

## Responsible Education, Learning and Teaching in Emerging Economies

**Frequency:** Quarterly

**ISSN:** 2708-4310

**ISSN(Online):** 2708-4183

### INTRODUCTION – ABOUT US

The journal **Responsible Education, Learning and Teaching in Emerging Economies (RELATE)** with ISSN: 2708-4310 and eISSN: 2708-4183 is an open access peer-reviewed research journal published bi-annually by CSRC Publishing, Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan. The journal RELATE is part of CSRC's commitment to champion responsible education and the United Nations' SDG Agenda 2030. The journal seeks to relate education and learning endeavors at various levels in the society with the sustainability challenges faced by emerging and developing economies. The content coverage highlights how teaching and learning intervention can be made responsible towards society in a sustainable way to produce inter-generational rewards. The journal would also bring forward issues in education management and social sciences for their implications for development of responsible civil society members with focus on emerging and developing economies. The journal is a platform for business people, academics, and others involved in the contemporary debate about the responsible role of business organizations and society towards each other. Coverage includes research or project reports, teacher education program evaluation, case studies of practice, action research reports, reports on teaching practice or techniques, issues of contemporary teacher education and innovation in educational management. The journal specially welcomes interdisciplinary research papers/case studies in relation to education, leadership and sustainable development. The journal welcomes papers from all those working in this important area, including teachers, researchers, business professionals, members of the legal profession, government administrators and many others.

### REVIEW PROCESS

Review process at RELATE is an integral part of the publishing process of the scholarly submissions made. All papers published in RELATE undergo peer-review process by which experts in relevant field of the paper review and give comments to authors regarding suitability of the paper for publication. Objective is to ensure academic quality and rigor of the publication process.



Prof. Dr. Hayat M. Awan  
Designation: President, CSRC

Official Stamp:



### **Double Blind Review Policy**

All papers submitted to RELATE undergo various steps of rigorous double blind review process by which both reviewer's and author's identity is not disclosed to each other in order to ensure independent review and avoid any potential conflict of interests.

### **Duration of Review and Publication**

In order to meet growing requirement by authors for an efficient review and publication, the journal has taken appropriate measures to speed up the process yet without compromising on the quality of publication. First step is desk review whereby a paper is screened by the chief editor himself and/or assigned to editorial board. This normally takes 15-20 days after submission of the paper in order to check similarity score, appropriateness of the study with journal scope and objectives. Email is sent to the corresponding author regarding decision of this initial screening usually within a month. After a paper goes through initial screening successfully, the paper undergoes review process by the peers, in second step, by which it is sent to two reviewers who are experienced academics in the area of research the paper focuses on. These reviewers make comments on originality, contribution, appropriateness of flow of discussion and references cited in the study. After this step, review reports are sent to all authors of the paper with a letter of acceptance conditioned to fulfilment of revisions in due time or rejection/excuse. This step usually takes another 30-45 days. The third step is about sending revised copy to the copy editors who look at proofreading and editing of the paper and their report is sent to the corresponding author as well. Authors are requested to submit the proofread and edited copy of the paper within 1-3 weeks after which paper is sent for production. Print copy is sent to corresponding author on request after publication. The journal has introduced early online production system by which the advance copy of paper is published and available online before the hard copy publication.

### **Editorial Role in the Review Process and Conflict of Interest Policy**

In order to maintain rigor and independence of review process, the papers are sent to well established scholars in the relevant field. The reviewers are different from the editorial board members. The role of editorial board members is to recommend the potential reviewers for the papers and manage the review process assigned by the managing editor. In order to avoid conflict of interest, when papers are received from any of the editorial members, the chief editor assigns such paper to alternate editorial member to manage the review and publication process in order to maintain independence and neutrality.

### **Guidelines for Reviewers**

Reviewers bear the responsibility for objectivity, professionalism, impartiality, and confidentiality of the assessment of content quality.



Prof. Dr. Hayat M. Awan  
Designation: President, CSRC  
Official Stamp:



Journal of Business and Social Review in Emerging Economies (RELATE) follows a double-blind peer-review process. Where the identities of authors and reviewers are hidden from each other. Its purpose is to improve the quality of content and of the scientific material under review that is ultimately published. A conscientious review is a time-consuming effort but is essential to assure the quality of scientific journals. The RELATE is very grateful for the time and effort reviewers invest in this process. RELATE adheres to the Committee on Publication Ethics (COPE) guidelines and strives to ensure that the review process is fair, unbiased, and timely. Decisions to accept a manuscript for publication depending on the importance of the investigated issue, originality, clarity, validity, and relevance of the work to the scope of the RELATE. Therefore, reviewers have a major role decision on whether to accept an article for publication.

