agencies from the water, the air and land by setting discharge limits is pollution control. A Forbes article cited a recent study found out that the link between mental disorders and air pollution was getting stronger, especially in children. (DiSalvo, 2019) Supply chain practices contribute to the increase or decrease in pollution and green supply chain management ensures that the level of contamination is contained.

3.4 Consumer Perception
The process of selecting, organizing and interpreting sensations into a meaningful whole. (Madichie, 2012)

H1: Consumer perception has a positive impact on green supply chain practices.
H2: Consumer perception has a negative impact on green supply chain practices.
H3: Purchase of Green Products has a positive impact on consumer perception.
H4: Purchase of Green Products has a negative impact consumer perception.
H5: Product life selection has a positive impact on consumer perception.
H6: Product life selection has a negative impact on consumer perception.
H7: Recycling has a positive impact on consumer perception.
H8: Recycling has a negative impact on consumer perception.
H9: Pollution control has a positive impact on consumer perception.
H10: Pollution control has a negative impact on consumer perception.

4. Methodology
4.1 Research design and analysis
Social surveys and experiments are frequently viewed as prime examples of quantitative research and are evaluated against the strengths and weaknesses of statistical, quantitative research methods and analysis. (Broadhurst, Holt, & Doherty, 2012) As with previous researches, SPSS IBM 20 was used to run tests on the data.

4.2 Sample size and technique
The sample size for this study was 260. A total of 260 responses were recorded. The data was obtained via online questionnaire survey drafted with the help of Google Docs. Respondents of various ages,
genders, working or studying in various institutes of different nature in the South Punjab region were selected. Random sampling was used.

4.3 Survey Instruments
The questionnaire that was developed was a close ended questionnaire that was given out to the relevant population. The questions were set on a five-point Likert scale in the following order:

- Strongly Disagree: 1
- Disagree: 2
- Neutral: 3
- Agree: 4
- Strongly Agree: 5

The questionnaire was split into two parts: the first one focused on gathering background information of the respondents; gender, age, education and nature of institution whereas the second one focused on questions drafted based on the variables and dimensions of the research: The questions were based on the following:

- Purchase of Green Products
- Product Life Selection
- Recycling
- Pollution Control
- Consumer Perception

A total of nineteen questions were asked, eighteen of which were based on the variables and the last one, the nineteenth question, which was included as an optional question, to check how many of the respondents were vegan.

5. Results and Discussion
5.1 Correlation:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Average_PGP</th>
<th>Average_PLS</th>
<th>Average_R</th>
<th>Average_PC</th>
<th>Average_CP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>224**</td>
<td>240**</td>
<td>.399**</td>
<td>.488**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>260</td>
<td>259</td>
<td>260</td>
<td>260</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>.224**</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.356**</td>
<td>.079</td>
<td>.199**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.205</td>
<td>.001</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>259</td>
<td>259</td>
<td>259</td>
<td>259</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>.240**</td>
<td>.356**</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.021</td>
<td>.195**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.733</td>
<td>.002</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>260</td>
<td>259</td>
<td>260</td>
<td>260</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>.399**</td>
<td>.079</td>
<td>.021</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.574**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.205</td>
<td>.733</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>260</td>
<td>259</td>
<td>260</td>
<td>260</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>.488**</td>
<td>.199**</td>
<td>.195**</td>
<td>.574**</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.001</td>
<td>.002</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>259</td>
<td>258</td>
<td>259</td>
<td>259</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).
The correlation test measures the relationship between two variables during the analysis. Not only does it measure the strength of the relationship but it also determines the direction it’s headed in; whether positive or negative. Pearson correlation was used to check the nature of the relationships between the variable and to determine if any variable had covariance with another variable in the study (meaning said variables moved in the same direction if subject to change). The correlation coefficient (the resulting value) ranges from +1 to -1.