### General Notes

- Reviews should be conducted fairly and objectively. Personal criticism of the author is inappropriate. If the research reported in the manuscript is flawed, criticize the science, not the scientist. Personal criticism is likely to lead an author to ignore useful comments, making your review less useful to your field. Criticisms should be objective, not merely differences of opinion, and intended to help the author improve his or her paper.
- You should decline to review manuscripts in which you have conflicts of interest resulting from competitive, collaborative, or other relationships or connections with any of the authors, companies, or institutions connected to the papers.
- If your previous or present connection with the author(s) or an author's institution might be construed as creating a conflict of interest, but no actual conflict exists, please include this issue in your confidential comments to the editor. If in doubt, please contact the Editor who requested the review before accepting.
- Respect the confidentiality of the manuscript, which is sent to you in confidence. You should not discuss unpublished manuscripts with colleagues or use the information in your own work. If you feel a colleague is more qualified than you to review the paper, do not pass the manuscript on to that person without first requesting permission to do so from the editor. Your review and your recommendation should also be considered confidential.
- If you choose to remain anonymous, ensure that you avoid comments to the authors that might serve as clues to your identity.

### Comments to Editor



Prof. Dr. Hayat M. Awan  
Designation: President, CSRC

Official Stamp:



Your Comments to the Editor will be submitted to the Managing Editor and the Editor-in-Chief only. These should include any possible conflicts of interest. Comments and constructive criticism of the manuscript should be placed in the Comments to the Author.

### **Comments to the Author (s)**

Your Comments to the Author (s) will be submitted to the Managing Editor and the Editor-in-Chief. They are also communicated to the author (s) and to the other anonymous reviewers of the manuscript once the editor has made a decision.

Comments should be constructive and designed to enhance the quality of the manuscript. You should consider yourself the authors' mentor. Make your comments as complete and detailed as possible. Express your views clearly with supporting arguments and references, as necessary. Include clear opinions about the strengths, weaknesses, and relevance of the manuscript, its originality, and its importance to the field. Specific comments that cite line numbers are most helpful. If you feel unqualified to address certain aspects of the manuscript, please include a statement to identify these areas.

Begin by identifying the major contributions of the paper. What are its major strengths and weaknesses, and its suitability for publication? Please include both general and specific comments bearing on these questions and emphasize your most significant points.

Support your general comments, positive or negative, with specific evidence.

If you wish to make comments directly on the manuscript pdf using the Note tool, you may do so. However, we do not expect you to copy-edit the manuscript. If you do annotate the pdf, please also include a summary of your general comments. You may also upload other documents (e.g. your review as a document, useful references). The journal editorial assistant will remove your identity from the properties of these documents to maintain your anonymity.

### **Points to consider in your review include:**

- Is the topic of the manuscript appropriate for the RELATE? Is the information of significant interest to the broad readership of the RELATE?
- Do the title, abstract, keywords, introduction, and conclusions accurately and consistently reflect the major point(s) of the paper?
- Is the writing concise, easy to follow, and interesting, without repetition?
- Is the aim clearly stated?
- Are the methods appropriate, scientifically sound, current, and described clearly enough that the work could be repeated by someone else?
- Is the research ethical and have the appropriate approvals/consent been obtained?



Prof. Dr. Hayat M. Awan  
Designation: President, CSRC  
Official Stamp:



- Are appropriate statistical/econometric analyses used? Are they sufficiently justified and explained? Are statements of significance justified?
- When results are stated in the text of the paper, are they supported by data? Can you verify them easily by examining tables and figures? Are any of the results counterintuitive?
- Are all tables and figures necessary, clearly labeled, well designed, and readily interpretable? Is the information in the tables and figures redundant? Is it repeated in the text?
- Are the conclusions supported by the data presented?
- Are the references cited the most appropriate to support the manuscript? Are citations provided for all assertions of fact not supported by the data in this paper? Are any key citations missing?
- Consider the length of the manuscript, relative to the content. Should any portions of the paper be expanded, condensed, combined, or deleted? (Please be specific in your advice, and don't simply advise overall shortening by x%).
- Does the manuscript comply with the Instructions for Authors?

**Please also comment on any possible research or publication misconduct, such as:**

- Does this manuscript report data or conclusions already published or in the press? If so, please provide details.
- Has the author plagiarised another publication?
- Is there any indication that the data have been fabricated or inappropriately manipulated?
- Have the authors declared all relevant competing interests?

**PUBLISHING POLICY**

CSRC Publishing is the publisher of RELATE and assumes responsibility of all processes and activities necessary for print and online publishing of the content copy sent by the editorial board. CSRC Publishing or its management body bears no right to interfere in the nomination of editorial board and their role. Similarly, CSRC Publishing affirms to NO INTERVENTION policy in the editorial process and activities thereof.

**EDITORIAL POLICY**

**Job Description (Terms of Reference) of the Editor in Chief**

Aside from providing prestige, the role of the journal's editorial board is to advise and support the editor.

Functions may include:



Prof. Dr. Hayat M. Awan  
Designation: President, CSRC

Official Stamp:



- To serve as Patron of the journal's editorial board contributing to journal's vision, mission and scope.
- To review the journal's various policies to make those at par with international standards.
- To conduct necessary editorial training for the editorial members to enable them carry out their editorial tasks.
- To guide the editorial board in achieving higher indexing and abstracting at various national and international agencies.
- To facilitate managing editor in attracting editorial members in line with the journal's vision, mission and scope.
- To provide necessary guidelines to managing editor in carrying out its responsibilities.

### **Job Description of the Editorial Board**

Aside from providing prestige, the role of the editorial board is to advise and support the editor.

Functions may include:

- Identifying new topics for commissioning special issues and advising on direction for the journal—giving feedback on past issues and making suggestions for both subject matter and potential authors.
- Provide content by writing articles and occasional editorials reviews
- Approaching potential contributors
- Help to identify and suggest reviewers with expertise in the relevant area of a research paper and/or provide second opinions on papers (i.e. where there is a conflict between reviewers)
- To ensure the implementation of ethical guidelines envisaged by Committee on Publication Ethics (COPE).
- To identify and resolve conflict of interest using journal's policy thereof.
- Identify appropriate conferences for editors to attend
- Endorse the journal to authors, readers and subscribers and encourage colleagues to submit their best work.
- To handle complaints/grievances by authors, reviewers or any other external and internal party.

### **COPE'S CODES OF CONDUCT AND BEST PRACTICE GUIDELINES FOR ACADEMIC PUBLISHING**

- **COPE's Principles of Transparency and Best Practice in Scholarly Publishing**
- **COPE's Code of Conduct and Best Practice Guidelines for Journal Editors**
- **COPE's Short Guide to Ethical Editing for New Editors**
- **COPE's Code of Conduct for Journal Publishers**
- **COPE's Ethical Guidelines for Peer Reviewers**



Prof. Dr. Hayat M. Awan  
Designation: President, CSRC  
Official Stamp:



## **ETHICAL GUIDELINES**

The RELATE follows ethical guidelines by Committee on Publication Ethics (COPE). Both the publisher and the editorial board of RELATE affirm to comply with and ensure ethical considerations in submission, review, conflict of interest, disclosure and publication process as underlined by COPE declaration on publication ethics and conflict of interest.

## **COPE'S CODES OF CONDUCT AND BEST PRACTICE GUIDELINES FOR ACADEMIC PUBLISHING**

- **COPE's Principles of Transparency and Best Practice in Scholarly Publishing**
- **COPE's Code of Conduct and Best Practice Guidelines for Journal Editors**
- **COPE's Short Guide to Ethical Editing for New Editors**
- **COPE's Code of Conduct for Journal Publishers**
- **COPE's Ethical Guidelines for Peer Reviewers**
- **HEC's Ethical Guidelines for Journals**

In addition, the RELATE also follows ethical guidelines suggested by Higher Education Commission Pakistan (HEC) which are considered as necessary benchmark for quality assurance of journals in the category of social and behavioral sciences. The links of COPE's ethical guidelines and HEC's ethical guidelines are mentioned below for the information of editorial, reviewers and authors.