PGP: Purchase of Green Products
CP: Consumer Perception
PC: Pollution Control
R: Recycling
PLS: Product Life Selection

There is a significant relationship between purchase of green products and consumer perception. The Pearson chi square value for the relationship between purchases of green products on consumer perception was 0.488 which indicates there is strong and positive relationship. There is a significant impact of Product life selection & consumer perception The Pearson value for the relationship between product life selection and consumer perception is 0.224, making it the weakest but positive relationship. There is a significant relationship between pollution & consumer perception. The correlation between pollution control and consumer perception, is the highest at 0.399, which is a moderate and positive relationship. There is a significant relationship between recycling & consumer perception. The correlation coefficient between recycling and consumer perception is at 0.240. Overall, the variables overall have a positive correlation with each other, with varying degrees of strength but the strongest relationship was seen to exist been green supply chain management and consumer perception.

5.2 Regression Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Coefficientsa</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Model</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Dependent Variable: Average_CP

The coefficient table of the variables explains the criteria of the acceptance and rejection of the hypothesis. If the significant value less than 0.005 the null hypothesis will be accepted and if the significant value is more than 0.05 the hypothesis will be rejected as there is no impact found. As in above table the significant value for purchase of green products (Average_PGP) is 0.000 which means it is positively impacting consumer perception (Average_CP) so our hypothesis, H3, has been accepted, whereas H4 has been rejected. The significant value for Product Life Selection (Average_PLS) is 0.248 which means that it is negatively impacting consumer perception (Average_CP) which means our hypothesis, H6 has been accepted whereas H5 has been rejected. The significant value for Recycling (Average_R) is 0.046 which means that it is positively impacting consumer perception (Average_CP) which means hypothesis, H7, has been accepted and H8, rejected.
6. Limitations and Future Recommendations
The thesis is conducted to find the impact of green supply chain practices on consumer perception in South Punjab. The thesis began with the discussion of green practices in the supply chain area of business and made its way down to how consumers play a part in it. This is business. Consumers affect each and every part of it, not just what you see on the surface and vice versa. Business practices DO have an effect on what the consumer believes, thinks and does. In the past, there have been studies conducted on integration of green practices into different areas of business and the green supply chain is a relatively newer phenomenon that it’s other counterparts. Within context of South Punjab, this is relatively new. Also, the validity of the instrument was verified. Should anyone want to conduct research in this area of study, it can be applied in future searches.

The findings conclude that there is a positive impact of green supply chain practices on consumer perception. Out of all the areas used to measure the relationship, there is one where it falls short, which is product life selection. However, we cannot ignore the strong links between pollution control, purchase of green products and recycling. If restaurants focused on more waste management practices and worked those practices into their daily activities it would help them cut down on costs and reduce the damage they cause to the environment by dumping. By buying green products, using them and advertising their usage, companies will bring consumer attention to these products which in turn will generate and shape consumer perception into a more favorable one.

However, there are limitations in various forms. Even though the search results have shown awareness, there is limited awareness among the male gender. It might be 2019 and more women are coming into the workforce, but gender disparity is still a problem in Pakistan. Even today, resources and opportunities are not distributed equally across all genders. Men and women aside, the transgender population is not even considered, and even though this research was gender inclusive, the response from their side was minimal. Overall, the response from the general population was better than initially expected in regards to awareness, but understanding and implementation of green supply chain management and its practices is limited.

Another thing of note that should be mentioned is another optional question that was included in the questionnaire. Veganism is another green practice that has been on the steady rise lately. Out of 260 respondents, 168 respondents (64.6%) responded that they were not vegan, but the remaining 92 (35.4) responded that they were. This does not have any bearing on the framework or results, but it should be noted that veganism is another thing to consider in the long-term and can be used as a dimension in future studies.

7. Conclusion
The situation is in front of you. Climate change, the ever looming threat of an imminent water crises, the increase in pollution… things aren’t looking good and Pakistan needs to wake up and do something before the sustainable front is too late to save. Changes begin with the first step, no matter how small it is. Governments need to develop programs and implement at a basic primary level, starting from schools, colleges, universities and making their way to organizations and institutions so people know the worth of taking the green way. Laws need to be drawn up regarding what green practices food businesses should implement into their supply chains and other areas. Regular checks should be made. Green supply chain management should be made mandatory. For other researches who will look into this topic of study later, look for more dimensions that could have an impact on green supply chain management and consumer perception in context of new variables and in other areas of Pakistan across specialized categories of the population and other industries.
References