- **HEC's Ethical Guidelines for Journals**

## **ORIGINALITY AND PLAGIARISM POLICY**

- Responsible Education, Learning and Training in Emerging Economies (RELATE) is committed to advance original work of scholarship and strictly NO tolerance for plagiarism.
- It is the author(s) responsibility to ascertain that s/he has submitted an entirely original work, giving due credit, by virtue of proper citations, to the works and/or words of others where they are used.
- Plagiarism in all its forms constitutes unethical publishing behavior and is not acceptable.
- Material quoted verbatim from the author(s) previously published work or other sources must be placed in quotation marks.
- In line with the Higher Education Commission of Pakistan policy and in conformity with the international publishing standard for academic writing, the submitted



Prof. Dr. Hayat M. Awan  
Designation: President, CSRC  
Official Stamp:



manuscript found to have a similarity index of more than 20% will either be rejected or left at the discretion of the editor for purposes of a conditional acceptance.

- Authors can submit manuscript previously published in abstracted form, e.g. in the proceedings of an annual meeting, or in a periodical with limited circulation and availability e.g. reports by government agencies or university departments.
- In case the research paper is part of the research thesis, the author shall make explicit statement to the managing editor at the time of submission that the work is from a research thesis along with other details. However, the thesis shall not be formally published in book form by any academic publisher.
- In case that the paper has been published in the full paper proceedings of a conference or other meeting, the similarity of paper submitted for journal publication with its previous version must not be more than 40%. The author will be required to mention such case to the managing editor during the submission process.

### **PUBLISHING FEE POLICY**

In order to maintain academic independence of RELATE, the editorial board has decided to charge NO FEE for submission and publication of articles (No Article Processing Charges). The journal is independently and voluntarily managed by the editorial board whose members are academic staff from renowned institutions.

### **FINANCIAL MODEL**

In order to meet its financial needs to run the journal smoothly, CSRC Publishing and RELATE has relied to frame its unique business model which is based on following.

- a) Volunteer admin staff and editorial board** comprising of PhD scholars and faculty members who render their services without any fixed salary.
- b) Funding support from Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan** which seeks to promote Green Model of Publishing of its publishing division, CSRC Publishing, with no pay walls and open access policy.
- c) Fast Track Review and Publication:** The RELATE has introduced a fast track review and publication process under which authors are charged a nominal fee of USD 180/equivalent. The reviewers and editorial members are paid remuneration to help give a rigorous yet timely review and publication feedback to the submitting authors under this track.
- d) The published authors are offered to buy 5 reprints** of the journal issue for a total nominal charge of USD 100 including the courier charges.
- e) Funding from HEC Pakistan:** The journal has sought recognition and funding from Higher Education Commission Pakistan to cover part of the cost of running the journal.
- f) Annual Conference Fees:** The Center for Sustainability Research and Consultancy holds annual conferences of its various national and international chapters to further its mission to



Prof. Dr. Hayat M. Awan  
Designation: President, CSRC  
Official Stamp:



highlight sustainability issues in emerging and developing economies. The CSRC utilizes the funds generated from conference fee to support its annual conferences and academic activities including support to CSRC Publishing to run its Green Publishing Model. **g) Language editing and proofreading** may be required by the journal editorial for the papers accepted for publication after independent review process. The publisher may charge fee for template setting, language editing and proofreading service to cover part of the publication cost. The authors, however, are not restricted to use CSRC Language and Editing Service and rather may opt to use other professional services.

### ADVERTISING POLICY

In order to meet its financial needs, the CSRC Publishing and RELATE consider to accept advertising requests. The advertising policy states that advertisements from only academically relevant institutions and events be allowed on the website and printed materials. Given the sustainability focus of CSRC Publishing, the advertisements related to organizations promoting green and socially responsible products in any direct or indirect manner will also be considered for acceptance.

### COMPLAINT PROCEDURES

In order to ensure customer centricity, implementation of ethical guidelines and ensure transparency of editorial and publishing process, the editorial board and CSRC Publishing have taken appropriate measures. In order to ensure that complaints and grievances by authors, reviewers, editorial or any external and internal body are resolved in a transparent manner, two members of the editorial board are nominated to be part of Complaint/Grievances Committee who can be contacted for any complaints or concerns related to submission, review, conflict of interest and publication process. This committee is responsible to acknowledge all such complaints by email and setup the hearing and resolve of the issue within 30-45 days of receipt of the complaint.

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Vasyl Taras, University of North Carolina at Greensboro, USA.  
Email: v\_taras@uncg.edu

Dr. Waheed Asghar, Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority Punjab  
Pakistan.  
Email: waheedasgharpk@gmail.com

### OPEN ACCESS AND COPYRIGHT POLICY



This work is licensed & copyrighted under a Creative Commons Attribution-Non Commercial 4.0 International License.



Prof. Dr. Hayat M. Awan  
Designation: President, CSRC  
Official Stamp:



The editorial board of RELATE shares common vision with CSRC Publishing in providing unrestricted access to knowledge and education for all and thereby follows OPEN ACCESS POLICY to showcase its content. RELATE follows open access copyright and licensing policy on the principle that making research freely available to the public supports a greater global exchange of knowledge.

CSRC Publishing and RELATE adhere to Creative Commons Attribution-Non Commercial 4.0 International License. The authors submitting and publishing in RELATE agree to the copyright policy under creative common license 4.0 (Attribution-Non Commercial 4.0 International). Under this license, the authors published in RELATE retain the copyright including publishing rights of their scholarly work and agree to let others remix, tweak, and build upon their work non-commercially. All other authors using the content of RELATE are required to cite author(s) and publisher in their work. Articles of RELATE can be read and shared for noncommercial purposes under the following conditions:

- *BY*: Attribution must be given to the original source (Attribution)
- *NC*: Works may not be used for commercial purposes (Noncommercial)

CSRC Publishing and RELATE use the CC BY-NC to **protect the author's work from misuse.**

#### **ARCHIVING POLICY**

CSRC Publishing is a 'green' publisher, as we allow self-archiving of accepted and published papers through open access policy before and after the publication of a paper in RELATE. Authors retain the copyright of their scholarly work and can archive pre-print and post-print or publisher's version/PDF to personal or institutional repositories or libraries anytime without requiring permission from the journal or publisher.

Authors of *published articles* in RELATE are entitled to deposit their accepted manuscript **or the version of record (published papers)** in institutional and/or centrally organized repositories and can make this publicly available immediately upon acceptance and publication, provided that the journal and CSRC Publishing are attributed as the original place of publication and that correct citation details are given.

Upon acceptance of paper by the journal, the authors acknowledge while making their article publicly available that the article has been accepted for publication as follows:



Prof. Dr. Hayat M. Awan  
Designation: President, CSRC  
Official Stamp:



*This article has been accepted for publication in [Journal Title] Published by CSRC Publishing.*

Authors can also make their published article publicly available immediately after publication without requiring any permission to different repositories, libraries or personal websites provided that they also deposit the URL of their published article, in addition to the PDF version by correctly citing the journal name and CSRC Publishing as publisher along with other citation details.

### **DIGITAL ARCHIVING AND PRESERVATION**

In order to digitally preserve all published scholarly content including that of RELATE, CSRC Publishing submits the journals' content to Portico for digital archiving for long term digital preservation. This information can be found on: <https://www.portico.org/publishers/csrc/>. Furthermore, CSRC Publishing commits to submit the metadata of RELATE and all other journals to LOCKSS and CLOCKSS via PKP PN and other institutional repositories such as Repec. This is to make sure that the published scholarly content by CSRC Publishing remains available to the community despite discontinuation of any journal or any accidental loss of journals data in its personal archival records. CSRC Publishing has further made sure that the metadata of all its open access journals is compliant to well known repository services and their digital crawlers may regularly collect it for record and preservation.



Prof. Dr. Hayat M. Awan  
Designation: President, CSRC  
Official Stamp:



## **CONTACT US**

### **Patron**

Prof. Dr. Hayat Muhammad Awan  
President, Center of Sustainability Research and Consultancy Pakistan

### **Editor in Chief:**

Prof. Dr. Rosna Awang Hashim  
School of Education, College of Arts and Sciences,  
Universiti Utara Malaysi  
[rosna@uum.edu.my](mailto:rosna@uum.edu.my)

### **Managing Editor**

Dr. Ghulam Fatima  
Associate Professor, Institute of Special Education and Research,  
University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan  
[fatima.ier@pu.edu.pk](mailto:fatima.ier@pu.edu.pk)  
[relate@globalcsrc.org](mailto:relate@globalcsrc.org)

## **CONTACT PUBLISHER**

Sadia Zulfiqar  
Research and IT Executive  
[sadia@globalcsrc.org](mailto:sadia@globalcsrc.org)

First Floor Naseer Building No 58, Outside Pakgate, Multan 60000 Punjab, Pakistan  
Associate Head Office: Global CSRC (M) Sdn Bhd, A-2-09 Coplace 2, 2260, Jalan  
Usahawan 1, Cyper 6, 63000 Cyberjaya Selangor Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia.  
[info@globalcsrc.org](mailto:info@globalcsrc.org)



Prof. Dr. Hayat M. Awan  
Designation: President, CSRC  
Official Stamp:

